MARGARET ESTELLE BARNES AND ANNIE PRAED, Australia’s first women graduates in dentistry: twentieth century femininity and professionalism in dentistry.

Z. J. COMINO CERNY

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Dentistry
University of Sydney,
2000.
ABSTRACT

In 1906 two women, Margaret Estelle Barnes and Annie Praed, were amongst a group of thirteen graduands to be awarded the inaugural Bachelor of Dental Surgery degree at the University of Sydney. This moment was pivotal for women and their relationship with the dental profession in New South Wales. This thesis explores the ways in which personal and political factors in Barnes’ and Praed’s families, school and societal backgrounds interacted in a complex way to shape their careers in dentistry and their occupational choices and life choices after graduation. The context of examination has been to supplement more traditional forms of research data derived from written primary and secondary sources with the evidence of oral history testaments and interviews: a major contribution being received from a number of women dentists. In the process of probing gender relations within the institutions of family, school, university, profession and society, the complex nature of the meanings of femininity across these contexts has been explored and analysed to reveal how women dentists negotiate the tensions that arise from the meanings attached to a professional identity within a scientific, and therefore a masculine dental profession and societal notions of femininity. Placing Barnes and Praed at the centre of the inquiry illustrates the complexity of gender relations formed within a restricted occupational group. This has implications for women in dentistry.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis is the result of the efforts and generosity of a great number of people.

I have been fortunate in having two excellent supervisors. I am grateful to Associate Professor Peter Barnard, Faculty of Dentistry (University of Sydney), for his enthusiasm and support for the project. I shall be forever grateful for the good fortune of knowing Professor John Ramsland, Dean of Arts and Social Science (University of Newcastle), whose gentle but firm guidance and scholarly criticism gave me courage to put words on paper. Under this guidance I discovered another world, full of challenge and wonder.

In my journeys through archival repositories I have met wonderful and enthusiastic individuals. I would like to thank the archivists and library staff of the following institutions: Abbotsleigh Girls' High School Archives, Anglican Archives of Sydney, the Australian Dental Association, the Mitchell Library, the University of Newcastle Archives, the University of Sydney Archives, the New South Wales State Archives, the Society of Australian Genealogists, the City of Sydney Archives, St. Jude's Anglican Church, Randwick, Jessie Street Library; Sydney Girls' High School Archives, National Archives of South Africa, War Memorial Archives, the Local History Section of the Newcastle City Library, the Local History Section of the
Woollahra Library, the University of Newcastle, the University of Sydney, the Willoughby City Library, and the Royal College of Physicians. I would like to pay tribute to certain individuals, from some of these institutions, who accompanied me along the journey: Gael Orchard and Jenny Sloggett, Local History Section of Newcastle City Library, who expanded my inquiries into new territories; Gael Ringuet of the New South Wales branch of the Australian Dental Association, who responded to my enquiries with kindness and profession assistance; Rosemary Block, Curator of Oral History at the State Library of New South Wales, who nurtured my interviewing technique and knowledge of oral history; Stephen Barlow and Peter Chadwick of the NSW Lands Titles Office, who tirelessly traced records.

I am also grateful to the members of a number of institutions and historical societies who shared my passion and assisted beyond all expectations. They include: The Rev. Dr Bill Lawton, St. John’s Anglican Church Darlinghurst; Joseph Waugh, Randwick Historical Society Inc.; L. Crocker, Granville Historical Society Inc.; Helen Malcher, Ku-ring-gai Historical Society Inc.; Dr Lorna McDonald, Rockhampton and District Historical Society Inc.; Annette Weckert, Jan Cameron and Betty Pinderton, Scone and Upper Hunter Historical Society Inc.; and three very special tributes to Heather Harwood, Barnardo’s Australia; Norma Smith, Burwood and Drummoyne Family History Group and Marie McCulloch, Queensland Family History Society.

Individuals too became enmeshed in my quest. Among them the Dix family of Kandos and Sylvia Tupper (Praed Family history) deserve special mention.
Professional advice and assistance was warmly given by Robyn Stevenson, Pepperina's Bookshop Newcastle; Emeritus Professor Godfrey Tanner, University of Newcastle; Father Peter Brock and Alexis Antonia. With cartoonist Judy Horacek whose work I admire tremendously, I developed a conversation through correspondence. Researchers from the University of Newcastle, Jo May, Alison Holbrook and Grant Rodwell, shared their knowledge in the spirit of co-operation and scholarly pursuit. In their writing course, two exceptional authors, Drusilla Modjeska and Barbara Brooks, illuminated the need for revolving perspectives in writing about women's lives. And author Patricia Clarke, who is writing about Rosa Praed, responded so generously to all my enquiries. My supervisors' staff, Eileen O'Donohue, Jenny Smith, Maria Tingey and Joan Tasker, were always welcoming and helpful. Scott Jones regularly salvaged my sanity with his computer skills.

I would like to thank the people who permitted me to use material outside the established repositories. George Franki and Jamie Robinson willingly shared their research in dental history. Lindall Scott and her brother Michael Abbott gave me Linda Littlejohn's (their mother) letters. I owe a special debt to Professor Sydney Levine and Doreen Musgrave who generously gave me Doreen's excellent 1960s research on women dentists. Doreen deserves recognition for her foresight in seeking out early women dentists. Her collection has been and will continue to be a rich source for researchers.

Finding Madge Barnes' family was the most wonderful stroke of luck. Her great-niece, Virginia Hind, entrusted me with the Barnes' family albums and
memorabilia. When there was a technical disaster with photographs, Warwick and Virginia Hind came to my rescue, at a time when they were in the midst of building their new home. Madge’s nephew, Peter Tindale and his wife, Betty, always welcomed me into their home and gave generously in so many ways.

Women dentists opened their homes, their hearts and their memories to me. A special thank you to the Interviewees: Anna Enno, Ellice Weir Pilger, Marie Patison Cotton and Doreen Musgrave. Often husbands and wives offered the kindest hospitality: Dulcie Irvine, Millicent Levine, Frank Cotton, and the late Gordon Rouse. Another interviewee, John Edye opened the door to the life of his wife, the late Eila Bruce Edye. I am grateful to Jane Twartz Spark for her contribution. The interviewing experience has had an immeasurable and lasting effect on me.

Others who knew Madge Barnes and Annie Praed offered and gave their assistance. In this way, bit by bit, these two women grew out of a composite of perspectives. Richard Sautelle’s memories, photographs and letters of Annie Praed, offered a side to her private life. Ian Marshall’s boyhood memories of Madge and Annie were invaluable in that they positioned both women outside dentistry and family relations. Millicent Levine’s memories of Annie Praed produced another layer to Annie Praed. In sharing their collections, Anne Cook, Robert Irvine and Sally Burton-Bradley allowed Henry Burton-Bradley, a central figure in Annie Praed’s life, to emerge. I was privileged to share Robert Irvine’s passionate interest with his family ancestors, the Burton-Bradleys.
To friends and colleagues I also owe a great deal. Their support and encouragement gave me strength to endure the hard yards. Special people were Jane O’Sullivan, Lyn Dowling, Suzanne Mullen, Nedine Moir and Liz Thwaites. I benefited from the company and friendship of colleague, Thalca Agusni, whose PhD stress release, cooking, was a welcomed bonus. Neighbour and friend Anne Ferguson shared my passion for Annie Praed, through her interest in her ancestor Rosa Praed; she was most helpful in digging up all kinds of information. Good friend Wendy Swan, whose friendship and extensive knowledge of historical resources was invaluable, and her husband Russell Whitehead, came to my rescue to decipher handwriting in documents. Peter Bott, Leigh Knock, Phillipa and David Powis gave generous support. I wish to express my gratitude to the Tuesday night diners, a group of special women who listened patiently to the vicissitudes of this project. Among them is my good friend Rosie Ferris, who read endless copies of the thesis, gave editorial advice, cups of tea and gentle prodding. Jill Gibbon, my comrade in arms through the PhD journey, in her quiet way led me to ‘seeing’ women.

My family have lived through all the avenues and byroads of this thesis. All deserve recognition. My daughters, Amber, Eugena and Portia assisted on many occasions and gave that special love that tolerated my endless conversations about Annie and Madge. To my partner in life, Robert, who challenged me and yet grew with me through the project, a special thank you for his encouragement, love and support, and especially the meals. And also to my late parents for believing that tertiary education is a girl’s right.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. INTRODUCTION OF THEMES</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Gender</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Myth</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The personal and political connection</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1 Apologia vita mea</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 School influences</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Professionalisation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 University</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Organisations</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 Occupational choices after graduation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Postscript</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11 Conclusion</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. METHODOLOGY AND MYTHS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Insider historiography</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 Women's history approach</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Oral history interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td>Criticism of the interview as a research tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3</td>
<td>Interview planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4</td>
<td>Interview structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5.1</td>
<td>Interviewee/interviewer relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5.2</td>
<td>Memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5.3</td>
<td>The narrative component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5.4</td>
<td>Gender and the organisational culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Myths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>Family myths and resource contradictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4</td>
<td>Family background and resource contradictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5</td>
<td>The successful orphan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.6</td>
<td>Myth: The pioneer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.7</td>
<td>Myth: The dentist as a lady</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.8</td>
<td>Myth: The lady dentist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.9</td>
<td>Myth: The woman dentist as a matriarch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. PERSONAL FACTORS INFLUENCING CAREER CHOICE 94

3.1 Introduction 94

3.2 Influences 103

3.3 Pearl Barnes 144

3.4 Henry Burton-Bradley 152

3.4.1 Sir William Westbrooke Burton 154

3.4.2 Henry Burton-Bradley's public life 155

3.4.2.1 The Health Society of NSW 159

3.4.2.2 The Model Lodging House Company 161

3.4.3 Apprenticeship 163

3.4.4 'Apologia vita mea' 168

3.4.4.1 Audience and motive 170

3.4.4.2 Henry Burton-Bradley's line of argument 171

3.4.4.3 Henry Burton-Bradley's mood 174

3.4.4.4 Summary of the 'Apologia vita mea' 174

3.4.4.5 Annie Praed's situation at Llewellyn 181

3.4.4.6 Annie Praed's departure from Llewellyn 187

3.4.4.7 Conclusion 187

3.4.5 Annie Praed Trust 189

3.5 Annie Praed family 196

3.6 The name, Praed 199

3.7 Hypothetical Praed/Shaw connection 202

3.8 Conclusion 211
4. THE SCHOOLING EXPERIENCE  

4.1 Introduction  
4.2 Private venture urban girls' schools  
4.3 Suffrage ideology  
4.4 Timing  
4.5 Lotaville  
4.6 Accomplishments and fine motor skills  
4.7 Societal factors  
4.8 Eugenics ideology
  4.8.1 Clothing  
  4.8.2 Kindergarten Union  
  4.8.3 Froebel  
4.9 Riviere College  
4.10 Herbartian theories  
4.11 Role models  
4.12 Religious background  
4.13 Political factors  
4.14 Conclusion

5. PROFESSIONALISATION: PROCESS AND CULTURE

5.1 Introduction  
5.2 The University of Sydney  
5.3 Organisational culture  
5.4 Centralisation  
5.5 Apprenticeship scheme
5.6 Timing 324
5.7 Conclusion 327

6. UNIVERSITY 332

6.1 Introduction 332
6.2 University models 336
6.3 Dental School 340
6.4 Pioneer women 344
6.5 A gendered presence 347
6.6 Graduation 359
6.7 Science and gender 365
6.8 Role models and mentors 372
6.9 The class of 1906 377
6.10 Conclusion 381

7. ORGANISATIONS 382

7.1 Introduction 382
7.2 Non-dental organisations 382

7.2.1 Sydney University Women Graduates’ Association 385
7.2.2 Australian Federation of University Women 388
7.2.3 United Associations of Women 388
7.2.4 Business and Professional Women’s Club of Sydney 391
7.2.5 Feminist Club 396

7.3 Dental organisations 397

7.3.1 Introduction 397
7.3.2 Containment and exclusion 398
7.3.3 Odontological Society of New South Wales 399
7.3.4 University of Sydney Dental Graduates' Association 400
7.3.5 Society of Dental Science 401
7.3.6 Australian Dental Association (NSW Branch) 403
  7.3.6.1 Rural divisions of the ADA (NSW Branch) 405
7.3.7 Dental Public Health 406
  7.3.7.1 Introduction 406
  7.3.7.2 Dulce Skinner 406
  7.3.7.3 Joan Bates 410
  7.3.7.4 Dental Health Committee 414
7.4 Participation at conferences 416
7.5 Publications 430
7.6 Conclusion 434

8. OCCUPATIONAL CHOICES AFTER GRADUATION 436

  8.1 Introduction 436
  8.2 Organisational culture 437
  8.3 Available work 442
  8.4 Uniforms 446
  8.5 1906 to World War I 447
  8.6 World War I 458
  8.7 Inter-war years 472
  8.8 Postgraduate studies 505
  8.9 Women's earnings 512
  8.10 World War II 520
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.11</td>
<td>Post-World War II</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.11.1</td>
<td>Last days</td>
<td>529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.12</td>
<td>Annie Praed, mentor</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>Annie Praed Oration</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.14</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>GENERAL CONCLUSION</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>POSTSCRIPT</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>1950s - late 1960s</td>
<td>560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>1970s</td>
<td>571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>1980s</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>1990s</td>
<td>584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>586</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td></td>
<td>591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td></td>
<td>612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Women dentists registered between 1902-1934</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Women dentists registered between 1920-1928</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Australia’s first women graduates in “Firsts”</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Total numbers in each year that Barnes and Praed attended university</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Known family details of the men who graduated with Barnes and Praed</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 1st ADA Congress</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 2nd ADA Congress</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 3rd ADA Congress</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 4th ADA Congress</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 6th ADA Congress</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 7th ADA Congress</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 8th ADA Congress</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 9th ADA Congress</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>Women dentists participating at 11th ADA Congress</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Report of the 8th Conference of Australian Federation of University Women, 1938: Women Graduates in Australia</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Men and women in final year dentistry: 1923-1929</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.3 Men and women in final years: 1930-1939
8.4 Men and women in final years: 1940-1944/45
8.5 Women in final years: 1946-1950
10.1 Number of men in final years: 1949-1955
10.2 Women in final years: 1974-1981
10.3 Social backgrounds of women in 1973 final year
10.4 Women in final years: 1906-1993
ILLUSTRATIONS

1.1 Madge Barnes and Annie Praed,  
   Australia’s first women dental graduates  
   Page 1

2.1 ‘So Mother Christmas - tell us your story’  
   Page 32

2.2 Pioneer women dentists article in *Australian Women’s Weekly*  
   Page 51

2.3 Theresa and Margaret Quinn  
   Page 71

2.4 Annie Praed photograph by Monte Luke  
   Page 75

2.5 Annie Praed’s signature in the NSW Dental Board records  
   Page 76

2.6 The Hermitage, 1923  
   Page 78

2.7 Map showing the location of Twemlow’s residence,  
   Middle Harbour  
   Page 80

3.1 Advertisement for S. H. Barnes, Mudgee  
   Page 104

3.2 Ravenscraig, Harriette Street Neutral Bay  
   Page 106

3.3 Mrs ‘Ramborger’ Hammell  
   Page 108

3.4 Autographs from Ashleigh Camp, Newport  
   Page 111

3.5 Edmond Row Barnes  
   Page 114

3.6 Clifftdale, Scone  
   Page 125

3.7 Daryl Tindale, 1915 aged 5  
   Page 126

3.8 Tindale children at Scone  
   Page 126

3.9 Brassington Tindale  
   Page 127

3.10 Sydney University Appeal  
   Page 131
4.5  Prof. Henry Hughes 244
4.6  Prof. Henry Hughes, the elder 244
4.7  Watercolour painting of ‘Lilies’ 248
4.8  Advertisement for Riviere College 257
4.9  Riviere College, formerly Esher 260
4.10  Map, Glenhead Estate, Woollahra 263
4.11  Centennial Park Camp 267
4.12  Riviere College students 269
4.13  Advertisement for Riviere College featuring Emily Dornwell 272
4.14  M. Meares in chemistry class, University of Sydney 272
4.15  Sketch of Riviere College from Barnes’ Album 275
5.1  Advertisement 286
5.2  Advertisement 291
5.3  Advertisement 292
5.4  Advertisement for Miss Maggie Hamilton 322
5.5  Advertisement for Mrs Larkins 325
6.1  Madge Barnes, c.1904 334
6.2  Otis Chambers, King Street Sydney 335
6.3  Dental laboratory photograph taken by M. Barnes 353
6.4  Newspaper sketch of Madge Barnes, LDS 359
6.5  Sydney University’s inaugural BDS graduates, 1906 361
6.6  Madge Barnes and friends at a picnic, c.1906 364
7.1  ‘Class ceiling’ 384
7.2  Madge Barnes 386
8.1 193 Macquarie Street Sydney

8.2 Challis House, Martin Place, Sydney

8.3 Wavertree, Cremorne, c.1999

8.4 T&G Building, Park Street, Sydney

8.5 T&G Building, Park Street, Sydney

8.6 Five women featured in ‘Careers for women’ series in the Daily Telegraph, 1915-1916


8.8 Cover of 1930s Australian Women’s Weekly

8.9 Madge Barnes and Kenneth Maltby-Robinson’s wedding

8.10 Madge Barnes and Kenneth Maltby-Robinson, Maria Island

8.11 Kenneth Maltby-Robinson, Maria Island

8.12 Madge Barnes Maltby-Robinson in New Zealand

8.13 Map of Sydney, locating Malcolm Buildings, Malcolm Lane

8.14 Westminster Flats, William Street, Kings Cross, c.1999

8.15 Women students, Faculty of Dentistry, 1937

8.16 Social Committee for ADA Dental Congress, 1937

8.17 Two Australian Women’s Weekly covers during World War II

8.18 Derriwong, Frank Street, Labrador

8.19 Madge Barnes and Kenneth Maltby-Robinson, Southport, c.1960

8.20 Kenneth Maltby-Robinson, Southport, c.1960

8.21 Advertisement for knives
8.22 10 Brighton Parade, Southport, c.1960 534
9.1 Marjorie Chidley's correspondence to Doreen Musgrave 557
10.1 Advertisement: 'Why dentists are such wonderful people' 559
10.2 Teaching staff – 1952 – Faculty of Dentistry 564
10.3 Cover POL magazine January 1978 572
10.4 Two 1970 final year dental students 578
10.5 Centrefold of 1978 Articulator 579
10.6 Examples of early and late twentieth century advertisements 585
10.7 'Unrequited love no. 5' 587
10.8 Sydney University Appeal, 1998 590
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>Australian Dental Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Australian Dictionary of Biography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>Bachelor of Dental Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMA</td>
<td>British Medical Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPWC</td>
<td>Business and Professional Women's Club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>circa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>co.</td>
<td>company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDSc</td>
<td>Doctor of Dental Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDS</td>
<td>Licentiate in Dental Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>New South Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSWTF</td>
<td>New South Wales Teachers' Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no.</td>
<td>number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NZ</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>Queensland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAAF</td>
<td>Royal Australian Air Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>South Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUDUA</td>
<td>Sydney University Dental Undergraduate Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T&amp;G</td>
<td>Temperance and General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URSA</td>
<td>Urban and Rural Systems Associates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic.</td>
<td>Victoria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vol.</td>
<td>volume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>Western Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>Young Women's Christian Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION OF THEMES

'It is enunciated by psychologists that the power of translating "desire" into "will" is given to the few.' Annie Praed, 1933.¹

'The faculty had just opened and I thought I would like to "be unique" and do the unusual'. Madge Barnes, 1964.²

FIGURE 1.1
Madge Barnes (right) and Annie Praed, Australia's first women dental graduates
Courtesy University of Sydney Archives


1.1 Introduction

Unlike the practitioners of medicine, nursing and science, dentists as a profession have not gained the detailed attention of Australian historians or social scientists. Studies about dentists come mostly from within the discipline or from other allied health disciplines. This is not surprising, since dentists are relatively few in numbers and self-employment is the dominant professional ethos. The insulation of the dental profession serves to keep its boundaries well defined in terms of self-interest. At the same time, little attention has been sought or gained from institutions. The small amount of historical research that is available suffers from the insider perspective. Accounts of dentists have been restricted to profiles that in glorifying the professional image serve self-interest and pride, perhaps from a sense of obligation.

Until 1994 women remained a minority in graduating dental classes at the University of Sydney. Yet in 1906, two women, Annie Praed and Margaret Estelle Barnes, were among a group of thirteen on whom was conferred the inaugural Bachelor of Dental Surgery. In researching these women’s lives from an historical and gender perspective, an understanding of the meanings attached to professionalism and femininity within the organisational culture of the dental profession will be gained. Historically relevant social, economic and political events are addressed within a framework of gender. Analysis of these dimensions illustrates the personal and political interactions that shaped Barnes’ and Praed’s career and life choices.
The image of the dentist in twentieth century Australia is firmly rooted in the masculine. While the community in general has a fear of dentistry, the profession has relatively high social and economic standing. Dentists at the turn of the twentieth century struggled to establish dentistry as a profession to gain both the social and economic status of their medical colleagues as opposed to being associated with trade. Their push, therefore, was to redefine themselves as university-qualified professionals, unlike their predecessors who relied on apprenticeship-based skills.

As this thesis is part of an ongoing project on women dentists who graduated from the University of Sydney, a gendered perspective has informed the approach to methodology. The project is built on a foundation of oral history interviews that empower women dentists by providing them with the opportunity to voice their experience. Testament interpretation through a discourse analysis inter-links the relationship between the personal and the political, with the lens focused on gender relations.

1.2 Gender

Gender is at the centre of this inquiry, in keeping with the views of Grimshaw, Lake, McGrath and Quartly\(^3\) who have argued that 'gender is integral to the processes that comprise the history of Australia — that political and economic as well as social

\(^3\)Grimshaw, P., Lake, M., McGrath, A. & Quartly, M. 1994, Creating a Nation, McPhee Gribble, Ringwood, Vic., p. 4.
and cultural history are constituted in gendered terms'. Gender, according to researchers, has been constructed in theoretical terms and has been defined as 'a psychological and social category' as distinct from the biological category of sex. Short has made the distinction between gender identity and the 'nature-nurture' debate:

gender identity and its related practices [are fixed] firmly in the realm of the interaction between an individual and his or her social context...one in which the individual’s subjectivity is constructed in an ideological framework, through both conscious and unconscious processes.

A subjective approach to gender was also favoured by Norton, who argued that ‘individuals are constituted within a multiplicity of social structures, which simultaneously make and are made by those individuals in living out relations to social institutions’.

Gender cannot be narrowly defined in terms of simplistic bipolar relationships such as ‘masculine’ and ‘feminine’; and hence my approach to an understanding of gender has been informed by a number of researchers in this field, including Theobald who has pointed out that:

---


6Norton, J. 1992, 'Intimacy, independence and masculinity: Keeping a distance at close quarters', in Grimshaw, Fincher & Campbell, op. cit., p. 64.
the perception of gender as historically contingent has been further refined into the notion that the category ‘woman’ (and therefore the category ‘man’) is not fixed and is always open to contestation. A feminist reading of history allows for the possibility that women themselves are to be found at the centre of this contestation, though they are usually less powerful and their material circumstances are seldom of their own making.\(^7\)

Damousi and Lake have asserted that:

Femininity (and masculinity) are, as many feminist historians and theorists have pointed out, historical constructions, the products of diverse practices in a variety of sites or social demands — the workplace, the legislature, the schoolroom, the media. There is no one discrete ‘sex role’ dispensed by a master dramaturge but rather competing, often conflicting definitions of femininity.\(^8\)

This thesis is informed by these concepts of femininity and masculinity in its efforts to gain insights into Barnes and Praed’s responses to various cultural environments at different times during their lives. This approach allows the complex meanings of identity to surface.

---


According to Sowerwine, gender has often been compared to class because it adheres to similar social hierarchical principles. He contends that gender is more akin to racism because:

Sexual inequality was more internalised and less often articulated as social injustice...Sexism and racism did not exist in earlier societies: the terms themselves indicate consciousness of the oppression they denote. The oppression had to be recognised, the consciousness developed, the terms invented. And in a society in which being human was coded male, women had not only to become aware of male dominance but also to conceptualise the construction of gender.⁹

Barnes and Praed did not live within an informed contemporary frame of gender reference. Perceptions of how gender is expressed and interpreted within society are shaped by the personal and the political climate of the individual and of the period. Therefore, the choices of these women are analysed as a dynamic interaction between their times, race, class and gender.

The personal circumstances and the political climate at the turn of the century shaped the lives of both women. Comparative analysis with the testaments of some of the women dentists who graduated after them will be submitted. The analysis of these accounts will support the argument that they occupied common sites in their societal and professional landscapes: by positioning themselves

---

within the parameters of social structures of subjectivity, they were defining themselves in relationship to the male dentist as the benchmark. This centring of the male dentist therefore positions women as the 'other'; discussion will examine the ways in which women dentists, in striving for the centre, tended to over-compensate. Post-mortems of Barnes and Praed's life histories have relocated them within a gendered pioneering myth within the dental profession.

1.3 Myth

Oral history analysis centres on uncovering the myths that are embedded in the narrative. Myth construction is interpreted and analysed within a framework of gender, the personal and the political. The construction of myths held in the institutions of the Barnes family and the dental profession will be teased apart to ascertain how the bending of content has been effected to meet the mores of the institutional culture. The pioneering myth is one example of meanings being assembled for a diversity of interests. While Barnes and Praed share common threads of the pioneering myth, their particular personal and political factors shaped individual expressions. For example, in exploring the meanings invested in the Annie Praed myth by the dental profession, the organisational culture of dentistry can be examined. Identification of the myths surrounding Barnes increases the understanding of how professional and family culture are informed by class and societal factors. With each of these two women, myths have been invested with mixed meanings for the benefits of the individual, the family, and the organisation.
1.4 The personal and political connection

Barnes' and Praed's career choices were the result of a number of factors: gender, personal and political elements. Among these were their social backgrounds, education and the professionalisation process of dentistry. Central to the discussion will be the importance of timing; their adolescence, education, university and professional periods provided an opportunity to unravel the ways in which economic circumstances, career choices and paths were interlinked with cultural environments.

The personal component will take into account the importance of relationships without discounting the significance of absence: absent parent/s contrasting vividly with available mentors located in families; social circles; the educational institutions of girls' schools, the university and the dental profession. Here again the theme of women pioneers in tertiary education is encountered and examined to evaluate its authority. Pioneering as an endeavour, at the turn of the century, gained a significant meaning for a number of women. For the first time educational opportunities, piloted by political change, opened new possibilities for white Anglo women of the middle and upper classes in Australia. Common to both was the dimension of woman as pioneer: as pioneering women graduates and, more particularly, as pioneer women in dentistry from Sydney University.

Contesting meanings of femininity for Barnes and Praed surfaced in the assembly of component parts of their lives. For example, femininities constructed around Barnes involved her as a daughter, sister, aunt, wife, friend,
author, secretary of the Kindergarten Union, and dentist. Praed, on the other hand, has been portrayed as dentist, educator, friend and active participant in a public sphere. The motives and influences behind Praed’s drive to become a pioneer in her field are complex and may never be entirely available. However the circumstances of her earlier life and the powerful presence of Henry Burton-Bradley are significant factors. Evidence supporting this argument, that Henry Burton-Bradley was a key influence in Praed’s pioneering motive, is located in the number of expressions of pioneering throughout generations of the Burton-Bradley family.

As neither Barnes nor Praed married or had children during their years of dental practice, conflicts and negotiations over family demands and ensuing implications for their construction of femininity and professionalism did not require attention or analysis. Discussion will, however, include the implications of Barnes’ retirement from dental practice upon marriage that complied with the mores of her social sphere.

1.4.1  Apologia vita mea

The most significant document that shed light on Praed’s social background and the circumstances that led to her to a career as a dentist was Henry Burton-Bradley’s unpublished ‘Apologia vita mea’. Today this document exists in a typed form from the original hand written version. The transcribed title is ‘Appologea vita mea’ which may be due to either a translation or transcription

---

error. The original title may be Henry Burton-Bradley's non-literary and grammatical error. While Henry Burton-Bradley described the document as his 'apology of my life',\textsuperscript{11} I strongly suspect that possibly there was a transcription error from the original intended 'Apologia (mea): vita mea' a derivation of Newman's \textit{Apologia pro vita sua}.\textsuperscript{12} I came to this conclusion after viewing a number of Henry Burton-Bradley's original letters that showed that his handwriting was difficult to decipher. The 'apologia' represents the writings of a complex man and any discussion of this document necessitates multiple readings. Composite meanings therefore evolve from the two possibilities of the title. However, as Henry Burton-Bradley's delivery is strongly defensive in its execution, the document is referred to as 'Apologia vita mea' throughout this thesis.

1.5 School influences

Barnes and Praed's attendance at private venture girls' schools for their secondary education made their future career paths possible, although there were notable differences. The timing of their education and the provision of role models within these institutions will be explored to chart the impact of those factors on Barnes and Praed's career choices. Again comparative data from interviewees' testaments will be incorporated to search for patterns and differences in women dentists' educational experiences.

\textsuperscript{11}Burton-Bradley, Henry. 1889, Correspondence to Frank Davis. \textit{Robert Irvine Collection}.

\textsuperscript{12}I am indebted to Alexis Antonia and Emeritus Prof. Godfrey Tanner for their assistance with the literary associations and Latin meanings.
The significance of timing in the education of Barnes and Praed becomes more important because their schooling preceded the domestic science emphasis introduced in 1906 by the Director of Education, Peter Board, who held that the morally legitimate career for women was the care of the home. Subjects illustrating this point included domestic hygiene, home management, care of children, cookery\textsuperscript{13}. It is important to note that these factors narrowed girls' opportunities, affecting the numbers of women entering the dental school. Women's representation in graduating classes remained below 10% well into the 1970s. Under these strategies of exclusion, women turned to the more culturally acceptable and available professions of teaching and nursing.

1.6 Professionalisation

The relationship between gender and professionalism will be investigated within the parameters of an historical journey through Barnes and Praed's course of study and practice. What will emerge is an understanding of identity in gendered terms during their lifetime. This period is extensive since Barnes lived until 1975, although her active participation in the profession ceased in 1921. Praed's span of continual practice until her death in 1948 allows a more complex analysis of her space in the profession and her interaction with male colleagues over this period. Significant highlights are the years of the professionalisation process, the wars and the immediate post-war periods.

The conceptual shift from an occupation to a profession involved a number of characteristics. A campaign led by a small group of men, who sought security in terms of class and finance, gained momentum. They brought to the public forum their desires for change in the form of a structure outlining the characteristics of a profession and attitudinal concepts. In their debate they emphasised the values of altruism and knowledge, while avoiding the issues of privilege and financial benefit. Keen to incorporate intellectual dimensions associated with new technological and scientific innovations, the new vanguard of dentists, in their drive for elevated status and economic benefits, favoured and established the new tertiary course at the University of Sydney. These men struggled to enlist numbers because they faced opposition from both the public and members of the dental profession. This recruitment strategy resurfaced whenever there was a shortfall in male students: during World War II and also during the 1960s and 1970s. Women proved acceptable and even desirable under these conditions.

The turn of the century marks the pivotal point for this change. In examining the lives of Barnes and Praed there is an opportunity to explore how race, class and gender underpinned this transitional period in the development of the profession. It also allows observation of the professionalisation process to reveal the relationship between changing status and the control and centralisation of

---


knowledge, as demonstrated in this profession as it struggled to establish an identity that fell within the respected stratum of social power.

Praed's dental training spanned both vocational systems and ideologies. Therefore, her presence in the university course generates interesting dimensions for gender analysis. Barnes' and Praed's experiences as dentists have relevance for the study of other women professionals since their working-lives, particularly Praed's, spanned decades of great and rapid change. For professional women, the demand for services was a direct measure of society's attitudes towards women's participation in the workforce at the professional level. These attitudes were shaped in many ways. A clear distinction in the level of acceptance of women professionals during war (Praed's in both World War I and World War II) and peace time indicates the impact of a social factor on society's attitudes towards women in paid professional careers. The insights gained from this study demonstrate that professionalism is constructed around a relationship of class, gender and race.

On another level, a major component of the timing element was the very existence of the apprenticeship training scheme and its intense competition with the newly established university course. Under the social and economic change and progress in Australia at the turn of the twentieth century, young Australian men with means sought dentistry qualifications abroad, in particular, in Philadelphia. The young members who had trained in reputable overseas dental schools supported the emerging profession. The desire for the enhanced status already enjoyed by colleagues in medicine brought about important changes to
training, shifting from indentured to tertiary education. The suffrage movement, too, encouraged women from the middle classes to seek educational qualifications that held complex gender and societal meanings of work practices.

1.7 University

Unlike their women colleagues in medicine and law at the University of Sydney, Margaret Barnes and Annie Praed did not encounter visible obstacles to their presence in dentistry. On the contrary, timing proved the essential differentiating factor. The entrance of women into the dental profession at the University of Sydney was facilitated by the existence of the apprenticeship-based scheme. Historically, the momentum of the women's suffrage movement; the energy associated with the turn of the century, women's visibility under the apprenticeship scheme and the timing of the shift to the professionalisation of dentistry provided these two women with an unusually favourable climate for their entry to university.

Entry into dentistry for Barnes and Praed was also facilitated by the entrance requirements of their time. After the curriculum changed to include science subjects, fewer women could enter dentistry through the university course, as only a scant number of girls' secondary schools offered these subjects. Disadvantages for girls as compared to boys stemmed not only from the limited availability of science and mathematics subjects, but also from the fact that curriculum levels were lower, resulting in poorer examination outcomes.
When women were first admitted, the University of Sydney, unlike its counterparts in New Zealand, the USA and the United Kingdom, did not engage in a separatist model of education for women. Certainly the earlier struggles by their counterparts in Britain helped pave the way for women's admission to universities in Australia. Advantaged too, by the absence of dominant traditionalist and clerical influences, and with support from men, Australian women moved more freely into the universities. When these women, after graduation, moved into the workforce they experienced diverse and complex responses to their presence: some faced visible and invisible barriers, while others, in particular teachers, found acceptance but in gendered terms of wages and conditions. Suffrage philosophies gave rise to multiple interpretations in the context of women's liberation, and therefore multiple models of feminism. On the one hand, education of women was valued within a domestic context, while on the other, equity in the paid workforce signalled independence. Backed by suffrage ideologies, a number of women took up the challenges to move into the paid workforce with degrees of permanency. Morantz-Sanchez noted the connection between the rise of feminism and the entrance of American women into the medical profession.  

1.8 Organisations

Engagement in dental and non-dental organisations raises multiple readings of gender and professionalism for Barnes and Praed. A gender template resulted

---

that set the pattern for generations for Anglo women during the twentieth century. Membership in non-dental organisations formed predominantly along meanings of gender, race and class. Dental organisations offered women dentists a limited choice of professional sites that were dependent on the availability of male recruits to dentistry. Their participation in organisations revealed inter-generational links of role models, predominantly women. Barnes and Praed were influenced by these role models, women who came from their educational and social spheres. In turn they became mentors to younger women dentists.

Non-dental organisations held, for both women, an appeal from a gendered perspective of multiple meanings of femininity. All bodies held in common an attraction for women of the white Anglo educated middle and upper classes. Whilst Praed's involvement with the United Associations of Women and the Sydney Business and Professional Women's Club is indicative of strong feminist beliefs, she joined Barnes in bodies that expressed a meaning of femininity of the kind formed around the pioneering university graduate. With marriage, Barnes claimed meanings of femininity that were socially acquired from class: philanthropically appropriate organisations such as the Kindergarten Union and the Society of Women Writers. Marriage and motherhood continued to be the foremost occupations for women, which precluded the concept of paid employment for married professional women. Summers discovered this attitude amongst the very institutions that promoted women's education:
to engage upon the most important public service a woman can perform, that of bringing up children to serve their day and generation as useful member of the state.\textsuperscript{17}

These views reinforced the barriers to women’s activity in professional careers, psychologically and socially. Their careers were left in cultures of either impermanence or a second rate femininity.

The degree of active participation in dental organisations was directly related to the availability of male recruits into the dental profession. In the embryonic phase of professionalisation, women were wooed to swell the membership. Once the dental profession became established at both educational and organisational levels, the dominant masculine professional culture would manifest itself in complex, often subtle and contradictory ways.

Gender and professional boundaries were inter-linked and traversed along complex paths incorporating new meanings for the new educated woman whilst maintaining the domestic apron strings of philanthropy and housekeeping. Women joined organisations that would reflect meanings of philanthropy and housekeeping whilst struggling to fit new meanings of professionalism. Periods of war offer one example when gender boundaries were redefined and often dissolved: meanings attached to the paid work in the public sphere transformed

the visibility of women in the dental profession. It was also a time when women’s organisations achieved their greatest membership.

1.9 Occupational choices after graduation

Barnes and Praed were confronted by professional and societal cultures where for women the professional identity was shaped along lines of masculinity at odds with most societal constructs of femininity. For women who entered the professions, this issue of a conflicting gendered identity in relation to professional and societal cultures is fundamental in any analysis of their presence or absence in the dental profession during different periods of the twentieth century.

Gender underpinned Australia’s wage system during Barnes’ and Praed’s lifetimes. The ‘gender barrier’\textsuperscript{18} was based on the belief that women’s financial needs were met within the paradigm of a family wage, with a male as breadwinner. This tenet of males as breadwinners excluded women who were without male income support. Thompson concurred with Cass, Kingston, Apps and Edwards:

\begin{quote}
the domestic economy has been the location of women’s undercapitalised labour and the ‘identification of women with unpaid non-
\end{quote}

market work has disadvantaged them in the distribution of income and power. 19

Women’s progression into the public area of paid work was accompanied by these meanings attached to unpaid work. The size of Praed’s estate provides documentary support for this argument. Her executor and beneficiary, Mr Richard Sautelle, recalled his surprise on learning how little Praed had accumulated during a lifetime of earning without any dependants:

On her death...I found out that she really didn’t have a great deal of capital. I think she must have put a lot of her money into honorary work in the dental profession...what she left wasn’t enormous by any means. 20

This supports the argument that women’s earnings were low in proportion to their male counterparts, even in the prestigious circles of a profession such as dentistry. 21 Praed, Barnes and other early women graduates were to practise in private practice alone, with another woman dentist, or with family members.

Practice with male colleagues, either as partners or associates, or even as assistants, was not common, except during the war years. Opportunities for work in public health were limited. Separatist institutional establishments for women

19 Ibid.
did not exist when Barnes and Praed graduated. Later women graduates in dentistry found a place for their professional skills at the Rachel Forster Hospital, which was established by women.

Cass's study of women academics illustrates that when women were a minority in male-dominated areas of the workplace, they were, according to the cultural beliefs at the time, a 'deviant group':

first because they have obtained university qualifications; second, because they are employed in a male dominated profession, and third, because they have redefined certain aspects of the domestic division of labour.\(^{22}\)

Although women dentists have in recent years reached equitable numbers in final year at the University of Sydney, they remain a minority within the profession. As a minority group they share a number of the issues raised within this thesis. Barnes' and Praed's identities become a fluid synthesis of professionalism and multiple meanings of societal femininities: the fulcrum shifting according to the dominant cultural factors operating at any time.

---

1.10 Postscript

The presence of women entering the Faculty of Dentistry at the University of Sydney in the years after World War II reflected economic and societal factors. The immediate post-war period was dominated by the urgency to redefine masculinity in terms of paid work and sexuality: resulting in government policy aimed at achieving for economic and population growth. These definitions of masculinity dramatically affected meanings of femininity and professionalism for white Anglo women of the middle and upper classes.

Structural and psychological barriers were orchestrated to return these women to the domestic sphere. It became culturally unpalatable to women of these classes to enter professional courses and even more unacceptable socially for married women to practise professionally. The dental profession developed a dominant masculine ethos in a white Anglo heterosexual culture where few women of these classes sought to enter.

The major change to women's presence in the Faculty of Dentistry in the post-war years was caused by immigration. Women who entered dentistry during this period were predominantly from cultures where dental professions contained a strong presence of women. The presence of Anglo women re-emerged in the early 1970s, when the public became aware of feminism as a positive force. Coinciding with high employment, when men were less likely to seek the security offered by a career in dentistry, women were actively recruited to fill the professional gap.
1.11 Conclusion

Significant personal and professional relationships will be examined to provide an understanding into the ways in which aspirations and career choices intersected with the dynamics of societal and professional forces. Intrinsic to the arguments raised will be the importance of mentors and role models in the choices available to and selected by Barnes and Praed throughout their lives. Argument will be raised and supported by evidence to examine how role models and mentors are drawn from a number of relationship contexts: family, school, social and professional. The benefits of the relationships may have been interconnected, with multi-layered effects, and may have been expressed in combinations of psychosocial, pioneering, professional or lifestyle dimensions. The professionalisation of dentistry as a process with an inherent masculine organisational culture would seem to be more an Anglicised phenomenon, since European and Asian cultures have a stronger representation of women in dentistry.

Researchers have claimed that women's entrance into the teaching, nursing and medical professions was aligned with the notion of women as healers and nurturers. Dentistry, too, as a profession, fulfilled these ideals to a degree; however, another dimension of dentistry must be considered. As a profession emerging from a tradition of craft it can be said that it had more in common with the domestic economy. During the years of the apprenticeship scheme, women practised as dentists in family units contributing to the domestic economy, and perhaps in this way there was more in common with silversmiths and tailors. As
dentistry pushed forwards towards a profession, it annexed the ideologies of the eugenics movement.

My aim has been to flesh out the characters of Praed and Barnes to gain insights into their experiences as women in the context of their age and to weave their experiences within the shared tapestry of women's history. Here I have found direction from the research of Kyle\(^{23}\) who highlights 'the positive achievements of women without leaving out the fact that discrimination and a certain amount of oppression' occurred: an invaluable way to gain wider vision of the dental profession. Kyle's views are in tune with those of a number of researchers who have emphasised the need for a wider perspective to historiography than the more limited insider view.

This thesis endeavours to explore the impact of influences in personal circumstances in relationship to societal pressures in shaping the career choices of Barnes and Praed. What were the obstacles and opportunities that presented to Barnes and Praed in their personal, educational, cultural and institutional experiences during their journey through life? In what way do they relate to the interviewees' experiences?

A key influence that underpinned the project to interview early women dental graduates was Allen's approach that 'there is a need to collect more empirical data on the relations between women and science in precisely delineated

\(^{23}\) Kyle, loc. cit.
historical and socio-political contexts.\textsuperscript{24} The dental profession offered an opportunity to gather data from a specific sphere, at a time when professionalisation transformed it from an art/trade base to a professional/scientific one.

Researchers agree that 'science is a socially produced body of knowledge and a cultural institution', and that as the institution of science mirrors society's norms and values, 'we can expect a sexist society to develop a sexist science'.\textsuperscript{25} The professionalisation process of dentistry at the turn of the century coincided with the dawning frontier of science that founded a masculine organisational culture. For women the effect of this process and culture was exclusion or containment. Over most of the twentieth century women were excluded in significantly visible numbers or they were contained to delineated sites.

Gender research from outlined directions has informed the approach towards this study of Barnes and Praed. This research aims to explore and interpret Barnes' and Praed's lives in relation to societal forces and the dental profession of their day, in order to contribute to the understanding of the link between the

\textsuperscript{24}Allen, N. 1993, 'The exception to the rule: The career of an Australian woman physicist', \textit{Australian and New Zealand Physicist}, vol. 30, no. 12, p. 306.

\textsuperscript{25}Allen, 1992, op. cit., p. 551.
personal and the political, the past and the present. The concept of a continuum has implications for women today who share common ground with Barnes and Praed.
CHAPTER 2

METHODOLOGY AND MYTHS

2.1 Introduction

2.1.1 Insider historiography

When I set out to research the lives Annie Praed and Madge Barnes, I became aware of the difficulties that insider\(^1\) historiography present to the researcher and the 'need to challenge basic assumptions\(^2\) held by members of the dental profession. Attempting to achieve a historiography of these two women consistent with the recommendations outlined by Godden, Curry & Delacour\(^3\) would deconstruct myths surrounding these two women and cause unease for me, members of Barnes' family and dental colleagues. A dilemma was thus presented — how to search as a scholar beyond the myths, and yet avoid political agendas and conflicts of interest at the cost of possibly offending the very people who have provided the research resources.

---

\(^1\)Godden, J., Curry, G., & Delacore, G. 1993, 'The decline of myths and myopia?: The use and abuse of nursing history', *Australian Journal of Advance Nursing*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 27–34.

\(^2\)Ibid., p. 28.

\(^3\)Ibid., pp. 31–3.
It must be acknowledged, however, that there are certain advantages for insider historiographers through the informal fellowship that exists in a small profession such as dentistry. Serendipity unfolded research information at social functions associated with the University of Sydney: for example, the fate of Praed’s dental practice and the opportunity to contact the Dignam family who had known Praed.

Influential in my approach were the approaches of historians, including Katherine Borland’s exploration of the ‘potential for interpretative conflict’ over the oral history of her grandmother, and her suggested ‘model that respects the speaker’s “ownership” of...words as well as the researcher’s commitments to scholarship’. I concur with Heilbrun who argues that there is a need to ‘read fictional representations of gender arrangements in our culture whether of difference, oppression, or possibility’ as an opportunity for exploration and criticism. Theobald’s discussion of ‘the uneasy marriage of celebration and critique’ added a further dimension to the preferred approach towards the historiography of Barnes and Praed.

---

4Conversation, 14 Nov. 1997, with Dr G. Wing. 50th Anniversary of Continuing Education in Dentistry, Cocktail Party, Union Building University of Sydney.

5Conversation, 17 Mar. 1998, with Dr P. Dignam. Alumni Dinner, Faculty of Dentistry, University of Sydney, The Matilda Bay Restaurant, Crawley, WA, 29th ADA Congress, Perth.


The most difficult aspect of this research was the relationships that evolved between the researcher and the interviewees and the effect they had on objectivity. As a woman dentist, I found myself having shared experiences, memories and feelings with interviewees who were women dentists. Being aware of the criticism of this aspect of insider historiography and yet not invalidating the interviewee's story became a complex and often painful balancing quest. Doreen Musgrave presented the greatest hurdle and left unresolved tensions. Her earlier research and publications provided a unique and valuable resource. She herself was generous in every possible way, making available all her earlier research documents, and volunteering to be interviewed at length. While forming a personal connection with Doreen Musgrave I have exposed her, I hope, in a constructive manner rather than the opposite.

2.1.2 Women's history approach

Influential too, in my approach was the view of Grimshaw, Lake, McGrath & Quartly⁹ that gender is fundamental to the processes that compromise the history of Australia: that political and economic, as well as social and cultural, history are constituted in gendered terms. I concur with their recognition that women's history needs to be 'seen as a more complex and contradictory saga' than earlier perceptions contained in feminist works of the 1970s. Their concepts of femininity and masculinity as interdependent of each other, shaping and being

shaped 'by all social relationships and processes has led to the analysis of
gender as a central category of historical analysis'.

Methodology evolved from a qualitative perspective: primary and secondary
documents were integrated with oral history interviews of men and women who
knew, either directly or indirectly, Barnes and Praed: friends, members of Barnes’
family, and dentists who had known both women. Multiple views of Barnes and
Praed created shifting perspectives that ultimately allowed complexities, albeit
juxtaposed at times, to form broader, and less stereotypical images of these
women.

Private documents offered insights, often intimate, into personal backgrounds.
Most important amongst these, Henry Burton-Bradley's disclosures in his
'Apoloagia vita mea' provided multiple layers of possible interpretations about
Annie Praed's childhood and early adulthood. This single document tore apart
and interrogated much of the published account of Praed that had directed or
influenced many of the interviewees' memories of her. In published reports
Praed was known as Mr Bradley's ward, a station more befitting for one of the
emerging professional class. The suppression of the circumstances of Praed's
situation in the Burton-Bradley household warranted close examination.

Experienced researchers have contended that scholars need to look beyond
'the very categories which have constituted and confined women'. They have

---

10 ibid.

argued for an ‘awareness of the interdependence of the public and private, and [the need] to pursue the everyday world of women on the infinitely more difficult terrain of power, ideologies and subjectivities’.\textsuperscript{12} Debate has raged between a theoretical versus narrative approach in the writing of women’s history. My approach was informed by Theobald’s convincing argument that:

theory and historical narrative may inform each other — that the writing of women’s lives may be enhanced by, rather than paralysed by, post-modernist insights into the act of ‘knowing’ and the status of text, historian and subjectivity.\textsuperscript{13}

However, the dialectic between narrative and theory exists in the events of women dentists’ lives. The post-modernist insistence upon multiple readings of the category ‘woman’ allows us to recognise that the category ‘woman’ was further destabilised by women dentists’ status as members of the dental profession, a dominant masculine culture.\textsuperscript{14}

Methodology included data from official sources. Bureaucratic information was analysed from a multi-level perspective. While on one hand, it ‘is the lifeblood of bureaucracy that it seeks to obliterate the personal and the private, privileging the public and the universal’,\textsuperscript{15} these very records could also be utilised as

\textsuperscript{12}Theobald, op. cit., p. 176.
\textsuperscript{13}Ibid., p. 180.
\textsuperscript{14}Ibid., p. 191.
\textsuperscript{15}Ibid., p. 190.
valuable research tools and resources in a number of particular ways. These records either offered new information that would allow the research to expand into new territories or they substantiated or nullified earlier written accounts of Barnes and Praed. Methodology of this kind allowed for an evolution of the woman dentist with multiple readings of femininity, along similar lines to Theobald’s study of teachers. Theobald concluded that:

woman was caught in the quicksands of conflicting subjectivities — wife, daughter, sister, teacher and servant of the state. The instability of the category ‘woman’ was at the centre...as it was for all women teachers who tried to be equally present with men in the public sphere.\textsuperscript{16}

The contextualising of woman and dentist within this frame of contesting femininities provided a diversity of interpretations of the choices that Barnes and Praed faced throughout their lives. Oral history interviews of other early women dental graduates were incorporated to support the argument that there are multiple readings of femininity drawing from societal and professional frameworks.

\textsuperscript{16}Ibid.
FIGURE 2.1
’Somother Christmas – tell us your story’

Courtesy Judy Horacek

2.2. Oral history interview

2.2.1 Introduction

In the interview there is a shift from information-gathering methodology to interaction where the focus is on the dynamic unfolding of the subject’s viewpoint (see Figure 2.1). In shifting the balance of control from the interviewer to the interviewee, the interviewee is empowered to tell his or her own story, and to construct his or her own meaning of events. It is in this telling that embedded information is exposed to gain insights into identity. Relevant to this study was the multiple perspective of the meanings attached to being a woman dentist.
2.2.2 Criticism of the interview as a research tool

The most problematic issue of the oral history interview for many historians has been the claim of liability of no consistency of measurement. This yardstick is equally inherent in the quantitative methodological argument. Faith in the veracity of the written document is often left unchallenged within this framework. I concur with Holbrook, who upheld Tonkin’s view that ‘validity is a judgement of the appropriateness of a measure’.¹⁷

However, there are questions that need to be asked. Does all evidence simply lose its validity because it doesn’t fit within a traditional well-established paradigm? Is it not the time to question this point of view? Do complexities have value only when they are reduced to fundamental units comprehensible to researchers?

May upholds Nelms’ conceptual directional shift that:

it is this selectivity that gives oral history its power, as psychologists generally agree that what a person selects to remember is usually what that person has found meaningful or significant in their lives. A well conducted oral history interview taps that which the informant believes is important in his or her past.¹⁸


Oral testaments offer an important research device with which to validate information, but more significantly to validate an individual's life story as a contributory part of a nation's history.

2.2.3 Interview Planning

Interview structural planning incorporates various categories including family, educational and socio-economic background, societal and individual beliefs associated with success, and women's roles in the profession and society. While questions are formulated, they are neither fixed nor rigid, thus allowing a degree of flexibility, an inherent characteristic of the interview technique.

In an effort to enhance the atmosphere for the interview, many factors require consideration. Firstly, the interviewer's role needs to be understood: of importance are issues regarding image, gender, age, researcher, and location in the dental profession. The position of the interviewer can influence interview outcomes. Being an insider can create difficulties within a closed or partly closed community, especially in terms of deconstructing myths and limiting perspective. The loss of anonymity for some interviewers may or may not be an advantage. However, boundary issues were recognised as being significant and the role of the interviewer was closely scrutinised.

Another factor is the number of interviews. I have found that a technique of two interview sessions of at least two hours duration each, with an interval of one or more weeks between interviews, has certain advantages. An interval between interviews not only acts to stimulate the interviewee's memory but also allows
for the development of a better rapport between interviewer and interviewee. This two-interview technique is also being employed in a larger project on women dentists. However, a more flexible interview arrangement was conceived to accommodate interviewees who were not women dentists. When interviewees were connected in some way to a woman dentist (the colleague, friend, relative or widower of a woman dentist), the interview was often reduced to one session, as the available memories were not of the kind related to this topic.

2.2.4 Interview Structure

The first contact with the interviewee was by letter. This was followed by telephone calls to arrange interview time and location. The structure followed the following format:

Pre-interview arrangements:
1. Informal meeting before start of recording;
2. Use of small, technologically sound equipment;
3. Quiet location, without interruptions;
4. Release forms that had been ethically authorised;
5. Prompts: photographs, memorabilia.

Post-interview:
1. Debriefing period for interviewee;
2. Field notes made to record any comments made off the tape;
3. Reaction piece to the interview as a useful research aid;
4. Interview log to facilitate referencing;
5. Transcripts, only necessary for written documentation. They must include aurality components in the text;

6. Letter of appreciation and thanks to interviewee.

2.2.5 Analysis

A multi-layered approach was favoured, as the narrative value is not in the language alone, but in the aurality and the myths that are buried in the narrative within the interview. We all construct myths\textsuperscript{19} to give meaning to our lives and the interview analysis exposes how individuals frame their identity in their world.

