

**An Army in Conflict:  
The Changing Musical and Cultural Identity of the Salvation Army in Australia**

A thesis submitted to fulfil requirements for  
the degree of Doctor of Philosophy  
Sydney Conservatorium of Music, The University of Sydney

**Victoria Parsons Kelly**

**May 2023**

## **Statement of Originality**

This is to certify that to the best of my knowledge, the content of this thesis is my own work. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or other purposes.

I certify that the intellectual content of this thesis is the product of my own work and that all the assistance received in preparing this thesis and sources have been acknowledged.

Victoria Parsons Kelly

## **Acknowledgements**

Firstly, I would like to acknowledge and pay respect to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples as the traditional custodians of the land on which this research was conducted. In particular, I wish to acknowledge the privilege I have to study, work, and live on the lands of Gadigal and Wangal peoples of the Eora Nation. I pay my respects to their Elders past, present and emerging.

Sovereignty has never been ceded. It always was and always will be, Aboriginal land.

To my primary supervisor, Associate Professor Charles Fairchild, thank you for agreeing to another project, for your wisdom, council, and patience. You have often been the calmer of two heads, and I appreciate that endlessly.

I would also like to thank my family and friends who have supported me throughout this process. There have been many times I have been unavailable to you, and you have always met me with such grace and understanding. I want to honour an incredible group of women who have gifted me their time, encouragement, care, and wisdom: Dr Danielle Eden, Dr Lyn Edge, Dorelle Sellers, Kiara Parks, Myfanwy Rees, Grace Leong, Rhonda Smart, Kimberley Cugley, and Rosemary Douglass. Above all, I would like to thank my husband for being my loudest cheerleader. You have endured the late nights and early mornings, carried me through times of struggle, and celebrated every victory big and small. Thank you for proof reading snippets of text, discussing ideas, and cooking the yummiest of food when I felt like I couldn't leave my desk. Thank you for your endless love and support.

Finally, I wish to thank the many local corps, music-making groups, and participants who gave me their time and shared with me their lives, passions, opinions, and experiences. Without your generosity and openness this research would not have come to fruition.

## Contents Page

<b>Cover Page</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Statement of Originality</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Contents</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Abstract</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>	<b>7</b>
1.1 Statement of the Problem	12
1.2 Exploration of the Research Problem	15
1.3 Theoretical Framework	16
1.3.1 Definition of Terms	19
1.4 Outline of Thesis	21
<b>Chapter 2: Historical and Social Context of The Salvation Army</b>	<b>24</b>
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 The Salvation Army	24
2.2.1 The Salvation Army Australia	30
2.3 Music of the Army	31
2.3.1 Brass Bands	33
2.3.2 The Music Department	35
2.3.3 Singing and Songsters	38
2.3.4 Timbrel Brigades	41
2.3.5 Rationalising Excellence	45
2.4 Modernity and the Worship Wars	47
2.4.1 Impact on The Salvation Army	51
<b>Chapter 3: Methodology</b>	<b>57</b>
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Placement of self as researcher	58
3.2.1 The Placement of Self and the Malleable Insider/Outsider Dynamic	58
3.2.2 Co-creation and Reflexivity	61
3.3 Qualitative Research	63
3.3.1 The Research Design	63
3.3.2 Choosing Locations	64
3.3.3 Participant Observation	66
3.3.4 Fieldwork Notes	67
3.3.5 Interviews and Questionnaires	68
3.4 The Data Collection Process	71
3.4.1 The Data Collection Period	71
3.4.2 Ethical Considerations	72
3.4.3 Participant Recruitment	73
3.4.4 Limitations and Problems	74
3.5 Approaches to Data Analysis	76
3.5.1 Limitations and Delimitations	77
3.6 Conclusion	78

<b>Chapter 4: A music-making people</b>	<b>79</b>
4.1 Introduction	79
4.2 Participation and inheritance	80
4.2.1 Beginnings and the impact of gender roles	81
4.2.2 Music and Education	86
4.3 Community and Fellowship	91
4.4 Nostalgia and Lament	94
4.5 Identity and <i>Salviness</i>	99
<b>Chapter 5: Tradition and Contemporary Worship Music</b>	<b>108</b>
5.1 Introduction	108
5.2 Setting the scene	113
5.3 What is a traditional and contemporary corps?	115
5.3.1 Space and place making	116
5.3.2 Ethnographic case study	121
5.4 Engaging with worship music	127
5.5 Music delivery: internal music-making ensembles	127
5.6 Organising music-making for congregational worship	136
5.7 Technology within the worship space	144
5.7.1 Perspective One	145
5.7.2 Perspective Two	151
5.8 Conclusion	156
<b>Chapter 6: Community Music-making</b>	<b>157</b>
6.1 Introduction	157
6.2 Community Music	157
6.2.1 Categories of Community Music	159
6.3 Perspective One: Music of a Community	161
6.4 Perspective Two: Communal Music-making	162
6.4.1 Blurring the boundaries	167
6.5 Perspective Three: facilitated community music programmes	171
<b>Chapter 7: Are we still Salvo?</b>	<b>174</b>
7.1 Introduction	174
7.2 Approach to the research question	177
7.3 Discussion of themes	178
7.4 Conclusion: Are we still Salvo?	182
<b>References</b>	<b>184</b>
<b>Appendix I: Participant Information Statement Example</b>	<b>197</b>
<b>Appendix II: Participant Consent Form Example</b>	<b>200</b>
<b>Appendix III:</b>	<b>202</b>

## **Abstract**

In 1878 at Salisbury, England, four men gathered with their instruments to accompany the singing at a Salvation Army public meeting and inadvertently formed the first Salvation Army brass band. From its earliest days, The Salvation Army has enjoyed a particularly strong musical heritage. Brass bands quickly became the aural signature of The Salvation Army as the sight and sound of brass instruments and songster brigades would capture the very essence of Salvationism for generations of salvationists to come.

However, as congregational attendance has lessened over the past thirty years, traditional Salvation Army music-making practices such as brass bands, songster and timbrel brigades, have slowly diminished in size. As liturgical music tastes shifted toward a more contemporary band setting, local corps (churches) now incorporate worship music that has been sourced from other church denominations, defined by some as ‘non-Army’, removing the demand for traditional music-making practices; ultimately changing the musical landscape of the Salvation Army in Australia as they cater to local expressions of Salvationism. Yet, as Salvation Army musicians contend with these obstacles, many musicians have found creative ways of reproducing and experiencing their musical heritage in new and innovative forms.

This thesis explores how salvationists maintain their *salviness*, their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity, through music-making activities and what forms this may take at present. Based on extensive multiyear, multisite ethnographic fieldwork, this thesis examines the familiar constructs of tradition and change, how change has been experienced, and how many salvationists choose to explore different ways of *musiking* as they express the sounds of *their* Salvation Army, Australia.

## Chapter 1: Introduction

*'MID all the traffic of the ways,  
Turmoils without, within,  
Make in my heart a quiet place  
And come and dwell therein:*

*A little shrine of quietness  
All sacred to Thyself,  
Where Thou shalt all my soul possess  
And I may find myself:*

*A little place of mystic grace,  
Of self and sin swept bare,  
Where I may look into Thy face  
And talk with Thee in prayer.*

*Come, occupy my silent place,  
And make Thy dwelling there!  
More grace is wrought in quietness  
Than any is aware.*

John Oxenham

Making music within faith-based communities is far from unique. For many religious bodies, music is interwoven throughout corporate worship and community outreach groups as the creative process of music-making brings together a local tapestry of individuals made up of “social factors which include aspects of identity, heritage, group solidarity, healing, bonding, celebration, and other factors” such as music education and frequent opportunities for everyday people to participate in music (Veblen 2013: np; see also Dykema 1916).

In their own ways, local, national, and international expressions of The Salvation Army can be found supporting music programmes that have arisen out of the needs of the communities

they serve. From worship choirs and ensembles to school band programmes and rehabilitation singing groups, many salvationists draw upon a strong musical heritage and reputation to connect with members of their own congregation and the general public. However, not unlike many fellow Christian denominations, The Salvation Army Australia Territory finds itself in the midst of change where congregational attendance has lessened over the past thirty years. ‘Traditional’ Salvation Army music-making practices that require large groups of people such as brass bands, songsters (choirs), and timbrel brigades (percussion ensemble), have slowly diminished in size, and whilst the dichotomy between ‘traditional Army music’ and ‘contemporary non-Army music’ continues to be challenged and explored, more salvationists are gravitating toward the types of liturgical musics that suit their local corps (church) expressions.

This thesis is the result of the long-standing debate between ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ music expression that continues to find its voice within the everyday lives of Australian salvationists. From the tunes sung on a Sunday morning to the music selection of a national commissioning, or the YouTube music clips projected on a screen to a large brass band on a platform, so integral is the use of music to notions of ‘salviness’ that all people, not only salvationist musicians, feel an entitlement to air their concerns, joys, celebrations, and differences surrounding how music is done within their local, national, and even international Salvation Army.

In an attempt to unravel the ‘traditional versus contemporary’ discourse within The Salvation Army Australia, this thesis attempts to uncover how salvationists come to terms with a crisis of people leaving, of traditions dwindling, of times changing, of new people creating new sounds, of identities being challenged and identities being recreated, of ‘where to go’ and ‘what to do next’, and how the sounds of The Salvation Army paint a new picture of diversity of an organisation that is attempting to pick up momentum after finding itself in flux for over three decades. Rather than moments of conflict, these themes point to moments of intersectionality where music, identity, gender, tradition, and community overlap creating interesting moments of interplay where members challenge what it means to ‘be salvo’ as individual salvationists and *The Salvation Army* within their wider communities.

This research is timely as The Salvation Army in Australia has experienced significant organisational restructure. The two preceding territories, Australia Eastern Territory (New



South Wales and Queensland) and Australia Southern Territory (Northern Territory, Western Australia, South Australia, Victoria, and Tasmania), merged to form the Australia Territory which was officially launched on the 1<sup>st</sup> of December 2018 (The Salvation Army Year Book 2019: np; Simpson 2018: 17). During the development of the Australia Territory, salvationists sseries of sermons, short videos, devotionals, and a one-hundred-day prayer and scripture series (The Salvation Army Year Book 2019: np). As a researcher, this provided a dynamic research field as salvationists in all communities found themselves processing new ideas and information, different ways of approaching and managing tasks, a widening of their territorial boundaries, and ultimately change and an unknown future. This transition was met by a collision of reactions from feelings of inspiration and excitement to feelings of uneasiness, frustration, anger, and for some, devastation. More importantly in the midst of this change, many salvationists found themselves questioning who they are as “The Salvation Army”, and for many retirees, their self-worth and the worth of their service; “it’s a shame the way the Army’s going, they’re forgetting our old people” (personal communication 19.08.2018). Salvationists of all ages found themselves reassessing their relevance to an ‘outside’ world that had seemingly moved on without them, as many were faced with the reality that The Salvation Army of the past was well and truly in the past,

In what condition so we now find ourselves? I want to suggest that The Salvation Army today has fallen victim to its own considerable success. For much of the past century, The Salvation Army has been sustained internally by generational inheritance rather than conversion. The world has been pleased with us, as a nostalgic reminder of good but quaint folk, doing things that they admire but would not really be comfortable with themselves. In the last thirty years, even that has begun to fail as the external culture has shifted so rapidly and profoundly, that even the most robust internal institutional cultures are failing (Cleary 2016).

Although the advent of the Australia Territory momentarily destabilised The Salvation Army as an organisation, this liminal period allowed salvationists the opportunity to question and reassess their current internal climate both nationally and locally. The anxieties Cleary touches upon are not only reserved for the larger organisation structures of The Salvation Army but are made visible as they filter down through all expressions of Salvationism. For some, ‘traditional’ expressions of Salvationism have become seen as dwindling remnants of the past as The Salvation Army recognises that “an entire generation of young people have all

but disappeared” (Living Our Vision 2018). Census data recorded by the Australian Bureau of Statistics reports three decades of decline for Salvation Army associates. In 1991, 72 342 census participants recognised The Salvation Army as their religious expression within the national census resulting in the largest population recorded for the denomination (Australian Bureau of Statistics 1993: 21). Prior to the 1991 census, each census indicated growth for The Salvation Army Australia. In 2001 the national census reflected a slight decrease in associates (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2003: np). Although this decrease was small, the census data collected throughout following two decades presents a denomination in sharp decline. By 2011, the population recorded for Salvation Army associates was reported to be 60 162, 48 939 in 2016, and 35 356 in 2021 (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2012, 2017, 2022: np). Within the mission, this trend is represented throughout the yearbooks of The Salvation Army; a publication that reports a yearly survey of The Salvation Army International (The Salvation Army International 2023: URL). The decrease in association impacts the general organisation of a denomination in countless ways. However, many Australian salvationists rely on the state of traditional Salvation Army music groups to illustrate the changes that are occurring around them.

With these significant changes in mind, how salvationists choose to make music provides a unique and powerful insight into how members negotiate significant sociocultural change and conflict within a liminal milieu as their communities attempt to address the lingering question, “what happens when an organisation, a community, so willing to serve in a myriad of ways, realises that certain cultural practices and ways of being have become obsolete?” or as one bandmaster forecasted, “the demise of brass bands will spell the eventual demise of The Salvation Army. Of that I have no doubt” (Woods 1993: 1). The opening song, *Mid all the traffic of the ways*, captures the heart of this dissertation in two distinct ways (Oxenham 2015: 777). To begin with, Oxenham’s lyrics speak to the change and discomfort of finding one’s place in a busy world whilst confronting the challenges that already exist within. For many salvationists, negotiating a shift in music-making within the mission has led to great turmoil and sadness as they come to terms with an outside world that is moving at an ever-quickenning pace. However, many participants within this research note finding a place of quietness, reflection, compromise, and positivity as they acknowledge the difficulties of the past and engage with the present as one worship leader notes,

Actually, I don't know what it looks like. I think it could be something completely new and I have no idea what that looks [like], but I think we have the opportunity to almost come up with the new thing, the new style of music that incorporates all different things ... it's premature to say that 'cause I don't know ... what God is doing there, but I feel like we have the opportunity to do something new that uses all [of our musical] skills (Interview: 04.04.2019)

Although these lyrics can be sung to a number of tunes found in the 2015 Salvation Army Tune Book (64: Clone, 91: Llyod, and 112: St Agnes), many salvationists associate Oxenham's lyrics with Lenard Ballantine's 1998 hymn tune arrangement *Mid All the Traffic*. In this arrangement, Ballantine sets Oxenham's words to the tune *Shenandoah* (Salvation Army Music Index 2022: URL). A North American folk tune (or shanty), the song *Shenandoah* harkens back to the days of early river and canal trade routes (Wall 1913: 1). These shanties illustrate the landscapes, peoples, and stories experienced by nineteenth century North American sailors as they were shared between each other as working songs (Williams 1895: 7). An early reference to *Shenandoah* relies on the reader to interoperate the "particular melodious cadence and inflection that can only be caught by hearing them" (ibid). Thankfully a recording of Charles Rosher singing *Shenandoah* is captured on a wax cylinder by Percy Grainger in 1906 demonstrating the familiar melody enjoyed by many salvationists today (Grainger 1906: URL). As will be explored further in chapter two, the adoption of popular tunes for evangelical use has been somewhat of a Salvation Army tradition. Dating back to the beginnings of The Salvation Army, the transformation of secular songs to spiritual songs served as a hook to draw in the public as they recognised the melody (Cox 2011: 26). For the salvationists of the twentieth century, Ballantine's arrangement revisits the well-known compositional practices of adoption by "religionizing" (Winston 1999: 4) a well-known tune by uniting Oxenham's poetry with the melody of *Shenandoah*,

In this setting, the insightful words of John Oxenham's 'Mid all the traffic of the ways' are married to the beautiful American folk melody 'Shenandoah'. It is hoped that the restful serenity of the music will enhance the listener's personal shrine of quietness, thereby yielding a place of mystic grace where God's healing and wholeness can be experienced (Ballantine 1998: URL)

### 1.1 Statement of the Problem

Throughout this research project it quickly became apparent that music-making within this organisation finds itself settled within a tenuous void weathered by time, nostalgia, politics, identity, vision, and innovation; all simultaneously informing each other as they contribute to a web of ideas (re)imagining, “what *is* Salvation Army music?”

As an organisational member, my interest for this research arose from my own introduction and interactions with The Salvation Army and their unique ways of making music. Rather than having grown-up in this denomination, I found myself as a reactive learner taking in a set of abstract qualities and mythologies that were socially and culturally attributed to *salvonness* (Eraut 2000: 115). I engaged with this learning process through the musical groups at my local corps and was introduced to ‘the way things were done’. As a newcomer and a young musician, I was welcomed warmly and invited to join the musical sections. Although I remain a wind musician, I found myself learning instruments to fit in with the traditional salvationist brass aesthetic. Wind instruments were not discouraged and I did play with a pianist for the non-brass segments (and was encouraged to keep playing) however, there seemed a clear cultural and structural distinction between how ‘traditional Salvation Army music’ was approached and organised in comparison to the ‘other musics’ within this local corps.

Throughout the years of my attendance at an inner-city corps and well into this research, I am pleased to have encountered a diverse range of musical and creative arts expressions. As I began to delve into these interactions at length, I became increasingly interested in how salvationists choose to make music in community, what aesthetic qualities appeal to the salvationist sensibility, and how they draw upon sociocultural histories and mythologies that inform salvationists of who they are, where they come from, and how they ‘fit’ within the world today. The interest for this study grew out of a casual collection of these observations as I began to develop a sense of what is and is not deemed ‘salvo’. In other words, an assortment of certain actions and qualities that are accepted and rejected within the *habitus* of The Salvation Army Australia (Bourdieu 1980: 53). In response to these observations, the term ‘salvonness’ has been applied throughout the research as a key concept that acknowledges a series of complexities shaped by the culture of The Salvation Army and its place within the wider cultural context of Australia. *Salvonness*, despite its illusiveness, has sustained itself through generational inheritance, storytelling and myth-making, recontextualisation of

traditions, and the continuous negotiation between the past, present, and future that binds a community together.

Although The Salvation Army and its members actively reproduce the mission's history, very little has been written regarding the musical traditions of The Salvation Army. However, a few key texts provide a sound foundation to build upon. Ray Steadman-Allen's *The Evolution of Salvation Army Music* is a series of 15 articles published in The Salvation Army's music publication *The Musician* between 1966 and 1967. The series summarises the development of Salvation Army music as each article intends to capture the "spiritual heritage" of the musical salvationists of the past, whilst addressing the musical practices of the time (Steadman-Allen 1966: 171). The genre of the magazine article provides Steadman-Allen the opportunity to address each topic (history, bands, vocal music, publications) succinctly, whilst presenting a snapshot of the approaches to music-making of 1960s England. In 2001, Steadman-Allen contributed a brief history of Salvation Army music-making to the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. This includes the useful segment *Music, worship and training* that provides a short introduction to the sociocultural landscape of The Salvation Army.

Both Brindley Boon's *Play the Music, Play!* (1966) and *Sing the Happy Song! A history of Salvation Army vocal music* (1978), present moments of early Salvation Army music history and music development within the mission. These books contain chapters that capture the beginnings of musical traditions other than brass bands. This is of particular importance as most musical publications regarding Salvation Army music have gravitated towards the brass band tradition. More recently, Ronald Holz two-volume series *Brass Bands of the Salvation Army* (2006, 2007) contributes an in-depth historical recount of Salvation Army brass bands in the United Kingdom. What is of particular importance for this research project is Holz's explanation of music-making (particularly brass bands) in an organisational and functional way. Holz clearly outlines the *how's* and *why's* surrounding certain organisational music-making practices that, although may no longer be present with in the Australian context, are still alluded to by older salvationists. As Holz focuses on brass bands of the United Kingdom, he includes a few chapters addressing Salvation Army music-making in other countries including an Australian contribution by John Cleary (Cleary 2006: 273 - 331). Cleary's chapter, *1880 – 1920 The Wide Brown Land*, presents one of the few musical histories recorded for The Salvation Army Australia. His research speaks to important subjects for

Australian salvationists such as women in bands, the impact of World War I and World War II, post-war migration, the musical creativity of the 1970s and 80s, and the decline of banding in the early 2000s. In his concluding remarks, Cleary touches upon the challenges for brass bands, and Salvation Army music in general, within the Australian context as music-making cultures have shifted requiring corps to include “more flexible formats and differing musical combinations for worship” (Cleary 2006: 330).

Trevor Herbert (2000) and Gordon Cox (2011) contribute two significant texts to the small body of literature regarding Salvation Army musical tradition. British academic, Trevor Herbert includes one chapter dedicated to the unique expression of worship through brass banding and the world in which it was shaped. In his book, *The British Brass Band, God's Perfect Minstrels* is an impressive overview of the origin of Salvation Army brass bands, the attitudes that governed them, and the self-sustaining nature of the early Salvation Army. Herbert sheds light on the effectiveness of institutionalising all aspects of music-making within the mission, particularly in-house publications, instrument production, and performance practices (Herbert 2000). As a non-salvationist text, Herbert's insight into the world of Salvation Army brass banding presents a valuable assessment of banding and its early cultural development from the outside. Gordon Cox's book, *The Musical Salvationist, The World of Richard Slater (1854 – 1939)*, delves into the life of the Richard Slater in conjunction with the development of Salvation Army music and its institutionalisation. Often deemed 'Father of Salvation Army Music', Cox refers to Slater as the “lynch-pin of the Musical Development of the Salvation Army between 1883 and 1913, responsible for shaping the rapid musical development of the movement in its formative years” (2011: 32). Slater's meticulous hard-written diaries provides a rare glimpse into the musical engagement, education, and desire for self-improvement of Victorian salvationists, the nineteenth century sensibilities of The Salvation Army, and the continuous debates within organisational life. Although this was not the study Cox intended, his research has brought together a rich tapestry of primary source data that presents the ongoings of the early mission and their struggles without the overtly romantic and hagiographic language of internal publications (a problem Cox encountered himself) (ibid: 4). As a former organisational insider, Cox's research position provides an understanding and appreciation of organisational processes and experiences as he considers himself to be “a cultural ‘outsider’, looking on and reflecting” (ibid: 10).

Aside band anniversary and history books (Holz 2007; Collins 2015), numerous academic dissertations have explored Salvation Army music-making from the perspective of composition and performance (Corry 2016; Sharman 2015; Draper 2012; Cobb 2006; Lingard 1999; Holz 1981), pedagogy (Sutton 2010), and brass band history (Rowden 1996). Although each thesis provides invaluable insight into the compositional, performative, and historical contexts of Salvation Army music, almost all dissertations concentrate on the brass band idiom. Very little has been written regarding the relationships between music, identity, and ‘belonging’ within The Salvation Army. Although these themes have been alluded to throughout The Salvation Army’s Orders and Regulations (The Salvation Army 2000), the importance of music and its sociocultural impact within mission is still a relatively untouched field of knowledge with the academy. This study builds upon this body of literature and extends it further into the field of ethnomusicology by approaching the research question ethnographically as it is informed by a Bourdieusian theoretical framework.

## **1.2 Exploration of the Research Problem**

The aim of this research was to explore how salvationists maintain their *salvonesse*, or their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity, through music-making activities and what forms this may take at present. Therefore, the purpose of this research project was to gain an understanding of the current state of Salvation Army music-making in Australia via an extensive ethnographic study. Due to the limited academic source materials and extensive self-published materials by The Salvation Army concerning Salvation Army music traditions, long-term fieldwork provided direct insight into the questions and topics at hand. The fieldwork period took place over a 22-month period from 2017 to 2020. It involved 66 fieldwork sites, 18 in-depth semi-structured interviews, 20 questionnaires, and live streamed events. The rich and diverse data generated from this research project provide an important glimpse into the musical lives of many salvationists during a time of great change and challenge. My inquiries led me to “gently and tentatively, pick up one strand and see where it leads, and then follow that strand on to the next and beyond, and, in the process, begin to loosen the whole knot” (Carrithers 1992: 3 – 4). Although the whole knot may not have come undone, each theme has led this investigation back to one overarching question:

*How do salvationists maintain their salvoness, or their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity through music-making activities, and what forms these may take at present?*

### **1.3 Theoretical Framework**

Although internal investigations regarding music-making have been conducted in the recent past and many opinion pieces published by in-house publications, the nature of this research required a robust theoretical framework as the data encapsulated a different set of complexities (Australian Eastern Territory Mission Team 2015, 2018). As the research question investigates themes such as identity, community, belonging, and change, Pierre Bourdieu's concepts of *habitus*, *field*<sup>1</sup>, and *capital(s)* provide a sound theoretical basis that allows for the teasing apart of the data as we make sense of the intricate musical world of The Salvation Army (Bourdieu 1980). Bourdieu's concepts are concerned with the individual's understanding of self (*habitus*), their negotiation of the social spaces they occupy (*field*), and the personal and sociocultural qualities they utilise when establishing status within each social *field* (*capital*), as they internalise the social and cultural rules of each *field* (*doxa*) (Bourdieu 1980, 1996 [1979]; Navarro 2006; Wacquant 2016, 2018). Bourdieu summarises the interaction of these concepts as:

[(*habitus*) (*capital*)] + *field* = practices (1984: 101).

Rooted in Aristotle's philosophy of *hexis*, Bourdieu's primary theory of *habitus* speaks to the relationship between sociation and individuation (Wacquant 2005: 319, 2016: 65). A multi-faceted concept, *habitus* concerns itself with the negotiation of ontological makeup, the social spaces we occupy (*fields*), and how we participate and make choices within those social spaces (Maton 2014: 52). In other words, *habitus* "captures how we carry within us our history, how we bring this history into our present circumstances, and how we then make choices to act in certain ways and not others" (ibid). Therefore, as a "mediating construct", *habitus*,

---

<sup>1</sup> Throughout this thesis Bourdieu's concept of *Fields* has been italicised so as not to get mixed up with the other fields (research "the field").



is what confers upon practices their relative autonomy with respect to the external determinations of the immediate present. This autonomy is that of the past, enacted and acting, which, functioning as accumulated capital, produces history on the basis of history and so ensures that permanence within change that makes the individual agent a world within the world (Bourdieu 1980: 56).

However, the negotiation of habitus in relation to social *fields* can have “varying degrees of integration and tension, depending on the character and compatibility of the social situations over time” (Wacquant 2005: 319). Wacquant explains that habitus can flounder and have moments of confusion and reassessment when participating within a social *field* in flux (ibid). Habitus is not perfect structure “set” in place, rather, it is a “durable set of dispositions that are formed, stored, recorded, and exert influence to mould forms of human behaviour” (Navarro 2006: 16). Group histories and individual experience shape habitus in a myriad of ways, allowing for (re)negotiation during times of uncertainty as social forces shape how individuals comply, deviate, and/or creatively work within social *fields* and the practices maintained within them, “this is because habitus does not necessarily agree with the social world in which it evolves” (Wacquant 2005: 320). Habitus, therefore, highlights the tension continuously evoked between autonomous actors and the social *fields* they are shaped by; “the *dialectic of the internalization of externality and the externalization of internality* [emphasis from original]” (Bourdieu 1977: 72).

The second part of Bourdieu’s equation, capital(s), refers to concepts surrounding an individual’s resources. Although the term “capital” is generally associated with economics, Bourdieu extends the concept of capital to all kinds of resources that assert power within social *fields* (Navarro 2006: 16; Moore 2014: 101 – 102). While capital as a resource presents itself in varied ways, Bourdieu tends to group capital(s) into four categories: economic capital (money, property, assets, and commodities), cultural capital (education, insider knowledge, qualification), social capital (social relationships and affiliations, family, social origin and cultural heritage, networks, religion), and symbolic capital (legitimacy, public recognition, prestige) (Bourdieu 1977: 179, see also Bourdieu 1986; Fuchs 2003: 392; Navarro 2006: 17; Thomson 2014: 69). Each form of capital reinforces the other as neither form of capital functions and accumulates independently as “this embodied capital, external wealth converted into an integral part of the person, into a habitus, cannot be transmitted (unlike money, property rights, or even titles of nobility) by gift or bequest, purchase or

exchange” (Bourdieu 1986: 18). Capital(s) are therefore, slowly acquired, embodied, and deployed within different social *fields* according to their value and the “structure of the social world” (Bourdieu 1986: 15; Navarro 2006: 17; Thomson 2014: 69).

Bourdieu’s concept of *fields* explores the complexities of social worlds that are made up of sets of “logics” that organise and frame these worlds in specific ways (Bourdieu & Wacquant 1992: 97). Although there are many analogies to understand the concept of *field*, Bourdieu illustrates the idea of *fields* via the example of a game (Bourdieu 1980: 67). He explains that,

In a game, the field (the pitch or board on which it is played, the rules, the outcome at stake, etc.) is clearly seen for what it is, an arbitrary social construct, an artefact whose arbitrariness and artificiality are underlined by everything that defines its autonomy - explicit and specific rules, strictly delimited and extraordinary time and space. Entry into the game takes the form of a quasi-contract, which is sometimes made explicit (the Olympic oath, appeals to 'fair play', and, above all, the presence of a referee or umpire) or recalled to those who get so 'carried away by the game' that they forget it is 'only a game' (ibid).

