CHILDHOOD TO TEACHER:
PRE-SERVICE EDUCATORS’ FORMATIVE MUSICAL EXPERIENCES AND THEIR DECISION TO BECOME A CLASSROOM MUSIC TEACHER

Dominique Courtney Anderson

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of Music (Music Education) (Honours), Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney

2009
ABSTRACT

This study explores the relationships between formative musical experiences, narrative constructions of music teacher identity and the influence of these identity constructions on the decision to become a classroom music teacher among a group of pre-service music educators. Case studies of 15 participants were conducted. Participants were from the Bachelor of Music (Music Education) degree program at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, The University of Sydney. Data were collected through individual semi-structured interviews with the participants. The study explored the musical, schooling and cultural backgrounds of these pre-service music educators. Data were analysed through open coding and narrative analysis. Narrative responses to questions about formative musical experiences, their relationship to music teacher identity construction and how these relate to the decision to become a classroom music teacher, encoded five key frames. These are: individual cultural background; memories of patterns of pedagogy; impressions of music teachers; the cultural and educational status of music; and music’s importance within family and social life. The findings of this study contribute to the growing body of research and literature in this field and generate a number of avenues for future research.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Over the past two years I have been supported by so many people, all of whom cannot be named here. Those who I have singled out have been a constant source of encouragement.

To my supervisor, Dr Michael Webb – there are no words to express the amount of thanks I have for your assistance. Your constant enthusiasm for my ideas and project, your belief in me that I could interview 15 participants and your humourous and informative tangents during our meetings have been invaluable to me. You are a fountain of knowledge and I have so much respect for you. I will be forever grateful for your time and effort, both during my time at the Con and at school.

Dr Kathy Marsh and Dr James Renwick – your initial support during the first year of honours was so much appreciated. Your knowledge and assistance with my initial change of topic and subsequent project have guided me through the program. To the Sydney Conservatorium of Music education staff – your love for teaching, passion for music and wisdom about life have guided me through my four years of tertiary training. I believe you have had a significant impact on my music teacher identity formation.

Fourth Year 2009 – your friendships, support, sense of fun and love of music have been precious to me. To my fellow honours associates – I believe it was worth it in the end!

To the 15 participants without whom this project would not be possible – thank you for volunteering and being so helpful throughout the project.

To my friends at home who are always there for me – Emily, your uplifting emails when I was stressed and your constant friendship have been important in me getting through my project. Laurie – thank you for the books, the company, the reading, lunches, and habitus.

Finally, to my parents – Mum and Dad, you have been my centre of gravity. Without your love, support for my musical career and encouragement at all times of the day and night, I would never have got to this point. There are no words, so I dedicate this project to you. I love you.
For Mum and Dad
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ABSTRACT</strong></td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</strong></td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LIST OF TABLES</strong></td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justification of significance</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation of thesis</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF LITERATURE</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is identity? – The concept of the self</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Narrative and experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development of musical identities: ‘musician’ or ‘music educator’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The social construction of music teacher identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context: Habitus, Australia and beyond</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical socialisation of pre-service music educators</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The influence of the teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Previous experiences as a model of teacher identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The influence of parents and family</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative methodology</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Narrative Inquiry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recruitment Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection methods</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Semi-structured interviews 18
Audio recording 20
Data analysis techniques 20
Ethics 21
Research limitations 21

CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS 22
The study participants 22
Formative musical experiences 23
I. Family and home musical interactions 23
II. School music interactions 27
III. Musical interactions in community settings 29
IV. Private musical tuition 31
Narrative construction, musical identity, and becoming a classroom music teacher 35
Frame one: Individual cultural background 36
Frame two: Memories of patterns of pedagogy 37
Frame three: Impressions of music teachers 38
Frame four: The cultural and educational status of music 40
Frame five: Music’s importance within family and social life 42

CHAPTER FIVE: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS 45
Summary of findings 45
Educational implications 47
Suggestions for future research 47
Conclusion 47
REFERENCES 49
APPENDICES 54
Appendix A: Interview schedule 55
Appendix B: Recruitment notice 57
Appendix C: Participant information statement 58
Appendix D: Participant consent form 60
Appendix E: University of Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee - Letter of approval 62
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Participant interview information 19
Table 2 Participant information overview 24
Table 3 Instruments and examinations 33
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

This thesis is a multi-case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision by Sydney Conservatorium of Music pre-service music educators to become a classroom music teacher. It is a study of one of a number of musical roles students identify with at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, that of classroom teacher (in contrast with but possibly including aspects of others such as performer, conductor, composer or musicologist) and how students come to assume this role as a significant aspect of their musical identity (see McCarthy, 2007).

Research has shown that there is a strong relationship between narrative and the construction of identity. Stories arise out of musical experiences and the meanings of these are entangled with the music making and the human relationships surrounding such musical activity and the dialectic that sustains these (McCarthy, 2007). While the subject of the study is the relationship between formative musical experiences and pre-service music educator identity, it also concentrates on how such experiences are woven into stories. As will be seen, stories are shaped by individual cultural background, memories of patterns of pedagogy, impressions of music teachers, the cultural and educational status of music, and music’s importance within family and social life more broadly.

It is important to investigate how music teachers are influenced by the contexts in which they construct their musical identity. The affective experiences one acquires, and related relationships one develops in the context of these experiences before undertaking tertiary music study, can be extremely influential in shaping current and future identity. As McCarthy states, formative musical experiences are “[powerfully] evocative media in remembering the past” (McCarthy, 2007, p. 5) but this study proposes that these experiences are also significant in the ways the future is imagined.

Each music teacher has their own rich history of musical interests and experiences, each shaped by unique social and cultural contexts. When investigating musical identity, especially pre-service music educator identity, it is worthwhile investigating how past musical experiences shed light on their current values and ideologies regarding teaching. Pre-service music educators have an important perspective to offer since in a sense they are in a liminal space, somewhere between the formative
experiences that have shaped their decisions to pursue music education studies and the full realisation of the musical identity they have assumed or are in the process of assuming.

Research Questions

The study addresses the following research questions:

1. What are the formative musical experiences of Sydney Conservatorium of Music pre-service music educators?
2. How are these experiences constructed into narratives, and what do such narratives tell us about the construction of the musical identity of these students?
3. In what ways do the musical identities of these pre-service music educators influence their decision to become a classroom music teacher?

Justification of significance

Although much research has been conducted into the area of teachers and their attitudes towards teaching, and their development of identity and their self-image, to date there has been little investigation into the previous musical experiences of pre-service music educators. This study aims to investigate the variations among (or even similarities between) musical experiences of pre-service music educators at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, while considering the social and cultural backgrounds of these participants, an aspect that has not been the focus of similar research.

The literature in relation to musical identity is substantial, however in relation to links between the development of identity and formative musical experiences there is a deficit. The literature covers how prominent figures in a child’s life (such as parents and teachers) influence the development of identity, the influence of context on musical learning, and also how formative musical experiences affect musical identity, but it provides little insight into the types of formative musical experiences an individual has and the links between these encounters with the decision to become a music teacher.
Concentrating in the study on this specific ‘moment’ in identity construction may be useful to other pre-service music educators as well as tertiary music educationalists. It can assist the former in understanding their musical background and their opinions and feelings regarding their own musical identity and how they confirm and/or adjust their perceptions during their tertiary education years. It can assist the latter in planning university courses and in providing resources and support for pre-service music educators as they prepare for their future career.

This synchronic study at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music allows for future comparisons with studies of various kinds in relation to music teacher identity and the links between formative musical experience and identity construction.

**Definitions**

In relation to the study, terms used throughout the thesis are defined as follows:

*Formative musical experiences*

Formative musical experiences are previous musical experiences that a participant in this study identifies as being influential in shaping their future involvement with music. These experiences may have occurred either prior or subsequent to their commencement of study at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music. Examples of formative musical experiences include: school music learning; private instrumental tuition; experience provided within family music learning contexts (including the modelling of musical parents or other close relatives); cultural musical experiences and music tours; ensemble participation (including orchestras, community bands, and choirs); and any informal or formal music learning experiences that the participant may have been involved in (for example, early childhood music education programs).

*Classroom music teacher*

Classroom music teacher means a music teacher who teaches within the formal classroom, whether in primary or secondary school. This excludes private instrumental music teaching.
Pre-service music educator

Pre-service music educator refers to students who are currently undertaking the Bachelor of Music (Music Education) degree at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music (hereafter SCM). These may also be referred to as ‘student music teachers’.

Narratives and narrative inquiry

At its broadest, a narrative is anything that is told or recounted, and this done often in the form of a story. Narrative inquiry involves analysis of narrative data “against a series of frames including those of the research participant, the researcher and the larger cultural narratives in which these individuals are situated” (Barrett & Stauffer 2009, p. 11).

Musical identity

There are identities in music (musical roles we identify with, such as performer, teacher, conductor, composer) and music identities (the role music plays in for example, peer, gender, ethnic, religious, and/or cultural identity) (McCarthy, 2007, p. 5; see also Macdonald, Hargreaves & Miell, 2002). Both types of identity are addressed.

Organisation of thesis

This thesis contains five chapters. Chapter two is a review of literature discussing the findings of existing research relevant to the study. The review is organised as follows. It begins with a discussion of identity and the concept of the self. It then examines literature on narrative and experience followed by literature on the development of musical identity. The social construction of music teacher identity is discussed next; this is followed by a brief discussion of Bourdieu’s concept of habitus and how it relates to Australian society. The review concludes with a discussion under various sub-headings of musical socialisation of pre-service music educators. Chapter three contains information regarding research methodology applied in this study. The research findings are then presented and discussed in Chapter four. The final chapter contains the researcher’s conclusions, educational implications of the findings, and suggestions for future research.
CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The journey from student to music teacher is one of evolution and understanding of self. An individual’s formative musical experiences shape their developing identity in relation to their specific environment (Bronfenbrenner, 1979). Having a strong musical identity is clearly an important element in becoming a well-developed ‘musician’, whether it is in relation to performance or music educator capacity (Lamont, 2002). ‘Self-concept’ and ‘self-image’ are part of making the transition between student and teacher, especially those endeavouring to take on the role of classroom music teacher.

The literature in relation to the topic addresses a range of subjects. Those most relevant to the study include musical identities and their formation and development. The social construction of music teacher identity, modelling teacher identity on previous experiences, the development of musical identities in terms of being a ‘musician’ versus ‘music teacher’, the socialisation of music teachers and learning within a context are discussed below in relation to other research.