Alongside other oral historians like Passerini, Portelli, Thompson, Samuel and Holbrook, May supports a multi-layered analysis of oral data to dig deep into the structures to uncover the ways individuals create meaning in relationship to their social structure.\textsuperscript{20} Chanfrault-Duchet proposes that myths are ‘organised around two central axes: one refers to collective myths, the other to the individual’s history’.\textsuperscript{21} This concept has been a major tool in the interpretation of available resources. The interviewee’s narrative then is not just a personal story, but one that provides the link between the individual, the group and the society.


\textsuperscript{20}May, op. cit., p. 180.

Analysis of the interview occurred in a number of ways. The interview structure and the dynamics of the interview were probed through a multi-layered approach to data to provide insights into the gender relations and cultural environment of the dental profession as an organisation. The oral history interview was viewed as a multi-layered speech event. Essential to this approach was the interpretation and understanding of the value of major components of the oral history interview. They were aurality, verbal and non-verbal content, body language, facial expressions and silences.

2.2.5.1 Interviewer/interviewee relationship

A significant factor in the technique and analysis of the oral history interview is the fluidity of power within the interviewee-interviewer relationship. This dynamic allows for control to shift between the two, creating a more balanced distribution of power. A flexible interview structure enhances this dynamic in a number of ways: it facilitates spontaneity that can drive the inquiry into uncharted territory and it frees the interviewee to tell his or her own story. It is imperative that the interviewer is aware of the importance of appearance as an influencing factor. Preferably, the interviewer should strive to dress and behave in a manner that does not project an image that may influence the interviewee's responses.

2.2.5.2 Memory

The oral history interview has drawn criticism based on the problematic nature of memory. However, the concept of memory needs to be put in context: what is remembered is what is important to the individual. Taska has claimed that
'memories are infused with dominant cultural values and political ideologies'. I support Darian-Smith's views that it is through memory that we construct a 'sense of individual, group and national identities, give meaning to our own life history and understand our social past'. According to Peel, 'the meanings applied to a territory accordingly shape social practice and powerfully affect life chances'. The memories that surfaced with interviewees who knew Barnes and/or Praed provided a rich resource to explore and interpret Barnes and Praed as individuals, as women and as dentists.

**2.2.5.3 The narrative component**

As 'language shapes the interpretation of self', deeper meanings are to be found within the narrative component of the interview. Language often provides symbolic clues to the 'Interaction between social institutions, social roles and women's consciousness'. Barnes, Praed and other women dentists, who by the very mechanism of being qualified as women and dentists, have factors in common. This emphasis of difference in professional cultures is a mechanism that Witz calls containment and exclusion.

---


The narrative components in the interviews were examined to explore how gender relations were played out in the dental profession and their relationship to societal constructs of femininity and masculinity. The oral history interviews were analysed to expose how the masculine culture of an organisation reasserted its dominance. In emphasising the domestic role of women, the shift from the professional to the domestic identity is contained within the feminine.

As women dentists are often unaware of these structural concepts they are often left with the remembered discomfort that they seek to resolve by resorting to acceptable societal constructs of femininity. This is what Hamilton and Darian-Smith call 'the gendering of memory to the interaction between the private and public aspects of our existence'. The resulting tension from personal and public constructs of contesting femininities and masculinities leaves women dentists in ambiguous locations within the dental profession and the broader Australian community. As pioneer women dentists, Barnes and Praed encountered a diverse range of gendered experiences at different times of their life.

2.2.5.4 Gender and organisational culture

Connell has argued that 'elements of sexual character are embedded in the distinctive sets of practice sometimes called "occupational cultures"'. He claims that professionalism is where the combination of 'theoretical knowledge with technical expertise' is 'central to a profession's claim to competence and

---

monopoly of practice'. An historical construction of a professional has emerged in a masculine form: 'emotionally flat, centred on a specialist skill, insistent on professional esteem and technically based dominance over workers'. Inherent to this form of professionalism is the complete freedom from childcare and domestic work provided by having wives and maids to do it. The masculine character of professionalism has been supported by the simplest possible mechanism, the exclusion of women.

Connell concurs with J.M. and R.E. Pahl's study\textsuperscript{30} that professional men have:

families whose personal lives are kept in order by those immense labours of a wife, who appears to have no career but whose work is the absolute condition of her husband's apparent 'individual success'.\textsuperscript{31}

Rather like sonic photography, the interview is more powerful than the written text, as the dimension of aurality allows contradictions and ambiguities to surface. By delving into the deeper layers of the narrative, information can be accessed. The exposure of ambiguities and contradictions, often disguised as trivial, permits a deeper understanding and validates the complexity of gender relations in professional organisational cultures.\textsuperscript{32} A particular example is the


\textsuperscript{31}Connell, op. cit., p. 223.

perspective of sexism: how past and present societal values intersect, with the resultant tension surrounding gender relations for the individual in the dental profession. Chanfrault-Duchet posits that:

Women's life stories, unlike men, deal not only with the relation between self and the social sphere, but above all, with...collective representations of women as they have been shaped by society.  

This concept that an individual woman dentist's experience is a measure not only of the collective of women dentists but also of the wider collective of women generally has underpinned the approach to this thesis.

The intersection of a past memory with present often exposes contradictions related to 'shifts in personal attitudes and changing external environment'. The interviewees often sought explanations to make sense or give meaning to a memory. This myth-making process allows individuals to make sense of their lives and also helps them convey meanings related to their changing experiences and attitudes to exploitation of power. Taska contends that 'memories are infused with dominant cultural values and political ideologies'.

The oral history interviews reveal that for women dentists, their professional identity is in tension between cultural norms of societal femininity and

---

33 Chanfrault-Duchet, op. cit., p. 78.
34 Taska, op. cit., p. 78.
35 ibid., pp. 78-9.
professionalism that is dominantly masculine. The interviews show how these women struggle to negotiate their individual territory. In this argument I am supported by Hamilton’s and Thelan’s comments that ‘people’s memories provide security, authority, legitimacy and finally identity in the present’.

Minister concurred with the views of Stewart, Cooper and Friedley who concluded that women ‘traditionally talk to each other about personal and affiliated issues that reflect who they are; men tend to traditionally talk about task and power issues that reflect what they do’.

2.2.6 Conclusion

The interview is a complex dynamic process which can be influenced by the interviewer, the interviewee, memory and the relationship established between the interviewee and the interviewer. Analysis, when multi-layered, can provide insights into how the individual relates to an institution and/or an organisation, in this instance the dental profession.

As a tool, in this project, the taped oral history interview assisted in bringing to light the complexities of gender relations within the dental profession and the

---


38 Minister, K. 1994, 'A feminist frame for the oral history interview', in Gluck & Patai, op. cit., p. 31.

multi-factorial aspects of career choice. The interview is an invaluable tool in 'uncovering women’s perspective...women's unique experience as women is often muted, particularly in any situation where women's interests are at variance with those of men'.

As a research device the interview methodology can provide insights into the ways in which women dentists shape their identity between societal prescriptions of femininity and a professional identity that is inherently masculine. Methodology of this kind facilitates untangling the complexity of gender in a professional cohort and offers an exploratory medium to gain a greater insight into the connection between the political and the personal.

2.3 Myths

2.3.1 Introduction

Qualitative methodology gives space for patterns and ideas to emerge without the constraints of a restrictive formalised agenda. It became apparent that there was a connection between the memories of interviewees and the emerging identity of Barnes and Praed. Remembered narratives of written accounts of these two women were recalled in oral testaments by way of myth construction based on a gendered core.

---

40Anderson & Jack, in Gluck & Patai, op. cit., p. 11.
Narrative analysis of publications and oral history interviews concentrated on myth construction to explore the link between the personal and the political. Patai supported the views of Hankiss who argued that as speakers narrate their story, they endow certain episodes with a symbolic meaning that, in effect, turns these episodes into myths.41

Myth formation indicates how individuals give meaning to their lives in a social context. It became evident that narrative analysis was integral in understanding the manner in which Barnes and Praed were portrayed by family, friends, women dentists, male dentists and others who may have known or written about them.

Life stories as resources of historical evidence offer opportunities for multi-layered interpretations of the individual's relation to cultural influences. The individual life story is an expression of the link between the individual's social experience and the way in which that social experience integrates with and becomes part of history. Samuel and Thompson noted this link in their narrative analysis of oral histories:

the individuality of each life story ceases to be an awkward impediment to generalisation, and becomes instead a vital document of the construction of consciousness, emphasising both the variety in any social group, and also how each individual story draws on a common culture: a defiance of

the rigid categorisation of private and public, just as of memory and reality.\textsuperscript{42}

Chanfrault-Duchet’s argument that myths ‘are organise[rd] around two axes: one refers to collective history, the other to the individual’s history’\textsuperscript{43} is fundamental in the analysis of the Barnes and Praed myths. In this instance, there are two collectives, namely women and the dental profession. Therefore, gender and professionalism are the collective links to these women as individuals.

However, individual accounts (unpublished, published or oral histories) of these women tell us much about how they as individuals are interpreted within the institutions of family and profession. With the discussion focusing on gender, there is an unfolding of the historical and institutional dimensions and of the dynamics of femininity and masculinity.

Passerini’s study of an Italian community revealed how a political interpretation of events was transmitted over generations.\textsuperscript{44} Following Passerini’s line of argument, elements in Barnes and Praed’s lives have been interpreted and transmitted to maintain dominant cultural values. Barnes family myths, now residing in the Tindale-Hind family, are gender-based, while Praed myths for dentists are founded on a dynamic interaction between gender, class and professionalism. The dynamic of the relationship between individual and

\textsuperscript{42}Samuel & Thompson, op. cit., p. 2.

\textsuperscript{43}Chanfrault-Duchet, op. cit., p. 81.

collective, be it family, women, or profession, unfolds an interaction and interdependency between the political and the personal, with gender as the unifying link.

Thompson’s research on the factors that shaped the construction of identity for the surviving Anzac soldiers employed oral history interviews and explored ‘the relationship between identity, memory and public versions of the past’.⁴⁵ The oral histories of dentists who knew Praed drew on the published, and therefore public, accounts of her life. Their interpretation of these accounts is instructive in the way that myths created in the published accounts have informed women dentists’ identity. This is another example of how private and public expressions of social experiences interconnect to reveal the link between the individual and the political.

Shute argues that ‘mythologising woman has always been a standard method of gilding her cage’ and certainly the myths surrounding Barnes, Praed and other women dentists in this research support her view.⁴⁶ The myths formed around Praed are fashioned in the collective of white Anglo women in Australia: as pioneers, as the successful orphan or lost child, as ladies in dentistry and as lady dentists.⁴⁷ These myths abound with romantic images of adventure, race, class


and status. The reconstructions of Praed's personal and professional life in dental publications and in interviewees' narratives clearly follow these themes. Barnes shares the pioneering woman image but it is contained more within her letters, in the family album she shared with her sisters, and as part of a family myth with links to her mother, aunt, sisters and school. Certainly Praed reached legendary heights in the profession; Barnes, on the other hand, became almost invisible.

My task was to take these views into account to assess and analyse their significance, then to locate them within a frame that held their individual lives, times, race, class, gender and the dental profession. To achieve this required a multi-layered approach to the research, supplementing the evidence from oral history interviews with examination of published accounts of these women, together with primary and secondary records. A concerted effort was made not to lose sight of the hard evidence of officialdom as a backdrop, a complex layering of the meta-messages\textsuperscript{48} from these and other sources. Therefore, the aim was to create multi-dimensional images of these women from this fluid matrix of available resources.

A start was to find and read all available accounts of their lives. While for Annie Praed quantity abounded, the opposite was true for Madge Barnes. However, members of the dental profession had written many of these accounts. Therefore, these accounts are open to the problematic nature of the insider perspective, of

\textsuperscript{48}Anderson & Jack, op. cit., pp. 11–25.
being 'adversely affected by the narrow aim of celebrating constructed heroes, ethos and ideologies'.

I concur with Godden et al, and Hicks's views on insider historiographies. They claim that insider historiographies are inherently problematic because they are based on a dominant model with a linear dimension of ascendancy, where 'progress...occurred in a straightforward process from darkness into light and was the result of noble efforts of great men (and rarely women)'.

Integrated into my approach was the need to validate the insider's perspective but also to step back with a degree of distance to analyse the objectivity of their claims. This was especially relevant when these sources were other women dentists; I had to be mindful at all times that 'femininity is never fixed and always contested'.

A major component of the methodology consisted of a search of all official primary records. These included births, deaths and marriages registries, probate documents, electoral rolls, early telephone and city directories and dental registers. Investigations also led to a search of the records held at the Sydney branch of the Society of Australian Genealogists, the papers of the New South Wales Branch of the Australian Dental Association, and national, state and

---

49 Godden, Curry, & Delacore, op. cit., p. 27.

50 ibid.

51 Grimshaw, Lake, McGrath & Quartly, loc. cit.
university archives. These searches unravelled complexities, contradictions, unanswered questions, and often generated more paths to investigate.

At some point a decision had to be made to accept the available evidence without further pursuit. Once again Praed presented the greater challenge; her birth and family records have not yet come to light even after considerable delving in many directions. This very mystery of Annie Praed’s background is in itself significant.

Official documents provided clues that yielded another avenue of research: that of the oral history. Perhaps my most successful achievement was in locating the relatives of Madge Barnes: her great-niece, nephew and his wife. However, their stories in themselves were to provide challenges. Again myths, this time located in the institution of the family, were under threat. Another moment of good fortune was when Mary Ferguson, my friend and neighbour, drew my attention to Anne Cook’s notice in the *Sydney Morning Herald* seeking information on Annie Praed.

Oral historians are aware of the significance and complexity of the interviewee’s narrative and the historian is aware of the need for validated evidence to support certain statements. As a number of dentists who had known Annie Praed were interviewed, it became obvious that a relationship existed between published accounts and the interviewees’ versions. Hamilton and Le Goff noted ‘the importance of mythic stories and their repetition as a key element in the formation of collective history’.52 Published accounts of Barnes and particularly of Praed

52Hamilton, op. cit., p. 19.
informed members of the profession and became the device by which myths were constructed around Barnes and Praed within dental history.

Published accounts and oral history interviews with people who knew Annie Praed left me with a well-defined public image. The clarity, however, was just a little too well defined. For example, the interviews mirrored written accounts without any degree of variation related to personal knowledge. I began to wonder who was responsible for the construction of this image.

Multiple forms of femininity and masculinity as forms of gender expression in professionalism became evident with exploration of the myths created around Barnes and Praed. These forms were affected and shaped at different times by varying societal factors and were most evident during periods of rapid change such as the turn of the century, the coming of Federation and major wars. More women became dentists during World War I and World War II as a direct result of the dental needs in the community and the absence of men who were on overseas military duty.
FIGURE 2.2
‘Pioneer women dentists’, Australian Women’s Weekly

Doreen Musgrave, a 1937 graduate, was conscripted to encourage women students into the Faculty of Dentistry in the 1960s when the university quotas for the dental course were not filled. As part of her campaign, Musgrave organised a dinner for women dentists where she raised sufficient funds to establish a scholarship for a woman student. The scholarship received publicity in the

press and women were featured in an article in the nationally popular woman's magazine, *Australian Women's Weekly* (see Figure 2.2.). In the late 1960s, a similar drive to recruit women in the USA was directly related to the shortfall of male recruits seeking a career as dentists.

### 2.3.2 Gender

Gender has been described as a factor in historical outcome. This is reflected in the ways femininity and masculinity are played out at different periods of the twentieth century. Understanding the dynamics of gender interaction can offer insights into the difficulties encountered by women who cross the bridge into dominantly masculine domains of work. Sowerwine discusses the significance of gender in his work on Madeleine Pelletier (1874–1939):

Gender is often compared to class as a force in history. But people had long been fully conscious of the social hierarchies denoted by ‘class’...indeed such discourse was an essential part of everyone’s representation of society. Gender was not. Sexual inequality was more internalised and less often articulated as social injustice.

---


One layer of the myth construction was based on the masculine biographical model of valorising professional achievements within the context of the public sphere. However, femininity as an expression of gender underpinned other myths. One of these myths was that of the pioneering women as university graduates in Australia. Another was that of the 'lady' professional with the desired elements of class and status (factors central to masculinity but contained within the feminine). In these myths, societal femininity is arranged around the concepts of the domestic expertise in sewing, cooking and gardening; it is also constructed in the myth of matriarch.

The portrayal of Barnes in dental history is twofold: on one level she has shared, until the late 1960s, an invisibility in common with the experience of most women in history. On the other hand, she was reconstructed in the 1960s as a 'pioneer' and 'lady'. Partly as a result of economic boom years, the period of the late 1960s was a time of energising changes for women's increasing participation in tertiary education and the workforce. As employment opportunities were relatively high, the climate was ripe for a gender shift in the workplace. Another operative factor was the low number of men seeking careers as dentists.

Interviewees' memories of Praed not only confirm her location in the form of the heroic myth, but they are recalled as an affirmation of identity for other earlier women graduates. Interpreting this issue of myth construction are two major considerations: the inherent disadvantages of insider historiography and Praed's importance to the generation of women dentists who had known her. Praed held a certain prominence among these women, for she gave them a visible role
model in a profession where little existed. Annie Praed stands out through her availability to the generation her presence reached; this has boosted her significance to the dental profession. For the dominant and masculine component of the dental profession, Praed became the ‘token’ woman and therefore fulfilled and dispelled notions of gender obligation for these men.

This dominant visibility of Praed as a pioneer woman dentist suggests a number of interpretations. Crucial to Praed’s identification as the matriarch is the argument that the organisational culture of dental profession is one of patriarchy. The silencing and invisibility of Barnes’ presence furthered the image of Praed as a powerful singular figure of matriarchy, a symbol of Christianity.

Reports in the popular press of 1938, when Praed was awarded a Doctorate of Dental Science show that seventeen years after her retirement, Barnes’ presence in the 1906 graduating class seemed completely erased. The Bulletin announced Praed’s achievement as:

Sydney University’s first woman Doctor of Dental Science Dr. Annie Praed was a distinguished figure in her scarlet gown, its wide Portia-like sleeves lined with purple and bordered with ermine, as she went forwards to receive her degree in the Great Hall of the University last week. All the doctors’ degrees have an Australian seal. She was the first woman to get her licence in dental surgery at Sydney University, she was its first
woman Bachelor of Dental Surgery and now she has taken her doctorate
at the same address, the first woman dentist to do so.\textsuperscript{58}

The excerpt captures succinctly the essence of myth-making in gendered and
professional terms: matriarch, pioneer, gentrification of the dental profession and
validation of the university's credentials.

\textbf{2.3.3 Family myths and resource contradictions}

Peter Tindale's (Barnes' nephew)\textsuperscript{59} memories of his family, in particular his
mother and his grandfather, propelled me into many long arduous hours in
archives and libraries. The lack of success in finding evidence to support his
narrative had in itself significance to the construction of the Barnes-Tindale family
myths along gender themes. Uncovering facts that may have been omitted from
family accounts because of the social mores, especially along gender lines of that
time, can sometimes be difficult for the researcher to reveal to the family. Both
facts and myths, even when in contradiction, contributed to the interpretation and
understanding of the construction of Madge Barnes' femininity and her choice of
career.

The myth surrounding Peter Tindale's mother's departure from the study of
medicine to marry has many layers of interpretations. Records of Kathleen
Barnes' Senior or Matriculation Examinations could not be found. Nor was she
listed in any of the undergraduate lists of the medical faculty at the University of

\textsuperscript{58}A woman's letter', \textit{Bulletin}, 26 Jan. 1938, p. 34.

Sydney. It would seem that there is a lack of strong evidence that she attended university. A likely explanation for this family story is that when her marriage to wealthy grazier Reginald Tindale failed due to the financial loss incurred during the 1916 drought, Kathleen sought to redefine her identity along the lines of her sisters, as a pioneering university woman graduate (See Chapter 3).

Another example of a family myth reconstructed along gender lines, but in the form of masculinity, was Peter Tindale’s narrative about his grandfather’s alleged ownership of a pharmacy at Wycombe Road Neutral Bay, and a family home, Ravenscraig, at 3 Harriette Street, Neutral Bay. This myth, one of masculinity, was based on his grandfather being defined as a good provider. However, city and telephone directories between 1900 and 1922 failed to establish Stafford Henry Barnes in Neutral Bay. Stafford Henry Barnes’ 1922 death certificate, locating him at La Mascote Avenue, Concord, was a valuable record in tracing his whereabouts.\textsuperscript{60} As records attained from electoral rolls over a number of years confirmed this address as his residence there is a strong evidence for a parental separation.\textsuperscript{61} Divorce for this generation was fairly uncommon and socially unpalatable; therefore it is likely that family stories, in line with the social mores of that period, have maintained a silence over this arrangement.

\textsuperscript{60} NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the register; Between the wars Index 1919–1945, 1922, no. 2566.

\textsuperscript{61} Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral Roll, Division of East Sydney, Polling Place – Bligh, 1903, p. 4, no. 232; Division of Nepean, Polling Place – Concord, 1915, p. 2, no. 91; Division of Nepean, Polling Place – Concord, 1921, p. 5, no. 221.
The shifting constituents of the 'gilded cage' femininity and masculinity in the Barnes-Tindale family myths are exemplary illustrations of the link between personal and political. While family informed and affirmed femininity as agency, albeit for women as pioneers in professions, societal constraints of defined masculinity found their expression in the family myth surrounding the ownership of Ravenscraig. Documents record Pearl, the eldest Barnes daughter, as the purchaser of Ravenscraig in 1927 for £575 from Edward Lloyd Jones, Charles Lloyd Jones and Eric Lloyd Jones. Again family myths bounded by societal definitions of masculinity have rendered invisible this financial contribution by Pearl to retain the image of Stafford Henry Barnes within a version of masculinity that encompassed financial responsibility and capability. The myths created around the ownership of Ravenscraig illustrate how contesting femininities in a family have an interdependent relationship with societal constructions of masculinity and femininity.

2.3.4 **Family background myth and resource contractions**

Searching for information on Annie Praed’s family background has been a challenging and frustrating journey through records. Praed has been mythologised within the dental profession through published accounts relying on anecdotal evidence that proved valuable at times and at others unreliable.

---

An example of a research detour was the entry in the *Australian Dictionary of Biography* (ADB)\(^63\) that listed Praed’s birth date as 1873 and her matriculation school as St. Vincent’s College, Potts Point, a Catholic school. Her death certificate, however, proffered contradictory evidence in terms of religious practice, registering her as Anglican. Seeking confirmation among Senior Examinations records,\(^64\) I discovered that Mr Nichols and Mr Davies tutored Praed for her matriculation to university and that the ADB misinformation was the result of a line error in the records. The young woman listed immediately below Annie Praed had attended the Catholic college.

Oral history interviews with dentists, who were students or on staff during Praed’s time as a clinical demonstrator at the university, enhanced the myth that had been formed around previous published accounts of her life. Anecdotal evidence, with questionable authenticity, revolved around an English father and an Australian mother who came here perhaps via South Africa; when Praed was orphaned, her guardian, Mr Bradley, a dentist, persuaded absent paternal relatives to meet the tuition costs at Mrs Hughes’ privately operated girls’ school. Joe Skinner, her successor in her Temperance and General (T&G) practice, indicated a disadvantaged childhood when he wrote ‘Dr. Praed’s early years were far from affluent. She had no relatives in Australia’.\(^65\)

---


\(^{64}\) University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/135/5, Examination Register 1894–1899, Matriculation, Mar. 1895, p. 37.

\(^{65}\) Skinner, J. 22 Apr. 1967, 'Dr Annie Praed – Biographical notes'. *Doreen Musgrave Collection*. 
During interviews, published accounts were repeated so frequently and with such authority that I continued to delve without success into birth records around Australia following a lead on her death certificate ("Birthplace-unknown-somewhere in Australia"), as well as in South Africa and England. The Praed name, which is of Cornish origins, is relatively rare among Australian records of that time: a handful of miners in Victoria, a Mrs Alice Praed, two miners at Cobar, and a Mrs T. Praed who lived at Lindfield (1900-1905). John Praed, a miner with a strong public following, was Mayor of Eaglehawk and General Secretary of the Amalgamated Miners’ Association of Victoria and Tasmania between 1890s until his death in 1909, at the age of 48. Another Victorian Praed in the public light was the colourful Alice Praed, the spiritualist, who gained public notoriety when one of her clients accused her of fraud. Then, of course there were those famous Praeds, the Queensland author, Rosa, and her English husband Arthur Campbell Bulkley Praed, a younger son of the banking (now Lloyds Bank) and brewing family.

---

67 State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Bourke, 1884-1885, p. 338, no. 3683, (John); no. 3684. (Otto).
69 The late Mr. John Praed, Mayor of Eaglehawk & General Secretary of the Amalgamated Miners’ Association’, Argus 30 May 1909, p. 19; ‘Mr. John Praed, Secretary of the Amalgamated Miners’ Association of Victoria’, Bendagonian 4 Mar. 1897, p. 9; ‘John Praed, Mayor of Eaglehawk & General Secretary of the Amalgamated Miners’ Association’, Leader 8 June 1908, p. 34.
70 Alice Praed, spiritualist medium’, Weekly Times, loc. cit.
71 Electronic Communication with Jessie Campbell, Archivist, Barclays Group, Jessie Campbell@baclays.co.uk., 19 May 1999.
72 Mrs. Campbell Praed’, Australasian 10 Jan. 1891, p. 87.
Success in a minor form came in the Senior Examinations results that recorded her schooling at Mrs Hughes' Lotaville, Walsh's Terrace, Randwick, and also confirmed her birth date recorded as 4 January 1872. The veil over her birth raises unanswered questions.

Serendipity in searching fortunately produced Mr Bradley, who turned out to be Henry Burton-Bradley. Substantial evidence exists that he played a major role in Annie Praed's career path (see Chapter 3). Henry Burton-Bradley fulfilled the image of a successful Victorian middle-class public man.

Mystery surrounds the details of Henry Burton-Bradley's relationship with Praed. Indeed this relationship led to his writing an 'Apologia vita mea' to his family in 1889, five years before his death. The document survives today and a copy was made available by the generosity of Anne Cook and a Bradley descendant, Robert Irvine. While the document is open to a number of interpretations, it is clear that Henry Burton-Bradley was responsible for funding Annie Praed's education at Lotaville in Randwick. This document is discussed in greater detail in Chapter 3.

2.3.5 Myth: The 'successful orphan'

Oral and published narratives of Annie Praed's early life are reminiscent of popular fiction of the nineteenth century. In keeping with the kind of heroic myth

73 University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/58/4, Examination Register- Public 1894–1899, Senior, 1892, no. 2627.

74 Randwick & District Historical Society Inc.: Lotaville School; Transcript of Charlotte Elizabeth (Cissy) Hughes' 1888 Birthday Book.
of insider historiography, the published version of Annie Praed fulfilled the "Dickensian orphan success" myth. The dominant themes in the accounts of Annie Praed’s life carry strong associations with Rosa Praed novels and although highly speculative, suggest possible connections with the novelist’s husband, Arthur Campbell Praed. Indeed, when all accounts, oral and written were analysed a remarkable conclusion was deduced: all versions mirrored each other. This added to the mystique and fictional nature of the narrative.

The earliest version was Elsie Sautelle’s typed account:

The daughter of an Englishman who came to Australia for health reasons, married an Australian girl, and both dying young, Annie was left with no one to take much interest in her until a friend of her father’s saw her possibilities and wrote to distant relatives in England who sent money for her education.\(^{75}\)

In the first published form, the narrative was enriched:

Anne was the daughter of an Englishman who came out to this country and married an Australian. Both he and his wife died early, and Anne, a delicate girl, moved from one to another of her mother’s relatives. A Mr. Bradley, a dentist and a friend of her late father, observing Anne’s capabilities, wrote to England. Her relatives then sent out a lump sum for

her education and Mr. Bradley placed her in the charge of a Mrs. Hughes, who conducted a school for young ladies at Coogee.\textsuperscript{76}

In the document to his family, 'Apologia vita mea', Henry Burton-Bradley stated that Annie Praed's grandmother 'was born of a good family in England, a Praed, the Bankers of some note in London' and that her grandfather had at one time been tipstaff to his uncle (Judge Westbrooke Burton). While Henry Burton-Bradley also referred to Praed's father and grandmother in the present tense, he failed to name them.

When Annie was placed with us by her grandmother...I told her that if it should occur again...that I would send her back to her grandmother...I obtained Annie's apprenticeship to me by her father...\textsuperscript{77}

Indeed, secrecy and ambiguity infuse the whole document. For example, the explanation for the funds for Annie Praed's education was:

I had the good fortune to be the depository for the security of £150 which I obtained leave to dispose in Annie's cause with the promise of more if it should be wanted.\textsuperscript{78}

Henry Burton-Bradley did not name the person who supplied the £150. However he does provide sufficient proof that Annie Praed was not an orphan


\textsuperscript{77}Burton-Bradley, H. 23–24 May 1889, 'Apologia vita mea', op. cit.

\textsuperscript{78}ibid.
in May 1889. Probate records\textsuperscript{79} confirm Henry Burton-Bradley’s financial contribution to Annie Praed’s education at Lotaville. However the ‘Apologia vita mea’ strongly suggests an absent mother. Coincidentally, Tiffin’s analysis of Rosa Praed’s literary work points out that there is a strong representation of ‘vulnerable motherless daughters’ in her writing.\textsuperscript{80}

Most probably the use of the orphan device romanticised further the Annie Praed myth, and also served to mask the legitimacy of Annie Praed’s parentage.

2.3.6 \textit{Myth: The pioneer}

Barnes and Praed occupy a certain space in dental history. They were the pioneers of the new university dental course. They were also the first women to graduate with a Bachelor of Dental Surgery. This achievement gains even greater importance when their presence is viewed in the context of the following seventy years. In percentage terms the presence of women did not reach the same level until the mid-1970s. By tracing pioneering as a factor in women’s choice of dentistry as a career over this period, a theme emerged linking generations of women. Viewing Barnes’ and Praed’s presence as two of a collective produces a link from the past to the present. An example of this argument can be found in the oral history interview of a mid-1970s white, Anglo, middle-class graduate whose reasons for choosing a dental education at university included: ‘I liked

\textsuperscript{79}Supreme Court of NSW: Probate Index; vol. A–C, 1880–1900, Series 4, 21 Mar. 1895, no. 8643.

being different. Lots of nasty dentists but I was determined to be a nice one. Bit of a challenge really.\textsuperscript{81}

Lake and Holmes argue that past experiences of women are inexorably linked to women’s experiences in the present. They liken the process to charting ‘surprising continuities’.\textsuperscript{82} It can be deduced that inter-dependence exists between the personal and political pioneering images created around these women. Timing was the linking factor between the 1970s graduate and the pioneers, Barnes and Praed. At the turn of the century and from the late 1960s to early 1970s, the Women’s Movement gained political impetus and public awareness.

Images of heroic and romantic proportions are conveyed in the Musgrave version: her portrayal of Praed facing the elements and overcoming hardships both physical and personal sets the narrative in the adventure genre. Praed’s alleged early loss of her parents enhances this image of the pioneering adventurer who overcomes overwhelming circumstantial and physical misfortunes. Her assigned orphan status, too, is evocative of literary characters: she is described as a young ‘delicate girl, moving from one to another of her mothers’ relatives’. Delicacy in Victorian terms of gender was strongly associated with gentility. Henry Burton-Bradley’s document records that while Praed was ill


with typhoid in April 1886, she recovered sufficiently to attend to her household duties.\textsuperscript{83}

Literary images abound in the narrative of her rescue from these misfortunes by the goodness of a benefactor, her father's friend: a dentist who recognises her ability and presses her English paternal relatives to finance Praed's secondary education. But Henry Burton-Bradley was actually a solicitor and not a dentist. It was his grandson, John Houghton Bradley, who was a dentist and one of Praed's 1906 classmates.

Establishing an image of noble moral character, with an independent spirit, suitable for the new frontier of dentistry, and juxtaposing the ideals of the new Federation of Australia are the tales of her adventures across the high seas, albeit Sydney Harbour. The physical adventurous element of the heroine in the pioneer myth is related in the narrative of:

As Mr. Twemlow's sight was failing, Anne used to read to him. Under his direction, and with the aid of the manual that accompanied the parts, she put together the first motor-boat engine that ever ran on Sydney Harbour.\textsuperscript{84}

And found also in the following:

\textsuperscript{83}Burton-Bradley, H. 23–24 May 1889, 'Apologia vita mea', op. cit.
\textsuperscript{84}Musgrave, op. cit., p. 52.
Anne thus had to row across the Harbour to Folly Point (sometimes their boatman took her but quite often she rowed herself), walk up to Military Road, catch the tram to Milson’s Point, the ferry to Circular Quay and the tram when she could afford it, to the University.85

These accounts fall within Hicks’ charter and criticism of insider historiography of movement from ‘darkness’ into ‘light’.86 Evidence for the motor boat anecdote has not been found. In a telephone conversation with Willoughby Historical Society representative, Les Vaughan, it was stated that motor boats were in operation on the harbour as early as the mid-1860s.87

Barnes’ image in Musgrave’s publications also fulfils the adventure myth: a young woman pioneering the uncharted territory of a university career:

I could detect in her eye the mischievous gleam of the girl she had been.

A lifelong friend described her as “fair-haired, of great charm and friendliness, and with a ready and malicious Irish wit.”88

This myth is also found in Barnes’ recollection of her career choice: ‘the faculty had just opened and I thought I would like to “be unique” and do the unusual’.89

85 Ibid.


88 Musgrave, op. cit., p. 53.

89 Barnes, M. E. 22 Aug. 1964, Correspondence. Doreen Musgrave Collection.
For each woman, the pioneering myth that underpins her narrative reflects a particular form of femininity that was available to each generation. Whilst women of Barnes’ and Praed’s generations were subject to the images of the pioneering suffragettes, Musgrave was receptive to literary imagery of a heroine cast in the romantic adventurer. During the 1930s the aviatrix was the icon of this myth. By the 1970s, Enno has caught her generation’s train of feminism. Connecting all narratives is the pioneering myth of the woman seeking to meet the challenge of the new frontier.

Role modelling for Barnes and Praed may have included the glamorous, well-travelled, financially independent American, Mrs ‘Ramborger’ Hammell, whose arrival in Sydney in 1890 was described in the local newspapers as “the pioneer of dentistry among women”. This is discussed more extensively in Chapter 3.

The seeds for Praed’s pioneering pursuits were most likely planted by Henry Burton-Bradley, who pioneered a number of reforms in the mid to late 1880s in Sydney. Indeed, pioneering new ideas in the public arena seems to flow through Henry Burton-Bradley’s descendants. Among the outstanding achievers are Henry Houghton Bradley (hybridisation of Australian plants), John Houghton Bradley (1906 dental graduate), Clement Henry Burton-

---


Bradley\textsuperscript{93} (immunisation), Eileen and Joan Bradley\textsuperscript{94} (bush regeneration), Claudia Burton-Bradley\textsuperscript{95} (cerebral palsy) and Sir Burton Gyrth Burton-Bradley\textsuperscript{96} (psychiatry in New Guinea). Henry Burton-Bradley\textsuperscript{97} was well known for voicing his views on social and public health reforms. He was also a leading figure in horticulture for his time. Evidence of his efforts may be found at the Scottish Hospital (Glenmore Road and Cooper Street), Paddington, the site of his former home, The Terraces, which he built in 1849.

Denne described The Terraces as:

The Paddington Assessment Book of 1862 gives a description of the house “Stone and brick House, shingled, two floors, eleven rooms”. Bradley was an ardent horticulturist and laid out the terraced gardens for which the house was well known.\textsuperscript{98}

Henry Burton-Bradley’s grandson, Peter Bradley, wrote that The Terraces:

\textsuperscript{93}Mitchell Library: Bradley, Clement Henry Burton; 616.01/141, Oral methods of immunisation, (with bibl.), Sydney, Deaton & Spencer, 1944.


\textsuperscript{97}‘The late Mr. H. B. Bradley’, \textit{Sydney Morning Herald} 29 Dec. 1894, p. 6.

became a haunt for the elite of Sydney until Bradley moved to a new mansion, Llewellyn at Five Dock. Bradley left his mark in Paddington where he had spent much of his spare time in the large grounds attending his garden. Bradley was a keen horticulturist and was well known for his experiments and success with bulbous plants. Some of the trees he planted in the grounds of the now Scottish Hospital are still prospering.\footnote{Society Australian Genealogists, Sydney: Bradley, Henry 1815–1894; 4/10,232, family investigation letters written to P. Geeves for column in Sydney Morning Herald, Peter Bradley, 16 Apr. 1981. 100.}

Horticultural and zoological pastimes were reasonably fashionable among prominent men at that time in Sydney. Henry Parkes, too, had an active horticultural interest at his home at Faulconbridge.\footnote{Stories of Australian history: Squire of Paddington's home now hospital', Sun 16 July 1975, p. 12.}

The pioneering of new ideas, particularly public health, into the public arena resurfaces among generations of Burton-Bradleys. With an almost evangelistic fervour the Burton-Bradleys pursued and publicised their views, thereby gaining public recognition.

One family member, Henry Houghton Bradley (1845–1918), who was the son in legal practice with Henry Burton-Bradley, developed an interest in horticulture and became an authority in 'hybridisation and genetics'. Recognition for his work in this field earned him an award that he received at the 4th International

Conference on Genetics in 1911. He was a foundation member of the Entomological Society of NSW and the Linnean Society of NSW.\textsuperscript{102} In his younger days he was also an authority on spiders.\textsuperscript{103} His son, Clement Henry Burton-Bradley, became well known for his medical research into infectious diseases.\textsuperscript{104}

George Fullerton Bradley’s (1848–1889) son, John Houghton Bradley married his first cousin Caroline Mary Drummond, the daughter of Mary Louisa Burton-Bradley who was born in 1844. While John Houghton Bradley became a pioneer dental graduate in 1906, his daughters, Joan and Eileen, pioneered techniques for bush regeneration in Australia.

In this way Henry Burton-Bradley’s influence permeated generational membranes and resurfaced in new expressions of idealism that resonated with passion and found expression in a public dimension. Clearly his ideas of pioneering in a public way infiltrated to Praed. She in turn explored and crossed frontiers that were opening up to the ‘new woman’ and the new professional, the dentist. Therefore the path was paved for Praed to take on the challenge of being a pioneer graduate with a Bachelor of Dental Surgery, later a Doctorate of Dental Surgery, and a foundation member of a number of dental

\textsuperscript{102}Madden, op. cit., pp. 153–4.

\textsuperscript{103}Mitchell Library: Linnean Society of NSW; ML MSS 2006/108, various collections, items 1—3, Henry Houghton Burton-Bradley, correspondence 1865–1877.

organisations. The urge to pioneer holds a number of meanings, some simple, others complex, covert and overt. Central is the drive for recognition, personal and/or public.

In a historical context, the timing of the formative years of Barnes' and Praed's youth was a significant factor in their position as pioneer graduates in dentistry. For they were adolescents during a period of great political activity, a time when women's suffrage and the nation's federation was sought and won.

FIGURE 2.3
Teresa and Margaret Quinn
Courtesy Virginia Hind

In the case of Barnes, the myth of pioneering women, I suggest, was transmitted over generations. From her maternal grandmother who migrated from Ireland to Calcutta, to her mother Teresa Quinn and Aunt Margaret who moved to Australia (see Figure 2.3), and to her sister Pearl who pioneered new
territory when she crossed gender boundaries to become a graduate of the University of Sydney. This flowed onto the next generation as Brassington, the nephew Madge partly raised, married one of New Zealand’s pioneer university graduates.  

The pioneering myth was influenced and reinforced by the social spheres available to Madge Barnes, primarily through her education at Riviere College and her associations with her sister Pearl’s Sydney Girls’ High School colleagues many of whom were graduates of the University of Sydney. These women, who were influential as role models for the early university graduates, are further discussed in the chapters dealing with education and personal influences on career choice.

2.3.7 **Myth: The dentist as a lady**

Invested interests, either personal and/or professional, have been unveiled in the accounts relating to Barnes and Praed. The makeover, for example, of Annie Praed’s reconstruction to Dr Anne Praed, is indicative of the kind of narrative formed along gendered and class lines.

The myth of ‘dentist as a lady’ appears in Musgrave’s article ‘The history of the pioneering women in dentistry’. Of Barnes, Musgrave wrote ‘I first met her in 1964 at Southport, Qld She was, and still is a truly regal lady, with manners and

---

105 Virginia Hind Collection.
stately bearing of a duchess born and bred.¹⁰⁶ Musgrave portrayed Praed along similar lines, as having a 'gentle, dignified and regal manner'.¹⁰⁷

Several points in the account dealing with Praed need to be analysed: the altering of her first name; the Twemlow link as a measure of desired status; the claimed regret for her single status; her expertise in the domestic domain; her dedication to the profession. But the most significant factor is the suppression of Annie Praed's status when she entered Henry Burton-Bradley's household. Annie Praed arrived as a servant and left as his ward.

Musgrave's representation of Praed in the 1968 Appolonia¹⁰⁸ is more in keeping with the image and concomitant myth of 'lady dentist'. Her publications and interviews tell us not only about Annie Praed and other women dentists but also about herself, as a woman dentist who has been a witness to the years between 1930 and 1970s. All offer expressions of what Lake and Holmes have described as symptomatic of 'self-conscious women, negotiating the contradictions and tensions of twentieth-century femininity'.¹⁰⁹ Musgrave is a strong advocate of women's rights to educational and professional opportunities. However, she is adamant about her anti-feminist views – reiterating her stand that she is dentist first, without an emphasis on gender. Contrary to this ideology is the evidence

¹⁰⁶Musgrave, op. cit. p. 53.
¹⁰⁷Ibid., pp. 49–53.
¹⁰⁸Ibid.
¹⁰⁹Lake, & Holmes, op. cit, p. 40.
that she is responsible for a considerable amount of research material on women dentists, an undertaking that was of her own initiative.

A number of sources support this composite construct of femininity and professionalism that is embedded in a matrix of Anglo middle and upper class culture. Joe Skinner recorded that 'Dr. Praed was very feminine in her nature, very meticulous in her dress, appearance, speech and in her work.'\(^{110}\) Magnus gave a similar account:

How well do I remember her in those days, with her immaculately laundered uniform, her iron grey hair and her pince-nez glasses...She was dignified and instinctively courteous.\(^{111}\)

It would seem that Praed actively cultivated this image that may have been drawn from her experience with Henry Burton-Bradley, who was remembered as being the 'perfect gentleman in manners and education.'\(^{112}\) Magnus' recollection of her 'immaculately laundered uniform' offers a clue to Praed's time in domestic service. Elsie Sautelle's memories that 'in addition to this she could cook like a French chef, sew better than most women, and was devoted to children and young people'\(^{113}\) also provide clues to her earlier working-life when she met the domestic needs of the Burton-Bradley family.

\(^{110}\)Skinner, J. op. cit.


\(^{113}\)Sautelle, E. op. cit.
FIGURE 2.4
Annie Praed, Monte Luke photograph
Courtesy Richard Sautelle
Contributing to the myth of the dentist as a lady and that of the pioneer woman dentist is 1930s photograph of Praed (see Figure 2.4). Monte Luke, a photographer of some note, was Praed’s choice for the public image she wished to convey. Circulated among dental and public publications this photograph was the dominant image portrayed by and of Praed.

Another transformation worth noting was the variation of Praed’s first name. The changing of Praed’s first name from Annie to Anne holds meanings of class and professionalism. Annie was the name recorded on her death certificate, will, and probate papers. In her own hand she is officially recorded as Annie Praed in the Signature book of Dental Register (see Figure 2.5). It would appear that Praed was aware of her public image.

FIGURE 2.5
Annie Praed’s signature as it appears in the NSW Dental Board records

Published accounts, of Praed’s relationship with the Twemlows, support the argument of privilege as a desired adjunct to the image of professionalism. Gentility enhances the image and myth ‘lady dentist’:

---

114 NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5166, Signature Book no. 1, 1901–1923, p. 9, 1901, 5 Mar., no. 83.
Having finished her early education, another friend, Mr. Twemlow, who although an essayer by profession numbered dentistry amongst his other accomplishments, took Anne to live with his wife and himself (being childless) as their daughter... The Twemlows lived in Middle Harbour, on the north side of what was then known as Twemlows Point and where the home of Sir Edward Holstrom now stands.\(^{115}\)

Leslie’s history of Northbridge\(^{116}\) states that a William Lenty Twemlow, married to Mary Marshfield, built The Hermitage at Fig Tree Point, Northbridge, later purchased by Sir Edward Hallstrom (see Figure 2.6). Leslie claimed that the Twemlows had a daughter whose elopement had estranged her from her parents until the birth of her child, Aubrey. Leslie also disputed that William Twemlow, a dentist, listed at Sailor’s Bay Road (off Alpha Road) and William Lenty Twemlow were one and the same. However the Sands’ directories list Annie Praed as residing at The Hermitage and working with a Twemlow in her rooms in King Street, Sydney between 1901\(^{117}\) and 1903.\(^{118}\)

In his will William Lenty Twemlow\(^{119}\) bequeathed all his estate, including The Hermitage to Annie Southwell. William Twemlow did have a daughter with his

\(^{115}\)Musgrave, op. cit., p. 52.


estranged wife, Mary Marshfield\textsuperscript{120} who, in 1913, bequeathed her estate to this daughter, Jane Whitehouse. Annie Southwell's will acknowledged her as also being known as Annie Twemlow. It is most probable that Annie Southwell-Twemlow and William Twemlow are the Twemlow couple referred to in Musgrave's publication.

\textbf{FIGURE 2.6}
\textit{The Hermitage, 1923, A.G. Mitchell Collection, (C289)}
\textit{Courtesy Willoughby City Library}

Supporting the Southwell argument is the fact that at one time Southwell and Praed lived at Tournay in Redan Street, Mosman.\textsuperscript{121} The relationship between the women remains unknown, and in the dispersion of Southwell's estate Annie

\textsuperscript{120}Supreme Court of NSW: Probate Index; vol. R–Z, 1911–1918, Series 4, 23 July 1913, no. 61431.

\textsuperscript{121}Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral roll; Division of North Sydney, Subdivision of Mosman, 1909, p. 141, no. 8402, p. 115, no. 6852.
Praed received no mention. Southwell's beneficiaries included Twemlow female relatives, including one whose married name was unknown to Southwell. Annie Southwell-Twemlow's relationship with Praed is unknown and I suggest that the arrangement of landlady-boarder is a most likely interpretation. However Praed's connection with William Twemlow offers another possible explanation for her entry into an apprenticeship in dentistry.

Available evidence from publications, directories and probate documents suggest that William Twemlow, dentist and William Lenty Twemlow, the owner of The Hermitage, were one and the same. No death or probate records exist for another William Twemlow. Leslie's and Musgrave's accounts have points in common. Musgrave's version was:

Anne...had to row across the Harbour to Folly Point (sometimes their boatman took her, but quite often she rowed herself) walk up to Military Road, catch the tram to Milson's Point, then ferry to Circular Quay and the tram when she could afford it, to the University.¹²³

Leslie quoted Lenahan's 1964 research:

In those days, the only access to the house was by water, and every day William Twemlow and a servant sailed from 'The Hermitage' through the spit, round Middle Head and Bradley's Head to Circular Quay and thence


¹²³Musgrave, loc. cit.
to the jeweler's shop in the Sydney Arcade. When becalmed, they resorted to the oar.124

FIGURE 2.7
Map showing the location of Twemlow's residence, Middle Harbour
Courtesy Mitchell Library

Leslie also acknowledged that Twemlow's Reef was known locally as a 'popular fishing area'.125 The illustrated map126 locates the Twemlow's property on the southern side of Sailor's Bay Road (see Figure 2.7).

Praed's association with William Twemlow and his de facto wife Annie Southwell has become gentrified in dental history to fit an idealised image of

125 ibid.
professorialism. It is this type of revision that stimulates some of the criticism of insider historiography.

In the oral history interviews with Musgrave, she articulated the meanings of class that she attached to professorialism. Musgrave’s comments about class and femininity suggest that these views informed her articles: her form of professorialism was linked with class and femininity of a romantic kind. These views on professorialism and femininity need to be located in her time frame of a late 1930s graduate. Morantz-Sanchez has drawn attention to the 1930s as a time when women physicians in America training in a masculine environment ‘learned to accept the prevailing values of the profession without wielding any real power within it’.\textsuperscript{127} She argues that women in medicine experienced a double minority: in their profession and among other women. They struggled with the ideals of the professional, set in the masculine ethos of ‘individualism, scientific objectivity, rationality, personal achievement and careerism’\textsuperscript{128} and with the segregation they experienced from other women in society. In crossing into the realm of professorialism the blurring of the ‘sexual spheres’\textsuperscript{129} can be noted in Musgrave’s contradictory views on women as dentists.

In the myth of the dentist as a lady, the important link between class and gender is evident in the term ‘lady’ dentist and its social connotations. Paid work for

\textsuperscript{127}Morantz-Sanchez, op. cit., p. 7.
\textsuperscript{128}Ibid., p. 5.
\textsuperscript{129}Ibid.
women was generally limited to working-class women, whilst work in the public sphere for the women of the middle and upper classes was generally of the unpaid philanthropic kind. Paid work in the public sphere was considered the exclusive realm of men.

As white Anglo middle-class women crossed the boundary from unpaid to paid work, they carried fragments of meanings attached to work from all these spheres: working class, philanthropy and masculinity. The layering of class over paid work in a sense tipped the balance towards masculinity and philanthropy, thereby leaving such women to negotiate their identity through a minefield of gender. Notions of femininity associated with the term 'lady' however carried certain meanings for these women. Grimshaw, Lake and others have argued that:

These activities provided affluent women with an engagement that occupied some leisure time and gave them a sense of agency commensurate with their status. Less affluent middle-class women also found such work important for their identity.¹³⁰

Myth construction surrounding Praed’s practice of dentistry drew upon these notions of middle-class femininity that defined work in terms of eugenics ideologies and social relations, for her ‘patients were largely children, servants or old friends, with here and there an occasional brave male patient’.¹³¹

¹³⁰Grimshaw, Lake, McGrath, & Quartly, op. cit., p. 160.
¹³¹Musgrave, op. cit., p. 52.
Barnes has also been moulded to fit this work model, but with a slight variance on the theme. Even though in family anecdotes Barnes is depicted as a woman with no desire to be involved with children, her dental expertise was transformed to incorporate motherhood of a public kind. This form of femininity is illustrated in the following:

She did not favor children as patients, yet nevertheless became the first official dentist for the boys under the care of Rev. Aspinall from Scots College. As they rushed from school in the afternoon for appointments, Madge decided to ply them with tea and biscuits on their arrival. This greatly reduced the incidence of fainting.\(^\text{132}\)

Barnes and Praed were left to negotiate a professional identity that was caught in crossfire of vestiges from an unpaid work model of feminine philanthropy and a paid work model of working-class femininity and middle-class masculinity.

2.3.8  Myth: The lady dentist

Another myth uncovered in the oral history narratives was that of ‘the lady dentist’. The gendered labelling of dentist is only ever expressed in the feminine, indicating the assumption that dentists are men. Musgrave has strongly defended her views against feminism and a gendered concept of a dentist. So strongly held are her views that she refused to join the Women’s Dental Association. The oral history interview disclosed how she negotiated professionalism and contesting femininities as a dental student and graduate. When her fellow university students...

\(^{132}\)ibid., p. 55.
students, all male, would go to the pub she felt 'lonely', yet remained insistent of the equality she shared with them. Musgrave's relationship with the wives of her dental colleague exemplifies the way she traversed the complex territories of contesting notions of femininities:

I was always asked to join the wives' committees. They were all trading on their husband's status I might add and they all had a certain degree of importance according to the degree of their husband's importance. It gave me a great deal of amusement but I also made a great many friendships with the wives....\footnote{133}{Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 14 May 1996, op. cit.}

Matthews\footnote{134}{Matthews, J. J. 1984, \textit{Good and Mad Women: The historical construction of femininity in twentieth-century Australia}, Allen & Unwin, Sydney.} has argued that there are three sites of femininity in twentieth-century Australia: sexuality, motherhood and work. The above quotations from the oral history interview illustrate how Musgrave encountered and negotiated her way around complex and contesting meanings of femininity and professionalism. These complexities can be sifted out of her articles featuring Barnes and Praed. Femininity in terms of work and motherhood is important to Musgrave and informed her writing, particularly on Praed's single state. Musgrave's prescriptions for meanings of femininity and professionalism are apparent in the following:

Anne was dedicated to her profession and she felt she could not marry.

This she greatly regretted in later years and would advise all young
dentists, "You must marry, my dear". She devoted herself to Elsie's
children — indeed all young people.\footnote{Musgrave, loc. cit.}

Senior men and women dentists repeat this account of Praed's views on
marriage.\footnote{Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 14 May 1996, op. cit.} While Musgrave applauds Praed's calling to the profession, and
valorises Praed's involvement, it is framed within a context of the higher calling
of marriage, woman's true vocation. Musgrave touches upon the very issues
that connect women of today to the past: how contesting messages about
femininity are individually negotiated through a sea of family, professional and
societal cultures and values.

Musgrave's views of femininity and professionalism are constructed in response
to a masculine model of a dentist and a masculine organisational culture of the
dental profession. That culture was dominant during the years of the
Depression, and the 1950s and 1960s, when there was a strong social culture
against Anglo middle-class women's participation in the paid workforce.