However, Bourdieu continues by explaining that the construction and arbitration of social *fields* are not so explicit. The development of social *fields* is a “long, slow process of autonomisation” that encapsulates a particular historical and sociocultural context as its foundation whilst members within the *field* continue to reassess, mediate, and (re)create the common practices (*doxa*) of the *field* (Bourdieu 1980: 68; Thomson 2014: 70). For members born within the social *field*, *doxa* is the intermediary between *field* and habitus (Bourdieu 1980: 68). It is the pedagogical process of learning the rules and common practices of the *field* as they are internalised and made “natural” from birth (ibid). Therefore, *doxa* rationalises the “logics of practice” allowing members within the *field* the “capacity for practical anticipation of the ‘upcoming’ future contained in the present, everything that takes place in it seems sensible: full of sense and objectively directed in a judicious direction” (Bourdieu 1980: 66; Deer 2014: 120). Upon entering the *field*, new members require a series of confirmations, education, rites of passage, and demonstrations of faith (cultivation of cultural capital) as an acknowledgment of internalised *doxa* and affirmation of their compliance to the *field* (ibid: 68 – 69). Bourdieu suggests that the use of large ceremonies involving music and movement symbolically bind together members within a social *field* as,

Symbolic power works partly through the control of other people's bodies and belief that is given by the collectively recognized capacity to act in various ways on deep-rooted linguistic and muscular patterns of behaviour, either by neutralizing them or by reactivating them to function mimetically (1980: 69).

In this sense, Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, capital(s), social *fields*, and *doxa*, provide a theoretical framework to translate practical fieldwork data into tangible data (Thomson 2014: 81). As Bourdieu suggested, fieldwork is where the job is done, "you have little choice but to interview... It is at the cost of such a work of construction, which is not done in one stroke but by trial and error, that one progressively constructs social spaces" (Bourdieu & Wacquant 1992: 230 – 231).

With regards to this research, Bourdieu's concepts lend themselves perfectly as members of The Salvation Army navigate a unique social *field* (and *subfields*) that is governed by significant social histories and mythologies. Through Bourdieu's framework of social *fields*, we may begin to piece together how salvationists organise the everydayness of their *salvonness* and how they find new 'ways of being' as they (re)organise specific sociocultural tropes in response to the demands of twenty-first century life.

### 1.3.1 Definition of Terms

Due to the militaristic organisational structure of The Salvation Army, certain military terms have been co-opted to assign member status and organisational positions (rank), religious expressions, localities, and symbols. The application of correct terminology can indicate a certain embeddedness and understanding of the social *field* (Thomson 2014: 69). The acquisition and correct use of Salvation Army terminology indicates an increase of cultural capital as new members adapt to a new social *field*. Likewise, an abandonment of certain militaristic terms by members in leadership, or less 'traditional' corps, may indicate a shift from certain organisational ideas to more mainstream protestant, 'outsider' terminology<sup>2</sup> and a subversion of the original concept. The terminology listed below are terms that are applied daily within salvationist language:

---

<sup>2</sup> Some officers use terms such as 'pastor' rather than 'officer' as they may feel it is more relevant and relatable when communicating with the public. Other times, terms such as congregation and church are interchangeable with corps the build and corps the people.

**Adherent:** A person who has completed Salvation Army information classes and has chosen not to become a uniformed salvationist (soldier).

**Cadet:** A senior soldier (uniformed member) in training for officership.

**Citadel:** A building recognised as a local Salvation Army church.

**Commission:** An official document recognising authority and/or ministerial position upon officers and local leaders.

**Corps:** a local Salvation Army church expression.

**Division:** Smaller regions designated within a larger territory. Within the Australian context, divisions have been designated by state and territory.

**General:** The officer elected by the High Council as the international leader of The Salvation Army.

**Junior Soldier:** A young person who has signed the junior soldier's promise becoming a member of The Salvation Army

**Mercy Seat (or Penitent Form):** "A bench provided as a place where people can kneel to pray, seeking salvation or sanctification, or making a special consecration to God's will and service. The mercy seat is usually situated between the platform and main area of Army halls as a focal point to remind all of God's reconciling and redeeming presence" (The Salvation Army International 2023: URL).

**Officer:** A salvationist who has undertaken officership and has been commissioned and ordained as a minister in The Salvation Army. Members may refer to commanding officers as 'COs'.

**Promotion to Glory:** A term used to describe the death of a salvationist.

Rank: “Based on years of service or special appointment. Today officers in the Salvation Army may be Captains, Majors, Colonels, and Commissioners, although previously there had been a plethora of ranks (e.g. Senior-Captain, Staff-Captain, Senior-Major, Brigadier etc.)” (Cox 2011: 16).

Salvo: Australian vernacular for a salvationist or The Salvation Army, ‘the Salvos’

Soldier (Senior Soldier): Is an individual who has undertaken Salvation Army information classes, signed the Articles of War and enrolled as a member of The Salvation Army. In doing so, these members may choose to wear a ‘full’ Salvation Army uniform.

Territory: A country, or collection of countries, in which Salvation Army work is organised and governed.

Further terminology will be introduced as it is used throughout the thesis.

#### **1.4 Outline of Thesis**

This dissertation is informed by three primary themes that arose from the data during collation. Each theme addresses the research question from different angles and perspectives as they intersect and inform one another. As such, these themes have shaped the core of the dissertation represented in three chapters, *A Music-making People, Traditional and Contemporary Worship Music*, and *Community Music-making in The Salvation Army*. Following this introduction, chapter two outlines the beginnings of The Salvation Army as a Christian mission and the unique culture that would shape Christian lives for generations to come. This chapter also discusses the impact of the worship wars and how certain institutional tropes conflicted with a tidal wave of change. It is essential to gain an understanding of The Salvation Army’s roots as these deep historical, mythological, and cultural tropes fall as a backdrop to institutional and individual social worlds as they continue to inform the (re)production of certain practices. Chapter three presents the methodological approach applied throughout the research project to address the overarching question. This chapter outlines the research period and approach to fieldwork, ethical considerations, data collection and analysis, limitations, and importantly, placement of the researcher. The research study presents a snapshot of music-making practices and trends within The Salvation Army Australia at one point in time. The data collected presents a glimpse into the motivations,

experiences, thoughts, and ideas surrounding music-making as a salvationist within the Australian context.

The following three chapters explore the three fundamental themes around which the dissertation is organised. Chapter four, *A Music-making People*, explores the interconnectedness of ‘musicking’ and *salvonness*. Christopher Small’s concept of *musicking* highlights the communal nature of music-making by suggesting that,

To music is to take part, in any capacity, in a musical performance, whether by performing, by listening, by rehearsing or practicing, by providing material for performance (what is called composing), or by dancing (Small 1998: 9).

In doing so, chapter four explores how *musicking* is interwoven throughout the everydayness of Salvation Army life, how salvationists experience moments of conflict, crisis, and creativity, and how the historical framework of the past continues to inform the present in interesting, and at times, unexpected ways. Throughout this chapter, participants share their histories, stories, and experiences that have been shaped by a life lived within The Salvation Army and how they continue to find their places within it. The following chapter presents an extensive investigation into the discourse surrounding ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ worship music within contrasting Salvation Army worship expressions and how this dilemma continues to be negotiated. For some, this conflict is a trouble of the past. Yet for others, it continues to be present within the everydayness of their Salvation Army experience. Chapter four presents a variety of worship and performative practices salvationists have employed to meet the needs and expectations of their congregations including the recreation of worship spaces, use of symbolism, reorganisation of music expressions, and engagement with digital technology. Finally, chapter five examines how salvationists engage with music-making as communal. The chapter turns to community music theory to present diverse expressions of *musicking* within The Salvation Army Australia that connect members throughout the organisation. Understanding Salvation Army music-making as community music allows us to explore how salvationists organise and manage different musical groups within the mission, community music programmes for the wider public, and moments of intersectionality where ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ music-making converge. In doing so, chapter five employs Higgin’s three perspectives to tease apart the many ways Salvation Army music-making may be experienced as these practices continue to be tightly woven together. The final chapter

concludes with a reflection on the state of Salvation Army music-making in Australia, and the need of further research in a post-COVID19 lockdown world.

## **Chapter 2: Historical and Social Context of The Salvation Army**

### **2.1 Introduction**

The chapter presents a historical and sociocultural context ('the world') of The Salvation Army. From its very beginnings, The Salvation Army has perpetuated specific 'ways of being' that are founded in Victorian nineteenth-century sensibilities and grounded in an autocratic organisational structure that continues to govern organisational life to date. Although this paper is not a historical research project, it is important to gain an understanding of this denomination's organisational roots and the role it has played in the lives of salvationist members and the wider community. As is explored further in this chapter, the decisions made by the founders and first-generation salvationists drastically shaped the experiences of Salvationism for members today. Throughout this chapter we seek to locate the development of The Salvation Army's ever changing social *field(s)*, and the uniqueness of the Australian context that is (re)created and (re)enforced by governance, mythologies, language, education, and rites of passage. Bourdieu stresses the importance of histories, how histories fall as a backdrop to institutional and individual social worlds, and how these histories inform the (re)production of practices in conjunction with the habitus of individuals and social *fields* (Steinmetz 2011: 54; Thomson 2014: 79). This is of particular importance as salvationists often draw upon the examples of The Salvation Army's founders and ethos of first-generation salvationists to validate their motivations, decision making, and opinions today (Davies-Kildea 2017: 27 – 28).

This chapter offers insight into the historical and mythological roots that shape and underpin the experiences of Salvation Army music-makers within the Australian context and how salvoness is mediated by a set of organisational discourses that have slowly weathered by time, generational inheritance, and sociocultural change.

### **2.2 The Salvation Army**

The Salvation Army is known as one of many Christian charities that provide community and social welfare services for people and communities in crisis. At present, the denomination can be found in over 130 countries (The Salvation Army Yearbook 2021: np). For the Australian public, 'the Salvos' are associated with their second-hand stores, emergency services, rehabilitation centres, crisis accommodation, women's refuges, homelessness outreach, and many other social services both locally and nationally provided (Salvation Army 2022a: URL) Twice yearly The Salvation Army appeal to the public via the Red Shied Appeal and



the Christmas Appeal. These appeals draw attention to certain social crises within their communities (such as a rise in homelessness), to the services The Salvation Army provides, and the need for public funding to maintain these services. During these appeals, The Salvation Army's red shield has become recognised as a symbol for care and support when life gets tough (Salvation Army 2022b: URL). However, The Salvation Army is often misconstrued as a charitable organisation with a Christian heart, rather than a member of mainstream Christianity (Escott 1996: 12). This misconception highlights the duality of the organisation as both an extensive social service provider and evangelical denomination (Davies-Kildea 2017: 11).

From its earliest days, the success of The Salvation Army's mission was shaped by innovation and the adaptation of secular resources for religious use (Winston 1999: 4; Edge & Morgan 2017: 58). Community needs were met in their immediacy and were provided by salvationists living and working in the similar (if not the same) conditions as their patrons. The passion, motivation, and innovation of first-generation salvationists was evident in the fluidity of their missional services and their attitudes surrounding it. Permanency of space, methodology, and practices were of little concern. If an initiative was ineffectual or ceased to be of use, ending the initiative and starting the next project was a natural part of service (Edge & Morgan 2017: 58).

At present, salvationists continue to volunteer their time and energy to community programmes through their local corps from soup kitchens to national disaster relief. However, the delivery of many services through The Salvation Army have become professionalised and regulated by government standards. This has resulted in the removal of large social welfare services from local corps to the professional social welfare space as they are managed by the Territorial [National] or Divisional [State] Salvation Army (Davies-Kildea 2017: 46). Because of the growing division between charity and church, some members feel as though the Christian message has been removed from their missional services as these services have become directed by 'non-Army' employees who do not understand The Salvation Army and its mission (Hill 2006: 116; Davies-Kildea 2017: 46). It is not unusual to overhear conversations between salvationists questioning their role as 'The Salvation Army' in the hope for reintegration of church and charity 'like it used to be' in fear of the charity overtaking their church; in essence, muting their message of salvation.

What is complex about this reflection is the determination of romanticised ideas and the realities of the early Salvation Army and the real complexities the mission faced that shaped its development. During the days of the founder, The Salvation Army was the quickest developing Christian movement of the late nineteenth century and the mission's impact was substantial (Murdoch 1994: 136; Edge & Morgan 2017: 59). A highly disruptive and controversial movement, early salvationists often experienced apathy and hostility from those in the community inspiring bands of 'hooligans' who would disrupt public evangelism (Boon 1966: 1). Perhaps what was more controversial were many of the foundational ideas The Salvation Army was predicated upon. For instance, The Salvation Army's choice to champion women in leadership roles as well as men has become a badge of honour for generations of salvationists (Walker 2001: 116 – 117).

From its very beginnings, the founders of The Salvation Army, Rev. William Booth (1829 - 1912) and Mrs Catherine Booth (née Mumford, 1829 - 1890), had no intention of creating another Christian denomination (Hill 2006: 35). William Booth forged his way through the Methodist New Connection as a circuit preacher in the north of England prior to his ordination in 1856 (Hattersley 1999: 88). Booth's wife Catherine gained prominence as a preacher during their stay in Gateshead, having stepped into the role during her husband's depression (Metrustery 2016: 6; Hattersley 1999: 113). During a time where women preachers were a novelty and often controversial, Catherine's skills as a preacher were quickly recognised and she became a popular evangelical (Walker 2001: 31 – 34). More academic than the Reverend Booth, Catherine brought to the pulpit an educated female voice in a primarily male oriented social sphere. A quality soon to become one of the foundational values upheld by the early Salvation Army.

Controversy and disagreement lead to William Booth's resignation from circuit preaching and the Methodist New Connection in 1861. In 1865 the Booths relocated to London and in the same year began to evangelise to the slums and urban working-class in the East End of London (Murdoch 1994: 3 – 4). In his book, *The History of the Salvation Army (1865 – 1878)*, Robert Sandall describes William Booth's first night preaching at Mile End Waste,

His commanding figure and forceful words immediately challenged attention. Passers-by stopped to listen. They drew nearer. Soon a crowd had gathered. Not before has these people heard sin denounced, the love of God extolled and

Salvation offered so plainly. The language used was the simple speech of their everyday life. Every point of importance, too, was aptly and clearly illustrated. They not only heard; they understood! (1947: 1 – 2).

For many salvationists, this first night marks the beginning of The Christian Mission. An outreach mission that would provide a transient evangelical space where volunteers, and other ministers, would preach to the people, win souls for Christ, and direct new converts to established local churches. However, many local churches were unwelcoming of working-class congregants wishing to participate in corporate worship. Because of this, many new converts were unsuccessful and returned to The Christian Mission (ibid: 48). Booth concluded,

1st. They would not go when sent. 2nd. They are not wanted. 3rd. We wanted some of them at least ourselves, to help in the business of saving others (Booth in Murdoch 1994: 48).

For the first few years The Christian Mission focused on evangelism and conversion. The theology of the mission was greatly influenced by American revivalist preaching (Hattersley 1999: 103; Walker 2001: 20). The energetic, emotional, and dramatic language of preachers like James Caughey, Charles G. Finney, and Phoebe Palmer, appealed to the evangelical sensibilities of the Booth's as the fiery nature of revivalist preaching spoke directly to the hearts and minds of the working classes (Hattersley 1999: 103 – 104). The Booths' adopted charismatic tropes such as public penitence, lay ministry, and public speaking and coupled them with the theological practices of British Wesleyanism (Murdoch 1994: 2 – 4). Charity was provided in an ad-hoc manner, but nothing of substance took. However, by 1878 the Christian Mission found its feet as 'The Salvation Army' (Sandall 1947: 230). The adaption of militaristic organisation spoke to the Victorian sensibilities as members were quickly organised into rank and file (Cox 2011: 14 – 15). For General Booth, militaristic organisation allowed for the immediate deployment of resources as well as the ability to galvanise his officers and soldiers into action (Hattersley 1999: 239). In its few years, the mission had grown from an organisation focused on evangelism and saving souls, to a mission recognising the importance of holistic intervention (Edge and Morgan 2017: 58 – 60). The mission quickly learned that "you cannot warm the hearts of people with God's love if they have an empty stomach and cold feet" (Booth in The Salvation Army Western Territory 2021: URL) and by the 1880s William and Catherine had interwoven the

importance of “earthy salvation” and “spiritual salvation” within the overall message and motivation of The Salvation Army (Edge and Morgan 2017: 6).

Throughout organisational history, salvationists have written and rewritten the events and characters that shaped the early days of the Army through historical recounts, educational materials, and public publications<sup>3</sup>. Whilst some of these histories portray a flair for the romantic, it is clear that many salvationists look to the past so it may inform their place in the world at present. Sandall’s description of Booth’s first experience preaching in the east end illustrates a flawless performance, mythologising the genesis of The Salvation Army as perfect and necessary. In the light of this mythological representation, The Salvation Army’s mission is portrayed as a serendipitous union between the slums of London and an evangelist looking to preach the gospel to the dislocated, marginalised, and downtrodden populous. That said, most in-house texts acknowledge the difficulties salvationists encountered as they ‘opened fire’<sup>4</sup> in new places. Whilst some found the message of these new salvationists moving, others stared and teased. In her book, *Pulling the Devil’s Kingdom Down*, Walker notes that,

Salvationists did not necessarily fear opposition because it could serve to build the movement, and Salvationists often embraced “persecution.” In some communities, opposition was casual and limited to tossing rotting vegetables and fish. In other instances, young men organized themselves into “Skeleton Armies,” which initiated serious, well-organized street frays (2001: 207).

Skeleton Armies were particularly malicious, often made up of working-class men who found the music and the preaching of temperance particularly offensive especially in rural townships (Winston 2000: 24). Salvationists experienced physical and verbal abuse, as well “minstrels, editorialists, and pundits stoned the group with words” (ibid). However, as salvationists embraced this persecution, their torment allowed them to reposition themselves as “champions of the working-class” against established churches that tended to reject the working-classes in their pews (Walker 2001: 207).

---

<sup>3</sup> History of the Salvation Army series, Year Books, Soldiership resources, inhouse publications and websites.

<sup>4</sup> To ‘open fire’ is to plant an outpost or corps in a new area.

A fundamental sociocultural trope of The Salvation Army is the awareness and general willingness ‘to serve’. “To love your neighbour as yourself” (Mark 12:31) is a common calling throughout Christianity as well as many other religions. However, *service* in The Salvation Army meant meeting the needs of their communities in practical and pragmatic ways. Many of these responses were to provide basic food, clothing, and shelter, whilst engaging with the larger social and structural issues. Unemployment and underemployment, poor housing, small wages, ‘sweating’ labour practices, child labour, and child sex exploitation, were some of the larger social injustices impacting the lower working-classes of the nineteenth century. The Army’s early activism arose from engaging with the symptoms of these injustices and a powerful desire to address the causes of these systemic problems (Coke et al., 2015: 2 – 6). Examples such as the “The Maiden Tribute of Modern Babylon” (1885), their response to the “Match Girls” strike in 1888, the establishment of the “Prison-Gate Brigade” outside Melbourne Gaol in 1883, and the “Doughnut Lassies” of World War One, have become powerful stories depicting a history of service and sacrifice, the bedrock on which modern Salvation Army Social Justice is built (Coke et al., 2015: 6; Edge and Morgan 2017: 6).

Reimagined stories, myths, and histories by salvationists capture a set of sensibilities that continue to shape who *they* are as they can be observed throughout many contrasting expressions of the denomination throughout Australia and The Salvation Army International. After the death of William Booth in 1912, The Salvation Army faced the challenges of the twentieth century, namely the solidification of practices and traditions, and an ever-quickenening shift in sociocultural expectations both within and external to the mission. Edge and Morgan note that after one generation (in this case after the death of the founder) progressive organisations tend to settle in an effort to maintain their self-identity (2017: 63; see also Hill 2006). This paradoxical trend creates traditions and, in this case, the start of stepping away from Booth’s original concepts of adaptability and the public world they resided (Hill 2016: 47; Mestrustery 2016: 2).

An example of the solidification and formalisation of tradition and practice is illustrated through the development of music-making within The Salvation Army. This concept will be explored more fully throughout this chapter. It is important to note the impact early iterations of The Salvation Army’s music department and the views of General Booth had on music-making within the mission for the next one hundred years (Herbert 1991: 47). Music within

The Salvation Army is transformed from a somewhat scruffy, improvised expression to a formalised idiom to be regulated and maintained within the orthodoxy of Salvationism.

### **2.2.1 The Salvation Army Australia**

During a wave of international growth, The Salvation Army made its way to the shores of Australia in 1880. Murdoch describes this period of The Salvation Army as “the world's fastest growing Christian sect in an age of missions” as the mission had “invaded” thirty-four countries by 1890 (1999: 136). Although some invasions were more successful than others, Edge and Morgan note that The Salvation Army formed stronger ties in countries influenced by the British Empire,

While gaining a global reach, The Salvation Army remained culturally tied to England. Even today the colonial influence remains and The Salvation Army is largely at its strongest in former colonies of the British Empire (2017: 59).

The invasion of The Salvation Army into colonial Australia began at the back of a greengrocer’s cart under a river red gum (Bolton 1980: 7). Salvationists John Gore and Edward Saunders met at an evangelical lecture and shared desire for public evangelism and a disillusionment with the local churches in Adelaide (ibid: 10). On the 5<sup>th</sup> of September 1880, accompanied by supporters and the general public, Gore and Saunders held the first Salvation Army open-air in Adelaide’s Botanic Park (Bolton 1980: 7; *The Salvation Army Yearbook* 2019: 61). In her book, *Booth’s Drum: The Salvation Army in Australia 1880 – 1980*, reporter and Salvation Army officer Major Barbara Bolton presents a detailed illustration of the rapid growth of the mission in Australia. By 1891, The Salvation Army had reached five states; New South Wales (1882), Victoria (1882), Tasmania (1883), Queensland (1885), and Western Australia (1891), with the city of Melbourne chosen for national headquarters until 1921 (ibid: 7 – 26). In 1921, The Salvation Army in Australia was reorganised into two territories, The Salvation Army Eastern Territory (Queensland, New South Wales, Australian Capital Territory) and The Salvation Army Southern Territory (Victoria, Tasmania, South Australia, Western Australia, Northern Territory) with territorial headquarters in Sydney and Melbourne (*The Salvation Army Yearbook* 2019: 61). 136 years after Gore and Saunders preached their first open-air, The Salvation Army in Australia launched the Australia One project in Adelaide; a project to unify both Australian Salvation Army territories (*The Salvation Army*

Yearbook 2017: 55). On the 1<sup>st</sup> of December 2018, the two Australian territories officially unified forming The Australia Territory (Simpson 2018: 17).

### **2.3 Music of the Army**

The beginning of Salvation Army music-making and the tradition of brass banding as an organisational feature has been attributed to a local builder from Salisbury, England, and his three sons. Charles William Fry (1838 – 1882) was a third-generation builder and talented musician playing violin, brass, piano, and conducted the Wesleyan Chapel Choir (Cox 2011: 30; Boon 1966: 2). Brindley Boon describes The Salvation Army's colourful 1878 reception as an invasion. Locals quickly took to the papers calling these strange evangelicals hooligans, a group of “disorderly Christians [who] parade in the streets singing revivalist hymns” (1966: 1). Although these disruptive evangelicals continued to be verbally abused, and at times physically assaulted, they continued to preach their open-air meetings in the streets attracting large crowds to their spectacle. Due to the hostility, Charles Fry and his sons were not necessarily asked to serve as musicians for worship, but rather as a distraction to help quell possible conflicts (Boon 1966: 2 – 3; Herbert 2000: 190; Holz 2006: 65). They formed a brass quintet and were so effective at attracting and directing crowds that William Booth employed the Fry's into full-time service (Cox 2011: 30; Holz 2006: 65 – 66).

Although Fry's brass ensemble was successful, Boon notes Booth's hesitation with regards to sanctioning the use of musical groups (Boon 1978: 13; Holz 2006: 68). Booth was wary of the vice's bands and choirs could foster. He observed that whilst these groups could enhance the corporate worship experience, music groups could fall to the sins of self-interest, elitism, and “professionalism” (Cox 2011: 25). In response to these concerns, Booth developed strict orders and regulations for ‘bandsmen’ (the term inclusive of women<sup>5</sup>) surrounding their commitment to their musical missional service (Holz 2006: 89; Cox 2011: 66). In 1881, Booth and the early Salvation Army music department released the second ‘General Orders: Brass Bands’ in order to dictate how bands were to be organised practically and spiritually complementing the nineteenth century salvationist sensibility (Cox 2011: 65). The general orders state that “No one will be admitted or retain a member of any Band who is not a member of The Army”, that all instruments played in the band be properly of The Salvation Army, and “In no case are instruments to be used to play anything but Salvation music, or on

---

<sup>5</sup> Early gender equality lost within a generation with regards to elite SA banding

any but Salvation Army service” (General Orders quoted in Cox 2011: 65; Herbert 1991: 47 - 48). Booth draws upon the ever-strengthening mechanisms of autocratic governance within the Army as he attempts to curtail early music-making practices within the realms of Salvationism in order to dissuade notions of brilliance and superiority by shifting the focus off music and back to the mission. These regulations framed how musicking would be performed within The Salvation Army for the next one-hundred-years influencing how salvationist musicians organised their musical lives and the separation of Salvation Army music publications from the ‘outside’ world (Herbert 1991: 47 – 48).

The strange contradiction regarding Booth’s music policies concerns the progressiveness of The Salvation Army. Unlike established Christian denominations of the time, The Salvation Army was quick to utilise new trends and technologies and adapt them in order to extend the mission (Winston 1999: 4). In her book, *Red-Hot and Righteous*, Diane Winston explains that,

The Army’s desire to “secularize religion” or to “religionize secular things” meant hallowing space, activities, objects, and even relationships. Most basically, Salvationists sought to saturate the secular with the sacred. To accomplish this they adapted two key facets of the commercial culture—performed entertainment and material objects—for spiritual purposes. Suffusing secular forms with religious content, Salvationists staged vaudeville shows and epic pageants that subverted the very culture that gave rise to these entertainments. Likewise, by investing ordinary objects with religious meaning, they attempted to transform consumption into consecration (ibid).

Much of the Army’s early music followed the “religionise secular things” principle as many popular secular songs, particularly music hall, were transformed into spiritual songs (Escott 1996: 43; Cox 2011; 27 – 29; Boon 1996; 4). Innovation and subversion regarding secular entertainment and objects was met by Booth with one overarching rule, that “any creative process or genre was legitimized by the sincerity of its offering in the spirit of worship” (Herbert 2000: 204). In this sense, adapting secular tunes in “the spirit of worship” allowed salvationists the opportunity to catch the ear of the public whilst functioning as a didactic device. Not only were music hall tunes, traditional folk songs, and ballads recognisable to the public, salvationists included the vernacular language of the day as “they could be sung ‘right



off, without any loss of time” (Booth in Cox 2011: 28). In this way, the adaptation of this type of music and musical expressions reinforced the working-class status of The Salvation Army, “some perhaps will call my taste vulgar, but mind I am a utilitarian; I go in, not for the ornamental, but the useful” (Booth in Walker 2001: 212).

### 2.3.1 Brass Bands

The choice to adapt secular entertainment and secular activities reinforced The Salvation Army’s station as middle-class within the wider sociocultural context of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. As salvationists further “religionised” the popular middle-class musical pastime brass banding, the Army tapped into a medium that was immediately understood “by people of their own class, who would go after them in their own resorts, who would speak to them in a language they understood and reach them by means suited to their own tastes” (Catherine Booth in Booth-Tucker 1892: 234). Brass banding became an extremely popular nineteenth century musical leisure activity coming into prominence during the industrial revolution (Herbert 2000: 4 – 5). It is suggested that brass bands started in the 1840s or 1850s during a point of the industrial revolution where the technology for brass instruments had improved to the point where these developments lent themselves to mass production, cheaper instruments, and greater ease of playing (ibid). From the Industrial Revolution grew the concept of ‘popular leisure’ time, a social phenomenon newly experienced by urban and agrarian workers (Cunningham 1980: 37 – 38). As the rise of the middle class challenged ‘traditional’ social systems, this growing population found themselves forging new types of leisure activities that were inclusive and meaningful (ibid). Within this new social space, the Victorian notion “to elevate and improve upon oneself” (Cunningham 1980: 39) found a place of expression in societies such as unionist groups, temperance societies, education clubs, radical religious movements, and many more (Cunningham 1980: 39 – 40; Rose 2001: 200). Brass bands and other musical groups quickly gained popularity as community groups often connected to a workplace, volunteer organisation, religious denomination, or leisure time (Russel, D 1987: 222). For the public, part of brass banding culture was to support your band similar to sporting teams. Competition and the rules that surrounded serious brass bands shaped the way bands governed themselves, often demanding large amounts of time and money from their players (Herbert 2000: 194). For the early Salvation Army, the sound and use of as popular group activity appealed to their mission, however, the conventional framework of volunteer brass bands contradicted the ethos of the mission (ibid). To ensure the sanctity of music and participation, General Booth

published a series of directives outlining the rules and expectations of salvationist bandmen (Herbert 1991: 47 – 48).

Brass bands were not an uncommon site on the streets, and like buskers, a cause of disruption to the soundscape of public spaces (Schafer 1977: 66) However, Holz explains that bands attached to churches, volunteer groups, and temperance movements were often out in the public and were acceptable as their behaviour was purposeful and well measured (2006: 64). In contrast, “SA [Salvation Army] bands would be radical, confrontational, and would challenge accepted practice, blaring forth their fervent evangelical message in manner that would cause, initially, controversy, violent opposition and general public disapproval” (ibid). The Salvation Army’s transformation of “an acceptable British institution” complemented salvationist sensibilities as a musical medium understood by the working-classes, especially as religious movements found themselves competing against the leisure market (Boon 1966: 4; Cunningham 1980: 179). After opposing most leisure activities, nineteenth century churches in Britain began to incorporate religious versions of popular secular entertainments in order to attract and maintain their congregational numbers (Cunningham 1980: 181). For salvationists, brass bands had the capacity to involve large groups of people, provide musical instruments and music education, engage their musical “gifts” in the form of service, and provide a communal space for members. In particular, bands gave men a practical, purposeful, and social place that fit within the church context<sup>6</sup>. Practically, brass bands supported the mission by:

1. Attracting people to the meetings. In this the brass band has great advantages. Out of doors, it can readily operate in any part of the district, and its pleasing strains, reaching farther than the human voice or than most other instruments, will draw many within earshot of the Army’s message, and often lead to their salvation.
2. Accompanying the singing and thereby helping and enriching it.
3. Conveying, by the association of ideas, salvation messages direct to the hearts of the hearers. This is likely to take place when tunes or selections are wisely chosen... (Orders and Regulations for Bands and Songster Brigades 1983: 6)

---

<sup>6</sup> Often women were the ones who volunteered and were involved within church life.