There are no specific replicas of the study but many have used similar methodologies (qualitative methods) for gathering their data. A specific study of student music teachers has not been conducted in a university institute such as the SCM anywhere in Australia before and so the study is unique in that sense. Many other studies worldwide have touched on particular facets of the project but not a similar focus.
**What is identity?: The concept of the self**

McCall and Simmons (1978, p. 65) define identity as “the character and the role that an individual devises for himself as an occupant of a particular social position” (see also Bouij, 2004; Dolloff, 1999; Roberts, 1991). The social position in this study is that of music teacher. Identity itself is a multi-faceted concept and the extensive body of research into the topic is growing. Identity can be conceptualised in relation to various elements: the idea of the self, self-image and self-concepts, reflexivity, and context bound constructions of identity.

Taylor (1989) uses the idea of frameworks for identity construction, the basis of these being morality. The notions of the self and how the self is viewed are the subjects of ongoing debate. According to constructionist theory, in opposition to the idea of a single ‘core’ identity, “people have many identities, each of which is created through interaction with other people” (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 10).

“Self-image” and “self-concept” are the different ways we see ourselves (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 7). “Self concepts” are either context/situation specific (for example, dealing with certain circumstances) or domain-specific (here, music teacher identity). According to McClean (cited in Ferguson 2009, p. 90) “[i]mages of self-as-person and self-as-teacher are critical to the process of becoming a teacher”.

The self is constructed reflexively (Giddens, 1991, p. 3; see also De Nora, 2000). It is a “project” which entails active production over a period of time as well as constant monitoring of behaviour against a socially constructed framework, that is, influential entities around us (De Nora, 2000; Giddens, 1991; MacDonald et al., 2002). The significance and ‘work’ of identity construction is seen in the presentation of the self to others (De Nora, 2000, p. 62; see also Bruner, 1990; Ferguson, 2009; Giddens, 1991; Polkinghorne, 1988).

Experiences, situations and other people we come into contact with have an impact on our self-construction and are a part of the constant reconstruction of that self (MacDonald et al., 2002). Due to the reflexive nature of self-construction, constant comparisons of the self are made against others in order to make sense of the world (especially during childhood). Therefore, learning contexts heavily influence the development of the self during childhood and adolescence, in particular the contexts of family and schooling (MacDonald et al., 2002).
The identity of the ‘teacher’ is an individualised manifestation of personal stories to live by. These stories are shaped by the experiential past and present context in which the teacher identity is constructed (as cited in Clandinin, et al., 2006, p. 112). In relation to music teacher identity, the idea of the self as a music teacher can only be constructed in relation to both a variety of musical experiences and direct contact with people within the field of music teaching (broadly conceived).

**Narrative and experience**

Humans are seen to have a base purpose in life to communicate their experiences and ideas to others in order to make sense of the world around them (Barrett & Stauffer, 2009; Chase, 2000; Clandinin, 2006; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Polkinghorne, 1988; Squire, 2008). Reflection on past experiences, as well as interactions with other people in various contexts, affects the development of the self in the future (MacDonald et al., 2002). Narratives are seen as an organisational framework for reflection in story form to others (Polkinghorne, 1988, p. 13).

The construction of narratives is not a static process. It is ever changing as new experiences are assimilated into the self (De Nora, 2000; Giddens, 1991; Polkinghorne, 1988). Bruner (1990) and Giddens (1991, p. 72) both argue that identity and the self are constructed through coherent autobiographical narratives. These narratives are continuously revised and are filtered through abstract systems such as various life experiences (Giddens, 1991, p. 5). Through reflections on previous experiences, and filtration of new information, a continual process of identity construction is facilitated (Ferguson, 2009, p. 88).

In relation to musical experience and construction of music teacher identity, the understanding of narrative construction allows for pre-service music educators to “stitch their lives together ... through musical memories” (Slobin, 1991, p. 6). Through narrative inquiry, this study seeks to link formative musical experience, music teacher identity construction and the decision to become a classroom music teacher. This line of inquiry is elaborated in Chapter three.
Development of musical identities: ‘musician’ or ‘music educator’

Many studies of pre-service music educators have been conducted worldwide including in Ireland (Stakelum, 2008), the United States (Ferguson, 2009; Hellman, 2008; Kadushin, 1969; Wubbenhorst, 1994), Canada, (Roberts, 1991) and Sweden (Bouij, 1998). The focus of each study has been different but each has investigated the development of music teacher identity and ‘musician’ identity.

Conservatoriums and music colleges (similar to the SCM) have been the focus of many pre-service music educator identity studies (Ferguson, 2009; Kadushin, 1960; Mark, 1998; Roberts, 1991). This may be due to the fact that music education study programmes encourage students to identify with the role of teacher through professional experience-related activities.

A number of studies have found that each musician struggles with the conflict of identifying themselves as either a musician, in the sense of a professional performer, or music educator, such as a classroom teacher (Mark, 1998; Woodford, 2002).

Most musicians spend time in their musical lives working as teachers, which then calls for the need to identify with the process of teaching and, in turn, develop better skills in learning music (Mark, 1998). Formative musical experiences, such as their own primary and high school music learning environments, and teachers become a model here for understanding the processes involved in teaching.

At the time of entrance into tertiary music education courses, students state a high opinion of themselves as performers and claim their right to study music on this basis (Roberts, 1991, p. 34; see also MacDonald et al., 2002). This highlights that many pre-service music educators at the time of entrance to music school (the same as those in the study) have identified themselves as ‘performers’ and ‘musicians’ before teachers.

The social construction of music teacher identity

Family, education, media and social structures heavily influence classification in relation to gender and social class, which in turn, means identity (Giddens, 1991; O’Neill, 2002). Studies into musical identities of children, teachers and performers have dominated the field of musical identity research (Borthwick & Davidson, 2002;
Each individual must grasp his or her own self-image. How we imagine ourselves is how we understand, define and relate to others (Lamont, 2002). As a child develops, they must understand how they themselves exist in a social context, such as school, and also how they develop in relation to others (as discussed earlier).

Taking into account what is known about the construction of the self and identity, this must now relate to music. Self-image is fundamentally linked to the idea of ‘identities in music’ (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 8). Identities in music (IIM) are defined by the roles within music adopted by society and culture. Two categories of distinction of identities in music are generic and specifically founded.

‘Generic’ distinctions are related to broader musical identities. For instance, in the field of professional musician, roles such as performer, composer or teacher are considered to be generic identities. ‘Specific’ distinctions are derived from smaller, special interest groups such as instruments (for example: pianist, vocalist, string player) and musical genres (for example: jazz, classical, pop). Another field of musical identity that is considered is ‘music in identities’ (MII) (MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 14), constituting developing aspects of a person’s identity in relation to gender, youth and cultural background.

Roberts (1991) argues that pre-service music educators identify themselves as ‘musicians’ rather than ‘performers’. The exploration of previous musical experiences gauges how a student became competent as a musician. At the time of entry to tertiary music education training, students have a high self-efficacy in the area of musical skill (MacDonald et al., 2002; Roberts, 1991). Many believe that to be a “competent” music educator, one must be a proficient musician (Roberts, 1991, p.35; see also MacDonald et al., 2002, p. 7). Present in both studies, we see a construction of identity initially through musical skill (at the time of tertiary entry) but also a restructuring of that identity through further study in education. There is currently a lack of research relating to the “production” of skilled musicians and how they came to study music education at a tertiary level.
Musical activities are at the core of self-identities, especially those of professional musicians. According to a study of pre-service music educators by Hargreaves et al. (2007), music education is valued for its “social and extra music personal benefits to the pupil rather than as a foundation for a professional career in music” (cited in Hargreaves & Marshall, 2003, p. 272). Indeed, many student music teachers see themselves above all else as highly qualified musicians and they consider other teaching skills required such as communication and time management to be less relevant.

Personality and identity are also closely related to music teacher identity development (Hargreaves & North, 2008; Kemp, 1996). Musical behaviour is influenced by personality via an interaction with physical and social environments (Hargreaves & North, 2008). Although studies have argued that one must be a good musician before one becomes a teacher (Kadushin, 1969; Mark, 1998; Roberts, 1991) both fields require similar personality traits (Hargreaves & North, 2008; Kemp, 1996; Wubbenhorst, 1994).

The study of social construction of music teacher identity is one of much intricacy. To understand the person who has constructed their identity as a music teacher, they must be investigated through the “unpacking of the social world in which the opportunities and obligations to construct these identities occur” (Roberts, 1991, p. 38). Formative musical experiences are an inseparable part of the “social world” in which pre-service music educators form their music teacher identity.

**Context: Habitus, Australia and beyond**

Bourdieu’s theory of *habitus* provides a framework for social cognition and interpretation (Lee, 1993, p. 31; see also Bourdieu, 1977; Bourdieu, 1993; Tranter, 2006). *Habitus* influences group behaviour and social experience. *Habitus* is a “preconscious, shared set of acquired and embodied dispositions and understandings of the world, developed through both objective structures and personal history” (Tranter, 2006, p. 4).

The term *habitus* finds its origins in the words ‘habit’ or ‘habitual’, meaning an implied tendency to act in a certain way, which has been internalised into our
cognitive structure from a very young age (Bourdieu, 1977). “Habitus describes people’s embodied capacity to assume the attitudes and actions required within particular social fields” (Tranter, 2006, p. 4). It has a direct impact on thinking and evaluation of life experiences in the present and future of an individual.

Habitus directly relates to the idea of ‘cultural capital’, in particular the ‘embodied state’ and the ‘objectified state’. The ‘embodied state’ of cultural capital is in the form of experiences (here, formative musical experiences), which are incorporated in mind and body and accumulated from early childhood. Hargreaves and North (2002) state that the authenticity of a child’s musical experience is determined by the social and institutional context in which they take place. This form of cultural capital “requires the investment of time by parents and others to sensitise the child to cultural distinctions” (Tranter, 2006, p. 3). The ‘objectified state’ is cultural capital in the form of objects such as musical instruments, sheet music, recordings and iconic buildings that represent excellence in musical culture and its transmission (such as the SCM) (Bourdieu, 1993, p. 246).

Habitus and its relationship to music and capital valued by musicians is what determines a person’s success and image within that said domain (Tranter, 2006). In music, Stakelum (2008, p. 3) and Roberts (1991) state that the social and historical context from which a person has emerged and evolved is know as the “cultural field”. In relation to this study, the “cultural field” includes schools, private music tuition, community music learning settings, country of origin, peers, and family settings.