Writing under a pseudonym,\footnote{Murray, A. R. (pseud. of Doreen Musgrave) 1974, \textit{Looking Down in the Mouth}, self-published, Devon, Great Britain.} Musgrave's \textit{Looking Down in the Mouth} is a
fictional account of dental student life in the 1930s couched in the romantic
genre. Although this book was self-published in the 1970s, it was written soon
after graduation. The oral history interview confirmed the importance of romance
to Musgrave's perspective on femininity. Musgrave's construct of femininity is
informed by those constructs of her youth, exemplified by her statement, ‘romance was the big thing and I think we should go back to it...women like to look up to men. It’s part of being female. That’s romance.’ Musgrave’s second novel, *No Magic Lost*, written in the 1990s, is imbued with family history and romance. Set on the Hawkesbury River, NSW, the home of her Australian ancestors, the main character is a pioneering red-haired single young woman, who is transformed by romance into the elegant wife of a gentleman. In this transformation, none of the qualities that are necessary to overcome the challenges of the New World are lost. As Old World meets New, from European gentility to Aboriginal medical survival skills, the dominant theme is one of pioneering a new frontier. The narrative is in keeping with Musgrave’s view of a familial femininity. In both novels, the heroine, like Musgrave, is a redhead.

Meanings of femininity have their foundations in social relations. Wicks supports Connell’s views on gender order:

> At the level of mass social relations, however, forms of femininity are defined clearly enough. It is the global subordination of women to men that provides an essential basis for differentiation. One form is defined around compliance with this subordination and is oriented to

---

138 Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 14 May 1996, op. cit.


accommodating the interests and desires of men. I will call this 'emphasised femininity'.

Connell described this collective form of gender, being expressed across different generations of women, as one 'around themes of sexual receptivity in relation to younger women and motherhood in relation to older women.'

In her description of Barnes' retirement from dentistry, Musgrave returned to the theme of romance:

A handsome young soldier seeking Anne's professional help one day encountered Miss Barnes. "Won't I do?" she asked sweetly. "You'll do!" said Sapper Maltby-Robinson fervently. And Madge gave up practice to be married in 1920.

At forty years of age Sapper was hardly a youth! While Musgrave supports this form of femininity in ideological terms she draws upon a diverse range of femininity for her identity. Musgrave holds that it is this 'emphasised femininity' that is the desirable form of femininity among professional men. Indeed she champions this form for women dentists. She advocates that intelligence in women needs to be masked. She expounds these opinions in her book:

---

141 Connell, op. cit., p. 183.
142 ibid., p. 187.
143 Musgrave, op. cit., p. 55.
"You know what the boys say," commented Harry mournfully, in one of our frequent discussions.

"I generally get to find out. But what is it they say this time?"

"Never marry a graduate. They think for themselves."

"They think; period," I corrected bitterly.

"Maybe Hugh Denning's a bit afraid of you, Gravy. You're so strong minded." Harry pressed the point.

"The stronger the female the stronger the man she needs, that's all. And don't tell me Hugh isn't stronger."

"Yes I know he is," Harry agreed carefully, scratching his ear with one hand and attempting to shove in a shirt tail with the other, "but maybe you're just a bit of a threat to his ego or something. Just even being a University student narrows a girl's chances of getting married, really."

"I guess you're right," I sighed. "If you want to be clever you have to play dumb."¹⁴⁴

During the oral history interview, Musgrave's reply to these views was:

That's true! If you wanted to be clever you had to play dumb. I still believe that. Men do not like clever women. They feel threatened. My sister is a classic example of that; she's clever and she's always coy, very feminine, clingy and everybody loves her...she's vivacious...but she would never let it be known that she had any brains and she did. Very much so. I think she is most probably the most feminine woman I know.¹⁴⁵

¹⁴⁴Murray, op. cit. p. 88.

¹⁴⁵Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 14 May 1996, op. cit.
Nevertheless, Musgrave's constructs of femininity are also informative about the kind of masculinity that was present in the dental profession. Connell's definition of a hegemonic form of masculinity as 'a social ascendancy achieved in a play of social forces that extends beyond contest of brute power into the organisation of private life and cultural processes'\textsuperscript{146} clearly illustrates how 'emphasised femininity' exists in response to the concepts of acceptable masculinity. Musgrave's notions of femininity emerge in response to this concept of hegemonic masculinity that is inherent to her social sphere, particularly in the professional culture of dentistry.

Evidence has been offered that certain myths, constructed around gender and professionalism, are the collective links between generations of women dentists. These myths offer an understanding of women dentists' construction of professionalism and femininity against a backdrop of dentistry and the larger society. This strong affirmation of a form of femininity that had attached meanings of class and sexuality was a response to the masculine culture's push to stereotype the women who dared to enter their masculine world as 'asexual deviants'.\textsuperscript{147}

2.3.9 \textit{Myth: The woman dentist as a matriarch}

Earlier examples of myth construction for women dentists have a central gendered core of sexuality. However, another myth, emerging in terms of age,

\textsuperscript{146} Connell, op. cit., p. 184.

has attached an asexual element that tends to fuel the myth. Annie Praed in many ways has become mythologised to legendary levels in dental history; the fact that she sits there alone emphasises the gender dominance in the dental profession. The problematic elements of insider historiography are exhibited in descriptions of Praed in this form. They are exemplified in the following statement: “She was a woman of outstanding personality, magnanimous, never bearing a grudge, and with a determination to ‘do’”, wrote Elsie Sautelle. “She was truly great.”

The image of the matriarch is reinforced with this description:

> gentle, dignified and regal manner. The picture of her immaculately starched frocks, iron grey hair, pince-nez glasses is as unforgettable as her toque hats, elegant gowns, ermine with tails and double strand of pearls about her neck.

Insider historiographies have contributed to the mythologising of Praed as an historical figure of legendary proportions. One such account of the glorifying kind came from Sir Charles McDonald on the occasion of the 1966 Annie Praed Oration:

> I was fortunate to know, love, and respect Annie Praed, as one of my teachers. Besides her academic achievements and ability, Annie Praed wore the humility of the great, the rectitude of the saint, and that kind,

---

148 Musgrave, op. cit., p. 53.

149 Ibid.
friendly, and helpful disposition of an ordinary mortal. We need our Annie Praeds, our Lillian Lindsays\textsuperscript{150}, our Pierre Fauchards\textsuperscript{151} now, more than ever, to show us the way.\textsuperscript{152}

The establishment of an oration in her honour immortalised Annie Praed in matriarchal terms. Inherent in the myth of matriarch, and therefore legend, is the concept of hierarchies of class and gender. Class in these terms signalled implications of a desired status of professionalism. The matriarch myth serves to reminds us that by singling out only one woman, Praed, women dentists remain the exception. This retains the image of a masculine culture for the dental profession. Praed was dentistry's matriarch, a position she copied from Henry Burton-Bradley who was one of the legal profession's patriarchs. At the time of his death in 1894, he was the longest practising solicitor on the roll of the Supreme Court of NSW.\textsuperscript{153} When Praed died in 1948, her professional career had also spanned over fifty years.


\textsuperscript{151}Ibid., Lillian Lindsay, Britain's first woman graduate dentist, and 'great dental historian', translated Fauchard's work in 1946.

\textsuperscript{152}McDonald, C. G. 1967, 'The Annie Praed Oration, 1966', \textit{Australian Dental Journal}, vol. 12, no. 3, p. 249.

\textsuperscript{153}Bennet, op. cit., p. 91.
2.4 Conclusion

Discussion has focused on how resources and methodology interrelate in a dynamic manner. Representations of Barnes and Praed in dental publications capture, on one hand, the problematic nature of insider historiography: the genre is one of celebration rather than objectivity. On the other hand, the very existence of these publications is a distinct advantage, offering an opportunity to validate the argument that contesting femininities are underpinned by complex interacting factors of class, professionalism and societal values.

The analysis of resources helped to expose the myths that have been constructed around Barnes and Praed. Methodology based on a qualitative approach formed a flexible framework to explore the relationships between resources and myth. Narrative analysis served to recognise and explore the complexities of insider historiographies.

With the myths that are part of the Annie Praed story, it has become a challenge to locate the source of these narratives. Doreen Musgrave was given these stories in good faith by Praed’s friend and former nurse, Elsie Sautelle, and by Joe Skinner, the dentist who shared Annie’s professional rooms in her twilight years of practice.

The most likely conclusion is that Annie Praed constructed her own story by the selection and suppression of certain details. Was this deliberate? Yes and no! The answer may lie in Annie’s unknown life between 1872 and 1886. If the final image she gave herself appears to be of mythical proportions — a literary
construction — then perhaps her paternity and maternity suggest a number of possibilities. It is also interesting, though highly coincidental and speculative, that the G. B. Shaw play, *Mrs Warren’s Profession*, which was written and performed in Annie Praed’s lifetime, contains some threads like Annie’s. The narrative that underpins Annie Praed’s story gives an insight into the ways that women’s roles were being redefined in personal terms as a result of political change at that time.

Myth construction emerged from the narrative analysis to illustrate how gender and gender relations were constructed for early women graduates in the dental profession. Biographical portraits of Barnes and Praed in dental history contain contesting forms of femininity drawn from myths based on class, gender, professionalism and pioneering. However, the architecture of the Praed image also housed the successful orphan myth of the ‘Dickensian’ kind.
CHAPTER 3

PERSONAL FACTORS INFLUENCING CAREER CHOICE

3.1 Introduction

At a time when comparatively few women obtained university degrees and even fewer in the science and professional fields, the personal factors in Barnes’ and Praed’s lives offered an opportunity to broaden the inquiry into another dimension of the contribution of women in history. Being among the few to attain tertiary entrance is remarkable in itself; however, the majority of women who undertook university study moved into the Arts Faculty and more broadly into humanities fields, rather than to the science-based faculties.

While privileged in their achievement of a professional career in comparison with peers of the same gender, Barnes and Praed earned less than their male peers did. Personal factors were linked to socio-economic forces in complex and often contradictory ways, as Barnes’ and Praed’s individual responses to their personal and social environment shaped their career choices. Class and gender are central to the analysis of these factors.

Personal profiles were constructed by peeling back the layers of available information on Barnes’ and Praed’s family and societal cultures to seek out the impact these had in forming beliefs on education, work and femininity. How did
the personal background surrounding the occupations and social class of parents, family and societal culture relate to political and social issues of that time? What impact did the Depression of the 1890s, the Federation of the Australian states, the Eugenics and the Suffrage movements have in shaping their destiny? In what way were their circumstances, on the one hand uniquely individual, and on the other, common to women of their generation?

Dentistry as an academic study fulfilled predominantly vocational rather than purely liberal intellectual objectives. This difference is significant. What motivated Barnes and Praed to choose this direction in preference to the humanities that the majority of women followed? Certainly a gender divide favoured the vocational courses at university for men and the humanities for women. How did the concept of 'citizen mother' emerge from a number of political forces, including Federation and the Suffrage movement, to inform their career choice? Bashford has argued that:

as men gained more political and economic power in industrialised societies, women were culturally compensated, so to speak, with a heightened moral and spiritual place.¹

Individual economic circumstances are another significant factor in the analysis of the relationship between personal circumstances and career choice. A career choice as a dental practitioner offered a greater degree of

autonomy, better financial rewards and working-conditions than those of teaching or nursing which were considered the more traditional avenues for women of their class. For women at that time, dentistry was free of the overt gender barriers that women faced in the legal and medical professions.

Earlier accounts of their lives seem to indicate that the two women had little in common. On the surface, their family backgrounds appeared very different. Although a number of sources have claimed that Annie Praed was an only child and orphaned when young, this has not been fully verified. Madge Barnes, on the other hand, was one of four children of educated middle-class parents, suggesting a more traditional family and social class environment.

By investigating the personal circumstances I hoped to ascertain the forces and factors that contributed to that interface between the personal and the political which ultimately steered them into a career in the dental profession. Exploration of the interaction of individual personal particulars with factors of class, race, gender and economic environments within an historical context exposed differences and factors in common.

Australia, at the time of their birth, had been transformed in social and economical terms by the Gold Rushes of the 1850s. Mass immigration caused the population to swell dramatically. In Sydney, it grew from 44,240 in 1851 to 106,578 in 1881. The legacy of the subsequent Depression of the 1890s was

---

social instability that led to greater numbers of abandoned and neglected children. Welfare institutions expanded through the increasing demand for their services. Barnes, and more so Praed, were products of this time.

Emerging suddenly after a period of growth and buoyant economy, the Depression of the late 1890s was confronting and frightening to white Australians. Darwin’s theories were embraced to redefine poverty in terms of self-reliance at the political level and to deny the visible explosion in unemployment in the Australian community.

Men without work fell into despair as they failed to meet social definitions of masculinility: being financially responsible for their wives and children. Their lives were mainly defined by the notion of work. Stafford Henry Barnes was one such middle-class man who, in times of capitalist prosperity, was able to run his own establishment as a chemist. However, during the Depression years of the late nineteenth century he was unable to find secure employment. I suggest that it may have been these circumstances that caused his separation from the other members of the family, leaving his daughters in an exclusively feminine household with their mother. He may have felt a deep sense of shame about not being able to support his family.

Women who were aware of their financial dependence on men were drawn to the ideology of the Women’s Movement during this period. Due to their middle-class white Anglo background and their father's circumstances during the 1890s Depression, Pearl and Margaret Barnes were well placed for these ideas
to take root and grow into the new possibilities of femininities and gendered work relations.

Common to both Barnes and Praed was the absence of a dominant male presence during their pre-adolescence, their most formative years. Although Henry Burton-Bradley's arrival in Praed's life dramatically altered her occupational direction, surviving evidence indicates that before this period of 1886–1888, her father was absent. Without male siblings (Barnes' older brother, Edmond, had died by the time she was six years old) both were encapsulated in predominantly female households. For Barnes, evidence of ambitious parental educational aspirations has been located in various school records. Chambers has postulated that:

The stages of a girl's life are conditioned by the fact of her being biologically a female, but her education, and even ambitions and aims in life are still very much controlled by her family through her genes, other inherited patterns, and even by aspirations held by her parents.³

Federation and Suffrage movements over the period of the 1890s and the first decade of the twentieth century were central forces influencing change in Australia. Scientific knowledge too, a new and promising phenomenon, was embraced by many in England, America and Australia with enthusiastic zeal; this underpinned the basic tenets of the Eugenics Movement.

Middle-class women responded to these changes in domestic productivity, industrial, political and economic vicissitudes, and advancements in scientific knowledge. From diverse ideological positions, constructs of femininities were defined in the moral terms of a nurturing educator for both private and public spheres.

For these middle-class women, the meaning of work was transmuted into a noble occupation, thereby glorifying the role of women with a moral dimension of a patriotic kind to guarantee the nation’s future survival. Connell concurs with this view:

The women’s suffrage campaigners argued that the public realm needed the moral uplift, domestic virtues and nurturance that were the natural attributes of women. Along this track it was easy for upper-class feminism to merge into charity or moral surveillance of the poor, in the kindergarten movement and campaigns for infant health and mothercraft centres, eugenics, domestic science teaching and the like.⁴

Dawson⁵ has confirmed that women from more elite backgrounds were more likely to achieve tertiary levels of education. Howarth and Curthoys have also drawn our attention to the fact that pioneer women university graduates ‘were,

---


of course a tiny and select minority, recruited overwhelmingly from the middle-
class families.\textsuperscript{6}

During this period of rapid change Barnes and Praed grew from girls to young 
women. Bashford and other researchers have documented how the concept of 
the ‘new woman’ arrived in Australia in the 1890s out of Britain as:

\begin{quote}
\begin{quote}
a literary representation and a cultural icon, the new woman was 
one means by which a range of new femininities and a changing 
gender order could be spoken of, and ideas about women’s 
independence and interventions into masculine domains explored.\textsuperscript{7}
\end{quote}
\end{quote}

It would seem that a number of Australians, including Barnes and Praed, were
influenced by and embraced this ideology of femininity that shifted the
boundaries for middle-class women, particularly in relation to men and work as
part of the wind of modernity that swept through Australia. A number of images
in Barnes’ album support the argument that Barnes was influenced by the
ideology of the ‘New Woman’. Two powerful images are the poem, \textit{Man on
woman — Woman on man}\textsuperscript{8} and Pearl Barnes’ drawing of the ‘woman warrior’\textsuperscript{9}.
(These are discussed extensively in Chapter 4.)

\textsuperscript{6}Howarth, J. & Curthoys, M. 1987, ‘Gender, curriculum and career: A case study of women
university students in England before 1914’, in \textit{Women, education and the professions},
Society, Leicester, UK, p. 4.

\textsuperscript{7}Bashford, op. cit., pp. 223–4.

\textsuperscript{8}L. C. \textit{Man on woman -Woman on man}, Album, Madge Barnes Personal papers. \textit{Virginia Hind
Collection}.

\textsuperscript{9}‘Woman warrior’ is my term.
Public resistance to this ‘New Woman’ contained this form of femininity to select spheres. Complaints of the kind:

It ministers to the new aspiration of some women “for living their own lives” — that is, in fact, getting rid of the fetters of matrimony and maternity...a sort of lust of masculinity seems to prevail...the advent of the new woman is an abhorrent apparition...‘Their sex cannot have both equality and privilege; it cannot fight man in the battle of life and appeal to his chivalry for protection at the same time’."\(^{10}\)

Campaigners for the Suffrage Movement, as Grimshaw et al claim, propelled activist middle-class women into ‘a conscious process of modernising, of ‘correcting behaviour’."\(^{11}\) They won places in the expanding ranks of the ‘helping professions’ as doctors, nurses, psychologists, inspectors, teachers, approved institutional visitors, social workers and matrons. Howarth and Curthoys support this view of a select and determined number of middle-class women who could realistically:

set their sights on a relatively well-paid professional job, as a headmistress, academic, doctor or inspector of factories or schools; or alternatively on winning public recognition, if not affluence, in some kind of public, social or literacy work."\(^{12}\)

---

\(^{10}\) The revolt of a woman', *Newcastle Morning Herald* 16 July 1896, p. 3.


\(^{12}\) Howarth & Curthoys, op. cit., p. 11.
Women at the turn of the century would steer themselves towards careers that were socially acceptable to gendered constructs of femininity. Men of these classes, however, were more oriented to career paths with favourable financial and vocational outcomes. There is a case for adding dentistry to the acceptable professions for women listed by Grimshaw et al.

The Women’s Movement provided role models and new possibilities to young women, with a public visibility previously unknown socially. Role models for Barnes and Praed were drawn from their family, societal and the wider socio-political spheres. Further to the suffrage arguments and supporting women’s progress into the professions were the newspaper items of interest to women that offered unprecedented role models. The public medium of the press gave new careers a social legitimacy by raising women’s awareness of new possibilities.

During the twentieth century, the portrayal of women’s participation in the workforce and higher education has had complex and contradictory meanings. For example, during World Wars, newspapers published didactic articles on the patriotic importance of women’s roles in the workforce. These articles were influential in increasing women’s entry into a number of work places that were previously held to be inherently masculine. It may have been a newspaper report about a woman dentist in the days of their youth that influenced Barnes’ and Praed’s career choices.
3.2 Influences

Published accounts of the lives of the two women indicate that Barnes and Praed were from relatively privileged social and economic circumstances. The youngest of four, Margaret Estelle Barnes was born\(^\text{13}\) in 1881 at Market Street, Mudgee (leasehold) to Maria Teresa, the daughter of an Army Officer,\(^\text{14}\) and Stafford Henry Barnes, a chemist;\(^\text{15}\) they had married\(^\text{16}\) at Barragan\(^\text{17}\) in 1872.\(^\text{18}\) All four\(^\text{19,20,21}\) children were born in Mudgee: the eldest and their only son,

\(^{13}\) NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages Register: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1881, no. 21115. (Madge — 6 Mar.).

\(^{14}\) Teresa's father, Michael Quinn, an officer in the East India Company, married Mary Malone; both originally from County Clare, Ireland. Teresa was born in the English possession of East Indies 15 Apr. 1850; arrived in Australia in 1864. Her sister Margaret, born Ennistymon, Ireland 1841 married Edmond Alfred Tindale of Barragan, at Kelso, NSW in 1861. Stafford Henry Barnes, the son of haberdasher, Thomas, was born 28 Nov. 1836 in London. Barnes' family Bible. Thomas Barnes was born in 1806. *Virginia Hind Collection*.

\(^{15}\) NSW State Archives: NSW Register of Chemists; 1876, 25 Oct., no. 33. "Carried on business as chemist and Druggist prior to sale and use of Poisons Act 1876".

\(^{16}\) Wallis, L. Research Officer, Mudgee Historical Society, 26 Feb. 1997, Correspondence. 'Stafford Henry Barnes, bachelor, born London, England, chemist 36 years, of Mudgee, son of Thomas Barnes and Mary White, silversmith and jeweller, married Mary Maria Teresa Quinn, spinster, born Calcutta, 24 years, of Barragan, daughter of Michael Quinn, and Mary Malone, army officer. Barragan, house and residence of Mr Edward Alfred Tindale; W.C. Reynolds and H.G. Tebbutt, witness'.

\(^{17}\) ibid., 'The village of Wollar is approx. 25-26 miles from Mudgee, and the pastoral property of Barragan, a further 9-10 miles- the road at that time, over a mountain range would not have been of a very high standard.'

\(^{18}\) NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1872, no. 2720. Marriage at Tindale property at Barragan, Mudgee.

\(^{19}\) NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1873, no. 14108. (Edmond — 20 Sep.).

\(^{20}\) NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1875, no. 15704. (Pearl Ella — 24 July).

\(^{21}\) NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1878, no. 1666. (Kathleen P — 17 Mar.).
Edmond Row died in Sydney, in 1887.\textsuperscript{22,23} By late nineteenth-century standards, the Barnes family size was relatively small.

Records show that Stafford Henry Barnes was a chemist, druggist and seedsman at Market Street Mudgee from as early as 1867\textsuperscript{24,25} until at least 1883 (see Figure 3.1).\textsuperscript{26} Residential instability was first noted in the Mudgee records when the family moved from leasehold to leasehold: Market Street to Lewis Street\textsuperscript{27} and later to Dennison Street.\textsuperscript{28}

\begin{center}
Chemists.
\end{center}

\textbf{BARNES, S. H.}

(Member of the Pharmaceutical Society),

Chemist, Druggist, AND SEEDSMAN.

\begin{center}
\textbf{FIGURE 3.1} \\
Advertisement for S.H. Barnes — Mudgee
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{22}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1887, no. 4464.

\textsuperscript{23}Waverley Cemetery Burial lot 1512. Florentine Album. \textit{Virginia Hind Collection}.


\textsuperscript{25}State of NSW: Electoral roll; Mudgee, Police district of Mudgee, 1869–1870, p. 846, no. 85.

\textsuperscript{26}\textit{Wright’s Australian & American Commercial Directory and Gazetteer 1881–82}, George Wright, New York, NSW Section, p. 165.

\textsuperscript{27}State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Mudgee, Police district of Mudgee, 1870–1871, p. 916, no. 88.

\textsuperscript{28}State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Mudgee, Police district of Mudgee, 1882–1883, p. 1470, no. 103.

\textsuperscript{29}State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Mudgee, Police district of Mudgee, 1883–1884, p. 1338, no. 101.
The Barnes family’s move to Sydney and their subsequent residential instability reflect the economic hardships of this period. According to residential records they led a nomadic existence around Sydney, living first at 42 Castlereagh Street, then Elizabeth Street, Point Piper Road in 1887, then to various rental locations around Paddington between 1888 and 1894; Newtown in 1894, Harriet Street, Marrickville (1894–1898) and in Crown Street, Surry Hills (1898–1903). Family division appears when Stafford Henry was at Crown Street in 1903 while Pearl Barnes was located at Abbotsleigh Girls’ School.


36State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Marrickville, 1894–1895, p. 487, no. 137.

37State of NSW: Electoral roll; Electoral district of Marrickville, 1895–1896, p. 488, no. 120; 1896–1897, p. 488, no. 121; 1897–1898, p. 468, no. 123.


39Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral; Division of East Sydney, Polling Place-Bligh, 1903, p. 4, no. 232. (148 Crown Street).

40Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral roll; Supplementary Roll, Division of Willoughby, Polling Place-Gordon, 1902–1903, p. 4, no. 217. (Barnes, Pearl Ella. Lane Cove Road, Wahroonga).
and Bondi Road, Waverley.\textsuperscript{41,42} As the 1903 records locate Pearl and Teresa\textsuperscript{43} at Waverley and Stafford Henry at Crown Street, Surry Hills, it is most likely that Barnes' parents separated around 1902. Poverty bound the residents that congregated to Surry Hills during this period, suggesting further that Stafford Barnes was struggling financially.\textsuperscript{44} It is a significant factor that there are no surviving photographs or portraits of Stafford Henry Barnes.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure32.jpg}
\caption{Ravenscraig, Harriette Street, Neutral Bay\textsuperscript{45}}
\label{fig:3.2}
\end{figure}

\textit{Courtesy Virginia Hind}

\textsuperscript{41}Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral roll; Division of Wentworth, Polling Place-Waverley Junction, 1903, p. 3, no. 197. (Barnes, Pearl Ella. Bondi Road, Waverley).

\textsuperscript{42}NSW State Archives: Dept of Education, Sydney Girls' High School; 5/17744, Records 1902–1909, Correspondence, no. 10835, 20 Nov. 1905, letter from Pearl Barnes to J. W. holliman, Secretary, Public Service Board. (Lara, Bondi Road, Waverley).


\textsuperscript{44}Keating, C. 1991, Surry Hills: The city's backyard, Hale & Iremonger, Sydney, pp. 61–63; p. 86.

\textsuperscript{45}Virginia Hind Collection.
Stability for the Barnes' women was finally achieved with their arrival at Ravenscraig, 3 Harriette Street, Neutral Bay\textsuperscript{46} (see Figure 3.2) where they shared accommodation with Maria Teresa's widowed sister, Margaret Tindale. Family and school culture provided a social environment where education for women was particularly valued. Indeed, a sophisticated level of education is identifiable in Maria Teresa's poems\textsuperscript{47}, written in commemoration of her son. With the loss of a male sibling and an absent father, a family and social culture that was predominantly feminine imbued Barnes' late adolescent years. Pearl's teaching colleagues at Sydney Girls' High School and Riviere College's pupil-staff composition reinforced an intellectual femininity of pioneering education. A suffrage philosophical leaning can be argued by Pearl's voluntary presence on the Supplementary Electoral Roll of 1902.\textsuperscript{48}

Possibly Barnes and Praed were influenced by the announcement in the press of an American woman dentist's arrival to Australia in 1890. Mrs 'Ramboger' Hammell became the first American woman to receive the degree of 'Doctor of Dental Surgery'. The \textit{Illustrated News}\textsuperscript{49} reported her as being "the pioneer of dentistry among women" and depicted the practice of dentistry as requiring 'delicate manipulation' especially suitable to "feminine powers". She clearly would have provided an ideal role model for the two young aspiring women.

\textsuperscript{46}Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral roll; Division of North Sydney, Polling Place-Neutral Bay, 1906, p. 2, no. 104; Polling Place-Mosman, 1906, p. 8, no. 369, (Madge Barnes); no. 371, (Maria Teresa); no. 373 (Pearl Ella).

\textsuperscript{47}Barnes, Maria Teresa. \textit{My only son – My boy; Acrostic (Edmond Row Barnes). Peter Tindale Collection}.

\textsuperscript{48}Commonwealth of Australia: NSW Electoral roll; 1902–1903 Supplementary Roll, loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{49}Mrs. 'Ramboger' Hammell: Doctor of Dental surgery', \textit{Illustrated News} 7 June 1890, p. 12.
Foreshadowing Annie Praed's later journey into dentistry was Hammell's own path: born Annie Ramborger, when orphaned at the age of 15 and 'surrounded by difficulties, among the greatest being that she was penniless', her dental education was sponsored by her uncle.\textsuperscript{50} This article may possibly have inspired Henry Burton-Bradley to direct Annie Praed into the practice of dentistry.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{figure}
\caption{Mrs Ramborger Hammell\textsuperscript{51}}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{50}ibid.

\textsuperscript{51}ibid.
The newspaper chronicled Hammell’s anecdotes of gender bias that she encountered during her passage through the dental course at Pennsylvania College of Dental Surgery. Gender in both feminine and masculine forms of sexuality and visibility underpinned her report of her experience at this dental school: ‘she literally hewed her way through what she termed “a howling wilderness of men”’. Hammell was confronted with fierce opposition from fellow students who tried unsuccessfully to expel her from the course. Her presence, they argued, ‘would cause them to cease smoking’, and ‘would deprive them of the full anatomical explanations of the human organism’ during anatomical lectures. Hammell countered the opposing body with “Science knows no sex”. In response to the male students’ petition she was expelled by the Faculty until the Board of Trustees of the College overturned this action. Supported by the appropriately named Dr Truman, she eventually triumphed over the obstacles that the Faculty continually raised and graduated at the age of 19, second in a class of 34.52

Upon graduating she set up her own practice in Pennsylvania, later moving to ‘elegant rooms at St. George’s Hall’ with a ‘clientele…the best in the city’ and she had ‘as many men patients as women’. Reported to be earning a lucrative income of $7000 a year, Hammell’s financial success translated into a heightened level of social status that gained her entry into society’s more prestigious circles. The journalist described Hammell as being ‘equally at home in Europe, where she has many friends among scientists, royalty, and cultivated

52ibid.
people of all nations, the physicians of Germany especially regarding her as a shining light'. What a role model! ⁵³

Lending strength to the argument of the significance of role models and female support in career aspirations was the presence of Pearl Barnes' friends and colleagues. Howarth and Curthoys ⁵⁴ have argued that the women teachers at girls' schools influenced the women who gained tertiary teaching qualifications prior to 1970. Among them was Isola Thompson, MA, ⁵⁵ who with Mary Elizabeth Brown became the first women graduates of Sydney University. Thompson most probably taught the younger Pearl and later they were colleagues at Sydney Girls' High School. In receiving public acclimation, ⁵⁶ Thompson and Adelaide's first graduate, Domwell, were well located to be role models to girls of Barnes and Praed's generation. Another influential figure may have been Fanny May Austin, OBE, ⁵⁷ who was a contemporary of Pearl Barnes: her signature appears in the Barnes' album ⁵⁸ commemorating the Ashleigh Camp at Newport in 1909. Happy memories attached to Newport may

---

⁵³Ibid.

⁵⁴Howarth & Curthoys, loc. cit.


account for Madge and Pearl's purchase of land in that locality (see Figure 3.4).\textsuperscript{59}

![Autographs, from Ashleigh Camp, Newport\textsuperscript{60}](image)


\textsuperscript{60}Quiafe, Aldyth G. Dec. 1908, Album. Madge Barnes Papers. \textit{Virginia Hind Collection}. 
Barnes' social environment was infused by the new possibilities for women's academic achievement. Parental support and encouragement of scholastic achievement for their daughters can be argued by their choice of schools, even at times when economic circumstances presented major difficulties. Both Pearl and Kathleen (known in the family as Patti) attended the academically orientated Sydney Girls' High School. When faced with financial difficulties of the Depression of the 1890s, Stafford Barnes struggled to meet the costs of school fees. However, his determination to give his daughters an education is evidenced in his letter to the Department of Education:

Your Collector has been calling upon me for the Fee – £2.2.0 – due for the present Quarter for my Daughter Pearl E. Barnes at Girls' High School

This is the Fifth quarter she has been attending and has all thru held a good position in the classes, being moved up every exam: Hitherto I have been able to pay the Fees but really since the commencement of this Year, it has been a hard struggle to get enough to live upon, for months I have had no regular employment, tho' willing & anxious, every business in my profession — chemist — being bad.61

61NSW State Archives: Sydney Girls' High School; 5/17742, Records 1887–1892, Correspondence, no. 41998, 6 Sep. 1890, letter from S.H. Barnes to E. Johnson, Under Secretary, Department of Public Instruction.
Financial respite for her father allowed Pearl to continue her secondary education. However, by 1894, the economic strain increased with Patti’s entrance to Sydney Girls’ High. In this unfortunate predicament he requested a reduction from six to four guineas per quarter, pleading that:

we could by a sacrifice manage the Four Guineas for the two girls — but six 
we cannot...Kathleen has already passed the Junior and we desire her to go 
up...for times are hard enough.

Approval of higher education for women, positioned Stafford Henry Barnes with men such as Charles Perry, who was an activist for women’s entry to university. Of Perry, Theobald wrote, ‘with his liberal views, limited income and five daughters, he was in many ways typical of the men who underwrote the right of women to a university education’.

Stafford Barnes’ letter and the existing poems written by Barnes’ mother provide evidence of the parents’ relatively high levels of literacy. These documents contribute to the argument that the Barnes parents encouraged their daughters’ intellectual development (see Figure 3.5).

---

62Id., no. 43215, 13 Sep. 1890, letter from S.H. Barnes to E. Johnson, Under Secretary, Department of Public Instruction.


64Theobald, op. cit., p. 59.

65Barnes, Maria Teresa op. cit.
Acrostic

Edmond
Everything is bright & fair
Do not the Angels enter there?
Mercy to them is always shown
Oh you are with them I'm all alone
Never again to hear your voice
Dark are the days now. I cannot rejoice.

Row
Rise up angels bid him enter
Open wide the heavenly door
Watch & guard him evermore

Barnes
Blest-redeemer love my boy
As you died his life to save
Receive his soul fill him with joy

Now I have lost him my loving boy
Every hope with him has flown
Sorrow has come which before was unknown

His bereaved Mother
My only son – my boy

Dark are the days now my darling has left
Sad is my heart in its deepest despair
Weary my life Oh I feel quite forsaken
My boy is with angels & I am not there

2nd
Edmond my darling Oh why did you leave me
And go to a home where I may not be
Why did you not tell me that you were going soon
I’d like to go first and wait there for thee

3rd
When you bid me goodbye I thought you were dreaming
I knew not the journey that farewells foretold
I thought it was sleep & looked for the awakening
Nor thought I that death would my darling enfold

4th
My thoughts never leave you God help me to bear it
The blow was a sharp one the stab was severe
But God who is mercy I knew what he was doing
I did not take care of you when you were here (last word unclear)

5th
My heart was too selfish I did not like trouble
I fretted through — I had sorrow & woe
But — what — was — it — all as mercy trifles and bubbles
Compared with your loss ah my boy what a blow

6th
Oh with what joy I awoke on that morning
When I expected you home from your holiday rest
The birds sang so sweetly but now they are mourning
with your sad hearted mother — yet God thinks it best

7th
God took you away Ah I hope he will love you
His Angels are many but he wanted more
I hope you will meet me when my turn comes my darling
I’ll call on my God & He’ll open the door.
Chambers, too, has drawn attention to the importance of family influence on career choice:

it was the family which steered the women doctors, the top female teachers and the successful business women into their respective occupational channels by the turn of the century, and parents and relatives who encouraged them initially in their often radical stances.\textsuperscript{66}

Evidence supporting this argument is documented in a letter to Doreen Musgrave in which Barnes described her family’s attitude towards her career choice as ‘Certainly no family opposition though medicine was their preference’.\textsuperscript{67}

Maternal determination and strongly ambitious aspirations for daughters may prove to be a salient factor in women choosing dentistry as a career. On this theme of the relationship between career choice and maternal influence, support can be found in the interviews with other upper- or middle-class women who found their way into the NSW dental profession before the 1950s. A mother’s unfulfilled educational and career yearnings were often projected onto their daughter/s.

One example is Eila Bruce, who was in Sydney University’s graduating class of 1940. Bruce entered the Faculty of Dentistry at the insistence of her mother,

\textsuperscript{66}Chambers, op. cit., p. 49.

\textsuperscript{67}Barnes, M. E. 14 Apr. 1966, Correspondence. Doreen Musgrave Collection.
who desired that her daughters secure professions that had a degree of status, autonomy and that seemed to guarantee financial independence. Eila’s older sister, Gwen, had proceeded into the study of medicine, later specialising in anaesthetics. As teachers, her parents had felt the hardship of the depression years with wage cuts and the enforcement of the marriage bar. When her father George, was posted as an Inspector to Western NSW, Bruce’s parents endured a separation for the sake of their daughters’ education at North Sydney Girls’ High and the University of Sydney. Paternal absence, too, in Bruce’s, Barnes’ and Praed’s situations may well have augmented maternal authority, albeit a surrogate one in Praed’s situation.

Ellice Weir, another graduate of the 1940s, followed her father and brother into dentistry at her mother’s bidding. Maternal determination outstripped the limited scholastic expectations and orientations of the teachers at Crown Street Girls’ High where Ellice attended to the Intermediate Certificate level. For her final two years of high school, her mother arranged a transfer to Sydney Girls’ High School where she had earlier failed to gain entry. As a selective school, Sydney Girls’ High School improved her chances of preparation for university entrance. Paternal absence in Weir’s situation is complex: although her father remained living in the family home, the strained state of her parents’ marriage had transformed him emotionally into an absent and remote figure.

---

68 Interview with John Edye who was married to the late Eila Bruce, 29 Apr. 1996. Women in Dentistry Project 1995–1999.

While Doreen Musgrave claimed that her father was the most influential parent in the educational achievements of her two sisters and herself, the oral history interview provided more complex insights about her mother’s attitudes to university education for women:

Two of her brothers were doctors. Women were never educated in that way and my mother hated that. She said “I have as many brains as they’ve got” and she was very resentful that she couldn’t go to the university instead of staying home and washing the white coats.\(^{70}\)

Another graduate, Marie Patison, also had a mother whose unrealised aspirations were projected onto her daughter as the following quotation reveals:

She was the one that was very anxious that I should go to university. She was the one who was convinced that because she got married she was denied doing a job she would have liked to have done...she would have liked to have been in business in some way. She was really one to push me quite a bit.\(^{71}\)

Sowerwine’s study of Madeleine Pelletier, a turn-of-the-century French scientist, doctor, activist and feminist theoretician unravelled multi-layered maternal influences that contributed to Pelletier’s belief system and career path. His study sifted into focus Pelletier’s complex responses to her mother’s approach


to standard gender practices. Sowerwine contends that although Pelletier ‘rejected her mother and her mother’s consciousness, she appropriated her mother’s unconscious struggle to fulfil herself in the face of gender constraints’.\(^72\)

Dawson, too, has established the importance of the maternal factor in women who gained entrance into universities and achieved careers in academia or the professions.\(^73\) Complex individual responses to the mother’s circumstances in the study certainly shaped the career outcomes across a diversity of classes. This recognition of ‘gender constraints’ may have been a strong factor in Praed’s motivation to move beyond her inherited station in life. Surviving evidence of Praed’s earlier life more than suggests an absent mother and father, and the presence of a grandmother. Certainly a number of sources indicate that Praed’s early life lacked the privileges of class status and financial security.

Teaching as a career path for Madge Barnes may have appeared less attractive and she may have been actively discouraged from this direction by her sister Pearl. Compared to their male colleagues, women teachers at this time were subjected to lower pay, longer hours, poorer promotional opportunities and harsher conditions.\(^74\) Structural barriers, including


\(^{73}\) Dawson, op. cit., pp. 19–23.

\(^{74}\) Chambers, op. cit., pp. 131–54.
differentiated salary scales in the education system, clearly dictated the inferior professional conditions and practice for women teachers. For Barnes, her family's preference for medicine and acceptance of a career in dentistry may have been informed by the hardships of Pearl's teaching experience as a woman. Both medicine and dentistry offered greater scope for autonomy and at least the perception of a more equitable financial reward.

Pearl's achievements are well documented in the history of Sydney Girls' High School.\textsuperscript{75} Completing the Junior examination in 1891 and matriculating in 1894\textsuperscript{76} to the University of Sydney, Pearl became a pioneer woman graduate in Arts. With her BA Class II Honours in English literature (1897) and MA (1905), Pearl taught at Shirley School, Abbotsleigh Girls' School,\textsuperscript{77,78} and Sydney Girls' High (1906–1919) where she became Deputy Headmistress (1912–1913) before taking up the appointment of Headmistress at Maitland Girls' High\textsuperscript{79} (1920–1922). Until ill-health forced a retirement before her death in 1927, she was Headmistress at St. George Girls' High. The latter three schools were highly academic in nature, publicly well regarded and selective. In relative terms these

\textsuperscript{75} Norman, loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{76} University of Sydney Calendar 1894, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 169.


\textsuperscript{78} NSW State Archives: NSW Department of Education; Sydney Girls' High School, 5/17744, Records 1902–1909, Correspondence, 21 Nov. 1905, no. 10835, letter from P. Barnes to J. W. Holliman, Secretary, Public Service Board.

three schools supplied Sydney University with a large proportion of its female students.

Emotional, financial and physical support among the Barnes women justifies the argument that family culture influenced Barnes’ choice of dentistry. Chambers has argued the importance of family support as a ‘safety net’ that can overcome even the most negative messages from a hostile society.\textsuperscript{50} Examples of this support in the Barnes family can be found in the family response to Patti’s needs. Patti’s entrance to Sydney Girls’ High in 1892\textsuperscript{51} culminated with the Junior examinations in 1893.\textsuperscript{62} Neither Patti’s Senior results nor any university records have been located to substantiate family claims\textsuperscript{53,64} of her attendance in the Medical Faculty at the University of Sydney. Her path to marriage\textsuperscript{65} at the age of twenty-seven suggests the common path for a woman of her class. It would seem from interviews with the members of Barnes family that family culture informed expressions of femininity with some individual variations. Betty Tindale contrasted the more athletic Madge as ‘an Amazon and not interested in things domestic’ with the ‘smaller, softer and more feminine’ Patti.\textsuperscript{66}

\textsuperscript{50}Chambers, op. cit., p. 37.

\textsuperscript{51}NSW State Archives: NSW Department of Education; Sydney Girls High School, 9/1892, School records, 1893-96, Bundle A.

\textsuperscript{52}University of Sydney Calendar 1893, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 40.


\textsuperscript{54}Virginia Hind Collection.

\textsuperscript{65}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Federation Index 1889–1918, 1906, 2 May 1906, no. 3088.

Constructs of femininity in the Barnes family culture flowed around an axis of multiple definitions of societal femininities. This factor of multiple and contesting femininities was also been noted in the interviews, particularly in families with all female siblings. Temple has argued that women in science 'describe themselves as being less maternal, less gregarious and more independent than the self-descriptions of women in social sciences and humanities'.

Praed's shift from the servant to professional class status captures a number of these issues surrounding domesticity and independence. In discarding the focus on domestic duties and replacing them with professional ones, Praed gained greater autonomy in personal and financial terms. However, she translated these notions of class and professionalism and fashioned them into a stereotype. Clearly her vision of the professional woman contained within it the archetypal mannerisms of Victorian times. Recalled memories of Praed strongly reflect this image.

Certainly those who knew Annie Praed portrayed her in these terms. Along with Magnus, and Skinner (see Chapter 2), Elsie Sautelle's words reaffirm this image of Victorian feminine gentility, for she described Praed as 'rather prim and very thin — rather stiff...Anne was really beautiful, longed to be gay'.

---


Ian Marshall's childhood view of Barnes and Praed is the one recollection that possibly captures the essence of these two women:

I remember her (Praed) as being a rather shy type. She was not outgoing I didn't think as Meg Barnes...she was very academic I think because she used to talk dentistry all the time to my father and she was very dedicated... Meg Barnes was probably much easier for me to get on with than Annie Praed. Annie Praed was perhaps rather aloof and more ...well wrapped up completely...that was her whole life, dentistry, whereas Meg Barnes was always very interested about life...Praed came across as far as a child was concerned with very little sense of humour. She was rather a strict type I would say with her glasses sitting staring at you and just answering your questions in just a few words. Whereas Meg Barnes was very outgoing, full of personality and she just seemed able to get across with children perhaps easier that Annie Praed.\(^1\)

Praed's reserve contrasts strongly with Barnes' social ease. Praed had gained her model of behaviour through observation. Both working- and upper-class images are found intertwined in Praed's narrative. Hints of her earlier life in domestic service are found in the descriptions of her domestic skills, for 'she could cook like a French chef, sew better than most women, and was devoted to children'.\(^2\) Self-determination presents as a strong motivating force in her


\(^2\) Sautelle, E. loc. cit.
life. Her friend and former dental assistant, Elsie Sautelle, opined 'she was a woman of outstanding personality, magnanimous, never bearing a grudge and with a determination to “do”'. Praed defined it as 'It is enunciated by psychologists that the power of translating 'desire' into "will" is given to the few'. Clearly Praed's view of herself was drawn from her actual experiences at various social sites in Australian society.

Interviews with Barnes' family certainly indicate that the younger Madge was less maternally oriented, except where her niece and nephews were concerned. Lacking interest in domestic expertise, she preferred to focus her energies elsewhere. Her nephew, Peter Tindale, remembered her as very outgoing and described her 'as a collector of people'.

Patti Barnes' marriage in 1906 to the wealthy landowner Reginald M. Tindale, of Cliffofield, Scone resulted in three children: Brassington, Kathleen Daryl (Daryl) and Peter (see Figures 3.6, 3.7 and 3.8). The severe drought of 1916 devastated the Tindale fortunes and the economic hardships were an important factor in causing the marriage to break down in the early 1920s. In Patti's struggle to raise and educate her children she received financial and personal assistance from both sisters. Daryl's secondary education was made possible by her attendance at the schools where Pearl had teaching appointments. At

93ibid.


95Interview with Peter Tindale, 31 May 1996, op. cit.
various times during her young adulthood, Daryl was guided by Madge: initially into attending a physical education college; later being a nanny and, during World War II, nursing. These occupations were in keeping with the principles of Eugenics and Suffrage that influenced the younger Madge Barnes.

FIGURE 3.6
Cliffield, Scone
Courtesy Scone & Upper Hunter Historical Society
FIGURE 3.7
Daryl Tindale, 1915, aged 5, in Red Cross uniform
*Courtesy Virginia Hind*

FIGURE 3.8
Brassington, Daryl and Peter Tindale
*Courtesy Virginia Hind*
Brassington, as an adolescent, joined Madge and her husband Sapper, who encouraged and assisted him into his own profession of engineering (see Figure 3.9). Patti in turn gave support in nursing Pearl and her mother during their terminal illnesses.\(^{96}\)

Unlike her older sisters, Margaret Barnes was educated at Riviere College for reasons that are now obscure. Matriculating in 1902,\(^{97}\) she commenced her studies in dentistry a year after Praed, who had entered the first year of the newly established university Licentiate course in dentistry.

\(^{96}\)ibid.

\(^{97}\)University of Sydney Calendar 1902, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 310.
As a boarder, Praed attended Lotaville, Mrs Mary Jane Hughes' ladies' school that was not nearly as academic as Riviere College, Barnes' alma mater. The acknowledgement of Praed as 'friend' in Cissy Hughes' birthday book of 1888 suggests a relationship with the Hughes family that was outside most pupils' experience of school. This argument is supported by the fact that she maintained a connection with the Hughes family, possibly living in the same area in William Street, Darlinghurst. In latter life, a Winifred Hughes was Praed's last dental assistant, and it was to her that she bequeathed her watch and £50. All evidence suggests that Praed's educational experience at Lotaville was one in which her achievements were encouraged and where an opportunity to appreciate the pursuit of knowledge was available, albeit rather limited and in the form of a traditional accomplishment curriculum.

Marriage and motherhood presented no barrier to Mrs Hughes becoming the owner and principal of a school. In the nineteenth century, owning and/or operating a private school was one of the few socially acceptable avenues for educated middle-class white Anglo women to secure financial independence. Absent bureaucratic structures gave middle-class women access to such stations during this period. This career path for women diminished when a centralised, state controlled system was introduced. On a parallel with private girls' school proprietor, being a dentist was an option in the limited career offerings to women in the late nineteenth century: most probably Mrs Hughes acted as a role model for the young Annie Praed. A more obvious connection in role modelling can be

---

98Randwick District Historical Society Inc.: Lotaville School; Transcript of Charlotte Elizabeth Hughes' 1888 Birthday book.
detected between Hughes and her daughter Cissy who followed her mother's path into teaching.99

In March 1895, Praed matriculated100 to Sydney University after being tutored by Mr W. H. Nichols, BA and Mr W. J. E. Davies, BA, LLB. Unlike Riviere College, Lotaville did not succeed at the level of university preparation. Praed, however, did not proceed directly to Sydney University. Strong evidence exists that her benefactor, Henry Burton-Bradley, mapped out the alternative of an apprenticeship for her. Although dental publications have recorded that she undertook an apprenticeship with the acclaimed Septimus Hinder, this could not be validated, through lack of evidence. It is possible that the link with Hinder came through Henry Burton-Bradley, whose medical practitioner was Dr Henry Vincent Critchley Hinder,101 Septimus Hinder's brother. It is also possible that she was indentured, sometime after her Senior Examination in 1892,102 to William Twemlow who was practising as a dentist at 9 Hunter Street, Sydney from 1877103, and later at 252 George Street Sydney in 1882.104 By 1883, he had relocated to Sailors Bay Road in North Willoughby.105 However, records

99NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the register; Federation Index 1889–1918, 1904, 21 Sep., no. 7287.

100Sydney University Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/135/5, Examination Register- Public 1894–1899, Matriculation, Mar. 1895, p. 37.

101NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre-1900, 1894, no. 3963.

102Sydney University Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/58/4, Examination Register- Public 1894–1899, Senior, 1892, no. 2627.


establish that Praed was practising at Otis Chambers by 1900\textsuperscript{106} where Twemlow joined her between 1901\textsuperscript{107} and 1903.\textsuperscript{108}

It would seem that utilitarianism was significant in career choice for Barnes and Praed. Personal and economic circumstances for both would account for their availing themselves of the possibility of financial opportunities offered in a career in the dental profession that had the added advantage of class acceptability. However, this element of pragmatism may also be linked to the culture of the times. An outcome of the economic climate of the 1890s Depression for Sydney’s working and middle classes was an orientation towards a more utilitarian and vocational curriculum in education. It was this focus in the community’s educational philosophy that infiltrated the university, leading a shift in curriculum direction from the earlier intellectual and classical emphasis towards a vocational focus.

It would also seem that Chambers’ assertion, that migrant families valued education and the intellectual pursuit of study held true for the Barnes family, who certainly viewed education as a valuable and desirable endeavour for their children. Maria Teresa’s donation of £20 in memory of Pearl, to the Sydney University Appeal offers evidence of the esteem she had for her daughter’s academic achievements (see Figure 3.10). Maria Teresa’s encouraging and


supportive contribution to the education of her daughters was probably most important. Pearl’s poem to Madge captures the esteem and affection that the Barnes women had for their mother.

FIGURE 3.10
Sydney University Appeal\(^{109}\)
Courtesy Virginia Hind

FIGURE 3.11
Patti, Madge and Pearl Barnes
Courtesy Virginia Hind

\(^{109}\)Florentine Album, Madge Barnes Personal papers. Virginia Hind Collection.
FIGURE 3.12
Madge Barnes
Courtesy Virginia Hind

To Madge

What shall I say of thee, sister mine?
That truth shines out of those eyes of thine?
That the sunlight plays midst thy golden hair?
And that broad low brow is unfurrowed with care?

Shall I praise the grace of that form so slim?
The vigour and strength of every limb?
Shall I speak of the wit and wisdom that flows
From those lips? Not so, for themes like those
Would be quite unsuited to such a pen
I will leave these to other women — or men
But this I may say — ‘tis thy Mother I see —
Noblest of womankind to me —
In that calm pure faith and trust secure;
And nothing can harm thee while life endure
If her image, her influence never decline;
Strengthen it, cherish it, sister mine!\(^{110}\)

\(^{110}\)Barnes, P. E. 17 Mar. 1901, To Madge, Album, Madge Barnes Personal papers. Virginia Hind Collection. Format is a replicate of the original.
From available documents Praed’s birth date has been determined as 4 January 1872, but this has not been validated elsewhere. The date appears to be typical of an assigned orphanage date. Actual birth records have not been located even after a comprehensive search over all Australian states, India, NZ, South Africa and the UK. Contacts with Praed and Cornish family researchers in Australia, South Africa and the UK have not brought forward any information on her family background. It is most probable that she was the child of an illegitimate relationship to a person or persons with financial means, as evidenced by the provision of her education. Friends, colleagues, her beneficiary, and solicitor were not privy to any details of her parental lineage. Praed herself never referred to them in any legal document. Orphan School records have not provided any evidence of Praed before her arrival at Henry Burton-Bradley’s Five Dock home. Correspondence with a number of British organisations dealing with the records of orphans yielded no information. Further

---

111Randwick District Historical Society Inc., op. cit.; University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/135/5, Examination Register 1894–1899, Senior, 1892, p. 2627.