Cunningham suggests that throughout the nineteenth century Christian denominations began to allow secular entertainments such as dancing, outdoor games, and concert going as a part of everyday life (1980: 1979). In contrast, The Salvation Army framed supplementary entertainments in such a way that their vaudeville, pageants, musicals, and concerts seemingly blurred the secular and the sacred to the public (Winston 2000: 4). However, as The Salvation Army grew in sociocultural and institutional strength, the mission effectively set themselves apart from secular influence. The tension between the Army's adoption of "outside" technologies and the desire to maintain "a spirit of holiness" is evident in the decision to regulate the music played by Salvation Army bands,

From this date no Band will be allowed to play from music excepting 'The Salvation Army General Band Book' – the Journals published by us from time and time and other music issued from Headquarters. Quicksteps and Introductions are strictly prohibited ('General Order Respect Brass Bands', *War Cry*, 1885 in Cox 2011: 66).

This order, declared in 1885 by the Chief of Staff, set a clear precedent for the treatment of Salvation Army music well into the twentieth century. The declaration gave the General, and later the Salvation Army Music Department, complete control over the publication and regulation of Salvation Army music and instruments, setting Army music groups apart from the external musical world (Cox 2011: 66; Holz 2006: 88; Herbert 1991: 48). Although the Army established their own publishing and printing department, internally maintaining their musical material reinforced the exclusiveness of Salvation Army music groups (Cox 2011: 66; Russell 1987: 169). Russell explains that this exclusiveness placed Salvation Army brass bands outside of the secular "orthodox band tradition" encouraging a kind of "hostility between the two camps" (1987: 169). Not only were Salvation Army bands beginning to train and produce excellent players, but good Salvation Army bands were also able to maintain their performance spaces within the public sphere, a sphere well cultivated by "outside" brass bands (*ibid*).

### 2.3.2 The Music Department

In many ways, before the establishment of the Music Department, Salvation Army music did not exist (Cox 2011: 67). As has been established, the early sounds of The Salvation Army (or The Christian Mission) were adaptive to the musical instruments at hand. A variety of

ensembles coloured the musical landscape of the mission ranging from concertina bands, small orchestras, drum and fife bands, along with an assortment of scratch bands (Cox 2011: 57; Walker 2001: 102). The music used in worship and evangelical settings were either established hymns or adaptations of popular tunes arranged for the musical ensemble present. Prior to any official organisation of music content, music groups seemed to rely on secular brass publishers, and music leaders to notate and arrange pieces specific to their local needs (Steadman-Allen 1965: 171; Taylor 2011: 74). In September 1881, Fred Fry was appointed to develop and produce music for brass bands (Cox 2011: 59; Taylor 2011: 74). Fry managed to produce 13 sets of cards comprised of eight tunes each (Steadman-Allen 1965: 171; Cox 2011: 67). Although this first attempt at internal publishing was generally unsuccessful, it did open the doors to the development of The Salvation Army's Music Department, later titled the International Editorial Music Department (IEMD) (Taylor 2011: 74 – 75).

In 1883, Richard Slater joined the Music Department with Fred Fry and Henry Hill, under the supervision of Herbert Booth (Cox 2011: 58; Taylor 2011: 75). The three men were to publish music education tools (technique books and music tutoring manuals), tune books for bands and pianists, and the beginnings of band journals (1884) released monthly comprising of an additional two to four tunes (Steadman-Allen 1965: 171 – 176; Taylor 2011: 75). However, it soon became apparent that brass bands required more stimulating pieces (Holz 2006: 93). This challenged Booth's initial concerns surrounding music excellence, elitism, and professionalisation requiring him to reframe the terms and conditions of Salvation Army composition guidelines (Taylor 2011: 76 – 77). On 4 September 1901, the IEMD submitted a proposal to alter the original music publication policy (Holz 2006: 94). This proposal was granted under direction of three main guidelines:

1. An evangelical message was to remain the primary motivation behind all Salvation Army band music
2. Standard instrumentation was to be adopted for all Salvation Army bands, along exclusively brass band guidelines
3. Members of the IMED would provide model pieces to serve as examples for contribution from outside the department (Holz 2006: 94).

Ultimately, these changes gave the department the ability to extend the difficulty of compositions, arrangements, and instrumentation whilst slowly introduce new compositional

styles for bands (ibid). Although these changes were heavily supervised and reviewed by committee, the musical literature of The Salvation Army took an important turn towards their own internal sound and style of music making. The IMED took upon itself a number of initiatives to increase the production of repertoire including competitions (Cox 2011: 129). These competitions encouraged salvationists to compose brass band pieces in the hope that they would win and be published by the IMED. However, Cox notes Slater's disappointment at many of the entries as he records in his diary,

It was to me one of the most painful experiences in music I have ever had, and I left the room depressed in mind and exhausted in body from the effects of what I had listened to (Slater 1905 in Cox 2011: 129).

However, most contributors were self-taught musicians and willing to learn. These "painful experiences" often lead to moments of education and mentorship. Through this exchange, the department connected with composers and arrangers with real potential (ibid: 130). This was the making of a self-sufficient music-making Army and the foundation for outstanding compositional achievements for the future.

Accompanying the development of repertoire for bands, the standardisation of instrumentation solidified the style, sounds, and musical practices identified to be 'traditional' Salvation Army music at present. Other styles of bands (such as concertina bands and small string groups) did continue to come and go. However, the brass band became an institutionalised musical expression sustained by an "ambition to rationalise and standardise Army music, and to ensure that the place of music in worship and evangelism should develop according to a centrally determined design" (Herbert 2000: 204). The centralisation of publications meant that music-making salvationists (particularly in brass bands) could join in any band, play from their own tune book, and it would be the same regardless of the location. Additionally, centralisation provided the opportunity to censor most of the music played throughout The Salvation Army International and encourage compositional submissions through competition and mentorship (Cox 2011: 129). This level of institutional control led to a consistency of style and performance parameters. Although brass bands did include 'outside' music on occasion, The Salvation Army became so proficient at providing fresh material for their musical groups that there seemed to be little need for external sources. In this way, the IMED continued to shape the sounds and performance practices throughout the

mission and maintain a particular musical style that served The Salvation Army for over one hundred years.

### 2.3.3 Singing and Songsters

The advent of Salvation Army songsters is less clear. Unlike brass bands, the genesis of the songster brigade is not mythologised in the history and educational books produced by The Salvation Army. Most of the texts surrounding the history of Salvation Army music-making begin with the Fry Family genesis story and the development of the brass band within the mission. This may be due to the uniqueness of brass bands within the worship setting and the significant social capital they wield. What is apparent, is the importance William Booth placed on congregational singing and his complex relationship to formalised singing groups. Although this chapter has explored Booth's anxieties surrounding the potential vices of musical groups, this dilemma is central to the development and organisation of singing within The Salvation Army. In 1877, Booth addressed his concerns surrounding singing groups whilst outlining what he constituted as "Good Singing" (p202 – 203). Within *The Christian Mission Magazine*, he passionately outlines three requirements constituting good signing:

1. It must be congregational. All the people must sing ...
2. It must be HEARTY...
3. It must be USEFUL... (ibid: 203).

These three requirements approach singing in the most practical manner possible. In Booth's directness, he attempts to capture the purity of worship untainted by the temptations of self-involvement and elitism,

You won't get good singing by selecting a few people, converted or unconverted, and bringing them to the front to lead the congregation, just because they happen accidentally to have melodious voices ... Merely professional music is always a curse, and should you ever find a choir in connection with any hall in this mission, I give you my authority to take a besom and sweep it out, premising that you do it as lovingly as possible ... I have ever found choirs to be possessed of three devils, awkward, ugly, and impossible to cast out, without destroying the choir itself. That is the quarrelling devil, the dressing devil, and the courting devil, and the last is the worst of the three (ibid: 203 – 204).

Regardless of Booth's misgivings, singing groups were formed for the use of campaigns and eventually rogue singing brigades began to form as early as 1882 (Boon 1978: 10). By the 1890s the number of singing brigades grew quickly before the songsters were officially recognised by The Salvation Army in 1898 (ibid: 11; Holz 2006: 68). Boon notes that placing these groups within the musical landscape of The Salvation Army involved continuous efforts from local officers appealing to Booth directly (1978: 18). Unlike the adaption of brass bands, songsters were commonplace within the religious sphere and eventually took second place next to the aural and visual brilliance of brass bands. Accompanied by Booth's general suspiciousness of choirs, Cox notes Richard Slater's frustration at the irregular nature of songster brigades as they were often made up of young voices "lacking depth and force", chose pieces void of their skillset, and tended to stay quiet during congregational singing (2011: 99 – 100). In particular, the development of musicality of songster leaders was haphazard as local songster leaders were left to their own devices. Cox suggests this was due to the slow formalisation of songsters within the mission as well as the subordinate position songster leaders were held against bandmasters within local corps expressions (ibid). In fact, songster leaders would need to wait until 1934 before they would be provided a space on corps census boards placing them on equal footing with bandmasters regarding corps business (Boon 1978: 137).

However, like brass band music, music for organised singing became a compositional focus as The Salvation Army began to meet the needs of their choirs and publish their own music. Richard Slater and Herbert Booth composed songs for songster groups in the 1880s that supported brigades such as *The Salvation Songsters* (disbanded in 1885) and the *Singing, Speaking and Praying Brigade* in 1886 (Boon 1978: 8; Cox 2011: 60). The launch of *The Musical Salvationist* in 1886 became a monthly magazine providing many of the new songs for singing published by the International Editorial Music Department (IEMD) (Steadman-Allen 1966: 35). In *The Evolution of Salvation Army Music*, Steadman-Allen outlines how the IEMD published new songs in *The Musician*, noting that by 1913 the magazine had established a pattern,

1. General Songs:
  - (a) Salvation and evangelical.
  - (b) Holiness and devotional.

- (c) Praise.
  - (d) Experience.
2. Standard and new hymn and American-type gospel songs.
  3. The songsters' section.
  4. The soloist's page.
  5. The women songsters' page.
  6. The bandsmen's page.
  7. The young people's page (from January, 1925, to October, 1946, a single detachable young people's supplement was included) (ibid).

Although many of the works were published in simple verse and chorus form, Steadman-Allen notes that this magazine allowed for larger songs to be shared for events such as festival items and sessional anthems (ibid). Numerous books and collections of songster music have been published such as the popular eight editions of the *Gems for Songsters* (1922 – 1979) and *Sing to the Lord* (formerly *The Musical Salvationist*) series first printed in 1994 and continues today (Holz 2016: 161; Caffull, D., & R Caffull. 2015 – 2023: URL). However, *The Song Book of The Salvation Army* has prevailed as a congregational staple for salvationists throughout its reiterations. Each edition of *The Song Book of The Salvation Army* (or collection of Salvation Army songs) has presented a version of the song book which included new songs, the redaction of old songs no longer in use, and an attempt to address the musical issues of the day (Holz 2016: 161). For instance, the 1930 song book and brass band tune book contained differing arrangements of the same songs (Steadman-Allan 1966: 43). Since then, more attention has been given to the relationship between the tune book and the song book as well as the rearrangement of older tunes for congregational use (ibid). For many, *The Salvation Army Song Book* has become a central text to their daily worship and devotional practices, as the early Christian Mission and later Salvation Army relied on songs for didactic purposes,

The highest value of our singing after all has not been the mere gladness we have felt because of our own salvation, but the joy of pouring out the praises of our God to those who have not known Him, or arousing them by our singing to new thoughts and new life (Booth 1911: iv).



#### 2.3.4 Timbrel Brigades

Timbrel brigades within The Salvation Army sit within a unique position of neither wholly music nor dance. What is certain is that timbrel brigades are a worship expression unique unto The Salvation Army. This expression has developed specific ways of producing sound, movement, and performance in conjunction with the brass band tradition since its inception (Steadman-Allen 2001: URL; Hooper 1995: 6). Colloquially referred to as “timbrels”, these groups (brigades) and individuals are considered one of the three “traditional music” sections together with brass bands and songster brigades. Timbrel brigades are groups of predominately women who play a tambourine with a drumhead by striking it in a choreographed fashion either as single “beats” (gestures) or an entire routine made up of beats that involve arm and body movements. These routines (or drills) accompany up-beat brass band pieces during worship concerts and vibrant songs within services (especially during a chorus) (Stanfield 2007: 8; Hooper 1995: 6; Moyle 1993: 3). As well as an expression of worship, many note the attractiveness of a timbrel performance out in the public especially during marches, open air meetings, outreach, and public Christmas services (Parsons Kelly observation etc.) As two timbrelists explained,

The community was really excited when we marched down the street at Anzac Day playing timbrels. So, we started off, it was just going to be a one-off thing, for that Anzac Day and the response was so positive, we kept going and we played at the [Christmas] carols (Interview: 18.02.2019)

I think in regards to playing in public, it draws a crowd, which I think is a good thing ‘cause it’s something different, people haven’t seen it before and they’re interested in this strange thing that we’re playing (Interview: 27.08.2017)

This attractiveness has played an important role in The Salvation Army since the late nineteenth century as the Army continued to announce their presence through sound and publicly express the joy of their salvation to the crowds that gathered (Stanfield 2007: 12). Due to this role, leaders of timbrel brigades have continued to reinforce a balance between public performance and worship,

First and foremost, the playing of a timbrel brigade should be done in praise and honour to our Lord and Saviour. Therefore, careful thought must be given as to

how and what we present in the performance. We must remember to enhance the atmosphere of praise, joy and respect and at the same time – enjoy ourselves (Moyle 1993: 3).

In a small segment entitled “Tambourines”, Brindley Boon presents an account regarding the beginnings of timbrel playing in his book *Play the Music, Play!* (1966: 189 – 190). Boon proposes that the instrument gained popularity after an appeal in The Salvation Army’s weekly magazine, *The War Cry* (1881), where William Booth asked,

Do not our prophetesses lead their people with music and song under the bear heavens in the processions of mercy? Do they not play their music – if not timbrels – their violins, and cornets, and concertinas, and such other instruments as come to their hands? (Booth in Boon 1966: 189).

Regardless of the mission’s overt invitation for women to join brass bands, very few women took an interest (Cox 2011: 102). Nevertheless, one year after Booth’s article, The Salvation Army reported that 1 600 timbrels were purchased within six weeks, kick starting an expression almost entirely occupied by women (Boon 1966: 189). The instrument gave the salvationist women of the 1880s the opportunity to contribute to worship in a rousing way, attract a crowd, and collect monetary offerings in their instruments during open airs (Stanfield 2007: 13). As the excitement of the timbrel escalated, timbrelists were encouraged be mindful of their use in conjunction with the music of the band and congregational singing (Boon 1966: 190),

Regarding singing and the Timbrel, much more satisfactory use might be made of the instrument if it were played correctly. I have personally approached an Open-air Meeting when the banging of the Timbrels has almost overpowered the singing, making the words of the song indistinguishable (Marion 1947: 4)

Mrs Lieutenant-Colonel C. J. Marion speaks to the rudimentary years of timbrel playing. In her article to *The Musician*, Marion continues to suggest how this instrument should be employed during singing, “the ‘jingle’ should be used in preference to the ‘bang’; and it should be remembered that the sound of the voices must always be heard about the sound of the Timbrel” (ibid). Although Marion sharply addresses the state of timbrel playing during the

late 1940s, her article foreshadows a shift in the performance and delivery of timbrel playing within The Salvation Army.

Divisional timbrel leader Mrs Annette Hooper outlines the development of timbrel brigades took place over three stages throughout the mid-to-late twentieth century. In her 1995 article to *The Musician*, Hooper credits a significant shift within timbrel practices from simply keeping the beat to a new “method of ‘playing’ to the music” in the 1950s. By referring to band scores and mimicking instrumentation, this new approach led to more choreographed movements and routines that complemented the band rather than disrupt or overpower the music (Hooper 1995: 6). By the 1970s this shift in method and performance altered how timbrels collaborated with the brass band. Hooper notes that, “[Timbrel] leaders were challenged not only to produce beats but to select movements that would complement the piece of music, keeping in mind that this must be done in a tasteful manner” (ibid). Rather than only sticking the drum of the timbrel, timbrelists explored new ways of producing different sounds such as playing on their fingertips and readjusting the “grip” on the instrument to provide more movement. However, as the music composed and performed by brass bands began to involve significant changes in tempi, timbrel leaders were faced with the challenge of playing during slow movements. To address this dilemma, Hooper describes the use of a vocal soloist while the timbrel brigade involved slower gestures to keep the jingles quiet. Hooper’s third stage of development draws attention to an increase of elaborate routines to accompany a wave of bright, up-tempo compositions by men such as William Himes and Barry Gott during the 1980s. At times, timbrel routines took on greater complexities involving leg and arm movements and an increase in coordination between players within the brigade (ibid).

Although Hooper’s observations are anecdotal, Stanfield draws similar conclusions through his conversations with retired timbrelists exposed to the Australian and Canadian timbrel experience (2007: 13 – 14). He notes a similar three stage progression complimenting Hooper’s article as he pays close attention to the increase of routine complexity, aural and visual patterns, and awareness of musical expression and delivery (ibid).

It is clear is that the practice and performance of timbrels is regarded as a musical expression of worship unique to The Salvation Army. However, unlike the brass band and songster/singing traditions, timbrel brigades have not experienced a continuous influx of

method books and routines throughout their development from a central source. Over the years, many local manuals and small guides have been written by timbrel leaders to record and communicate the routines they have developed. Some have devised their own forms of notation drawing upon their experiences as musicians whilst others jot down each beat over a brass band score part (England nd: np; Stanfield 2007: 8; fieldwork observation). Today, leaders have begun to turn to video recording where they film themselves performing each part before sharing the footage with each member and relying on it for revision (fieldwork observation). Due to the lack of centrality, timbrel brigades and their leaders have learned from each other and developed distinctive local styles whilst collaborating with their neighbours both near and far,

...it wasn't necessarily about being perfect. They were people of all levels of ability for playing the timbrel. There were people from all different nations and cultures, and it was a commonality that was able to unite people together and I found that experience good and uplifting (Interview: 16.03.2019)

With this in mind, it is apparent that the history and progression of timbrel practices deserves greater investigation. Although timbrels are a distinctive feature of The Salvation Army that has involved generations of women<sup>7</sup>, there have been very few, if any, publications regarding the history and growth of timbrel practices comparable to the books, journal articles, and dissertations that address the brass band tradition<sup>8</sup>. Generally, timbrels have been included briefly in the texts of some publications concerned with brass bands (Boon 1966: 74 – 75, 189 – 190; Cox 2011: 99) and historical accounts of The Salvation Army. They are interwoven throughout the fabric of the denomination with little recognition of their history and sociocultural impact on The Salvation Army itself. One article presented by Norman Stanfield explores the adoption of the tambourine by the early Salvation Army and its historical association with ecstatic dance as an escape from paternalism. In doing so, he places early timbrel playing in conjunction with a rebelliousness against the patriarchal sensibilities of the nineteenth-century by appropriating the timbrel in the spirit of Miriam (2007: 12, 15),

---

<sup>7</sup> Men have participated in this expression. However, it is female dominated and has often led to men parodying this expression.

<sup>8</sup> Timbrel training guides and local knowledges have been recorded. However, it has been difficult to find an official publication sanctioned by The Salvation Army.

<sup>20</sup> Then Miriam the prophet, Aaron's sister, took a timbrel in her hand, and all the women followed her, with timbrels and dancing. <sup>21</sup> Miriam sang to them:

“Sing to the Lord,  
for he is highly exalted.  
Both horse and driver  
he has hurled into the sea” (NIV: Exodus 15:20).

Stanford provides an in-depth discussion surrounding the protagonist of Miriam as a strong feminist role model within the Christian context. In this way, he suggests that the qualities of the prophet Miriam complemented the sensibilities of Salvation Army women, particularly in the early mission (2007: 12, 15). Considering the early mission's affirmation of women preachers equal to men, Sanford's observations speak to the boldness of women within The Salvation Army as they carved out places for themselves as well as challenge the boundaries of the male sphere.

For timbrelists, Miriam is a strong biblical character who used a timbrel in the spirit of praise, however, grounding performance in Exodus 15:20 reinforces the primacy of public praise and worship over the novelty and spectacle that often attract the public in the first place,

When timbrelists are performing, it is important for them to remember why they are playing and for whom they are playing. Miriam, Moses' sister “took her timbrel and danced” (Exodus 15:20) in praise and thanksgiving to the Lord. As timbrelists and Christians this must be our first priority, playing our timbrel to the glory of the Lord (Moyle 1993: 3).

### 2.3.5 Rationalising excellence

Throughout their music-making lives, music groups within The Salvation Army continued to straddle the tension between music for excellence and music for worship. Since William Booth's weariness of self-interest, elitism, and 'professionalism' within the music space, The Salvation Army developed a framework that allowed the pursuit of excellence in the spirit of worship (Herbert 2000: 204). As the International Editorial Music Department (IEMD) continued to publish educational materials and music groups improved, salvationists required

a theological basis and language to legitimise their ambitions. Like other denominations, salvationist composers carved out a space between regulation and creativity by placing their craft in the service of the mission (ibid). The institutionalisation of this space may be observed in the Orders and Regulations,

Orders and Regulations 2000:

### **1. Supreme Aim**

The aim of all music making is to proclaim the gospel and help to accomplish The Salvation Army's mission.

### **4. Musicianship and Spiritual Power**

Belief in the value of music as a vehicle for worship and communication will require a commitment to the highest possible standards, while ensuring that performance never becomes an end in itself.

### **5. To be of Service**

All music sections/groups have a special responsibility:

- a) To engage in outreach activity of all kinds.
- b) To aid worship by:
  - i. Sensitively supporting/accompanying congregational singing and assisting in the teaching of new songs and choruses in co-operation with the meeting/worship leader.
  - ii. Contributing music which will enhance the spiritual purposes of the meeting/occasion.

On the surface the requirement for “the highest possible standards” may seem contradictory, however, Herbert suggests that salvationist music-makers found a balance between the desire of excellence, service, and worship (2000: 204). An example of this understanding may be observed in a passionate article published in *The Musician* where one bandmaster asserts, “we should not have the audacity to ask God’s blessing on mediocrity” (Gott 1993: 3). The rationale of excellence sat between the standardisation and censorship of music practices as they are offered in “the spirit of worship” (ibid). Although tensions exist within this rationale, the notion of music performance (or any creative expression) as an offering of worship within the context of Army service and performance legitimised the pursuit of professionalism,

especially as the mission moved towards more a greater ritualised experience (Taiz 2001: 157).

As The Salvation Army moved towards its second and third generations, the mission moved from a grassroots response to poverty and wider social issues to a formalised organisation (Hill 2006: 118). The eventual professionalisation of social welfare services and a desire to establish a respectability with middle class citizens moved Salvation Army membership away from the experiences of their forbears and closer to the pews of mainstream protestant denominations. Through their book, *Hallelujah Lads and Lasses: Remaking the Salvation Army in America, 1880 – 1930*, historian Lillian Tiaz provides an insightful investigation into The Salvation Army's response to evangelism, urbanisation, social welfare, and the refinement the mission in response to social change in the United States. Due to the global nature of the early Salvation Army, the refinement of the mission Tiaz illustrates may be observed in many countries the Army resided. Taiz explains that the spontaneous nature of the early Salvation Army was eventually tamed of its raucous and confronting energy and by the early twentieth century "Salvation Army bands...took on a 'disciplined professionalism' that led to the development of highly trained 'staff bands' playing carefully planned and executed musical programs" (2001: 157). Soon, brass bands were to participate in mainstream parades such as the Rose Parade, determining The Salvation Army as achieved a certain level of respectability (ibid). By the 1960s the Army had turned inward, shifting from an outward looking mission to an inwardly focused denomination concerned "with the interests, needs and desires of the existing members" (Hill 2006: 112). For a time, this rhetoric sustained a strong self-perpetuating style of *armyness* that continuously (re)enforced the importance and grandeur of *The Salvation Army*. However, this was to be relatively short lived, as the youth culture of the 1950s and 1960s brought with it the activism, scepticism, and mobility of youth and the worship wars (Hamilton 1999: 30).

#### **2.4 Modernity and the worship wars**

The final section of this chapter concerns what has been colloquially referred to as the worship wars. The research for this thesis took place during a time when the concepts of 'traditional' and 'contemporary' worship had settled into certain performative tropes. Although few academics have shed light on the impact of the worship wars within The Salvation Army, the impact of this conflict is, and was not, insignificant (Cleary 1993, 2006; Hill 2016). As salvationists negotiated a series of external shifts, the disruption of the worship

wars challenged the social *field(s)* of The Salvation Army in countless ways. Many reaffirmed their *salviness* in the face of this disruption as the early sounds of ‘contemporary’ Christian music clashed against the tonal pallet of brass bands and songster brigades. Others however, embraced the challenge of new sounds and the potential to adapt external worship expressions within the social world of The Salvation Army. This section presents a brief overview of the worship wars, the complexities surrounding significant social changes, and its impact on Salvation Army music-making within the Australian context.

It is safe to say that most mainstream protestant Christian denominations suffered a degree of conflict during the musical changes and challenges of the mid 1960s. This period is now recognised as the beginning of the worship wars. Spurred on by the rise of youth and rock ‘n’ roll culture of the 1950s and the folk revival of the 1960s and 1970s, Ingalls explains that the qualities of “folk simplicity” appealed to a new sound of congregational singing (2008: 59 – 61). The simplicity of folk sounding choruses and humble origin stories encouraged an ideology of authenticity surrounding worship (ibid). The people composing these songs wrote to the immediacy of their experiences framed in common chord progressions, colloquial language, limited vocal range, and repetitive choruses (Ingalls 2008: 64 – 66; Hamilton 1999: 31). However, worship and praise choruses such as these fell against a moral panic surrounding popular music, progressiveness, and a highly mobile and engaged youth culture. Hamilton notes that the division of acceptance and understanding perpetuated a sense of cultural dislocation between the traditional world (pre-World War II) and a progressiveness driven by the baby boomer generation (Nekola 2013: 408; Hamilton 1999: 30 – 31). Rooted in a general distrust of public and religious institutions, baby boomers sort to affirm their ideals and identities through music expressions, “when one chooses a musical style today, one is making a statement about whom one identifies with, what one’s values are, and ultimately, who one is” (ibid: 30). Although worship music was the easily identifiable signifier of change, the worship wars revolved around a collection of anxieties involving social change within and outside of religious spaces (Ruth 2017: 5).

Where many Christian music-makers of the 1960s and 1970s confronted traditional worship expressions by approaching contemporary (secular pop and rock) music as neutral, the 1980s saw the emergence of new Christian commercial spaces. In this new commercial environment for worship music, the production and performance of contemporary Christian music fell into two main categories: Contemporary Christian Music (CCM) and contemporary worship



music. Ingalls explains that “CCM is a presentationally oriented religious popular music genre intended for performance by solo artists and bands to listening audiences rather than for participatory congregational singing” (2018: 7). Although some Christian rock and pop artists participated in the secular contemporary music world, Stowe describes CCM as existing in a “parallel universe” reflecting the musical trends of the profane (2013: 2). In general, the commercialisation and experiences of music changed as technology transformed how individuals engaged with their favourite artists and applied these sounds within their lives (Frith 2007: 98; DeNora 2000: 47). In this sense, individuals may use music to frame moments, regulate emotional states, elevate moods, and distract from monotony (Frith 2007: 99; DeNora 2000: 47). As a result, however, the entire interaction with worship music is no longer determined by leadership but at the discretion of individuals in their own personal lives (Ruth and Lim 2017: np; Frith 2007: 201). The self-determinism and dislocation of worship music from religious spaces presented more challenges to established church communities. Churches were no longer the gatekeepers of worship music. As the boundaries between CCM and contemporary worship music blurred, few ‘traditional’ churches kept up with the influx of new content, shift in instrumentation, and adaption of digital technology with little conflict. The rise of the worship leader, casual attire, colloquial language, and the impact on worship practices appealed to many Christians as it also isolated many others. Although the terms ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ fall short of nuance, Evans suggests that ‘traditional’ refers to worship music embedded with a congregational history as opposed to ‘contemporary’ worship music that is brought into an established church space (2006: 58 – 59). For traditionalists, Evans describes a defensiveness that surrounds the sounds well known to a congregation that are interwoven throughout the rituals of their worship founded by previous generations (ibid). Contemporary worship music is often safeguarded as worship music that employs current music trends in the hope of reaching the unchurched (2006: 58). However, where long standing Christian denominations did not make space for such change or compromise, megachurches filled the void.