Within Australia, particularly New South Wales, the results of music education initiatives can be gauged through the number of students who graduate from high school to undertake university courses in music education performance and through the high level of community music participation (McPherson & Dunbar-Hall, 2001).

Each individual teacher is a product of their own environment (Hargreaves & North, 2008; Lamont, 2002; Roberts, 1991; Stakelum, 2008) therefore teachers’ schooling and musical experiences, in relation to the Australian syllabus documents and curricula, shape the ways they view music and their experiences in the past. When studying participants for this style of research, it is important to acknowledge the
individual life story and experiences of each participant in relation to the context in which they have assumed their identity (Dolloff, 1999; Hargreaves & North, 2008).

The context in which a child is learning affects the authenticity of an individual’s experience. This is determined by the social and institutional contexts from which this person evolves and develops, whether or not it is in a school music setting (Hargreaves & North, 2008).

**Musical socialisation of pre-service music educators**

Throughout childhood and adolescence, each person will meet people who make different and lasting impressions on them (Borthwick & Davidson, 1999; Bouij, 1998, 2004; Hellman, 2008; Lamont, 2002; Mark, 1998). Childhood and adolescence is a significant period of change and development in life. Teachers have the power to effect changes in the pupils they teach (Stakelum, 2008) and the importance of teachers in a students’ life is understated.

The socialisation of a professional self-concept happens during specific school music attendance (Bouij, 2004; Kadushin, 1969). Many pre-service music educators identified themselves with music teaching roles before the commencement of university studies (Mark, 1998). Tertiary music education programs have been founded to strengthen the professional identities of those that study there (Hellman, 2008).

Specifically, primary socialisation occurs during the primary schooling years of a child’s life, from the age of eight to around twelve years old (Dolloff, 1999; Ferguson, 2009; Hargreaves & North, 2008). It is argued that the musical identity and socialisation of a child becoming a music teacher occurs during high school (Mark, 1998), sometimes as young as eight years old due to a child’s identification of themselves as a musician (Hargreaves & North, 2008).

A child’s affiliation with music and possibly a music career can occur when a child encounters a “crystallising experience” (Freeman, 2000). These experiences occur when a child signals an affinity with some large-scale domain of interest, such as music. This “crystallising experience” may be instigated by a master teacher,
performer, parent, or even contact with a particular instrument (Freeman, 2000, p. 7; see also Stakelum, 2008).

**The influence of the teacher**

The music teacher is the person who controls the context from which an individual derives their musical experiences. The teacher shapes and moulds these learning experiences within a schooling context upon which individuals then develop musical knowledge and ability (Hargreaves et al., 2007; Reimer, 1970). By the time a child has reached entry to a university teaching course they will have experienced at least fifteen thousand hours of face-to-face teaching observation and have become accustomed to the expectations and standards of the teaching profession (Dolloff, 1999, p. 83).

The teacher is extremely influential in both the primary and high school years in shaping the knowledge and experiences of children and in turn those who choose to study music education (Hargreaves & North, 2008; Lamont, 2002; Stakelum, 2008). Many pre-service music educators and qualified music teachers attribute their interest in music teaching to the positive impact of their own former school or private instrumental music teachers (Ferguson, 2009; Hargreaves & North, 2008; Lamont, 2002; Stakelum, 2008).

**Previous experience as a model of teacher identity**

Our experiences help to construct meaning within our lives, including the vocations that we choose to pursue (Woodford, 2002). Identity is socially constructed in the sense that knowledge of self and of others around us is acquired through previous experiences. Appropriate behaviour within a particular social role, such as that of a teacher, is also attained through learning from past events, in particular relating to choice of teaching materials and other elements of classroom learning (Ferguson, 2009; Stakelum, 2008).

Stakelum states that it is “widely recognised that teachers have the power to effect changes in the pupils they teach” (2008, p. 101). When asked to think about self-image as a teacher (Dolloff, 1999), it is common for pre-service music educators to
recall unpleasant teaching experiences from their own teachers. Some build images of teachers who meet their own emotional needs. Here we see previous learning experiences influencing the future construction of music teacher identity.

The influence of parents and family

Parents, family, teachers and others whom an individual identifies with emotionally are the people who make a difference later in life in choosing a career. Whether or not a child’s parents are musicians, the immediate family members play a shaping role in musical development, both children and adults alike (Borthwick & Davidson, 2002, p. 76; see also Bouij, 2004). A child’s musical experience is directly impacted by their parents in terms of resources being available, permission to participate, monetary contribution, and support.

According to Mark (2002) and Borthwick and Davidson (2002), a large proportion of pre-service music educators have grown up in musically active families. Musical beliefs and experiences of a child’s parents are of central importance in shaping the way in which the following generations experience and value music for themselves within the family and in society (Borthwick & Davidson, 2002; Dolloff, 1999).

Some believe that without the impetus of parental music learning, some children may never experience music in the first place (Borthwick & Davidson, 2002; Stakelum, 2008). The inextricable link between parents reliving their own experiences through their child cannot be overlooked. Many parents believe that their own negative or positive affiliations with music play a significant part in their own children’s musical identity (Borthwick & Davidson, 2002, p. 63; see also Stakelum, 2008).

There is a deficit in Australian music education research relating to music teacher identity construction and its relation to formative musical experiences. Harrison (2004) is one of the few extant studies. Although many of the above studies were similar in methodology to this project, the study seeks to build on the body of research and literature on this topic. This qualitative study will provide a detailed insight into the thought processes of pre-service music educators at the SCM – a useful resource for the institution in the future. The methodology used in this research project is outlined in the following chapter.
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

Qualitative methodology

The study falls under the qualitative research paradigm due to the highly personal nature of the study. Qualitative methods attempt to capture and understand individual definitions, descriptions and meanings of events (Burns, 2000, p. 380) The study is heavily reliant on context bound conclusions and it recognises the importance of the experiential “life world” of people (Burns, 2000, p. 11).

The research follows two of the three main characteristics of qualitative research as outlined by Burns (2000). The study has an emphasis on highly contextual descriptions of people and events through the investigation of formative musical experiences. There is also an emphasis on the interpretation of emic issues (issues concerning the participant and their life) and etic issues (issues pertaining to the researcher).

Research design

The research design is in the form of a multi-case study. Due to the personal nature of the research it was decided that narrative inquiry would be used for the research project. Using narrative inquiry (Clandinin, 2006), formative musical experience and music teacher identity construction will be analysed. The aim of this multi-case study is to preserve the uniqueness of each individual case but produce a cross-site conclusion for each inquiry (Bresler, 2006).

Narrative inquiry

Narrative inquiry is an avenue of research allowing for a deeper exploration of the lives and “stories” of different people. Simply expressed, narrative inquiry involves the analysis of the ways people recount their lived experience (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). This research approach often leads to the sense that researcher and participants are collaborators. Narrative inquiry focuses not only on the ‘content’ of the story told but also on how that story is told, including on the particular choice of language and how the moment-by-moment reflective process moves the narrative forward into further, often deeper reflection (Abramo, 2008, p. 96).
It addresses familiar topics and events (Bresler, 2006), in this case formative musical experiences of pre-service music educators and the impact of these on music teacher identity construction. This style of research creates a more accessible and effective means of discourse. It is easier to reflect on personal experience than something that requires deep and detailed research or knowledge in a particular field (Bresler, 2006; Clandinin et al., 2006). This makes it easier for people to participate in the research process. In the same vein, narrative inquiry allows for the celebration of human agency through the telling of life history and personal story (Abramo, 2008, p. 97).

Music is a “multi-sensory experience” involving auditory, kinaesthetic and aesthetic sensitivities (Bresler, 2006, p. 23). These experiences are embedded in the memory of every human and so become integrated with their own narrative of life. Using this method, the researcher helps generate the participant’s narrative through questioning, listening and imagining participants’ musical experiences.

Study through narrative inquiry is based on a particular understanding of the speaker’s self (Abramo, 2008, p. 213). This methodology engages with the idea of constructing the self and understanding one’s own “identity” in this case both a musical and vocational identity.

Narrative delivery, whether it is conveyed through text or aural/oral means, is an ephemeral experience. Through the acknowledgment and conscious construction of narrative, each individual can grow in terms of meaning making, in this case in terms of their philosophies behind choosing music teaching as a career path.

Narrative construction is produced in two ways: descriptive and explanatory narrative (Polkinghorne, 1988). Descriptive narrative is narrative accounts, which are utilised (by individuals and researchers) to organise meaningful events in life (Polkinghorne, 1988, p. 162). Explanatory narratives analyse data in relation to themes that emerge in life and also why certain events happen (Polkinghorne, 1988, p. 177). Although not explicitly identified, both types of narrative are analysed in Chapter four.

By relating and retelling self-constructed personal narratives to another person (in this case the researcher), this research experience acts as a reflection process in the construction of music-teacher identity.
Sample

The sample for this research project comprised fifteen students studying the Bachelor of Music (Music Education) degree at the SCM. The sample was chosen for its diverse range of cultural and musical backgrounds. It provides a broad range of perspectives on the topic, as there are participants from many cultural, socio-economic, schooling and musical backgrounds.

Opportunity sampling was used to choose participants (Burns, 2000; Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2000). The sample was readily available as the researcher was a member of this community and a colleague of the participants. The implications of this are discussed below (semi-structured interviews).

Recruitment process

Participants were chosen from amongst those who expressed an interest to participate and were selected according to the following criteria

- **Musical background** – Principal study at the SCM on an instrument (performance), composition or musicology, participation in orchestras/bands/choirs
- **Cultural background** – students from backgrounds other than Anglo-Australian and also Anglo-Australians themselves
- **Schooling background** – regional, rural and metropolitan schooling experiences with a range of high to low ranging socio-economic backgrounds

Participants were recruited through advertisements (see Appendix B) and class meetings. One class of 30 third year music education students and two classes of about 20 fourth year music education students were approached. From that initial collection of participants, 25 students showed interest. Potential participants were emailed a form to complete. This constituted a small biography in relation to their musical, schooling and cultural background. Musical background information comprised examination results, awards, ensemble experience and instruments played. Schooling background related to the actual school/s attended for primary and high school. Cultural background related to the countries or cultures that the participant may be related to.
Potential participants emailed the form back and were then selected from the above criteria. As there were a variety of responses, fifteen participants were selected for participation.

**Data collection methods**

The main data collection method was semi-structured interviews (Burns, 2000) with the selected sample group. This style of interviewing allows for a more subjective line of questioning according to the answers given by the participant. This allowed the research to delve into more personal areas such as influences of music teachers, parents, culture and musical ability.