117A list of these organisations appears in the bibliography.
complicating this issue of Praed’s possible orphan status is the lack of records from the boarding-out system for state children that Henry Parkes introduced in 1878.\textsuperscript{118}

Secrecy surrounds Praed’s family background, compounded by the number of available explanations and possibilities for her place of birth. Musgrave’s\textsuperscript{119} article, informed by Elsie Sautelle,\textsuperscript{120} pronounced an English father and Australian mother, both dying young. Musgrave has indicated to me that possibly Praed was born in South Africa or Africa. However, no evidence has been found to substantiate these claims. Her death certificate recorded her parents as ‘unknown’ and her birthplace as ‘unknown place somewhere in Australia’.\textsuperscript{121} Archival records from South Africa failed to offer any link that was a possibility.\textsuperscript{122} The only Praed from the Mackworth Praed line, James, a trader, died at the age of twenty-eight, in 1880 and records indicate that he was a bachelor without any known surviving offspring.\textsuperscript{123}

This evidence supports Chambers’ argument that:

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{120}Sautelle, E., loc. cit.
\textsuperscript{121}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths, & Marriages: Index to the Register; 1948, no. 25257.
\textsuperscript{122}National Archives of South Africa: Death notices; no. 963, Praed, Sarah Jane, 5 Jan. 1885; 6574, Praed, Thomas, 12 Apr. 1883; 2778, Praed, James, 29 Oct. 1894.
\textsuperscript{123}ibid., 1165, Praed, James Winthrop Mackworth, 19 Oct. 1880.
\end{flushright}
in the case of bearing an illegitimate child, the baby was nearly always adopted out to another respectable family. The whole matter was *sub judice*, and people actually went to their graves with their lips sealed about illegitimacy.\(^{124}\)

Possibilities for Praed’s heritage include an important firm of London bankers,\(^{125}\) a number of Victorian miners,\(^{126}\) a Mrs T. Praed of Lindfield,\(^{127}\) and a Queensland landowner, Englishman Arthur Campbell Buckley Praed. The latter lived on Curtis Island and married the author Rosa Praed on 29 October 1872.\(^{128}\) All offer possibilities, but without evidence only become purely speculative. However, an argument for the illegitimacy with well connected Praeds presents a more likely explanation for the financial contribution to educational fees and secrecy surrounding her birth. Henry Burton-Bradley’s ‘Apologia vita mea’ strongly adds credence to this possibility.

Praed’s move in the mid-1920s to William Street, Darlinghurst, which was home to a number of society’s fringe dwellers, offers possible clues to her past and is open to multiple readings. By 1931, Praed had taken permanent tenancy at the

---

\(^{124}\)Chamber, op. cit., p. 170.


\(^{126}\)Victoria Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register, 1837–1888, 1887, no. 2626.

\(^{127}\)Sydney Government Telephone Exchange List of Subscribers Dec. 1889, Postmaster General’s Department, Australia, p. 212. (Mrs. Praed, Egerton, Gladstone Avenue, Lindfield).

\(^{128}\)Queensland Registrar General’s Department: Genealogical Index; Master Report, 1829–1889, p. 12071, no. 72/B003973.
Westminster Flats\textsuperscript{129} where the residents were predominantly single women, supposedly earning their living through their dextrous skills of sewing. Recalling a visit to Praed’s flat, Musgrave’s description of the building was:

She lived in William Street in a unit there and there were prostitutes in every other unit and Annie didn’t know. I wish she had because she would have thought it was great. She’d have laughed her head off.\textsuperscript{130}

One wonders how little Praed knew. This choice of William Street as a location may add evidence to the argument of illegitimacy of Praed’s birth. However, during this period, the mid-1920s, an apartment in Kings Cross was considered a fashionable address. Once again it appears that Praed’s inner and public life fused in the meaning behind her choice of this location.

Annie Praed’s first known appearance was her arrival in April 1886 at Llewellyn, the Five Dock house that solicitor Henry Burton-Bradley shared with his second wife Louisa Portia (nee O’Ferrall) and their children. Circumstances surrounding Praed’s presence in this household led to her departure around 1888. The relationship between Praed and Burton-Bradley caused such a disturbance between Burton-Bradley and his family that in 1889, at the age of seventy-four years and five years before his death, he wrote an ‘Apologia vita mea’.\textsuperscript{131} This

\textsuperscript{129}\textit{Sands’ Sydney Suburban & Country Commercial Directory 1931}, J. Sands, Sydney, p. 125. {Listed tenants include costumier’s Misses Burrows (no.2) and Roberts (no.17), Miss F. Masters, dressmaker (no.10); Praed (no.11)}.

\textsuperscript{130}Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 23 Apr. 1996, op. cit.

\textsuperscript{131}I am indebted to Anne Cooke and Robert Irvine who so generously gave me a copy of this document.
document came to Robert Irvine from the Davis family via his aunt, Edith Markell (nee Chauncy) who was the daughter of Sarah Elizabeth Burton-Bradley, the eighth child of Henry Burton-Bradley and his first wife, Charlotte Spedding.

Barnes and Praed shared a number of personal details with other first graduates in Britain, North America and Australia who 'married less often, married later and had fewer children when they did marry'.\textsuperscript{132,133} Neither woman had children, Praed never married and Barnes married at forty years of age. No evidence, either in interviews or directories, has surfaced to indicate that either had a long-term same-sex relationship. From interviews with family members and her album we know that Barnes did have a number of earlier romantic liaisons. A postcard from the World War I front town of Ypres certainly implied an amorous interest (see Figure 3.13).

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{greetings_front.png}
\caption{Card from Ypres}
\label{fig:card_ypres}
\end{figure}

\textit{Courtesy Virginia Hind}

\textsuperscript{132}Theobald, op. cit., p. 67.

Her great-niece mentioned a broken engagement when she was handling some of Barnes' personal possessions: among these are number of ornamental elephants, a gift from this former fiancé, whose sexual indiscretion with one of his plantation workers in Malaya dissuaded Barnes from committing herself to marriage.\(^{134}\)

Unrequited love was uncovered in an untitled poem in her album that can be dated between 1901 and 1907. Written by Barnes, the poem was signed X for Xenia as part of the pen name, Margaret E. Xenia Barnes, that she adopted in the album. The timing of this romance may have been significant factor in Barnes' career path and other relationships with men. As it occurred around the time of her entrance into dentistry, it is possible that the man in question may have been a colleague whose meaning of professionalism was uneasy with Barnes' kind of femininity. Interviews confirm that close relations between men and women as students often transformed either in final years or immediately after graduation: the males seeking women who fulfilled notions of what Connell has coined as 'emphasised femininity'.\(^{135}\)

\(^{134}\) *Virginia Hind Collection.*

Untitled\textsuperscript{136}

Love quite alone thou hast left me
Will thou never return?
Why didst thou teach me to love thee
Midst the maiden hair fern!

Ah! It was most cruel my beloved.
For well you know
Every throbbing & passionate heart beat
was only for you

Fast in your arms you have held me —
And I have lain
Not seeing the darkness descending
The darkness of pain

In the maiden hair fern I am lying
My birth-place — my grave
For life you gave when you loved me
and death when you took what you gave.

Peer friendships for Barnes provided her with emotional support that encouraged her to find her own identity of a pioneering kind. A social circle that encouraged educational achievements was also available to Madge through Pearl's associates from Sydney Girls' High School. Florence Jane Murray, (later Armitage), another Sydney Girls' High pupil, was on the same list with Pearl at the conferring of her Master of Arts degree. At the same ceremony Fanny May Austin, another Sydney Girls' High pupil, was awarded her Bachelor of Arts degree. Friendships found expression in the shared social activities outdoors that encompassed the ideals of the Eugenics ideology.

\textsuperscript{136}Barnes, M.E. Poem (untitled). Madge Barnes Personal papers. \textit{Virginia Hind Collection}. 
FIGURE 3.14
Madge Barnes with friends Alice and Len
Courtesy Peter Tindale

Landscapes featured strongly as a backdrop for photographs, literary entries and sketches in Barnes' albums (see Figures 3.14, 3.15 and 3.16). One of the poems in Barnes' album exemplifies how individuality was cherished among this group of friends:
A cottage by the sea

The name of my story may sound very old
But cast it not down please before it is told
For let me assure now, 'tis quite quite new'
Full of fresh items; — of interest too.
Five of us live in a cottage of wood,
We're all quite happy — because we are good;
Useful and helpful, by day and by night,
Always agreeable, — we cannot fight
First there is Margaret, so tall & slim
Angular curves in each graceful limb
Curly of head — of purpose firm
Jaunty of speech, — prosaic of term
Next there is Ida, swarthy & stout;
Always jumping & thumping about
Seen at her best in original farce,
Her most frequent expression is "Silly Arse"
Leila stands third, a giddy young spark,
Always ready for any lark,
Highly attractive to every male,
Her coquettish advances are ne'er known to fail.
Addie the gentle — I next will describe,
My pen cannot picture, though hard I may strive
Such kindness of manner, such sweet winning smiles
In docile submission she accepts all her trials —
Last there comes Laurie, — best of her sex.
Born to produce, "chaperonic effects"
Most stately of females, — Come all the world laud her
For she keeps Taunton Ville in most excellent order.
Now mortals in general, I think I have given
A veracious account, — at least I have striven;
If success has not deigned to attend me — Well then

I'll never attempt to write poems again.

---

Maxwell, Laurie Gail. 1904, A cottage by the sea, 12 Apr., Album, Madge Barnes Papers. Virginia Hind Collection.
FIGURE 3.15
Austinner Camp, Xmas 1908

Courtesy Virginia Hind

3.3 Pearl Barnes

FIGURE 3.17
Pearl Barnes, Ravenscraig Neutral Bay
Courtesy Peter Tindale

Pearl Barnes was an outstanding woman of her time (see Figures 3.17, 3.18 and 3.19). Her influence over her younger sister Madge most probably was considerable. A former student, Mildred Phelps, described her as ‘a tall slim woman, with a quiet voice and a charming manner’.\footnote{Mitchell Library: Mildred Phelps; ML MSS. 4965, Papers c.1900 – 1922, Sydney Girls' High School – the old school, Elizabeth Street.} Dorothy Millicent Fisher (nee Sinfield), remembered her as one of the three teachers at Sydney Girls' High that ‘stood out’.\footnote{Fisher, D. 1998, ‘Reminiscence from an Elizabethan’, Sydney High School Old Girls' Union News Sheet, no. 151, 13 Dec., p. 6.} Newspaper items at various times of Pearl's career leave an image of a dedicated and respected teacher. Years after her death she was remembered as ‘the well-known educationist’.\footnote{Madge Barnes: Personal papers, Florentine Album, Newspaper cutting, 'Kindergarten Secretary', Sunday Sun 13 Jan. 1935, Album. Virginia Hind Collection.}
FIGURE 3.18
Pearl Barnes, young girl
Courtesy Virginia Hind

FIGURE 3.19
Pearl Barnes, St. George Girls' High School
Courtesy Virginia Hind
Her achievements in educational appointments in a restricted employment field were remarkable, as the following excerpt from a newspaper article illustrates:

There are only five Girls' High Schools in the State that women teachers can hope to attain the position of Head Mistress of a high school. The latest to take up the ranks is Miss P. Barnes, M.A., who is to take charge of East Maitland School after a lengthy period at the Girls' High School, Elizabeth Street, where she has held the position of Deputy Mistress, and during the long absence of the Headmistress through illness last term she took charge of the school.\textsuperscript{143}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{figure3_20.png}
\caption{Pearl Barnes' resignation\textsuperscript{144}}
\end{figure}

\textit{Courtesy Virginia Hind}

\textsuperscript{143} Madge Barnes: Personal papers, Florentine Album, Newspaper cutting (anon. & undated). \textit{Virginia Hind Collection}.

\textsuperscript{144} Florentine album, ibid.
Tributes following her resignation (see Figure 3.20), and subsequently, after her death praised Pearl's commitment to girls' education. It was acknowledged that she inspired many former pupils (see Figures 3.19 and 3.20). Among them was the prominent author, Marjorie Barnard, who in praising her former teacher declared that Pearl Barnes had 'taught me not only to love history but to think historically; who shaped my prose style and established my literary ideals'.

IN MEMORIAM

LATE MISS BARNES, M.A.

Miss Pearl Barnes, who died, after long illness, last May, was well known to High School girls in Sydney, where she had been acting head-mistress, and in West Mailand, and at St. George, of both of which schools she had the headship at different times in her career. At the University she was second to the present headmaster of Sydney Grammar School on one honours list, when she graduated B.A., and the sole honours graduate in English literature at the M.A. examination. Her mother, who has been living in Tasmania, has now sent a gift of £20, in memory of her, to the University appeal. This will associate her name with the benefactors of the University that she loved and served so well. Similar gifts have begun a series of memorials, mostly for graduates, but necessarily so at the University.

FIGURE 3.21
Pearl Barnes' obituary (undated)

Courtesy Virginia Hind

---


146 Florentine album, ibid.
Another, E. McK., (most probably Eleanor McKinnon OBE (nee Addison) who founded the Junior Red Cross and enrolled at Sydney Girls' High School in 1885)\(^{147}\) paid tribute to Pearl’s contribution to the improvement of educational facilities at St. George Girls’ High School:

She said that she made herself such a nuisance by her importunities to those in power, that the rats, dampness, and dilapidation soon gave place to the present wonderful building so splendidly equipped.\(^{148}\)

Overcoming obstacles was not uncommon to the Barnes women. The idealism of the middle-class woman’s role as society’s philanthropic worker can be gleaned from Pearl’s attitude to work, which was remembered as ‘seldom has a woman’s work been less of a “job”.\(^{149}\) Underpinning this ideology was the Protestant work ethic transformed from a physical to an intellectual form. McK.’s testament confirms this argument:

She was essentially a giver. Money, energy, and that most precious thing: leisure, seemed to her to be possessed only in trust for those to whom she delighted to hand them on, and all her friends were the richer for her sympathy and reasoning optimism.\(^{150}\)

\(^{147}\) Norman, op. cit., p. 225.

\(^{148}\) Madge Barnes: Personal papers, Florentine Album, Newspaper cutting, ‘An Appreciation, Miss Pearl Barnes M.A.’, (McK. E., undated), ibid.

\(^{149}\) Ibid.

\(^{150}\) Ibid.
By her mother, North of Pearl
Barnes, many of her contemporaries
have a valued friend and the
youngest, Frederick, A. A. Bealer, who
had been her youth during the 30 years
of her ancestor's work. She graduated
St. Agnes College in 1923, taking
her M.A. in English literature, and
was named the M.A. in

She was named in English literature, and
was named the M.A. in

AN APPRECIATION

Miss Pearl Barnes, M.A.

(From E. A. Mc.)

By far the most of Pearl
Barnes, several of her contemporaries
have a valued friend and the
youngest, Frederick, A. A. Bealer, who
had been her youth during the 30 years
of her ancestor's work. She graduated
St. Agnes College in 1923, taking
her M.A. in English literature, and
was named the M.A. in

She was named in English literature, and
was named the M.A. in

LONG FIGHT

She was made to feel in

She was made to feel in

BROAD SYMPATHY

She was universally praised by

She was universally praised by

FIGURE 3.22
Pearl Barnes' obituary

Courtesy Virginia Hind

151 Ibid.
For Madge, Pearl opened up possibilities in her attitudinal approach and application to educational achievements and career paths. Madge and Pearl, it would seem from interviews with members of their family, did not exhibit the sibling rivalry shown between the attractive Patti and the taller, more athletic Madge.

Philanthropy, organised around the concepts of public maternal citizenship, informed by formal tertiary education, emerged as a new construct of femininity for Anglo women of the middle and upper classes in early twentieth-century Australia. Moral responsibility in a societal dimension underpinned the ideals of the women of the Young Women’s Christian Association (YWCA), some of whom were linked to Pearl.\textsuperscript{152} It would seem that this selective group of women was available to Madge through Pearl’s social circle of acquaintances, colleagues, and friends. Therefore, Pearl’s influence on the younger Madge was substantial.

Women teachers of Pearl’s calibre possibly offered young girls wider visions of femininity than those available in their families and social spheres. Fanny Cohen was Headmistress of Fort Street Girls’ High where Doreen Musgrave completed final year of her schooling. Cohen, BA BSc MA, and a university medallist, widened Musgrave’s vision of the educated woman.\textsuperscript{153}

\textsuperscript{152} Mitchell Library: YWCA; ML MSS 3262 3K23677, Records, Particulars re annual meetings1908–1913, Aug. 1909, p. 35, invitation card for program 26 Aug. 1909.

\textsuperscript{153} Bygott, U. & Cable, K. J. 1985, \textit{Pioneer Women Graduates of the University of Sydney 1881–1921}, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 47; p. 35.
Musgrave recalled Cohen's advice that 'a clever woman can turn her hand to anything'. Cohen offered the young Musgrave another model of femininity:

she was a very strong...she was a very good strong personality...very good looking woman with dark, brown eyes, very vivacious...she was a very strong influence in my life, Fanny Cohen: as a headmistress anyway and as part of the community too. But feminine at the same time. I could never understand why these women weren't married, perhaps, there weren't any men as good and they couldn't marry anybody who wasn't better. They all felt like that I'm sure. They needed — you don't want a bully or a dictator but somebody better just little bit because women like to look up to men.\textsuperscript{154}

Musgrave's comments exemplify how contesting notions of femininity co-existed and informed women either covertly or overtly in multiple ways. The perception of the shifting boundaries of women's roles in society was fundamental in Barnes' and Praed's lives. They were open to the cultural forces of their times and class: the underlying ideologies of the Women's Movement inspired their approach to their career choice. In an interview with Barnes, Musgrave discovered that she 'belonged to some women's organisations. She'd been interested in the Women's Movement'.\textsuperscript{155}

\textsuperscript{154}Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 14 May 1996.op. cit.

\textsuperscript{155}ibid.
3.4 Henry Burton-Bradley

The major known influence in Annie Praed's career choice was the Sydney solicitor, Henry Burton-Bradley. When Annie Praed entered his Five Dock household, uncharted possibilities opened to her. The old solicitor's interest in Praed is open to a number of interpretations, all holding some degree of validity.

FIGURE 3.23
Henry Burton-Bradley
Courtesy Sally Burton-Bradley Collection
In April 1886, at the age of 14, Praed entered Burton-Bradley’s household as a servant and two years later she left as his ward. With this acquired privilege Praed gained access to education that was improbable in her former station. But Henry Burton-Bradley’s influence over Annie Praed extended beyond being the financial provider of a formal education. Their situation reflects the culture of their times.

A number of surviving documents in public and private hands suggest that Praed adopted and mirrored Burton-Bradley’s image in public and private terms. Among these documents, the most prominent, is Henry Burton-Bradley’s ‘Apologia vita mea’, which he wrote to his family in May 1889. This document is discussed in depth, as it provides a unique perspective of Henry Burton-Bradley and Annie Praed.

Henry Burton-Bradley, a man of his time and class, embraced the values of philanthropy in a public sense. It would seem, from the evidence presented in his apologia, that he translated his private behaviour (to his family) to fit this social model. Strong parallels can be drawn between Henry Parkes\(^\text{156}\) and Henry Burton-Bradley, from their childhood in England to their adulthood in Australia. Both faced personal losses during their early years in England. Later, Australia offered them opportunities that were unavailable in class-rigid England. In Australia they found space for their public voice, and class mobility. However, a better understanding of Henry Burton-Bradley, and therefore of

\(^{156}\)Martin, op. cit., p. 297.
Annie Praed, may be gained by tracing back to a significant connection with Sir William Westbrooke Burton.

3.4.1 **Sir William Westbrooke Burton**

Henry Burton-Bradley's\(^{157}\) life in Australia was strongly influenced by Judge Sir William Westbrooke Burton, the uncle who took him in after his father's death in 1829. Henry, the son of Henry Bradley and Annie Singer Burton, was born in 1815 and in 1894, at the age of seventy, died from typhoid. In 1827, he left London to join his uncle, who had accepted a seat as second Puisne Judge on the bench of the newly constituted Supreme Court at the Cape of Good Hope.\(^{158}\) Possibly the early loss of his mother in 1818, offers another answer for his attraction to Annie Praed. Available sources would seem to indicate the absence of parents, in either physical or emotional terms, in Annie Praed's life. Perhaps, too, he was drawn to Annie by her first name, that of his mother. Coincidentally when Annie Praed arrived at Llewellyn at fourteen, she was a similar age to Henry Burton-Bradley when his uncle, Judge Burton had become his guardian.

When Judge Burton was appointed to the bench of the Supreme Court of NSW in 1832, he brought his 'problem nephew'\(^{159}\) with him. Burton's biographer, Allars, has pointed out that the judge 'displayed that conscientiousness which

---


\(^{159}\) 'Squire of Paddington's home now hospital', Sun 16 July 1975, p. 12.
so characterised his life’, a discipline gained from his years in the navy. Judge Burton was reputed to have high principles, and on several occasions, his often inflexible and pious views on religion and law led him to dramatically tender his resignation from important posts. He sometimes called for legal reforms that were unpalatable to the leading class of that time. These reforms, many of which were later adopted, included the establishment of the Registry of Deeds and the abolition of transportation. Burton strongly believed that the outcome of transportation based on penal rather than reformatory practices was destructive, furthering the corruption of those who underwent punishment. He linked individual criminal and corrupt behaviour to the social conditions in the colony, and proffered solutions in the courtroom, in the press and in his publications. In his work, *The State of Religion and Education in New South Wales*, he advocated better education and religious practice as a means of rectifying the colony’s criminal problem. The Judge strongly believed that these reformatory measures would raise the moral standards and address the social injustices in the colony.

3.4.2 **Henry Burton-Bradley’s public life**

Years later, in 1887, Judge Burton’s nephew Henry Burton-Bradley, would propound similar views through his writings, including ‘Larrikinism’, a study undertaken of his initiative. Henry Burton-Bradley was particularly active as an organiser and writer. He contributed letters regularly to the press and he was a

---


161 City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, ‘Larrikinism no. 7,’ ‘Larrikinism no. 8’, no. 492.
founding member of a number of organisations founded on altruistic ideology. These bodies of like-minded men, and occasionally women, sought solutions to the health and social problems in the colony of NSW. The subject matter of all these organisations was evidently influenced by the Eugenics ideas that were spreading throughout white Anglo middle and upper classes of Australia at that time. Clearly Henry Burton-Bradley was directed towards these organisations by his own circumstances.

Henry Burton-Bradley voiced reformatory ideas through the Health Society of NSW. In another project, he acted for and was a subscriber to the Blandford Proprietary School in Newcastle in which Mrs Helenus Scott had a major interest. At an individual level, he also campaigned for local affairs. His interests ranged from environmental situations near his office, of which he wrote, 'I desire to call your attention to the disgraceful filthy and abominable state of the street adjacent to the Belmore markets', to the physiological needs of working-class men:

Sydney is almost and utterly deficient of closet accommodation for the thousands of working men employed at a distance from their homes and for the large number of visitors from the country and suburbs.

---

162 Mitchell Library: Scott family papers; ML MSS 38/19, Records of Glendon 1824–1876, Sarah Anne Scott (nee Ruden) c.1845–1893, material regarding Blandford Proprietary Grammar School Newcastle, correspondence, 24 Jan. 1885; 5 Feb. 1890.

163 City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 2294/1897, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 1516.

164 City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 201/1884, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 2111.
In a series of articles to the Health Society of NSW, Henry Burton-Bradley stressed the need for reforms to combat physical and moral disease. He also used these avenues to campaign for better housing, education and the introduction of improved standards in public health. He urged the government of the day to introduce sanitary measures to prevent the spread of typhoid and cholera, diseases with high mortality costs. Henry Burton-Bradley's motivating factor in his campaign for improved sanitary standards may have been drawn from his own sufferings from the symptoms of typhoid.

He was a strong advocate for improvements in housing regulations. His efforts were not confined to rhetoric, for he was also one of the founders of the Model Lodging-house Company, which housed about 120 men. His obituary in the *Sydney Morning Herald* pointed to this philanthropic focus in his life:

> He was a founder of the Model Lodging-house, from motives of philanthropy, and the progress of that institution gave him much gratification. He interested himself in sanitation, and his letters on public health frequently appeared in this journal. Strange it is that he should have succumbed to that very disease against which he so often warned and instructed the community.\(^\text{165}\)

Echoing the earlier sentiments of his uncle, Judge Burton, Henry Burton-Bradley claimed that reforms in housing and religious instruction would remedy

\(^{165}\)The late MR. H. B. Bradley', *Sydney Morning Herald* 29 Dec. 1894, p. 6.
the criminal behaviour of the street gangs, the 'larrikins', who later became literary romanticised figures.

I cannot blame those who fail to draw fine distinctions between larrikinism in the streets, and larrikinism in the Parliamentary Chamber... This large number of lads comprises, I am sorry to find, not only those whose homes with dissolute parents, might offer excuse for their frequenting the streets, but the sons of men in respectable positions of life, occupying large and well furnished houses and possessed of ample means... The absence of parental control, in all classes alike, seems to favour the license with which young lads use their liberty for evening amusement, and the dearth of innocent amusement within the reach of all but the opulent, seems to point the direction of remedy... It appears to me that in many cases the education of children above the level of parents has led by swift degrees, from disrespect to contempt of parents, and that this is not confined to the lower classes is borne out by the complaints of many parents in easy and respectable circumstances, and who asked to be advised what to do with their sons, whom they are unable to control; this, too, appears to point the direction of remedy. 166

Henry Burton-Bradley, like his uncle and some of his descendants, sometimes shed the contemporary prejudices and practices of this class and viewed problems from a broader more humane perspective. However, these views were still contained within the context of his class, drawn from paternalistic

166 City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, 'The Larrikin no. 7', no. 482.
upper class ideals of altruism. In this way, his influence permeated generational membranes and resurfaced in new expressions of idealism of a pioneering passionate kind. The pioneering myth has been discussed in Chapter 2.

Henry Burton-Bradley held strong views on the powerful effect of culture from individual to societal levels:

I find that our respective home nationalities and their Australian born children supply all the larrikins to our streets, for there is not a foreigner, not even a Chinese, in the class, and yet the circumstances of all are alike favourable or unfavourable, to the development of this form of mischievous person.\textsuperscript{167}

It is extraordinary that he wrote this at a time when the Anglo-Australians generally favoured the establishment of the White Australia Policy. During that period, the dominant white culture held strongly racist views, attributable to increasing social tension, an outcome of the economic insecurity brought on by the Depression of the late 1860s. The Chinese community bore the brunt of these economic insecurities and accompanying racism.

3.4.2.1 The Health Society of NSW\textsuperscript{168}

Henry Burton-Bradley's involvement in the Health Society of NSW was driven by altruistic motives shaped by Eugenics principles. He was a foundation

\textsuperscript{167}ibid.

member and secretary of this organisation whose motto, 'prevention is better than cure' underpinned the themes of his lectures. Later, Praed championed this philosophy in dentistry. In his lectures Henry Burton-Bradley advocated the addition of physiology to the school curriculum and the implementation of sanitary structures. His colleagues were some of Sydney's elite, including Sir William Montagu Manning, Thomas Holt (MLC), A.T. Holroyd and Clements Lester. The society's aims were:

1. To diffuse among all classes plain information on the subjects of Health and Disease, particularly as these are connected with cleanliness, ventilation, and infection; 2. To prevent the adulteration of food and liquors; 3. To induce and assist people by personal influence, example, and encouragement, to live in accordance with recognised laws whereby health is maintained and disease prevented; 4. To seek the removal of all noxious influences by means of legislation and by a legitimate pressure upon the executive authorities.

Henry Burton-Bradley's level of activity in the Society was considerable. His contribution was recorded in glowing terms:

---


170 Mitchell Library: NSW official publication; 981/4B1, a collection of unpublished papers, 1884; 'Charitable institutions', p. 29. This format is a copy from this document.
Personal factors influencing career choice

It owes its origins to its indefatigable Secretary, Mr. H. Burton-Bradley, who, by letters and speeches has sought to stir up his fellow-citizens to the recognition of the claims which man's body has upon man's care.\textsuperscript{171}

This organisation gave lectures, printed and circulated leaflets on health topics, and lobbied the government of the day to introduce legislation for improved standards in education, housing and sanitation. The philosophy of this society was put into practice in its establishment of the Model Lodging-house Company, which operated from Henry Burton-Bradley's professional rooms.\textsuperscript{172,173}

3.4.2.2. The Model Lodging House Company

The ideology of this body linked social and moral issues with the unhealthy living conditions of the poor in Sydney. The members advocated reforms in public health measures to improve the lives of the people living in the colony. Henry Burton-Bradley raised the issue of social injustice by drawing attention to the connection between morbidity and space, cleanliness, the quality of the water supply and sewerage facilities:

Is it possible that some classes of society fatten upon these miseries of their fellow men? It is not possible, it is true, there is a large and very influential body of persons in Sydney, of various ranks in life, who are

\textsuperscript{171} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{172} The late Mr. H. B. Bradley', loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{173} Sands' Sydney Suburban & Country Commercial Directory 1890, J. Sands, Sydney, p. 519. (58 Margaret Street).
pecuniarily interested in overcrowding dirt, unwholesome food, intemperance, and disease, which are alike the causes, and in some respects the consequences of the misery which surrounds us.

The general ignorance prevailing with reference to the conditions which a life of health demands, coupled with the indolence naturally consequent on a depressed vitality, and on a sense of individual powerlessness to extricate themselves from the web of wretchedness, are also among the reasons why dirt, cupidity, and intemperance are allowed so long to reign over men.\textsuperscript{174}

Henry Burton-Bradley defended his argument with data from England’s Register of Births, Deaths and Marriages, introduced in 1837, providing statistical evidence into the causes of death.

The Model Lodging House Company, which provided shelter for homeless men, was established with the following objectives.\textsuperscript{175}

\begin{quote}
The objects for which the Company is formed are to erect and furnish a Lodging House for men exclusively having beds baths reading and smoking rooms and other appurtenances with the view of improving the morals of the lower class of society...The Capital of the company is five
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{174}Mitchell Library: John Sands; A 4758, Item 36, papers, memorandum and articles of the association of the Model Lodging Company of Sydney Ltd., 1878, p. 9.

\textsuperscript{175}Mitchell Library: A collection of unpublished papers, NSW official publication; 1884, 981/4B1; 'Charitable institutions', loc. cit.
thousand pounds £5,000 divided into one thousand shares of five pounds

£5... 176

Between 1889 and 1892, Burton-Bradley was the secretary, with the chairman Louis Phillips; the auditor was William Laing, the accountant E. Haviland. The first directors were Thomas Buckland, James Reading Fairfax, Samuel Dickinson, Joseph Grafton, Ross James, and Stuart Harrison. In 1887 James Reading Fairfax and Alexander Dean resigned and were replaced by William Beaumont and William Fowler. 177 Under Henry Burton-Bradley's guidance the company prospered. After his death the company went into liquidation in June 1903. 178

3.4.3 Apprenticeship

Annie Praed's path to dentistry was initially through an apprenticeship. This path was most likely the one chosen for her by Henry Burton-Bradley. A number of surviving sources confirms that Henry Burton-Bradley believed that this form of vocational training offered moral and educational benefits. From the early days of the nineteenth century, the upper ranks of the colonists held the apprenticeship system as a means of social control. 179

---

176 Mitchell Library: John Sands; A 4758, op. cit., p. 1.
177 Ibid., p. 13.
178 Mitchell Library: Model Lodging House Company of Sydney; Q 647.9, Reports, 1887; 1889; 1890; 1892.
It is no coincidence that Burton-Bradley's grandson, Praed's classmate, John Houghton Bradley, at the age of eleven, entered the dental profession by the same route.\textsuperscript{180} Burton-Bradley's firm beliefs in the apprenticeship model of education came from his own experience. As historian Bennett has recorded, his uncle, Judge Westbrooke Burton, paved his path:

The judge was unsure what to do with young Henry and, after weighing up a number of callings, decided to smooth his way to an apprenticeship in the law. Burton prevailed on Chief Justice Forbes to appoint Bradley as Third Clerk of the court with an annual salary of £160 having effect from 8 February 1834...Bradley adapted well to the work and, by January 1837, had advanced to being Second Clerk on £350 a year.\textsuperscript{181}

Henry Burton-Bradley's son, Henry Houghton, and a number of his sons-in-law followed this form of training into the law profession.\textsuperscript{182} Henry Burton-Bradley's apprenticeship experience reinforced his views, voiced in his study of 'Larrikinism':

I have arrived at the conclusion that the apprentice system prevailing in the old countries, and which has been almost discontinued here, under the pressure of trades union ideas, had, in itself, much power of repression, of which we are deficient...The good old system which


\textsuperscript{182}Robert Irvine Collection.
comprised the master workman seated surrounded by his apprentices, who all became workmen, has been abandoned, for a system which draws in young children by small wages and teaching them only one branch, keeps them in a perpetual bondage from which they seek enfranchisement on the streets. The statements of young girls, comparatively children, as to their comparative earnings, afford a picture of hopeless depravity. Legislation is required for factory improvement, and control. ¹⁸³

Henry Burton-Bradley believed that apprenticeships gave young people structural guidance in educational and moral terms:

It has appeared to me that, whereas in the old countries of Europe considerable scope is found for the high spirited and volatile portion of their youth, in the military and naval services, in which a few years of training and strict discipline implant habits for life, we have not here, except in the Vernon, whose sphere of action is limited, any equivalent provision for making habits of order, method and obedience, and for steadying the character which these services supply at home, this observation points a remedy.

An utter want of respect for authority, an unbounded selfishness, and want of consideration for others, permeate the community. ¹⁸⁴

¹⁸³ City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 492, loc. cit.
¹⁸⁴ Ibid.
Expanding this concept of training as a means of improving social relations, Henry Burton-Bradley called for the establishment of reformatory institutions of the kind that Parkes had created, such as the school-ship, Vernon and the Industrial School for Girls, 'Biloela'.\textsuperscript{185,186} It would seem that his views strongly supported the environmental aspect of the nature/nurture debate. It is interesting to note that he attributed the responsibility for this wayward behaviour to the parents:

The absence of parental control, in all classes alike, seems to favour the licence with which young lads use their liberty for evening amusement, and the dearth of innocent amusement within the reach of all but the opulent, seems to point the direction of remedy.\textsuperscript{187}

He supported his arguments for the establishment of such schemes by drawing attention to the effects poor housing conditions had on moral conduct:

It seems to that the state of the homes of the hard working classes is a large factor in the production of lice, intemperance and particularly of the class of persons called the Larrikins.\textsuperscript{188}

\textsuperscript{185}City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 211/1886, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 656.

\textsuperscript{186}Peyser, op. cit., pp. 185-6.

\textsuperscript{187}City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 492.

\textsuperscript{188}City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 44.
Henry Burton-Bradley's arguments are in keeping with the mid-nineteenth-century beliefs held by the post-gold rush 'powerful commercial middle class' whose concern was 'the need to develop a respectable, law-abiding and well-ordered society'.\(^{169}\) While this elite group espoused philanthropic engagement in child saving institutions, they also benefited economically from the institutions' supply of trained-skilled labour in their domestic and work spheres. Between 1873 and 1890, the influence of Dickens filtered through to the colony, where there was a rise in 'reformist philanthropists, largely of middle class and non-conformist backgrounds'.\(^{190}\) These views heralded a new era that shifted from the 'large-scale "barrack" or asylum concept' to smaller units based on family concepts of socialisation.\(^{191}\) Such were the predominant origins of Henry Burton-Bradley's beliefs that were given public prominence by Henry Parkes. While the *Vernon* was Parkes' 'flagship of child social welfare', it failed to deliver the promise of maritime employment to the boys, many of whom followed the fate of the earlier convicts into domestic and rural unskilled labour in times of a competitive labour market. In light of the complexities of the *Vernon* experiment, Henry Burton-Bradley's choice of the *Vernon* as exemplary of reformatory ideals was in keeping with the evangelical zeal of the reformist philanthropists.\(^{192}\) Henry Burton-Bradley's views on the apprenticeship educational model are steeped in hierarchical and patriarchal power structures, fundamental to his class.

\(^{169}\) Ramsland, op. cit., p. 70.

\(^{190}\) Ramsland, op. cit. p. 218.

\(^{191}\) Ibid., p. 156; p. 164.

\(^{192}\) Ramsland, op. cit., pp. 118–38.
However, Henry Burton-Bradley's public rhetoric did not match his private behaviour. A number of his children from his first marriage felt neglected while he attended the needs of the O’Ferrall women. At the time of his writing the 'Larrikin' study, Annie Praed had been in his household for over a year. The attention he gave her exceeded that towards other members of his domestic service.

3.4.4. ‘Apologia vita mea’

The exact nature of the bond between Henry Burton-Bradley and Annie Praed is unfathomable. His family’s opposition to Annie Praed’s presence in his life, generated such tension that, between 23 and 24 May 1889, Henry Burton-Bradley wrote ‘Apologia vita mea', in defence of his actions. He sent this document with a letter to his son-in-law, Frank Davis, who had married Maria Fanny Burton-Bradley (Min), his tenth child with his first wife, Charlotte Spedding. In Brisbane, Min and Frank Davis were distanced from the immediacy of the drama that no doubt, took on daily instalments with the Sydney members of his first and second families.

The meaning of the Latin word ‘apologia’ does not carry that of its English equivalent, ‘apology’, and according to Culler, it ‘admits no guilt and asks no pardon, but, on the contrary, repudiates the very suggestion that pardon is necessary.’

---

193 Robert Irvine Collection.

Therefore the apologia is ‘a defence of the opinions or conduct of a writer or speaker’. Henry Burton-Bradley’s choice of this genre to justify his actions was in keeping with his times and training as a solicitor. John Henry Cardinal Newman had written his infamous version, *Apologetia pro via sua*, in 1865. Henry Burton-Bradley’s modification to ‘apology of my life’ suggests that his version is a fusion of two meanings: Newman’s apologia (defence) and the lay Edwardian concept of an apology.

Culler has argued that Newman’s version contained a strong sense of the dramatic. In his apologia, Newman was defending himself against Kingsley’s accusations that held strong undercurrents of sexuality. This link between sexuality and morality was relevant in the Newman context, for according to Culler, it ‘is no novelty to recognise that religion and sex are associated in human experience, but seldom have they been so closely associated as in the mind of Charles Kingsley.’

Sexuality and drama also infuse the language of Henry Burton-Bradley’s version. His accuser, the ‘fiend’, was Mary Louisa, the third child from his first marriage. Mary, supported by the other members of the family, disapproved of his marriage to Louisa O’Ferrall. To some degree her influence continues to this day among descendants:

---


197 Culler, op. cit., p. ix.
Annie has strictly kept the promise which Minnie claimed from her 'not to insult Mama's feelings by being frequently seen with me' – she has been very infrequently with me (seen or unseen) since her return from Brisbane and why? Simply because it has not frequently been necessary.\(^{108}\)

3.4.4.1 **Audience and motive**

The very act of creating such a document as the 'Apologia vita mea', has an audience in mind. This is a key factor in any analysis. While self-effacing and self-promoting at the same time, Henry Burton-Bradley's main purpose was to present his own agenda in the best possible light. When Henry Burton-Bradley wrote his apologia he had a particular readership in mind, his family. He initiated his appeal by entering into correspondence with his Brisbane-based daughter Min, who had assisted him with Annie Praed. His statement of "It was very good and dear of my Min to cover my protégé with her mantle – the dear child continues to deserve that recognition"\(^ {109}\) confirms Min's role. Min and her husband Frank Davis welcomed a number of the children from Burton-Bradley's second family. One, Claudia Louise (Chloe) 1879–1967, lived with them for several years in the 1920s.\(^{200}\)

Henry Burton-Bradley's aim was to sway members of his family in his favour and to turn them against his second wife, the former Louisa Portia O'Ferrall and

\(^{108}\) Burton-Bradley, Henry, 24 May 1889, Correspondence, loc. cit.

\(^{109}\) Ibid.

his daughter, Mary. Therefore the content of the document is subjective. Although the document was sent to his son-in-law Frank Davis, Henry Burton-Bradley intended a larger audience — the nineteen children of both his marriages. Was Henry Burton-Bradley’s apologia just a legal man’s means of using his legal craft to justify his passion or is should it be taken at face value? The document requires multiple readings to address the complexities of this man, his family and social relations. Henry Burton-Bradley’s choice of the term ‘apologia’ is telling, for it is underpinned with religious notions of moral conduct drawn from Newman’s well known version.

Over time the audience has been extended beyond his family and acquaintances and now this document is of academic interest. Any analysis of this document therefore must acknowledge the interests of Henry Burton-Bradley and academic perspectives.

The letter accompanying this document reveals that Henry Burton-Bradley and his second wife, Lousia Portia O’Ferrall, thirty-three years his junior, were in a state of marital discord.

3.4.4.2 Henry Burton-Bradley’s line of argument

Henry Burton-Bradley, in an accusatory tone, shifted the focus and blame of infidelity. Manoeuvring his way through accusations of moral irresponsibility, he employed legal tactics to divert the blame of public scandal over extramarital liaisons from himself to his wife.
Could you love a woman who had treated you so? I can understand "a just man and one who fears God, being unwilling to make a sinful wife a public example" by putting her away because I have in my own family, now dead, a man who did not put away a bad woman...and that the circumstances of her family were disastrous and there was the opportunity for my intervention in the hope of amelioration. I addressed myself to these circumstances as occasion seemed to demand and afforded what aid they required...and from all these facts as they were gradually disclosed, the disposition was created in my mind towards this child which eventually developed into the plan of sending her to school as a means of placing her out of reach of certain perils.\(^{201}\)

As part of his defence, Henry Burton-Bradley named the character witnesses who supported him seventeen years earlier. However, by 1894, all but one had died. These men were remarkably similar to Henry Burton-Bradley in experiences and background. All were English born, of a similar age, arrived in the colony at approximately the same time, and engaged in like-minded philanthropic activities.

Exemplary of these men was the Rev. Robert Allwood, the respected clergyman, who was well known for his fashionable parish of St. James, where his pastoral activities extended to the needs of convicts, immigrants, and those

in institutional care. Among his many educational interests, Allwood was well known for his work at Sydney University.\textsuperscript{202}

Another character witness was the deceased Arthur Todd Holroyd (1806–1887), who had trained in medicine and law. Holroyd and Burton-Bradley had many interests in common, professionally and privately. A barrister, Holroyd, had a very successful law practice and was politically active in the Legislative Council and Legislative Assembly before being elected to represent Parramatta between 1861 and 1864. He had a short and chequered career at the Supreme Court. He too had a passionate interest in horticulture, and his efforts were realised in the establishment of the municipality of Prospect and Holroyd where he resided at Sherwood Scrubs. It is the latter that is significant to Henry Burton-Bradley.\textsuperscript{203}

The suitability of Henry Burton-Bradley's character witnesses is suspect. One of them, Judge John Fletcher Hargrave, another one of Henry Burton-Bradley's legal associates, was considered mentally unstable and had left a trail of controversy in his career. His major contribution to the colony was his promotion of legal education.\textsuperscript{204}


Henry Burton-Bradley employed a legal approach to deal with the emotive subject matter of his apologia.

3.4.4.3 Henry Burton-Bradley's mood

From examination of this document, the writer appeared to be in a mood of melancholy or depression. The particular expression that conveys this mood is 'having laid down a chart of my journeyings in the desert of life.'\textsuperscript{205} Is this just a crafty man's way of using his advancing years as a means to fortify his defence?

3.4.4.4 Summary of the 'Apologia vita mea'

The apologia begins with Henry Burton-Bradley's strong declaration of the injustice and the audacity of his accusers to make charges of impropriety against him. In his defence he utilised legal procedures to affirm his innocence. One of these was his argument of precedence, as he recalled earlier instances of chivalry. He then named the women in distress (Cobcroft, Holmes, Dodd, Hayes, Holmes and Taggart) for whom he had volunteered his legal services. He claimed his actions were driven out of a sense of moral duty. Henry Burton-Bradley wrote:

1...have had an abundant experience of the wrongs which women suffer at the hands of my own sex and remember now that in my very early career I arrived thus at a conclusion that help to women was a duty lying at the door of each one calling himself a man-imbued with this principle,

\textsuperscript{205}Burton-Bradley, H. May 1889, 'Apologia', op. cit., p. 2.
which early became part of my life, I have throughout the long vista of years upon which I look back with great complacency as 'tis fitting that faulty men should cast a retrospect, put myself forward in all cases, legal, social, into which the redress of woman's wrongs has appeared to me to be practicable.\textsuperscript{206}

He supported this argument quoting his past code of behaviour with the O'Ferrall sisters, whom he rescued from financial, moral and social disaster. His recall of that time was:

the days of Rolla O'Ferrall daughters and their half sisters whose mother sent for me on her deathbed in the middle of 1870, she died in September of that year, and made me aware of the condition in which she would leave 4 orphan girls. In that month I stood by her bed and promised to stand by and guard and guide and if possible save, her children. That I have done so is known to many but none more fully than to every one of them...I paid their mother's debts, re-shingled and repaired their home, placed my likeness in a brooch on each side of the two elders and desired them toward them as signs that they were under my guardianship and that offending one would have to reckon with me. I took France out of her kitchen, I engaged and paid a governess to wait upon them. I purchased the shares of a half brother and half sister in the O'Ferrall estate for my present wife. I borrowed the money, £1000, to pay for these shares, I paid the interest on it and eventually the principal. For about two years and a half I made up every Saturday night the deficiency

\textsuperscript{206}ibid.
in the exchequer and eventually married the eldest daughter and lifted the others up to my own level... I performed, at that time, a noble act, an which no other man has been known to perform in this country.\(^{207}\)

Throughout this document, Henry Burton-Bradley argued that his behaviour was always chivalrous:

> In 1870–71–72 I used to be a frequent visitor at "Fairlight"\(^{208}\) certainly every week, more frequently oftener and it was one of the necessities of my Ward’s case that I should do so.\(^{209}\)

His actions at that time angered some of his children from his first marriage. Most probably their mother’s deteriorating health from cancer was the cause of this anger. Charlotte was ill for at least two years before her death on 26 March 1872.\(^{210}\) Henry Burton-Bradley pointed an accusatory finger at his daughter Mary and then rather obliquely at Min (the recipient of this letter):

> Does not Minnie remember how, to please her eldest sister, she used to destroy the buds of the flowers I wanted for my then ward – now wife?\(^{211}\)

---

\(^{207}\)Ibid.

\(^{208}\)Fairlight, Five Dock was the Robson/O’Ferrall home.


\(^{210}\)Ibid.

\(^{211}\)Burton-Bradley, Henry, 23 May 1889, Correspondence, op. cit., p. 2.
FIGURE 3.24
Burton-Bradleys c.1905
Back row: Left to right – Sarah Elizabeth, Mary Louise, Caroline, Maria Fanny
Front Row: Left to right – Annie Singer, Emily, Henry Houghton, Charlotte Spedding
Courtesy Robert Irvine

One has to wonder why Henry Burton-Bradley was paying such attention to his then young ward, Louisa Portia O’Ferrall, when he had eleven children and a sick wife at home (see Figures 3.24, 3.25 and 3.26). There was also the matter of travelling the considerable distance (on horseback) between his home at Paddington and the O’Ferralls at Five Dock, with his law practice situated in the city at Margaret Street. It would seem his actions at that time were sufficient to arouse his eldest daughter’s (Caroline) suspicion, jealousy and anger.
FIGURE 3.25
Louisa Portia O’Ferrall
Courtesy Sally Burton-Bradley
FIGURE 3.26
Henry Burton-Bradleys, The Terraces, Paddington, c. 1860
Courtesy Robert Irvine

Left to right:


Middle row: Sarah Elizabeth; Charlotte Burton-Bradley (seated);
Robert Prowett; Caroline; George Fullerton; Annie Singer.

Front row: William Gordon; Mary Louisa (seated).
The 1870 Sands' directory records that a Mrs Robson owned Fairlight.\textsuperscript{212} In 1858, the former Louisa McNamara,\textsuperscript{213} had married Alexander Robson who died in 1863\textsuperscript{214}. When she died in 1870, Louisa Portia and Frances Ann, her two surviving children whose father, Rolla O'Ferrall, Robson had never married. Major Rolla O'Ferrall\textsuperscript{215} fathered a number of children with three women, none of whom it seems he married. Was Henry Burton-Bradley drawn to the O'Ferralls and to Praed by the circumstances of their birth?

A number of curious similarities present between the lives of Henry Burton-Bradley and Henry Parkes. In his private life, Parkes’ three marriages also caused family rifts with his children. Indeed, Parkes, like Henry Burton-Bradley, courted his second wife while his first wife was alive, and his third wife was his former servant. Clarinda, Parkes’ first wife died on 2 February 1888. Twelve months later Parkes married his longstanding mistress, the 29-year-old Eleanor Dixon, who bore him children while his first wife was alive. On 1 October 1895, he married his third wife, Julia Lynch, who was twenty-three, when he was eighty. Like Parkes, Henry Burton-Bradley believed that women’s happiness was tied to the emotional, physical and financial support of men. However, surviving records imply that Parkes was very active in extramarital relationships.


\textsuperscript{213}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages Register: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1858, no. 936.

\textsuperscript{214}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages Register: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1863, no. 2342.

\textsuperscript{215}NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages Register: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1834, no. V18342411 35A, (Portia Tasmania’s mother was Mary); 1837, no. V18372412 38A, (Rowla’s mother was Mary); 1843, no. V1843262 140, (William’s mother was Catherine).
with younger women. Henry Burton-Bradley may have had more in common with Parkes than their interest in federation.²¹⁶,²¹⁷

In Parkes' public life, this masculine vigour was transformed into a morality of a pious kind. Parkes' political reign was characterised by a 'fresh and eager spirit of reformism'.²¹⁸ Henry Burton-Bradley behaviour in public and private life mirrored the Parkes model.

3.4.4.5 Annie Praed's situation in the Llewellyn household

Henry Burton-Bradley justified his behaviour with a rhetoric that was underpinned by a high moralistic tone. His defence over his response to Annie Praed began with:

In April 1886 a little child, just over 14 years of age, was brought to our house to wait upon our children – she soon fell ill (of typhoid fever) and for some weeks was an invalid. I visited her night and morning and took care that besides the doctor's physic she should get half-hourly a few drops of turpentine, the antidote of typhoid.²¹⁹

At fourteen, Annie was hardly a child. And as a working-solicitor, with nineteen children from two marriages, and three other female servants in his household, Henry Burton-Bradley's actions seem rather extreme. Possibly, his own

²¹⁸ Martin, op. cit., p. 127.
²¹⁹ Burton-Bradley, Henry, 'Apologia vita mea', loc. cit.
sufferings with typhoid fever may account for his interest in Annie. Correspondence files of 1884 and 1886, found at the City of Sydney Archives, indicate that cholera, typhoid, and small pox were regularly reported by the Board of Health.220 The turpentine treatment was one of a number of recognised methods employed to treat typhoid at the end of the nineteenth century. Hare wrote:

A considerable number of cases were put on turpentine, according to Professor Wood’s formula. It did not seem to appreciably affect the mortality and it certainly did not prevent either haemorrhage or perforation. It sometimes considerably lessened tymanitis, but its most marked action seemed to be on the tongue and the secretions of the mouth. Dry, brown and stiff tongues frequently became under the influence moist and flexible, and thirst was much lessened. Eucalyptus appeared to act similarly, but was less powerful.

In cases with a tendency to cardiac failure, digitalis, ether and alcohol gave the best result.221

Interestingly, medical researcher and later specialist, Clement Henry Burton-Bradley later wrote a paper referring to the spread of typhoid in Sydney during the 1880s:

220 City of Sydney Archives: Correspondence files 26; 201/1884, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 2111; 211/1886, no. 655.

221 Hare, F. W. E. 1887, ‘Typhoid fever’ The Australasian Medical Gazette, Apr., vol. 6, p. 163.
There was a typhoid outbreak in 1886 at Balmain. Typhoid was high during the hotter months, from Nov. to May. 1886 had a high mortality rate due to typhoid.\textsuperscript{222}

Was it possible that curiosity over his grandfather's behaviour underpinned Clement's scholastic endeavour? Certainly family stories recount that Henry Houghton Bradley, Clement's father, disapproved of his father's visits to Fairlight between 1870 and 1872.\textsuperscript{223}

\begin{figure}
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure3.27}
\caption{Llewellyn, Five Dock
\textit{Courtesy Sally Burton-Bradley}}
\end{figure}


\textsuperscript{223}Robert Irvine Collection.
At Llewellyn (see Figure 3.27), Annie Praed shared a bedroom with two of the three female servants whom Henry Burton-Bradley described as ‘unfortunate’.

He disapproved of the influence of one of these women over Annie, and while he took steps to ‘save’ Annie, he denied the other servants such opportunities. This is his account:

I found that one of these women used to take Annie out, to walk, at night. I remonstrated to each of them, the practice continued however. I then took Annie into the room which we call “the Green Room”, locked the door and pointed out to her, as decently as I could, what steps had led to the downfall of these young women and that walking in the dark had been the first step in their trouble and I told her that if it should occur again she must go. I believe it did occur again and I then told her, after some exhaustive sermon, that I would send her home to her grandmother the next time it should happen. The child seemed impressed and satisfied to be guided. However, I found that from time to time the girls, generally, got up to tricks of various kinds and when they were found out contrived to let all the blame fall on Annie.

These escapades led, with the varying phases of her family affairs, to my seeing a good deal of this child, in my Green Room and to the observation by the women that Master pays too much attention to Annie, so that after something more than two years my wife told Annie she had to go – she said that she did not find any fault with her but she had better go.

---

About this time Annie, then a little over 16, had been persuaded by the women to answer a matrimonial advertiser and she had made an appointment to meet him at my gate. I became aware of this and watched her movements and the gate for half an hour, Nobody came and I then saw the opportunity of showing her how men made fools of girls. Coming out from concealment under the trees I told her what a chance she was invoking of a fate like that of the other girls so impressed her that on my offering to give her an education to fit her as a governess she put her hand in mine and promised me the direction of her life, subject to her father's consent being obtained.225

A number of points from this excerpt, need to be addressed. Historic furnishings consultant, Elizabeth Wright advises that 'the Green Room' refers purely to the colour of the room.226 However, the term 'Green Room' has associations with the theatre:

A room in the backstage area of a theatre, set aside for the use of cast and stage crew. It was formerly used for the reception of visitors before and after a performance.227

225 Burton-Bradley, Henry, 'Apologia vita mea', loc. cit.


The *Concise Oxford Companion to Theatre* states the term is based on the colour of the room.\(^{228}\) Literary examples exist that are imbued with emotional associations. The author, Graham Greene, remembered the 'green baize door' of his father's study, with a sense of foreboding.\(^{229}\) However as early as the eighteenth century the term the 'green room' has been associated with the theatre.\(^{230}\) Henry Burton-Bradley's disclosures of the happenings in 'the Green Room' imply a strong element of theatricality. In many ways he and Praed appear to be the central actors in a play of dramatic proportions. A strong argument exists that he and Praed shared a certain closeness in this room; his second usage of the possessive pronoun 'my' implies privacy and intimacy.