What is essential for this research is establishing an understanding of who, how, and what The Salvation Army in Australia found itself in contending with during the late 1980s into the 1990s. As The Salvation Army observed popular CCM from the United States and United Kingdom, the most prominent global megachurch to arise out of the suburbs of Sydney, New South Wales, was Hillsong Church. Founded in 1983, Hillsong Church hit the CCM and contemporary worship music scene in the early 1990s rapidly producing high quality worship

music that bridged both worship music genres (Possamai and Tittensor 2022: 144). Hillsong's facilities range from 300 seat auditoriums to their original campus building housing up to 3 500 seats (ibid). As Possamai and Tittensor explain, this large auditorium supports live video and audio recording, editing, and production facilities (ibid). Part of Hillsong's early success were their spectacular congregational sizes, sleek music and video production, and energetic branding as they appealed to middle-class Australians,

Hard-drumming and distorted-sounding electric guitars had prominent roles in driving the Hillsong worship experience. This musical quality stood in dramatic contrast from the production efforts of Maranatha! Music that shaped their projects toward a mild rock groove or the rich sonorous orchestral texture in Hosanna! Music ... Hillsong's invasion of the global contemporary worship world began especially after Darlene Zschech became the church's music director in 1995. The church's guitar-driven, full- rock music-making style made an impact on American contemporary worship both in terms of songwriting and in terms of the leading of services (Ruth and Lim 2017: np).

The appeal of Hillsong's presentation is wrapped up in the quality of 'liveness' mediated through video and audio recordings. The continuity between their live services and compact disks, televised services, and later, online streamed digital media, plays an important role in the consumption of their worship music. Through these media, Hillsong's services presented blocks of songs exemplifying how this music could be used within local contexts whilst facilitating a worship experience for individuals or small groups outside of traditional worship spaces (Ruth and Lim 2017: np). Their broadcasted services and worship video clips involve shots of mass corporate worship, providing greater context to the viewer as well as inviting them to connect in similar ways. In this way, the physically distant congregation is valued as highly as the present one as all participate in the consumption of Hillsong's brand,

The music, which is predominantly recorded live – an important aspect of the genre – lets parishioners vicariously engage in “coperformance by the congregation,” thereby enabling a sense of emotional uplift that takes individuals outside of themselves (Thornton, 2020: 112–113).

Riches and Wagner note that following the commercialisation of 1980s CCM, Hillsong (and other Australian megachurches such as Planetshakers and C3) organised itself around

sophisticated branding negotiated through community and identity formation (2012: 20). Although Hillsong's music could be encountered in many established Christian denominations, this intense style of branding was met with scepticism and a wariness of Hillsong's early prosperity preaching (ibid: 25). What was evident, however, was the pervasive nature of Hillsong's consumerist culture. Martyn Percy explains that,

On the one hand, consumerism can be all about the satiation of appetites, which then drives markets, desires and social life. On the other hand, consumerism provides a format for social intercourse, and produces a degree of individual and social satisfaction (2012: 171).

Religion, Percy reflects, settles between these definitions as contemporary consumer culture allows individuals to construct their own faith (ibid: 174). Like Hamilton's observations surrounding identity and the baby boomer generation, Percy notes that the consumerist approach to religion has shifted the approach to religious practices in western cultures. Rather than acknowledging the presence of the church in everyday life, "adherents to religions often do not see their faith-related practices as mandatory or obligatory, but rather as vocation, volunteerism or simply a matter of selection" (ibid). Because of this, denominations call out to seekers as an invitation rather than an imposing force in the lives of new adherents (ibid: 177). As pastor Nieuwhof suggests, "engagement is the new attendance...if you want your church to grow, stop trying to attract people. Start trying to engage people" (2023: URL). Nieuwhof's church, Connexus Church, exemplifies this approach from the outset stating on their website, "God's for you, your church should be too" (2022: URL). The following section explores the impact of the worship wars within The Salvation Army and how music became the representation of change and conflict.

#### 2.4.1 Impact on The Salvation Army

It is understandable then, why mainstream Christian denominations experienced the social changes from the 1960s onward within and outside of church culture so profoundly. It is also understandable why contemporary worship music and CCM presented itself as the proverbial scapegoat. Worship music within The Salvation Army remained relatively stable and understood within the regulations of Salvation Army publishing. Contemporary worship music and CCM represented an outside culture as it provided a tangible expression of change, and therefore, something tangible to challenge. Christian worship historian Lester Ruth explains,

Around 1993, American Protestants declared war on each other. And they did so over worship. Although the weapons used did not inflict physical harm on the combatants, there were wounds nonetheless. Bitter disagreements, angry arguments, and political machinations spilled across the church. Pastors and musicians were fired or sometimes left on their own, shaking the dust off of their feet. Congregants voted with their feet, or their wallets, or with raised hands if the question of which worship style was right was brought to a vote. And thus were the conflicts known as the worship wars. The most obvious front line of combat in the wars was music (2017: 3)

Ruth's description illustrates the devastating impact these conflicts had on church communities. Many congregations lost entire generations from their worship halls as the conflicting messaging surrounding identity and self-expression, service and commitment, and the pressures of late twentieth and early twenty-first century life settled into the rival categories of 'traditional' and 'contemporary'. Where megachurches framed their worship practices around the sounds of contemporary worship music, technology, and commercialisation, protestant denominations such as The Salvation Army struggled to find their feet in the midst of rapid change.

Few scholars have written specially to the impact of the worship wars within The Salvation Army; however, the effects of this period have not passed unacknowledged (Cleary 1993, 2006; Hill 2016). Like many established mainstream churches, the significance of the worship wars challenged similar themes surrounding identity, community, expression, purpose, and theology throughout the mission. However, The Salvation Army's reception and negotiation of the sociocultural shifts of the 1960s onwards confronted core beliefs beyond the 'who are we'? It questioned the 'what have we become'? The early Christian Mission prided itself as being set aside from the established denominations who rejected the poor working-class citizens of the nineteenth century. This legacy continued to inform Salvationism well into the twenty-first century particularly after the honourable reputation the Army had earned itself from serving in both world wars. However, the establishment of an acceptable middle-class reputation placed The Salvation Army in a conflicting position where the mission became "a nation within the nations, with its own art and culture and music", a secure, insular culture with the ability to sustain itself for a significant period (Bramwell

Booth in Cleary 2006: 43). Hill (2006) and Taiz (2001) explain that by the second and third generation of salvationists, The Salvation Army had formalised its traditions, established an intricate organisational structure, and lifted its general membership (soldiership) from the undereducated working-class to high school and university educated professionals (Taiz 2001: 155). These generations were the children and grandchildren of the poverty-stricken working class from the Industrial Revolution. They understood the mission, continued in the sights and sounds of the early Army, but refined it in ways that deemed it palatable to middle-class culture (Hill 2006: 111). The professionalisation William Booth had feared crept into the social consciousness of the Army transforming a progressive and proactive mission into an established church (Taiz 2001: 144).

The worship wars arrived on the doorstep of The Salvation Army during a time of self-sustainability where the internal cultural practices of the time continued to reinforce a sense of continuity. In his paper, *Salvationist Worship – A Historical Perspective*, John Cleary speaks to the initial response of The Salvation Army to the changes of worship music interest noting their proactive response to the challenge (2006). Cleary suggests that the formation of the pop band, the *Joystrings*, was The Salvation Army's answer to the emerging youth culture of the 1960s,

[General] Coutts suggested that perhaps the college might come up with a response to the new youth culture. His challenge was taken up by a group of cadets including Joy Webb. Modern rock was emerging from Skiffle and Rhythm & Blues. These were not difficult musical forms, and within a few months The Salvation Army had elbowed its way back to the centre of popular culture. The Joystrings were initially seen as a pop novelty, but with the success of a series of songs and albums, they were recognised as “legit” artists in the vibrant UK pop scene at a time when British pop dominated the world with the Mersey sound of the Beatles, The Rolling Stones, Manfred Mann, and a myriad of other groups. Here was the Army living up to the best of its traditions of positive engagement with popular culture, and proving its capacity to successfully respond to the most dramatic shifts in cultural style (ibid, 44).

However, as Cleary and Hill note, the sustainability of the *Joystrings* was relatively short lived. The Salvation Army celebrated its first one hundred years in 1965, reinforcing the

traditional cultural and musical practices of the Army and in doing so, left musical innovations such as the *Joystings* to the side (Cleary 2006: 44 – 45; Hill 2006: 19). Although this contemporary music group reached the public and spoke to a new generation of salvationists, the *Joystings* were often perceived as a frivolous novelty where “some prominent leaders were determined it should be short lived” (*The Musician* 1993: 5). What is important to note is the success of ‘traditional’ Salvation Army music composition and publication that coincided at the time. Although Salvation Army brass bands occupied a similar space as church choirs and organs, The Salvation Army’s music publishing department and composers had reached world class standards, perpetuating the significance and strength of brass band culture throughout The Salvation Army of the west (Cleary 2006: 45). As an organisation, the Army officially encountered the impact of the worship wars in the 1980s as contemporary Christian music (CCM) and contemporary worship music flooded the commercial market. ‘Music’ being the tangible signifier of change, brought into question the very identity and purpose of the Army by highlighting the gradual shift from ‘mission’ to ‘church’ (Hill 2006: 39). Like many Christian denominations around them, The Salvation Army struggled to juggle the onslaught of Christian music from the ‘outside’ and the theological content of these songs often deemed shallow, self-centred, and overly emotional (Cleary 2006: 34). In 1992, The Salvation Army relinquished its restrictions on Army publications allowing ‘outsiders’ the opportunity to purchase and play their music (Herbert 2000: 187). Herbert observes that this was an attempt to “serve salvationists, and to ensure that they were protected in both practical and spiritual terms from the fickle whims of open capitalism” (ibid: 188). Regardless of restrictions, Salvation Army music was already in circulation and salvationists were already engaged with external CCM, contemporary worship music, and the capitalist culture that surrounded it.

In the midst of the chaos, a secondary crisis arose. As has been noted, The Salvation Army prided itself on a one-hundred-year-old legacy of grassroots progressiveness; a movement that met the people ‘in the field’ during their moments of physical and spiritual crisis. However, CCM, and the cultures surrounding it, brought into question the legitimacy of The Salvation Army’s legacy and the fundamental purpose and practice of Salvationism in the late twentieth century. From the ‘front line battle’ of music-making to internal cultural conflicts, the Army struggled to confront the reality of its state as an established church, of the world they had built, and the need to (re)engage as salvationists with the outside world if they were going to survive. Jonathan Dueck’s approach to the worship wars from the viewpoint of sociocultural

relationships and experiences provides a valuable framework to explore the institutional, communal, and personal impact these challenges and conflicts presented (2017: 4). Congregational music-making is greater than the sounds of ‘the church’. It holds the “life stories in which particular genres of music or even individual songs reminded them of – even placed them in, once again – relationships with friends and loved ones” (ibid: 5). Armed with this awareness, it is understandable why many salvationists perceived and experienced such rapid change as conflict rather than (re)engagement. Major Joy Webb from the *Joystings* recalls,

We forget that some of the things that we do and say are completely foreign to the majority of people. Contemporary styles have never been as fully understood within the Army as they now are in other parts of the Christian Church. People feel threatened by them, especially if they can’t actually do them themselves... the use of worship bands did not start in the Army; we caught it from other churches. I and others have tried to have some kind of linking music, bridging the gap between traditional and contemporary style (*The Musician* 1993: 5).

The call for salvationists to compose their own contemporary worship music has been long standing (Cleary 2006: 331; *The Musician* 1993: 5). At the beginning of the twenty-first century, Cleary recalls a number of big bands, worship bands, events, and cross-over music arrangements where salvationists explored the new sounds of the Army within the Australian context noting that,

...the [Salvation Army] must continue to make its own music. Whether they are classic brass, local ensembles, worship bands, or big bands, the musicians of The Salvation Army must sing an alternative to the self-absorbed spiritual pap that passes for much Contemporary Christian Music (2006: 331).

Some composers and arrangers have continued to develop new material for brass bands and ensembles, vocal music for songster brigades, and contemporary worship music. However, as Salvation Army music-makers contend with the quality and quantity of CCM and contemporary worship music, many popular ‘outside’ worship songs have made their way into the arrangements of Salvation Army brass music, the repertoire for songsters, and *The songbook of The Salvation Army* (2015). Salvation Army publishing processes have not

maintained pace with external production companies often leaving the sounds of The Salvation Army to be determined by local music leaders, composers and arrangers, and worship music expressions themselves.

The fieldwork conducted for this research project falls against the backdrop of the worship wars as Australian salvationists struggle with the aftermath of these conflicts and the meaning of 'traditional' and 'contemporary' worship music. In the decades that follow the peak of the worship wars the dichotomy between tradition and contemporary has shifted slightly from a threat to identity (yet still a central issue) to survival. Attendance has lessened significantly, placing greater pressure on Salvation Army music-makers to continue performing the sounds of the Army and the continuation of the mission. This research project investigates how salvationists in Australia continue to experience and engage with their *salviness* as they find *new ways of being*.



## Chapter 3: Methodology

### 3.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the methodological approach applied throughout the research project to address the overarching question,

*How do salvationists maintain their 'salviveness,' or their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity through music-making activities, and what forms these may take at present?*

The theoretical framework and design of the study involved qualitative research methods. Qualitative research provides the opportunity to delve into the realities of another's world(s) and explore their perspectives, experiences, and construction of meaning making within the 'everydayness' of their lives (Flick 2007: 2; Suter 2012: 344). Although qualitative research is explored further within this chapter, Denzin and Lincoln offer the following as a concise definition for qualitative research,

Qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible. These practices transform the world. They turn the world into a series of representations, including field notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings, and memos to the self. At this level, qualitative research involves an interpretive, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them (2005: 3).

With this in mind, the design of the research project follows the well-trodden path from previous academics providing a sound methodological process. This chapter then outlines the research period and approach to fieldwork, ethical considerations, data collection and analysis, limitations, and importantly, placement of the researcher.

The value of this research project lies in the data provided by the generous participants who contributed to this study. For the future, this study involved the collection of new data such as oral histories and unpublished historical records that may be of value to those studying Salvation Army history, music, culture, and the organisation. This study aims to fill a gap in

the literature as it discusses the experiences of music-making, meaning-making, change, and adaption within The Salvation Army Australia.

### **3.2 Placement of the self as researcher**

This section of the chapter explores the position as an organisational ‘insider/outsider’, the unique advantages this position afforded during fieldwork, and the continuous negotiation of reflexivity and co-creation throughout the research project.

#### **3.2.1 The Placement of Self and the Malleable Insider/Outsider Dynamic**

As an organisational member, my interest for this research arose from my own introduction to and interactions with The Salvation Army and their unique ways of making music. Rather than having grown-up in this denomination, I found myself as a reactive learner taking in a set of abstract qualities and mythologies that were socially and culturally attributed to *salvoness* (Eraut 2000: 115). I engaged with this learning process through the musical groups at my local corps and was introduced to “the way things were done”. As a newcomer and a young musician, I was welcomed warmly and invited to join the musical sections. Although I am a wind musician, I found myself learning instruments to ‘fit in’ with the traditional Salvation Army brass aesthetic. Wind instruments were not discouraged, and I did play with a pianist for the ‘non-brass’ segments (and was encouraged to keep playing), however there seemed a clear cultural and structural distinction between how traditional Salvation Army music was approached and organised in comparison to the ‘other musics’. Throughout the years of my attendance at an inner-city corps and well into this research, I am pleased to have encountered diverse musical and creative arts expressions and as I began to delve into these interactions more, I become increasingly interested in how and why salvationists ‘do the music’.

The Insider researcher status/position arose in contrast to the outsider, non-member, researcher status, traditionally associated with social scientists engaged with researching peoples and their cultures dissimilar from their own (Burnim 1985: 432). It was heralded that the outsider researcher inhabits a status that enables ‘objective’ observation and ‘safeguards’ against the possibility of personal bias (Kanuha 2000: 440; Tedlock 2003: 181; Burnim 1985: 432). Although the outsider position may encourage a certain air of ‘objectivity’ and the Insider may possess certain privileged insights in the field, in practice, both research positions rarely maintain a clear distinction between ‘in’ and ‘out’ whilst engaging with the research process.

As the nature of ethnography relies on human interaction, Mercer suggests that both statuses are malleable as humans are relational and recognise inherent similarities and differences between each other (2007: 5 – 6). Similarities and differences such as gender, age, class, ethnicity, sexual orientation, culture, or organisational affiliation recognised between researchers and participants can alter how they interact with each other, the types of information and experiences shared, and how helpful and forthcoming they may be. No longer a fixed state, Mercer proposes that the researcher's social position in relation to their field and participants moves along a continuum that is not determined by "a single status set" of insider/outsider qualities but rather "a complement of variously interrelated statuses which interact to affect both their behaviour and perspectives" (Merton 1972: 22 in Mercer 2007). For this research, an important element of the status set is religious identity. In their paper, *Turning the Categories Inside-Out: Complex Identifications and Multiple Interactions in Religious Ethnography* (2006), Ganiel and Mitchell explore the fluidity of the insider/outsider role and the permeable nature of social identities. In particular, they focus their discussion on how religious identity may impact the collection and interpretation of data and question if religious identity places the researcher in the position of insider or outsider. In doing so, Ganiel and Mitchell offer personal reflections on their experiences as researchers in Northern Ireland. Interestingly, they note that they expected the "salvation boundary" to clearly define insider/outsider positions (one researcher identifying as Christian and the other as a religious backslider) (ibid: 8 – 10). However, they found that other identity factors such as age, gender, educational status, and nationalities held greater significance than their religious identities (ibid: 11 – 13). Rather than the salvation boundary defining insiderness or outsidership, Ganiel and Mitchell conclude that all aspects of their identities impacted their interactions with their participants and their relationship to the collection and interpretation of data (ibid: 17 – 18). Therefore, as researchers, we move beyond the binary of insider and outsider, acknowledging the qualities both standpoints assume, yet recognise their non-existence.

For myself as the ethnographer, understanding where I sat along the continuum became an integral part of my ethnographic process. Each corps, room, event, and person I spoke to involved the continuous negotiation of reorienting my degree on insiderness and outsidership. In many ways, orienting where and how everyone is placed within the

denomination is part of normal salvationist conversation. When entering a new corps, it is expected to be asked where you come from, who you are related to, what corps do you attend, do you know such-and-such, and so on. By the end of this exchange, both parties have pieced together an idea of who, where, and how each person is connected, and how they too, are now connected. As a researcher, these conversations provided the opportunity to learn where I sat along the insider/outsider continuum, whilst introducing my research and establishing relationships with participants within the field. A second and equally significant step in establishing my place within the field was the use of uniform. As an organisational member, I already understood the significance of uniform within The Salvation Army and the different meanings each iteration represents. The uniforms worn within the field instantly communicated my member status to others within the denomination. In a 'traditional corps' (or uniformed corps) I wore 'full uniform' as opposed to a 'modern corps' where I wore a Salvation Army t-shirt or more casual version of the full uniform. Generally, it was easy to learn from 'Army talk' and social media where each corps fell along the spectrum of traditional and modern. My anticipation and adaption of each uniform helped to signify that I had entered the field as an insider and indicated my knowledge of moving between different expressions of The Salvation Army. One distinction I did chose to make was the adaption of neutral signifiers when wearing a version of the full uniform. Salvationists are quick to read a uniform to determine your rank, your origin, and at times, what musical expressions you are involved in. These are often displayed by the colour of your epaulets and the badges pressed into them. When taking on the researcher role, I made a conscious decision to remove any badges that indicated my local corps and the musical groups I may be involved with. Instead, I chose to wear 'neutral' soldier epaulets (a simple 'S' on each navy-blue epaulet) and wear a small silver badge on my shirt with my university crest. Within the field this small badge signified that I was an outsider with a purpose and opened more opportunities to engage participants. The questions and comments such as, "what is that badge for?" or "oh the University of Sydney..." offered the opportunity to signpost my presence as a researcher and talk about the project as we partook in our usual introductory conversations. Often these conversations lead to corps folk introducing me to the 'right person' and to participant recruitment. By understanding the uniform and its significance, my insider knowledge and experience allowed me to anticipate the kinds of places and spaces I would encounter and aided me as the researcher, the opportunity to adapt to each fieldwork site accordingly. As a conversation starter I was able to utilise an attribute salvationists rely upon to relate to each other in culturally appropriate ways. My insider knowledge may have provided "a more

complete knowledge than that available to Outsiders”, however my otherness or *outsiderness* still existed in the engagement of the unknown (ibid).

### 3.2.2 Co-creation and Reflexivity

Reflexivity is an essential feature of all social science research, especially researchers who have engaged with the ethnographic process (Whitaker & Atkinson 2019: 2; O'Reilly 2012: 3; Aull Davies 2008: 3). It is part of the ethnographer's research process to think critically about the social worlds they occupy in relation to their research and how their experiences may affect the topics, peoples, events, and places chosen to engage with (O'Reilly 2012: 3-4; Aull Davies 2008: 3-5). In essence, reflexivity is an intrinsic part of the research process where the researcher pays close attention to the choices made throughout the research process and acknowledges the fact that they too make up part of the world in which they study (ibid). Often this acknowledgement leads to concerns regarding objectivity and subjectivity, a debate closely aligned to our previous discussion concerning insider and outsider researcher dynamics (Aull Davies 2008: 3-5). Some researchers attempt to limit the number of social interactions with their participants and the field by employing quite observation from a distance and structured questionnaires and interviews. Although these attempts to lessen the impact of the researcher's influence are admirable, critical reflexive engagement involves understanding the extent of the researcher's impact upon each element of the research design (ibid). Denscombe reminds us that “what is observed during fieldwork observation is a process that relies on what the researcher already knows and already believes, and it is not a voyage of discovery which starts with a clean sheet” (2014: 88). However, reflexivity is a healthy practise that can aid the researcher, researched, and the reader understand the collaborative nature of the ethnographic process. Rather than constrict the position of the researcher in an attempt to remove their presence from the data, we may invite the ‘intrusive self’ into the equation as a collaborative voice amongst the voices our participants (O'Reilly 2012: 5).

As an organisational insider, my tacit knowledge informed the research process in a myriad of ways. However, this knowledge and experience allowed me as the ethnographer the opportunity to connect with participants as co-creators sharing in the research process rather than simply taking information from them. Although many of my participants were older and had experienced The Salvation Army longer than I, my experience as a music-making salvationist facilitated a rapport between myself and participants. Because of this we were

able to communicate within the world of the Army as they shared their stories and opinions of the past and present. Identifying as “salvo”, not born-and-raised Army, and younger than many participants placed me in a unique position where I was able to critically engage with my participants, step back and observe the field, whilst still connect as a cultural insider. Through these interactions it became apparent that as a cultural bearer suspended between cultural spheres, salvationists trusted their stories and experiences with me in the knowledge that they were understood and represented accurately (Burnim 1985: 437). Through their own research as a cultural insider, Burnim reflects that,

The cultural insider who conducts field research is commonly viewed as a potential contributor to the group, rather than an exploiter. The insider has the opportunity to become a source of cultural reinforcement, and as a by-product, a source of cultural pride. This fact can play a major role in the nature and degree of cooperation the researcher receives in executing the field project. (ibid: 445)

Within my own fieldwork experience, there was an underlying sense of safeguarding the opinions of participants that had been held for years. It is likely that these conversations had taken place in the confines of the home or in trusted relationships. But for many, our conversations as researcher and participant/s were the first opportunity for these music-makers to be formally asked what their opinions were in a safe space. My position as a music-making, salvationist insider who still remain as an occasional outsider due to my stauts as researcher and student, but also due to my comparative youth and my status as a woman, provided the space for these participants to speak into a project that sought to address their concerns and interests that was not biased in another Salvation Army publication. For many contributors, the prospect of an investigation into their music-making traditions by an insider writing for an “outside” publication served as “a source of cultural pride” as it reinforced a sense of value (ibid). With this in mind, I relied on a constant reflexive state as I oscillated between the roles of researcher and participating salvationist, honouring of the importance participants placed on *their salvoness* and *their* Salvation Army. Co-creation provided invaluable insights into a specific time and place within an organisation experiencing crisis and great change.

### 3.3 Qualitative Research

The findings of this thesis are grounded in qualitative data. Qualitative research methodologies rely on data created by sophisticated words and images such as social interaction and participant observation (Denscome 2014: 276). This approach to such data places an “emphasis on the qualities of entities and on processes and meanings that are not experimentally examined or measured ... in terms of quantity, amount, intensity, or frequency” (USCLibraries 2022: URL). As a category, qualitative research is comprised of many methods such as case studies, participation, interviewing, documents and observation, each concerned with investigating the nature of human experience and the layers of meaning interwoven throughout complex social fields (Denzin and Lincoln 2005: 10; USC Libraries 2022: URL). The employment of qualitative methods may be considered more as establishing a perspective as the research and researcher are placed “in the world” with the intention of transcribing their surroundings as best as possible (Denzin and Lincoln 2003: 4 – 5). Because of this, qualitative researchers draw upon numerous approaches to record data within the research field aiming to capture the most detailed description of the moment at hand (ibid).

Due to the nature of the research question outlined in chapter one, I have engaged with the research process as a qualitative researcher. Throughout the research, I employed methods that followed the sound and well-trodden path by previous academics. The malleability of qualitative research methods allowed the research process to be flexible, creative, inclusive, sensitive, and open especially when working with fieldwork sites and participants. These qualities brought to the data a deeper, more diverse understanding to the topics and themes explored throughout the research.

#### 3.3.1 The Research Design

From the start of this research, it was clear that this project would involve many music-making salvationists, contrasting locations and events, and time. To address the research question, it became apparent that a long-term ethnographic fieldwork study would generate a richer and more diverse data set by providing a deeper understanding of the topic.

Ethnography as a holistic research approach involving observation and participation in the communities studied (Coffey 2021: 2; Denscombe 2010: 80) In essence, the researcher immerses themselves “in the world”, and engages with the sociocultural aspects of the environment and the communities within the field for an extended period of time (Rice 2014: 27 – 28). Through this process, ethnographers bring together experiences that are meaningful

as “human behaviour is generated from and informed by meaningfulness” (Tedlock 2003: 165). As a social research method, ethnographers can involve fieldwork, participant observation, interviews, and questionnaires into their fieldwork practice (Rice 2014: 28 – 43). These methods help to offer a snapshot of the social world so “ethnographers can better understand the beliefs, motivations, and behaviours of their subjects than they can by using any other approach” (Tedlock 2003: 166).

The fieldwork for this research took place over a 22-month period from 2017 to 2019 and involved 66 fieldwork sites ranging from rural to urban locations in Queensland, New South Wales, and Victoria, Australia. Local corps, music group leaders, and event organisers were all contacted prior to fieldwork which often resulted in a discussion surrounding the most appropriate time to attend the corps, rehearsal, meeting etc. In addition to local permissions, I received clearance from The Salvation Army Headquarters and support from the Territorial Worship Arts Co-ordinator.

### 3.3.2 Choosing Locations

As has been established in the previous chapter, The Salvation Army is a diverse international denomination. Initially when scaffolding this research, I intended to capture The Salvation Army music-making practices of one country, Australia. However, it quickly became apparent that this was an unfeasible expectation due to the size of the country, a limitation on time, a small research team (one person), and the financial demands of long-distance travel. I refocused the scope of the research to include three major cities on the east coast, their surrounding suburban corps, and rural corps.

The choice of fieldwork locations was determined by a collection of factors, including diversity, location, time, availability, accessibility, and finance. My primary goal was to conduct fieldwork across a group of corps that represented a diverse expression of Salvationism in Australia. Although each corps is unique, corps may be grouped into categories that help salvationists understand the culture of each place. Differences may be explained as ‘traditional’ or ‘uniformed’, ‘modern’ or ‘nonuniformed’, ‘multicultural’ indicating an obvious diversity of backgrounds, and ‘rural’ describing a small-town corps



often with limited resources<sup>9</sup>. These terms are part of colloquialism salvationists use when describing place and their worship expression. Throughout the research period I conducted fieldwork at 25 corps and successfully connected to corps that fit within these categorises, and many others that sit between them. Generally, I attended each corps once. However, there were a few corps I visited twice to gain more data surrounding certain worship and music expressions unique to their corps. Aside corps fieldwork sites, I attended national Salvation Army events, local concerts, rehearsals, community music information nights, music education days, a Salvation Army music conference, and an international music development conference call as an observer. Attending these events were organised around conducting fieldwork at local corps as many occurred during the week or took precedence over a local corps visit.<sup>10</sup>

Access to fieldwork sites relied upon correspondence and clearance from personnel in charge such as a local officer, music leader, event organiser etc. Requesting permission relied on lengthy email correspondence. Personnel in charge were emailed a detailed explanation of the research project, a Participation Information Statement and Permission to Conduct Research form and were given the opportunity to respond or not. A few personnel did not reply which required alterations to the research plan. However, this form of correspondence aided in gaining an understanding of the fieldwork site and planning when would be the most appropriate time to visit. Therefore, the selection process of fieldwork sites became less systematic and more strategic in execution.

A smaller portion of the fieldwork was conducted online. Throughout the research period The Salvation Army headquarters, music groups, and some local corps live streamed their events online via social media profiles on Facebook or on their official websites as an embedded livestream. All events were published as ‘public’ and did not require an invitation or password to access them. Profiles for corps, music groups, and music departments served useful for background information, maintaining up-to-date information (such as concert dates), and watching live streamed content. To create a fieldwork boundary within the social media field, extra groups such as band appreciation groups and follower comments were not

---

<sup>9</sup> I have heard of people referring to urban corps as “like a rural corps” because of the small congregation and limited resources (resources including music-makers). Often ‘multicultural’ indicates a suburban corps that involve a large refugee community and/or peoples from another country other than white Australia.

<sup>10</sup> During national events it is not unusual for the surrounding corps to close and attend the larger event rather than stay open.

included in this study as well as general comments within the official group websites and profiles I engaged (Markham 2013: 438). These sources were accessed as a platform for public information and not as an opportunity for gathering public opinion.<sup>1112</sup>

Throughout the research project participant identities have remained anonymous as well as the de-identification of events, spaces, and places observed during the research period.