**Semi-structured interviews**

Each interview was around 20 to 30 minutes in duration. Each person was interviewed on the questions from the previously constructed interview schedule. Interview questions were related to study at the SCM, parental influence on musical study, childhood musical experiences, school music learning contexts, geographic location and cultural background (see Appendix A). Table 1 below records general participant information and the dates of each interview.

Semi-structured interviews were used because of the highly personal nature of the study. The interview is a chance for the participant to tell their personal stories (Squire, 2008; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). To prevent bias in interviews, the wording of questions was the same for each participant. The sequence of the questioning was not altered, providing reliability in the data (Cohen et al., 2000). With a set protocol of questions written by the researcher (also known as the researcher frame), the interviewee is able to answer these and possibly diverge into unique areas of their own experience to give diversity to the data as well as deflect any issues that may arise with ethics protocol.

The interview’s success is also dependent on the co-operation of each individual interviewee. This style of interviewing is seen as less of a conversation but more a
Table 1 Participant interview information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Date of Interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>29\textsuperscript{th} April, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brett</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>5\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louise</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>8\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtney</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>8\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holly</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>12\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>13\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>15\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>15\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirsty</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>19\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>20\textsuperscript{th} May, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3\textsuperscript{rd} June, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>3\textsuperscript{rd} June, 2009</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
one-way passage of information with the interviewer as an active listener who prompts through questioning. The participant offering answers that they think the interviewer will want to hear may compromise this style of research. Although there was a collegial relationship with the participants, this issue did not arise. Measures were taken to avoid jeopardising the objectivity of the data through following a set protocol for interviewing and meeting in a convenient, mutual place for interviews – the SCM.

**Audio recording**

Throughout each individual interview, the participant was recorded using an audio recording device. Audio recording is another set of ears and is an accurate way to capture one’s own individual perspective of the reality in which they live (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Audio recording monitors everything (bar the visual) and is an unbiased data collection method as it is a machine. As video recording was seen as intrusive on the participant, there was no other method of data collection.

**Data analysis techniques**

The researcher transcribed audio recordings of interviews using open coding (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) and narrative analysis (Barrett & Stauffer, 2009). As mentioned earlier, narrative inquiry involves analysis of narrative data “against a series of frames including those of the research participant, the researcher, and the larger cultural narratives in which these individuals are situated” (Barrett & Stauffer 2009, p. 11; see also Polkinghorne, 1988, p. 13; Squire, 2008, p. 50). The data were coded in relation to five frames of research that arose from the literature and participant responses: individual cultural background, memories of patterns of pedagogy, impressions of music teachers, the cultural and educational status of music and music’s importance within family and social life. Over 60 codes were generated over the five frames. A sixth frame, the researcher frame also arose. This, and the analysis process are discussed in detail in Chapter four.
Ethics

The study observed the ethics protocol set out by the University of Sydney and the standard ethical principles of qualitative research. The nature and aim of the study was made clear to the participants who were consensual on a volunteered basis. Where possible, the identities of participants have been concealed through the use of pseudonyms. Interviews were conducted in a distraction-free environment familiar to both the researcher and participant, the SCM. The comfort and convenience of the participants was paramount in the research process for the gathering of rich data.

Research limitations

The nature of the qualitative research paradigm is the essentially subjective nature of the research. Because of this, it was important to consider various factors that influence the outcomes of the data. It is recognised that “the researcher’s identity, values and beliefs play a role in the production and analysis of qualitative data” (Denscombe, 1998, p. 209), hence the acknowledgement of the researcher frame.

The findings cannot be generalised to the wider population of pre-service music educators as the study had a limited sample. Although the sample is small in scope, the findings are a valuable exploration of the opinions and thought processes of pre-service music educators at a highly esteemed tertiary music education institution and will provide insightful information for further research in the area. These findings are presented in the following chapter.
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS

As stated at the outset, this study examines the relationships between pre-service music educators’ formative musical experiences and their decision to become a classroom music teacher. The literature survey indicated that musical identity construction is at the heart of such a study. Recruited from the same tertiary institution (the SCM, University of Sydney), the fifteen participants in the study nevertheless display considerable diversity in their musical, cultural and schooling backgrounds.

The research design was developed around a comprehensive interview schedule that began by eliciting details regarding the participants’ decision to study at the SCM. Also collected in the interviews were data relating to parental influence on music learning, childhood musical experiences, school music learning contexts, geographical location and cultural background and personal reflections on how these factors influenced the participants’ decision to become a classroom music teacher.

The interview process invited reflection and the participants constructed narratives about their formative musical experiences in relation to questions posed by the researcher (referred to here as the researcher frame, as discussed below). Through coding and analysing the interview data, five additional themes or ‘frames’ emerged, as will become clear in this chapter.

In order to place the findings of the study in context, the chapter begins with a brief description of the participants. These descriptions are based on data collected during the recruitment and interview processes. Subsequently, the first topic discussed is the formative musical experiences of the participants. This is followed by a detailed analysis of participants’ constructed narrative responses to interview questions, which are discussed in relation to musical identity formation and the participants’ decision to become a classroom music teacher.

THE STUDY PARTICIPANTS

Fifteen participants were recruited for interview and all were enrolled in the Bachelor of Music (Music Education) degree programme. Three of these were from the 2009 third year cohort and twelve were from the 2009 fourth year cohort. This sample
group comprised six males and nine females aged between 21 and 23. Table 2 provides details of the participants’ schooling, musical involvement and cultural background. It should be noted that while not all participants are quoted directly in this thesis, data from every case study interview is included in the actual analysis.

As cultural background was a significant factor in the study, it is important to note this representation in the sample. Four participants (three female and one male) were born outside Australia. Six are of Asian descent (five Chinese and one Burmese), one is of Middle Eastern descent and the remaining six are Anglo-Australian.

FORMATIVE MUSICAL EXPERIENCES

As stated in Chapter one, formative musical experiences are previous musical experiences that a participant identifies as being influential in shaping their future involvement with music. Although the interview schedule did not provide for a chronological recollection of these musical experiences, during the interviews all participants elaborated on musical experiences that were influential in their lives. Although some participants recollected negative experiences, the majority of formative musical experiences discussed could be described as positive. The formative musical experiences recalled can be placed in four broad categories and these will be discussed successively: family and home musical interactions; school musical interactions; musical interactions in community settings; private musical tuition.

I. Family and home musical interactions

Interaction with music in the home and with family played a significant role in all participants’ musical upbringing. Although not all of the participants’ parents were accomplished musicians, all had an appreciation of music. The participants acknowledged a wide range of abilities and backgrounds among their parents, and their reflections were often humorous.

Experiences recounted by the participants included the styles of music listened to by their parents, parental musical ability, sibling participation in music and parental
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Musical focus and involvement</th>
<th>Schooling</th>
<th>Cultural background and experience*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
<td>Clarinet, alto saxophone, prestigious bands</td>
<td>K-12 private Catholic boys’ school Northern Sydney</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brett</td>
<td>Vocal major, began late, tenor saxophone</td>
<td>Yrs 3-12 private boys’ school, Sydney</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian, lived in UK in 2004 teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louise</td>
<td>Late starter, saxophone/voice, composition</td>
<td>Various primary schools, private girls’ high school – North Shore</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>Violin – late starter</td>
<td>Various primary schools in West Sydney, Christian high school</td>
<td>Iranian born; moved to Australia in 1994,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>Various schools overseas, Anglican high school South Sydney</td>
<td>Chinese born (Shanghai); moved to Australia in 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris</td>
<td>Saxophone, many bands</td>
<td>Public primary, private co-educational Christian high school North West Sydney</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtney</td>
<td>Piano/flute, rock band</td>
<td>Various North West Sydney primary schools, Christian co-educational high school</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holly</td>
<td>Clarinet, viola, violin</td>
<td>Northern Beaches 2 local public schools</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>Jazz pianist</td>
<td>Public schools, selective high school</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>Various schools overseas, public high school North Sydney</td>
<td>Chinese born, moved to Australia in 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>International schools, public high school West Sydney, Performing Arts high school</td>
<td>Burmese born, Asylum Seeker now Australian citizen (2000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirsty</td>
<td>Piano, trombone, competent conductor</td>
<td>Various South West/West Sydney primary schools, girls’ Catholic high school North Sydney</td>
<td>Chinese ancestry, lived in Australia entire life, speaks dialect of Chinese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>Various schools overseas, private girls’ high school Sydney</td>
<td>Australian-born Chinese, has also lived in Hong Kong and Singapore,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>Bassoon/Flute</td>
<td>Public primary, private co-educational high school Tasmania</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David</td>
<td>Oboe/Piano/Voice/Saxophone</td>
<td>Public primary, private co-educational Christian high school, South West Sydney</td>
<td>Anglo-Australian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Unless otherwise stated, all participants were born in Australia
encouragement to begin learning music. We will briefly consider each of these aspects of family and home musical interaction.

Of the 15 participants, 14 recalled experiencing music intensely before the age of five. This included listening to parents’ favourite music, early childhood music programs, instrumental practice by parents and/or siblings and self-initiated musical activity (such as singing, moving with music and playing with musical toys).

*Styles of music*

The average age of participants in the study was 22 years old. The musical styles that contributed to shaping the musical backgrounds of each participant include popular music from the 1980s (when most of their parents were young adults), church music, jazz, traditional ethnic music and Classical music. Participants were exposed to these musical styles from a very young age and were therefore engaging in listening to that music and identifying with it in a positive manner. For example, one participant fondly recalled:

Sophie: We listened to a lot of mum and dad’s records…there was a lot of 80s glam rock stuff from mum and a lot of punk sort of stuff from dad.

Another recalled her mother’s love of Classical music and how this shaped her musical future:

Holly: My mum really loves classical music and I think she said she was introduced to it at seventeen … and she just fell in love. I think because she feels that she never had the opportunity when growing up to learn a musical instrument that she really wanted to push that on my sister and I.

This reflection highlights how a deficit in parental music learning can be channelled into a child’s experiences.

*Parental musical ability*

This aspect can be further subdivided according to whether parents have musical performance or other skills or whether they do not however demonstrate a strong appreciation for music. Eight participants had musical parents of varying ability ranging from informal music learners or ‘hobby musicians’ to professional instrumentalists.
Parents who were ‘hobby musicians’ played guitar or piano and taught themselves and would often play around the home. One participant, Emily, experienced traditional ethnic music from her own country with her father playing a traditional instrument.