A number of inconsistencies exist in Henry Burton-Bradley's argument regarding his moral conduct in 'my Green Room'. His action of locking Praed in 'the Green Room' and his attention to Annie were beyond the parameters of employer-servant relationships. Furthermore, his secrecy in observing Annie's arranged tryst and the physical intimacy implied in his description of her acceptance to his offer of education for Annie ('she put her hand in mine and promised me the direction of her life') suggest sexual motives.

There is sufficient evidence to support an argument that Henry Burton-Bradley formed either a sexual intimacy with or a suppressed sexual desire for Praed.

---


3.4.4.6 Annie Praed’s departure from Llewellyn

When the marriage soured between Henry Burton-Bradley and his second wife, accusations from both sides split most members of his two marriages into two opposing groups. A number of his daughters of his first marriage, who had previously shunned his second wife, joined forces with Louisa. The content of Burton-Bradley’s accompanying letter to the ‘Apologia vita mea’ locates the fault with his wife’s infidelity with a man whose period of residence, at Llewellyn, began only months before Annie’s arrival. However, Burton-Bradley did not accuse his wife until six months after Annie Praed’s arrival. Perhaps Louisa’s anger at the attention that he bestowed on Annie came from her own experience prior to their marriage, when she was his ward. Possibly it was this knowledge that led her to dismiss Praed from the household.

From evidence within the document, it would seem that Louisa did not blame Annie Praed for Henry Burton-Bradley’s behaviour. Indeed in Burton-Bradley’s words, Louisa’s dismissal of Praed was to avoid servant disharmony. However, this reason does not account for Louisa’s anger towards Henry Burton-Bradley.

3.4.4.7 Conclusion

Surviving documents give complex and often contradictory messages about Henry Burton-Bradley. Exemplary of such mixed messages are those referring to his public profile. While this man maintained a strong commitment to public health issues that gave him a strong civic presence, his eulogy offered a contrary view of him:
A retiring man, to whom any kind of ostentation was repugnant, he took no part in political life, though it is safe to say that in those circles where he was known he was regarded as a most upright and estimable man in all relations of life.  

However, the contrary is implied in the accompanying letter to his study on 'larrkinism'. Clearly, Henry Burton-Bradley intended the document to be recorded, for he wrote 'I would express a hope that my statements and opinions may on the whole be found worthy of a place in the records of your office'.

In discovered documents, private and public, Henry Burton-Bradley cast himself as a man of principle. He drew upon these ideals to justify his relationship with Praed. As a defender of women's rights, social equity, and public health, he was well placed to rescue Praed from typhoid and from the moral evils that awaited her in the company of the other servants in his household. One wonders why he did not rescue any other servants from this moral danger. In drawing attention to Praed's ancestry was he merely appealing to Victorian notions of upper class values of breeding in order to persuade his audience that his actions were justified not only on humane and moral grounds, but in terms of class?

Another reading of this document is that Henry Burton-Bradley, behaving as a man of his era, acted out his version of a Victorian fantasy of a romantic and

---

231 'The late Mr. H. B. Bradley', op. cit.

232 City of Sydney Archives: City of Sydney Council; Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 492.
philanthropic kind, one that was asexual in its execution. Certainly evidence supporting this line of argument may be found in his public stand on moral and health issues, particularly his letters to the press and to the City of Sydney Council.

Clearly Henry Burton-Bradley was a man of his times and class. His construct of a public identity of Victorian respectability held notions of altruism and philanthropy. In his professional and social circle he surrounded himself with similar men. And yet his apologia offers multiple readings regarding his behaviour in his personal relationships. The final impression of his private conduct is a complex one, imbued with secrecy and ambiguity. And yet his response to his times and class is at times poignantly individual. In his apologia, he married the personal and the public forms of himself to justify his attitude to and behaviour with Annie Praed. He justified his actions in terms of the public Victorian morality of his class.

3.4.5 The Annie Praed Trust

In the ‘Apologia vita mea’ Henry Burton-Bradley gave an obscure account of the trust that funded Annie Praed’s education. His last will and testament, written 1 February 1889 with codicil (due to the death of proposed executor) in 3 March 1894, gave the following explanation:

I had the good fortune to be the depository for the security of £150 which I obtained leave to dispose in Annie’s cause with the promise of more if it should be wanted. I dedicated this and £40 which was given by a friend (part of £50 towards my objects generally) to this purpose. I supplied from
my own purse whatever more was required to constitute a fund, then
invested, to carry the child through a four year course at a boarding
school where I placed her\ldots\textsuperscript{233}

Henry Burton-Bradley’s explanation may be read a number of ways. The funds
may have come from Annie’s relatives who wished to keep their identity hidden.
These points of analysis add further support to the illegitimacy argument and
possibly even the Campbell/Praed connection. Another reading may be that the
funds came from Henry Burton-Bradley’s circle of friends who were fulfilling
their moral sense of colonial philanthropy. A further interpretation is that Henry
Burton-Bradley may have fabricated the origins of the major funding, to diminish
the extent of his own financial contribution in order to avoid the ire of his wife
and family and therefore to further embellish his own philanthropic image.
However, it remains a conundrum that Henry Burton-Bradley was willing to
commit funds for the private school education of his servant, while the children
of his second marriage attended the local public school,\textsuperscript{234} where Louisa
Burton-Bradley was a member of the School Board.\textsuperscript{235}

Throughout the document, Henry Burton-Bradley’s delivery carries a strong
sense of courtroom drama, as the rhetoric of the following excerpt exhibits: ‘she
is now distinguishing herself, as Plato described Aristotles, as the “intellect of

\textsuperscript{233}Supreme Court of NSW: Probate Index; vol. A–C, 1880–1900, Series 4, 21 Mar. 1895, no.
8643.

\textsuperscript{234}Souvenir of the Five Dock Public School Jubilee 1861–1936, Five Dock Public School, Five
Dock, Sydney, pp. 34–6.

\textsuperscript{235}ibid., p. 14.
the school". He employed this emotive and gendered approach as a means to justify his actions, and promote his cause:

I must now go into the principles discovered by me in my long life. Of which every prudent man, when has made a discovery, avails himself of it in guiding his steps. I have found that woman wants man to lean upon, that a woman may be saved by her love as she is, alas, too often lost by it. That women delight in confidences I learnt with O'Ferrall's children, eighteen (nearly nineteen) years ago and with Annie during less months. I applied my wits to the giving support thus invoking affection, to the acquisition of confidence and unbounded liberality and unfailing attention, an entire openness, which has been the means that I have employed to these ends. I used to visit the O'Ferralls frequently, I endeavoured to draw our dormant powers of inducting the perusal of classic authors, English, and translation of classic works which I found applicable then.

However, while the rhetoric is altruistic in its appeal, there is a strong inference of gender and sexuality. Burton-Bradley's document is infused with patriarchy, and although benevolent in form it is nevertheless cloaked in secrecy and possibilities of subterranean sexuality. Henry Burton-Bradley's reasoning for this secrecy is flawed:

It will be remembered that on entering upon this latest guardianship I kept myself in the background. This I did advisedly and had I not found it "fauce" I should have continued to do my work privately. Directly,

however, that my plans became known I was driven into the adoption of
the most open and public course. I desired Mrs. Hughes to inform her
friends that Miss Praed is Mr. Bradley's ward, and by all convenient
means showing her the attention of a daughter, I thought to effect what I
had done in the O'Ferrall cases by the broaches with my likeness in them
for the purpose of warning all men that Annie Praed is under my care and
that who injures her must account to 'the OLD Lawyer'.

The whereabouts of Annie Praed's broach is unknown. It did not appear in
assets of her estate, nor does her beneficiary, Richard Sautelle, have any
memory of it. Its absence is noteworthy. Did Praed discard it?

In his defence, Henry Burton-Bradley also drew on meanings attached to the
philanthropy in keeping with the literary paternalistic figures of his time:

In Annie's case I have endeavoured to raise her imagination by the
paintings in our National Gallery where I have taken her, I think, three
times, perhaps four and by the contemplation of the wonderful power and
diversities of action of Divine Providence shown by the specimens of
natural history in the Museum, these things applying themselves as I
have thought more directly to her state of education than books of
imaginative character which will come later. I have endeavoured in her
case to inculcate and maintain a high religious tone and availed myself of
the solitary opportunity afforded me of kneeling with her, at Sherwood
Church. At the communion table on the first Sunday in this year. Thus my

\[237\text{Ibid, p. 5.}\]
aim has been by dealing with each of my cases according to what I have conceived to be its peculiar requirements, to accomplish the work of building up, a woman now, four on the previous occasion.\footnote{ibid.}

Henry Burton-Bradley's excursions to the Museum and Art Gallery with Praed mirrored the practices introduced to the Vernon boys during Neitenstein's period of command (1878–1890). However, Henry Burton-Bradley's choice of church raises a number of issues. Why did he take Annie Praed to Sherwood, which is now the Wentworthville-Merrylands, area at a considerable distance from his home at Five Dock and Praed's school at Randwick? Was this choice connected to his friend Holroyd? Where did Annie stay during school vacations? Sherwood and Holroyd's residence Sherwood Scrubs were located in a small village west of Merrylands station.\footnote{Mitchell Library: Sherwood NSW — history; 991.2/F, William Freame, Jubilee history, Municipality of Prospect & Sherwood, 1972–1922, \textit{Parramatta Cumberland Times}; Karskens, G. 1991, \textit{Holroyd: A social history of Western Sydney}, New South Wales University Press, Kensington, NSW, p. 91; Mitchell Library: Sherwood NSW; Q991/F, A weekend ramble, Paul Twyford papers.} The Sherwood Church referred to may be either St. Matthew's Mission Church on Holroyd's estate or St. Peter's, Sherwood. The curate of St. John's Parramatta conducted services at St Peter's Church as it was not licensed until 1907.\footnote{Anglican Archives of Sydney: Acts & Proceedings of the Bishop of Sydney; vol. 7, 1901–1910, 16 Mar. 1907, p. 353; vol. 6, 1891–1901, 4 Oct. 1894, p. 199; 26 Aug. 1896, p. 325.} The church service that Henry Burton-Bradley attended with Praed took place in early January 1889. Holroyd had died in 1887\footnote{Holt, H. E. 1972, 'Holroyd, Artur Todd (1806–1887), in \textit{Australian Dictionary of Biography}, vol. 4, 1851–1890, D–J, eds B. Nairn, G. Serle & R. Ward, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, Vic., pp. 411–12.} but his wife and daughter occupied Sherwood...
Scrubs. Was Henry Burton-Bradley being merely secretive by taking Annie Praed to a church outside the social milieu of those who knew him? It is known that he attended St. Luke's Burwood, where he married Louisa.\textsuperscript{242} Joan Francis has recorded that the Llewellyn Burton-Bradleys attended St. Alban’s Anglican Church Five Dock.\textsuperscript{243}

There is also the possibility that the name ‘Sherwood’ held some special meaning for Henry Burton-Bradley, because Sherwood Farm, at Moorlands, near Taree NSW, was the family country estate, started by William Westbrooke Burton-Bradley.\textsuperscript{244} Appearing on the stationery of this estate is the family crest of a pelican feathering its nest bearing the Edwardian motto ‘audaces fortuna juvat’ (see Figure 3.28).\textsuperscript{245}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{sherwood_farm.png}
\caption{Burton-Bradley Family Crest}
\end{figure}


\textsuperscript{243} Francis, J. 1984, \textit{A Brief History of St. Alban’s Anglican Church Five Dock}, self-published, Sydney, p. 13.

\textsuperscript{244} Sally Burton-Bradley Collection.

\textsuperscript{245} The translation of ‘Audaces fortuna juvat (juvat)’ is ‘Fortune favours the bold/brave/daring’. I am indebted to Emeritus Prof. Godrey Tanner, University of Newcastle, for his assistance in this translation.
Passion threads through Henry Burton-Bradley's apologia, about his feelings for Annie Praed. Whether this passion is of the Victorian fantasy kind is debatable. In the document there is also the hint of a possibility that Praed may have been his own child:

I am bound to my adventure, Annie relies upon me, with a daughter's love as upon a second father. Her amiable disposition has endeared her to me as a child, the child of my spirit, the child of my wisdom, the child of my chivalry. Of my quixotism if the term be preferred...That my adventure should cause umbrage or occasion distress to any is a matter for regret...I shall not desist from saving my youngest child in the same way....what I am now doing in my child Annie's case was in most particulars done ten times over in the O'Ferrall case.\textsuperscript{246}

A coincidental offering to this point of view is the uncanny resemblance between his granddaughter Claudia Portia Burton-Bradley and Annie Praed (see Figure 3.29). Another piece of evidence supporting this line of argument is that Annie Praed's first name was the same as Henry Burton-Bradley's mother, Annie Singer Burton.

Is it once again a lawyer throwing his audience off the track? It must be remembered that at each time Henry Burton-Bradley was attending to the needs of the O'Ferrall girls and later Annie Praed, he had a wife and a

\textsuperscript{246}Burton-Bradley, Henry, 'Apologia vita mea', op. cit., p. 6.
considerable number of children at home. With his second wife Louisa, his seven living children were all younger than Praed.

FIGURE 3.29
Dr Claudia Burton-Bradley and Annie Praed

3.5 Annie Praed's family

Henry Burton-Bradley's apologia is one of the few known sources of information on Annie Praed's background. However, the reliability of the evidence within this document is debatable. In the apologia Burton-Bradley wrote:

Seeing her frequently I became interested in her, learned that her grandfather had been tipstaff to Judge Burton when I was a boy...I learned that the grandmother of this child (the Annie of present controversy) was


controversy) was born of a good family in England, a Praed, the Bankers of some note in London...²⁴⁹

Other unqualified fragments of information that Henry Burton-Bradley drops are:

When Annie was placed with us by her grandmother...I told her that if it should occur again...that I would send her back to her grandmother...I obtained Annie's apprenticeship to me by her father...²⁵⁰

Thus it would appear that between 1886 and 1889 Annie's grandmother and father were still alive, although to date no available information has been found to verify this account. Why did Henry Burton-Bradley not provide the names of her father and grandmother? Was the grandmother in question, the Praed grandmother? Did Annie Praed carry her grandmother's surname and not her grandfather's? Or is this merely a ploy on Henry Burton-Bradley's part to safeguard the name of the father? Did Henry Burton-Bradley fabricate the connection to the Praed banking family, a name he may have been familiar with as his father's business was at 5 St. Swithin's Lane, in the centre of London.²⁵¹ Annie Praed's surname strongly suggests that illegitimacy (the term of that time) is the logical conclusion.

²⁵⁰ ibid.
²⁵¹ Robert Irvine Collection.
Evidence supporting the argument that Praed’s early life was one of disadvantage is in keeping with Joe Skinner’s version that ‘Dr. Praed’s early years were far from affluent. She had no relatives in Australia, she never married and lived alone during her adult life’.252

But once again it is possible that Skinner’s evidence was affected by Annie Praed’s tampering with and filtering out the details of her past.

 Surviving evidence strongly supports the argument that Annie Praed spent some of her early years in an institution that prepared young girls for domestic service. Firstly, there are a number of testimonies to Praed’s domestic expertise in sewing, cooking and gardening. Another factor supporting this line of argument is her age (fourteen) at the time of her arrival at Llewellyn. It was customary for girls in institutions, such as the privately subscribed Female School of Industry, and the government run Female Orphan Schools, to begin an apprenticeship at fourteen.253 Another factor is Annie Praed’s alleged birthdate of 4 January, which may be typical of the assigned birthdate given to orphans at the time of their admission to an institution. Henry Burton-Bradley’s inference in his apologia of an absent mother adds further evidence to this argument, because it has been documented that the loss of a mother was a major reason for the placement of a child in an institution.254 Another clue to her past may be Praed’s choice of accommodation in later life. Many of the

252Skinner, loc. cit.
253Ramsland, op. cit., p. 51.
254Ibid., pp. 56–7.
residents in her apartment block were prostitutes. The children of prostitutes were often placed in institutions. Barbara Smoker wrote that Praed Street, London was ‘notorious for the number of nocturnal soliciting prostitutes who walked up and down or lurked in doorways’.\textsuperscript{255} Possibly Annie Praed was the child of a prostitute, and her surname is a derivation of that street.

In 1889, only two years after her arrival at Lotaville, Annie Praed’s scholastic achievement at the Civil Service examinations also indicates that she had some earlier education.\textsuperscript{256} As public schooling was not compulsory at that time, and given the fact that Praed came from an impoverished background, she would have had limited access to education. Therefore it would seem most likely that Praed attained a vocationally orientated education at a child saving institution. It may be that she attended one of the Ragged Schools in Sydney where there was an ‘encouragement of upward social mobility and self-improvement through education’.\textsuperscript{257} However, no documentation has been found to confirm Annie Praed’s location in an institution.

3.6 The name: Praed.

Over the nineteenth century there were relatively few Praeds living in Australia. They were predominantly in Victoria, as they were generally miners. Two

\textsuperscript{256}Sydney Morning Herald 8 Jan. 1890, p. 10. 
\textsuperscript{257}Ramsland, op. cit., p. 227.
notable exceptions are Mrs T. Praed, Sydney, and the Queensland Praeds, who dominated the public's attention from the 1880s to the early decade of the twentieth century. The latter Praeds were the author, Rosa Praed (nee Murray-Prior) and her English husband, Arthur Campbell Praed.

An odd curiosity is the mysterious Mrs T. Praed,\textsuperscript{258} of whom no information has been found. NSW Lands Title records for her residence, Egerton in Gladstone Parade, Lindfield have not been found. The house no longer exists. It does seem rather coincidental that Egerton was the name of one of Rosa Praed's younger brothers and Gladstone is the Queensland coastal town nearest Curtis Island where Rosa and her husband Campbell Praed lived between 1872 and 1876.\textsuperscript{259}

In October 1872, nine months after Annie Praed's alleged birth, Rosa Murray-Prior married Arthur Campbell Bulkley Praed, the younger son of an English banking (Fleet Street) and brewing family (Northamptonshire).\textsuperscript{260} Campbell Praed's unsuccessful quest for a colonial fortune on Curtis Island began an economic pattern that continued throughout their marriage that ended in 1899 with a legal separation.


\textsuperscript{259}Tiffin, C. & Baer, L. (comps) 1994, The Praed Papers: A listing and index, Literary Board of Qld, Brisbane, Qld, p. 1.

\textsuperscript{260}Mrs. Campbell Praed', Australasian 10 Jan. 1891, p. 87.
Campbell Praed's predilection for marital infidelity was well known. His nine years in Australia may have been productive in other ways. Certainly, the dominant themes of his wife's novels are the predicament of women. Rosa Praed's writing is imbued with the limited options available to women. Spender argues that in the novel, *Nadine*, Rosa Praed's focus was 'What does a woman do when she is pregnant and has no husband? Has she made a "mistake", and how far is she entitled to deny her past and the claims of a child?' Tiffin, too, recognised a similar theme in Rosa Praed's novels.

In 1876 the Campbell Praeds left Australia to settle in the family brewing region of Northamptonshire until their move to London in 1882. His family held directorships in Barclay's bank and had brewing interests in the Midlands. There is increasing evidence, albeit circumstantial and hypothetical, to support that Annie Praed was the illegitimate daughter of Arthur Bulkley Campbell Praed. Firstly the timing of her birth fits with Campbell Praed's arrival in Australia in 1867. Another factor is that he was the only Praed from the banking Praeds in Australia at that time. Thirdly, Henry Burton-Bradley's 'Apologia vita mea' linked Annie Praed to the Praed banking family. Finally, the fact that Henry Burton-Bradley consulted Praed's father about her schooling suggests that her father was alive in 1889. Why was he not named and why is it that

---


Henry Burton-Bradley claimed that Annie Praed’s grandmother was a Praed related to the banking family? But then again, Henry Burton-Bradley claimed that Annie Praed’s father had been tipstaff to his uncle, Judge Burton. Is Henry Burton-Bradley baiting his audience? Is his evidence reliable? Did he think that by giving Praed a family background with some degree of status, it would add more credence to his own defence? Is this a red herring? Was Annie Praed, his biological child from an earlier extramarital relationship? There is a suggestion of this possibility in his apologia.

Henry Burton-Bradley’s protestations of innocence, fidelity, and respectability are so elaborately delivered in the tone of the wrongly accused that they may leave the reader with a degree of disbelief.

3.7 Hypothetical Praed/Shaw connection

It is a highly speculative but interesting conjecture that Rosa may have known Annie Praed’s circumstances and that she may have communicated them either directly or indirectly to G. B. Shaw. There is evidence that they had acquaintances in common due to their social and literary activities, although it may be telling that neither documented any direct connection.\textsuperscript{264,265} It is well known that Shaw was not beyond denying the sources of his plays.\textsuperscript{266}

\textsuperscript{264} Tiffin & Baer, loc. cit.


\textsuperscript{266} Wisenthal, J.L. (ed.) 1979, Shaw and Ibsenism: Bernard Shaw’s ‘The quintessence of Ibsenism’, and related writings, University of Toronto Press, Toronto, Canada, pp. 51–5.
Another interesting and most probably coincidental piece of evidence along this line of hypothetical argument is found in Shaw’s play, *Mrs Warren’s Profession*,\(^{267}\) where the underlying social comment is the social, legal and economic exploitation of women and the inequalities of choice that women have in society.

The play centres on Vivie Warren, a ‘New Woman’, who is a recent mathematics graduate of Cambridge. Vivie learns that her mother has gained her affluence through a chain of brothels that she operates with Sir George Crofts, who in Shavian terms represents the upper class with its hypocrisy and its superficial respectability. In this play Shaw exposed the class exploitation of working-women through Crofts. Shaw delivered with force the argument that prostitution was the outcome of economic rather than moral circumstances, and placed the moral responsibility for prostitution with wealthy men such as Crofts, who benefited either economically and/or sexually.

Shaw’s aim was to expose the very structure of Victorian society that had women of all classes financially dependent on men. The resolution for Vivie was to reject traditional societal values of marriage and to follow a new path in which she pursued a life of economic independence free of men and her mother’s ill-gained wealth.

The three other men in the play are Vivie's young suitor, Frank; his father, Rev. Samuel Gardiner, who is the most likely contender for Vivie's paternity, and an architect, Praed. The last character is Shaw's ironic pawn, a rather comic character, embodying the ideals of Victorian society's concern for the aesthetic, who is blind to the rotting structures that underpinned Victorian society. At the end of the play, Praed's solution of seeking intellectual pursuits of an aesthetic kind to Vivie's situation is temporary, albeit pleasurable. Praed's avoidance of the real issues is Shaw's tool to persuade the audience of the hypocrisy of Victorian society, in that while espousing the rhetoric of moral virtue it not only fails to deliver pragmatic solutions, its exploitation of the poor, especially women, is the fodder of capitalism. Praed is a curious character, as Shaw offered no reason for his connection with any of the other characters. In this way, Praed stands separate from the other characters. Annie Praed, too, was a character fitting this mould, for in dental history and her private life, she is a 'lone' figure.

The character of Praed may hold relevance to Annie and Rosa Praed's situation. Did Shaw know Rosa Praed? Most likely he was aware of the effects that Campbell Praed's financial and extramarital affairs had on Rosa. Was his choice of the name Praed for this character a deliberate comment on Campbell Praed? A number of critics have argued that the name Praed, like all the other names of the characters, is 'associated with the earth: Gardener, Warren,
Crofts, even Praed which, taken from Praed Street, is derived from "praedial" meaning "landed".\textsuperscript{268} Barbara Smoker of the Shaw Society has suggested two other possible explanations for Shaw's choice of the name Praed. One is that 'in the 1890s both Warren and Praed Street were notorious for the number of nocturnal soliciting prostitutes who walked up and down or lurked in doorways'.\textsuperscript{269} The other explanation Smoker suggests is that Praed Street and Warren Street, were 'within walking distance of Mrs Shaw's home, where GBS was living at that time'.\textsuperscript{270} It is purely speculative, but one might ask, if Annie Praed was Campbell Praed's 'illegitimate' child and Rosa had discovered this, could Rosa have communicated Annie Praed's circumstances to Shaw, either directly or indirectly? When the play was written in 1893,\textsuperscript{271} Annie was excelling scholastically at Lotaville. Annie Praed's choices parallel those of Vivie Warren, in that they chose to remain single and centre their life in their professional work. Their choices exemplify the tenets of the 'New Woman' that Finney has described:

The New Woman typically values self-fulfilment and independence rather than the stereotypically feminine ideal of self-sacrifice; believes in legal and sexual equality; often remains single because of the difficulty of


\textsuperscript{269} Smoker, B., Secretary, Shaw Society. 22 Apr. 1999, Correspondence. \textit{Women in Dentistry Project 1995–1999}.

\textsuperscript{270} id., 19 Apr. 1999.

\textsuperscript{271} Wisenthal, op. cit., p. 42.
combining such equality with marriage; is more open about her sexuality that the "Old Woman"; is well educated and reads a great deal; has a job; is athletic or otherwise physically vigorous and, accordingly prefers comfortable clothes (sometimes male attire) to traditional females garb.272

In Mrs Warren's Profession, Shaw tones down this version of the 'New Woman' for Vivie's choices at the end of the play as too extreme. Shaw's theatrical tempering tool is Praed, who represents the opposite concern for aestheticism and appearances. This stands in stark contrast to Vivie's pragmatism. Wisenthal's opinion is that in Shaw, 'morality is relative...morality is not fixed but evolving, so that a moral precept cannot be taken for granted but must be brought to the test of experience.'273 Annie Praed's changing circumstances from servant to a professional woman provided her with more moral and social options.

Shaw's play contains further threads of Annie Praed's narrative. It would seem that with changing circumstances from servant to financially independent professional woman, Annie Praed acquired the affectations of her adopted class.

Contributing evidence to this hypothetical link between Shaw and Rosa Praed is the appearance of a character of Shaw's proportions in her novel The Bond


273 Wisenthal, op. cit., p. 42.
of *Wedlock*, published in 1887. In this work, Rosa Praed’s literary sketch of a playwright at a theatre party closely resembles George Bernard Shaw:

a liberal minded and aesthetic divine, who offered himself as a living testimony to his faith in the stage as a school for morals.\(^{274}\)

A character in the same novel has a strong resemblance to Shaw’s Praed in *Mrs Warren’s Profession*:

...he stumbled across a literary man called Hatherton, who belonged to the Renaissance school and wrote semi-philosophical essays about art – a large-footed, limp, invertebrate sort of being, with a depressed, uninteresting manner, and a general want of breeziness and healthy vitality, as if he had lived in dusty churches, and had only seen the sun through stained glass.\(^{275}\)

Rosa Praed’s literary works offer the hint of some discord between herself and Shaw. For example, in her novel *Lady Bridget of the Never-Never Land*, published in 1915, Rosa Praed, a strong advocate of spiritualism, was not beyond having a literary dig at Shaw and his followers:

...I met some most original dears — Christian Scientists and Spiritualists

— and then these Socialists — not a bit on the lines of the old Fabians


\(^{275}\)ibid., p. 68.
and Bernard Shavians and the rest who used to believe in Matter — specially land property matter — and in parceling that out among themselves.²⁷⁶

Annie Praed’s narrative runs along the lines of Shaw’s play Mrs Warren’s Profession. While Shaw exposed the complexities of morality and women’s choices, Annie Praed lived them. Underpinning the action of the play are undercurrents of maternity, paternity and incest. Annie Praed, like Shaw’s character Vivie, turned her back on her family and her past, and chose the path of a professional career with some degree of financial independence. She escaped a future, foreboding early death from overwork and ill health. This expectation is described in Shaw’s ‘Author’s apology’ to Mrs Warren’s Profession:

the majority of English girls remain so poor, so dependent, so well aware that the drudgeries of such honest work as is within their reach are likely enough to lead them eventually to lung disease, premature death, and domestic desertion or brutality, that they would still see reason to prefer the primrose path to the stony way of virtue, since both, vice at worst and virtue at best, lead to the same end in poverty and overwork.²⁷⁷


Shaw's play *You Never Can Tell* adds further circumstantial evidence to this hypothetical Praed/Shaw argument, for the opening scene is set in a dental surgery. Another interesting point is that not only is one of the main characters a dentist, but the play was written between 1895 and 1896.\textsuperscript{278} Is Shaw, in offering 'the comedy of Don Juan as dentist',\textsuperscript{279} playing around with an inverse idea of morality and passion? Was he, in some oblique way, referring to Campbell Praed's sexual encounters? Again the theme poignantly captures elements of Annie Praed's narrative; Gibbs states 'the stress falls on hopeful possibilities: life and chance appear in the benign aspects'.\textsuperscript{280}

According to available evidence, Annie Praed's path as a servant was altered by chance: her presence in the Burton-Bradley household. In *You Never Can Tell*, Shaw toyed with the theme that 'feeling and intellect are largely opposed forces'. Henry Burton-Bradley's feelings towards Praed gave her the opportunity to exercise her intellect through academic pursuits, freeing her from a life of servitude and relative poverty.

Another coincidental factor is that two of the characters in *You Never Can Tell* are lawyers, one bearing a strong similarity to Henry Burton-Bradley (see Figure 3.30). Here is the description of the two contrasting lawyers:


the friendly and humane family solicitor, M'Comas, and the imposing and aggressive QC Bohun, whose eyebrows resemble early Victorian horsehair upholstery, and whom Valentine describes as 'the very incarnation of intellect'.

The description of these lawyers is akin to the image of Henry Burton-Bradley (see Figure 3.30).

FIGURE 3.30
Henry Burton-Bradley, c.1890
Courtesy Sally Burton-Bradley

A connecting link between both plays is the subtext of sexuality, either the socially sanctioned or disapproved kind. It is highly speculative and only slightly plausible that there is a connection between Annie Praed's narrative and George Bernard Shaw's plays Mrs Warren's Profession and You Never Can

\(^{281}\)ibid., p. 97.
Tell. Most likely it is simply a case of art imitating life. However, it is interesting to note that the plays and Annie Praed's narrative have certain common elements. It was a time when feminist and Eugenics ideals ran high.

3.8 Conclusion

The essential difference between Barnes and Praed was their social class and backgrounds. Without discounting the financial difficulties faced by the Barnes family, nevertheless, Madge Barnes inherited the hallmarks of middle class. This most probably shaped her femininity construct along that of this class, and she entered the profession of dentistry via the construct of the 'New Woman'. Therefore, a career in dentistry merely represented the interval until marriage. Her life was shaped strongly around nurturer, pioneer and adventurer myths informed by suffrage and eugenics philosophies.

For Praed, the issues of influences and choices are much more complex. Only faint details surrounding her family background are available and they suggest working-class derivations. The major known influence was Henry Burton-Bradley, who gave her access to an education that escalated Praed to another class. The fusion of the values of these two classes did not dissolve either entirely, and as the doyenne of dentistry, her career choices reveal these complexities. As a professional woman, she fulfilled middle-class notions of femininity in terms of philanthropy. For single women of this educated class, economic survival was secondary to this philanthropy. As a working-professional woman meeting her own financial needs, Praed transferred
working-class values for women. While Praed acquired her adopted class's pure aestheticism and its concern for appearances, her choices were tempered by the working-class appreciation of the more practical and fiscal considerations in life. Annie Praed's actions, from the known details of her life, show an intelligent woman with a strong sense of self-reliance and determination, striving to meet her need for economic independence and her adopted class values of philanthropy that were informed by suffrage ideals. It is debatable to what degree Annie Praed was a creation of Henry Burton-Bradley or self-created.

As little information on the personal aspect of Praed's life has survived, deductions about Praed's early life have been pieced together from the limited available records and are therefore to some degree speculative. However, I have argued that a number of factors contributed to her seeking a career as a dental practitioner. Major contributing factors in Praed's path to a professional career were the absence of a recognised parental presence, the appearance of Henry Burton-Bradley who secured the privilege of private schooling, and the access to a class with social advantages. All these factors shaped her identity and aided her path to a professional career.

The entrance of Henry Burton-Bradley into Praed's life was the vital link, especially in terms of timing, to Praed's access and entrance into the dental profession. Mystery surrounds the details of Henry Burton-Bradley's relationship with Praed. Although his disclosures in his surviving document, 'Apologia vita mea' are subject to a number of interpretations, it is clear that Henry Burton-
Bradley was responsible for funding Annie Praed's education at Mrs Hughes’ school, Lotaville, at Randwick. For Annie Praed an apprenticeship was inevitable. In this endeavour she was guided by Henry Burton-Bradley who held well known and publicised moralistic views on the suitability of the apprenticeship system as an educational model.

A strong image of Henry Burton-Bradley evolves from surviving documents. The more public documents such as lectures and letters strongly suggest a Victorian gentleman in the patriarchal and philanthropic mould. His didactic oratory style is in keeping with Victorian ideas of public morality. The dominant and possibly fabricated image that emerges is that of a sage at the lectern delivering moral edicts. However, his ‘Apologia vita mea’ offers a more intimate perspective of the man. The tone of this document is essentially defensive and, while the subject matter deals with personal issues, its delivery is in the adversarial manner of legal practice. Therefore, the final impression of Henry Burton-Bradley is a double-edged sword. On the one hand there is the image of the public man upholding the public ideals of the Victorian morality, and on the other hand there is an image of the private persona, mysterious and complex. In many ways, the final image of Annie Praed mirrors his. Martin’s biography of Henry Parkes offers a similar example of this public/private Victorian construct of masculinity. Henry Burton-Bradley's influence over Praed appears complex and the full meaning of his presence in her life may never be fully understood.

Evidence has shown that there were relatively few Praeds in the Australian colony between 1870 and 1900. Some hypothetical and highly speculative
discussion focuses on the author Rosa and her husband, Arthur Campbell Praed as possible links with Annie Praed. In this line of argument, another coincidental and hypothetical variant of this Annie/Rosa connection is the interpretation of two of George Bernard Shaw’s plays as literary signposts. Whilst all the evidence is circumstantial and purely conjectural, and even unlikely, it does offer some interesting and contemplative points.

Formulating arguments for Barnes’ journey towards a career as a dental practitioner with university credentials has been facilitated by available information through official documentation, the Barnes family memorabilia and oral history interviews. Supplementing arguments with evidence from interviews with a number of early women graduates in dentistry has strengthened the argument that a dynamic interaction between personal circumstances and societal factors influenced Barnes and Praed in their choice of a career.

Barnes and Praed were exposed to a number of personal influences in their immediate family culture, social circle and societal culture that operated in complex and individual ways to provide them with the incentive to enter the dental course at the university.
CHAPTER 4

THE SCHOOLING EXPERIENCE

4.1 Introduction

Realising and practising a profession based on university qualifications was not a popular option for women in the late nineteenth century and turn of the twentieth century. Central to the analysis of Barnes' and Praed's schooling and professional education are the issues of race, social class, individual and political factors in gendered terms. The complex interaction of these factors resulted in an educational experience, not entirely or essentially academic, which furnished the elements to prepare Barnes and Praed for successful university studies. This educational experience assisted their way into a sphere of paid work that was widely considered by the Anglo society of their time as being masculine, scientific and technological in nature. Researchers have noted the importance of secondary schooling as an 'important stage in...psychological development'.

The earning of a family wage was viewed as a masculine domain: white Anglo men were the breadwinners and women's paid work was thought at best as 'only

---

supplementing the family income'. Socialisation of boys and girls therefore always occurred within this context of the male as breadwinner. Education for girls was generally considered less important than it was for boys and it centred on a moralising intent for both working and middle classes, although there were different connotations for individual social classes. The kind of curriculum structured along this belief prepared boys for the paid workforce, thereby disadvantaging girls at both elementary and secondary level. Only a few secondary girls' schools offered an academic curriculum preparatory for university or professional studies. However, Barnes and Praed were fortunately placed in that their education occurred at a time when the number of schools was expanding to meet demand.

For Barnes and Praed, the possibility of a career choice and the pathway to professional qualifications were intimately linked to their particular educational experience. Personal circumstances interacted with economic and political factors to create an environment that was to their educational advantage. A major factor affecting their career choice was the timing of their secondary education: during the 1890s depression, the political and philosophical changes associated with Federation, and an era when the suffrage movement was informing women of broader possibilities.

---


Economic downturn intertwined with optimism and pragmatism for future visions to inspire the community towards directions for national progress in education, women's roles and a workforce with newly defined technological proficiency. All these factors contributed to the multi-layered and formative ingredients of significance in Barnes' and Praed's educational experience.

The timing factor was an essential element in the state of development of the educational system in NSW. Education was in the limelight during this period: it went hand in hand with the philosophical ideas of women's suffrage and Federation in the drive for a national identity in Australia. Political pressure was energised into structuring educational policy, enhancing the strong institutional development of schools. Public awareness of education as a desirable pursuit was raised to new heights. However, a separatist rather than egalitarian approach set up a segregated schooling system. The establishment of the state system along these lines ensured a place for private venture schools such as Lotaville and Riviere.

The charging of fees and the entrance examination selectivity at the well established public high schools in Sydney, Maitland, Goulburn and Bathurst excluded many and ensured class distinctions. Over this period these schools emphasised an intellectual, liberal form of education, in contrast to the vocationally orientated syllabus of the 'superior' high schools, whose pupils' futures lay in industry, commerce and domestic service.
Barnes' and Praed's secondary education occurred at a time when an accomplishment-driven curriculum formed the core of girls' education in privately operated girls' schools. The subject, domestic science, had not arrived as a curriculum concept. The study of domestic science in girls' schools did not attain maximum importance and prestige until the 1920s when it was used to prepare girls for a future in paid or unpaid domestic roles. Needlework, however, played a major curriculum component in girls' schools throughout the nineteenth and for most of the twentieth century, often at the expense of mathematical and science subjects. Girls were therefore at a disadvantage in gaining expertise in these subjects from an early age.

Elsie Sautelle stated that Praed 'sewed her own print surgery dresses by hand'. Historians have debated the site of sewing in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries: in the school curriculum, affecting career paths, and important to the domestic unpaid economy. Sewing, as a paid and unpaid skill, is an example of contesting femininities, with multiple possibilities and complex interpretations. Certainly in Praed's situation, needlework in her schooling curriculum would have assisted the development of her manual dexterity, a skill that is vital to the practical aspects of dental practice.

Motherhood, informed by suffrage and conservative ideology, took on a more moralistic and intellectual tone than a utilitarian one for the middle and upper classes of that time. Accomplishments formed around the intellectual and social

---

graces were viewed as desirable for girls with futures as wives and mothers in the upper echelons of society. Catering to these privileged classes, privately operated girls' schools focused on a female and polite accomplishments curriculum, structured on a tradition that had its origins in these classes of eighteenth and early nineteenth-century Britain. Transplanted to Australia, America, Canada, South Africa and New Zealand, accomplishment-based education for girls came out of an ideology of civil patriarchy: creating separatist forms of education for men and women. The intellectual component of the accomplishment curriculum that formed along an arts and humanities frame was derived from the philosophical ideologies of the Reformation, and 'the Enlightenment — the rationalist, liberal, humanitarian and scientific mode of thought of the eighteenth century'.

There were differences of opinion about the suitability of intellectual pursuits for girls. These differences were debated across the community, leaving girls' education on an ambiguous and tenuous ideological footing. The press vented the views against the newly introduced femininities:

It is surely a reason for caution and deliberation that the determination of a certain circle of women to force their way into places of male education presents itself as a part — though it may be the least alarming or unattractive part — of a general revolt of women against what have hitherto been regarded as the limitations and the safeguards of their sex.

It is connected more or less with the sudden passion for what hitherto

---

have been male employments, male practices, male pleasures, male resorts, and even male habits of dress.⁶

Multi-factorial, contradictory and complex messages were delivered to girls and boys about the expression of femininity and masculinity in public and private spaces. Measor and Sikes argue that pupils are exposed to a range of complex messages at school. They state that ‘pupils are exposed to several agencies of socialisation, which probably transmit a range of different gender codes’. Further, they determined that the individual response was to choose ‘elements from this gender code and mix them with ideas that derive from their own background and community culture’.⁷

Powles, too, concluded that parental ‘attitude, social background factors, school socialisation processes and the curriculum itself act as filters and channels for potential subject and career direction’.⁸

While ideology supported women’s entry to university, the prevailing societal perception remained one where the ultimate moral and social goal for women was their role in the domestic sphere. However, ‘suitable’ education was available for approved occupations for women who were either waiting for marriage or whose circumstances left them unmarried. Appropriate occupations for women of

---

⁶'The revolt of a woman', *Newcastle Morning Herald* 16 July 1896, p. 3.


⁸Powles, op. cit., p. 3.
the middle and upper classes were limited in range, and while dentistry suited Praed and Barnes, it did not suit most.

Barnes' educational experience at Riviere College contrasted to that of Praed at Lotaville. Yet both experiences display an interconnection between education, personal circumstances, race, religious beliefs, gender and social class. For it was the educational opportunity that opened possibilities for personal financial independence for women of their race, class and times. Howarth and Curthoys argue that:

> Most university women had been educated at the kind of High Schools, public boarding schools or academically ambitious (and therefore expensive) private schools to which relatively few girls had access.⁹

### 4.2 Private venture urban girls' schools

Analysis of Barnes' and Praed's education is limited to secondary schooling as no information on their elementary schooling has been located. Both attended single-sex urban private schools. Although rural private venture girls' schools were available, an urban locality definitely improved Barnes and Praed's tertiary educational possibilities. The city provided a cultural environment befitting the expansion of girls' education to embrace academic and intellectual pursuits as it did for boys. Chambers argued that 'cities came to provide the setting for the

---

most advanced girls' schools with rigorous academic studies for further training.\textsuperscript{10} This was certainly the case with the prominent pioneer woman gynaecologist, Dr Constance D'Arcy, whose improvement in matriculation examination results was achieved at the urban Riviere College. Her earlier attempts at the rural Rylestone High School were not successful.\textsuperscript{11} Jessie Aspinall was another student of Riviere College. Jessie exemplified the new pioneering university woman: she was the first woman to achieve residency in medicine. Barnes most probably knew her father, the Rev. A. Aspinall, headmaster of the nearby Scots College for boys. His visibility at Riviere can be argued in the notice that he was an official guest at the school's speech day in 1899.\textsuperscript{12}

At a time when public schooling was expanding it is important to note that both attended privately operated girls' schools. This is of greater importance in the case of Barnes, whose sisters attended Sydney Girls' High School.

Barnes' attendance at Riviere College may have been the result of failure to pass the difficult entrance examination to Sydney Girls' High School, although no records to confirm this opinion have surfaced. Access to Sydney Girls' High School during this period was limited to the 'social and intellectual elite'\textsuperscript{13} who had


\textsuperscript{11}Sydney University Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/135/5, Examination Register 1894–1899, Matriculation, 1894, p. 13.

\textsuperscript{12}Sydney \textit{Morning Herald} 21 Dec. 1899, loc. cit.

\textsuperscript{13}Kyle, op. cit., p. 116.
the means to afford the high fees. Riviere's fees\textsuperscript{14} were lower at 2 guineas per quarter for day scholars, than the three guineas charged at Sydney Girls' High.\textsuperscript{15} Madge's attendance may have been linked to a connection between principal Meares and Pearl, who shared a university experience. Pearl's donation of a school prize for English may be an indication of this link, although it may also be directly related to Madge's last year of attendance at Riviere.\textsuperscript{16}

In keeping with a family culture that championed tertiary education for its daughters, Riviere most probably fulfilled these criteria. During Barnes' school days, under Meares' principalship, Riviere was promoted as a preparatory school for university studies:

the growing tendance to take up University subjects at an early age, thus ensuing success at the examinations without undue effort. The College had maintained its prestige this year with seven Trinity College musical passes, two junior and two senior University passes, one of the latter appearing four times on the honour list.\textsuperscript{17}

However, as education for women of privilege was perceived primarily in terms of social rather than economic outcomes, the school emphasised the continued

\textsuperscript{14}Sydney Morning Herald 27 Dec. 1899, p. 3.
\textsuperscript{15}NSW State Archives: Dept. of Education; Sydney Girls' High School, 5/17743, Records 1893–1902, Correspondence, no. 41999, 6 Sep. 1890, letter from S.H. Barnes to E. Johnson, Under Secretary, Department of Public Instruction.
\textsuperscript{16}Sydney Morning Herald 20 Dec. 1900, p. 3.
\textsuperscript{17}Sydney Morning Herald 16 Dec. 1898, p. 3.
attention to the subjects of elocution, art, singing and the ‘practical accomplishment’ of sewing and dressmaking.

Riviere College, it would seem, met the requirements of parents seeking these social and intellectual goals for their daughters. Intellectual development was viewed primarily as a desired accomplishment for wives of gentlemen and as future mothers of the privileged class.

Summers argues convincingly that in the middle and upper classes, education for women was viewed as preparatory for this greater role of motherhood. She cites the vision for the future expressed by the distinguished Sydney University Women’s College principal, Louisa MacDonald:

> When the mother may guide her household, and train her children the better in that she has studied more deeply the history and expression of human thought, and has learned the principles of nature’s laws, and the duty of obedience to them.\(^\text{18}\)

Summers also cites the views of Lady Janet Clarke, the generous benefactor of Melbourne University’s Women’s College. Clarke had a ‘strong desire to advance the higher education of women, believing that a well-educated woman made the best wife and the best mother’.\(^\text{19}\) Ideology of this kind promoted

\(^{18}\) Hole, W. V. & Treweeke, A. H., 1953, *The history of the Women’s College within the University of Sydney*, Halstead, Sydney, p. 32.

education as insurance for the continuance of a hierarchical structured society that was advantageous to this elite group.

Faust concurs with Richard Evans' argument that Protestantism being an 'almost essential prerequisite'\textsuperscript{20} to the suffrage movement, endowed it with a dimension of feminine-based responsibility for societal morality. Elevating women to such glorified and sacred sites evolved from the changing status of women within the home. With the rise of capitalism and the economic shift in home production, women reached dignified heights to meet the cultural demands of the emerging bourgeoisie.

In keeping with commercial prudence and colonial functionalism, these privately operated girls' schools advertised their locality in terms of convenience to transport\textsuperscript{21} and elevated position. While Lotaville was described as being located at the Belmore Road tram terminus\textsuperscript{22}, Riviere College's locality was described as having 'Woollahra, Bondi and Waverley trams pass within five minutes of the College, which is also the terminus of the Hargrave-street line of omnibuses'\textsuperscript{23}.

At Lotaville, Hughes appealed to the aspirations of the new middle classes seeking to emulate the accomplishments of the upper classes, while maintaining colonial and protestant practicality. Hughes' advertisement demonstrates these

\textsuperscript{20}Faust, B. 1991, Apprenticeship in Liberty, Angus & Robertson, North Ryde, NSW, p. 185.

\textsuperscript{21}Sydney Morning Herald 14 Jan. 1891, p. 3.

\textsuperscript{22}Sydney Morning Herald 14 Jan. 1888, p. 4.

\textsuperscript{23}Sydney Morning Herald 5 Dec. 1891, p. 12.
ideas: ‘Young gentlewomen’s Boarding and Day school...sound education, habits and manners are carefully supervised...trained to be useful, sensible, intelligent...kindly women’.\textsuperscript{25}

Contesting positions on women’s roles in society supported these views, often from a diversity of philosophical perspectives. The temperance movement, for example, fought on the grounds of ‘social purity\textsuperscript{26} while working-class male unionists defined their masculinity in terms of their financial responsibility for their women and children. In defining gender-specific roles across a broad spectrum of political lines, women became encased within “the “motherhood principle” (nurturing; altruism; care of the young, old and needy; peace making; judicious good judgement)\textsuperscript{27} all in the name of national prosperity.

What degree home education played for Barnes and Praed is uncertain; however, family documents suggest that for Barnes, at least informally, this was a vital dimension. I have not discovered the exact number of years that Barnes attended Riviere. Surviving documents show that Praed was at Lotaville between 1888\textsuperscript{28} and 1892\textsuperscript{29}. In particular, Henry Burton-Bradley’s ‘Apologia vita mea’

\textsuperscript{24}Sydney Morning Herald 28 Jan. 1893, p. 13.


\textsuperscript{27}Ibid, p. 182.

\textsuperscript{28}Randwick & District Historical Society Inc.: Lotaville School; Transcript of Charlotte Elizabeth (Cissy) Hughes’ 1888 Birthday Book.

clarifies this detail and suggests that Praed had some degree of education before arriving at Lotaville.\textsuperscript{30}

The schooling experience offered an opportunity to examine the bridge between the personal and the political. Essentially the difference of youthful experience for Barnes and Praed was one of social distinction. In keeping with middle-class values of the period, private girls' schools were favoured 'for reasons of social status. Many middle-class parents would have considered the public system morally and socially inferior and highly unsuitable for their daughters'.\textsuperscript{31}

Fees and selectivity ensured a place for the elite public girls' schools along similar parameters of social acceptance for these classes. The distinctive difference was that these elite public girls' schools reinterpreted the work ethic by fuelling the value of intellectual pursuits with vigour to match the more genteel accomplishments. Eugenics and Protestant beliefs infiltrated all levels of their schooling experience.

The diverse meanings of femininity at this time were the outcome of a complex interaction between contesting ideologies of liberalism and conservatism. Parents chose schools in keeping with their value system and financial circumstances. However, school culture must often have been secondary to individual responses

\textsuperscript{30}ibid.

\textsuperscript{31}Kyle, op., cit., p. 45.
that were the result of the interaction between the individual and family, peer, school and community cultures.

4.3 Suffrage ideology

Economic and societal factors created an environment for suffragettes to formulate an ideology of the ‘servant question’ and the ‘woman question’. Class informed ideological positions on these questions. Competing employment opportunities in factories and shops for working-class women left a shortfall of available domestic staff for middle and upper class households.

Suffrage ideology increased educational opportunities for women. Coupled with the advances in technology, this contributed to a movement of women into various realms of the workplace. Increased visibility of women in a workplace formerly perceived as a masculine realm created debate across all classes, particularly concerning male employment in lower paid sections of the workforce. Women’s autonomy threatened masculinity constructs across all classes in different ways and, with the undermining of male authority, the ‘woman question’ enmeshed with the ‘servant problem’ to raise objections from many sectors of society. Economic change signalled a redefinition of women’s domestic role, particularly for middle and upper class women. Morantz-Sanchez illustrates how these issues drove ideology:

consumption would replace production as an increasingly important part of their daily lives. Accompanying these economic changes was a domestic ideology that glorified the separation between home and the
world and extolled female qualities of nurturing, moral superiority, maternity, and subordination.\textsuperscript{32}

Suffragettes focused on education for women as a means of raising the status of women's domestic and maternal roles. Therefore, women's education was founded on a base of social morality that was in keeping with Christian traditions that cast women in the role of saviour. A sketch by Pearl Barnes in the Barnes' album\textsuperscript{33} captures the symbolism of contesting femininities for women during this period in a fascinating way, particularly that of woman as a romantic social warrior (Figure 4.1).

In this drawing of a young woman in costume, there is a sense of a mythical figure: a romantic figure with golden tresses flowing beyond the armour of her breastplates, helmets, and torch. The crusader image is powerfully evocative of woman as society's moral emissary. The image offers an accessible metaphor for the competing femininities at the turn of the century: sexuality counterbalanced by the saintly, and reminiscent of a powerful Joan of Arc image. It would seem that visual symbols of womanhood in this drawing advocate empowerment of the kind sought by the women's movement. However, there is also a strong undercurrent of the romantic constructs of femininities from previous times.


\textsuperscript{33}Madge Barnes: Personal papers, Album. \textit{Virginia Hind Collection}. 
FIGURE 4.1
Drawing of 'woman-warrior' by Pearl Barnes
Courtesy Virginia Hind

The image is a composition of femininities that were available to the Barnes women who retained the past and annexed new meanings of femininity. Elements of mystery, sexuality and morality are bound together with a strong underpinning of virginal purity. At a time of rapid change, the image proffered assurance without fear, by embracing the new possibilities for women of this
class while maintaining established and more acceptable societal meanings of femininity.

4.4 Timing

The timing of Barnes' and Praed's educational experience was critical, allowing them to choose and practise careers as dentists. They were not encumbered by the restructuring of the school curriculum for girls' schools that was introduced as a response to the effects of the 1890s Depression. The cultural environment of their schools and society at that time allowed a window of opportunity for a few able and adventurous women. Essentially their educational outcomes were related to expansion in the number of schools, a response to the operating societal factors at that time. Hill estimates that from '1880 to 1900 the number of schools and teachers doubled, while the student population increased by 60 per cent'.

The timing of their schooling was such that it was not affected by the legacy of the depression, the re-organisation of the educational system along vocational guidelines. Vocational orientation of education arrived in the new century. This excluded the role of women's participation in the paid workforce and re-emphasised their primary role in the home. The educational policy aligned its objectives to working- and lower middle-class girls' preparation for domestic service, while the upper and middle classes received an educational approach.

---

34Hill, op. cit., p. 64.
more in keeping with a genteel station in life that entailed the attainment of an acceptable range of polite accomplishments. For women across all classes, the reorganisation of the school system at the turn of the century directed girls' education towards the domestic sphere in terms of the national good.\textsuperscript{35}

This policy ignored the movement of women into the new jobs available in factories, shops, schools, businesses and hospitals. A deficit in subjects with a technologically oriented curriculum constrained the scope of the curriculum for girls' schools, restricting or ignoring their career potential outcomes for more than half of the twentieth century.