### 3.3.3 Participant Observation

As has previously been explored, the ethnographic approach involves the use of multiple methods to help build a deeper understanding of the relationships enacted between location, context, and people. Participant observation is the primary method of ethnography as it involves interaction and immersion in the field over an extended period of time (Guest, Namey & Mitchell 2017: 2). Throughout the research period, I engaged with each fieldwork site as a participant observer where participants within the field were aware of my presence. Although participating ‘openly’ may have altered the field, the events I attended were almost always pre-planned (such as a service or large event) or steeped in a weekly habitual state. I was welcomed to the corps a few times during the announcements segment in a meeting, however this is extremely regular and often I was not the only visitor recognised. Within rehearsals, I was also welcomed with a quick disclosure of my role, research, and open opportunity to speak to me afterwards about the work and a possible questionnaire. After this announcement I received no special attention and the rehearsals continued as normal.

The ethnographic approach is labour intensive, requires building rapport with participants, and investing time to gather an appropriate amount of data (Guest, Namey & Mitchell 2017: 5; Dencombe 2008: 218). Immersion within the field as a participant observer involves small talk, conducting informal interviews, maintaining an awareness of the environment, and discreetly taking field notes whilst attempting to make connections with participants who may be amendable to answering a questionnaire or semi-structured interview. Within this research project many of these methods and skills suited dynamics of my research field. As has been previously noted, opening conversations are very normal within The Salvation

---

<sup>11</sup> The commentary on social media and its interconnectedness in terms of The Salvation Army’s music is beyond the scope of this research project. However, how salvationists engage with each other via social media communities does offer an interesting topic for future study, especially during COVID19.

<sup>12</sup> See Markham 2013, *Fieldwork in Social Media: What Would Malinowski Do?* for further discussion on the complexities of conducting digital ethnography in the twenty-first century.

Army. The church environment lends itself to welcoming conversations before the Sunday service often to be followed up at morning tea. These are the types of conversations that tended to help me connect to the ‘music-making people’ as my welcomers were eager to assist in my research.

Although I entered each fieldwork site as an organisational insider and understood ‘how things work’, conducting fieldwork required planning and organisation in an attempt to curb the sense of overload when trying to capture an overwhelming volume of data (Guest, Namey & Mitchell 2017: 30; DeWalt & DeWalt 2010: 99). Within the field I relied on note taking, photos, and audio recordings. Through my field experience I quickly learned how to capture the event as non-invasively as possible. For example, a Sunday service tends to follow a standard order of service. Working within this structure allowed me to observe what was different, capture visuals, take field notes, and at times include audio recordings. It is normal for members of the congregation to take notes in the meeting, particularly during the sermon, therefore taking notes was not viewed as different, a distraction, or an offence. Audio recordings, however, became essential when attending a larger service or event that involved more action. For instance, during some rehearsals note taking would have been a distraction, especially to the leader. Leaving a voice recording device to record the rehearsal meant capturing talk, music, and process without interruption, especially when engaging as a participant. This allowed me to take mental notes of salient moments, write them down as soon as the event was over and refer to the recording. Knowing when to leave technology to the event organisers and rely on those relationships to support the research process became an invaluable source and skill. Not only did I cultivate good relationships with people in these types of roles, the data they captured for live streams and general record keeping was of good quality and freed me up as the researcher to observe the field in other ways. Understanding how to best utilise these forms of data gathering helped to capture the best data possible as well as not interrupt the natural flow of the field.

### 3.3.4 Fieldwork Notes

Field notes are the ‘raw data’ accumulated during fieldwork (Tenzek 2018: 3). Field notes may be comprised of jotting down observations, transcriptions of quotes, photos, sound recordings and voice memos, and documents from the site. This data becomes the foundation for further note writing after fieldwork where the researcher expands on their data capturing the event in greater detail (Tenzek 2018: 4; Denscombe 2008: 219; Mills, Durepos & Wiebe

2012: 2). By doing so, the researcher creates a permanent record of the event to which they can refer to in the future (ibid). As human memory can be unreliable, it is expected that the field researcher attends to their notes immediately after their fieldwork to record the best version possible (Denscombe 2008: 219). For some, these notes are strictly descriptive, focusing on a recollection of time, place, space, and ‘objectivity’, in contrast to reflective field notes that allow for the researcher’s personal interpretation, critical insights, speculation, and inclusion of other relative information they deem relative to the event (Tenzek 2018: 4). What most can agree upon is that “field notes are urgent business” and must not be delayed in order to maintain data integrity (Denscombe 2008: 219).

The field notes written throughout this study comprised of short note taking, photos, audio recordings, and collecting documents from the site. Lengthy descriptive field notes were then recorded soon after fieldwork had been conducted. These notes involved thick description as they were grounded in the data collected on site. Some the extended fieldwork notes included critical reflections and ideas. These reflections were marked separately from the initial description as they offered ideas about the content and connections to pervious field works sites.

### 3.3.5 Interviews and Questionnaires

Interviews and Questionnaires can provide a rich source of data. These methodologies can provide clarity, depth, and human experience to the data set. Rather than observing participants within the field, interviews and questionnaires directly ask participants about their opinions (Denscombe 2014: 184). Accompanying the ethnographic process, semi-structured interviews and questionnaires made up a significant source of data for this research. In essence the ethnographic approach coupled with interviews and questionnaires made up two sides of the same coin, each side addressing the same research question. This combination of these perspectives provided a holistic approach to the data where one side supported the other and so on.

#### *Questionnaires*

Questionnaires are a popular method for gathering data as they offer various forms of enquiry. They provide the scope to involve only quantitative data or qualitative data, or a combination of both, by asking direct and indirect questions. A well dispersed questionnaire can reach a large group of people in a short period of time and provide standardised data. (Denscombe

2014: 174). For the purposes of this research, a questionnaire was developed and dispersed throughout the fieldwork period.

During the design phase of the research project, it became clear that due to recruitment and time constraints, conducting approximately 40 semi-structured interviews was unrealistic. A questionnaire with 15 open ended questions was developed that were grouped into three sections, “*A little bit about you...*”, “*Music and Worship...*”, and “*Salvation Army music yesterday, today, and tomorrow...*”. Each section guided the participant through the questionnaire with the intension of addressing the main themes of the initial research question. A final segment at the end, “*Other thoughts...*”, invited participants to include any thoughts, experiences, stories, opinions, and facts about Salvation Army music-making they thought could be relevant, interesting, or fun. Each questionnaire was headed with the university logo and contact details followed by an explanation of what the questionnaire is all about<sup>13</sup>.

Participants for the questionnaire were recruited through fieldwork connections. Members of music groups who were interested in the research but had little time were offered a questionnaire to be sent to them. For a few participants, this opportunity suited their temperaments as they had the opportunity to sit and think about their answers rather than participating in a semi-structured interview. Most questionnaires were read and sent back with follow-up questions underneath the participants answers. This allowed for a semi-ish structured questionnaire, where the exchange felt more conversational<sup>14</sup>. Generally, this exchange only happened once, and participants were happy to answer a second round of questions. Emailed questionnaires also provided the opportunity to continue discussions with participants in other cities and rural areas and allowed participants to forward my research details on to others who may be interested. Each participant was emailed a description of the research, as well as a copy of the Participant Information Statement (PIS), Participant Consent Form (PCF), and researcher contact details. All participants contacted me via phone or university email. By the end of the fieldwork period, 20 questionnaires were completed and filled out the dataset.

---

<sup>13</sup> See appendix.

<sup>14</sup> I was very careful not to ask too many follow-up questions as I didn't want to overwhelm my participants. 1 or 2 follow-up questions in each category sufficed.

### *Semi-structured in-depth interviews*

Semi-structured in-depth interviews can provide direct insight into the field from the perspective of the participant's experiences. Like questionnaires, semi-structured interviews ask for the participant's opinions in a conversational format using open-ended questions and free flowing discussion (Given 2012: 2; Morris 2018: 3). Rather than restricted by the structure of a questionnaire and or structured interview, the semi-structured interview provides the opportunity for the participant to share their experiences in the way they choose (Morris 2018: 3). An experienced researcher will prepare questions and topics before the interview to help gently guide the conversation and ensure all points have been covered (Denscombe 2014: 184). It is important to note that due to the nature of conducting semi-structured in-depth interviews, this data is a moment of collaboration between the researcher and the participant (Given 2012: 2). A social encounter where the researcher and participant "collaborate in producing retrospective (and prospective) *accounts* or *versions* of their past (or future) actions, experiences, feelings and thought" (Rapley 2007: 2). Rapley suggests that the researcher should analyse each interview from a place of reflexive observation, "how your interaction produced the trajectory of talk" (ibid). In this sense, maintaining an awareness of my social position as the researcher within each interview context became an essential step throughout my reflexive practice.

Semi-structured in-depth interviews contributed to a significant portion to the richness of the data collected during the fieldwork period. As the questionnaire provided a sound framework of investigation, the design structure of each interview followed the same questions and themes. Due to the nature of semi-structured interviews, these questions and themes were not addressed in the same order as the questionnaire. Like the questionnaire recruitment, participants for interviews were recruited in person during fieldwork. Each potential interviewee was provided a copy of the Participant Information Statement (PIS), Participant Consent Form (PCF), and researcher contact details. All participants contacted me via phone or university email.

Interviews were conducted either before or after a fieldwork event or arranged for a time outside of fieldwork. These interviews took place in cafés, pubs, my house, and participant's

houses, as well as Salvation Army buildings<sup>15</sup>. These were all conducted under the auspices of a Safety Protocol established during the process of completing the Human Ethics process at the University of Sydney. A couple of interviews took place over Skype or Zoom due to time and distance constraints. Each participant was approached equally via a uniform process of consent and no participant was interviewed to gain information on another person. After written consent was confirmed, I reiterated the process and consent verbally before turning on the digital recorder. Each interview began with the first two questions “what kind of music-making do you do in The Salvation Army?” and “how did you begin?” However, for participants I was already acquainted with I included an introductory disclaimer acknowledging that “although we already know each other, I’m going to ask you some questions I may know the answers to. Even though this may feel odd, almost all of the time we learn new and surprising things”. In many ways this acknowledgement freed up the conversation between myself and participants as it provided the space for their story to be told, rather than an assumed, unspoken version between two people.

Generally, participants engaged with the interview process in productive ways contributing to over 14 hours of conversation. Although I attempted to transcribe the interviews myself, the process took longer than anticipated and I engaged an external service. After receiving the transcriptions, I listened to each interview again I corrected inaccuracies whilst taking note of major themes that arose from the data. 18 interviews were conducted during the fieldwork period, with two additional interviews conducted in 2020. Organising these interviews added more administration, time, travel, expense, and invaluable data to this research.

### **3.4 The Data Collection Process**

#### **3.4.1 The Data Collection Period**

The aim of this study is to explore how salvationists maintain their ‘salviness,’ or their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity through music-making activities, and what forms these may take at present. To address the research question, a significant fieldwork period of 22 months was dedicated to the project. From June 2017 to April 2019, 66 fieldwork sites were included in the study involving rural and urban locations. Field work was conducted in Queensland, New South Wales, and Victoria,

---

<sup>15</sup> Interviews conducted at my home or participant’s homes were not strangers. Each interview took place in a safe space.

Australia. These sites involved Sunday services, concerts, rehearsals, divisional and national events, education days, community outreach, and planning meetings. During the fieldwork period, 8 live streamed events were attended and observed. Salvation Army headquarters, music groups, and some local corps live streamed their events online via social media profiles on Facebook or on their official websites as an embedded livestream.

Throughout the data collection period, 18 semi-structured in-depth interviews were conducted contributing to over 14 hours of conversation. By the end of the fieldwork period, 20 questionnaires completed the dataset.

### 3.4.2 Ethical Considerations

This study was granted ethics approved by the Research Integrity & Ethics Administration, Human Research Ethics Committee at The University of Sydney in June 2017. I received clearance from The Salvation Army Headquarters and support from the Territorial Worship Arts Co-ordinator to conduct this study in The Salvation Army, including consent from local corps leaders, music group leaders and committees, and event organisers. During the ethnographic process, interviews, and questionnaires, all participants were treated with fairness and respect. Participants were informed of the specifics of the study via the Participant Information Statement (PIS), Participant Consent Form (PCF), and researcher contact details. All participants contacted me via phone or university email. Within the PCF, participants were offered the opportunity to receive feedback regarding the results of the study.

Participant confidentiality was of prime concern for this study. Confidentiality has been achieved using pseudonyms and broad physical descriptions. References to locations, corps, music groups, participants, and other identifying factors have been given pseudonyms and broad descriptions to further protect the participants.

Although it has been previously stated that fieldwork observations were conducted online, it is important to reiterate that all events were published as “public” and did not require an invitation or password to access them. Profiles for corps, music groups, and music departments served useful for background information, maintaining up-to-date information (such as concert dates), and watching live streamed content. As the online environment is porous, there was a strong need to create a fieldwork boundary within the social media field.



Extra groups such as band appreciation groups and follower comments were not included in this study as well as general comments within the official group websites and profiles I engaged (Markham 2013: 438).

### 3.4.3 Participant Recruitment

From the research development stage of the study, it quickly became apparent that a combination of both questionnaires and interviews would best add to the data. Both methods directly involve the opinions and life experiences of participants adding depth and meaning to the research. Recruiting participants involved in-person invitations, introductions by other participants and gatekeepers, and general invitations to music groups inviting participants to approach the researcher. Each potential recruit was provided a copy of the Participant Information Statement (PIS), Participant Consent Form (PCF), and researcher contact details. All participants contacted me via phone or university email.

Throughout the fieldwork period I was conscious of recruiting a broad range of participants differing in age, gender, musical expressions, leadership positions, Salvation Army experience, and backgrounds. Some participants were included in the research due to their specialised position within the organisation. However, each participant contributed invaluable data to the study (Denscombe 2008: 189). Although potential recruits were visible and easily accessible during fieldwork, managing questionnaires and arranging interview times required time, administration, and persistence. As is the nature of qualitative research processes, many questionnaires and interview invitations were neglected. By the end of the collection period, I managed to include a cross-section of The Salvation Army that represented the general trends of the organisation at the time.

The participants included in this study may be analysed in a myriad of ways, however, the inclusion criteria involved a cross-section focused on three categories: current organisational position, gender<sup>16</sup>, and age. 'Current organisation position' clarified if participants were in a leadership position or not at the time of questionnaire or interview. Both leaders and non-leaders provide contrasting perspectives and experiences with music-making and the decisions surrounding it. Historically within The Salvation Army, genders have experienced

---

<sup>16</sup> This research did not investigate gender diversity within the context of music-making in The Salvation Army. Further study regarding gender diversity within The Salvation Army would greatly benefit this field of research.

specific role casting that has changed within the last three decades. For older salvationists, this history has impacted them in significant ways shaping their engagement with the denomination. Thirdly, the age of participants provided invaluable insights into how salvationists experience the denomination and relate to music-making practices institutionally. Participants older than 30 years of age generally experienced more of the shift in Salvation Army music-making than those who were younger. Although there were participants close to the age demarcation, many participants in their 20s approached Salvation Army music traditions differently. Participants in their 20s tended to accept change, enjoy both traditional and modern music, and were more interested in expanding the definition of music-making within the denomination. Participants older than 30 years old were interested and engaged with modern worship music but tended focus on the *who, what, when, where, and how* music-making expressions were neglected institutionally. Older participants reflected more on attrition and how music-making could be (or could have been) “fixed” as opposed to younger participants whose focus was on the here and now. Both groups recognised specific ways of ‘being salvo’, however, participants over the age of 30 were able to comment on the rapid decline of church attendance, attitudes, and sounds experienced over the last three decades (and more). Although this observation may seem obvious, these perspectives bring to light those who are laden with the knowledge of yesteryears and those who are less burdened and look towards tomorrow.

The research development stage of the study 40 questionnaires and 20 semi-structured in-depth interviews were estimated at the beginning of the fieldwork period, questionnaires and interviews were finalised at the point of data saturation (Morris 2018: 10). 20 questionnaires and 21 semi-structured in-depth interviews were completed by the end of the data collection period.

#### 3.4.4 Limitations and Problems

Thankfully throughout this research period I was welcomed into The Salvation Army Australia as an external researcher and experienced very little hesitation throughout the research process. The problems and limitations experienced throughout the research process concerned the practicalities of conducting fieldwork, questionnaires, and interviews.

Fieldwork within The Salvation Army Australia involves traveling long distances to connect with different corps. Because of this, the study was limited to three states, Queensland, New

South Wales, and Victoria. Most travel involved weekend trips. However, due to distance, time, and finance, it was important to interview as many participants and conduct as much fieldwork as possible when traveling interstate. Because of the time constraint, many participants made the effort to meet up for an interview, suggest events to attend, and passed on my information to other potential participants. Time pressure also limited the number of events I could attend and often meant missing out on fieldwork due to double bookings (rehearsals occurring on the same night) or lack of available days. Continuous assessment was necessary throughout these situations as determining what was best for the study was always the priority. Nevertheless, visits to each city were always fruitful and contributed rich data to the study.

Conducting fieldwork on weekends presented as another limitation. Arranging fieldwork at each corps (and other events) took time and negotiation. Generally, this negotiation regarded the most appropriate weekend to attend. Although I made it clear that a “normal Sunday was entirely appropriate”, many officers and music leaders wanted to make sure I observed their musical sections on well attended weekends. Most weekends were easy, and I was able to fit in with the local corps calendar. At times, this was a secondary problem where weekends clashed, and I needed to schedule visits many weeks in advance. In terms of time management this was positive, yet I quickly became aware of the limited number of Sundays available in a year. Therefore, an “off” or cancelled Sunday impacted the timeline requiring me to wait another week to conduct fieldwork.

Although physical distance presented fieldwork challenges, live streamed events provided a different way of engaging with the field. Due to the amalgamation of the southern and eastern territories, salvationists relied more on live streaming to connect with The Salvation Army nationally. The advantages of conducting fieldwork in this way was the ease of access (all live streams were published as public) and limited travel. However, live streamed/videoed events present a one-dimensional interaction that has been framed and edited in certain ways to suit the medium and message of the organisation. Another limitation was the quality of the live stream. Large national events were recorded and streamed professionally, however

during the fieldwork period many corps or music groups relied on the technology at hand<sup>17</sup>. At times this meant observing some concerts and services with poor sound and image quality.

### **3.5 Approaches to Data Analysis**

The ethnographic data for this research project was collected from three main sources: ethnographic field notes, questionnaires, and semi-structured in-depth interviews. Data analysis commenced once a substantial amount of data had accumulated and continued throughout research period. To collate qualitative data, computer assisted qualitative data analysis software (CAQDAS) was employed throughout the research project. NVivo is a widely used qualitative data management system that assists in analysing and coding data (Houghton, et al. 2016: 875). Although the process of analysis and coding is manual, this programme replaces the need of physical highlighting, tabs, post-its, files, note cards, and paper (Davis & Meyer 2009: 119). It provides a flexible way of changing and updating codes as more data is included throughout the research period, allows the researcher to quickly access and export specific data sets, and is entirely portable. Due to the amount of data gathered throughout this research project, NVivo became an essential tool that aided the management and organisation of data into topics and themes as they emerged from the research.

Before importing participant responses into NVivo I read over each response to gain a general overview and understanding of each participant. Although I took mental notes of topics and themes pertinent to the research, a second reading allowed for simple coding where large sections of the responses were highlighted, indicating importance and a need for greater in-depth analysis. For semi-structured in-depth interviews, this process provided the opportunity to listen to the audio, fix missed words and mistakes, and become more familiar with the data. Questionnaires contributed invaluable data; however, each participant follows a strict question and answer process. Due to the nature of semi-structured in-depth interviews, coding this data is far more nuanced involving more time. In this research project, the conversation style of semi-structured in-depth interviews suggests that topics and themes tend to be interwoven, demanding a teasing apart the data and therefore more attention and discernment during analysis.

---

<sup>17</sup> Although fieldwork was not conducted during COVID-19 lockdowns, larger corps did invest in quality technology to provide more professional looking services and concerts.

After importing interviews and questionnaires into NVivo, I drew upon the topics and themes that structured the questionnaire as my primary codes, referred to as ‘nodes’ in the program. These themes provided the primary codes (nodes) that made up the basis of each category:

1. Community
2. Governance
3. Identity
4. Music
5. Today (Modern)
6. Traditions

These six primary codes provided the basis of analysis and a theoretical framework to organise and build secondary codes. Secondary cords (again, nodes) provided a greater refinement of the data as more data furthered the need for subcategories. After each response was uploaded into NVivo, further analysis was undertaken coding each topic and theme into either primary or secondary codes. As themes emerged from the data, I was tracked which themes were more prominent than others until most codes (primary and secondary) reached a point of saturation. To establish consistency, a code book was developed and referred to throughout the analysis period. The code book was consulted frequently to ensure the criteria and meanings of each code were maintained throughout the analysis period. It is important to note that this process isn’t linear, it is highly reflexive and changes as it responds to the data evolved throughout the project.

### 3.5.1 Limitations and Delimitations

This ethnographic research project was limited and delimited by a number of factors. Although the investigation managed to represent a large portion of The Salvation Army Australia, the research concentrated on the eastern states of Australia. Due to the size of the country, research was not conducted in South Australia, Western Australia, the Northern Territory, the Australian Capital Territory, and Tasmania. During the ethnographic research period, most national events were held in Sydney, New South Wales and Melbourne, Victoria (between the two Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters, Australia). Ethnographic research was limited to a 22-month period where 66 sites were visited, 20 questionnaires answered, and 18 semi-structured in-depth interviews provided sufficient data to hit a point of

saturation. The data gathered was limited by time, a small research team (one person), and the financial demands of long-distance travel. Additionally, a boundary was defined surrounding online engagement as this research did not include in-depth online interactions with salvationists and other membership groups involving Salvation Army members.

### **3.6 Conclusion**

This chapter presented the overarching theoretical framework and research design for the research study. The research study presents a snapshot of music-making practices and trends within The Salvation Army Australia at one point in time. The data collected presents a glimpse into the motivations, experiences, thoughts, and ideas surrounding music-making as a salvationist within the Australian context. By conducting ethnographic field work, semi-structured in-depth interviews, and questionnaires, I was able to capture significant to the seemingly everyday events and provide a selection of avenues for participants to share their experiences, thoughts, and ideas. The following chapter begins to explore some of these ideas, in particular, how salvationists associate Salvation Army *music* to a sense of belonging, oneness, and service.

## Chapter 4 – A music-making people

### 4.1 Introduction

What is particularly striking about the salvationist identity is the interconnectedness of *musicking* and *salviness*. Frequently throughout this research, many salvationists proudly proclaimed to me, “well, we *are* a music-making people!” after discussing this research project with them. Throughout the fieldwork period, this was a common phrase (or saying) older salvationists used to explain who they were and why music was such an important part of their identity. However, it quickly demonstrates the implication that to be a salvationist is to make music. Chapter two presented an important historical backdrop illustrating the rich sociocultural context Salvation Army music was developed, regulated, and later challenged as the worship wars eventually made its way into worship halls and onto the platform. This chapter explores moments of intersectionality where music-making within The Salvation Army Australia finds itself settled between moments of conflict, crisis, and creativity, and how the historical framework of the past continues to inform the present in interesting, and at times, unexpected ways.

As a point of affinity, many salvationists contribute to the recreation of specific sights and sounds within their communities permeating a sense of *salviness* as many associate Salvation Army *musicking* to a sense of belonging, oneness, and service. Within The Salvation Army context, *musicking* refers not only to the leading musicians on the platform, but also to the congregation in song and worship, the families and friends supporting their loved ones in practice and rehearsals, the educators, composers and arrangers, and technical support teams, through to the volunteers who set-up and pack-down the stage week in and week out. As Small suggests,

To music is to take part, in any capacity, in a musical performance, whether by performing, by listening, by rehearsing or practicing, by providing material for performance (what is called composing), or by dancing (Small 1998: 9).

It is with this definition in mind that highlights the importance salvationists place on music-making. *Musicking* is an activity that involves “all participation in a musical performance, whether it takes place actively or passively, whether we like the way it happens or whether we do not, whether we consider it interesting or boring, constructive or destructive, sympathetic or antipathetic” it involves the corps and their entire community (ibid). However,

as the sounds and sensibilities of ‘outside’ contemporary worship music becomes embedded within local Army expressions, reconciling what it means to ‘*be salvo*’ presents a myriad of challenges that fall to instances of conflict, negotiation, and (re)creation.

To investigate further the relationship between salvationist sensibilities and the impact of change, this chapter focuses on how salvationists continuously expand their understandings of what it means to ‘*be salvo*’. From their music-making pasts through to the present, salvationists reconcile numerous competing demands such as maintaining inherited music traditions whilst engaging with contemporary worship music and the difficulties of managing twenty-first century life with the expectations of previous expressions of *salvoness*. Throughout the research period, the stories and experiences shared by participants through their semi-structured interviews, questionnaires, and general conversations in the field, illustrate how Army music-making of the past shaped their childhoods, their music education, their worship practices, and even their relationships. Importantly, their stories illustrate how *musicking* in communities powerfully informs and shapes individual and community identities especially during times of change. This chapter explores some ways *musicking* and the sociocultural context in which it occurs challenges, informs, and at times, inspires diverse expressions of *salvoness*.

#### **4.2 Participation and inheritance**

At its core, music groups within The Salvation Army are made up of unique individuals who frequently come together to make music. Lee Higgins highlights the importance of music-making within communities as it has the capacity to articulate “a community’s local identities, traditions, aspirations, and social interactions” (Higgins 2012: 4). The act of *musicking* within The Salvation Army brings together individuals of all ages who participate in the continuation of heritage and tradition, worship, and fellowship. Within The Salvation Army, community music-making can be categorised into two groups: groups involving members of The Salvation Army (inside) and those involving the public (outside). Although these two categories are fluid, all music groups observed did fit within either category. salvationists participating in ‘inside’ groups (corps music groups, divisional and territorial groups etc) tended to have grown-up as salvationists or have been members of the denomination for a significant period. Generally, these are the children of a generation that experienced a version of ‘The Golden Age’ and significant change and conflict during the worship wars.



For many salvationists, taking part in musical expressions either locally, divisionally, or nationally, has played a significant part of their self-definition within the denomination. Often these participants contribute to more than one group, moving between various brass bands, songsters, timbrels, and worship bands, connecting to more than one musical community. The determination of self within these groups may be supported by the instruments and music played, uniforms adorned, gender, age, family, and (at times) the chair one sits in. These signifiers express skills capital (Fletcher 2020: 2), social capital (Bourdieu 1986: 248; see also Endress 2014), and cultural capital (Bourdieu 1986: 17) as members create a sense of belonging and place within the wider Salvation Army. The negotiation of these kinds of capital may be observed in conversations between bandmen, songsters, worship bands, and even the technical team, frequently comparing individuals and groups strengths, weaknesses, and differences. From levels of excellence to “who’s transferred where”, the dynamics within these groups sustain an intricate network of people continuously negotiating a balance between sustaining the ideals of ‘The Golden Age’ with the realities of their twenty-first century lives. For salvationists whose upbringings are steeped in a shared tradition and common personal histories, these sociocultural negotiations have led to an opening up of opportunities where musical groups (re)imagine what their musical lives could look like, whilst others continue to cling to the ‘traditional’ experiences of the salvationists of yesteryears. The following section introduces the significance of family histories within the organisation, the impact of gender roles, and how certain *ways of being* have been internalised and challenged from one generation to the next.

#### 4.2.1 Beginnings and the impact of gender roles

Many participants who were raised in The Salvation Army recall a similar narrative describing their early introduction to music, “I was born into the army, dedicated in the army, was exposed to army music from the womb...” (Interview: 16.04.2019) and “Well, growing up in the Salvation Army meant that I was exposed to everything Salvation Army from when I was born” (Interview: 04.04.2019). For these salvationists, music and The Salvation Army are considered one and the same,

My parents are TSA officers and have been since before my birth. I was literally born into TSA and I have been regularly attending and involved in TSA corps and activities since that time.

I have been involved with music in TSA literally my entire life. My mum happily recollects that as a baby I would sleep through the brass band, but wake up when it stopped!