Some participants had parents who were professional singers, pianists and orchestral instrumentalists who would often teach them about music, sometimes formally. In such situations participants were exposed to their parents’ practice habits, which filled homes with music and provided positive models for future musicians to learn from. Those that had not learnt musical instruments themselves were supportive and appreciative of the musical endeavours of their children. Many saw it as a means of self-expression, creativity and also a means of becoming a more well rounded person in the long term.

Paul had a musical mother who played the trombone (and whose own father was a trombonist in an elite orchestra in Canada) but his own father was not a musician. He reflected on how his own developing musical ability brought happiness and appreciation of music to his father:

Paul: Dad never learnt any instruments … I used to call him “primitive” when it comes to music. It was a little joke that we had ... he certainly does appreciate music a lot and he thanks me a lot of the time for opening up the things that he listens to and he enjoys listening to.

Sibling influence on musical interaction

Although not as significant as parental interaction with music, many participants reflected on their musical siblings. Older siblings often played in primary school ensembles, learnt instruments before the participant or studied music intensely. Many served to motivate participants to begin learning music, as in the case of Kirsty who attended her siblings’ piano lessons.

Kirsty: They started learning and I used to go along because they couldn’t find a baby sitter for me. I used to just go with them and sit in the corner and listen to them. I said, “Oh yeah, I really want a lesson” and I finally convinced them [parents].
This was a “chrystallising experience” (Freeman, 2000) for Kirsty. Her siblings’ musical involvement prompted her own determination to learn a musical instrument, which she recalls as a particular ‘moment’ in her imagination.

II. School musical interactions

In addition to home experiences, participants offered in-depth reflections of formative musical experiences connected with their school and schooling. 13 years of formal schooling has shaped their musical identities in significant ways, both as musicians and as pre-service educators. These formative experiences can be grouped as: secondary school classroom musical experiences and school extra curricular program experiences. Primary school experiences were neither recalled nor recounted in any detail. However, many mentioned that primary school provided a foundation for musical technique and future musical endeavours.

High school

All participants studied music throughout their high schooling (Years 7 to 12) and recollections of this time in terms of musical development varied, some being positive, others negative. In some cases reflections on high school experiences conveyed data regarding the dramatic positive impact on their musical development of their classroom music teacher (discussed below).

Apart from the four Asian participants who moved to Australia during their high schooling years (and therefore changed high schools), the remainder of the participants attended the same high school for six years, some even remaining at the same school from Kindergarten. Four participants attended public high schools, the remainder private, many prestigious.

Positive school experiences

Eight participants spoke of positive musical experiences in the high school classroom, all related to the enthusiasm and capability of their classroom teachers. Personality traits such as charismatic, enthusiastic, inspiring and happy were often remarked upon. Mention was also made of actual teaching ability:
Lisa: She got everyone together to strive for something.
Lisa came to Australia from China in 2003. Her experience at a local public high school proved to be influential in her decision to become a music teacher and was cited as a formative musical experience. Her teacher assisted her with many activities and encouraged her musical abilities in piano performance. Her teacher’s ability to create ‘community’ in the classroom has become a memorable part of Lisa’s formative musical experience.

Negative experiences
The remaining participants reflected on negative experiences in their high school music education. Teachers with a narrow range of repertoire for study and those that only taught pre-1900 Western Art Music tended to surface as ‘poor teachers’.
Participants commented on rigid syllabus study, superficial detail about music, poor planning and constant reminders of Higher School Certificate examinations fed into negative images of the teachers of these participants.

Emily: You know: Peter Sculthorpe (laughs). That was it! It was very much, ‘listen to the recording, look at the score and go through the concepts of music’.
Here we find reference to a restricted kind of musical knowledge being taught, therefore acquired by the students. Emily often reflected on her poor music learning in high school and how in her own (projected) future practice she would like to counter that kind of reduced music teaching. From the position as tertiary students in music education these participants were able to critically reflect on the pedagogical practices of their high school teachers and also critique their own formative music experiences.

Extra-curricular programs
Extra-curricular programs often served as an extension of classroom learning or compensated for a deficit in classroom opportunities and experiences. 11 participants were heavily involved in extra-curricular programs at their high schools; the remaining participants were pianists who did not seek out further opportunities for ensemble performance.
Through these programs participants extended their learning about music, improved instrumental technique and gained experience in ensemble performance. As formative musical experience, participants saw such programmes as providing a solid foundation for their own future as a music teacher, as Holly reflects:

Holly: The bands, the school and the extra curricular music activities I did, I think they were leading me up to the decision [to become a music teacher]. Without that foundation … I wouldn’t have been as enthusiastic about music as I am.

Here Holly explains the relationship between her extra-curricular experiences and all of her subsequent interactions with music.

### III. Musical interactions in community settings

Settings other than school and home were also a place for interaction with music. The most common community settings mentioned by participants were places of religious worship, individual cultural community experiences, musical theatre productions with youth theatre companies, community bands or orchestras, tours and festivals relating to these ensembles and Gap Year programmes embarked upon at the conclusion of schooling.

All participants recalled experiences in settings ‘external’ to the home and school as being highlights among their many beneficial formative musical experiences. They enhanced and enriched the lives of each participant and gave them a musical and experiential advantage over other prospective music teachers. A brief discussion of the various ‘community settings’ follows.

**Church**

A significant number of participants had a religious background – specifically, Christian. These participants reflected on how their religious involvement had enhanced their musical experiences in general, as well as how it contributed to their decision to become a music teacher, and hence influenced their formation of a music teacher identity.
Five participants openly discussed their Christian faith in interview, voluntarily reflecting on their experiences within family and church settings in relation to this faith.

David attended a local church not far from his home growing up. He explained that his Christian faith permeates all facets of his life including his choice of a music teaching profession and his musical ability. In relation to his actual musical experience in church, he spoke of singing in the choir and actively being involved in musical accompaniment. In the interview he spoke of how music was a “gift from God” and how his musical ability enabled him to express himself creatively and impart passion and knowledge to others.

David: I think as a Christian, I believe that God puts passion on people’s heart and he calls them and moves them around to different things. So, I feel like I have a real passion and I’ve been given this passion of education and teaching [music].

Emily was of Middle Eastern descent. Her worship experience was divided between a predominantly Anglo-Australian church and a local Middle Eastern church, which incorporated the Christian expression from her country of origin. A great deal of her musical experience came from these settings giving her experience in her own culture’s musical style and Australian Christian music styles. Emily also expressed her belief that music is a “gift from God”:

Emily: I realise the significance of music in who I am as a person. As a gift that has been given to me and how I can use that for a higher purpose [music teaching].

*Individual cultural community experiences*

Five of the 15 participants were born outside Australia. Their migration to Australia occurred for two reasons: either conflict in their home country or seeking an Australian education (two and three participants respectively).

The three participants who migrated for educational reasons were all of a similar Asian background. Musical experiences from within their own cultural community were lacking in their home country. Lucy stated that due to mass classes for music, her own national musical culture was rarely studied, if at all.
Lucy: I didn’t really get a lot of experience actually playing the music or exploring the music [of my] other country.

In contrast, Emily, who migrated to Australia after conflict in her home country, noted that her cultural musical experiences were richer from playing at parties for friends and family from the same background, and through involvement in her Middle Eastern church.

Emily: I would play for my parents’ [Iranian] church every week. So that music was always there in my life.

Hence, we see that cultural background or situation is a factor in the study since it contributes to particular kinds of musical experience and may also be the impetus to seek particular kinds of experience otherwise not available.

**Community ensembles**

Since the participant sample contained a number of multi-instrumentalists, involvement in a range of community bands ensembles was raised, including local community bands and larger elite ensembles such as Australian Youth Orchestra and SBS Orchestra. These pre-service music educators surrounded themselves with as many opportunities as possible.

The positive aspects of involvement in community music ensembles mentioned in interviews included the actual experience of participating in an ensemble, development of specific musical skills such as ensemble awareness and listening skills, as well as socialising opportunities. Band camps, music tours and festivals provided the participants with performance opportunities, which were noted in interviews as being beneficial in their musical identity formation.

**Gap Year programs**

Two participants in the study had completed a Gap Year in the United Kingdom, Louise and Brett. Both of these students attended private, single-sex high schools and sought opportunities to teach in the United Kingdom as a pathway towards future involvement in music education. Brett taught physical education and music in his school and Louise adopted many roles including foreign language teacher, administration roles, sports co-ordinator and creative arts teacher. Both participants commented that these experiences helped build their musical resume.
IV. Private musical tuition

All participants received private tuition for an extended period of time in their life. Although starting ages varied widely from as young as three to around nine years old, all were very experienced in their particular instruments. All participants in the study play more than one instrument (most pianists noted experience in singing in a choir).

Musical instruments studied

Table 3 below highlights the instruments played by each participant in the study. The first instrument in the list is the Principal Study of the participant whilst completing their degree at the SCM. One participant, Louise was a composition major but also an accomplished saxophonist, while Matt was a musicology minor. A majority of the participants noted their ability as a pianist whether at a concert or a hobby level.

All participants except one (Paul) studied Classical music. Interestingly, a pre-requisite for entry to the SCM is attainment of formal examination certificates to at least grade six AMEB (or equivalent). Three participants (Paul, Matt and Brett) gained entry without such certificates, which is discussed below.

Formal music examinations

12 of the 15 participants in the study attained certificates in formal examinations. The majority of the participants studied under the Australian Music Examinations Board (AMEB) syllabus and gained high levels of achievement (including Associate Diplomas) as can be seen in Table 3 below. Reflections upon formative private tuition experiences were mostly positive. Again, as with high school experiences, private tuition reflections were positive or negative in relation to the approach used by the teacher. Many cited their private teacher as being one of the most influential people in their personal music career, yet some did not credit them at all.