The drive for domestic science subjects, however, did not filter through to all schools, particularly the more elite ones, private or public. Intellectual development in these schools was viewed as a preparation of women for motherhood ideals at family and community levels. This intellectual form of femininity was valued in terms of class and gender. Women who had gained this kind of intellectual femininity became the new mothers, educating their children in their own homes; in the public sphere they introduced education for working-class children through the Kindergarten Union. In the paid workplace, single women sought out professional careers such as teaching, nursing, and allied professions that held notions of acceptable public and societal nurturing. Another avenue for this form of intellectual femininity was to meet the intellectual needs as wives and companions to newly educated men of their class. To a limited degree, dentistry as a profession for women also came within this context.

\textsuperscript{35}Summers, op. cit., p. 333.
Seeds from this educational policy and society's dominant ideology were sown early in the twentieth century, with far-reaching implications. Educational preparation for women also favoured this path of domesticity for women in England and America before World War I. Russia, however, over this period offered women a technical education embracing the study of 'mathematics, geography, history, natural history, hygiene, knowledge of merchandising, workshop accountancy'\textsuperscript{36} as well as the traditional domestic subjects.

Dentistry mirrors this outcome, as few women in NSW who experienced this kind of education made their way into the dental profession after these changes were implemented. It is an interesting observation that women's participation in the dental profession in Australia, USA and the UK remained at levels below 10% well into the 1970s, whereas in Russia and other Eastern European countries the levels were as high as 90%\textsuperscript{37}. Another interesting point of consideration is that women entering the faculty of dentistry at the University of Sydney between 1950 and 1980 were primarily of Eastern European origins.

With the admission of women to the University of Sydney in 1881,\textsuperscript{38} secondary education for girls was given a new directional impetus. A social awareness was created of new occupational possibilities that were deemed suitable for respectable middle and upper class white women. Commitment to social graces

\textsuperscript{36}Kyle, op. cit., p. 189.


\textsuperscript{38}Kyle, op. cit., p. 84.
and intellectual development by privately operated girls' schools gave rise to an elitism available to a privileged few. Riviere College, it would seem, was typical of this calibre of private girls' high school.

Expansion of private venture schools for girls occurred during the late nineteenth century in response to the community's needs. In 1882, 9.3% of all total pupil enrolments were in private schools.\textsuperscript{39} The more academic private schools like Riviere College were driven to reach the standards of excellence necessary for success at public examinations.

Once the public examinations system was introduced by the University of Sydney, the Junior, Senior and Matriculation examinations set the pace for secondary school curriculum standards and for the entrance criteria to the university. The public's assessment of a school's reputation was based on performance at these examinations. The Fairfax\textsuperscript{40} prize for the girl achieving the highest level of excellence was highly coveted and was a major marketing point for these private schools, as evidenced by numerous examples of newspaper advertisements of the time.

\textsuperscript{39}Chambers, op. cit., p. 84.

\textsuperscript{40}University of Sydney Calendar 1906, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 235.
4.5 Lotaville

FIGURE 4.2
Lotaville School, Randwick c1885
Courtesy Randwick Historical Society

Lotaville, a school with a rather nomadic existence around Randwick in Sydney was in the charge of former Melbournian, Mrs Mary Jane Hughes (nee Higginson). In the late nineteenth century, Randwick, 'on the heights overlooking the sea some three and a half miles from Sydney' was believed to have certain advantages: the area was 'at a distance from corrupting urban influences and the clean air of the locality would enhance students' health.'41 Securing an

environment safe from moral and physical dangers was probably a strong factor in Henry Burton-Bradley's choice of Lotaville for Annie Praed.

Before locating to the ‘more commodious and healthy premises’ of Cook Lodge, Randwick in 1885\(^42\) (see Figure 4.2), Lotaville was established at 332 Victoria Street, Darlinghurst in 1880, and the following year was at 92 Surry Street, Darlinghurst Heights. An early advertisement of January 1881, described the school as:

FINISHING SCHOOL FOR YOUNG LADIES, Lotaville, Surry-street, near Victoria-street, Darlinghurst; Mrs. HUGHES, Principal. – Large airy schoolroom, well-drained playground. High-class English, French (the language of the school). Classes for Drawing, Painting, Drilling, Cookery, Cutting-out and Making Clothes.\(^43\)

In this advertisement, Mrs Hughes was appealing to Sydney’s rising middle classes seeking to emulate the eloquent accomplishments associated with the upper classes. However, in the pursuit of elitism, this type of announcement did not shed the pragmatism that was at the heart of colonial survival. It can be argued that Hughes’ approach tapped into the multiple meanings of femininity that were evolving in Sydney at the turn of the century.

\(^{42}\) *Sydney Morning Herald* 7 Jan. 1885, p. 11.

\(^{43}\) *Sydney Morning Herald* 15 Jan. 1881, p. 2.
Factors that shaped these notions of femininity grew out of the values of Protestantism, federation of the Australian states; eugenics and suffrage ideologies. The influence of eugenics philosophies is evident in the advertisement where Hughes claimed that 'Hygiene has been always carefully considered in the school arrangements; the class-rooms are airy and bright; only cane seats with backs are used; the recreation ground is large and healthy'.

By 1882, Hughes had widened the attraction of her establishment by including a boarding facility. A later addition of bookkeeping to the school curriculum most probably was a response to the demands of the commercial sector of the middle classes. At that time Mrs Hughes promoted herself as being solely responsible for an academic standard that prepared pupils for the civil service and junior examinations. In 1886 there was an announcement that three of the thirteen successful candidates at the Civil Service Examinations were Lotaville pupils; in 1889, Praed was successful at these examinations (see Figure 4.3).

Hughes engineered Lotaville's appeal to meet contemporary middle class views on intellectual capability and idealised societal behaviour. A gendered concept emerged that equated intellectual acumen with physical strength, implying masculinity. Henry Burton-Bradley was attracted to these concepts, enough to

---


45 *Sydney Morning Herald* 9 Jan. 1894, p. 4.


47 *Sydney Morning Herald* 8 Jan. 1890, p. 10.
donate a prize of a gold medal and to chose the school for his beloved ward (see Figure 4.3).

LOTAVILLE SCHOOL, Belmore-road, Randwick.  

FIGURE 4.3
Advertisement for Lotaville

In advocating meanings of femininity that were popular at that time, Hughes was upholding societal beliefs that intellectual pursuits were biologically determined. Supporting this line of argument is an advertisement for Lotaville stating that ‘prolonged hours of study being so harmful to growing girls, Mrs. Hughes has for years adopted such management of the school curriculum that the school hours terminate at two o’clock.’

Fashionable views along this theme were voiced in publications such as the 1894 *Evolution of the diseases of women*, written by Sydney doctor Walter Balls-Headley. Viewing an education as physiologically traumatic to young women, he wrote:

---

48 Sydney Morning Herald 22 Dec. 1886, p. 3.
should she have the capacity for higher mental attainment, her nervous system is apt to develop at the expense of her body...higher mental culture is antagonistic to healthy sexual development and childrearing.\textsuperscript{49}

By 1891, when claiming success at 'various University Examinations', Hughes reaffirmed her scholastic values along the lines of utilitarianism. However, in keeping with the dominant views of the day, Hughes defined the parameters for higher education. Her advertisement of that year stated that 'the Principal is most desirous that her pupils should be useful women. Plain needlework and other branches of women's work are made specialities\textsuperscript{50} and that the education in the school 'is thoroughly practical'.\textsuperscript{51}

Pragmatism of a Protestant kind underpinned the values that Hughes endorsed. Such beliefs that melded with the tenets of eugenics philosophies were unearthed in the advertisements for Lotaville:

The pupils are trained to consider usefulness in life the aim of education.

Plain sewing and the cutting out of body linen are included in the school curriculum. Diet as part of hygiene is thoroughly studied.\textsuperscript{52}

\textsuperscript{49}Hicks, N. 1971, Evidence and contemporary opinion about the peopling of Australia 1890–1911, PhD thesis, Australian National University, p. 141.

\textsuperscript{50}\textit{Sydney Morning Herald} 19 Jan. 1891, p. 13.

\textsuperscript{51}\textit{Sydney Morning Herald} 21 Dec. 1899, p. 10.

\textsuperscript{52}\textit{Sydney Morning Herald} 19 Jan. 1891, ibid.
The appeal to modernity along eugenic principles was also found in advertisements that announced the school’s relocation from the Belmore tram terminus to ‘the newly-erected mansion Tara, near Alison Road terminus...replete with every modern improvement, convenience, and comfort’.

Essentially these values informed Praed’s path into a ‘useful’ career. A strong argument has been made that academic pursuits were not universally recommended at Lotaville. Further endorsement of this argument is found in an 1890 advertisement that claimed that ‘only pupils who are physically strong are permitted to study for University examinations’.

Lotaville’s poor academic record generally at the public examinations is indicative of its level of appeal. Praed and the principal’s daughter Cissie (Charlotte Elizabeth) were the only students listed in the Senior Examinations. Riviere College, on the other hand, it would seem, was more directed towards the delivery of a senior secondary education of an academic nature.

Lotaville aligned itself with the vicissitudes of societal meanings of femininities attached to a certain sector of the middle classes. In seeking the prestige of class associations, it gained from the political affiliations with John See MLA, whose children attended the school. This presence of the See family at Lotaville may

---

53 *Sydney Morning Herald* 22 Jan. 1890, p. 4.

54 Ibid.

have also played a role in Praed’s professional and private life. (See Chapters 5 and 7). Henry Burton-Bradley held strong views on the value of education and environment as instruments of change in young people’s lives. Mrs Hughes’ various advertised prospectuses obviously would have appealed to his philosophy of an education grounded in eugenic and utilitarian fundamentals.

Evidence for this argument is found in his investigation of the problem of larrikinism,\textsuperscript{56} which, although romanticised later, was a safety concern for Sydney residents. His debate was similar to Henry Parkes’ earlier study of crime in which he related the behaviour in the streets to Sydney’s complex social problems: housing, climate, education and the rapid change that the colony had undergone during the gold rush.\textsuperscript{57} Both men were in favour of reformatories for delinquent and vagrant children.

Lotaville’s closure in 1902 illustrates the attitudinal shift in education of an expanding middle class that resulted from the economic development following Federation. Demands for better standards of education from this class saw the end of many private venture schools. Lotaville’s poor academic performances at public examinations supports this argument: Praed’s matriculation requirements were achieved under the private preparation of the tutors Mr W. A. Nichols, BA and Mr W.J.E. Davies, BA, LLB who prepared students for

\textsuperscript{56} City of Sydney Archives: Correspondence files 26; 218/1887, Henry Burton-Bradley, letter, no. 492.

\textsuperscript{57} Martin, op. cit., pp. 174–5.
public examinations. Wyndham Davies was a barrister with chambers at Wentworth Court, 64 Elizabeth Street.

4.6 Accomplishments and fine motor skills

An 1885 school program discloses that Lotaville's science subject offerings were limited to the study of physiology. Music, on the other hand, was readily available, highly regarded, and taught by Hughes' husband, Henry Hughes, Professor of Music (see Figures 4.5 and 4.6). However, music was proffered within a gendered societal context. It was 'the core of a lady's curriculum', a suitable accomplishment for girls who aspired to the ranks of the upper and middle classes. The study of music at girls' schools fulfilled societal notions of femininity; it did not prepare young girls for careers as professional musicians in the public sphere.

60 Randwick District Historical Society Inc.: Lotaville School; Copy of 1885 Annual Concert and Distribution of Prizes & Certificates, Monday evening 21 Dec. This is a 1975 copy of Mrs. Hughes' grand-daughter, Barbara Vaughan, Malvern, Vic.
61 Information and copies of photographs supplied by Randwick District Historical Society.
62 Chambers op. cit., p. 172.
FIGURE 4.4
Mrs Mary Hughes, Principal of Lotaville
Courtesy Randwick District Historical Society
FIGURE 4.5
Professor Henry Hughes
Courtesy Randwick District Historical Society

FIGURE 4.6
Professor Henry Hughes
Courtesy Randwick District Historical Society
As with sewing, historians have categorised girls' study of music at school as a subject of the 'accomplishment' curriculum. However, its social application had specific expressions for each class. Theobald has argued that the study of music at school held societal expressions that were gendered: the 'public performance and musical composition were the prerogatives of men' while 'for daughters throughout the Western world, learning the instrument (piano) became a benchmark of gentility'.

Music at Lotaville held a position of honour, as evidenced from the 1885 program of the Annual Concert and Prize Distribution (Henry Hughes composed three of the eleven performed musical items). There is, however, another aspect of interest in this musical education. I suggest that it offered an opportunity to develop fine motor skills: an advantage in dental practice. Relatively high levels of competence in fine motor skills are acquired with both sewing and playing a musical instrument. This perspective offers insights into some of the skills that Praed brought to her career. However, over Praed's lifetime only a few women became dentists. When more women became dental assistants, manual acuity for dentists took on gendered meanings. Researchers in the 1970s found that by then, the technical and mechanical aspects of dentistry had acquired gendered meanings:

---

63 Theobald, op. cit. p. 9.
64 Randwick & District Historical Society Inc.: Lotaville School; 1885, Copy of Program of the Annual Concert and Distribution of Prizes & Certificates, op. cit.
While dental hygienists and assistants (usually female) learn to use most of the equipment employed by dentists, the use of elaborate instruments is not part of our social image for the feminine woman. Women generally do not score as well on the manual dexterity tests used for dental school application since their early childhood experiences and after training do not normally include the kinds of skills which might assist them such as mechanical drawing and auto or machine shop.\(^5\)

Masculine notions of science and technology underpin manual dexterity in this form of argument in simple binary terms. Views of this kind have neglected to recognise the masculine culture of the dental profession that stereotyped the dentist in hierarchical and patriarchal terms. The dentist, therefore as head of the team, was constructed in the masculine, while the dental assistants, hygienists and therapists were embodied in the subordinate, the feminine. The interaction between professional and societal culture acted strongly to reinforce gender destinations in the dental team. I suggest that the meanings of manual dexterity are complex and embedded in the culture of a society within a gendered and class structure. With manual dexterity, gender has been rearranged to fit the cultural group.

For women in dentistry, meanings attached to manual dexterity are exemplary of gendered complexities. A point of intersection between the boundaries of

---

class, femininity and professionalism is found in the views of Olive Irwin (a 1939 Brisbane honours graduate) on women as dentists:

Dentistry is an ideal occupation for women...They are naturally capable with their fingers and with a background of fine arts, piano playing and needlework should give them the necessary delicate touch.\(^{66}\)

However, I contend that the developed fine motor skills of white Anglo middle and upper class women, which were contained in terms of feminine accomplishment, were translated into the professional sphere of dentistry in a gendered context. The transfer of these meanings from domestic to professional spheres retained meanings of the domestic femininity. In this way women dentists were contained within the housekeeping areas of the profession. Their presence was most likely in the fields of paedodontia, public dental health and preventive dentistry. Supporting this argument is the evidence that women were excluded from the more prestigious and more masculine realms of the profession, for example, oral surgery.\(^{67}\)

---

\(^{66}\) Anon. 1939, 'What women are doing: Considers women make good dentists', *Australian Women's Weekly*, 2 Sep., p. 30.

Meanings of femininity assigned to manual dexterity were factors underpinning the career choice of Anna Enno, one of Sydney University's honours graduates in dentistry from the mid-1970s. The attraction of a career in dentistry was linked to the pleasure Enno had experienced with the manual aspects of childhood play and adolescent interests, which included drawing; painting; making plaster models; playing the piano and sewing. Art and dentistry were

---

68 Madge Barnes: Personal papers, Album. Virginia Hind Collection.

complementary, too, for former Melbourne resident Dorothy Waugh, whose exhibition of sculpture was held at her alma mater, Temple University, Pennsylvania.\footnote{Anon. 1940, ‘Let’s talk of interesting people: Dr. Dorothy Waugh’, \textit{Australian Women's Weekly}, 3 Feb., p. 2.} \footnote{Anon. 1934, ‘Let's talk of interesting people: Dr. Dorothy Waugh’, \textit{Australian Women's Weekly}, 1 Sep., p. 3.}

In 1996, the Faculty of Dentistry at the University of Sydney restructured the selection criteria for admission into the undergraduate course. Integral to the interview component is the requirement of a display of a high standard of competence in manual dexterity. Two of the most common forms chosen by women applicants are the performance of a musical instrument or exhibiting needlework skills.

As with sewing, the playing of an instrument has been debated as occupying feminised sites in society, but in Praed’s situation, both were also preparatory for the manual aspect of dental practice. It has been demonstrated that there is a need to rethink previously held notions of sewing and music as metaphors of a woman’s sphere. In Praed’s situation they serve as examples offering other interpretations of femininities.

Individual circumstances certainly can affect career outcomes. Sewing, music and art subjects have been viewed historically in the light of their suitability for the genteel sites of femininity in the nineteenth and the first six decades of the
The schooling experience 250

twentieth century. However, in the study of dentistry they have proved to be advantageous to women.

The interview with Marie Patison and her husband Frank Cotton, who both graduated in 1941, re-affirmed this argument. Marie, who was dux of her school in Art, and had also undertaken a sewing course before starting university. Transferring the skills she gained from these experiences she found that the creative aspects of prosthodontics, in particular crown and bridgework, were more to her liking than paedodontia, which she shared with Frank in their private practice. Marie perceived prosthetics 'as an art form', whereas for many dentists the perception of prosthetics is that it is a technical and therefore more a masculine domain. Her expertise and ease with this form of dentistry was possible due to the valuable experience she gained in a highly regarded crown and bridge practice during World War II: the absent male owner having taken up war duties.72 This experience was advantageous to her both psychologically and professionally. Marie and Frank commented on the importance of fine motor skills in the practice of dentistry. They discussed the fact that a number of their first year university male peers had experienced difficulties with manual skill, despite being awarded Exhibitions (scholarships) at the Leaving Certificate.

Therefore, there is another dimension to the argument that the accomplishments of painting (see Figure 4.7), sewing and music evolved in response to the class aspirations and functional needs of a developing colony. In this instance the

development of fine motor skills were also advantageous to the study and practise of dentistry.

4.7 Societal factors

The factors of class to different degrees underpinned Barnes' and Praed's schooling experiences. The affordability of school fees for example was a class-linked factor. With fee scales being indicative of class distinction and wealth, Riviere College as an educational experience offers many interpretations. An advertisement appearing for the school in the Sydney Morning Herald in January 1899 suggests that the school targeted its appeal to middle and upper classes of the social strata.\textsuperscript{73}

In its desire to meet the cross section of beliefs that were held by these privileged classes, Riviere College raised public awareness of its achievements by offering a menu of multiple meanings of femininities. Proclamations of success were voiced through speech day reports:

\begin{quote}
The standard maintained throughout was highly satisfactory. The results of the Latin, French, and mathematic examinations were especially gratifying. Needlework had not been neglected, and the Dorcas Club had again received a warm letter of thanks for clothes made for the poor of the neighborhood.\textsuperscript{74}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{73} Sydney Morning Herald 21 Dec. 1899, p. 10.

\textsuperscript{74} ibid.
A professional and commercial class connection to education at Riviere College can be detected through its curriculum, staff, academic achievements and its establishment. Typically, Lotaville and Riviere College operated as 'business ventures as much as educational institutions'.

In commercial terms, both schools offered the promise of stability in a society left unsettled from rapid change. In her advertisements, principal Meares described Riviere's scholastic achievements as 'in the public examinations Riviere still maintained her ancient prestige'. Hughes, too, marketed security with her reference to her school's longevity, claiming that Lotaville was 'one of the longest established Ladies' Schools in Sydney'. Riviere College promoted itself as a school 'to parents who are anxious to give their daughters a liberal modern education that will fit them for an honourable position in professional or social life'. Advertisements commending the physical environment of the school with 'elevated site, beautiful and extensive grounds' and 'hygienic exercises' provide documentary evidence that Riviere was influenced by the eugenics philosophies that were prevalent at the turn of the century.

---

75 Kyle, op. cit., p. 36.
76 Sydney Morning Herald 21 Dec. 1899, op. cit.
77 Sydney Morning Herald 1 Jan. 1898, p. 11.
4.8 Eugenics ideology

In 1883, the amateur English scientist, Francis Galton, a cousin of Charles Darwin, coined the term ‘eugenics’ which had Greek origins meaning ‘good on birth’ or ‘noble in heredity’. Galton’s intention was to denote the “science” of improving the human stock by giving ‘the more suitable races or strains of blood a better chance of prevailing speedily over the less suitable’. His philosophy advocated the utilisation of scientific methods and ideas, particularly mathematics, to genetically engineer racial advancement. Basing his concept on a ‘science that deals with all influences that improve the inborn qualities of a race; also with those that develop them to the utmost advantage’, Galton spread this eugenic net wider to encompass environmental as well hereditary factors.79

The influence of Galton’s ideas spread to Australia where they infiltrated a number of institutions, gathering complexities in meanings. Rodwell argues that Australian social and educational developments such as temperance education, sex-hygiene education, physical education, domestic science education, kindergartens, nature study, social hygiene, mental hygiene, vocational guidance, scientific management, special educational programs for mentally handicapped children and Aboriginal children, open-air architecture, and playgrounds were singularly concerned with eugenics.80


Eugenics ideas proclaimed the benefits of physical wellbeing, linking them to physical fitness and a healthy environment. Ideology surrounding the pursuit of physical activity had its foundations in patriotism. To this end the nation’s prosperity was perceived as dependent on the wellbeing of women and children. Physical and intellectual freedom arising from these beliefs, however, was restricted to the middle and upper classes. Barnes and Praed were poised to be exposed to this new philosophical approach coupling health and education, which for women of their class was tied to nurturing at family and civic levels.

4.8.1 Clothing

The eugenics philosophy informed ideas on the health of women’s bodies. Health reformers looked towards women’s dress as symbolic of past ills and new ideas. Less constraining forms of dress heralded a new construct of femininity: that of women freer to become educated in the new form of motherhood. Educated motherhood promised the guarantee of population survival by containing women within traditional domestic spheres but with a new twist in the construct of femininity. Middle-class women became the target so that they ‘could measure their respectability and self-worth. Elevating the art of domesticity to a science, reformers restored to their followers a sense of purpose and direction’. 81

Clothing changes during this period mirrored these ideas with a less restrained corset-free form. Harriet Dugdale, 82 an early advocate of women’s

82 Grimshaw, Lake, McGrath & Quarty, op. cit., p. 171.
emancipation, had already voiced her ideas on women's dress. Her hair and clothing designs favoured a more liberating form as a measure of women's physical freedom. A central theme in Barnes' life was the embracing of ideas informed by these concepts of women's emancipation across a spectrum of applications. On the introduction of the shorter length of the new dress, Barnes commented that 'fortunately shorter skirts became fashionable & I feel sure I was one of the first to follow the fashion'. 83 This statement reflects how Barnes' self-perception encompassed cultural beliefs of her class and times, particularly those associated with eugenics, suffrage and federation politics.

4.8.2 Kindergarten Union

Two of the founders of the Kindergarten Union were Francis Anderson, Professor of Logic and Mental Philosophy at Sydney University, and his wife who supported the eugenics philosophy. In 1901, Anderson lobbied for educational reforms resulting in the introduction of a regulatory system that set educational standards for schools. Riviere College achieved this desired registration after an 'inquiry into size and qualifications of teaching; of classes, time-tables' 84 and suitability of equipment and facilities. Barnes' involvement with the Kindergarten Union of NSW 85 was therefore linked to the eugenics ideas that had germinated at Riviere College (see Figure 4.8).


84 Sydney Morning Herald 23 Jan. 1901, ibid.

The eugenics movement’s missionary zeal spread their ideas of racial hygiene and influenced the ideas of educationalists, in particular the Kindergarten movement at the turn of the century. Hereditary and environmental facets of the eugenics philosophies informed their followers on the benefits of improving society’s declining population pool. Reaching an audience through education and prevention was the means of achieving a healthy future population. As a dentist and former teacher, Hunt’s ideas on dental education for children capture eugenics and Herbartian principles:

Why not give a lesson on teeth as a nature-study lesson? Teachers would find the children keenly interested in the subject, as I well know by former experience. I am strongly of the opinion that more time should be devoted to the study of physiology.  

Indeed physiology was the science subject of choice for many private venture schools such as Lotaville and Riviere.

---

RIVIERE COLLEGE, on the heights of Woollahra.
Principals: Professor and Mrs. GOERGS, assisted by a
staff of competent Teachers and Masters. Every facility is
offered for the acquirement of Foreign Languages. The musical
instruction comprises also Theory, Composition, and the History
of Music.
To boarders special advantages are given in the study of the
science of Health and of Botany. The Physical Education, the
value of which is enhanced by the healthiness of the locality of
the College, has been successfully pursued in the Ladies' Gymna-
sium for more than five years.
The principals will be at home TUESDAYS and FRIDAYS to
receive parents wishing to place daughters as pupils.
Classes will reassemble WEDNESDAY, January 25.

FIGURE 4.8
Riviere College Advertisement in Sydney Morning Herald

4.8.3 Froebel

Froebel's ideas on the 'power of environmental influences over those [of]
heritable' were given new meanings by the eugenicists. The eugenicists' ideas
and practice in Australia were to affect generations. Rodwell has argued that:

the virtues of fresh air were very much a part of the eugenic culture. It
was argued that for children to reach their full physical and mental
potential they had to have maximum access to fresh air.88

---

87 Rodwell, G. 1992, 'Clitoridectomies in glass houses: Eugenics in our kindergartens
1900–1939', Proceedings of the 21st Annual Conference of the Australian and New Zealand
History of Education Society, Australian & New Zealand History of Education Society Adelaide,
p. 5.

88 Rodwell G. 1996, 'Lessons in eugenics from Arthur Mee's Children's Encyclopaedia,'
Orthodoxies and diversities: Collected papers of the 24th Annual Conference, Australian & New
As formalised strategies to regulate the education system were introduced, Hughes moved to embrace and promote these concepts and credentials as integral parts of her establishment:

The kindergarten system, of which the principal was a pioneer, having opened a class in this as far back as 1876 in Melbourne, was conducted by Mrs. G.R. Pringle, who has studied the Froebel method in Germany.⁹⁹

Since Froebel's theories were popular with these sectors of Sydney society, Hughes adapted her educational approach to include a kindergarten under the charge of Fraulein von Berhheim.⁹⁰

Future generations of Australians continued to be influenced by these views. As a teacher, George Bruce's views on the importance of physical environment and fitness certainly influenced his daughter Eila to graduate in dentistry (1940). She was enthusiastically involved in many sporting activities throughout her life, and she represented Sydney University in hockey.⁹¹

In offering 'accomplishments only' Riviere College catered to the upper and middle classes with aspirations for the leisured future of a gentlewoman. Preparation as a concept expanded to include the options of 'special classes for the “Senior”, “Junior” and “Matriculation University Examination”' which were

⁹⁹ Sydney Morning Herald 21 Dec. 1898, loc. cit.
available to girls of these classes seeking academic and intellectual achievements. Typical advertisements appealed to this privileged sector:

This school is specially recommended to parents who are anxious to give their daughters a liberal modern education which will fit them for an honourable position in professional or social life.

While Lotaville, in comparison, promised relatively narrower offerings of possible femininities, it therefore appealed to those seeking financial or social alternatives to the higher fees of the state schools and private colleges of Riviere’s status and excellence. Lotaville attracted members of the middle classes who preferred the kind of school with a reputation that pupils were ‘trained to be useful, sensible, intelligent women’. Parents from these sectors may have favoured the security of a traditional school which emphasised the polite accomplishments rather than focusing on intellectual development.

As a school Lotaville exemplifies the transportation and translation of middle-class English educational traditions to the colony. Kyle draws attention to this private school model, untainted by public schooling, retaining ideals of womanhood grounded in a utilitarian domestic sphere, thereby serving as a form of ‘social control’.

---

93 Sydney Morning Herald 23 Jan. 1901, loc. cit.
94 Sydney Morning Herald 1 Jan. 1898, loc. cit.
95 Kyle, op. cit., p. 2.
4.9 Riviere College

Riviere College, however, offered an education that embraced both new suffrage and traditional meanings of femininities. An advertisement illustrating this argument is the one: ‘curriculum meets all the needs of students preparing for a University career while at the same time it affords every facility for the study of domestic and ornamental accomplishments’. 

Students at Riviere College were in a more favourable position of having two career path choices: a respectable marriage or distinction in a profession that held sanctioned meanings of femininity.

FIGURE 4.9
Riviere College, formerly Esher
Courtesy Woollahra Library
Matriculation to the university opened possibilities of professional vocations desirable to women of these classes. Riviere College’s special classes provided the necessary matriculation standard that admitted Constance D’Arcy to the Faculty of Medicine. For Barnes and Praed their schooling opportunities expanded their occupational goals towards a profession that appeared to promise financial autonomy, a means by which to maintain inherited social status. Praed’s orphan status and the claimed financing of her secondary education by English relatives is a likely explanation for her presence at Lotaville, a school with lower academic standards.

One aspect of the interconnection between class and education can be discerned from Riviere College’s history. Established in 1874 by Miss Emily Baylis at Riviere House, Piper Street (now Queen Street), Woollahra, it began as a Ladies’ Institute, with advertisements that appealed to the burgeoning middle classes:

The salubrity of the situation, the comforts of the house, and the extent of the grounds make it a desirable home for young ladies from the country, whilst the careful supervision which will be exercised, and the course of instruction given by the Directress and assistant masters will ensure an education in all points befitting the daughter of gentlemen. 97

Another early player in Riviere’s history was Professor Karl Wilhelm Goergs, formerly of Brighton, England, who advertised for pupils in January 1874:

96 Sydney Morning Herald 1 Jan. 1898, loc. cit.
97 Sydney Morning Herald 12 Feb. 1874, p. 4.
permanently settled in Sydney, to give lessons in Singing, Pianoforte, and Guitar Playing, and in musical composition. Apply Mr. PALING, George Street; or at the Professor’s residence, Lavender Bay, North Shore.98

By February of that year, Goergs had joined Riviere’s staff. Like Henry Hughes at Lotaville, he brought to Riviere the study of music, a desirable accomplishment for the young women of the expanding middle class.99 With the marriage of Baylis and Goergs in 1876, Goergs became principal, albeit joint with his wife.100 At Lotaville, however, the role of principal was not a partnership between Mrs Hughes and her husband. Indeed a strong feminine presence prevailed: a shared principalship had developed with her daughter, Cissy, by 1898.101

Riviere relocated a number of times: initially to the southwest corner of Wallace (known as Wallis) and Nelson Street, Woollahra.102 In 1885, during the Goergs’ principalship, its expansion led to a move to Esher (see Figures 4.9 and 4.15), on Nelson Street and Edgecliff Road (see Figure 4.10).103 A Germanic influence can be argued by the school’s motto Des Fleisses Lohn, referring to the rewards of work and diligence. This philosophy suited the cultural environment of a

98 Sydney Morning Herald 16 Jan. 1875, p. 3.
100 NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; The Pioneer Index-pre 1900, 1876, no. 1486.
101 Sydney Morning Herald 21 Dec. 1898, op. cit.
103 Sydney Morning Herald 19 Dec. 1885, p. 3.
developing colony. There is evidence that supports the argument that the GoerGS prided themselves with academic excellence: their 1879 Riviere advertisement was 'Professor and Mrs. GOERGS having engaged the best Masters for the Classes, for the Junior and Senior University, Examinations'. Popular nineteenth-century German educational philosophies and theories of Herbart and Froebel can be detected in Riviere College's practice of teaching and learning.

FIGURE 4.10
Map, Glenhead Estate Woollahra
Courtesy Mitchell Library

104 Sydney Morning Herald 7 Jan., 1879, p. 2.
4.10 Herbartian theories

Johann Freidrich Herbart (1776–1841) placed great emphasis on the premise that good moral values were achievable through a structured educational methodology. School society, as a microcosm of the broader community, underpinned Herbartian theory: well-educated individuals with a strong moral code would result in a better society. Education instilling self-discipline and self-determination was the foundation of teaching methods. Central to the execution of Herbart's ideas was the need for a larger and better-trained staff.

According to Herbartian theory, the acquisition of knowledge in education was possible through a multi-layered methodological system. Fundamental to this approach was the tenet that new ideas, concepts or information could be maintained only by stimulating the pupil’s interest. To achieve this essential degree of interest, relevance of a topic was channelled through the connection of a student's existing meanings. A four- and later five-step teaching method was proposed by his followers 'to ensure the assimilation of new ideas to old'.

In the first step, 'preparation' through revision, old knowledge was brought back to awareness before the teacher introduced the new ideas of the second phase, 'presentation'. In 'association', the third step, the teacher's role was to assist the class in the process of analysis of the 'new knowledge or experience and to compare and contrast it with the old'. For this step, 'psychological

---

106 Ibid.
apperception\textsuperscript{107} was critical and could be achieved only with excellent teaching standards. The fourth step of ‘systemisation’ was when the new knowledge was revised and evaluated in terms of its relevance to a wider meaning. The final step, ‘application’, introduced the concept of problem-solving to show the pupil how new knowledge could be applied and practised in other contexts. Barnes’ comments on Musgrave’s research (on women dentists) contains Herbartian concepts: ‘I love the way you are “absorbing atmospheres” preparatory to the writing of your story’\textsuperscript{108}

Central to the application of Herbart’s theory was the role of the teacher as a guide to encourage pupils’ interest through ‘self-activity’ in an active manner. To execute these concepts in a systematised method, there was a need for teaching of a high standard. Riviere College fulfilled many of these ideals, as evidenced from its newspaper advertisements, the quality of its principals, and the selection of well qualified teachers at a time, when many private venture schools were staffed by untrained teachers.

Teacher training at the turn of the century was in a state of transformation, and Herbart’s views elevating the vocation of teaching to new heights was more in keeping with the creed of the new breed of university-qualified teachers like Dornwell, Meares, and Pearl Barnes. Riviere was committed to the changing status and establishment of credentials for teachers:

\footnote{\textsuperscript{107} Ibid.}

\footnote{\textsuperscript{108} Barnes, M.E. 14 Apr. 1966, Correspondence. Doreen Musgrave Collection.}
many present, could remember when men and women who were mentally and physically incapable of useful work in the world took up teaching as an easy and suitable employment. All this had been changed. People demanded in their teachers not only a high degree of intellectual culture, but also professional skill in imparting knowledge so as not only to induce pupils to think and reason for themselves, but to be able to prove their attainment under the test of examination and to be prepared to use them in the actual work of life.  

In this context, the professionalisation of dentistry and teaching shared common ground. Perhaps by witnessing the process of professionalisation in teaching Barnes was ideally placed to follow a similar journey of professionalisation in the dental profession.

Emphasis on the healthy physical environment in these advertisements went in hand with Herbartian and eugenics beliefs that "a healthy mind in a healthy body" was a prerequisite to the complex, more advanced education of the citizen. Eugenics philosophies had wide-ranging effects: 'enlightened' to the cause the message was delivered across a spectrum of spheres. Dentistry, too, was touched by the eugenic implications of educating individuals for the national good. The dentist, Pallett, wrote 'for my part I look upon a due regard to hygienic principles as the very basis of all the work which we as dental surgeons are called to do'. Another dentist, Goddall, pointed out that 'it has

110 Curtis, & Boulton, op. cit., p. 362.
been definitely proved that oral disease leads to invalidism, immorality, drunkenness, crime or insanity'.\textsuperscript{112}

Altruism, endemic to the code of the newly established and embryonic professionalism of dentistry, was high on the platform for the new dental practitioner, the dental graduate. Hanson, too, referred to the educational role of the dental practitioner along the lines of the eugenics philosophy, when he stated that the 'Committee of Oral Hygiene with a view to educating the public on the care of the teeth...should prove a great factor in educating the community'.\textsuperscript{113}

\textbf{FIGURE 4.11}

\textit{Centennial Park Camp}

\textit{Courtesy Virginia Hind}

\textsuperscript{112}Goodall, A. 1914, 'Care of the teeth', \textit{Commonwealth Dental Review}, vol. 11, no. 2, 16 Apr., p. 244.

\textsuperscript{113}Hanson, A. 1914, 'Presidential address', \textit{Commonwealth Dental Review}, vol. 11, no. 2, 16 Apr., p. 247.
Barnes' schooling along such principles contributed to the shaping of her identity. She applied these ideologies to her career choice and practice but also in her non-professional activities: the guidance of her niece and nephews, her involvement in the NSW Kindergarten Union Movement during 1930s, and the physical outdoor activities in her recreational life (see Figure 4.11). Even when she was older she would walk daily at a brisk determined pace over some distance even though she suffered from severe pain from bunions. 114 Another of Riviere College's well-known students, Lillian de Lissa, became the founding director of the Kindergarten Training College in Adelaide (1907). Her commitment epitomised the ideals of the eugenics and suffrage philosophies of the 'early twentieth century sentiments about the almost sacred calling of those who look after young children'. 115 Certainly the sentiments of the school's advertisements, such as 'boarders enjoy the advantages of a beautiful and well appointed home, with careful supervision and hygienic exercise' support the connection between the school culture and eugenics principles. 116

Another interconnection between class and education can be seen in Riviere College's links to the commercial class. During the period 1886–1894, the headmistresses of Riviere College were the Misses Hall, who conducted the school at the residence of their merchant father, Frederick Hall. One daughter, C. J. Hall, a former Riviere pupil, continued the teaching philosophies inspired by the

---


Goergs. The commercial classes sought useful education, adorned with a layer of cultural subjects to fulfil their aspirations for upward class mobility.

FIGURE 4.12
Riviere College students
Courtesy Virginia Hind

Yet another link between class and education was Riviere College’s academic and physical environment, with its low student staff ratio and extensive, charming and healthy grounds. Riviere College’s promise of a ‘large and qualified staff of professors and governors’, was possible only in schools with a befitting fee schedule. In line with Herbartian principles, Riviere College’s staff and environment exceeded the intellectual and physical standards of most private girls’ schools.

4.11 Role models

Researchers have extolled the benefits of role models to young women.\textsuperscript{118} Integral to Barnes’ and Praed’s educational experiences was the importance of headmistresses as key role models. Changes of headmistress were few at Riviere College and there were none at Lotaville, ensuring a degree of stability. Chambers drew attention to the importance of the ‘personal qualities of the dedicated head’ as a ‘paramount factor’ in the success and reputation of a private venture school.

At Lotaville, the headmistress and owner, Mrs Hughes, was an available role model for Praed: a middle-class woman capable of earning an income by running her own establishment. Two of Riviere College’s later headmistresses, as pioneer women graduates of their universities, also acted as role models for the young Madge Barnes, who justified her career choice by declaring that she ‘would like to

be unique and do the unusual.\textsuperscript{119} It can be argued that Riviere College’s headmistresses, who acted as role models, influenced Barnes.

Edith Emily Dornwell (later Raymond), Adelaide University’s first woman graduate with a BSc First Class Honours in Physics and Physiology (1885) was headmistress at Riviere College over the period 1890–1893 (see Figure 4.13). Dornwell’s academic success was attributable to her attendance at Central Model School where her intellectual talents were nurtured in a highly regarded academic environment.\textsuperscript{120} Though she came from a less privileged background of an immigrant family who traded in horses, her educational experience opened new vistas both academically and socially.

Dornwell’s scientific excellence supports the notion that the prominence of science in the school curriculum was in keeping with Herbartian ideas. Barnes herself claims that Riviere College was ‘a science school’, yet she did not study chemistry or physics for matriculation: physiology, botany and geology were the preferred science subjects for most of Riviere College’s pupils.\textsuperscript{121} Women teachers with adequate training in science were scarce: science was omitted from the curriculum at the main teacher training institution in Sydney, Hurlstone Training College for Women.\textsuperscript{122}


\textsuperscript{120}Theobald, M. op. cit., p. 1.

\textsuperscript{121}University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/135/5, Examination Register 1894–1899.

\textsuperscript{122}Kyle, op. cit., p. 150.
RIVIERE COLLEGE, WOOLLAHRA.
Established 1874. Principals: The Misses HALL. During the temporary absence in Europe of Miss EDITH HALL, her place is being efficiently supplied by Miss DORNWELL, B.Sc. (Adelaide University, with honours in Physics and Physiology; winner of the Elder Prize for Physiology and of the highest Government Exhibition and Scholarship; Assistant Teacher in Advanced School, Adelaide, for two years; and for over three years a SENIOR Resident Teacher in the Methodist Ladies' College, Melbourne). Fairfax Prizes—the highest awarded to females at the Sydney University—were taken by pupils of this College in 1885, 1887, 1888, and 1890, besides many medals for special subjects. The domestic arrangements are superintended by Mrs. Hall, every attention being paid to the health and comfort of the boarders. The position of the College, standing within its own extensive grounds on the heights of Woollahra, and overlooking the harbour and Bellevue, leaves nothing to be desired in point of health. Woollahra, Bondi, and Waverley trams pass within five minutes of the College, which is also the terminus of the Hargrave-street line of omnibuses. A FEW VACANCIES FOR BOARDERS. Prospectus on application. Studies resumed February 1st.

FIGURE 4.13
Advertisement for Riviere, featuring Emily Dornwell

FIGURE 4.14
Matilda Meares in a chemistry class at the University of Sydney 1886
Courtesy University of Sydney Archives
From 1896 until 1920 Matilda Meares MA, a Sydney University pioneer woman graduate, became Riviere’s longest serving and last headmistress (see Figure 4.14). She was known as Mrs Mitchell-Meares after her marriage to William Henry Douglas Mitchell, a widower who was listed as landed proprietor of The Grove, Cabramatta, Liverpool. Riviere College’s eventual disappearance was in keeping with the decline in smaller private venture schools during the decade of the 1920s.

Meares’ academic scientific emphasis can be argued by her attainment of Class II Honours in Mathematics at the Matriculation examinations. Her first year of a Bachelor of Arts included the subjects of chemistry and physics, with Latin, French and the classics. Graduating in 1889 to a Bachelor of Arts with Class II Honours in Mathematics, Latin and French, Meares was one of the few women teachers with university qualifications of a scientific kind. Indeed, Riviere College was privileged and exceptional in having teachers with such scientific academic backgrounds and qualifications. Interviewees have indicated that their secondary school women teachers in the mathematics and science fields were responsible for inspiring their pupils with an enthusiasm for these subjects that was not common among girls. For Musgrave, two teachers, Fanny

---

123 NSW Register of Births, Deaths, & Marriages: Index to the Register, Federation Index 1899–1918, 1911, no. 268. Matilda Meares, 48 years, daughter of Richard Meares and Mary Anne Roberts, married 65 year old, London widower, William Henry Douglas Mitchell, on 20th May 1911. She was born at Hastings River, NSW.

124 University of Sydney Calendar 1895, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 202.

125 University of Sydney Calendar 1896, University of Sydney, Sydney, pp. 206–7.

126 University of Sydney Calendar 1898, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 220.
Cohen at Fort Street Girls’ High School and Lillian Whiteoak at St. George Girls’ High School nurtured an interest in mathematics.

However, teachers at selective schools would not only advise girls to pursue a career in the feminised sphere of teaching, but actively discouraged girls who were interested in careers with masculine organisational cultures. The experience of orthodontist, Jane Twartz Spark (BDS 1969) exemplifies this point. Jane Twartz Spark recalled her career counselling at the prestigious Newcastle Girls’ High School:

I was asked at my interview, what I thought I might like to do when I left school. I replied that I was interested in Architecture or Dentistry as a career. The interviewer, after a thoughtful pause, responded that maybe I might be happier with teaching or nursing. My interpretation of this was that the teacher was assessing my ability to handle a university course and that maybe I was not capable of achieving that. Newcastle Girls’ High (a selective school) had a strong academic emphasis in its curriculum and I knew that I wasn’t one of the most “brilliant” at the school. It didn’t take much to erode my confidence. When later I told my father of my fears, he proclaimed them “rubbish” and with his and my mother’s encouragement I continued on to realise my ambitions at university. I should note here that I had no difficulty handling the academic requirements of the Dentistry course.\footnote{Twartz Spark, J. 17 Nov. 1999, Correspondence. Women in Dentistry Project 1995–1999.}
Career choice was inexorably set in a framework of marriage in the Anglo middle-class culture that dominated Australian society until the end of the twentieth century. However, for Jane Twartz, with a European father, Edward Keith Twartz, who was an engineer, and a mother, Marion (nee Green), of Anglo background who was a nurse, she was offered another perspective that was not available to many girls growing up in Australia. This illustrates the importance of schooling influences in shaping career choices. It is no wonder that only few young women chose careers outside the Anglo mould of teaching, nursing, and social work. Jane Twartz Spark’s narrative also provides evidence of the importance of family cultural and parental influences.
The link between class and education can be recognised in Riviere College's appeal to a wider section of the upper and middle strata of society (see Figure 4.15). This is evidenced in Barnes' lifelong and school friend Pearl Mitchell, who came from a Jewish and legal family background. Lists of pupils (see Appendix) contained names that suggest a strong presence of non-Anglo ethnic groups.

In the late years of the nineteenth century, academic achievement became more sought after. A legacy of the pain of the depression of 1891–1893 was the growth of the importance of the public examinations to access vocational qualifications. Advertisements confirmed the examinations records: Riviere College’s pupils were often among the recipients of the Fairfax Prize.

4.12 Religious background

Another aspect of the interconnection between social class, religion and education is that Barnes and Praed were Anglican and thus part of the Protestant ascendancy. It is a little surprising that Barnes and Praed were Anglican rather than Presbyterian or Methodist, since the latter tended to be more favourably inclined to the benefits of education for women as well as men. Catholic girls' schools at this time favoured a domestic or more culturally centred education. An earlier reference to Praed's attendance at St. Vincent's College, Potts Point, pointed inaccurately to a Catholic education. The Protestant work ethic underpinned the educational philosophies at both schools: a template of diligence and duty set up lifelong patterns that Barnes and Praed would follow. At Lotaville, Hughes expressed this as 'it was
constantly set before the girls that life was not for amusement—that pleasure should be recreation and not displace duty'.

Similarly at Riviere, this sentiment was voiced as ‘the Principal expressed her satisfaction with the spirit of conscientious work and hearty good fellowship that prevailed throughout the school’. Barnes and Praed shared common ground at school in that both were awarded Scripture prizes.

4.13 Political factors

Barnes’ and Praed’s later years at school were marked by the continued energy of the Women’s Movement that heralded changes for women’s claim to space in the public domain. Change of such magnitude offered broader visions previously denied to women of earlier generations. Marriage was no longer the sole available option for white Anglo women of privilege. The caring professions as avenues for social reform engaged women in an extended vision of motherhood. Riviere College’s ideology made an impression on a number of its pupils, for example, Lillian de Lissa (1885–1967) and Constance D’Arcy.

Inherent to both schools was this paradoxical nature of the educational environment. On one hand these schools, which were run by independent

129 Sydney Morning Herald 16 Dec. 1898, loc. cit.
130 Sydney Morning Herald 20 Dec. 1900, loc. cit.
131 Sydney Morning Herald 8 Jan. 1890, loc. cit.
women, were exemplary in informing pupils of the possibilities for women in positions that attracted relatively high status and pay, compared to the options available to their working-class peers. On the other hand, their curriculum and cultural environment reaffirmed the widely held view in society that woman's primary role was in the home. Gender bias in the educational preparation for the workforce extended beyond curriculum choices and differential standards to the actual design of examination questions that endorsed the intellectual and societal inferiority of women.

Structural and informal barriers served both to confuse and contain women. Ideals for the new woman eventually came face to face with entrenched views. However, this was still a time of change and hope reigned under the Federation and suffrage visions for the new possibilities for women of privilege. In line with these new visions, there emerged in small pockets of society, redefinitions of femininity and masculinity: new idealised forms of relationship between men and women that were 'based on mutual love'. Young women like Barnes' friend 'L.C' in 1907\(^{132}\) captured the spirit of these views when she wrote:

**Man on Woman**

The matter of fact man — prosaic in his ideals — views a woman only as a prospective wife, and in that capacity a chattel — something fairly pleasant, but in the main useful; someone who will wait on him, rear children, and be submissive to his will; a sort of lady companion, housekeeper, hospital nurse, and sewing woman rolled into one.

Ladies! How like you this type?

---

Woman on Man

He is not for me, who cannot think of me, as a Soul first, and a Woman after.

Riviere College's pupils exemplified the ambiguous position on offer for the new educated middle-class girl: encouraged to enter prestigious professions of law, medicine and dentistry, where these dominant masculine cultures had no perceived acknowledged or available space for women. More often than not these professions either overtly or covertly excluded women from their ranks.

4.14 Conclusion

As white, Anglican, urban and middle-class by virtue of birth, both Barnes and Praed were well positioned to access the necessary means to achieve entry into the corridors of tertiary training for the embryonic profession of dentistry. Common to both was the legacy of the depression of the 1891–1893; the passion of the Women's Movement and the sites that they occupied in their class. Without inherited financial independence, their motivation for agency was heightened to extend their educational experience and occupational vision to careers in the dental profession where they could achieve some degree of security through financial autonomy and yet retain the status of their class.

The phenomenon of class expectations informing work outcomes is reflected in the fact that their career choices were not directed towards the expanding role of women as office workers or factories, as was the destiny of the working-class girl. Yet pragmatism in terms of financial rewards and autonomy persuaded Barnes
and Praed into the self-employed world of dentistry. At that time the practice of
dentistry was aligned with commercial rather than professional values.
Professionally, dentistry may have appeared to be free of the gendered
disadvantages of teaching where women earned less and had fewer promotional
opportunities than their male peers.

Documentary evidence about both schools is fragmentary. Due to the paucity of
available information on Riviere College and Lotaville, conclusions have been
reached after examination of primary sources such as directories, local history
records; public examination results, newspaper advertisements and the
information compiled from Barnes' personal papers and correspondence.

In the final analysis Barnes' and Praed's educational experiences certainly
shaped their identity, career choices and paths. Supporting this argument of
schooling as an influential factor for women choosing dentistry as a career are
the high representation of graduating female students in dentistry (prior to 1950s)
who attended selective schools.

Barnes and Praed were exceptional for women of their generation: their career
paths being considered more suitable for their male peers during this period of
technological, economic, political and societal change. Visible and invisible
barriers limited most women's access to a similar career path. Educational,
personal and societal factors shaped women's primary role in the domestic
sphere.
School culture created networks that benefited Barnes in formal and informal ways throughout her life. The Aspinall connection is one such example. The Aspinall family connection is the most probable explanation for Barnes' appointment as the dentist to Scots College (see Chapter 8).

Exposure to women with high public profiles was another aspect of the school culture at Riviere College. These offered the young Barnes role models. Headmistresses Dornwell and Meares were two obvious ones. Other pioneer women graduates complemented the staff and former pupils. There was also the presence of women in the public arena, at speech days, such as Louise Macdonald, the principal of Women's College at the University of Sydney.\textsuperscript{133}

Access to curriculum standards and choices for tertiary entrance qualifications presented a major obstacle for women. Mathematics and science subjects in the main were either excluded from the girls' curriculum or offered at a lower level than for boys. However, the more elite selective public and private girls' high schools were positioned to counter these factors to a degree. Career teachers as role models were also a significant factor in the educational experience of Barnes and Praed. An argument can be made that Barnes' entry into the new territory of the dental profession was directly linked to the pioneering role models of Dornwell and Meares, who were at the vanguard of the professionalisation of teaching. In common with dentistry, teaching shifted in that era from apprenticeship to institutional training.

\textsuperscript{133}ibid.
Personal circumstances for both Barnes and Praed fuelled their drive for financial independence. While both were well connected socially, they were without inherited wealth: Barnes due to her family's financial difficulties, and Praed, an orphan with limited means. Their social class connections were influential in providing access to educational and vocational opportunities that were not open to most women of their generation. Their working-class peers, in contrast, had limited work aspirations which were directed into domestic service or factories, whilst lower middle-class white Anglo women ventured into the commercial sphere and the apprenticeship forms of nursing or teaching. Praed's social ascendancy from working-class servant to her employer's ward at Lotaville exemplifies this argument.

Among their own class, however, women, particularly in Barnes' social circle, were fulfilling the ideology of the suffrage movement and becoming 'citizen mothers' by pursuing careers in social work, nursing, teaching and medicine. Praed's position in the class stratification is exemplary of class informing career options. A private venture girls' school education as a protégé of her benefactor, Henry Burton-Bradley, gave her access to this class. It has been argued that white Anglo middle-class women educated at elite girls' schools had the opportunity and aspirations to pursue careers in the professions.\textsuperscript{134}

However the community's founding belief in 'archetypal home environment'\textsuperscript{135} raised conflict with this educational preparation. A resultant tension ensued for

\textsuperscript{134} Kyle, op. cit., p. 217.

\textsuperscript{135} Chambers, op. cit., p. 19.
these women as their society contained and excluded them from equitable places in professions and society. In a developing white Anglo community with insecurities about the future and the need for population expansion, societal forces in Australia constructed femininities around motherhood as central to white survival. Survival needs intertwined with traditional views on women's roles derived from Britain and formed barriers that in the main excluded women from seeking careers in any visible numbers in the dental profession during Barnes' and Praed's lifetimes.

For all the rhetoric associated with the education of girls in elite private schools, the long-term consequences of this educational preparation were contained within the strict parameters of being a wife and mother. The difference was that education raised the standard and therefore prestige of these stations. Another aspect of this societal and educational shift was the new-found public space for motherhood in the helping professions. Single women as working-professionals had become acceptable by the 1880s\textsuperscript{136} with the knowledge that with marriage the male-as-breadwinner and woman-at-home roles were retained. This state of economic and social relations remained unchallenged until the women's movement gained the attention of the media and public in the 1970s.