My experiences with music are so intertwined with TSA that it is virtually impossible to separate my involvement in music with my relationship with TSA (Questionnaire: no. 11)

It is not unusual for participants to start their musical Salvation Army history with “I was born into the Salvation Army” or “Born and bred! My family have been Salvos for several generations...” to be quickly followed up with “I have always been in TSA with my family, and as is typical, I was given an instrument to learn on at the age of 7 or 8” or “I played the timbrel since I was about 2-3 years old”. For participants such as these, the introduction to Salvation Army music-making was fostered by an intergenerational learning experience,

I guess, it was a couple of things; one was my mum and dad were in the army, and that they encouraged me into the music sections. Part of it was because when I was at Campbelltown, I had wanted to be in a band since Uncle Robert<sup>18</sup> taught me cornet, so decided to have a go at that (Interview: 30.07.2020)

Many salvationists recount that when they were big enough to handle an instrument, or if they showed any interest, they were encouraged to learn. Young children (typically young boys) learnt brass instruments by joining the corps junior band, taking lessons from members of the senior band, and/or by copying off the person next to them. Many participants noted the amount of time older bandsmen would sacrifice each week to teach beginners, as well as fathers, grandfathers, and uncles who also taught and played. For young girls, learning timbrel was encouraged and were often taught in a junior group lead and supported by senior timbrel ladies. Although this gender divide was not mandated by any General Orders (and over time men and women participated in both music expressions) in many corps these groups solidified causing a gender binary between brass bands and timbrels. The following participants explain how this divide dictated their music-making opportunities,

---

<sup>18</sup> Pseudonyms have been provided to protect anonymity

Gender impacted my generation. Girls played the Timbrel, guys were in the band. I was never given the opportunity to learn an instrument and so probably have not then had the interest. Now, I see that we are becoming more gender neutral with music-making in most areas. My observation around is that we still have more men than women in the band, but the opportunities are there. In worship groups or songsters, the opportunity is for both genders (Questionnaire: No. 12)

The ‘traditional’ (hate that word but can’t think of another one) split of girls play timbrel, boys do brass, was predominant in Brisbane TSA circles when I was a child through to teens. A couple of my good friends were pioneers in the female brass player area and it wasn’t easy for them. I really regret never properly learning a brass instrument ... and if I had my time again would possibly push harder to do so (Questionnaire: No. 13)

The topic of gender has played an important role within the history of The Salvation Army. The Salvation Army has prided itself on gender inclusivity celebrating the progressiveness of the mission in its early days. The young Salvation Army of the nineteenth century championed women preachers during a time when they were often considered controversial, or at best, a novelty (Walker 2001: 31 – 34). Women were actively encouraged to participate as preachers, held responsibilities for missions, asserted their authority in decision making, and wore uniforms just like the men (ibid: 116 - 117). Pamela Walker suggests that the early Salvation Army redefined gender roles as women moved outside the domestic sphere as salvationist men rejected masculine working-class past-times such as betting and drinking (ibid: 92 – 92). The knee drills, a military uniform, and brass bands, however, “created a characteristic male world, combining the masculinity of militaristic uniforms, the machismo of the brass instrument, and the religious content of the sacred music” (Brown 2009: 138). In this sense, due to the military connotations and working-class popularity, brass bands provided a musical outlet that fostered a predominantly masculine culture (Cox 2011: 103). William Booth appealed directly to the women of The Salvation Army declaring,

And do not our prophetesses lead their people with music and song under the bare heavens in processions of mercy? Do they not play their music – if not their timbrels – their violins and cornets, and concertinas, and such other instruments as some to their hands? (Booth in Sandall 1950: 4).

Cox notes that although the Army attempted to attract women to bands by creating women's brass bands their attempts failed at sustaining the longevity of these bands (2011: 102; Blyth 2015: 39). The impact of this gender division continues today. Although salvationists in their early forties and younger may recount the gender division between brass bands and timbrels becoming less rigid, gender roles continue to be perpetuated throughout corps and other music expressions within The Salvation Army. As two officer participants discuss,

Officer 1: The gender problems are perpetuated by the congregation and you can tell by the language that they use that timbrels for them are for women, a bit like World Day of Prayer. It hasn't been the Women's World Day of Prayer for 40 years, and they're still calling it the Women's World Day of Prayer. Old habits die hard. So it's still novel to them, it sounds novel to them for me to say 'and men can be involved'. So when I'm wanting them to understand that there's no gender restriction, I'm still trying to get them over that hurdle of it's okay to allow men in women's group. So one step at a time, I think.

Officer 2: This even extends to the craft group.

Officer 1: Men are very welcome. But if a man walks in the door, the question is asked, "What are you doing here?" and similar for children actually. Oh "we want lots of families to come, but the children have to sit over there and be quiet. We don't want them to interrupt our conversations". So, it's ingrained, this idea that this is for women (Interview: 18.02.2018)

These ingrained gender roles may be observed throughout all types of music-making within The Salvation Army, particularly with regards to the representation of women in brass band leadership positions and 'high level banding'. Many participants noted the low numbers of female musicians in territorial level staff and youth bands within Australia, particularly the lack of female bandmasters both young and old, "the role models are not there and those who do 'make it' into leadership roles (myself included) get there on passion, initiative, and by creating our own opportunities. There is still a strong patriarchal system in TSA" (BL). Although these trends are present in "high level banding" in The Salvation Army

Australia<sup>19</sup>, the gender division between brass bands and timbrels has become more flexible and inviting. Salvation Army corps bands, beginner bands, singing groups, and timbrels encourage all children to play and sing, altering the ratio of gender expression within these groups,

... the children's band I was involved in, it was evenly split. The choir was also evenly split ... And then the adults' band were probably about 70% male and 30% female in my corps growing up (Interview: 16.03.2019)

...in Just Brass for example, there is equal representation of male and female (50/50!) so it's obviously not that girls didn't want to do music, they just weren't offered the chance. I hope to be part of that change and offer young people, especially young girls, a capable role model (Questionnaire: No. 5)

For younger and newer members of The Salvation Army, the impact of the assigned gender roles "girls played the timbrel and boys were in the band" (Questionnaire: No. 19) has decreased significantly. Most music expressions observed throughout the research period presented not only gender diverse groups, but also diverse ages, musical abilities, membership engagement, and instrumentation. However, many salvationists have experienced gender segregation in their formative years which has shaped how they internalise and interact with Salvation Army music-making. Generally, women noted their enjoyment of playing the timbrel and singing in the songsters, but keenly pointed out trends of gatekeeping surrounding leadership and the social, cultural, and skills capital associated with brass bands,

Even as a young girl, it was always this mentality that band was a men's thing even if it wasn't explicitly said. Like, I was always super aware of the fact that if I was in the band, I'd be a female, like it was almost an achievement. People celebrate it as well. They'd always say that it was so good to see a female in the band or a *young* female, like a young person and that additionally that I was a girl, it seemed to have an appeal, which while they were celebrating that, still highlighted the distinction there, that has happened in the past and the distinction

---

<sup>19</sup> Other international Staff Bands include many women in their bands, although most are still male dominated with only one or two women represented in these bands.

that actually still occurs, I believe ... But then there's the flipside of where I'm babied as well or like things are dumbed down for me especially for those older men who, in their formative banding years, wouldn't have had females around. So, I think amongst the men my age, there's probably not very many barriers at all. I feel quite welcome in band settings but once it comes to there being older men involved, by older I mean probably like above 50, there's still that tension whether it's positive or negative that the fact that there are females in the band (Interview: 24.06.2018)

The historic exclusion of women from brass banding within The Salvation Army has denied generations of untapped potential, not only of years past, but for women in music leadership today, resource development (composers), a general band membership. As Blyth contributes, "female membership has only aided many bands where without them they would certainly not be able to operate musically" (2015: 42).

#### 4.2.2 Music and Education

Music education within The Salvation Army has drastically changed over the past four decades. From formalised education environments to non-formal/informal learning interactions, these varied experiences of learning music as young salvationists have left the adult music-making salvationists of today with an assortment of skills, opportunities, and experiences that continue to shape their relationships with Army music and their place within it (Souto-Otero 2021: 367). For many participants, the introduction to music-making within The Salvation Army is closely intertwined with early experiences of corps and family life,

There was just no separation between what they were doing and what I was doing. So if dad was playing an instrument, I was playing as well. But my choice of involvement, probably when I was in Singing Company when I was – I think I probably joined when I was four and even now I've said that, I was in musicals from when I was two, so really – so I probably never chose it [laughs] probably just ... part of my church experience actually ... Salvation Army music was part of my Salvation Army experience which was from birth (Interview: 04.04.2019)

A large number of salvationists can attest to the early music education experiences that were guided by the internal processes and opportunities music sections offered at each corps.

Attendees of larger corps tended to have the opportunity to introduce young children to a junior band, timbrel group, or singing company before progressing into intermediate groups and then more senior music sections. At times children were given individual or small group tuition provided by music leaders or members of the senior music groups. For many of these young learners, participating in Salvation Army music was simply what people did,

It was compulsory when I grew up, in one sense. I say that partly tongue in cheek, but at the time I grew up in the '80s, there were a stack of us who were all about the same age. We all got to six – about six or so – and it was kind of, “Here you go, sport. Here’s your cornet. Go and join the junior band.” Kind of everybody did it – was a rite of passage. And I think back to those times and we were actually literally just sat in a brass band and told, “Right, play” with no clue. So I think we did about three months’ worth of fumbling along, looking at the guy next to you, and going home and writing the fingering in underneath before one of the older guys in the corps noticed that that was happening. And he actually pulled us aside and pulled about four of us aside and instead of going to the junior band practice, he would take us in another room, and week by week, we went through the Tune A Day series and literally learned how to play that way  
(Interview: 27.12.2018)

Although not all learning experiences were so structured, many participants acknowledge the practical nature of corps music groups and their immediate immersion within the sounds of the Army as young people. This casual intergenerational interaction of family life interwoven within musical expressions illustrates the interconnectedness of the private sphere (family), community (corps), organisation (The Salvation Army), and spiritual life (Christianity) experienced by many salvationists daily. Older salvationists recall full day of programmes where they would spend an entire Sunday at the corps and different meetings throughout the week. Their weekly routines (family older and younger) revolved around a certain experience of Salvationism that encouraged commitment and service, but also held other elements of their lives accountable to the corps and sectionals (especially the brass band). Often participants portrayed their weekly corps commitments with excitement and nostalgia. Many recalled people coming together regularly to learn, practice, rehearse, and worship in preparation for Sunday meetings, concerts and musicals, anniversaries, Easter and Christmas programmes, and other local corps celebrations. However, participants were quick to

comment on the weakening of music education standards and a drop in musicianship as congregational attendance began to decline,

It's a mixed emotion situation because I don't think it could be the way it was due to just society – people work longer hours, they do whatever, and there's an entire generation and a half, maybe even two generations that went missing from the Salvation Army, who would be the age that the guy who took us aside when I was six to play – they would be that age now for my kids. And if my six-year-old wanted to start playing, the person who should be showing her the way is now gone. That entire generation disappeared (Interview: 27.12.2018)

The shift in music education has also been attributed to a lack of institutional investment. Salvationists are quick to theorise *how* and *why* music education has rapidly decreased in quality over the past four decades. From societal expectations, “we stopped teaching our young people. We're busier as a society and we also live in a society that says we should be able to do it and do it immediately” (Interview: 27.04.2019), to a lack of qualified leaders, “we give people local corps positions, paid positions, who have no credentials in youth work or whatever because ... if you're a good musician, then you could be a musical leader, rather than you're a good musician, how about we sponsor you to go and try and get some training” (Interview: 16.04.2019), and institutional frustrations, “our territory and now particularly nationally doesn't seem to have a very strong focus on the arts, focus on the creative arts, or at least aren't willing to make a big investment in that” (Interview: 27.12.2018), older salvationists do identify that Salvation Army music camps have a lot to answer for.

Throughout the research period, ‘music camp’ was referred to by most music-making salvationists who answered the questionnaire or participated in semi-structured interviews. As an organisational insider this is one of the events, I had been invited to but had never attended and therefore I engaged with it as an outsider. What became evident, however, was the importance of music camp for participants. This camp<sup>20</sup> signifies a time and place where generations of salvationists have extended their music education, explored the creative arts, developed life-long friendships, flirted, met their future spouses, studied the bible, found their life's passion, worshiped in community, met with God, and committed their lives to following

---

<sup>20</sup> At present, there are many Salvation Army Creative Arts Camps throughout Australia.



Jesus. It is an annual event that conjures significant bouts of lament as past participants assess the state of music-making, education, and possibilities of ‘what could have been’ against a series of organisational decisions that have occurred since the early 2000s.

In the 1980s and 90s, music camps were annual events that brought together young salvationists from their divisions and territories to extend their musical and spiritual education, provide performance and worship opportunities, and foster the next generation of musical salvationists for The Salvation Army. Campers participated in bible studies, brass bands, timbrels, combined voice (choir), female voice, male voice, and music theory classes (*The Musician* 1980: 1). Theory exams and instrumental auditions were conducted at the beginning of camp to organise students in their respective classes (ibid). Campers were required to pass 4<sup>th</sup> grade theory to qualify for electives such as “fifth and sixth grade theory, street theatre, arranging and composition, conducting and leadership, timbrels (including timbrel leadership and score reading), guitar, vocal production and coaching, and in-depth study of the person and work of the Holy Spirit” (*The Musician* 1982: 2). A festival (worship concert) concluded the camp where campers shared their efforts in concert (ibid). Since the 2010s, the direction of music camp has significantly changed to include more worship expressions and opportunities to other young people. Although inclusiveness is considered positive, the quality of music education within this camp decreased,

I’ve watched vocal at camps go from these incredible chorus things to kids where friends of mine teaching the group can’t have a harmony in the group because the kids just don’t know how to sing a different note to other people. So, I think the quality is not always as high as it was, but then we have variation now which we didn’t have before (Interview: 04.04.2019)

For participants in their mid-thirties and above, music camps illustrated the changes to music engagement throughout their years of involvement in various roles. Most of this cohort noted that the lack of basic music theory and focus on music excellence was at the detriment of the Army,

I don’t want to be defamatory, but – nothing happens without investment, without effort. And if you look around our territory over the last ten years, our [creative arts camp], the main avenue where people were inspired to work their expression

has drifted very sharply into a youth camp. And there is no fostering of the creative arts. Now I know that's got to happen at a local church level before it can happen on a wider scale. One camp a year is not gonna fix that, but it will aid it and it will inspire people to make a change, and it's indicative of a deeper lack of focus or a deeper focus on other things and not creative arts, and while that's happening, while there's no resources out there for that, then we're certainly not going to rebuild on what we've lost (Interview: 27.12.2018)

For many in this cohort, the lack of focus on the creative arts displayed through the example of current "creative arts camps" presented an almost tangible example for salvationists to explain change, neglect, and loss. For one, many participants from this older cohort express hurt and frustration at The Salvation Army as an institution for failing to maintain music education programmes and question what will happen to Army music-making in the future if young people are not supported properly. For some, this means developing new ways of engaging younger salvationists in music,

I'm encouraged that if you wanted to learn, there would be avenues that you could. It is a little bit sad that the next generation won't have as available access as we all had to it. I think that's created some fantastic musicians or at least it gave the springboard for some fantastic musicians. What they did it was their choice, I guess, but I guess that's why I've wherever possible stuck around and I've been happy to be on staff at music camps and do whatever I can to encourage the next generation to sing and play and be a part of things, because it could easily be lost. It could drift away to nothing very quickly. There are a lot of bands out there that are largely 65, 70-plus in terms of age or average age and that could easily disappear in the next ten years without trying (Interview: 27.12.2018).

The sense of loss and lament over music programmes at all levels within The Salvation Army was shared across generations. For older people, this lack of investment signified the end of Army music as they had experienced it throughout their lives. For some of the 30- to 40-year-old cohort there seemed to be a sense of loss having missed out on playing with big brass bands, experiencing the support of a larger institution, and a disappointment at inheriting musical practices in flux. However, music expressions such as brass bands, songsters, and worship bands contain players that have learned their instruments in a range of different

ways. Some continued to be introduced to brass instruments like their forefathers and a number of women in their early twenties shared how their fathers encouraged them to play brass regardless of gender. Others had gained their music education through school music programmes, private lessons, and community ensembles often applying their skills to new instruments in the service of filling a needed part in a brass or worship band. Regardless of how and where salvationists have learnt, they come together through music-making activities, grounding their musical practices on a legacy that champions community through creativity, fellowship, and worship. The next section discusses the importance of community, fellowship, and worship as the decline of large corps music groups means the decline of corps folk coming together to share their lives with friends in safe creative spaces on a regular basis.

### **4.3 Community and Fellowship**

*Salviness* is shaped by a myriad of factors. For some, being a salvationist means being connected to a large international Christian mission that expresses itself through specific sociocultural tropes as they strive to “save souls, grow saints, and serve suffering humanity” (Gowans in Swanson 2012: URL). As has been explored, for many salvationists, the world of The Salvation Army is a world they were born into preceded by generations of their families that are steeped in the cultural practices of the mission; embedded in the heritage of The Salvation Army in their own familial ways. It is simply, ‘what we do’. For others, The Salvation Army presents a world unto itself where one enters and learns how to ‘*be Army*’ or ‘*be salvo*’. However, regardless of origin, almost all music-making salvationists report community and fellowship as significant qualities of their music-making experiences within The Salvation Army.

Connection, acceptance, and trust are three key experiential qualities that sustain social cohesion and binds communities together (Freuchte 2011: 1). From large communities and the small groups within them, individuals rely on these qualities to relate to one another and share in their like mindedness. Within religious communities, these interactions are often referred to as ‘fellowship’. To “fellowship with one another” is to come together in some form of communal meeting such as a meal, bible study, music rehearsal, youth group and so on. However, it is important to note that although fellowship may be understood as synonymous to community, within religious circles “to fellowship” carries the implication of sharing in the spirit. Anum and Abdul-Hamid explain that what binds people together in

religious communities is not simply membership, but a sharing of spiritual experiences both communally and individually (2013: 270). Throughout the research, this extended sense of connection reinforced the efficacy of meaning making within music groups where gatherings, rehearsals, and services provided the social space for sharing in worship. In this sense, music-making becomes a mediating factor for community binding and fellowship, as one participant explained,

Part of that is the reason why in over the last several years, in Songsters, we've not only had the devotions time, we had someone out the front telling their testimony every couple of weeks. At some point, it's every second week we break in sections just to ask how life's going and so what we try and chat about are some of the spiritual content questions, and a group where people will come into the group that had never been in the Salvation Army before and it was just to talk about life, that's a pretty powerful space. So that sort of format and context really can be something that not only turns around the music sections, but also builds the capacity for the organisation to talk about faith and that journey (Interview: 30.07.2020)

In music rehearsals observed throughout the research period, most offered a free space for participants to share their stories, feelings, and experiences. For some groups, sharing times were structured where members were rostered on a weekly basis to prepare a devotional or thought halfway through the rehearsal. At times this opened a sharing time where members commented on the devotional, talked about a song that had spoken to them, shared difficult trials they were currently facing, and prayed together. For other groups, conversation surrounding faith and life experiences were intertwined with the learning and discussion surrounding the difficulties and attributes of each song. Generally, the latter style of fellowship and rehearsal suited groups engaging with contemporary worship music. This was for a few reasons:

- 1) worship ensembles tend to work from charts as well as lyric and chord sheets,
- 2) arrangements were decided as a song was learnt,
- 3) slip-ups and mistakes were generally accepted if the song was not interrupted and could still lead the congregation in worship,

- 4) at times, members needed to stop and refer to a recording or YouTube video to introduce a song, refresh their memory, or learn by ear,
- 5) members took time setting up instruments as well as amplification, giving more opportunity to communicate.

The continuous back-and-forth between set-up, negotiation of music, and a small ensemble provided the gaps for conversation and connection as members discussed musical technicalities, their lives, and how the songs had impacted them. In contrast, brass bands and songster brigades tended to practice a more structured rehearsal and fellowship approach. This was primarily due music delivery (players and singers read off full scores or parts), groups tended to involve more people, and each group is led by a conductor. Members do talk throughout the rehearsal, but not necessarily in a conversational style. Social conversations were reserved for break times and before and after rehearsals. As was illustrated above, some groups do stop for small group prayer, testimonies, sharing, and devotions, however, this is mediated by the conductor. Nevertheless, what brings these groups together is the desire to make music and spend time in fellowship,

The fellowship, one hundred percent. I like the timbrel and it's fun and it's rhythmic, and it's something I've grown up doing, blah, blah, blah. But I actually like it more because of the fellowship. So at [our corps] we have a huge range. We have our two leaders and then our youngest is thirteen and it's just fellowship for the girls and it's to support and we have fun. And so, for me, timbrels is more about *that* than the timbrel playing or even using the timbrel to glorify God. It's actually about, this is just a medium for us to have fellowship with a range of ages and have fun (Interview: 02.03.2018)

What is apparent is the close relationship between fellowship, socialness, and worship. Many participants referred to rehearsals as 'church'; another moment during the week to come together as a spiritual community and encounter God through music-making,

Then there's also the worship aspect of it. Every rehearsal is a worship session basically, and then we get to take that to other places. I almost see our rehearsals as totally separate from our weekends. I enjoy the rehearsals just as much as I enjoy the weekends but then there's also the social aspect of it. I've made many, many

friends through ... songsters, and [our rehearsal] nights, we are probably spend more time talking than singing 'cause a few of us get there early and have dinner there and then we have our break times and we're just chatting and catching up and supporting one another. It's one big family as well as one big choir (Interview: 26.10.2018)

The fellowship maintained through *musicking* supports meaningful social relationships that keep music-making members connected in small group communities. As well as *musicking*, groups such as these perform important non-musical roles that extend beyond their musical group or their local corps, as Finnegan notes, “to be involved with musical practice is not merely an individual matter or, indeed, asocial withdrawal (as it has sometimes been pictured) but *is* to be involved in social action and relations – in society” (1989: 329). She continues by noting the *humanness* of such interactions acknowledging “the usual struggles as well as agreements of typical human affairs” (ibid). It is often in these moments of fellowship and struggle where expressions of *salviness* are (re)determined as music groups such as brass bands, songsters, timbrels, and other worship ensembles, negotiate what is meaningful, relevant, and important in their immediacy. Although this response may be perceived as positive and proactive, some members of The Salvation Army exist in a state of lament as *their* Salvation Army and the music that informs it, transforms around them.

This section has explored how communal music-making can provide social spaces for individuals to come together regularly to rehearse but also to share their lives meaningful ways. Through these processes of *musicking*, participants note how the concepts of fellowship and worship can bring people together, and at times, become the motivating factor for attendance. However, as the sounds and socialness of *salviness* is (re)negotiated, some salvationists lament their Salvation Army of the past. The following section explores how nostalgia and lament may be drawn upon as emotional tools for (re)organising, understanding, exploring, and sharing who and how they were in the past and how the assets from the past may be employed in the present.

#### **4.4 Nostalgia and Lament**

Nostalgia (from *nostos* – return home, and *algia* – longing) is a longing for a home that no longer exists or has never existed. Nostalgia is a sentiment of loss

and displacement, but it is also a romance with one's own fantasy (Boym 2001: XIII).

It would be almost impossible to conduct this research project without touching on the topic of nostalgia and lament. Interwoven throughout the discourse between 'traditional' and 'contemporary', Salvation Army music-making carries a bitter-sweet aftertaste of nostalgia and lament for a certain period of brass band, songster, and timbrel performance. Boym explains that nostalgia is an emotional response to loss. A longing for an imagined time and place where feelings of familiarity, safety, and belonging are sort during times of emotional, physical, and psychological displacement (ibid: XV – XVI). Like Boym, Wilson suggests that,

Nostalgia is an emotion of longing for a past - admittedly, the longing may be for a past that did not necessarily exist (we do engage in selective memory). Nostalgia may be experienced collectively, in the sense that nostalgia occurs when we are with others who shared the event(s) being recalled. In this way, nostalgia might be used as conversational play and as a strategy for bonding (2012: 36).

In this sense, nostalgia may be drawn upon as an emotional tool for reorganising, understanding, exploring, and sharing in a version of the past that is not wholly true or untrue (ibid: 27). Instances of nostalgia as conversational play and bonding arose throughout the research period. Often members discussed interesting musical moments after corps worship services and large regional meetings, evening music programmes, rehearsals, and small social gatherings. During discussions such as these, an appreciation for some of the music may be shared. However, these sentiments tended to turn to a comparative discussion surrounding the size of brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades of times past down to the contemporary worship bands, singing groups, and the music-makers in these groups at present. Although these topics generally lent towards feelings of lament, nostalgia played a crucial role in the sharing and grounding of the past in the present. Some members bonded over shared friendships and familial connections, large corporate worship experiences, music tours, and raising their families in vibrant musical environments. One participant in their mid-twenties explains how quickly music groups can alter and how this experience is shared by other members within the local corps,

We looked back on it and say, “Oh, the timbrels –” yeah, all the time. I myself was really sad when it ended, and I still watch the YouTube videos and I’m like, “Oh, I remember the time,” and I don’t know how to say it without trying to be really up my self but we were really good, so I was like what a shame that the Salvation Army lost a really good timbrel brigade. We’re all the same age and we’d grown up playing since we were little together. I’ve been here for 15 years and so we all played together for 15 years before it ended, so it was a really good – and because we have the band, a really great band, behind us, it all just came together so well and everybody just smiled and entertained and had a great time and we were all praising the Lord out there, it was just the best thing ever. And so now I always think back and, “Oh remember the time when this happened. When we went to this concert –” all that kind stuff (Interview: 10.10.2018).

In this way, engaging with the emotional process of nostalgia reframes the assets of the past whilst placing aside the difficulties that surrounded them. Throughout his work surrounding barbershop singing, Nash suggests that nostalgic feelings help individuals and communities to come to terms with a changing world,

By constructing a version of what the past was like, people can sharpen and define meanings that they want to make important in the present... When people perceive threats and obstacles to constructing and maintaining coherent and consistent senses of self, they can shore up their identities through remembering, recalling, reminiscing, and having other emotional experiences associated with doing an imagined past (2012: 592).

Either in communities or as individuals, these imagined pasts are recreated each time they are called (ibid). However, Boym warns, that “the danger of nostalgia is that it tends to confuse the actual home and the imaginary one” (2001: XVI). For some, nostalgia is a healthy reimagining of times past. For others, it is a painful emotional cell holding them in stasis. What is evident is the power nostalgia holds in binding communities together through the sharing of experiences, stories, and mythologies. As nostalgia allows for a reframing of the past it simultaneously allows for reframing of the future. How one places themselves in the past informs how one interacts, understands, and finds continuity in the present (Wilson 2005: 27). This continuous interaction between the past, present, and future facilitates a sense



of control during change and a reassurance of identity and ‘realness’ in the world (ibid: 34). As Aden explains,

Nostalgic communication provides individuals with a means of symbolically escaping cultural conditions that they find depressing and/or disorienting. Using communication to move through time allows individuals to situate themselves in a sanctuary of meaning, a place where they feel safe from oppressive cultural conditions (1995: 35)

In this way, nostalgic communication and imagining provides a “temporal escape” where individuals and communities may escape the demands of contemporary life and explore moments of meaning that seem threatened or lacking in the present (ibid: 22, 26). This process was of particular importance as The Salvation Army Australia underwent a significant period of change as the organisation moved from two governing territories to one national territory (Simpson 2018). For some, this was a time of creativity and excitement. For many members, this was a period of confusion, uncertainty, frustration, and devastation. During this time, nostalgic communication provided a process to explain who *they* are as salvationists, who *their* community is, and what is important to *them*. From an inspiring worship meeting, territorial congress or music camp, down to the weekly routines of everyday Army life, salvationist nostalgia speaks to the histories, values, and particular *ways of being* that explain why and who they are at present. In many ways, the act of recalling and reinterpreting memories involves nostalgic communication in facilitating the “continuity of identity” (Wilson 2005: 35). Wilson explains that,

Nostalgic recollection gives us the opportunity to observe and juxtapose past and present identity. What are the changes in identity over time? Do images of former selves indicate ideals that we feel we should try to recapture? Those images can guide us in our ongoing construction of identity (ibid)

In this way, nostalgia and identity maintain a close relationship that are reinforced when peers come together. Although stories and experiences are shared in the spirit of communal bonding, nostalgia as a social exercise reiterates a ‘realness’ of the past. In many cases, the desire to relive a host of idyllic qualities captured within manicured memories, reinforces the sociocultural expectations and behaviours that are deemed acceptable within communities.

Through this process, nostalgia may be revisited in times of joy and reminiscence, but also in times of great challenge and change where one's place and identity are brought into question. Nash observes that the relationship between nostalgia and identity informs individuals and communities during times of change,

When people perceive threats and obstacles to constructing and maintaining coherent and consistent senses of self, they can shore up their identities through remembering, recalling, reminiscing, and having other emotional experiences associated with doing an imagined past (2012: 592).

Typically, turning to familiar self-expressions of the past are comforting behaviours that help to reground individuals and communities. The sharing of stories within Salvation Army environments often centred around music-making and impactful moments involving music where large groups of people came together and the sounds music groups made were familiar. Interestingly during the fieldwork period, one corps reflected on the history of The Salvation Army in Australia in an afternoon session involving historical talks and presentations, displays made up of artifacts, and some members dressed in old Salvation Army uniforms to portray famous Salvation Army figures from the past (ethnographic notes). What is significant about this event was the retelling of Salvation Army history, the connections members made to these figures (some were related generations ago), and the role music played throughout the afternoon. From the brass band and songster figurines on the table, old band photos on the walls, and the live brass ensemble dressed in historical uniforms, this corps community actively recreated a version of the past that reinforced a sense of permanence by drawing upon the qualities of nostalgic communication and imagination (ibid; Aden 1995: 35). By placing themselves in relation to the wider Salvation Army Australia story, this corps community partook in the renegotiation of history and memory as they reframed a sense of communal identity; a renewed sense of *salvoness*.

In their book, *Music, Nostalgia and Memory*, Garrido and Davidson discuss the power of music and its ability to conjure memories and feelings of nostalgia noting that,

The music of any particular culture at a given point in time reflects the sounds of the environment in that place and time as well as idiosyncrasies of the local language such as prosodic and rhythmic elements (2019: 49).

Due to the pervasiveness of music within The Salvation Army, it is no wonder why this expression of worship, culture, community, and identity holds such meaning and comfort to the members within the denomination. Certain styles and genres of Salvation Army music that were performed within specific sociocultural contexts summon versions of the past for many members as “music may thus be seen to serve as a container for the temporal structure of past circumstances” and as a “material rendering of self-identity; a material in and with which to identify identity” (DeNora 2004: 67, 69).