As with high school teachers, many referred to the positive personality traits of their private music teachers (and some negative). Enthusiasm, kindness and compassion were often traits described. Their personal abilities and love of music were also
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Instrument/s</th>
<th>Examination Board</th>
<th>Highest Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eric</td>
<td>Clarinet, Alto Saxophone</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>A Mus A (Clarinet)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brett</td>
<td>Vocal, Tenor Saxophone</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louise</td>
<td>Composition Saxophone/Voice</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 6 (Saxophone)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 8 (Violin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucy</td>
<td>Piano, Accordion</td>
<td>Shanghai Conservatorium of Music/AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 10 (Piano), A Mus A (Piano)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris</td>
<td>Alto Saxophone</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 8 (Saxophone)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtney</td>
<td>Piano, Flute/guitar</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 7 (Piano), Grade 5 (Flute)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holly</td>
<td>Clarinet, Viola/Violin</td>
<td>AMEB/Trinity</td>
<td>A Mus A (Clarinet), Grade 5 (Viola), Grade 5 (Violin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul</td>
<td>Jazz Piano</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>The Music Association of Canton</td>
<td>Grade 15 (Piano) – equivalent A Mus A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt</td>
<td>Musicology, Piano</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirsty</td>
<td>Piano, Trombone</td>
<td>ANZCA/AMEB</td>
<td>A Mus A (Piano)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellen</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>Royal School of Music/AMEB</td>
<td>A Mus A (Piano), Grade 8 (Piano)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td>Bassoon, Flute</td>
<td>Trinity</td>
<td>Grade 5 (Bassoon), Grade 8 (Flute)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David</td>
<td>Oboe, Saxophone/Voice/Piano</td>
<td>AMEB</td>
<td>Grade 8 (Oboe), Grade 7 (Piano), Grade 5 (Voice)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
conveyed in responses. Ellen reflected on the piano teacher she studied with upon settling in Australia. This teacher had a significant impact on her decision to become a music teacher but also enhanced her musical experiences by opening up her repertoire and skills.

   Ellen: Every lesson she was really happy to see you and if you played badly you could see she was still enjoying what you were playing so she would be moving along to the music.

Non-examination participants

Although formal examination certificates are a pre-requisite for entry into the SCM, Paul and Brett gained admission without these. Paul was a jazz pianist and Brett a vocal major. While both are accomplished musicians, they reflected in their interviews that during their musical learning, there was no need for them to sit exams. Paul in particular said that his parents believed that examinations would take the “fun out of learning” and make it stressful.

   Paul: Mum and Dad didn’t really want me to [do exams] again for that fun thing … making an examination, you kind of rip the fun out of it … I don’t regret their choices, maybe my technique could be better … I managed to get in here so I can’t be that bad.

Although technique may have suffered, both said that in the long term it has not adversely affected their music careers and both have a more positive outlook on their formative musical experiences in relation to private tuition.
NARRATIVE CONSTRUCTION, MUSICAL IDENTITY, AND BECOMING A CLASSROOM MUSIC TEACHER

The presence of the researcher frame concept is explained as follows. First, the research questions are grounded in the relevant music education literature. The researcher is herself a pre-service music educator studying at the SCM. Second, the interview questions supply a ‘frame’ around which participants can construct their narratives and in turn condition the narratives produced.

Five additional frames were identified in the data from studying the relationship between how the participants constructed narratives in response to the researcher frame. Over 60 codes related to these frames were also identified in the data, however space precludes every one of these from being discussed.

It is important to note that the frames do not generally ‘appear’ or ‘operate’ in isolation. Each frame allows the processing of data in relation to cultural, educational and social considerations more generally. The multiple codes operating within each frame mean that frames often overlap or interact with each other, in some cases suggesting complex causal links between frames, as will be seen.

The five frames are:

- Frame one: Individual cultural background
- Frame two: Memories of patterns of pedagogy
- Frame three: Impressions of music teachers
- Frame four: The cultural and educational status of music
- Frame five: Music’s importance within family and social life

Below is an analysis of how the five frames operate in relation to narrative construction and music teacher identity formation. Generally, only one narrative excerpt of data is able to be included here. The frames are shaded to indicate how they ‘operate’ in a narrative excerpt. Further on in the analysis that follows, frames are graphically depicted (with both shading and boxes) as operating in conjunction with each other.
Frame one: Individual cultural background

Cultural background is an actual ‘site’ of identity. Music is an impetus for grounding one’s own identity, and this can be seen in participant responses. The personal experiences of participants in relation to their home music culture and Australian musical cultures have had a role in their decision to become a music teacher. Instilling passion for music and an interest in cultures other than their own has even driven some participants to further music study. Emily reflected on the music of Iran and how it has contributed to her broader understanding of music:

Emily: Whenever I experienced music, Iranian music, it was always such an expression, like mournful music and like it’s really nostalgic. It might remind you of a particular thing. It expressed so much so clearly.

Below is an example of an international student’s decision-making reasoning in relation to parental advice. Lucy is from a Chinese background, having grown up in her home country and moved to Australia to begin Year 10. She narrates the traditional view of careers for girls in her country:

Lucy: I got two offers for Uni. One was commerce and one was music education…they [my parents] agree music suits me better…Traditional [Chinese] view about what kind of career is better for girls. They think if you are a girl you will have a family later, then your major role will be raising a child…music teacher means more time to spend with the family.

Lucy’s cultural background has significantly influenced her career choice. Her university offers were very different to each other, one being business-related (which she later in the interview explained would bring her more earning power) but music teaching, she explains, would be more suitable as a career for a female in her society. Not only is her cultural background shaping her decision – we also see that she relies on her parents for advice regarding career path. Her parents value music as a means for a woman to assume the conventional role of mother in a family, which points Lucy in the direction of preparing for a music teaching career.

A number of the Chinese participants explained how they were guided by particular cultural norms regarding what would be considered a worthwhile career in their home society, particularly for a woman. Although Australian born and resident in
Australia for her entire life, Kirsty commented on her struggle with her Chinese parents to begin learning music and choosing to study music education:

Kirsty: The whole family dream of having doctor children … it really was a struggle. I had to sort of convince them that I was going to do well in it … music wasn’t a profession.

As can be seen in these examples and also in the narrative constructions above, individual cultural background has played a significant role in the music teacher identity formation of these participants.

**Frame two: Memories of patterns of pedagogy**

Narratives constructed according to this frame encompass themes of pedagogical methods employed by school and private music teachers, learning venues, formal examinations, impacts of tertiary training and significant factors influencing pedagogical practice. Memories of patterns of pedagogy have been influential for two reasons. Firstly, the responses were cast either positively or negatively. The participants who reflected on positive memories of pedagogy said they were likely to emulate these positive teaching models. Those with negative experiences were motivated to avoid poor teaching practices and imposing these on their students, and these experiences themselves have been the impetus for their decision to become a music teacher. Here is one such memory of a music teacher from a participant:

David: He was a joke … in hindsight he gave me the motivation to be better than him … I was always trying to outdo him.

Secondly, memories of pedagogy are vividly imprinted on the memories of these participants. By critically reflecting on these formative experiences, participants develop their own unique music teacher identities using and discarding whatever information they have acquired to develop a stronger identity for their music teacher careers. Consider the following narrative excerpts, for example:

Chris: Some things you know I’ve been wanting to correct because I don’t agree with what I’ve been taught, but others I really want to reflect and build on what they’ve taught me as far as teaching is concerned.

Courtney: I think you teach the way you were taught – at least you know you could change the way you teach, but they have modelled greatly how I will be able to teach in the future.
Reflections on pedagogy can also be closely related to the impressions that music teachers leave on students. Emily reflects throughout her interview on a poor high school music teacher who, as a frame of reference, has significantly contributed to the formation of her music teacher identity. Here she narrates how influential aspects of her tertiary training shape her decision to become a music teacher. She includes reference to her secondary school teacher-model.

Emily: **Practical experience** was definitely a significant factor in my increasingly positive attitude towards music teaching. Although I was learning the facts of teaching, I didn’t understand what it meant to be a teacher until I had the opportunity to do so. So I have to say that my high school prac, more than any study at uni, impacted my decision to one day become a music teacher. Having said that, it also made me realise just how much work it takes to be an effective teacher who creates music experiences with relevance for the students. I’m determined that if and when I teach, I will be such a teacher, as I know first hand what it is to have a [high school] teacher who is the complete opposite!

As Emily narrates, the process of identity construction can be observed as emerging. She links practical experiences from tertiary education to memories of high school musical pedagogy, signalling how several factors co-operate in identity construction.

**Frame three: Impressions of music teachers**

By reflecting on pedagogical practices of former teachers, participants are also reflecting on the impression those teachers have left on them. These teachers include private instrumental teachers, band leaders/conductors and mainly high school music teachers. As with memories of pedagogy, participants reflected on their music teachers in both positive and negative ways. In relation to the formation of music teacher identity, eight participants reflected positively on their high school music teachers and the remaining seven, negatively. Brett, for example, reflected on how his music teacher had positively shaped his thinking regarding his future musical career through his work with him.

Brett: I think Mr Barnes had a big role in my singing life … he worked heavily with me on singing … I really fell in love with singing.

Brett was encouraged by his high school music teacher to sing which ultimately led him to undertake vocal training at the SCM. His teacher served as a model in the
development of his music teacher identity. In the following excerpt, he casts his thought in the form of reported speech:

**Brett:** I had a good music teacher which I thought, “I want to be like him,” ‘cos he was that good; it was like that. I thought, “Geez, I want to be that”.

This indicates an acknowledgement of the self, which is important in subconscious identity formation. Acknowledging that he processed the impression at the time, he relates his ‘self’ to a teacher-model and identifies with the model positively, thus demonstrating music teacher identity construction at work.

Here is another positive impression of a music teacher, this time a female band director:

**Kirsty:** My band director… she had an education degree as well, so talking to her made me think, “Oh yeah, this is what I really wanna do”… you know, like take a band in the school but also be qualified to teach in the classroom.

Here, as elsewhere in the data presented, the pre-service music educators participating in the study model themselves on teachers of the same sex as themselves. Kirsty narrates the origin of her desire to both conduct a school band program and qualify as a classroom music teacher. Her music teacher identity is being constructed in relation to a band director model. She also reflects her thinking process in the form of reported speech, clearly indicating how, during her high school music training, like Brett, Kirsty was already constructing her future music teacher identity.

Another kind of narrative construction in relation to the over-arching frame is indicated in the following excerpt, while recalling a negative memory of pedagogy:

**Emily:** But it was always just, “Okay, compose this,” and [I] just felt so like, “Where do I start? What do I do?” So it was never enjoyable for me.

As above, reported speech is used by Emily, but here in the form of quoting the music teacher then recalling her own thinking. Emily recalls the pedagogical approach of the teacher (a memory of a pattern of pedagogy) however in the form of a lasting negative impression. Emily’s feelings of confusion at the time are conveyed through a rhetorical question. In this example the frames clearly interact with each other to form links between frames and in turn, codes.
Chris had five saxophone teachers over a period of five years. He relayed stories about each of them in chronological order. For each he constructed narrative scenarios to convey information about the personality of each teacher. In this example he speaks of his third teacher who bullied him during his lessons:

Chris: The third teacher I had, she was really tough and pretty cynical. You know, you’d get a scale wrong in front of her and she’d be like, “Well, did you actually do any practice this week?”