The environment at the turn of the century was receptive to the eugenics movement. Certainly Barnes' educational experience, and its subsequent effect on her career path, exhibits many aspects reflecting how ideology informed

\textsuperscript{136}Theobald, op. cit., p. 205.
women's choices at that time, serving as an example of the interface between the personal and the political. Therefore, exemplary as Barnes and Praed are for women of their generation, class, and educational experience, the evidence illustrates that educational objectives in terms of preparation for the professions remained within the realm of their male peers rather than for women. Further evidence supporting this argument is the poor rate of participation of women in engineering, law, medicine and veterinary science until the eighth decade of the twentieth century. Faced with the opposing ideologies of the activism of feminism and the belief in the subordination and dependency of conservatism, few women found their way into the dental profession until the 1980s.

Education as preparation for women's futures was viewed in equal but different terms: separate spheres for men and women. Private girls' schools introduced the concept of intellectual and social accomplishments for ladies during a period when societal change in class stratification was embryonic in Australia. This ideology belonged to the established Old World and had not been a structured possibility for the middle classes in a pioneering society requiring primarily utilitarian needs for its survival.

Yet Barnes' and Praed's educational experience was infused with personal circumstances, with the rhetoric of the women's movement, the environment and culture of their secondary schooling, and in Barnes' case, the support of her family. All these factors made it possible for them to shift the boundaries of preconceived societal roles for women.
Prescribed forms of femininity were being challenged among the small pockets of elite schools. While on one level they achieved some change, it was contained paradoxically by maintaining a strong conviction in the sacredness of 'ladyhood'. The instruction of ladies was founded on the inclusion, within the curriculum, of a range of desirable accomplishments. Challenges to these stereotypes were possible in the pioneering and utilitarian environment of a developing community not yet entrenched in the preservation of rigid beliefs of older more established societies. Australia and New Zealand exemplify this argument in comparison with Britain and other European countries in their earlier achievement of full suffrage for women. It was the very attribute of class and its manifestation of 'ladyhood' equal to the 'gentleman' that was a qualifying requirement necessary for entry into a profession at a tertiary educational level.

For Barnes and Praed, their respective schools, Riviere College and Lotaville, were significantly instrumental in their educational preparation in social propriety, both structurally in curriculum terms and culturally in the social school environment provided by the pupils and staff.
CHAPTER 5

PROFESSIONALISATION: PROCESS
AND CULTURE

FIGURE 5.1

Advertisement\(^1\)
Courtesy Newcastle Local History Library

\(^1\)Maitland Weekly Mercury 29 June 1895, p. 2.
5.1 Introduction

Barnes and Praed entered the dental profession as it was undergoing a fundamental transformation. The shift from apprenticeship training to university-based training in dentistry represents a period when the profession sought to fashion a new public identity and a modern organisational culture. Dental education moved from the private to the public sphere. This was largely the product of the political and social atmosphere in Sydney at the turn of the century. The turn of the century heralded change in many forms including women’s suffrage, Federation, and the death of Queen Victoria. Aesthetic transformation of Sydney paralleled the growth in transport and communication. The city’s establishment of quarters began, and Macquarie Street became the epicentre for public buildings, doctors and dentists. During this period strong incentives were operating to reform organisationally both the dental profession and the university. These reforms were framed within a gendered and class process that established a homogeneous professional identity and culture. The dental profession developed the masculine image of white, Anglo, heterosexual, middle-class men.

Johnson concurred with Leggat’s list of characteristics ‘seen as an operational definition of a profession’.\(^2\) Essentially these characteristics are structural and attitudinal. Structural factors in the professionalisation process of dentistry were the installation of the Dental Board, the institutionalisation of dental education and the union of members into a single representative organisation. All these

---

structural implementations acted as regulatory controls over standards of training, practice and numbers entering the profession.

Attitudinal beliefs dictated a member’s public behaviour and practice principles. The leaders of the public campaign developed beliefs, fashioned from upper and middle-class systems of altruism and conduct, that they emphasised, delegating financial incentives to the background.

Economically driven motives forged a partnership between the university and the dental profession. The resultant profession formed around the boundaries of race, class and gender. The professionalisation of dentistry arose from the precarious state of both the university and the dental profession at that time. Linking both was the quest for improved status and financial benefit, and competition from other sectors.

Professionalisation of dentistry facilitated the ‘institutionalisation of male privilege’\textsuperscript{3} that created a masculine organisational culture. A culture of professionalism with an ethos of ‘individualism, scientific objectivity, rationality, personal achievement and careerism’\textsuperscript{4} resulted, formed along the parameters of masculine membership. Women who entered the profession faced this masculine professional model, as well as societal models of femininity. Barnes


and Praed shared with women in the medical profession an experience that was separate from that of most other women in their society.

The process of professionalisation involved the centralisation of knowledge through formal and informal control of education and the organisational unification of dentists. Transmission of dental knowledge took place via the university, professional bodies and the establishment of a single publication. Control of each area progressed through a transitional period of power struggles between various vying parties.

Formalised education established university credentials as the professional standard. Qualifications based on university training were not available to many in Australian society during this period. Whereas for women the apprenticeship scheme sanctioned their presence, university training disadvantaged them. This restricted access exemplifies the significance of race, class and gender in the professionalisation process.

It would seem that the very instability of the newly defined professional identity during this dynamic period of transformation offered Barnes and Praed an opportunity. Barnes and Praed entered the dental profession during a window period in the professionalisation process. This period represented a transitional stage between two systems of training, and the establishment of an organisational body. With favourable political and personal factors, it was timing that provided an advantage that was unavailable to many women in the twentieth century in Australia. Their location in the profession during their
practising life reflected political, societal and professional meanings of masculinity and femininity. Contemporary factors generally favoured a masculine professional culture, except when there was a shortage of available men.

5.2 The University of Sydney

The university, being both numerically and economically vulnerable, looked to its survival by expanding its curriculum to meet the demands of a community favouring the vocational and utilitarian opportunities associated with science and technology. Australia’s political environment, fired up with the democratic ideals and expansive visions of Federation, proved an ideal climate for the university to admit women in 1884. Opportunity for expansion was realised with the generous flow of funds from the Challis bequest to Sydney University in 1890. Energised by change from the new century, the new political climate and a changing society, the new professionals saw themselves as part of these political and social changes. In 1903, Donald Smith voiced his support for these views:

We stand, so to speak on the threshold of great things, and for this reason a dentist would be the most appropriate figure to suggest for the proposed statue of Australia facing the dawn.\(^5\)

TEETH EXTRACTED
Without any pain whatever by the
LONDON & NEWCASTLE DENTAL COMPANY
See Testimonials. We guarantee operations painless. No dangerous drugs used.

DENTAL SURGERY,
34 BOLTON-STREET, NEWCASTLE,
AND AT
Main’s Excelsior Hotel, West Tceiland,
Every Wednesday.

NEXT VISIT: WEDNESDAY, JUNE 26.
GEO. WEIR, L.D.S., Dental Surgeon, Manager.

For easy terms, qualified and competent workmanship, consult the above firm. No quacks employed. TEETH EXTRACTED without the slightest pain, 2s 6d. Real First-class DENTISTRY on approved principles. TIME PAYMENTS taken, but a deposit must accompany each order. Patients waited on at their own homes without any extra charge whatever. Upper or Lower SETS from 22, and Terms within the reach of all. Consultations free.

WHY SUFFER PAIN? Come and see and judge for yourselves. We lead; let those who can follow. Letters or Telegrams promptly attended to.

N.B.—Parents, see your children’s teeth cared for by duly qualified practitioners who guarantee regulations and extractions painless.

FIGURE 5.2
Advertisement
Courtesy Newcastle Local History Library

Dentistry as an occupation met the needs of a growing middle class that favoured employment of a suitable status for its sons. Without regulations in place, the profession was open to competition from a number of quarters, including chemists (see Figures 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3). Fear of this competition became a driving factor for regulation and control, and was voiced as: ‘We are

---

6Newcastle Morning Herald 11 Aug. 1904, p. 3.
but 1100 strong. We say that we do not mind men coming in, but we do think that we do not want a whole influx of them at one time.  

Growing competition from technical colleges forced the university to assess its curriculum emphasis of an intellectual and liberal education, which had a non-vocational goal geared more towards the upper classes of England. The colony’s growing middle classes, driven by professional, commercial and industrial interests, were ideologically opposed to the general offerings at the university. Commercial origins most probably shaped the dental profession along the lines of small business, where the solo practitioner formed the model of practice. The drive to eliminate advertising by dentists was a major component of the shift of dental practice from trade to profession.

---

![Advertisement](image)

**HIGH CLASS DENTISTRY AT REFORM PRICES.**

**COMPLETE SETS,**
**UPPER & LOWER,**
from

£5 5s.

**SINGLE TOOTH,**
from

10s. 6d.

**STOPPING, SEALING & EXTRACTION CAREFULLY PERFORMED.**

**BLACKALL AND HUNT,**
**36 HUNTER STREET, NEWCASTLE.**

**FIGURE 5.3**

*Advertisement*  
*Courtesy Newcastle Local History Library*

---


Urban and Rural Systems Associates (URSA\textsuperscript{9}) have suggested that the very isolation of solo practice affected teaching practices, establishing an educational paradigm that has continued throughout the century. Tutors and lecturers, drawn from formal and informal networks within the profession, were essentially masculine.

Solo practices remain the predominant kind of dental practice in the 1990s. The 1992 figures for private practice in NSW show that 50.9\% of dentists were solo-practitioners, 10.7\% were in partnerships and 14.1\% were in associateships.\textsuperscript{10} This pattern however, is gendered because 45.9\% of men were solo-practitioners while only 23.0\% of women were solo-practitioners.\textsuperscript{11}

With the university expanding its curriculum beyond the liberal philosophy of the study of classics, the availability of the study of science evoked a crusading zeal. A changing, political, educational and social scene at the turn of the century energised the enthusiasm for further change. To enhance its image, the university pushed towards new directions that embraced the new scientific emphasis in education. The earlier educational direction of liberalism had been designed to meet the needs of the well-heeled ruling classes that in fact frequently sent their sons to England for their university education. The


\textsuperscript{11}ibid., p. 17.
university's impoverished circumstances were related to its lack of response to middle-class expectations, aspirations and values. An ideology and curriculum founded on liberalism did not cater to the needs of the growing middle classes desiring an education that would fulfil vocational and utilitarian goals.

A marriage of convenience between the dental profession and the university was realised. In a paper read to members of the Odontological Society of NSW, Smith reasoned that status and financial advantages were mutual benefits of training through a university. These benefits would ‘not only benefit and elevate many deserving members of our profession, but will greatly popularise and strengthen the University School numerically and financially’.\(^{12}\) The educational shift to the university found support in the press\(^{13}\) that praised the new expanded course of the Bachelor of Dental Surgery, in keeping with both English and American standards. Struggling to form a new identity, the dentists appropriated the medical profession’s model. The dental school actually began its existence under the umbrella of the Medical Faculty headed by Professor Anderson Stuart.

### 5.3 Organisational culture

The professionalisation process of dentistry at the turn of the twentieth century centred on the self-interests of a group of white Anglo heterosexual men who

---

\(^{12}\) Smith, op. cit., p. 333.

\(^{13}\) Sydney Morning Herald. 1905, 'The University of Sydney and the Dental Hospital of Sydney', in *Australian Journal of Dentistry*, vol. 9, no. 3, p. 77.
desired a sphere that guaranteed them economic and social security. To achieve these aims, these men harnessed scientific expertise as a power base and under this technological banner they admitted members of the same race, gender and class. Maintaining elitism through gender, class and race had implications for women seeking individual sites in a profession with a dominant masculine organisational culture. Zimmeck found similar outcomes in her analysis of the civil service in which male dominance prevailed by the continual movement of the goalposts.\textsuperscript{14} Poiner's research on academic staffing in universities concluded that even in the more feminised professions, the knowledge itself, which constituted the basis for professional practice, was in the control of men.\textsuperscript{15} In these circumstances, Poiner discovered that women were able and willing to pursue their activities in these areas without social contradiction so long as they did so informally or as an extension of womanly responsibilities.\textsuperscript{16} Dennerstein, too, in her study of women medical practitioners found that:

professionally active women were thus less likely to be in positions of policy making for the profession or even to have their views and needs expressed, heard and acted upon.\textsuperscript{17}

\textsuperscript{14}Zimmeck, M. 1987, 'We are all professionals now: Professionalisation, education and gender in the civil service 1873–1939', in Sommerfield, op. cit., pp. 66–83.


\textsuperscript{16}Ibid.

The containment of women in the dental profession was to spheres of comfortable femininity. These fulfilled nurturing ideology or the accomplishment kind of femininity, in contrast to strongly held beliefs that technological expertise was a masculine domain. During the twentieth century, economic and political factors that affected discriminatory practices influenced women's participation as dental practitioners.

A legacy of the 1890s depression years was a dramatic increase in the numbers of practising dentists. Comparative figures for 1891 show that when the NSW population was 1,132,234, dentists numbered 225.\(^{18}\) By 1901, with the population at 1,359,133, the number of dentists reached 597. In the city of Sydney, dentists were in a ratio of 1 dentist to 1469 people. The campaign for professionalisation had an urban genesis. Rural areas had less to gain. In their endeavour to raise the status of dentistry, the new professionals recognised the advantageous relationship between higher education and financial gain. Directional change was sought and initiated from the ranks of dentists who had overseas qualifications from institutions the locals sought to emulate.

The professionalisation process depended upon the unity of dentists. In 1903, E.K. Satchell, President of the Odontological Society of NSW, recognised this factor and argued that "if we are to become a power for good, it will be by that unity that is strength."\(^{19}\) This new band of professionals adopted altruism as

---

\(^{18}\) Satchell, E. K. 1903, "The advancement of dentistry in the state of NSW", *Australian Journal of Dentistry*, vol. 6, no. 8, p. 201.

\(^{19}\) Anon. 1903, "The Odontological Society of NSW", *Australian Journal of Dentistry*, vol. 6, no. 8, p. 203.
their campaign emblem for a new set of professional parameters. Altruism had a strong association with the clergy, and these dentists harnessed altruism to promote a favourable professional public image. Patronising comments about the provision of free dental care by private practitioners reflected middle-class values on poverty: ‘that poverty was the direct result of personal failings’.20 Drawing on the popularity of Darwinism, self-determination in gendered (masculine) terms underpinned the ideology of professionalisation.

Competing bodies within the profession vied to gain ground for their own agendas. Important players in the new image of dentistry were Fairfax Reading and W. Septimus Hinder. Hinder’s relationship with Praed remains obscure, yet we know that their paths crossed. Praed’s entry into the dental profession may have been assisted through William Twemlow or William Septimus Hinder. Henry Burton-Bradley was most likely responsible for Annie Praed’s connection with Hinder. Evidence of a relationship between the Hinders and Burton-Bradley is found on Burton-Bradley’s death certificate which states that Hinder’s brother Henry Vincent Critchley21 was the attending doctor.22 Joe Skinner claimed that Praed ‘commenced as assistant to late Dr Hinder’.23


21 NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index – pre 1900, 17 Aug. 1865, no. 16698, Wilberforce.

22 NSW Registrar of Births, Deaths & Marriages: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index – pre 1900, 22 Dec 1894, no. 3963, Burwood.

Hinder exemplified the ideal of a professional man. Educated at Sydney Grammar School and subsequently at Philadelphia Dental College for his Doctor of Dental Surgery, he was ideally situated to practise among the medical elite in Macquarie Street. He became one of the first lecturers in the dental school at Sydney University, President of the Dental Hospital and chairman of the Dental Board of NSW.\(^{24}\)

Distancing the practice of dentistry from the tarnished image of the trade-commerce-business world required a new perception of fees more in keeping with the medical model of 'professional decency' for 'confiding patients'. This concept implied by association the elevated stations of the medical profession and the clergy. The introduction of a consultation-based fee model advanced dentistry towards a professional model (like medicine) and away from the trade-commerce model.

An uneasy transition followed for the profession as it moved from the sphere of trade-commerce towards a professional sphere. Blackwell brought these ideas to the attention of his dental colleagues when he introduced the new concept for dental fees. He advocated a change from a service-commerce model to the consultation-medical one. Blackwell recognised the link between competition and fee rates. He therefore agreed on the necessity to control the numbers of dentists. However, he provided altruistic reasons. According to his argument the introduction of regulations was:

\(^{24}\) *Sydney Morning Herald* 25 July 1930, p. 7.
emphatically better for the public...so important a branch of hygiene as dentistry should be practised under some measure of control...because the public will be getting better work, the profession will be earning better fees than under the old scheme.\textsuperscript{25}

In the campaign to professionalise the practice of dentistry, the protagonists of the movement targeted the practice of advertising that implied an association with the lesser status of trade. Utilising legislation as a tool, these new professionals pushed to establish guidelines within the Dental Act that prohibited advertisements. Criticism of advertisements was delivered in altruistic terms: they were counter to the community's wellbeing. Ash's statement substantiates this argument about advertisements being:

"[they are] usually quite worthless, and always misleading and dangerous because they prevent sick persons from obtaining proper treatment at a time when treatment is still capable of doing good." That sentence contains in a nutshell a wealth of argument...not only in relation to medicine, but also dentistry, nursing, and every branch of the healing art.\textsuperscript{25}


\textsuperscript{26}Ash, P. 1915, 'Quack advertisements', \textit{Commonwealth Dental Review}, vol. 12, no. 1, Apr., p. 168.
Dentists of the new order defended their push for the introduction of standards by discrediting advertising as a practice of greed that exploited the ignorant and vulnerable in the community:

Those in impoverished circumstances...are often influenced by the alluring advertisements of quacks, and eventually forced to the hospitals for treatment of the injury inflicted on them. Only doctors, dentists and others whose business it is to attend the necessitous poor at the public charitable institutions can testify to the irreparable harm which in some instances has been brought about by imposters.\textsuperscript{27}

The lobby for professional regulation acquired the principles of altruism. They were quick to point out the benefits in these terms: 'A registered practitioner is not a quack, because his registration implies that he possesses sufficient knowledge and skill for the efficient practice of his profession'.\textsuperscript{28}

Thus altruism rather than self-interest became the central theme of the professionalisation process. However, a gendered image of expertise emerged as women were singled out as the evil impostors:

We hear of some unqualified women donning the uniform of trained nurses and palming themselves off on the unwary as competent. It is readily conceivable that they may visit people of humble estate, introduce medicines, offer advice and, relying on the uniform to inspire confidence,

\footnotesize\textsuperscript{27}ibid. pp. 166–67.

\footnotesize\textsuperscript{28}ibid. p. 166.
eventually gain admission and receive remuneration for services rendered. This form of charlatanism is as dangerous as the most specious statements in public print.\textsuperscript{29}

This is an example of covert discriminatory practice where women were assigned an image that was contrary to the ideals of the masculine concept of professional identity.

According to Holly-Smith, professional identity depended upon intangible assets, such as noble birth, broad culture and special training.\textsuperscript{30} Linking privilege with moral and social duty, he utilised the metaphor of sport to outline his ideals of the professional man:

Now, life is a game, which is earnestly played...In all sports I have learned to admire the Englishman, because I have invariably found him willing to take the knocks and applaud an honest victor, even though he is himself a loser.\textsuperscript{31}

Clearly he defined the professional as a white Anglo man of a social class that was on a par with his colleagues in medicine and the clergy. At the same time in the USA, a similar high calling for the office of dentistry was also being championed:

\textsuperscript{29}Ibid., 167.

\textsuperscript{30}Holly-Smith, B. 1913, 'Professional responsibility', \textit{Australian Journal of Dentistry}, vol. 17, no. 3, p. 92.

\textsuperscript{31}Ibid., p. 93.
God and Nature and Society are on the side of the dentist, and it is for the dentist to be worthy of the honours that are surely coming his way. And these honours mean increased responsibility.\textsuperscript{32}

In their quest for higher social status, dentists were quick to grasp an alliance with their already established medical colleagues. These dental practitioners sought to gain for their profession, by osmosis, some of the medical profession’s kudos. To achieve this goal required a reconstruction of the image of dentists as educators of noble integrity. By increasing the public’s awareness that dental health underpinned physical wellbeing, the dentist was reconstructed within the context of social moral responsibility:

\begin{quote}
We, as dentists, will have to bring this about. We must take up this part of the “white man’s burden” and carry the gospel of the value of the clean mouth to them.\textsuperscript{33}
\end{quote}

The emerging image for the ranks of the profession was one of educated men, rather than educated women. From Hubbard in the USA, comparable gender values are evident in his statement ‘I want every dentist not only to be a good dentist, but to be a big man as well’.\textsuperscript{34}


\textsuperscript{33}Holly-Smith, op. cit., p. 94.

\textsuperscript{34}Hubbard, loc. cit.
An organisational culture steeped in the values of the desirable image of professionalism was born out of the values of the middle-class men whose domestic spheres were the responsibility of wives, mothers, and sisters. According to Faust, 'industrial capitalism had produced the dependent female as a status object', one that the new professional man sought to acquire. The wife at home was given the task of 'organising their households with considerable dedication, allowing their husband to concentrate on furthering their career'. These men were able to run organisational professional bodies, either academic or political, because they were free of domestic responsibilities.

A professional class emerged where occupational spaces filled by white, Anglo men created an organisational masculine culture that left women dentists in undefined sites. In academic terms, women at Sydney University gained qualifications that were equal to those of their male colleagues. This was not the experience of American women at Radcliffe, Vassar, Smith or Bryn Mawr. Sydney University did not segregate or exclude women. However, while formal acceptance of women occurred in the dental school, the women experienced other gender barriers. The hierarchical and therefore masculine power base of the dental profession held control over gender boundaries.

---

Rodwell and other researchers have detailed the impact of eugenics influences on the development of Australian professional cultures over the early part of twentieth-century Australia. Rodwell cites Watts’ argument that:

These new professions sought to combat social problems by policies and preventive social intervention. By bringing science to bear on the problems of economic organisation, they moulded the private sphere of family and personal life in the interests of the broader ‘social good’.

The supremacy of science during this period created a masculine organisational culture in professions such as dentistry for the remainder of the century. Scientific knowledge in the hands of the new professionals was a form of control, masked by altruism. This paradigm of altruism formed around eugenics ideas. In dentistry the vehicle for these ideas was the prevention of oral diseases. By drawing attention to their educational role within the community, the profession rose to moral heights as health reformers and crusaders. Possession of this specialised knowledge and expertise transformed the profession into a monopoly. The new professions were eager to associate with and claim the importance and intellectual superiority of science. The following example captured these sentiments:

---


In the family of knowledges Science is the household drudge who in obscurity hides unrecognised perfections; to her has been committed all the work; by her skill, intelligence, and devotion have all conveniences and gratifications been obtained, and while ceaselessly ministering to the rest, she has been kept in the background that her haughty sisters may flaunt their fripperies in the eyes of the world. We are fast coming to the denouement, when the positions will be changed and while these haughty sisters sink into merited neglect, Science, proclaimed as highest alike in worth and beauty, will reign supreme.\(^{40}\)

Gender constructs of professionalism had separate meanings for men and women. On the one hand, men, in keeping with societal constructs of masculinity, shaped their professionalism in terms of paid work. Women, on the other hand, carved their professionalism out of societal femininity constructs of altruism and domesticity. Nurturing from the domestic sphere was transported to their professional role. Therefore the societal meanings attached to unpaid work that women of their class performed in the domestic and public sphere blurred their meanings of paid work. These beliefs transferred to their professional roles in the public forum and in their professional practice. Women dentists in private practices predominantly treated women, children and the disadvantaged members of the community.

Oral hygiene became bound to the concepts of health in complex and gendered ways. Men with expertise were there to advise women as mothers on the best

\(^{40}\)Smith, op. cit., p. 237.
means to prevent disease in themselves, their families and the community. Women, therefore, became the targets for the eugenics philosophies. Health, on a personal and community level, was the responsibility of virtuous middle-class women. In dentistry, public expertise was twofold. One aspect was claimed by the 'dentist' whose moral obligation was to instruct the public, primarily mothers, whose duty was defined in such moralistic terms as: 'What greater sin is there than that of disregarding the duty of looking after health?'

The other aspect of public expertise was assigned to the righteous middle-class women subjected to the doctrines of the eugenics philosophies. These women were conscripted into educating the young and the less privileged sectors of the community, in order to safeguard the future growth of a white population. Suffrage and conservative groups embraced these philosophies with varying degrees of agreement. Public space for women as educators was linked to women's moral duty. Women dentists, as a result of organisational and societal cultural values, were delegated this welfare site in the profession, at the cost of diminished recognition of their technological expertise. An example is sixth woman graduate, Dulce Skinner, who gave oral hygiene lectures to the Feminist Club, and was also a foundation member of the Dental Health Committee of the ADA (NSW Branch).

---

41 Goodall, A. 1914, 'Care of the teeth', Commonwealth Dental Review, vol. 11, no. 3, Apr., p. 246.


43 Anon. 1977, 'Honorary member Dr Dulce Barr', ADA (NSW Branch) Newsletter, Oct., p. 4.
In 1925, Skinner and her friend Hazel Crowe, a former classmate from Sydney Girls' High School, were appointed to the Out Patients Dental Clinic at the Royal Alexandra Hospital for Children. This marked the beginning of women dentists' movement into the public sector. In working with children, Crowe and Skinner were fulfilling the ideals of middle-class constructs of femininity and professionalism by their containment to the housekeeping sites of the profession. Praed, too, blended this philanthropic form of femininity into her professional identity. Her summary of the sixth International Dental Congress, which she attended in London, illustrates this point:

Three outstanding features of the intended proceedings struck me: (1) the prominence given to dental education; (2) the stress laid upon the need for treatment of school children; (3) the growing popularity of ionic medication.\(^4^4\)

This supports the argument that for women dentists, professional and societal constructs of masculinity and femininity informed and shaped their professional identity in complex ways.

The delivery of oral health education to the public became entangled in a gendered context. In keeping with the ideals of the eugenics philosophies, middle and upper class women were delegated the task of taking the oral health message to the public. Two groups of women emerged: women dentists

\(^{44}\)Praed, A. 1915, 'Sixth International Dental Congress' Commonwealth Dental Review, vol. 12, no. 5, May, p. 204.
and the wives of dentists. Informed by feminism at the turn of the century, these women framed themselves around the image of ‘woman as mate’. The wives of dentists interpreted these ideals as an extension of their husband’s professional responsibilities and appropriated the professional duties of dental public health education. A blurring of femininity and professionalism occurred in the area of dental education, as the wives of dentists joined women dentists in this role.

Constructs of professionalism along gendered models left women dentists in a tension between societal constructs of traditional femininity, feminist constructs of femininity and constructs of professionalism defined in masculine terms. Integrated into these constructs of masculinity and femininity were the meanings of scientific knowledge along gendered divisions. For men scientific knowledge meant expertise and power. For women, however, the application of scientific knowledge remained within the constraints of the eugenics philosophies that constructed femininities around motherhood. Women either privately or publicly became responsible for the health education of children, in order to fulfil white Anglo notions of national prosperity.

Educational qualifications of superior standard became the banner for the new professionals, who formed organisations to support and consolidate this collective image. One such organisation, the University of Sydney Dental Graduates' Association, struggled in its early days, due to a shortage of members, to create a new elite in opposition to the apprenticeship-trained

45 Morantz-Sanchez, op. cit., p. 263.
dentists. This association welcomed all Sydney University graduates, regardless of gender. However, its terms of reference reinforced the masculine image of the new professional dentist.

An example of this image gendered in exclusively masculine terms, was the 1908 President’s outlining of the Association’s aims as ‘our original tacit aim was to have as members all men graduates in the Dental course at the University of Sydney’.

He voiced the need for mentors to the younger members, to ensure a future homogeneous dental community. Vital to the new profession’s consolidation was the strength of unity and an allegiance to their alma mater. Praed was elected Honorary Treasurer for 1908-9 at the same meeting. Was her gender insignificant or invisible? What was her position in terms of professional identity along such arguments? Was the shortage of qualified men a significant factor in rendering her male for the convenience of having a hard-working and efficient treasurer?

This situation exemplifies the complexities of societal notions of femininity for middle-class professional white Anglo women who crossed existing societal boundaries to explore new gender territories. Professional identity was intrinsically masculine, and women dentists in interviews have expressed a

---

relationship with their male class peers akin to that of siblings. These women described their sexuality in the workplace as being either contained or silenced.

There has been a continuing debate over the many expressions of femininity. As recently as 1998, the Anglican Church in Australia was divided over the ordination of women. In 1872, the discussion focused on the education of women: the admission of women to the University of Melbourne. The arguments for women’s education and ordination share common themes. The Anglican Bishop of Melbourne, Charles Perry, in 1872 asserted that ‘single women’ were ‘exceptional and unnatural’ and that the rightful place for women in society was as wife and mother. He sanctioned the need to maintain separate spheres for men and women. Perry argued from a conservative and English-based ideology that claimed intellectual inquiry was beyond the scope of woman’s nature or ability.

Perry’s views were challenged in certain spheres. According to Theobald, two stereotypes of women emerged in the nineteenth century: the ‘bluestocking’ and the accomplished woman. A ‘bluestocking’, viewed as a hardened intellectual, was depicted as ‘plain, boyish in physique (she is usually depicted as angular, flat-chested and hirsute) and poorly groomed, an example of misplaced learning and knowledge.’ The more dominant voices at that time desired and demanded a femininity that subscribed to the accomplishment

---


48 Ibid.
ideal. This accomplished woman, whose virtue was to know her boundaries, did not need to venture into the masculine sphere and 'did not appropriate knowledge in order to enhance self-esteem, moral authority or economic independence'.

At that time it was generally accepted that women's education in the accomplishments was an accessory to their femininity: rather like hats and gloves to their dress. In contrast, education for men centred on the intellectual and vocational preparation necessary for the men's varied stations in the public arena.

Female form, in both social and biological terms, is enmeshed with a complexity of attached meanings. It has been argued by many researchers, Foucault and Grosz among them, that the 'external inscription' of the body, the 'internal structure of subjectivity', and the acquisition of 'appropriate cultural attitudes', are linked. They concur that what one 'is' becomes embodied. For women in male-dominated professions, their identity, in terms of biological and cultural femininity, narrowed their range of professionalism. They were located between a complexity of shifting professional and societal boundaries. As individuals they struggled to negotiate these complexities.

World War I changed the perception of dental health. Oral health status became a determining factor in military fitness. A raised government and public

---

48 ibid., p. 22.

50 ibid., p. 23.
awareness of the importance of dental health was a legacy of the war. Coupled with dietary change, particularly an increase in sugar consumption, there was a surge in demand for dental treatment. With the professionalisation process, the introduced regulations resulted in fewer dentists and this gave way to a less competitive environment for dentists. Under these conditions public need for dental services increased and labour force demands on the dental profession carved gender niches for dental services. Women dentists fulfilled some of this shortfall but they were generally assigned to the housekeeping realms of the profession. This argument is supported by the introduction of the concept of a new dental auxiliary, the dental hygienist in USA.

The concept of children’s dental health being moved directly from dentists, (primarily men) to hygienists attached gendered meanings of domesticity and eugenics to this aspect of dental practice. Children’s dentistry thereby took on meanings of a subordinate area within the profession. The presence of dental hygienists and therapists, even in conceptual form, gave further credence to this view. As dental hygienists and therapists were exclusively ‘young girls’, this resulted in a blurring of professional boundaries for women dentists. Women dentists became professionally contained in areas of children’s dentistry and dental hygiene. While upholding the superior societal tenets ascribed to feminine morality, women dentists were left in subordinate spheres within the professional hierarchy.
Archival evidence supports the above opinions. At a meeting of the NSW Dental Board in 1929, the minutes record the views of Dr Vickers, a visiting professor of oral hygiene from the University of Pennsylvania:

The authorities following the war, realised the necessity for the introduction of a system whereby the care of the teeth of children should be treated as a matter of prime importance. Some 8 years ago several leading universities established children’s departments and the success which attended their efforts had led a number of others to do likewise. Dentists, Universities, and Education Departments all felt the need for early dental treatment in children. Young women are specially trained for the general hygiene work amongst children in schools, but this latter class are not permitted in any circumstances to do any dental work – their activities being confined to hygiene...the Board should endeavour to definitely have it laid down that full registration will not be granted to dental hygienists who may be employed in NSW.\(^{51}\)

Further evidence of containment of a gendered kind is found in the eleven committee members of the ADA (NSW Branch). Only two women, Musgrave and Praed, served on the Dental Health Committee and only one woman, the Director of Dental Health Education, at any particular the time, sat on the executive (see Chapter 7).\(^{52}\) Praed’s expertise and interest in prosthetic

---

\(^{51}\)State Archives of NSW: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5159, Fair Minutes Books, vol. 6, Jan. 1929-May 1937, Minutes of meetings, 18 Nov. 1929, p. 47.

\(^{52}\)ADA (NSW Branch): ADA (NSW Branch); Minutes of meetings of the Executive Committee, Nov. 1939-Sep. 1941, Dec. 1940, pp. 116–17.
dentistry was not shared with the all male Prosthetic Study Club of the ADA (NSW Branch).

Women occupied professional sites within a social context of acceptable femininity during this period. Their type of practice can be analysed in gendered terms. Most commonly, they worked in family groups as extensions of female responsibility to the domestic sphere. When they operated as solo practitioners they were more likely to be in rural localities where there was a shortage of male dentists. In urban situations their patient base comprised mainly women, children and the less privileged members of society. Later, institutional forms of practice offered women sites in the welfare sector of dentistry. In academia they were part of the unpaid honorary body, or they stayed at the lower levels where they acted as assistants to men in the upper echelons, in keeping with societal notions of heterosexual social relations.

5.4 Centralisation

The centralisation of dental knowledge was organised through a number of avenues. Legislative measures introduced in 1896 set the course for a series of regulatory standards for dentists that informed the public qualifications. Over time the standards changed and evolved. Training shifted from apprenticeships to the university, and a regulatory body, the Dental Board, was installed. Unification of various bodies of dentists to form the ADA furthered the march towards professionalism. With the centralisation of knowledge to one institution,
one professional organisation, and the publication of a single dental journal, the professionalisation process was complete.

The passing of the *Dental Act of 1900* (NSW) was the cornerstone of legislative regulation. As the drive to change the practice of dentistry spread though the dental community, it fostered among many dentists a fear of loss of control. In this period of uncertainty, vying bodies seized the opportunity to establish private dental schools that ultimately foundered under financial burdens. When the two existing dental hospitals amalgamated in 1905 to form the United Dental Hospital of Sydney, Hinder was one of the six university appointments to the Board of 12. Both Reading and Hinder were founding members of the NSW Society of Dental Graduates: Reading as President and Hinder as Vice-President. With qualifications from overseas dental educational institutions, both men were ideally suited to lead the new vanguard of change. Reading voiced his confidence in his desired outcome for the profession:

> It is hoped by many interested in the advance of dentistry throughout the State, that the advent of the Dentists Act and the inauguration of the Department of Dentistry of the University of Sydney, has sounded the death knell of our out-of-date pupillage system, and it seems as if a brake was at last to be applied to the increase in the long roll of practising dentists in New South Wales.\(^53\)

---

The desire and pursuit for autonomy and the promise of concomitant financial and status benefits were cloaked within a context of professional ethics and altruism. As the newly founded dental profession struggled against opposing forces from the public and within the profession, it sought to consolidate an identity for itself. The ideal of a profession for gentleman set the tone, and these factions aligned themselves with an ideology grounded in the power of capitalism and the superiority of science.

Praed's role in the professionalisation process was a secondary one of support. However, she may have contributed in an informal way through her Lotaville connection with Randwick resident, Sir John See MLA, who was the first Premier of NSW (1901–1904) after Federation. Dental Board documents recorded correspondence to See, 'reminding him of the Amended Act, now before parliament...having his support'.

The centralisation and therefore control of the various spheres of the dental profession curtailed the number of practising dentists. This led to a less competitive environment and gave rise to an elite group who benefited financially and socially.

Although the concept of a national dental association was first mooted in 1906, the journey to the establishment of the ADA was not an easy one. Beginning in

---


1892, the structural organisation of dentists began with the formation of the shortlived and later resurrected Dental Association of NSW. In 1929, the ADA on a national level was realised with the amalgamation of the Dental Association of NSW and the Society of Dental Science. Praed's friend and classmate, Frank Marshall, was the inaugural President. An earlier body, the Odontological Society of NSW, formed in 1898, disbanded after a period of twenty years.\textsuperscript{56}

The final step in the centralisation of knowledge was the establishment of a single dental publication, the \textit{Dental Journal of Australia}, changing to the \textit{Australian Dental Journal} in 1956. Two earlier dental publications, \textit{Commonwealth Dental Review} (1903–1919) and the \textit{Dental Science Journal of Australia} (1920–1928) were absorbed during this process.\textsuperscript{57}

The strong academic push had succeeded in its quest for reform and control.

5.5 **Apprenticeship scheme**

Apprenticeship training, as in the teacher-pupil system\textsuperscript{58} of training, offered more opportunities to women in dentistry. The presence of twenty women on


\textsuperscript{57} ibid., pp. 137–174.

the 1901 Dental Register was indicative that this scheme provided women with the necessary training that did not require institutionalised tertiary education.

Further evidence for this argument is found in the 1920 figures from the USA: under the apprenticeship scheme 3% of dentists were women.\textsuperscript{59} Once dental education became institutionalised, the presence of women in the dental profession dropped to such low levels that even by 1970 it remained below 2%.\textsuperscript{60,61}

The credential shift in dental education affected women's entrance into the dental profession. The introduction of academic standards was most effective in precluding women from entering the profession through the university. Few girls' schools offered the science and mathematics subjects that were academically necessary to gain acceptance into the dental, medical and engineering schools. Women were further handicapped by societal and cultural beliefs that did not favour university education for girls except in a few elite circles. Apprenticeship training offered women a more accessible path into the profession.

Physics, a subject rarely offered in girls' schools, proved a major obstacle for many women. This occurred on two levels, psychological and structural. Firstly,


\textsuperscript{60}Kell, K. 1993, 'A measure of progress', \textit{New York State Dental Journal}, vol. 59, no. 8, p. 33.

\textsuperscript{61}Women's Action Program, Office of Special Concerns, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning & Evaluation, & Department of Health, Education & Welfare, op. cit. p. 22.
in societal terms, the study of physics was constructed in gendered terms. Physics, construed as a masculine discipline, was culturally unacceptable to Anglo societal notions of femininity. These beliefs psychologically handicapped women. Secondly, in structural terms, there existed an educational barrier. The absence of physics in the curriculum at girls’ schools disadvantaged women in educational terms: both at university entrance and in the first year of the dental course. Interviewees have described first year physics as an obstacle. Their male peers, in comparison, received preparation at secondary school and therefore did not experience the same degree of difficulty. Without this level of physics knowledge, the women students began university with fewer advantages than the men (see Chapters 4 and 6).

Economically and socially, the apprenticeship scheme had advantages for women, because it gave them flexibility in structural and societal terms. Under these arrangements the main pathway for women was an apprenticeship with family members. Indentures were more readily available because of the less stringent academic requirements. Another operative factor was the lower training cost under such a system compared with university fees. Expenditure on tertiary education for women was not welcomed either economically or socially. (See Table 5.1).
### Table 5.1

**Women dentists registered in New South Wales 1902 – 1935 under the apprenticeship scheme**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brady, Mary Loretta</td>
<td>Nov. 1934</td>
<td>278 Oxford St. Paddington.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwell, Hilda May</td>
<td>Nov. 1934</td>
<td>Lismore.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eagleden, Emma Ann</td>
<td>Apr. 1928</td>
<td>Lismore.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fieldhouse, Mrs Annie Adeline</td>
<td>Jan. 1918</td>
<td>Regent St. Redfern.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton,</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>Neutral Bay.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Ingles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Married name Vost Ganesin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamilton, Marion Cameron</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>Bennett St. Neutral Bay.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marion Emanie</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughes, Clara</td>
<td>Apr. 1901</td>
<td>Cameron St. Hamilton.</td>
<td>Apprenticeship with Frederick A. Hughes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughes, Emily</td>
<td>Sep. 1902</td>
<td>Cameron St. Hamilton.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughes, Mary Ann</td>
<td>Mar. 1901</td>
<td>Newcastle.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughes, Myra</td>
<td>Mar. 1901</td>
<td>Newcastle.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kennard, Violet Bertha</td>
<td>Dec. 1918</td>
<td>Cowra, &amp; later Homebush Cres.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kliner, Henrietta</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>Kempsey.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Augusta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loydtrom, Elsie Maud</td>
<td>Nov. 1934</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McMaugh, Mary</td>
<td>Nov. 1934</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theresa Elaine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathleen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nichols, Mrs Ellen</td>
<td>June 1917</td>
<td>Granville; Auburn.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pelletier, Eve</td>
<td>Sep. 1917</td>
<td>Molesworth St. Lismore; Wellington, NSW.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praed, Annie</td>
<td>Jan. 1901</td>
<td>King St.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Caroline</td>
<td>May 1901</td>
<td>Narrandera.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanderson, Eva Ethel</td>
<td>July 1922</td>
<td>9 Carlsbrook Flats, Manly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short, Lulla (Eleanor)</td>
<td>July 1917</td>
<td>426 Darling St. Balmain.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith, Amy Gertrude</td>
<td>June 1908</td>
<td>Perkerel St. Bondi.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomon, Eleanor Maud</td>
<td>Nov. 1901</td>
<td>Wellington, NSW.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stewart, Elsie Edith</td>
<td>Mar. 1917</td>
<td>Dunedoo.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swann, Isabella Frances</td>
<td>May. 1902</td>
<td>Harold St. Parramatta; Elizabeth Farm House;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Parramatta; King &amp; Elizabeth St. Sydney.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thorarensen, Agnes</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>62 Erskine St. Sydney.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thorarensen, Rebecca</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>62 Erskine St. Sydney.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caroline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Paddington.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age: 21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White, Mary Clarence</td>
<td>June 1906</td>
<td>Newcastle.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Williams, Anne H.</td>
<td>Feb. 1901</td>
<td>Quirindi.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nov. 1902</td>
<td>460 Oxford St. Paddington.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For men and women outside Sydney, an apprenticeship offered an easier access to the profession. The diversity of the geographical base opened opportunities across a range of practices in the larger populated non-metropolitan areas. This rural factor in the apprenticeship-based training favoured women as indicated by the number of women who practised in country areas, often with family members. Newcastle, a coastal industrial city in NSW, had a number of women dentists without tertiary qualifications. The most
prominent were Mrs A. J. Larkins, Isabella Longworth (nee Swann), Mrs Elsie Maude Madigan, and Myra, Clara Emily, and Mary Ann Hughes, the Hamiltons and Mabel Wells. In 1895 Miss Maggie Hamilton of Newcastle claimed the honour of being 'the only woman dentist in the Colonies' (see Figure 5.4).

![A CARD.]

Painless Dentistry.

MISS MAGGIE HAMILTON, DENTIST
(Associate of J. Dickson Hamilton, Newcastle), 19 Hunter-street, Sydney. The only Lady Dentist in the Colonies.

FIGURE 5.4
Advertisement for Miss Maggie Hamilton
Courtesy Newcastle Local History Library

The upper Hunter Valley was well served by indentured women dentists including Mrs Edith Stewart whose practice at "Narbethong", Dunedoo, gave a

---

64 ADA (NSW Branch): ADA (NSW Branch); Minutes of meetings of the Credentials Committee, Dec. 1937-May 1942, 9 Aug. 1939, p. 2.
66 Newcastle Morning Herald 9 May 1917, loc. cit.
68 Malland Weekly Mercury 29 June 1895, p. 2.
number of young women their first experience as dental graduates. Doreen Musgrave\textsuperscript{69} and Joan Groundwater\textsuperscript{70} were two such women graduates. Apprenticed in Yass, Mrs Edith Stewart moved to Dunedoo after marriage. There she set up a practice that she maintained for twenty-four years\textsuperscript{71} until illness forced retirement.

Claims by Romaniuk and Acton that Myra Mackenzie Rendel became ‘the first registered dental surgeon in this country’\textsuperscript{72} in 1903 are incorrect, as Praed registered as early as January 1901.\textsuperscript{73} Another Queenslander, Emma Ann Eagleden, who was registered on 10 May 1901,\textsuperscript{74} may have precedence over Mackenzie Rendel as Queensland’s first registered woman dentist.

Praed’s professional journey offers support for this argument that the apprenticeship scheme gave women more access to practise dentistry. Her attendance at university was possible due to her earlier qualifications, which gave her exemptions from practical classes and in turn freed her to work half-days in her dental practice. She was therefore able to earn the necessary

\textsuperscript{69}ADA (NSW Branch): ADA (NSW Branch); Minutes of the Credentials Committee, op. cit., 6 June 1938, p. 3.

\textsuperscript{70}Ibid., 9 Aug. 1939, p. 1.

\textsuperscript{71}Musgrave, D. 1988, ‘The history of the pioneering women in dentistry’, \textit{Appolonia}, vol. 5., no. 1, p. 58.


\textsuperscript{73}NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5166, Signature Book, no. 1, June 1901 – Feb. 1923, 1912, p. 11.

\textsuperscript{74}Ibid., p. 4.
income to finance her university fees. Praed’s educational expenses were met to some degree through Henry Burton-Bradley. Although Henry Burton-Bradley died in 1894\textsuperscript{75}, the trust fund\textsuperscript{76} he established continued until 1907\textsuperscript{77}. However the degree of assistance is not clear, as the size of his estate was ‘under £1037’.\textsuperscript{78}

5.6 Timing

The importance of timing is crucial to any understanding of Margaret Barnes’ and Annie Praed’s presence among the first group conferred the Bachelor of Dental Surgery. Their entry into the profession was due to a window of opportunity period in the professionalisation process. This period marked a transition for the dental profession. During this time dentistry moved from a trade-commerce-image to a profession that aimed towards and claimed the elevated status associated with scientific knowledge and technology. Increasingly the standard for professional qualification shifted to the university arena with the apprenticeship scheme obsolete by 1935. This shift, fashioned within a construct of masculinity, resulted in a white Anglo heterosexual masculine culture that few Anglo women would comfortably seek to enter before the late 1980s. The apprenticeship-based training worked in women’s

\textsuperscript{75} NSW Births, Dearth & Marriages Register: Index to the Register; Pioneer Index – pre 1889, 1894, 22 Dec., no. 3963.

\textsuperscript{76} Supreme Court of NSW: Probate Index; vol. A–C, series 4, 1880–1901, 21 Mar. 1895, no. 8643.

\textsuperscript{77} NSW Registrar General’s Office: Lands Titles Office; Deeds, 1907, Book 845, no. 303.

\textsuperscript{78} Supreme Court of NSW: Probate Index; vol. A–C, series 4, 1880–1901, 21 Mar. 1895, no. 8643.
favour: women did not reach levels of 30% in graduating classes at the University of Sydney until the 1980s.

Recruitment of women into the dental profession reflected manpower levels at different periods over the twentieth century. Shortage of men during wartime raised women’s presence in the dental profession. This was evident during World Wars I and II when there was an increase in women’s presence in dentistry. With World War I women’s increased presence occurred through apprenticeship credentials. In World War II, more women students entered the Faculty of Dentistry. The teaching profession also experienced recruitment rates as a social response. For example, the need to provide work for men during the Depression of the 1930s resulted in the introduction of a bar that excluded married women from teaching.

**DENTAL NOTICE.**

_____

**MRS. A. J. LARKIN,**

DENTIST,

HAS REMOVED FROM DENTAL ROOMS, OVER MICK SIMMONS', HUNTER-STREET, TO SURGERIES, HUNTER-STREET WEST, OPP. UNION-STREET.

'Theme, Newcastle 640.

**FIGURE 5.5**

*Advertisement*78

*Courtesy Newcastle Local History Library*

---

78*Newcastle Morning Herald & Miners' Advocate* 27 January 1930, p. 12.
With an insecure professional environment, fledgling dental organisations welcomed women to fill the empty ranks. Evidence from ADA records confirms this situation: a number of women applied for membership in 1904. Among them were Miss J. Brooks (Royal North Shore Hospital), Miss M. Hamilton (T&G Building, Elizabeth Street, Sydney), Mrs Vost Janssen (T&G Building, Elizabeth Street, Sydney) and Mrs A. J. Larkin (514 Old South Head Road, Bondi Junction).\textsuperscript{80}

Under these circumstances, gaining membership of professional bodies was not problematic for Barnes and Praed. This situation recurred during World War II when most male members were absent on war duties. Corr’s\textsuperscript{81} study of sexual politics in the teachers’ union in the UK suggests that women abstained from membership in professional bodies because of a complex interaction of factors. A significant factor was the women’s difficulty in overcoming the psychological barriers in a male-dominated organisation, because the men did not understand the concerns of its women members and the men’s self-interest was at the core of the organisation. After World War II when professionalism shifted again in favour of men, a number of women cited financial reasons for the cessation of their ADA membership. While women earned less than their male colleagues, there was no adjustment in membership fees.

\textsuperscript{80} ADA (NSW Branch): ADA (NSW Branch); Minutes of the meetings of the Executive Council, Nov. 1939 – Sep. 1941, July 1940, pp. 80–81.

Barnes' and Praed's activities in dental organisations mirrored the political climate of the dental profession and the nation. There is support for an argument that interdependency existed between the individual and the culture at both professional and societal levels (see Chapter 7).

5.7 Conclusion

The professionalisation process was essentially an establishment of control over knowledge. Structurally, this was achieved through the centralisation of educational and professional bodies. The formal establishment of a dental school, journal and professional organisation overtly empowered the profession in social, political and financial terms. Control of each sphere was in the hands of a few men. Informal social practices of the time, which excluded women's participation and furthered the 'boys network' within the profession, spawned a professional masculine culture that had far-reaching effects into the future. Exclusivity of this kind was effected through avenues such as sport (e.g. golf), social life (drinks at the pub), and recreational activities that barred women. The outcome from a professionalisation process of this kind set the stereotype as white Anglo heterosexual male. Women dentists therefore constructed their professional identity around ambivalent definitions of professionalism. Even in the 1990s, women found it difficult to gain acceptance in the dominantly masculine spheres of oral surgery and upper levels of academia.82,83 Women

dentists were contained within the housekeeping areas of dentistry such as paedodontia and public health. This construct of femininity, of the philanthropic and domestic form, changed within these spheres from unpaid to paid labour.

The professionalisation process of the dental profession at the turn of the century took place within the context of a quest by middle-class men to establish a public site with social authority and financial gain. Concomitant with this period of professionalisation was the origin and rise of the public service, the bestowal of power and civic subjectivities through democratic institutions, and the invention of quasi-public societies. All these formed the building blocks of middle-class masculinity in the public sphere.

Institutional centralisation spread across many groups of the Australian community. Other institutions became organised with common aims. Among these institutions were banking and the professions. Professionalisation at an organisational level evolved with the elimination of competition. Control over the number of dentists was achieved by the installation of standards for entrance, licensing and education. Centralised power, through the elimination or merging of a number of dental bodies, restricted the number of graduates, a measure that secured the profession for the elite few.

The economic climate of the late nineteenth century favoured a growth in the number of dental practitioners that increased competition and reduced incomes. Reorganisation was rationalised by the acquisition of the ideology and knowledge of the new scientific age. This resulted in a longer and more
expensive course that was available to the few who had the financial means. The drive for elitism gained momentum. The reforms resulted in the institutionalisation of dental education and secured the aims of professionalisation. As dentistry moved from an art form\textsuperscript{84} towards a scientific and therefore masculine base, it attracted fewer women. Social practices of femininity and the masculine professional culture of dentistry discouraged women psychologically. Instead, the majority of women of the privileged classes favoured careers in the more feminised professions of nursing and teaching. This trend is shown in the low number of women dentists who registered in New South Wales during the post World War I period (see Table 5.2), a time when the profession shifted towards a more dominantly masculine culture.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>REMARKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ann Porcheron</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathleen Somville</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Warren</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eva Ethel Sanderson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dulce Skinner, BDS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bessie Cassandra Woodruff</td>
<td>BDSc Melb. Uni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dagmar Sylow, BDS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elsie Elizabeth Wearn, BDS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inherently masculine in origin and therefore culture, the die for dentistry in Australia was cast in a masculine mould that continued well into the late

\textsuperscript{84}Lindsay, L. 1933, \textit{A Short History of Dentistry}, John Baie & Danielson, London, UK, p. 57.
twentieth century. The idea of dentistry as an almost exclusively masculine occupation for Anglo men came into being; this excluded Anglo women from entering the profession in any visible numbers until the 1980s. The cultural background of women is an important factor in the analysis of final year dental students. Particularly after the 1950s they were predominantly from European, Asian and Middle Eastern origins. The presence of these women reflected patterns of migration. In their countries of origin, dental professions were not primarily masculine and in many cases the opposite held true. It would seem that the construct of professionalism in gendered terms depended upon the cultural origin of the dentist. In Australia, the professionalisation process of dentistry was initiated by and for white Anglo heterosexual men. Smith’s statement supports this argument of exclusivity:

the present and future success of Dental School, looking forward, as we do, to it as the institution in which our sons and young men who fill our earthly places will be guided and trained.⁶⁵

The shortfall in available middle-class Anglo men facilitated Barnes’ and Praed’s entry into the profession. This was at a time when an organised body of men was on a quest to establish a profession with the social status and financial benefits of their medical colleagues. Their success was due to a ‘sustained propaganda campaign’.⁶⁶ Professionalism, redefined in terms of

⁶⁵Smith, op. cit., p. 329.
training standards and in 'a set of values and prescriptions for behaviour'\textsuperscript{87}, served the interests of men. Ultimately professionalisation brought about the establishment of a system of privilege that was male-based. For Barnes and Praed the commencement of the institutionalisation of dental education proved an opportune time for entry, before the definitions for professionals became too set.