#### **4.5 Identity and *Salvones***

It is important to note that the matter of identity has been a significant concern for salvationists for many generations. Questions surrounding *who are we?* and *what is our purpose?* have echoed throughout the worship halls of The Salvation Army Australia for decades. Although the sociocultural internal and external shifts of the 1960s through to the worship wars point to significant times of change and challenge, The Salvation Army has continuously revisited what it means to *be* a salvationist. The dance between the mission (organisation), salvationists (the self), and the external world (the public) has taken place since its earliest days. Metrustersy notes that each iteration of the denomination has “found an element of ‘mission drift’ within the organisation” as each new wave of salvationists reassess, reorganises, and reinterprets what Salvationism is in response to their current sociocultural climate, preceding generations, and the origin myths of the early mission (2016: 2 – 3). The role of worship music expressions, and the dichotomy in which they sit, are interwoven throughout these concerns often reflecting the state of The Salvation Army more clearly than anticipated (DeNora 2004: 70). In this way, music-making provides an important lens to view and tease apart countless sociocultural changes experienced by many members of The Salvation Army within Australia and the impact of these changes on salvationist life,

Music, like identity, is both performance and story, describes the social in the individual and the individual in the social, the mind in the body and the body in the mind; identity, like music, is a matter of both ethics and aesthetics (Frith 1996: 109).

This chapter has discussed how music and *musicking* for many salvationists describes who they are, where they come from, and who they belong to. Within the sociocultural context of

The Salvation Army Australia, music-making has formed and informed the lives of generations where members have found their places within communities by participating in the life of the corps and in the wider Salvation Army in numerous ways. For some, actively participating in corps music-making has not only provided a musical outlet, it has also provided a role within the community itself. Hirabayashi suggests that performing a role, such as musician or teacher, provides members with a sense of stability and place within their community (2009: 41). However, Hirabayashi also notes that,

Having social roles does not imply the imposition of conformity. One does not always perform the socially demanded roles. As mentioned earlier, through music – the playing and teaching of it – community members share and negotiate their knowledge and experience. They carry forward their shared music tradition and rituals by negotiating the practices reproduced by their communal disposition (ibid: 41 – 42).

In this way, *musicking* as a social expression can reinforce social norms, challenge the status quo, articulate change, and reframe the sociocultural world in which it exists (Frith 1996: 110 – 111). In many local corps expressions, the worship music chosen each week reflected either the tastes of the congregation, a desire of the worship team to introduce new music, or a combination of both. Due to the centrality of music within Salvation Army expressions ('we *are* a music-making people'), the aesthetic choices surrounding worship music and its impact upon congregational members was evident. Although many themes surrounding *salviness* as an identity arose throughout this research project, almost all fell to one overarching question:

*If we as salvationists stop worshipping with our 'traditional' music expressions, are we still The Salvation Army?*

However framed, most participants grappled with this question in contrasting ways. A primary concern for many participants was a loss of salvationist theological teaching through the use of Salvation Army songs during meetings both in and outside of the corps building. During the research period, one retired Salvation Army officer offered these insights,

Traditional music on the other hand may be centuries old but has a much wider scope. Often the doctrine of the Church and what we believe as Salvationists is

contained within the pages of our Song Book. Because this music and verse is used by the Church Universal, it connects us to all other Christians in other denominations and brings about a unity of spirit.

Apart from special topics which cover events and celebrations, the songs contain:

- Devotional words which express much deeper emotion than just praise and worship and they help us express our love and commitment at a much deeper level.
- Songs of challenge & holiness. These songs are used by the Holy Spirit to convict us to look deeper into our souls and allow the work of the Spirit to help us to grow spiritually and to respond to God in new ways.
- Doctrinal songs which express what we believe. The recognition that God is almighty and the God of creation, that he is a God of forgiveness and works in our lives in love and mercy, that it is possible to live a life worthy of Him and to grow in His likeness, that His power is available to us to live a victorious life.
- Songs of the Cross and the sacrifice that Jesus made for us so that we can know His forgiveness, His love, His mercy and allows us to see God in new ways.
- Christmas songs, where the amazing power of God can be seen in His entry into our world (Participant notes: 27.10.2019)

As this officer explains, ‘traditional’ Salvation Army music holds within it the responsibility to connect, educate, and encourage spiritual growth at a much deeper level than the ‘contemporary’ “emotional expression” of praising God (ibid). Chapter two explored The Salvation Army’s adaption of popular music hall songs, folk tunes, and the traditional ballads functioned as a didactic device as they attracted crowds within the public sphere. The “religionise secular things” approach transformed secular nineteenth-century contemporary songs into songs of praise and worship (Winston 1999: 4). Many of these songs became canonised within *The Salvation Army Song Book*. The canonisation of these songs held within them the qualities salvationists valued and enjoyed. These musical and ideological tropes developed into a unique worship expression to be extended upon by composers for brass bands and songsters throughout the greater mission for decades as they

were held within the confines of Salvation Army publishing restrictions and regulations (Herbert 2000: 188). However, the influx of ‘outside’ worship music into the worship expressions of The Salvation Army Australia brought with it several anxieties. As one participant notes,

I think we’re simplifying the theology in our songs to match Hillsong, and then I think we’re losing because actually the whole concept of – we had song books in the first place because people couldn’t read and so they didn’t understand our theology. So if they could sing it, then they’d learn the theology. If you only knew about God what you sang these days, you’d be in trouble. You really wouldn’t know a heck of a lot about God at all. You’d know a lot more about yourself because a lot of the songs are about – God does this for me, I respond to God in this way. A lot are very self-oriented, and I say that because I’ve been trying to find songs for the ensemble that are not like that and it’s hard. Like actually there’s a serious lack of understanding of the Trinity and of God in contemporary songs – I think a lot of contemporary songs. So, I think if we were to only use non-Salvation Army songs, we would lose an element of our army-ness in that. I think we would lose a depth of theology that we need because our theology is not the same as everyone else’s and that’s something that we need to be aware of is that – yes, we are part of the wider Christian church, but actually we have some things that make us quite different to everyone else, and if we don’t learn them, then we lose them a bit (Interview: 04.04.2019).

The watering down of theology in worship music and the lack of specific Salvation Army doctrinal teaching through this worship expression is of concern for both traditionalists, contemporary supporters, and everyone in between. Regardless of age, most participants expressed a concern regarding a lack of teaching offered by contemporary worship music, the need to intentionally search for songs that offer depth, and the need to assess the theology offered,

I think it’s tricky cause I’m not against using new songs and let’s partner, let’s resource it, let’s not do the job twice, but at the same time, so much of our older songs have our theology in it, and so I think we need to be careful not to be doing songs that are teaching the wrong theology behind it ... if we’re not using a song

book anymore and those songs align with us, great, but I think it also creates a new opportunity to do something new to make sure our theology is still being taught in an easy way 'cause it's super easy way to teach masses about what we believe is through song. So if it's not being taught that way, fine, but it probably creates a new space to teach it some other way if that makes sense (Interview: 02.03.2018).

Many participants were diplomatic when discussing the challenges of 'outside' contemporary worship music, however, the introduction of contemporary worship bands has clashed against 'traditional' Salvation Army music-making practices. As Hirabayashi suggests, holding a social role allows members to "forward their shared music tradition and rituals by negotiating the practices reproduced by their communal disposition" (2009: 42). Although the impact of the worship wars has been discussed in chapter two, many members of corps brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades have found themselves displaced by the convenience of contemporary worship bands as well as a loss of music-makers. The personal cultural and social capital music-makers accumulated by performing certain roles in 'traditional' Salvation Army music groups and a sense of belonging and connection with others has changed. This has left many members questioning their place and position within their corps communities and the wider Salvation Army Australia. As has been noted within this chapter, music groups foster social spaces where participants can engage in fellowship and community as they move through various stages of life (Finnegan 1989). The significance of these groups no longer supporting "critical 'pathways' through life" as anticipated by members "born and bred!" challenges certain ideas of *salviness* as an identity (Finnegan 1989; Frith 1996: 46). In other words, the music-making roles that strongly informed individual and group identities have shifted leaving members questioning and reforming who they are and what their *salviness* looks like at present.

Although these challenges to identity and belonging have been difficult for many members to reconcile, others reconcile their musical *salviness* in different ways. It is important to note that during fieldwork, most corps supported a small contemporary worship band comprised of whomever was available. Larger corps may have a rostered music team, however, most had a small group of music-makers supporting the congregation week-in and week-out. While some corps continued in the 'brass tradition', at the time of fieldwork, few corps supported a 'full' brass band. Few songster brigades continued in their traditional form as

singing groups presented in diverse ways. Therefore, within these contexts, each participant spoke to a distinctive Salvation Army expression that was formed and informed by certain ideas of *salviness*. It is important to acknowledge that most participants noted a sadness at the possible loss of Salvation Army music traditions. So ingrained is the aural signature of brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades that most members attending corps without these traditions continue to connect to it. However, members such as these tended to stitch together an amalgamation of ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ worship music throughout their experience of *salviness*. For instance, one participant explained,

If you just rock up every Sunday and everybody is singing Hillsong and there’re lights and smoke machines, but everybody happens to be wearing a white shirt, that’s just Hillsong in white shirts. That’s not the Salvation Army. But if you come here and it’s like yeah, chuck in *Jesus loves me! This I know*, and *The Power of Blood* or even *O Boundless Salvation*, then you’re like, “That’s the Salvation Army” but, aye, sometimes they can incorporate Hillsong’s worship into it [as well] (Interview: 10.10.2018).

This participant highlights what is *salviness* and what is not *salviness*. Whilst some corps may draw upon the aesthetic practices of megachurches, *salviness* involves the continuation of the message and the mission in ways that are understood as ‘salvo’. What differentiates The Salvation Army from megachurches is the culture, mythology, and theology that is interwoven throughout the musical practices of The Salvation Army. Unlike the inward-looking songs described by previous participants, anthemic songs such as *The Power of the Blood* and *O Boundless Salvation* speak directly to the salvationist narrative of service, salvation, and a strength in community as they move out to win the world for Christ. Sensibilities such as these are important to supporting a narrative that supports certain aspects of salvationist identities. Elder explains that narrative making provides a tool for understanding the world one resides (2007: 6). However true or false these narratives may be, these stories provide a way to understand why the world is the way it is (ibid). As Metrusterly suggested, each iteration of the denomination has (re)assessed, (re)organised, and (re)interpreted what *salviness* is in response to their current sociocultural climate, proceeding generations, and the origin myths of the early mission (2016: 2 – 3). Involving music that connects to salvationist sensibilities is of primary concern for many members. The desire for songs to revolve around the message and the mission is central for many worship leaders. If



the qualities of message and the mission are upheld, ‘outside’ worship music may be appreciated. One participant noted that whilst older members may not like newer songs, “they don’t have a problem supporting it, but they still want the message to be the same, and I think that’s something I’ve appreciated in my own understanding of what arminess is, is they still say the same story” (Interview: 30.07.2020).

Whilst many of the more contemporary worship songs used within Salvation Army worship services are not composed by salvationists, participants noted specific qualities that resonated with their ideas of *salviness*. For many, the sound that speaks to their salvationist identity is that of the brass band, songster brigade, and timbrels. Generally, the participants who identified brass as *salviness* tended to be members who had grown up in the denomination. They acknowledged the uniqueness of a brass band within worship contexts and how Salvation Army tunes and lyrics made the band sound ‘salvo’, as the following participants noted,

I think we’ve made brass band sound synonymous with army sound, but the reality is I can’t tell the difference between an army – if I’m listening to a recording, I can’t tell the difference between an army brass band and a non-army brass band. So the way we play it, no; the reason we play it, perhaps, and the intent behind it, perhaps... (Interview: 04.04.2019)

Band music can ‘speak’ to you when you associate certain words with the music. Similarly with songsters – words associated with the music (Questionnaire: No. 3)

I think that the brass band was, I guess, ‘cause there’re not many bands left now. Having a brass band in church is fairly original. What’s the right word, fairly specific to the Salvation Army. You wouldn’t walk into the Baptist church down the road and see brass band sitting on the platform. So I guess we did do that and that was our thing for a long time (Interview: 25.02.2019)

Along with the brass band aesthetic and catchy, up-beat tunes, lyrical content plays a primary role for most members. Participants noted the passion and energy they feel when singing Army sounding tunes, “Having grown up ‘army’ I find it just ‘stirs’ something within me. An up-tempo Army song that fits with a good timbrel beat just sends shivers up my spine”

(Questionnaire: No. 2), and a certain kind of connectivity rousing Salvation Army tunes can have during praise and worship. Regardless of origin, themes such as social justice, kingdom building, and spiritual warfare within congregational worship music draws upon sociocultural tropes interwoven throughout *salvones*. One officer observed that,

It sounds army if it has references to armies and soldiers and that kind of more tone of going warfare and armour, wearing armour and being prepared for the fight and the battle, all those sorts of army type themes, particularly field, they're salvationist. I think, too, justice and particularly looking after the least the last and the lost. So, if you're talking about the poorest people or the people most vulnerable or whatever that is, that seems to have an army flavour in the song as well, and those sort of songs are really grab the community at the moment as well because community is very focused on courses and battling against some particular injustice. So that sort of brings that kind of contemporary thought into established army songs and flavours new army songs, makes them feel like army. So, these are few new army songs that our congregation embraces because of that justice and warfare kind of theme (Interview: 18.02.2019)

This officer is keenly aware of the thematic qualities that fit an expression of *salvones* that is relevant to their local corps expression. However, the musical tropes described above seem to resonate throughout The Salvation Army regardless of 'traditional' or 'contemporary' music. Although congregational worship music varies in genre, salvationists find moments of connection in worship music that is direct, sincere, and practical,

I would hope that salvo relates to its theology and perspective, rather than sound. Although, truly salvo, for me, would mean contemporary, straight forward language (easily understood), and easy to sing along with (hence contemporary). I'm not sure many would agree with me – I do not think brass arrangements of 80 year old songs is "salvo", but rather a relic of what was salvo at a particular time and place (Questionnaire: No. 7)

This approach to congregational worship music highlights the importance placed on theologically sound, community focused worship music. Not all worship music observed throughout the fieldwork period reflected this description. However, it has been observed that

as the sounds of The Salvation Army responds to the cultural shifts of the denomination, members have increasingly become more aware of the implications of ‘outside’ *and* ‘inside’ worship music and how these worship expressions inform notions of *salviness*. As one participant concludes,

If there is such a thing as ‘the sound of Salvo music’ – I would say it’s the lively, even raucous sound of people praising God, especially in Chapel services at the local Recovery services or Streetlevel. Whether it’s with a band, a guitar, or a CD, there is something about that sound that I’ve never heard anywhere else. When you see someone whose life has literally been turned around by Jesus and they are singing their heart out – that’s Salvo (Questionnaire: No. 13).

## Chapter 5 – Tradition and Contemporary Worship Music

### 5.1 Introduction

Based in ethnographic fieldwork both online and offline, chapter five explores how Australian salvationists negotiate the remnants of the worship wars as congregants in corporate worship. The chapter presents a variety of worship and performative practices salvationists have employed to meet the needs and expectations of their congregations including the (re)creation of worship spaces, use of symbolism, (re)organisation of music expressions, and engagement with digital technology. Through these negotiations and practices, salvationists diversify and (re)frame what it means to ‘be salvo’ in community, (re)connect to larger ideas of Salvationism and (re)formulate individual and communal expressions of *salviness* that are entirely relevant to their milieu. The following vignettes exemplify three contrasting worship experiences that illustrate congregations performing *salviness* in diverse ways.

Vignette one:

*This Salvation Army Corps is in an office building only a short walk from the train station and main street. Above the corps are Salvation Army administration services, however the corps occupies a large portion of the building. As you walk onto the office floor, you are met with large colourful posters and decorations celebrating the cultural diversity of the corps. I find myself a coffee as more people arrive for the Sunday morning meeting. It doesn't take long before the floor fills with congregants becoming busy and loud. We make our way into the worship hall that takes up at least one third of the office floor. It is an unusually shaped room as it accommodates the surrounding offices, kitchen, and cry room. The church uses the back wall and a low platform as the focal point. Small open boxes line the front of the platform to act as the mercy seat with tissue boxes placed under each one.*

*The band is set up on either side of the platform with the drum kit, amplifier, and bass guitar stage right and a six-piece brass band stage left leaving the middle for singers and the meeting to be led. A large wooden cross is on the wall in the middle with light white curtains on either side. Down lights light the stage. The ceiling is painted black with party lights hung throughout the church. This worship space has a homely ‘makeshift’ feel as the corps have fit a church into an*

*office building. Because of the building style, the ceiling is very low reducing sound projection. Almost all the musicians have microphones with the mixing desk and computer for projections are at the back of the church. Rather than pews, the corps use individual seats grouped around the room facing the platform. This seems to make the most of the strange shape of the room.*

*The meeting begins with a call to worship as the congregation enters the room and take their seats. It is casual yet respectful. Once we are settled, the worship leader introduces a second contemporary song that includes the small brass band... After the offering, we are invited to sing two more songs: "Power in the Blood" and "How Great is Our God". Power in the Blood is played by both the worship band and brass band musicians. This is a famous Salvation Army song that often feels like an anthem. With a worship band and four lead singers from different nations, it sounds a little lighter and not quite what we would expect from this song. Rather than a heavy, full brass band sound with traditional British congregational singing, this corps' rendition of Power in the Blood incorporates the sensibilities of a corps that sings traditional Salvation Army songs, western contemporary Christian music, and the worship music (and languages) from the homelands of congregants from across the world. The verses are kept, but the worship leaders add melisma pushing the style making it sound popish with Americanised vowel sounds. The band plays from the 2015 Salvation Army Tune Book but are overpowered by the singers and worship band.*

Fieldwork Notes, 6<sup>th</sup> August 2017

Vignette two:

*I am at urban corps in the south of Sydney. This urban corps is one of the larger corps within the region and has the reputation of being 'traditional'. The hall is typical of older Salvation Army buildings in its simplicity. Like many Salvation Army halls, the front doors lead into a small vestibule with windows that look straight into the hall. Like many Army worship halls, the hall is a plain box room with platform at the font, mercy seat to the side, a simple cross, and message on the back wall. Salvation Army flags stand stage right near a baby grand piano, electric drums and keyboard. As attendees make their way into the building, they*

*are greeted by members of the corps. Many find people they already know, greet each other, and find their seats very quickly. Most of these people are in navy Salvation Army uniforms and are of an older generation. There are few people under the age of fifty present.*

*I am greeted a few times and asked why I am attending today. I explain why giving my research and Army connections. As we wait for the meeting to begin, the brass band walk into the platform and take their seats. There are approximately twenty players, all men and all in navy uniform. After the band finishes, the songsters take their places on the steps that lead up to the platform. They sing “Come let us sing for Joy, Joy to the Lord”, a well-known song sung by the International Staff Songsters. This song is found in the Sing to the Lord series (Navy Cover). This is a large jubilant song that sounds quite traditional (in Salvation Army terms and people clap after the message.*

*After the songsters, the meeting begins and we are invited to sing “Stand Up and Bless the Lord”, which is accompanied by the band. The words are projected on the wall behind the band for everyone and we sing all verses. The platform takes up the width of the hall and the brass band assumes most the space. An acoustic drum kit is placed in the corner aside the band as the basses sit against the back wall. In this space the band is extremely loud. Although the drummer doesn't strike the kit hard, the sound still cuts through the band very well. “Stand Up and Bless the Lord” is a well-known song and the band plays this from the Salvation Army Tune Book (SATB) in a very strait traditional manner.*

*After singing we sit and there is a testimony time. During testimony time, we sing a verse and chorus of “There's No Other Name” between each testimony (again supported by the band). This is very common Salvation Army practice as it gives time for people to think about what they would like to share with the congregation. We clap during the chorus in “Army clapping patterns” often on the off-beat and in march patterns in time with the drums. When sharing, participants stand up and use a microphone so that everyone can hear. This singing of verse, chorus and sharing happens three times before this segment of the meeting comes to a close...*

Vignette three:

*In an entertainment centre several thousand salvationists join in worship and celebration. The large stage is arranged in the familiar set-up most salvationists recognise: platform, band in the centre, songsters stage right, dignitaries (clergy) stage left, Salvation Army flags adorn the platform as sizable projection screens cover the back wall. Between the congregation and the stage, six long white benches are arranged either side of a large figure of Australia providing mercy seats for prayer, reflection, and (re)commitment. Salvationist clergy wear navy uniforms whilst the brass band and songster brigades wear summer uniforms. Although some salvationists wear casual uniforms in the congregation, there are rarely casual uniforms on the platform.*

*The meeting begins with preludes from both the brass band and songsters before a welcome and acknowledgement of country. The congregation is invited to stand as a processional for dignitaries and newly commissioned officers commences to the tune of "Soldier's Hymn" played by the brass band. Each participant in the processional walks into the hall accompanied by a Salvation Army flag. Newly commissioned Lieutenants salute the General and other officials before taking their place at the front of the platform.*

*After a welcome to the congregation, three singers and a worship leader make their way onto the platform. The worship leader encourages the congregation to sing the song "We have come into His house". Although this song has not been included in the programming of the meeting, the congregation join the leader singing in four-part harmony. Many of the younger congregants do not know the song but follow regardless. The congregation sing one verse and chorus archipelago before being led into the next song, "O for a thousand tongues". This song is supported by the William Himes arrangement for brass band and piano that involves an instrumental introduction/transition after each chorus. The congregation stand and clap "Army patterns" during the bright uplifting choruses. They sing confidently and enthusiastically as this song is another popular tune that is sung throughout The Salvation Army International. During*

*the instrumental transitions, the worship leader prompts the congregation by saying the first line of the next verse. They sing with a mixture of American and Australian vowel sounds sounding slightly unrehearsed. Although all musicians on the platform are mic'd, the worship leader and singers are close mic'd. They are the only participants on the platform in casual uniforms. After the song, they make their way off the stage...*

Fieldwork Notes, 8<sup>th</sup> December 2018

These three vignettes capture diverse congregational music-making within The Salvation Army in contrasting worship spaces, illustrating the varied use of traditional and contemporary worship songs. In the first vignette the traditional Salvation Army song, *Power in the Blood*, takes on a new form as it is expressed in the voices of congregants from all over the world. Rather than assigning the 'traditional' Salvation Army songs to the brass band, this corps engages with traditional songs through the diverse voices that make up the worship band (including brass) and congregation immediately (re)imagining and (re)creating how salvoness is enacted and experienced within the corps. In the second vignette, an older congregation comes together for worship in a traditional Salvation Army hall that is purpose built. Within this space, salvationists continue to engage with a traditional format and worship style reminiscent of the Army pre worship wars. The corps is welcoming but held in a moment in time unyielding to the 'outside'. In the final vignette, salvationists gather in an entertainment centre to join in worship and celebration. The congregation engage with a familiar format where the music draws upon the traditional sounds of a brass band and songster brigade yet involves contemporary sounding worship leaders and a mixture of traditional and contemporary worship songs. This event attempts to find a middle ground for a national meeting that was attended by thousands of salvationists both in person and online nationally.

All three examples provide insight into how traditional and contemporary worship music is negotiated to reflect the needs and expectations of congregations from a local to national level. In this sense, *musicking* may be understood as the mediator between traditional and contemporary preferences. Where worship music is often a place of contention, vignette one exemplifies how music-making can bring together multiple cultures and musical preferences in a unified moment. The second vignette illustrates how traditional music-making speaks to



an older generation who understand and (re)create a version of *salviness* that is home to them, as the third vignette draws upon the qualities of both traditional and contemporary music expressions in the hope drawing upon the primary qualities that encompass what it means to ‘be salvo’.

For some salvationists, the discourse surrounding ‘traditional verses contemporary’ (or ‘modern’) continues to be a confronting, whilst others have reconciled certain ideas surrounding the challenges of contrasting expressions of worship musics. What is certain, is that all participants have opinions regarding this discussion. The peak of the worship wars may have passed, but music-making salvationists continue to encounter the residue of the conflicts that impacted The Salvation Army over three decades ago. This chapter explores the lasting impact of these conflicts upon the generations that experienced the full force of the worship wars and how the following generations inherited the consequences of these wars and how they negotiate the challenges left to them.

## **5.2 Setting the scene**

Tradition and change, old and new, right and wrong, thriving and surviving, are all challenges the church universal has weathered throughout its inception. However, as chapter two explains, worship music became the “front line” for the worship wars (Ruth 2017: 3). Contemporary worship music required changes to worship style, delivery, and often the space occupied. Instrumentation, technology, musical styles, and language became tangible symbols that challenged the ideological tropes of both traditional and contemporary worship music (Ruth 2017: 3; Ingalls 2018: 7). For some, contemporary worship music was a front to sound theological expressions of worship steeped in music hundreds of years old whilst advocates for contemporary worship music argued for involving the musical trends of the day in order to reach their contemporaries (Evans 2006: 58). A secondary challenge within this discourse is the feeling of confusion, hurt, distrust, and inadequacy within significant moments of great change. Ingalls explains,

More than a vehicle for communicating theological or ideological meaning, both traditional and contemporary styles of worship music are also a repository for individual memories and an enabler of the collective activities that hold communities together (2018: 8).

During the research, it was this concept of worship music as a “repository for individual memories and an enabler of the collective activities” that arose a primary theme throughout the data. Older members had engaged with large music groups supported and celebrated by their local corps communities. The worship wars challenged not only the validity of traditional Salvation Army music-making but also the importance of the traditional music groups that supported music-making salvationists in fellowship and community. By the 1990s, the worship wars had taken a hold of The Salvation Army in Australia and traditional music groups began to vocalise their distress, as one bandmaster expressed in the 1993 edition of *The Musician*,

It appears we have a small but vocal minority in Salvation Army ranks who believe that [brass] bands are a thing of the past ... the current growing use of “worship bands” (so called), and a feeling that perhaps these groups should take over, being more up-to-date and modern in approach and sound and having greater appeal to youth ... The demise of brass bands will spell the eventual demise of The Salvation Army. Of that I have no doubt (Woods 1993: 1).

Articles published within *The Musician* during the 1990s begin with headlines such as “Pursuing Relevance” and “Worship or sanctified vaudeville?” (Guy 1994: 1; Barbour 1995: 3). These articles, and others like them, question the place of contemporary worship music within the Salvation Army worship context. Some champion contemporary worship music defending its inclusive qualities whilst reassuring a love of brass bands and songster bridges, whilst others address the crisis head on by appealing to the values of both worship expressions in an attempt to quell further crisis (ibid). However, as the debates continue in print and in local corps, questions of value and identity continued throughout this period. As Woods poses in his article:

Will The Salvation Army retain its attractiveness to the men folk who today are so well represented in it? Will The Salvation Army lose its identity? What will happen to our presence on the street, in the market, and elsewhere? Will we cease to be an “army”? (Woods 1993: 8).

These questions are still prevalent today as many of the brass bands Woods refers to no longer exist. However, it is important to note that whilst the worship wars rattled The Salvation Army

throughout the 1980s and 1990s, members within The Salvation Army recall a quietening of the figurative canons,

The [corps] was the epitome of worship wars. We lost an entire generation of people because of the worship wars and I think that was the initial reason for it and then bad pastoring then resulted in us losing the entire generation of people. And I think worship wars, arguments over style could have been dealt with. I think they could – it didn't have to go like that. So, I don't blame it all on the music, but I think that started generational issues, I think. And so, I think I find it quite a success, I think, now for us to not have any question about... [contemporary worship music], like for there to not be any drama (Interview 04.04.2019).

At the time of research, the debate between contemporary and traditional had settled into certain ways of being as salvationists either seemed to find communities that provided the worship music they enjoy or come to terms with the music expression in their local corps,

the worship wars has subsided because people have either chosen a camp and that's where they're gonna sit in or they've become happy in a blended<sup>21</sup> arrangement (Questionnaire 30.07.2020).

### **5.3 What is a traditional and contemporary corps?**

As the worship music took the brunt of the worship wars, Ruth reminds us that music-making was not the only casualty of war (2017: 3). Worship environments, service style and delivery, the impact of technology, and the formality of dress, challenged the entire sociocultural framework of religious institutions (ibid). For The Salvation Army, meetings were held in more informal spaces and at times outside of the Sunday programme, services (or meetings) began to include “praise and worship” segments where the congregation were invited into sing contemporary worship music supported by the worship band, projectors conflicted with the values and messages held within the Salvation Army song book, and the a change in dress

---

<sup>21</sup> Within this context, the term ‘blended’ refers to placing ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ worship music-making practices side-by-side within a worship service or church event. This arrangement is discussed further in section 5.5.

brought into question the importance of uniform, the formality of it, and ultimately the need for it,

Do we need uniform? As long as we are an Army, fighting on the front lines, of course we do! But, is it possibly the time for the Army to redesign that uniform and make it less expensive? ... Can you imagine how a well-designed uniform might propel us into the 21<sup>st</sup> century: ... something that our young people especially would take pride in wearing publicly without looking like some drab thing from a previous generation (Camsey 1994: 1, 4).

Uniform, the song book, and traditional Salvation Army music highlight specific points of conflict as some members resist change and others (re)imagine how significant ideological tropes specific to *salviness* continue to be meaningful, relevant, and at times, more practical. Over the past three decades, salvationists have either left the mission or accepted change due to the damage of conflict in various forms. As one participant noted above, people have either chosen a camp or found blends they were happy with. Within this reordering of *salviness*, the qualities or ‘ways of being’ of each category (traditional, contemporary/modern, or blended) formed an institutional shorthand for explaining difference.

### 5.3.1 Space and place making

Throughout the ethnographic fieldwork process, it became apparent how integral space and place is to the contextual understanding of who, when, where, and how music-making occurred. From open air meetings to large national gatherings, *salviness* is framed in specific ways that inform salvationists of the place, social space, and environment they (re)enact Army life (Wells 2020: 2). Laden with symbolism, meaning, and conventional frameworks, the physical locations described in the vignettes above illustrate contrasting expressions of *salviness* as well as a cluster of unifying symbolic tropes that reflect the ethos and values still prevalent to The Salvation Army today.