Experiencing such negative interactions with a music teacher clearly left an impression on this participant, contributing to how he views music teachers and hence suggesting how in response he is constructing his own music teacher identity. Again, in this example, Chris recalls a memory of pedagogy, indicating how the frames interact with each other.

**Frame four: The cultural and educational status of music**

This frame addresses arising themes such as the status of classroom music in Australia and other countries, the status of private tuition and teachers, negative and positive opinions of Australian music teachers and also the status of the SCM as a music-training institution.

From the data, it was apparent that participants highly regarded the subject of music – whether it was related to teaching specifically or in general life. Opinion of the subject itself is highly influential in their decision to teach it in the classroom.

Through reflection on opinions of music teaching as a profession, participants assessed their prior knowledge and understanding of their future profession in relation to their formative music experiences and also social experiences of teaching. A clear distinction between positive and negative opinions was apparent in this frame.

In relation to other cultures, the data showed that in China, music was not a serious subject and only detracted from academic study. In Iran, music is highly valued in society and therefore becoming a music teacher is respected. In Burma, although not paid very well, teachers command a high degree of respect as highlighted in the narrative excerpt below.
Matt: In the professional field they are valued … put against god … they believe that teachers and parents, you have to give them respect, same as their god.

This is in contrast to Chris’ opinion of respect for music teachers in the Western Sydney region:

Chris: From my experience and what I’ve heard, the further west you go the less teachers are respected.

This narrative excerpt communicates a mixed (positive and negative) view of the status of music:

Kirsty: Teaching is a thing you do if you can’t get a good enough UAI… but people don’t think any less of them [teachers]. They respect their job because you know our education system compared to other countries is really good.

This participant believes teaching has low status but this is offset somewhat by the relatively high standard of Australian education. The excerpt indicates how the participant rationalises her enrolment in a pre-service music education degree and hence constructs her own music teacher identity.

Here is an opinion of the music education degree from within the SCM, which turns into a generalised personal opinion of teaching in society:

Holly: I feel performance students look down on the education side of things and a lot of people reflect on teaching in general – they say that thing … “Those that can’t do, teach”.

Holly recites the colloquial phrase “those that can’t do, teach,” which often arose in the participants’ narratives. The prevalence of this notion in participant responses across the sample suggests low self-efficacy in the area of performance among pre-service music educators at the SCM. Despite the performance-related accomplishments of the participants and noted high self-efficacy in music at the commencement of tertiary study, this suggests the presence of a significant element of self-doubt in the area of musical performance skills among pre-service music educators, which in specific ways may be part of the unspoken culture of the institution itself (further research could consider this notion). Among the study’s participants at least, the perception was prevalent that at the SCM the pre-service music education degree is valued less highly than the performance degree.
Many participants were drawn to study at the SCM because of the prestige of the institution, highlighting the presence of Bourdieu’s notion of *habitus* in the decision making process. The SCM serves as an ‘image’ of status and recognition in the music education world. All participants remarked that it was the best place for the study of music and to become a music teacher. Lucy in particular commented on the building itself being “impressive” and that studying there would be highly regarded back in her home country.

Lucy: I think the building, the first impression it’s really good. And then sort of you know learning music in a Western country was also impressive.

Participants also remarked on how their music teachers’ thought that the SCM was the best place to study due to their own prior affiliation with or knowledge of the University.

David: I grew up in south western Sydney and there was this kind of aura about the Con, that it was you know, the place to go … I guess I studied Music Ed because I want to be a teacher and you get a badge when you leave Sydney Uni.

Here we see how teachers themselves can be influential on the musical identities of their students. Instilling the idea of “cultural capital”, an essential part of *habitus*, in their students, they have built an image of the SCM as a positive and impressive place to study.

**Frame five: Music’s importance within family and social life**

It was apparent from the data that parents had a significant influence on their child’s decision to become a music teacher and subsequently have been influential in the construction of their music teacher identity. The ways and extent to which participants’ parents value music (both positive and negative) have created strong and lasting impressions and contributed significantly to their decision to become a music teacher.

In this narrative music teaching is projected by the parent as being socially beneficial, as constituting a kind of service to society (it also indicates that music is seen as a pursuit that is ‘unacademic’, one particular cultural view of music):
Courtney: Mum really encouraged me to be a teacher … especially music teaching because it’s an area where you can really care for the kids because they don’t often excel in other areas, but music is something you can help those kids that aren’t quite academic, really kind of blossom.

In contrast, Kirsty’s parents did not value music as a field of study:

Kirsty: my parents didn’t want me to do music at all … it really affected that way I thought about it because fifty percent of me was like, you know, “Totally doing it because damn I’m going to prove you wrong!”

This participant resolved to study music to prove something to her parents, almost as a form of rebellion. The participant once again projects her thoughts at the time as reported speech, acknowledging the self, indicating that she has critically reflected on her own construction of music teacher identity. Her determination to become a music teacher was initially motivated by this challenge to her parents’ cultural viewpoint. This was not the only factor that affected her music teacher identity construction, as she acknowledges, however it did play a major role.

Positive early experiences within the home have impacted all participants’ future identities in music in relation to musical taste, commitment to their study and becoming a teacher.

The data realised that positive parental/familial interactions with music in the younger stages of life can be influential on future musical participation. Although, at times, negative responses were recorded, positive parental encouragement, funding and love of music were prominent factors in the musical identities of these pre-service music educators.

A broad range of familial musical experience was recorded. Some participants had no musicians in the family whereas others came from a highly musical background. Despite these varying relations to music within the home, all parents encouraged music itself as a suitable recreational activity at the very least.

Early experiences with music in the home were all positive. Only two participants mentioned that they were ‘forced’ into musical study (Ellen and Lucy). Lucy reflected on the reasons behind her mother beginning her piano tuition.

Lucy: When I was little my mum forced me to learn the piano … she just thought if you can play the piano you can enjoy music and then you know make your life a little more colourful.
Although ‘forced’ is a negative word, we can see that Lucy’s mother had positive intentions for her daughter’s musical learning. Many participants started musical training at a very early age and so at times it would be only natural that parents needed to be prominent in the musical practice or instigation of musical study with their children.

Many parents instilled in their children a love of music but also the idea that teaching music would be a stable career path that would support a flowing income. Matt recalls how his mother advised him:

Matt: [Mum] said it’s better to do education so that you can have a secure job.

Here, music is perceived by Matt’s mother as offering job security, important to someone such as Matt and his family who moved to Australia seeking political and social stability.
CHAPTER FIVE: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

This study set out to explore, through narrative inquiry, the relationships between formative musical experiences, musical identity and pre-service music educators’ decisions to become a classroom music teacher. It investigated the perceptions of 15 pre-service music educators at the SCM regarding their formative musical experiences prior to commencing tertiary study, as well how these formative experiences have shaped their music teacher identity.

The research design was a series of qualitative, narrative inquiry-based case studies of 15 participants from the 2009 third and fourth year cohorts of the Bachelor of Music (Music Education) programme at the SCM. Prospective participants were asked to briefly describe their musical, schooling and cultural backgrounds. Ultimately, all who expressed interest participated. Interviews were conducted individually.

Summary of findings

The findings of the study established that the most influential factors on formative musical experience, music teacher identity formation and the influence of these on the decision to become a classroom music teacher were: individual cultural background; memories of patterns of pedagogy; impressions of music teachers; the cultural and educational status of music; and music’s importance within family and social life.

Formative musical experiences of pre-service music educators

In this study, the 15 participants recounted a wealth of musical experience. All participants identified that they were accomplished on one musical instrument (or voice), with many declaring proficiency on several. Similarly, the varied schooling backgrounds meant that a breadth of experiences was recalled. Regardless of the range of socio-economic backgrounds and schooling types (public, private, religious), many participants had access to similar performance and musical opportunities, no matter where they lived. On the other hand, classroom experiences differed, being significantly affected by the music teacher and how they taught rather than the school itself.
Influential factors influencing construction of music teacher identity

Previous research indicates that pre-service music educators credit their positive music teacher identity to their high school teachers (Hargreaves & North, 2008; Lamont, 2002; Stakelum, 2008). Two influential figures were noted as being important to music teacher identity formation: music teachers and parents. All participants noted that both parents and music teachers (high school teachers and private instrumental teachers) were the most influential on their decision to become a music teacher. This finding is supported by the literature (see MacDonald et al., 2002).

Institutions from which the participants matriculated were also influential on their music teacher identity construction. Many participants reflected on positive and negative school experiences in their memories of patterns of pedagogy and impressions of their music teachers (high school teachers as well as private instrumental teachers).

Symbolically, the institution of the SCM was itself another factor influencing music teacher identity construction. The operation of Bourdieu’s theory of habitus (Bourdieu, 1993; Tranter, 2006) was evident in participants’ narrative responses, many stating that their reasons for studying at the Conservatorium included the prestige of the institution as well as the idea of being a student there. Additionally, the Sydney Conservatorium of Music featured symbolically in many of the of the participants’ own music teachers’ musical identity formation, and these teachers strongly recommended the institution as a place of study.

Musical identity

High self-efficacy in the area of musical ability at the time of admittance to the SCM was noted by participants as being among their formative musical experiences (see MacDonald et al., 2002) in the context of statements relating to domain specific self-concepts and self-efficacy in music. This self-efficacy lessened as participants progressed through the degree, many citing as reasons the negative image of teachers in society and the image of education students within the SCM itself.
Educational implications

Since music teachers provide modelling for the future musical identity formation of their students, it is important for pre-service music educators’ to reflect on their own formative musical experiences in order to better understand their identity as well as what parts of that identity they will consciously model for their future students. This study concurs with the literature regarding the notion that music teachers and other factors including parents and schooling have a significant influence on identity formation.

The study also establishes that cultural background can play a significant role in the musical identity formation of pre-service educators. The context in which one learns, where one grows up and where one lives shapes one’s actions, especially relating to music (Roberts, 1991). In particular, this study highlights that participants who reside in Australia (yet are from a non Anglo-Australian cultural background) are significantly conditioned by both the values of their home culture and the values of Anglo-Australian society. Significant differences in relation to career choice were evident in the narrative data.

Suggestions for future research

There is much room for further research on this topic. Future research could profitably concentrate on pre-service educators’ cultural backgrounds and how these more specifically shape music teacher identity formation. Comparable studies could be conducted in other institutions in Sydney, in other States, and around the world, to consider the identity construction of pre-service music educators more broadly.