\textsuperscript{87}Morantz-Sanchez, op. cit., p. 29.
CHAPTER 6

UNIVERSITY YEARS

6.1 Introduction

Barnes' and Praed's presence in the inaugural course for Sydney University's Bachelor of Dental Surgery was to a large degree a function of timing. It was at this time that dental education was being structurally organised. The centralisation of dental knowledge signalled the process of professionalism that transformed the practice of dentistry from a trade-based occupation towards the new age of professionalism.

Having qualified for the Licentiate in Dental Surgery – Praed in 1904 and Barnes in 1905\(^1\) – both were eligible for the newly introduced Bachelor of Dental Surgery. The establishment of this degree was another step towards university credentials as the standard for the right to practise dentistry. As a qualification, the Licentiate in Dental Surgery had a short existence. In 1901 Praed enrolled in the inaugural year of the Licentiate in Dental Surgery course, and Barnes followed in 1902. Thus Barnes and Praed shared only one year at university, when in 1905 the hard-fought-for Bachelor of Dental Surgery degree was installed.

\(^1\)Sydney Morning Herald 9 May 1905, p. 6.
How did the men in their class and on staff respond to the presence of two women as members of the two earliest groups to enter university courses in dental education? How did the women negotiate the complexities of societal femininity with the interaction of a professionalism grounded in masculinity? How did Barnes' and Praed's university experiences differ from these of women dentists who graduated decades later?

Structural barriers to women's entry or participation in the dental school did not exist, and in comparison to the pioneer women of medicine and law, Barnes' and Praed's passage through their dental course would seem to have been relatively free of gender obstacles. However, just as 'social conventions...operated in both subtle and not so subtle ways to hinder their public life,' women in dentistry were confronted by meanings of identity across a spectrum of notions of femininities and professionalism. The ways in which Barnes and Praed negotiated contesting meanings of femininities and professionalism during their university days are explored in this chapter. Other women graduates' experiences are utilised to explore the link between the personal and the political.

The political element is drawn from the structural and cultural contexts of the university, the dental school and society. Gender underpinned the personal aspect of the way women in male-dominated professions construct notions of professionalism. With the professional gauge set in the masculine, women's

---

identity floated between contesting notions of femininity and professionalism as they negotiated the move toward the standard. The focus is on their presence as women, their experience of science, and the impact of role models and mentors. Once again, an historical perspective probes the significant factors that affected Barnes and Praed at university.

FIGURE 6.1
Madge Barnes, c.1904
Courtesy Virginia Hind
Barnes entered university immediately after matriculating in 1902 at the age of twenty-one. For Praed, the route to the Bachelor of Dental Surgery was more circuitous: the Senior in 1892\(^3\), matriculation in 1895\(^4\), and entry into the dental school in 1901, at the age of twenty-nine. Having gained her qualifications through an apprenticeship in dentistry, she was granted exemptions from the practical component of the course. As lectures were scheduled for mornings, Praed was free to continue afternoon clinical sessions at her practice at Otis Chambers, King Street, to finance her university expenses. (See Figure 6.2) Although Henry Burton-Bradley had established a trust for her education, there is little evidence to suggest that it met the costs of her university education.

![Otis Chambers, King Street, Sydney](image)

**FIGURE 6.2**
**Otis Chambers, King Street, Sydney**
*Courtesy City of Sydney Archives*

---

\(^3\) University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/58/4, Examination Register – Public 1894–1899, Senior, 1892, no. 2627.

\(^4\) *University of Sydney Calendar 1895*, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 108.
6.2 University models

Divisive gender practices in teaching did not exist when Barnes and Praed attended the dental school. The University of Sydney did not admit women on the separatist model of Cambridge and Oxford, but established what appeared to be a gender equitable curriculum and qualifying standard. For women, separatist and coeducational models of educational institutions presented a complexity of advantages and disadvantages.

Qualifications, for example, from women's establishments were considered sub-standard. Howarth and Curthoys have pointed out that 'professional women were always clear that separate women's examinations would inevitably be regarded as inferior in standard'.

However, open hostility was the coeducational institutional experience of women medical students in the USA. Therefore, separatist women medical schools offered certain advantages:


6ibid p. 5.


[the] psychological importance of separate female organisations, to the persistence of both overt and more subtle forms of discrimination, or to the continued ambivalence of women physicians about their relationship to the male medical world.\textsuperscript{9}

According to Morantz-Sanchez:

Female faculty served as role models, and the significance to younger women of such exposure should not be minimised. Furthermore, the atmosphere appears to have been rigorous and supportive.\textsuperscript{10}

It would seem that discrimination against women at coeducational university level was not just the prerogative of the pioneering generation of women. Even thirty years after the admission of women into the medical faculty in France in 1900, women 'were given honours grudgingly if at all, women interns were rare and women were virtually unknown in prestigious specialisations'.\textsuperscript{11}

Standardisation of qualifications would seem to offer equal opportunities to men and women, but such a simplistic interpretation excludes the invisible and visible factors that shaped constructs of femininity and masculinity. These in turn defined professional identity with gendered differences. However,

\textsuperscript{9}ibid., p. 159.

\textsuperscript{10}Howarth, op. cit., p. 5.

\textsuperscript{11}Morantz-Sanchez, op. cit., p. 111.

credentials gained from separate gendered institutions excluded women's participation in spheres where masculinity defined the standard. Sydney University did not follow the separatist gender practices of some universities, which excluded women's right to freedom of choice. The latter type of university contained women in specific sections where their qualifications limited their career outcomes to the more feminine and domesticated spheres of the workforce that attracted lower financial rewards.

Sydney University did not generate the same faculty gender divisions as Berkeley,¹² where women undergraduates were contained within the department of home economics when their increased numbers at the university were perceived as threatening. This move further diminished women's opportunity to professional careers and limited their aspirations to the domestic economy as future wives and mothers.

However, this was not the situation for Barnes and Praed, and, in the final analysis, timing was the most significant factor. Available women dentists as role models were absent in a university context. Therefore their identity centred more on the theme of pioneering women at a university level. As pioneer women graduates in dentistry, Barnes and Praed were served by the role models of the women dentists who had qualified through the apprenticeship scheme. Indeed, Praed was already a practising dentist when she entered university and her identity as a dentist continued to consolidate in this direction.

reaching the elevated heights of the ‘famous lady dentist’ in her later life. The presence of women dentists in visible numbers at the turn of the twentieth century was to a significant degree advantageous to Barnes and Praed, compared to the number of women who entered the law and medical professions.

In one sense, new barriers did not need to be crossed, since apprenticeship training already offered accessibility for women, especially in non-urban areas. For many women access to dental qualifications was facilitated by family connections: in Newcastle, the Misses Hamilton, Misses Hughes and Mabel Wells are some interesting examples. Indeed Maggie Hamilton in 1895 claimed the honour of being ‘the only Lady Dentist in the Colonies’. The Misses Hamilton who practised at the corner of Hunter and Newcomen Streets, came ‘from Sydney each week’. Mrs Larkins practised with her husband at Hunter Street West, and later by herself at the corner of Gordon and Tudor Streets, Hamilton. The Misses Hughes (Myra, Clara, Mary Ann and Emily) were in Beaumont Street, Hamilton, Isabella Longworth (nee Swann) at Mayfield; and

---


14 Newcastle Morning Herald 9 Sep. 1917, p. 6.

15 Ibid.

16 Maitland Weekly Mercury 29 June 1895, p. 2.


19 Ibid.

Mabel Wells, a relative of the Wells Brothers, established the Dental Hospital in Bolton Street. Although not achieving parity with their male colleagues, the women were nevertheless a visible presence in the dental profession through this avenue. However, their role modelling was contained within the domestic sphere of the profession, as the majority practised in family groups. Researchers have concurred that women's career outcomes are essentially linked to 'the powerful gender-structured pattern of social relations spanning many social institutions, including the family, the school and the workplace'.

This concept that work is internalised in gendered terms is relevant in understanding women's location in the spheres of dentistry that are perceived to be domestically connected.

6.3 Dental school

The struggle to establish an embryonic dental school facility was smoothed by securing its place under the auspices of the Medical Faculty. This step was not only economically advantageous, it also aimed to secure the status factor. This arrangement continued until 1920, when the dental school transformed into an

---

21Ibid.


autonomous body, the Faculty of Dentistry. These were humble beginnings for a body that faced a substantially larger opposition that supported an apprenticeship-based dental education. The diversity in qualification standards among dentists at the turn of the century and the competitive size of that group engendered a certain amount of distrust. The climate was favourable for a push towards university-based dental education.

The earlier regulatory step of the Dental Act in 1900 and the installation of the Dental Board\textsuperscript{25} set the stage for a subsequent series of initiatives towards the centralisation and control of dental education. Transformation to new ideals however, was not easy, and the majority of dentists qualified under the old order for nearly three decades of the twentieth century. This transitional stage continued until 1934. With the passing of the Dental Act in August of that year, the overlapping agreements between the Dental Board and the University of Sydney ceased. A new era of dental education had finally arrived with university credentials becoming the gold standard.\textsuperscript{26}

Division among the dental practitioners at the turn of the century was heated, with organised groups vying for power. A competitive atmosphere of a commercial nature emerged among the dental profession as different bodies established a number of dental hospitals with an educational arm.

\textsuperscript{25}ibid. pp. 340–50. 

\textsuperscript{26}ibid., p. 558.
Budgetary limitations dictated the dental course curriculum requirements. Members of the Faculty of Medicine catered for subjects that were not specific to dentistry. Therefore, only a handful of dental lecturers were needed for the subjects specifically for dentistry. The six academic appointments to the dental school were cut from the same cloth: with the exception of R. Fairfax Reading, who had an English Licentiate in Dental Surgery, all had been awarded their Doctor of Dental Surgery qualifications from Philadelphia.\textsuperscript{27}

Locality instability hindered the security of the new dental school. The university dental school began with a sojourn at Selbourne Chambers for the Lenten term in 1901 before an agreement was reached with Sydney Hospital that transferred the dental outpatients department to the new establishment. The University Hospital, which officially opened in January 1902, had modest beginnings: two rented rooms at the corner of George and Bridge Streets in September 1901. Lacking support from the honorary medical staff at Sydney Hospital, the efforts of the Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Professor Anderson Stuart to establish a dental school within the hospital failed.\textsuperscript{28}

Altruism and rivalry produced a second dental school, the Dental Hospital of Sydney, which was founded in Elizabeth Street to meet dental educational needs and provide dental care to the poor. High costs destabilised the institution and its amalgamation with the University was formalised under the

\textsuperscript{27}ibid., p. 354.

\textsuperscript{28}ibid., pp. 350–51.
legislative apparatus of the *Dental Hospital Union Act* in December 1901.\(^{29}\) Once again the university dental school, renamed the United Dental Hospital, faced further relocations: from the corner of George and Bathurst Streets\(^{30}\) to Chalmers Street in 1912, where stability was finally achieved with the building of a new hospital.\(^{31}\)

This transitional period was marked by organisational and academic vicissitudes that left the hospital vulnerable to attack by the dissenting members of the dental profession and the public. However, without entrenched practices, the environment was also ripe to raise challenges, which occurred in 1903, when the student body petitioned the Senate to upgrade the dental qualifications from the newly installed Licentiate in Dental Surgery to meet the standard set by the University of Birmingham. In this action the academic staff and dentists in the profession who were sympathetic to these ideals supported the students. Further impetus came from the old rivalry from the south, as Melbourne University had introduced the equivalent degree. Physical and cultural instability was the order of the day for Barnes' and Praed's years at university.\(^{32}\) However, this environment had certain factors favourable to women.

\(^{29}\)ibid., p. 352.

\(^{30}\)ibid., p. 353.

\(^{31}\)ibid., p. 354.

\(^{32}\)ibid., p. 355.
6.4 Pioneer women

Sydney University's Chancellor, Sir William Manning, was receptive to the concept of higher education for women; compared with the situation in Melbourne this facilitated the admission of women to the university. However, the acceptance of more women across all faculties was not entirely egalitarian, as the women in medicine and law discovered. By the time Barnes and Praed entered the new faculty the doors had already been opened to pioneer women in many faculties (Table 6.1).

Table 6.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Woman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BA</td>
<td>1883 Melb.</td>
<td>Bella Guerin (Mrs B. Lavender)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1885 Melb.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSc</td>
<td>1888 Syd.</td>
<td>Miss Fanny Hunt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MB</td>
<td>1891 Melb.</td>
<td>Drs Clara Stone# &amp; Margaret Whyte#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1891 Adel</td>
<td>Dr Laura M. Fowler (Fowler-Hope)#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch B</td>
<td>1892 Melb.</td>
<td>Dr Clara Stone, M.B.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mus B</td>
<td>1896 Melb.</td>
<td>Miss Mona McBurney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLB.</td>
<td>1902 Syd.</td>
<td>Miss A.E. Evans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSc</td>
<td>1904 Melb.</td>
<td>Miss Georgina Sweet*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>1906 Syd.</td>
<td>Misses Margaret Barnes &amp; Annie Praed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEc</td>
<td>1914 Syd.</td>
<td>Miss Edith M. Swain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAgSc</td>
<td>1918 Melb.</td>
<td>Miss I.M. Lowe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BArch</td>
<td>1922 Syd.</td>
<td>Misses L. Lukin &amp; E. Nosworthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BComm</td>
<td>1928 Melb.</td>
<td>Misses H. Amies, Eileen O'Reilly &amp; Alison O'Brien</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BVSc</td>
<td>1935 Syd.</td>
<td>Miss P. Littlejohn</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# These were the first three women to graduate in Medicine in Australia.
*BSc Melb. 1898; In 1920 appointed Associate Professor in Zoology (Melb. Univ); in 1927 appointed Hon. Lecturer in Parasitology in Vet. Science Dept. (Melb.). Tasmanian's first woman graduate was Miss Eliza Wilson, BA Melb. 1896, MA Melb. 1905. NSW's first two women to graduate in medicine were Drs Iza Coghlan & Grace Robinson, Sydney 1893.

---

Barnes' and Praed's admittance into the course in dentistry at this time was facilitated by the entrance requirements. With the introduction of the new Bachelor degree, credentials were 'made identical with the entrance to medicine, science and engineering'. This shift disadvantaged women, as few girls' schools offered the necessary curriculum to achieve the new standard.

Financially the costs of the course were not within the range of most: in 1905 the total cost including graduation was 146 pounds 19 shillings and 6 pence. Part-time attendance, with exemptions from practical classes, allowed Praed to continue working in her own practice and she was therefore able to meet her educational expenses. The high cost of university education put it beyond the scope of many women because of cultural attitudes and financial factors.

Barnes and Praed were relatively isolated from women in other faculties because the Dental Hospital was located at a considerable distance from the main campus of the university. It was unlikely that they spent much time with other women undergraduates in the women's common room on the University grounds. This especially was the situation in their final years when clinical requirements were demanding, and particularly for Praed who had her own dental practice commitments.

As with the pioneer women of medicine, residency requirements were not prerequisites to establishing a solo private practice, the most common career

35 University of Sydney Calendar 1905, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 206.
path for the early university women graduates with medical and dental qualifications. In 1905, Barnes and Praed benefited in a psychosocial dimension when Jessie Aspinall, a women doctor, won with public and faculty support the right to hospital residency in Sydney.\textsuperscript{36} As a former pupil of Riviere College, Aspinall’s victory most probably was inspirational to Barnes.\textsuperscript{37} Hospital residency, however, was not an issue at that time for Barnes and Praed, as specialising and hospital appointments had not attained any importance within the dental profession at this evolutionary stage.

Barnes and Praed did not encounter the overt discriminatory practice from the academic and honorary staff, in the manner that Ada Evans suffered throughout her days at the Law School. Professional obstacles continued until 1921 when Evans was finally admitted to the Bar in NSW. The long battle for recognition, and family and health demands prevented her from practising.\textsuperscript{38}

Marie Beuzeville Byles became the first woman to practise law in NSW. Her classmate, Sibyl Gibbs, was admitted to the bar in the year of her graduation in 1924. Both women had faced open opposition from peers and academic staff, according to Bygott’s summary:

---


\textsuperscript{37}Telephone conversation with Scots College Archivist, Denise Levoss, 9 Mar. 1998.

\textsuperscript{38}Bygott & Cable, op. cit., p. 43.
The male students, mostly ex-servicemen, disrupted their classes by catcalls and foot-stamping. The staff were often critical: 'Well, she does wather cwamp my style', lisped a lecturer of Marie Byles. The facilities were deplorable: 'not even a peg to hang their hats, let alone space to powder their noses'. But persistence won through. Both women graduated in 1924.\textsuperscript{39}

However, Barnes' and Praed's presence as women among a group of male students and teachers had implications that merit attention.

6.5 \hspace{1em} A gendered presence

Unlike the pioneer women medical and law graduates, Barnes and Praed did not experience overt discrimination from their male peers. Probably this was a result of the recruitment drive for participants for the dental course in its infancy. They were therefore viewed more favourably in relative terms than apprentice-trained dentists. Of course, the perception remained that women practised primarily within the extended domestic economy of family practice.

However, covert discriminatory practices may have been experienced by early Melbourne women medical graduates, who recalled that while staff and students were courteous, it was only at the graduation ceremony where all the scholarships were won by Margaret Whyte that the attitudes towards women became obvious. Dr Clara Stone described it as:

\textsuperscript{39}ibid.
The men were absolutely furious and were then extremely rude to both of us: to Margaret, because she had won the coveted awards; and to me, because I'd gone straight through too: their attitude in general was that if we girls hadn't forced our way in the men would have won the scholarships and some of them never forgave either of us.\textsuperscript{40}

Two women were among the seventeen enrolled in the foundation class of the Licenti ate in Dental Surgery in 1901:\textsuperscript{41} Annie Praed and Beatrice Genevieve G. Larkins. Larkins, while commencing with Praed in 1901\textsuperscript{42} and present again in Barnes' first year, did not complete the course. Little information has surfaced about Larkins: she may have been connected to the Larkins who were dentists, either Augustus\textsuperscript{43} of Cooks Hill, Newcastle or George Nicholas of North Sydney.\textsuperscript{44}

Academically, Praed excelled at university and was dux in 1905, her final year of the Bachelor of Dental Surgery course. In 1901, her first year at university, Praed was one of six to pass the final examinations without posts. Among the four who failed to continue onto second year was Beatrice Larkins.\textsuperscript{45} As with the experience of women who later entered the dental school at the University of Sydney, physics and chemistry subjects may have proven too difficult for her.

\textsuperscript{40}Hutton Neve, op. cit., p. 30.

\textsuperscript{41}University of Sydney Calendar 1901, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 310.

\textsuperscript{42}Ibid., p. 298.

\textsuperscript{43}NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5169, Rough Register of Dentists, 1902–1924, 1902, p. 8, no. 103.

\textsuperscript{44}Ibid., 1924, p. 8, no. 844.

\textsuperscript{45}University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; G.3/1356, Examination Register, 1900–1905, 1\textsuperscript{st} year examination, School of Dentistry, 1901, p. 57.
Table 6.2

Total numbers in each year that Barnes and Praed attended Sydney University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1st</th>
<th>2nd</th>
<th>3rd</th>
<th>4th</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Year*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praed</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barnes</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The fourth year figure is not valid, as it constituted two Licentiate in Dental Surgery (L.D.S.) groups.

Praed’s and Barnes’ ability to complete the course was remarkable considering the attrition rate between first, second and third years (Table 6.2). Timing was the key factor that differentiated between their experience and that of pioneer women graduates in other professions, particularly medicine and law. Barnes and Praed enrolled when there was low availability of male students, at a time when the course was struggling for professional acceptance. However, undercurrents of disapproval can be noted in the emphasis of difference when Praed presented her paper at the First Australian Dental Congress in 1907:

> And a woman, mind you! As Miss Praed’s office is in the same building as mine, I can testify to the perseverance which she has displayed in this matter. To my mind it has equalled that of the pioneers of the profession to whom I referred in my paper.

Another example of contradictory and patronising comments were:

---

46Praed, A. 1907, ‘How to make an electric furnace at home’, Proceedings of the 1st Australian Dental Congress, ADA (NSW Branch), Sydney, p. 165.
I add my congratulations to Miss Praed. Electricity is a hobby of mine. It is very pleasing to know that we have a lady amongst us able to give us such complete and accurate information. Miss Praed has proved the fallacy of the popular notion that ladies have no mechanical turn of mind.47

Whilst Praed was being valorised for her scientific knowledge a distinct emphasis is placed on her gender. She was being reminded of her difference in relation to other women and to the dominant members of the profession, the men. In being unlike the majority of women she was therefore not fulfilling more acceptable societal notions of femininity.

The statement of one of her class peers, Hardie, suggests a very different attitude:

On behalf of the Sydney graduates, I congratulate Miss Praed on her having taken in hand such a difficult subject, and with such definite and satisfactory results.48

Such comments document various positions on professionalism. Hardie’s remarks illustrate that Barnes’ and Praed’s class peers accepted them. As this was directly related to the significant timing factor for the professionalisation process, their presence was a function of the needs of the professional men.

47ibid., p. 166.
48ibid., p. 167.
An insecure minority, in seeking to forge a new professional identity against the mainstream, displayed a strong sense of loyalty to its members. In Hardie’s statement, his extolling of the virtues of the new university credentials was self-serving: for he was supporting this new band of professionalism of which he was a member. As Praed was also member of the struggling group he was defending this identity, ignoring any notion of femininity. Women were caught in the crossfire between new and old professionalism, leaving them in an ambiguous site: as women in a predominantly masculine profession but also as a valued member of a fledgling professional group.

Femininity and professionalism were complex issues for these pioneer women. They were faced with the complex societal expressions of femininity associated with their class; traditional views constructed femininity depicting women as the weaker sex, physically and intellectually, yet superior morally. Eugenics favoured healthy physical development for women as preparation to their educational role as citizen mothers. Feminism, however, was giving way to new constructs of femininity along egalitarian principles that proposed individual fulfilment in work and with relationships with men. In the professional sphere constructs of femininity were often aired, and contrasted with constructs of professionalism that were formed around masculinity.

Barnes experienced plurality of meanings on her arrival at the university. Her comment that ‘I could give you many instances to show you that in those early
days, women were not resented, but welcomed!\textsuperscript{49} implying the acceptance of
women in the newly established faculty, reinforces the argument that when
male recruits to the Faculty were low, women were encouraged:

Barnes described her presence, one of two women in a class of twenty-one, as:

\begin{quote}
From fellow students I had a warm welcome, a "protecting" care &
unfailing help throughout the 4 year course — so unfailing that the boys
were warned by the Director to refrain from giving me too much help!\textsuperscript{50}
\end{quote}

This is an example of contesting femininities: on one hand Barnes’ relationship
to her peers fulfilled acceptable notions of societal femininity where women
were regarded as the weaker sex, and on the other hand Barnes was facing
meanings of professionalism within a masculine organisation culture. In this
instance the ‘Director’ synthesises metaphorically the masculinity and
patriarchal authority of the dental profession and societal paternalism. It is
telling that the only surviving photograph of these early dental students in the
laboratory has Madge Barnes’ caption, ‘Learning to be a dentist & why am I not
present? Because I took the photo.’ (See Figure 6.3).

\textsuperscript{50}ibid.
Women's presence was in terms of male subjectivity. As women aspired to achieve the benchmark, the masculine, they were caught between negotiations around societal meanings of femininity and professional masculinity. These negotiations become obvious in Barnes' recollection of her first encounter of tooth extraction:

These extractions were without anaesthetics (that came later) so you can imagine the cries of the victims. I stood watching in a daze & then I found myself in the spare cubicle with my head being held down to the floor. That day I came to a mighty decision. I went to our Dean & told him firmly I had decided that when I started private practice I would not do extraction but would pass them on to others. I can still hear his laconic reply – "Miss Barnes, you will go into the extraction room for ½ hour every day, until you can undertake the work yourself". He probably smiled
sweetly at me to soften the blow, but I was far too cast down to notice if
he did! Later on – much later I expected I broke the record one afternoon.
How right he was!\textsuperscript{51}

This passage captures succinctly the fluid dynamics of femininity and
masculinity that encircled Barnes. One could argue that patriarchal authority
won the day but in a form of masculinity grounded in professionalism.

Barnes and Praed, it would seem, did not encounter overt discrimination during
their university studies, but subtle obstacles existed. Without role models in the
academic dental sphere, professional identity for Barnes and Praed was
shaped around mixed messages from professional constructs of masculinity,
societal constructs of femininity and feminist constructs of pioneering femininity.
Researchers have demonstrated that there is a psychological effect in male-
dominated educational institutions, where women without role models are
inhibited in their career aspirations.\textsuperscript{52} Some women dentists have indicated in
interviews that they felt they had to justify their presence and this was often
internalised. Lucas has argued that:

\textsuperscript{51}\textit{ibid.}
\textsuperscript{52}Morantz-Sanchez, op. cit., p. 269.
in psychological terms, the establishment of a fixed and dominant subjectivity inevitably involves, and indeed relies on, the formation — and immediate denial — of a suppressed and subjugated otherness.\textsuperscript{53}

Overcompensation or overachievement is a means by which women compensate for their otherness. Musgrave voiced this in her experience:

\begin{quote}
It was a bit of a battle you had to work very hard. You couldn’t slacken off and you not only had to be as good as men you had to be a bit better to be accepted. Otherwise there was a bit of a stigma.\textsuperscript{54}
\end{quote}

The demands of the dental course were emotionally and physically taxing. As a student Musgrave often worked at the Dental Hospital until 11.00 p.m. to complete work.

Patison’s comments from a societal and professional perspective support the argument that when women cross boundaries perceived to be set as exclusively masculine, they are confronted by societal disapproval. Reflecting on her graduation she said:

\begin{quote}
I was pleased for my family’s sake. My parents had got quite a bit of flak from people. ‘Why are you wasting money putting a girl through something that’s really a man’s thing’...I know quite a lot of people said
\end{quote}


that...I feel that (graduation) justified their (parents') faith that it wasn't a wasted four years.\textsuperscript{55}

Justification of their presence, because as women they stood in opposition to the benchmark, the man, was a recurring theme among interviewees. Patison too felt that she was constantly defending her presence:

I definitely think that goes with you all the way through. Well it was with me...I felt I had to justify...being there...there were certain students...particularly in first year that were pretty unpleasant about any woman being in the faculty let alone in first year and he was always ready to be upsetting about what he said... 'What are you doing here, we don't want any bloody women in this course'...I felt like going and howling my eyes out...that gave me the feeling that everybody felt that way...it made me more determined to justify why I was there...battling with physics and chemistry which I had never done...I was fairly apprehensive.\textsuperscript{56}

Researchers have reported psychological and social exclusionary tactics to women by their male peers:

Successful performance by females, particularly in 'masculine' and demanding situations is perceived as a freak phenomenon due to not their real abilities but to other unstable or external factors. They make the comment on the basis of research which demonstrates that a woman who behaves in a competent manner disconforms sex role expectations,


\textsuperscript{56}Ibid.
and is disliked or excluded from the group...or performance is discounted and attributed to chance.\(^\text{57}\)

Early women graduates have described their presence as a woman as being in opposition to the standard, the man. They were left with an internalised drive to justify their presence, yet at the same time dismissing any thought of discrimination. According to Allen, women scientists have voiced similar feelings:

she felt that 'women had to be better than men' to be offered appointment and that she had to prove herself at the beginning of her university career in a way that was not necessary for a man, she never felt discriminated against.\(^\text{58}\)

Interviewees from the Women in Dentistry project have made similar pronouncements. Even though Musgrave graduated with second class honours she placed her dental skills in the context of her social skills as opposed to her technical expertise when she claimed that 'the practice was just my personality. I wasn't an outstanding technician. I was good but never the best but I certainly wasn't bad'.\(^\text{59}\)


Musgrave's evaluation of her competency as a dentist was 'It was just the way I dealt with people. Communication more than anything. I'm a good dentist. Average dentist but I can communicate'. These statements suggest that Musgrave focused more on the relating aspects assigned to femininity, at the expense of her professional proficiency.

When the interviewer stated, 'You graduated with honours', Musgrave replied, 'But only second class'. Musgrave's second class honours achievement was a considerable one. First Class honours were rarely awarded by the Faculty of Dentistry at the University of Sydney until the 1990s. I contend that Musgrave was expressing a meaning of femininity from a middle-class discourse of her generation that defined women as intellectually inferior to men.

With man as the centre, there is a subjectivity of positioning woman as the other. For women in professions, while striving to reach for this centre they tend to overachieve or overcompensate, which is a reaffirmation of being other. Patison applied herself with extraordinary diligence throughout her dental studies, achieving such outstanding standards of excellence that the Faculty of Dentistry awarded her its first University Medal.\(^\text{61}\)

\(^{60}\)ibid.

6.6 Graduation

DENTAL SURGERY

B.D.S.—LICENTIATE IN DENTAL SURGERY

Pres.
Margaret Patellou Barnes, Harold Henry Bend; Rec.
Septimus Holy, Cyril Theodore Burtlett, John J

FIGURE 6.4
Newspaper sketch of Madge Barnes L.D.S.
Courtesy Virginia Hind

The University of Sydney's conferring of the Licentiate in Dental Surgery on Saturday, 8 May 1905 was reported in the press. A ceremony, well attended by the public 'who had received tickets of admission to the important and significant function', was held in the Centennial Hall of the Town Hall. The

62 Sydney Morning Herald 8 May 1905, p. 5.
accompanying annual commemoration procession ‘about half a mile long’ provided entertainment. The presence of women students (referred to as ‘girls’) caused some to comment that:

the girl graduates were very numerous, and were always sure of a demonstration from the gentler undergrads, in the hall. A burst of cheering greeted Margaret Barnes whom it was claimed was ‘the first girl’ to obtain the L.D.S.²³ (see Figure 6.4).

The latter claim was corrected the following day,²⁴ giving that credit to Annie Praed.

²³Ibid.

FIGURE 6.5
Sydney University’s inaugural BDS graduates, 1906

In later life, remembering and re-evaluating the day she graduated with the BDS, Barnes wrote:
Ann & I! Surrounded by the first B.D.S. graduates after the conferring of
degree ceremony!!! The men, as usual, look modern, Ann & I, alas! Look
like stiff sticks with ground-length skirts & severe solemn faces!!!

Barnes' statement clearly illustrates the gender difference at this significant
moment, the dawning of professionalism in dentistry. Barnes' description
captures the dynamics of the shifts between professional masculinity and
contesting meanings of femininity. The men are clearly defined in their
masculinity by being 'modern', implying a rightful alliance with the new century,
the new age of technology and the new era of the dental profession. Unlike this
scientific modern professional man, Barnes' focus is centred in the context of
traditional spheres of middle-class meanings of femininity: fashion and morality.
The example here illustrates contesting femininities as Barnes' and Praed's
femininity moves along shifting territory: from women as followers of fashion
that had not accelerated with modernity, to the moral ground, the rightful place
of women. While the men take the helm and steer towards modernity, the
women are bound to the past, to an Anglo-Christian tradition of moral
responsibility. This Anglo-Christian ideology is particularly evident by Barnes'
choice of words, 'solemn faces'.

It is interesting to note that Henry Burton-Bradley's grandson, is standing
directly behind Annie Praed in the photograph of the 1906 graduates (see
Figure 6.5). The relationship between Praed and John Houghton Bradley is
unknown.

---

The impact of negotiating between societal notions of femininity and professionalism seemed to cause some difficulties for Barnes. It would seem from the evidence of a poem (see Chapter 3) that between 1901 and 1907 Madge experienced unrequited love. The poem was signed X, denoting her acquired name Xenia, which has multi-layered meanings connected by the thread of difference. The *Oxford English Dictionary* provides 'pertaining to a guest, strangers' and 'an offering made by a subject to their prince on the occasion of his passing through their estates', conveying a sense of the special outsider.\(^{66}\) A similar theme occurs in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*’s explanation: ‘Friendships, ritualised (or guest friendship), a bond of trust, imitating kinship and reinforced by rituals, generating affection and obligations between individuals belonging to separate social units’.\(^{67}\)

According to her nephew\(^{68}\) the value of friendship was central to Barnes, and her note, 'Sad days', which recorded the deaths of a number of long-term close friends, is evidence of this.\(^{69}\) Friendship for Barnes was most probably carved from the classical references of ancient Greece and Rome where 'ritualised friendship was an overwhelmingly upper class institution'.\(^{70}\) (Figure 6.6)

---


\(^{69}\) Madge Barnes: Personal papers, ‘Sad Days’. *Virginia Hind Collection*.

FIGURE 6.6
Madge Barnes and friends at a picnic, c1906
Courtesy Virginia Hind

The back cover of Barnes’ album is also signed ‘Xenia’ above Noli me tangere but this time it is between the ‘Madge E.’ and the ‘Barnes’. The Latin is suggestive of a personal distancing, but without evidence, it is purely speculative to derive interpretations. Did Barnes’ sense of difference, underpinned with Christian beliefs of moral responsibility, arise from the family financial circumstances being at odds with their social class? Or did it have its origins from a synthesis of femininities drawn from family, school, suffrage, university and societal sources? Or did this arise during her university years where her identity hung at the slippery interface of femininity and professional masculinity?

71 The translation for noli me tangere is ‘do not touch me’.
Were Barnes’ usage of Xenia and Noli me tangere internalised concepts of self expressed naively in the romantic language of her generation? Was this concept of self, a salient factor in her attraction to the pioneering role? Did Barnes’ sense of difference underpin the pioneering she shared with Marie Byles, a pioneer woman in the law profession of NSW, who claimed to have chosen law as a career ‘because she “dared to be different”’?\(^7\) (Byles later became Praed’s legal adviser.)

6.7 Science and gender

In Australia, scientific knowledge has been culturally designated as a masculine domain. Grosz and de Lepervanche support other researchers when they argue:

> Girls are led to believe, in accordance with the stereotypes about them, that science is ‘a masculine area into which they should not intrude, to think that subjects like physics are “hard” and that engineering and mathematics are unfeminine’.\(^7\)

This belief system in Australian society has been well entrenched and accounts for the poor participation rates of women in science-based fields until more recent years. Grosz and de Lepervanche quote Fox Keller’s claim that ‘in


characterising scientific and objective thought as masculine, the very activity by which the knower can acquire knowledge is also genderized.\textsuperscript{74}

The discipline of engineering epitomises this gendered scientific knowledge, and as such, remains a major obstacle for women in the 1990s. In the hierarchy of first year science subjects, physics is considered the most problematic for women. Entrance to faculties with a prerequisite of physics has been a major barrier to women. In comparing the physics experience of Barnes, Praed and the interviewee women dentists, the outcomes illustrate the connection between the personal and the political. The importance of role models further demonstrates clearly how women’s perceptions about science can be affected, providing further evidence of the possibilities of multiple femininities.

Barnes’ and Praed’s acceptance into the dental course was facilitated because the entrance requirements were lower than the ones for medicine, law and engineering. Interviewees have stated that since few girls’ high schools included physics in the curriculum, the subject presented the major stumbling block in passing the first year of the dental course. Researchers agree that few schoolgirls chose or were offered the option of physics at matriculation level. Until recent years, girls leaving school were covertly or overtly discouraged by school counsellors from seeking a career as a dentist.\textsuperscript{75,76}

\textsuperscript{74}Fox Keller, E. 1985, \textit{Reflections on gender and science}, Yale University Press, New Haven, USA, p. 79.

\textsuperscript{75}Women’s Action Program, Office of Special Concerns, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, & Department of Health, Education & Welfare. op. cit., p. 39.

\textsuperscript{76}ibid., p. 57.
Interviewees have commented on their disadvantage compared to the male students in their year. Ellice Weir's struggle stretched over two years. Lacking prior educational preparation in physics was difficult enough but as women academics were few in physics, the lack of mentors inflated the disadvantage. The importance of mentors has been well documented by many researchers, including Allen.

For Barnes, Riviere's headmistresses provided her with role models and cultivated a scientific culture within the school. She was fortunate to experience the ownership of scientific knowledge being considered acceptable for women. Psychologically, this and the pioneering drive freed Barnes from the constraints that later young Australian women experienced in a variety of cultural environments.

Encouragement, enthusiasm and stimulation were gained from a woman teacher who created a supportive environment for Marie Patison to overcome the absence of knowledge in high school physics. Patison was fortunate to meet another pioneer graduate, Phylis Nichol BSc 1926, MSc 1927, who taught for thirty-five years. Here Patison describes the significance of her contact with Nichol, co-author of the physics textbook, *Introduction to Physics*.

---


78 Allen, op. cit., p. 135.

79 Bygott, op. cit., p. 51.

80 Turney, Bygott & Chippendale, op. cit., p. 531.
she decided I could learn Physics...I did a course for 3 months or more with her. The subject was just wonderful...I realised it was something I could comprehend and I enjoyed it with her. She made it live. She was an incredible teacher...She just had the ability to make it interesting enough to want to know more about it. She said I'd like you in first year to come along to the Women's College where I give tutorials...For the whole of that year I went to her Thursday night tutorials. At the end of that year I topped Physics. And nobody could believe it because I hadn't done it at school. She was extra-ordinary. The day before the Physics exam we'd all been there and she said "Now girls there is not one I expect to get less than a Distinction". And some of them got High Distinctions. There were only about a dozen in this tutorial but everybody else got distinctions. The whole lot...She lived in Women's College...she was incredible...she was a typical schoolteacher...that sort of look. But she knew how to lecture my word she did.  

In contrast, without any knowledge or the benefits of a bridging course in physics, Musgrave reflects on the difficulties she encountered in her first year of the dental course:

I didn't do physics because they wouldn't allow girls to do physics. I didn't do physics and that was dreadful. If I'd been in a co-ed school I'd have learnt physics but I found when I got to the university they'd covered five years of high school physics in three months which was dreadful. It was very hard... you went straight into it from the word go and you started

---

with torques to do physics and that was dreadful for dental students and if you hadn't done it and the boys all had and that was a great drawback for me. I managed to get through but it was very hard. The chemistry -- the five years of chemistry honours I did they did that in three months. Fortunately I could cope with that very easily. But physics, that was such a pity! 82

Ellice Weir compared her experience of physics with that of her eldest brother John, who had graduated in dentistry a few years earlier:

It was pretty nearly all brand new as far as the lectures and the work was concerned...At the time I wasn't finding it (physics) difficult and it seemed all understandable and good and interesting -- same as chemistry -- lovely subjects. It was only when it came to answering questions at the end of the year that I came to the realisation...that I knew nothing...We just didn't have those subjects in girls' schools then. Even my brother John who had this great record...of ever passing any examination while he was at Grammar...but I do remember he'd been rather startled when I went to him and said 'What does K stand for?'...and I think he had some qualms about my future...when you are in amongst stuff going on all the time, something latches on even if you don't pass examinations in it. 83

Weir's comments highlight the disadvantage of women entering dentistry without the background knowledge of science subjects. The subject of physics

82 Interview with Doreen Musgrave, 23 Apr. 1996, op. cit.
83 Interview with Ellice Weir, 14 June 1996, op. cit.
was a crucial obstacle for women to overcome in first year dentistry. A successful outcome in physics, it would seem, was dependent on either previous knowledge gained at high school (unlikely for most women), determined application, an excellent bridging course or the assistance of an enthusiastic woman tutor.

Praed’s secondary school education at Lotaville did not give her an adequate preparation for physics of a university standard. I suggest the benefits gained from her apprenticeship course, her diligence, augmented with the maturity of her age of twenty-nine were most probably major factors. At the end of first year dentistry, Praed had achieved the excellent results of Class II honours in physics, chemistry and metallurgy and a pass in anatomy.\(^4\) However, an essential difference between these two pioneers and later women was that their standard of science and mathematics was not at variance with that of their male peers. Supporting this argument are the words of John Houghton Bradley:

I think I am correct in saying that there are in our ranks four practitioners who availed themselves of the original concessions and at considerable hardship and loss to themselves went through the course and obtained the Degree of B.D.S. It was no light task, I assure you gentlemen, especially when undertaken, as in my case, fifteen years after leaving school, with a necessarily comparatively poor education – I was eleven

\(^4\)University of Sydney Calendar 1902, University of Sydney, Sydney, p. 259.
years of age when I started work. I don’t think anything would induce me
to undertake such a task again unless I had capital to back me up.\textsuperscript{65}

As boys’ schools moved to cater for matriculation standards guaranteeing
entrance to the vocational courses at the university and girls’ schools were
directed to a more domestic science orientation, fewer women had either
equitable educational standards or a gendered cultural acceptance for the
sciences and mathematics.

The high dropout rate for women after first year warrants further research. A
similar situation can be discerned from women’s writing in the dental student
magazine in 1945, stating, ‘First year as before, claims the majority, leaving five
in second year, one in third, and three in fourth’.\textsuperscript{66} This statement was made
during a period when societal attitudes were favourable to women’s
participation in the workforce and when there was a record number of women in
first year. The article’s comment, ‘We were very glad to see so many Freshettes
entering dentistry and showing that this is not only a “man’s world”’,\textsuperscript{67} supports
the argument that during World War II meanings of femininity were redefined in
terms of paid work.

Branch), Sydney, p. 114.


\textsuperscript{67} ibid.
6.8 Role models and mentors

Researchers have argued the importance of mentors in the careers of professional men and women. Powles’ view is that women at Australian universities were disadvantaged because ‘mentor-protégé relationships were seldom established between staff and female students’ and Haring-Hidore argues that women still have difficulties in finding a suitable mentor, and advocates that they should persevere until they do.\(^{88}\)

In the absence of women mentors, the presence of male mentors can make a significant difference to women. Allen’s interpretation of the careers of Helen Newton Turner, an animal geneticist, and Isobel Bennet, a marine biologist, illustrates the importance of male mentors to their careers. Allen reported that ‘with the guidance, encouragement, and help of these enlightened men, both women went on to achieve outstanding success in traditionally male-dominated fields’.\(^{89}\)

For Barnes and Praed the timing of their study at university marked a junction between women as pioneers at the university and the establishment of the university dental course. I suggest that that first student intake into the dental school at the University of Sydney had the privilege of forming exclusive relationships with teachers, especially Hinder and Reading.


\(^{89}\)Ibid., p. 551.
Septimus Hinder was active not only at an organisational level in the dental profession but also in the educational and administrative aspects of the newly established university dental education. The first groups who undertook the new course were fulfilling Hinder’s and Reading’s desires and ambitions for an entirely redefined dentist. Barnes’ and Praed’s presence symbolised and actualised Hinder’s and Reading’s visions for a future profession distanced from the established model grounded in the world of trade. I suggest that an interdependent relationship existed between Hinder, Reading and the early university graduates to counter the size of the opposition to the new standard in dental education.

A favourable educational environment, with the energy of the new and the intimacy of the small, fostered and generated mutual support and encouragement for the future survival of university dental education. Therefore Hinder’s and Reading’s relationship with the new graduates encompassed that of mentor and/or role model. Hinder and Reading, who had qualified at prestigious institutions overseas, were among the few dentists during this period with formal dental education and they encouraged the new breed towards a professional scientific direction. Therefore Barnes’ and Praed’s presence at this time had a special meaning in professional terms. Their position was further advantaged by the fresh ideologies of the Suffrage movement that had redefined women’s possibilities in the new century.

To what degree Hinder offered his support is open to debate. However his enthusiasm and encouragement towards Praed is documented in the paper she
presented at the First Dental Congress when he stated that ‘I had some trouble in getting Miss Praed to prepare this paper, but I feel very pleased indeed that I succeeded in overcoming her reluctance’. \(^{90}\)

I suggest that Hinder and Reading were available role models to their protégés. As a body, the majority of the 1906 graduates attended the same dental organisations patronised by Reading and Hinder. Organisational politics were oriented around an axis of dental educational qualifications, and the vying for support to individual dental bodies was well contested. A number of this group desired and gained doctorate degrees most probably following the example of Hinder; Marshall\(^{91}\) and Moxham\(^{92}\) received their Doctor of Dental Surgery from Pennsylvania and Praed her Doctor of Dental Science from the University of Sydney.\(^{93}\)

Mentorship for women dental students was an informal arrangement involving the few motivated women dentists. As graduates, June Allen, Doreen Musgrave\(^{94}\) and Annie Praed\(^{95}\) gave support to women undergraduates. Allen’s and Musgrave’s presence in the women’s common room at lunchtime in 1939

---

\(^{90}\)Praed, op. cit., p. 167.

\(^{91}\)NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5168, Dental Register, 1901–1935, p. 9.

\(^{92}\)Ibid.

\(^{93}\)Halliday, op. cit., p. 175.


was described as 'these two are able to give us much valuable help and advice, besides adding a "professional" atmosphere to the little family'. 96

Praed's activity as a mentor most probably grew out of her feminist convictions (see Chapter 7) and her recognition of her position as the matriarchal figure in the dental profession. Praed's influence continued even after her death. An awareness of Praed's achievements filtered through to the 1952 generation. That generation voiced this as 'Perhaps from our swelling ranks will come the next Doctor of Dental Science to wear Annie Praed's Cap and Gown'. 97

Younger generations of women dentists paid tribute to Praed's role in the dental profession. 98, 99 For example, when Praed addressed a Quota Club meeting, the young Dulce Skinner publicly acknowledged this mentoring role:

Miss Dulce Skinner, who is in charge of the dental clinic at the Children's Hospital seconded the vote of thanks and said in her student days, when women were regarded suspiciously as "gate crashers" into the profession, Miss Praed had been a tower of strength to her, and was largely instrumental in the establishment of a common room for the girl students, who hitherto, had been without any sort of accommodation. 100

96 Anon. 1939, 'Women's notes', loc. cit.
97 McKenzie, R. 1952, Women's notes', Articulator, vol. 9, no. 10, p. 34.
100 ADA (NSW Branch): ADA (NSW Branch); News cuttings of the Dental Health Education Department, p. 20.
Although it segregated them from the informal networking avenues available to their peers in the men’s common room, the establishment of the common room for women dental students created a sanctum for mutual support. It also gave the women dental students a visibility and a sense of permanence in the dental school.

The value of Praed’s support to the women students in her sphere was transplanted and carried forth to future generations by these messengers. In the 1960s, Musgrave filled Praed’s shoes by mentoring final year women students through correspondence. The following excerpt from one of her letters illustrates her role:

The future has never been brighter for women dentists. So if you have dark moments keep thinking of the end result. Quite frankly I believe Dentistry is the hardest course of all – but a wonderful profession for a woman once she is through. It combines so happily with marriage & motherhood. So all the very best to you. I shall be watching for your results.\textsuperscript{101}

The letter survives due to the connection between Musgrave’s daughter and the recipient Louise Margaret Latter, who became the first woman officer-in-charge of the Travelling Dental Clinic in 1975.\textsuperscript{102}


\textsuperscript{102}Ibid.
While the Annie Praed oration was in existence her visibility continued to contribute to this attitude. Musgrave’s continued support to younger generations through letters to graduands and published articles on women dentists provided a younger age group with professional possibilities.

6.9 The class of 1906

Without detailed research only a sketchy profile of the male members of the class of 1906 is at hand. As dental education forged new directions, the graduating class of 1906 reflected the transitional period. The old met the new when five apprenticeship-trained dentists entered the vanguard of the new era. John Houghton Bradley, Frederick Crouch, Howard Gordon Hardie, Cecil George Moxham and Leslie George Stockwell were apprenticeship-trained. Available information on the family backgrounds of the 1906 graduates indicates that the majority were similar to Barnes: middle-class Anglicans whose fathers were from the trade or commerce sectors of the community (see Table 6.3). Loyalty to the Empire led Crouch, Hardie, Marshall and Neave to enlist in World War I: the youngest member of the class, Frank Marshall being

---

103Musgrave, D. 1974, ‘Women...now and then’, Articulator, pp. 20–22.

104NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5168, Dental Register, 1901–1935, 26 Mar.1901, p. 2.

105ibid., 15 Apr.1901, p. 4.

106ibid., 30 Aug. 1901, p. 10.

107ibid., 20 Feb. 1901, p. 6.

promoted to the rank of Lieutenant Colonel.\textsuperscript{109} Crouch and Marshall's involvement in the dental corps during World War I was overseas.\textsuperscript{110}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Date, place of birth, religion</th>
<th>Father's occupation, place of birth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harold Henry BOND</td>
<td>9 June 1882</td>
<td>Accountant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elizabeth Bay, Sydney Church of England</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Houghton BRADLEY</td>
<td>1875</td>
<td>Solicitor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Albury, NSW Church of England</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frederick Richard CROUCH</td>
<td>9 Apr. 1879</td>
<td>Storekeeper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Casino, NSW Church of England</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Pearson Berkeley DOLAN</td>
<td>1871</td>
<td>No occupation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dublin, Ireland Church of England/Catholic*</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard Gordon HARDIE</td>
<td>19 Aug. 1880</td>
<td>Auctioneer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Point Piper, Sydney Congregational</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edgar Alexander MACTAGGART</td>
<td>No information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank MARSHALL</td>
<td>1883</td>
<td>Cornelius Charles Marshall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sydney Church of England</td>
<td>Dentist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cecil George Morecroft MOXHAM</td>
<td>12 May 1879</td>
<td>Station Master on Railway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Haydnton, Murrundii</td>
<td>Co-Longford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bevan Walter NEAVE</td>
<td>1880</td>
<td>Joseph James Neave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Norman</td>
<td>3 Sep. 1879</td>
<td>Ginger Beer Brewer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STARKEY</td>
<td>Sydney Church of England</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leslie George</td>
<td>1881</td>
<td>Publican</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STOCKWELL</td>
<td>Dover, England Church of England</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{*}A later change in religious beliefs.

Mystery surrounds E. G. MacTaggart: no records have come to hand about his social background or whereabouts after graduation. Documented addresses have located him at W. MacTaggart's (King and Phillip Sts., Sydney) before

\textsuperscript{109}Halliday, op. cit., p. 244.

\textsuperscript{110}Australian War Memorial Archives: Nominal Roll of the AIF abroad.
Albury, and then his name is removed from the register in 1928.\textsuperscript{111} It is unknown if he had a familial relationship with A. H. MacTaggart, who was among the first appointed lecturers to the dental school.\textsuperscript{112} Absent from the graduation photograph, although present at the conferring of the Bachelor of Dental Surgery,\textsuperscript{113} his last known location was Corowa in 1904.\textsuperscript{114}

It is difficult to know if this small group of graduates formed long-term relationships among themselves. Piecemeal details suggest that Barnes and Praed maintained some connection, as Peter Tindale recalled attending Praed's practice when he was a pupil at Sydney Grammar School.

In a letter just before her death Praed wrote of a Christmas invitation from the Marshall family: most probably this was her fellow classmate Frank Marshall and his family. As Bradley, Marshall, Moxham and Praed were active organisationally, their paths crossed within dental bodies. Crouch, Dolan, Marshall, Praed and Stockwell were the founding members of the University of Sydney Dental Graduates' Association in 1904.\textsuperscript{115}

\textsuperscript{111}NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5169, Rough Register of Dentists, 1902–1924, 29 Feb. 1904, p. 10, no. 1215.

\textsuperscript{112}Ibid., p. 89.

\textsuperscript{113}University of Sydney Archives: University of Sydney; 55\textsuperscript{th} Annual Commemoration, 11 Apr. 1906, p. 6.

\textsuperscript{114}NSW State Archives: Dental Board of NSW; 7/5168, Dental Register, 1901–1935, 29 Feb. 1904, p. 8.

\textsuperscript{115}Halliday, op. cit., p. 98.
In 1928, Marshall was elected the first president of the NSW branch of the ADA, a body for the formation of which that Moxham had lobbied hard. During World War II, when he was promoted to Lieutenant-Colonel, Marshall held the position of Assistant Director of Dental Services, which burdened him with responsibility, causing his health to decline. Marshall, who was an active member of committees, also joined the Royal Zoological Society, serving as President from 1945–1948.

Houghton Bradley's experience in dentistry began at the age of eleven. This apprenticeship background, together with his newly acquired Licentiate in Dental Surgery, gained him an appointment as one of the first examiners to the Dental Board examinations for apprentice-trained students. His academic responsibilities were across a broad spectrum of the curriculum: dental pathology, materia medica and metallurgy. Shortly after graduation, Houghton Bradley gained public notoriety for the unauthorised usage of the title Doctor, as did all the Sydney University graduates.

---

116 ibid., p. 168.
118 Halliday, op. cit., p. 108.
6.10 Conclusion

Barnes and Praed were at the interface of change with the emergence of professionalisation and the pioneering movement that persuaded middle-class women to seek employment in the paid workforce. This junction in time gave them a unique university environment with advantages that later women studying dentistry would not encounter. Most probably Barnes and Praed were emotionally reinforced by the public acclamation for the pioneering spirit of other earlier women graduates.

The significance of timing, of Barnes' and Praed's entrance into the embryonic stage of the dental course at university, ensured that there was little external or internal need to justify their presence as women. Timing, too, provided them with a window of opportunity, before the entrance standards were raised to meet those required for medicine, law and engineering. Those introduced requirements had considerable impact on the presence of women in dentistry, as only a small number of girls' schools offered the necessary science subjects and often the standard of the curriculum was lower at girls' schools than for boys.

Dentistry as a career was not a common path for women of the middle classes, who tended to favour careers in the more feminised professions of social work, teaching, nursing and librarianship that had already been reordered on gendered boundaries. Therefore the professions maintained an exclusive masculine culture and identity that psychologically acted as a gendered barrier to many women.