More specifically, this research could be consulted by the SCM to better understand and cater for the emerging needs of students during this formative stage in their lives and to assist in future planning of the music education degree programme. It could also be used in the development of strategies for recruiting international students to the music education programme.
Conclusion

This study contributes to the broader literature and research in the fields of music teacher identity formation and narrative inquiry in music education. It supports the notion that music teacher identity is significantly affected by formative music experiences and the shaping of identity in relation to these experiences significantly contributes to one’s decision to become a music teacher. The study also supports the findings that parents and music teachers have the greatest influence on pre-service educators’ decision to become a music teacher.
REFERENCES


new handbook of research on music teaching and learning (pp. 675–694).
Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wubbenhorst, J. (1994). Personality characteristics of music educators and
APPENDICES
APPENDIX A: INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

Introductory questions

1. Name.
2. Gender.
3. How old are you?
4. What instruments do you play?

Studying at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music

5. Why did you decide to study music education at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music?
6. Before beginning university, did you have any teaching roles? If so what were they?
7. Do you plan to continue teaching after your degree is completed? Why or why not?
8. In what ways have the last three/four years of tertiary music education impacted your decision to become a classroom music teacher?

Parental influence on decision to study music

9. Have your parents ever studied music? If so, what instruments, how long and to what extent?
10. How did this impact on your decision to become a music teacher?
11. Did your parents have an influence on you choosing to become a music teacher? If so, how and why?

Style of music learning – formative experiences during childhood

12. What were your musical experiences at home?
13. When did you first begin learning music?
14. Was this formal or informal? (Early childhood music groups, formal music lessons, self taught, traditional methods?)
15. Did you ever sit for any formal music examinations such as AMEB? If so, on what instruments and to what grade?
16. Do you think that AMEB exams made a difference in you choosing to become a teacher? If so, why or why not?
Style of music learning – school music learning context

17. Where did you go to school?
18. What impact did your school music learning experiences have on your decision to become a music teacher?
19. a) Describe your school music teachers.
   b) What teaching methods did they use? What was their approach to teaching?
   c) Do you believe they had a significant impact on you choosing to become a music teacher? If so, how and why?

Geographic location and context

20. Were you or your parents born in a country other than Australia? If so, where?
21. How did the traditional or cultural differences in music learning have an impact your own music learning?
22. How is the vocation of music teaching seen in your country/culture?
23. Where did you live while growing up? What area?
   (Rural/regional/metropolitan)
24. Do you believe where you lived had an impact on your school music learning? Why or why not?

Personal opinion of influence and extent of formative musical experiences impact

25. Do you believe that your formative musical experiences have had an impact on your choosing to study music education? If so, how? Why/Why not?
APPENDIX B: PARTICIPANT RECRUITMENT NOTICE

ARE YOU A MUSIC EDUCATION STUDENT?

Dominique Anderson is conducting an Honours research project on music education students at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music.

The project is investigating the previous musical experiences of student teachers and how these experiences have influenced the decision to become a music teacher.

What is involved?

A variety of students will be selected for interview on the following criteria:

→ Musical background
→ Cultural background
→ Schooling background

The interview will last about forty-five minutes and will include questions about previous musical experiences at home, at school and in community settings.

If you are interested please contact Dominique Anderson via email: dand0163@usyd.edu.au
APPENDIX C: PARTICIPANT INFORMATION STATEMENT

PARTICIPANT INFORMATION STATEMENT
Research Project

Title: A multi-case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher.

(1) What is the study about?

This is a multi-case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on an individual’s decision to become a classroom music teacher. This study will investigate the previous musical experiences that many music teacher education students have encountered in their lives as young musicians and to what extent these experiences have influenced their decision to become classroom music teachers.

(2) Who is carrying out the study?

The study is being conducted by Dominique Anderson and will form the basis for the degree of Bachelor of Music (Music Education) (Honours) at The University of Sydney under the supervision of Associate Professor Kathryn Marsh, Chair of Music Education, Sydney Conservatorium of Music.

(3) What does the study involve?

The study will involve the audio recording of semi-structured interviews with participants. The results will be compiled and recorded in the form of narrative case studies for each participant.

(4) How much time will the study take?

Each participant will be interviewed for forty-five minutes at a mutually convenient time and place in the Sydney Conservatorium of Music.

A multi case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher

Version [Three Thursday 18th December, 2008]
(5) Can I withdraw from the study?

Being in this study is completely voluntary - you are not under any obligation to consent and - if you do consent - you can withdraw at any time without affecting your relationship with the University of Sydney or the researcher.

You may stop the interview at any time if you do not wish to continue. The audio recording will be erased and the information provided will not be included in the study.

(6) Will anyone else know the results?

All aspects of the study will be strictly confidential and only the researcher and her supervisor will have access to information on participants. Pseudonyms will be used to protect the privacy of the participants in any published results, including the Honours thesis.

(7) Will the study benefit me?

The benefits of participating in this study are as follows.

It will provide you with the opportunity to:

a) Understand your own philosophy as to why you decided to become a music teacher;

b) reflect on your own past experiences and how these may influence your teaching and in turn may improve your own methods.

(8) Can I tell other people about the study?

Yes, you may.

(9) What if I require further information?

When you have read this information, Dominique Anderson will discuss it with you further and answer any questions you may have. If you would like to know more at any stage, please feel free to contact Dominique Anderson (0405 317 906) or Associate Professor Kathryn Marsh, Chair of Music Education (9351 1333).

(10) What if I have a complaint or concerns?

Any person with concerns or complaints about the conduct of a research study can contact the Senior Ethics Officer, Ethics Administration, University of Sydney on (02) 9351 4811 (Telephone); (02) 9351 6706 (Facsimile) or gbriody@usyd.edu.au (Email).

This information sheet is for you to keep

A multi case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher

Version [Three Thursday 18th December, 2008]
APPENDIX D: PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

1. [PRINT NAME], give consent to my participation in the research project

TITLE: A multi-case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher.

In giving my consent I acknowledge that:

1. The procedures required for the project and the time involved have been explained to me, and any questions I have about the project have been answered to my satisfaction.

2. I have read the Participant Information Statement and have been given the opportunity to discuss the information and my involvement in the project with the researcher/s.

3. I understand that I can withdraw from the study at any time, without affecting my relationship with the researcher(s) or the University of Sydney now or in the future.

4. I understand that my involvement is strictly confidential and no information about me will be used in any way that reveals my identity.

5. I understand that being in this study is completely voluntary – I am not under any obligation to consent.

6. I understand that I can stop the interview at any time if I do not wish to continue, the audio recording will be erased and the information provided will not be included in the study.

A multi case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher

Version [Two Friday 14th November, 2008]
7. I consent to: –

i) Audio-taping
   YES ☐ NO ☐

ii) Receiving Feedback
    YES ☐ NO ☐

   If you answered YES to the “Receiving Feedback Question (ii)”, please provide your details i.e. mailing address, email address.

**Feedback Option**

- Address: ____________________________________________________________
- ____________________________________________________________

- Email: ____________________________________________________________

Signed: ............................................................................................................

Name: ..............................................................................................................

Date: ..............................................................................................................

A multi case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher

Version [Two Friday 14th November, 2008]
APPENDIX E: UNIVERSITY OF SYDNEY HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE - LETTER OF APPROVAL

The University of Sydney

Human Research Ethics Committee
Web: http://www.usyd.edu.au/ethics/human

ABN 15 211 513 464

Gail Briody
Manager
Office of Ethics Administration

Marietta Coutinho
Deputy Manager
Human Research Ethics Administration

Telephone: +61 2 8627 8175
Facsimile: +61 2 8627 8180
Email: g briody@usyd.edu.au

Telephone: +61 2 8627 8176
Facsimile: +61 2 8627 8177
Email: mcoutinho@usyd.edu.au

Mailing Address:
Level 6
Jane Foss Russell Building – G02
The University of Sydney
NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA

Ref: DC/2009/11460

18 March 2009

Associate Professor K Marsh
Sydney Conservatorium of Music
C41
The University of Sydney

Dear Professor Marsh

Thank you for your correspondence received 18 February 2009 addressing comments made to you by the Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC). After considering the additional information, the Executive Committee at its meeting on 5 March 2009 approved your protocol entitled "A multi-case study of the influence of formative musical experiences on the decision to become a classroom music teacher".

Details of the approval are as follows:

Ref No.: 03-2009/11460
Approval Period: March 2009 to March 2010
Authorised Personnel: Associate Professor K Marsh
Ms D Anderson

The HREC is a fully constituted Ethics Committee in accordance with the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Research Involving Humans-March 2007 under Section 5.1.29

The approval of this project is conditional upon your continuing compliance with the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Research Involving Humans. We draw to your attention the requirement that a report on this research must be submitted every 12 months from the date of the approval or on completion of the project, whichever occurs first. Failure to submit reports will result in withdrawal of consent for the project to proceed.
Chief Investigator / Supervisor’s responsibilities to ensure that:

(1) All serious and unexpected adverse events should be reported to the HREC as soon as possible.

(2) All unforeseen events that might affect continued ethical acceptability of the project should be reported to the HREC as soon as possible.

(3) The HREC must be notified as soon as possible of any changes to the protocol. All changes must be approved by the HREC before continuation of the research project. These include:-

- If any of the investigators change or leave the University.
- Any changes to the Participant Information Statement and/or Consent Form.

(4) All research participants are to be provided with a Participant Information Statement and Consent Form, unless otherwise agreed by the Committee. The Participant Information Statement and Consent Form are to be on University of Sydney letterhead and include the full title of the research project and telephone contacts for the researchers, unless otherwise agreed by the Committee and the following statement must appear on the bottom of the Participant Information Statement. Any person with concerns or complaints about the conduct of a research study can contact the Manager, Ethics Administration, University of Sydney, on (02) 8627 8175 (Telephone); (02) 8627 8180 (Facsimile) or gbriody@usyd.edu.au (Email).

(5) Copies of all signed Consent Forms must be retained and made available to the HREC on request.

(6) It is your responsibility to provide a copy of this letter to any internal/external granting agencies if requested.

(7) The HREC approval is valid for four (4) years from the Approval Period stated in this letter. Investigators are requested to submit a progress report annually.

(8) A report and a copy of any published material should be provided at the completion of the Project.

Yours sincerely

Professor D I Cook
Chairman
Human Research Ethics Committee

Cc: Ms Dominique Anderson; Email: dand0163@usyd.edu.au
Encl: Approved Participant Information Statement
       Approved Advertisement
       Approved Participant Consent Form
       Approved Interview Schedule