Historically, Salvation Army worship halls in Australia have been simple rectangular buildings with little embellishment (Muratore and Willis 2015: 65). In a recoil from the ostentatiousness of older established denominations, the early mission’s approach to the

worship space was one of simplicity, economy, and practicality. In their paper, *Building Salvation*, Muratore and Willis pay particular attention to the style and development of Salvation Army halls built within the first forty years of Salvationism in Australia (2015). Halls from this period adopted the Tudor Revival and Edwardian Baroque styles, presenting a distinct look commonly recognised throughout Australia as ‘salvo’. The platform, mercy seat, speaking rail, and congregational seating were the set criteria for an Army hall. Ornamentation came in the form of local Salvation Army flags, a Salvation Army crest, and occasionally a painted mural involving a bible verse (Muratore and Willis 2015: 65). From the city to small outposts, each hall created under The Salvation Army Australia’s first Properly Department complied to the simple, austere aesthetics for the “buildings are cheap, well built and not excessive in cost” (The War Cry in Muratore and Willis 2015: 68). These stylistic choices reinforced the working-class nature of The Salvation Army to the public and served as sites for social programmes and soul saving (Muratore and Willis 2015: 81).

Salvation Army halls reinforce a sense of permanency and belonging as they provide specific sites that are understood via the use of symbolic meanings. To provide an unpretentious worship hall that invites ‘the whomsoever’ into the corps harkens back to the early days of the mission’s engagement with the impoverished working-class of Victorian England. However, whilst some may experience and understand sacred sites as set apart from the profane, salvationists blur these boundaries by creating sacredness within the profane through the use of symbolism and organisation of the spaces they occupy. The first and third vignettes provide interesting examples of the transformation of space unintended for worship. Spaces may be set aside for chapels and worship spaces in workplaces, schools, universities, hospitals, yet vignette one exemplifies an experience of permanency in an office space entirely unintended for a church. Nestled in suburbia, the recreation of this space is organised to meet the needs and tastes of the local community. Like the worship halls of early salvationists, the hall uses a low platform, a mercy seat, lectern for preaching, seating for the congregation, and a wooden cross on the wall; the symbolic tropes recognised by almost all salvationists delineating a worship space. However, the plainness of the worship hall is disguised with white sheer curtains, stage lights, party lights, and other decorations, creating a feeling of intimacy in a building intended for office work. These decorations indicate that this corps is not strictly ‘traditional’. Rather than the stained-glass windows and wooden pews indicating history and tradition found older church buildings, this urban corps made their worship hall “special” by recontextualising external aesthetic tastes amongst religious

tropes (Steuernagel 2021: 137). By bringing together elements from the ‘outside’ in, participants within this congregation reimagine how church represents and relates to their life contexts. Steuernagel suggests that congregations curate space and music to frame and legitimise their worship expressions as they encounter worship spaces as set aside from everyday life (ibid: 138).

The second vignette illustrates a traditional worship space for salvationists throughout Australia. Although many older corps buildings have been sold and redeveloped, this urban corps continues to meet in their original hall that reflects the classic building designs of early Australian Salvation Army architecture. The box hall with a large platform, mercy seat, lectern, and Salvation Army flags that suggests this corps prefers a traditional worship style. However, it is the arrangement of approximately twenty chairs and music stands engulfing platform that reinforces the prominence of traditional Salvation Army worship music. Although contemporary ‘worship band’ instruments sit to the side, these instruments are left untouched throughout the meeting. The band enters the platform from the back of the platform in single file, holding their instruments up right in an almost march-like fashion. In many ways, this entry is ritualistic as it is repeated weekly by brass bands in similar contexts throughout the nation. During the research period, many of the larger brass bands in traditional worship contexts signify the commencement of the Sunday morning meeting in this way, drawing upon the militaristic tropes of organisational life. For the congregation, this signifies the beginning of the meeting as members find their seats and finish their conversations. As the building frames the meeting, the sound of the brass band creates a sonic boundary ultimately setting apart worship from the world outside (Steuernagel 2021: 137). In their chapter, *Making special, play, and change*, Steuernagel discusses the (re)creation of worship environments and how congregations negotiate the balance between tradition and change and sacred and profane by attempting to frame worship through the use of space, time, and symbolism (visual and aural) (2021: 128 – 161). Through their own ethnographic examples, Steuernagel explains that “just as a gardener landscapes a garden, so do congregations use music to design a space that is theirs and that is distinct from the outside world and that features a special soundscape” (ibid: 137). In vignette two, the corps brass band and songster brigade support provide the traditional soundscape of Salvation Army worship in a physical location that may be interpreted as ‘traditional’. Although contemporary songs and arrangements may be used within Army worship for brass bands and songsters, these were not included in this meeting. Within the boundary of this worship space

is the wearing of navy uniform only. The significance of uniform is explained further in the following paragraph; however, navy uniform as ‘formal’ dress immediately indicates a certain level of tradition. Within a local corps expression, salvationists expect a certain kind of Salvation Army worship that is often gaged by the type and number of uniforms worn within the congregation. Uniform wearing has become the signifier for depicting how traditional, contemporary, or blended a corps is. So much so that it has become part of Australian salvationist colloquialism. For example, when determining new sites to visit during fieldwork, salvationists would describe different corps as ‘uniformed’ meaning traditional, ‘non-uniformed’ indicating contemporary, and ‘some wear uniforms’ as blended (a mixture of both). In this sense, uniform provided a strong visual indicator of what tradition looks and sounds like within The Salvation Army Australia.

Vignette three presents a snapshot of a national gathering of salvationists held in a large entertainment centre. This is the final meeting of an event that took place over one week involving workshops, youth gatherings, discussion panels, and training. Like the first vignette, the hall has not been built for a worship experience, however, familiar Salvation Army tropes reframe the space inviting participants in for worship. As was described, the platform (stage) is arranged with brass band in the middle, songster brigades stage right, dignitaries stage left, with Salvation Army flags scattered across the stage. This arrangement alludes to traditional Salvation Army meetings where traditional sections sit on stage throughout the meeting to support worship. The salvationists who stay seated on the stage wear either full navy uniform or ‘summer uniform’ (formal white shirts and navy skirts or pants). For traditionalists, these uniforms are what senior soldiers and officers wear. For others, these uniforms are considered formal and, perhaps, outdated. It is important to note that there are no ‘salvo t-shirts’ on the platform until the worship leader and other singers lead the congregation in worship, which is momentary. The use of uniform indicates a few things to the congregation both attending in person and online. Firstly, this event is a national event celebrating the formation of the Australia territory. The hope of this event is to bring people together, both near and far, in celebration and excitement for the future. Due to the significance of this unification, the event was attended by the general of The Salvation Army, the international leader of the mission and organisation. As a symbol of unity, uniform can offer “insights into the institutional rules and regulations encoded in specific designs; uniform is a special form of clothing that marks status much more visibly than other forms of dress” (Tynon and Godson 2019:13). The presence of the general and other high-ranking

officers reinforced the call to oneness under the governance of *The Salvation Army*. The spectacle of flags, brass band, songster brigades, and large physical space provided a powerful visual impression as members in uniform embodied what it meant to be part of *this* Salvation Army in a moment of collective effervescence (ibid: 8). Secondly, part of the event included the commissioning and ordination of new officers. This is a formal and sacred meeting where salvationists witness cadets (officers in training) become ordained and officially commissioned as officers (ministers) within the mission by the Territorial Commander (Grey 2011: 90). Although contemporary worship music may be used within these meetings, they are highly curated and used sparingly. Within this example, older choruses and well-known Salvation Army songs and arrangements bring the congregation together. However, due to the formalities and intention of inclusivity, uniform, music, and language were employed in the hope of bringing people together as one congregation, one Salvation Army. In this sense, organisational committees strive to create a worship space that includes all members. For some, their attempts are obvious yet acceptable. For others, it points to a lack of clear direction and understanding of contemporary Salvationism,

The biggest challenge is when we come together for divisional corporate worship, which is unusual now, and I feel it's much to our detriment, that we don't know what we should be using as content and that becomes often a poor sample of all (interview: 30.07.2020)

The confusion over content not only lends itself to a confusion over worship music expression, but also over *salviness* itself. Although the representation of The Salvation Army as a national body may be perceived as unsure, salvationists themselves choose where, when, and what style of worship they will engage with. Primarily in urban spaces, members have the ability to attend a corps that speak to their worship style preferences rather than attending their local Salvation Army corps. In his pivotal article, *The Triumph of the Prize Songs: How guitars beat out the organ in the worship wars*, Michael Hamilton explains that the continuation of worship music as a cultural indicator determines the type of congregation in attendance. In other words, "American churchgoers no longer sort themselves out by denomination so much as by musical preference" (1999: 29)<sup>22</sup>. Rather than attend their local

---

<sup>22</sup> It is important to acknowledge that worship music is used and valued differently throughout many protestant denominations.



corps expressions, many salvationists residing in urban locations choose the corps that suits their style and identity, furthering the division between traditional and contemporary,

“we are all still sectarians; we still prefer to congregate with the likeminded. Our new sectarianism is a sectarianism of worship style. The new sectarian creeds are dogmas of music. Worship seminars are the seminars of the new sectarianism; their directors are its theologians. The ministers of the new sectarianism are our church worship leaders” (ibid: 30).

Some corps are able to hold various services throughout the week to meet the needs of worship preference. Other smaller corps must attempt to either compromise or blend worship styles or settle for providing consistent traditional or contemporary worship practices. Due to circumstance, one corps observed during fieldwork found itself forced to split their congregation in two. This resulted in the same meeting framed in a contemporary format and then a traditional format. As a small ethnographic case study, the following example provides a unique glimpse into the mechanising of ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ as organisational tropes between two worship services.

### 5.3.2 Ethnographic case study

Ethnographic Notes: 12<sup>th</sup> August 2018

Sunday Morning Meetings: 9:00am and 10:45am

*Since my last visit to this corps, the congregation are relocating and found a temporary home whilst they wait for their next corps building. Because of this, the corps have needed to fit into a building smaller than their previous location. One of these decisions regards to the size of corps attendance on a Sunday morning. In order to meet the demands of the congregation, the Sunday morning meeting to be split: a 9:00am service and a 10:45am service. Each service has been designed to appeal to a different demographic. The 9:00am meeting appeals to a younger, ‘family friendly’, contemporary congregation and the 10:45am an older more ‘traditional’ congregation. Although the worship music delivery is different, the meeting has the same message, readings, order of service, announcements, songs, and even jokes. The corps officers maintain their roles between both services as one leads and the other preaches. The officers recap what the 9.00am*

*congregation have been up to in a continued effort to keep the community connected.*

*Between the meetings there is a morning tea, where the '9ers' and '10:45ers' catch each other as they have a quick coffee, biscuit, and chat before people either leave for their day or attend the next service. Very few people stay for the second service unless they are 'on duty' for something. Most of the 9ers head out to lunch or some kind of Sunday family activity – many note how much they like the early meeting time as they still have the day to go off and do things after the meeting rather than losing half their day to the corps on Sundays.*

#### *9:00am Worship Meeting*

*I, like many others, meander through the front doors to the corps building. I am greeted by friends who make up most of the worship team for the meeting. Most of the people coming in are teenagers, young adults and families, with a few older attendees in the mix. The music team for the morning is a worship band made up of four singers, piano, bass, and drums. People wear casual Salvation Army uniform (Salvation Army t-shirts with smart-casual attire). Few people in the congregation wear full navy uniform (as it is winter). The people who do are generally older.*

*I chat with the worship team as they set up. No music is played over the sound system as people find their seats. A couple of minutes after 9:00am, the meeting begins with a call to worship, Crown Him with Many Crowns (Bridges, Thring & Elvey 1851), with a new chorus sung in between each verse. Near the end of the song, one of the singers leads the congregation into a moment of prayer. The band continues a little softer underneath as he prays, suspending the moment of prayer and contemplation. After the prayer, the leader indicates to the band and congregation to sing the chorus again by lyrically introducing the words indicating what is to come next.*

*Soon after this session, the congregation is invited to partake in their freewill offering. As they do so, the congregation is led in the song This is Amazing Grace (Wickham 2013). After a prayer for the offering, the worship team finish*

*their section with one more traditional hymn song sung with a contemporary groove. The rhythm a little syncopated, chest voices used, and “American-pop” vowel sounds quickly indicate a newer style of song for the hymn. As the tune is very well known and very stable (strophic form) the modernising of the song is very easy to understand and the congregation follow happily.*

*After the sermon, the appeal song is an older chorus, Eagles Wings (Hillsong 1999). This is led by the worship leader and accompanied by piano only. They repeat sections of the song as needed as some people sing prayerfully, others sit and listen, and some pray. Written in 1998, this Michael Crawford song is well-known (and considered ‘old’ to youth today) so little leading is required.*

*The final song, Forever (God is faithful) by Michael W Smith (2001), is another popular older song that works very well with a small rhythm group. It’s upbeat and tend to naturally move to the song. Normal uplifting song for the end of a meeting before the benediction and sending out. The band recaps the final song as people leave and make their way to morning tea.*

*One most people have left, or are obviously hanging around chatting, the band quickly packs up and makes space for the brass band to come in and set up for the next service. The second congregating begins to arrive and join in for morning tea before the second 10:45am service beings. Many of the first congregation leave.*

#### 10:45 Worship Meeting

*As the second congregation find their seats, a small brass ensemble made up of older men in full navy uniform and a couple of young girls on tenor horn from the young people’s brass band provide the music. The brass band members rearrange the chairs and as the band master hands out parts for the players who have turned up for the day. As he does, he explains what and how each arrangement is to be played, “remember this one is quite a bit faster” or “okay, this one we will play a little slower for the appeal song” and “don’t forget the repeats at...”*

*The congregation is significantly older compared to the families and young people at the 9:00am service. Full navy uniforms are far more prevalent – not only older senior soldiers but also quite a few retired officers in the congregation. There are some young kids around, but only 1 or 2 compared to 10+ in the previous meeting.*

*At 10.44 the band plays 10,000 Reasons (Bless the Lord) as their prelude. This a contemporary song by Chris Thomlin (2012) arranged for brass band. When this song was released, it was wildly popular, similar to Shout to the Lord (Hillsong 1996). Like the first meeting, the opening song is Crown Him with Many Crowns, played by the brass band directly from the tune book. This is a ‘traditional’ strophic arrangement and is sung by the congregation with a more classical voice and British vowel sounds. The song is not lead by a singer over a microphone, however, one of the corps officers sings up the front and seems to direct the congregation through the verses.*

*Again, the offering song is This is Amazing Grace, however the song is included in the projection presentation as a music video. Rather than sing along, the song is faded out once the offering has finished being taken up. People seem to engage with it but listen and treat it as an upbeat background song. Again, a video is used as the appeal song to fill the void for a modern worship song rather than using the band. It seems that when quieter, more contemplative music is in need, a recording is used rather than using a louder brass band. People close their eyes in contemplation, the video is turned down and one of the officers leads the congregation in prayer before moving on to the last song.*

*Forever (God is faithful) (Smith 2001), is played by the band as the final song. An upbeat arrangement for brass, this song is thought of as a contemporary “worship chorus” for rhythm band. The sound seems to suit the congregation more as the tune is played in a very stable 4/4. The band recaps the song for their postlude as people make their way out to morning tea or home.*

Where some corps have negotiated or gravitated towards a particular style of worship, this corps provides an example of how a congregation can be (re)organised across two meetings

by mechanising the same divisive qualities that have impacted The Salvation Army over the past three decades. A division most, if not all, corps continue to address on a weekly basis. Comparatively, these services meet many of the needs of both congregations, however, the delivery of these Sunday morning meetings presumes the worship music preferences of both congregations. By doing so, worship music delivery is the primary point of differentiation. It is important to reiterate that both meetings follow the same order of service; the same bible readings, sermon, video clips, jokes, and announcements, are repeated in the second 10:45am meeting. What makes this example interesting is the choice of music. Rather than choosing contemporary songs to suite the theme for the first service and the traditional equivalent for the second, the corps officers choose to repeat the same music selection for both services relying solely on delivery.

Meeting one involves a contemporary worship band. Like much of the congregation, they are dressed in an assortment of casual Salvation Army uniforms. This group provides all worship music in the meeting including light piano vamping that is continued before and after singing. Dovetailing worship music in this manner is a standard trope of contemporary worship music where the band quietens as a worship leader leads the congregation in prayer and meditation. The continuation of a worship song in this matter holds the congregation in a moment of suspension entirely reliant on the direction of the worship leader. The leader may end the prayer and bring the moment to a close, or they may choose to bring the congregation back into song typically recapitulating a chorus. As the contemporary worship band plays provides all worship music, it maintains the equilibrium of the space as the ensemble continues in the same style throughout the meeting. This is a trusted format well understood by a congregation that are willing to be lead in this manner.

In contrast, the approach to the second meeting presents an important example of how ‘traditional’ delivery may not translate directly without significant consideration. The second meeting is supported by a small brass band comprised of members who did not serve in the first meeting. Although this kind of arrangement occurs in many corps, key music-making participants are divided over two services effectively limiting the scope of worship music practice.<sup>23</sup> The brass band plays three songs within the meeting whilst the remainder are played as contemporary worship music videos. This congregation enjoys the brass band

---

<sup>23</sup> Almost all of the contemporary worship band would have also played in the brass band in the same meeting.

accompaniment and sing along with them confidently as the words are projected onto screens around the hall. What is different about this experience is the rigidity of brass band arrangements and contemporary worship music videos. Understandably, corps brass bands are confined to the arrangement provided. Repeats may be indicated in the moment, however, they rarely lend themselves to dovetail quietly into prayerful moments in the same subtle way a contemporary worship band would. A similar situation occurs with contemporary worship music videos (colloquially referred to as ‘YouTube worship’). However, what is important to note here is how congregants engaged with contemporary worship music videos differently.

Digital technology in worship will be explored further in this chapter, however, with reference to this case study, contemporary worship music videos alter the process and practise of musicking as a congregation compared to live music-making. For the salvationists in the second service who have experienced the height of brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades, the use of digital technology challenges core values surrounding corporate *musicking* in worship. Where print media such as *The Songbook of The Salvation Army* and *The Salvation Army Tune Book* hold spiritual, social, cultural, institutional, and personal values for many, digital media falls short of the significance print media signifies (Nekola 2021: 41). Contemporary worship music, words projected on screens, and singing to a high-quality recording of a praise and worship band left members feeling detached as these songs lacked cultural significance (particularly without a live band). In this context, contemporary worship music videos provided moments of reflection, but lacked the socially binding elements of history, institutional culture, and importantly, active engagement in the (re)creation of congregational worship. Rather than singing and worshipping, these congregants found themselves held in a moment of liminality detached from the experience of *communitas* encouraged before them (Turner 1969 [2017]). After moments such as these, re-entering the worship space becomes a challenging prospect as the process of worship *musicking* has been interrupted.

This case study provides a glimpse into the complex relationship between contemporary and traditional music-making and the delivery of these music either through live performance or digital technology. In short, traditional and contemporary worship music may be (re)imagined in new ways, however, delivery must fit social *field*. Consequently, this ethnographic case study highlights the importance of sociocultural context, meaning-making, institutional history, and the necessity for understanding *salvones* as a ‘way of being’ that is experienced

in a multitude of expressions both as individuals and communities. The following section explores how corps officers, worship leaders, and congregations organise and deliver worship music within their local worship expression. Importantly, it presents the challenges corps communities negotiate on a weekly basis as they build their own understandings of *salviness* as individuals and communities.

#### **5.4 Engaging with worship music**

From the beginning of this research, it was clear that this project would encounter diverse music-making expressions. 66 fieldwork sites, 8 live streamed events, and numerous conversations later, the ethnography gathered over 22 months presents a rich tapestry made up of salvationists young and old making music together. Often music within each corps meeting, large event, and rehearsal reflected the state of a community, musical preferences, and expression of *salviness*. Upon further investigation, music-making within these communities exemplified how members participated in community as they organised themselves, creatively problem solved, and continued to (re)imagine a *salviness* that reflected their personal and collective ideas with The Salvation Army Australia. This section explores the different ways salvationists engage with worship music, how technology is negotiated within these music practices, and how the dichotomy of ‘tradition verses contemporary’ plays out within these spaces. To discuss these complex topics with greater clarity, the following sections are presented in the following segments: music delivery, internal music-making ensembles, organising music-making for congregational worship, and technology and YouTube worship.

#### **5.5 Music delivery: internal music-making ensembles**

During fieldwork, it quickly became apparent that the delivery of worship music was unique to each site making it difficult to reconcile ‘Salvation Army music’ as a unified concept. What is reconcilable are the common musical, sociocultural, historical, and communal threads that bind communities together in *salviness*. In this sense, this section focuses on music made for the purpose of internal use such as corporate worship. While understanding that Salvation Army music-making continuously crosses internal and external community music-making boundaries, this demarcation provides a framework to discuss the internal negotiation of worship music within corps, larger Salvation Army events, and various online worship services.

It is safe to say that most Salvation Army corps strive to sustain live worship music regardless of worship music preference. For many corps, large brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades are a thing of the past leaving smaller versions of these groups in the wake of the worship wars and the passage of time. At the time of fieldwork, ensembles continued to fall within the two categories, traditional and contemporary. However, thirty years after the peak of the worship wars, the edges of these categories had become porous allowing for variation within the definition of what constitutes ‘tradition’ and ‘contemporary’ music-making practices. Few corps sustained a clear demarcation of the two groups, encouraging a cross over between worship styles. Generally, the most prominent demarcation of style lay between brass band and contemporary worship bands, as exemplified here:

The meeting begins at 9.30am and a uniformed member plays an electric piano before the meeting begins. The brass band walks onto the platform just before 9.30am to play a short prelude as the pianist finishes. There are approximately ten members (all older men) who play out of tune. After their short prelude, the meeting commences with the opening song, *To God be the Glory* with all verses lead by the band. The congregation are then led in a worship chorus segment with two songs, *His Love Endures Forever* and *Thank You Lord (2004 Hosanna & Integrity Music)*. Three ladies lead the congregation in each song as they sing in unison accompanied by piano and bass guitar. This ensemble is gathered in front of the platform separate from the brass band...

(ethnographic notes 13.05.17)

This is a common scenario observed throughout corps during the research period. The physical separation of brass band and contemporary worship band within the worship hall reinforces the notion of traditional and contemporary worship music as opposites. Neither musical world shall meet. This structuring of traditional and contemporary worship has become standard worship practice throughout many Christian denominations. Based on Robert Webber’s notion of ‘blended worship’, Dueck explains that “the bended service means there are two musical worlds of musical practice and preparation, which coexist side by side in services” (2017: 105). The ratio of traditional to contemporary differs from corps to corps often reflecting the demography of the congregation. Corps that include a greater portion of traditional worship expression tended to be referred to ‘uniformed corps’. As was explained above, a uniformed corps implies a traditional worship space where congregants



wear full uniform and tend to be older as the corps maintains a longer historical presence in their communities. The expectations of traditional Salvation Army sociocultural conventions continue to be (re)created in these spaces as the majority of corps folk perpetuate a version of *salviness* that is reliant on specific ‘Army’ tropes. A gesture of contemporary worship music, projected words on screen, and worship leader may be appreciated in these halls, however whilst a brass ensemble is sustained, song book tunes are still championed in these spaces.

Where blended services may have been a strategic choice for larger corps, for others, this presented as the only option. The worship music performed by many small corps were informed not by traditional or contemporary preference but by who is available at the time. These corps tended to be coastal or rural, often with a strong history of The Salvation Army in their town, and sustained congregation numbers between ten and one hundred. Many rural and coastal corps continued to enjoy the sounds of a brass ensemble whilst involving a contemporary worship ensemble. Where some corps brought both music expressions together, many maintained a separateness for ease, worship style preference, or general availability of music makers. Like the brass ensembles, contemporary worship ensembles in corps such as these involved all ages transforming both worship ensembles into spaces of pedagogy and mentorship. In this way, the availability of music makers shaped the delivery of worship music and how it was organised for worship. For example,

...the hall is in the middle of town. Perhaps not the original corps building, this hall has been built within the past three decades. The worship hall however, maintains the same plain box shape room, small platform, mercy seat along the front, holiness table to the side, and local Army flags up the back. The congregation is older with a few families with young children. The band slowly gathers on the platform as they turn up for Sunday morning meeting. Eventually, there are eight in the brass band involving four primary school aged children, three older soldiers, and one of the corps officers... contemporary or quieter songs are led on piano by one of the corps officers leaving the song book tunes to the band...

(ethnographic notes 10.04.19)

In this kind of situation, blended worship as a structure has been determined by the availability of players. Four older players in the brass band support four young players as they learn their instrument 'on the job'. Piano is used to lead quieter reflective songs where one person accompanies the congregation rather than an entire contemporary ensemble. The adaptiveness of rural and costal corps speaks to the variation of worship music delivery as attendance slowly dwindles in number. Although some older members lament the large brass bands of the past, most recognise that attendance is their biggest challenge and turn to the musical skills present in their communities, rather than dwelling on traditional or contemporary worship preferences, as exemplified in the following ethnographic caption,

The meeting begins with the officer greeting everyone from the platform. They let us know that we're about to begin worship. The worship team is away today, but two ladies (one in her early 20s and the other in her late 30s) are to lead worship. The younger lady plays acoustic guitar and sings the melody, whilst the other taps on a hand drum singing a harmony line (generally in parallel thirds). They two have a folky sound as the guitarist does not change her strumming pattern between songs. However, her voice is sweet and carries nicely. The first songs are *Oceans* by Hillsong, followed by a new song, *Amazing Grace (Hallelujah, Jesus set me free)*.

Although the worship band is small, the congregation really sing loudly, many with hands raised, including the older people regardless of both songs being contemporary. This reaction from the older folk in the congregation surprises me as normally there is an obvious shift in engagement between contemporary and traditional music. Generally, where there is a newer song, older people disengage and younger people sing loud, where there is a traditional older song that is not sung often, younger people are left standing following the words, where the older ones will sing and clap along with confidence. On this day, everyone continued to engage with worship music.

During the offering the duet sing, *What a Beautiful Name It Is*, and the congregation join in quickly as the words are projected up on the screen. This song was released last year (2017) is quite new and very popular. The congregation sings along confidently in a meditative and reflective manner. The

offering is then followed by the song, *Come thou fount*, which is supported by the brass ensemble. This song is an old hymn and is not lead by any worship leader, rather lead by the corps officer who does not sing in a microphone. He asks the band to stop of the middle verse and it is read out by the congregation, giving the band a rest for a bit. The band is made up of a few older (mostly) uniformed salvationists. Their sound is a little shaky and today they are down a few numbers...

(ethnographic notes 19.08.18)

As noted in the example above, the multigenerational engagement between both traditional and contemporary worship music delivery was surprising. Rather than the structure of bended worship dividing the congregation or compromising on an accepted traditional/contemporary ratio, this congregation came together as one community in worship. In discussion with the corps folk after the meeting, they note that this corps has recently rebuilt their sense-of-self and oneness as they actively sought to reconnected with the wider public around them. In the wider community, young families live close to (if not in) poverty amongst older people who have established themselves in economically stable middle class lives. Because of this, these families are almost unnoticed within the suburbs. In the process of this corps asserting themselves as safe place for families to rest, (re)connect in community, and seek assistance, the corps naturally continued that process into their weekly worship practice. To reject worship expressions understood by new families is to reject a community seeking assistance, connection, and spirituality. In this way, this corps met tradition and contemporary worship music in the middle in an understanding oneness in worship.

Although the previous example may be the exception to the rule, many other corps found creative ways to work around the traditional/contemporary dilemma within the bended worship construct. For bigger events intended for divisional or national worship and corps with larger ensembles, 'cross-over music' seeks to bring traditional Salvation Army music-making groups together with contemporary worship ensembles. Although official Salvation Army brass band and worship ensemble arrangements exist, a number of members within The Salvation Army Australia have arranged contemporary worship songs specifically for the ensembles present in their home corps or larger events,

There were a lot of people out there doing [arranging], but quite often, the one you need hasn't been done. So, yeah, occasionally you have to do one for a particular event. I know at the [start] when we first started doing it, it was very much often at the request of whoever was leading that meeting. "I wanna use this song." and so, you plan to use that song and if you have a vocal arrangement for it, great. You add in the brass orchestration or vice-versa if you already have a rhythm section chart, maybe you could write a vocal part for it, just to make it all sort of work out that way. It's more on a case-by-case basis what would work for each one. Does it exist? And if it does already exist, then don't reinvent the wheel. I think there was a bit of a common understanding amongst a whole bunch of us that were writing those charts that if it's already in existence, then I'm not gonna do it. And there was a lot of communication there for a while too about – "Hey, has anyone got one of these? Has anyone done one of these? Before I start doing this song, has anyone done one?" which is kind of cool. And everyone has prejudices about certain publications or a certain series of publications that you're just like, "Oh, I know it's been done in that, but that series doesn't work for us or our section. So, we'll get our own or make our own (Interview: 17.12.2018)

In this sense, cross-over music brings together the aesthetic qualities appreciated by both traditionalists and contemporaries. What is challenging with this worship delivery are the required hours spent by arrangers and music groups to rehearse and bring these songs to fruition. Not every worship service involved cross-over music. If an arrangement 'fit' a corps music expression well, it may become a chart used regularly, however, the rehearsal of these arrangements required continuous engagement,

I guess I was fortunate enough to have the trust of the people involved and I think that's a big thing. If they trusted me, then they'll potentially go outside their comfort zone or go and do something they weren't necessarily comfortable [with] ... and then when it didn't work, you've got more leeway next time. And you had to be careful. You had opinions. Not every chart is gonna work. Not every Hillsong song will work with a brass band arrangement ... So you pick and choose at the moments you did it and use the right – like anything, use the right instrumentation for the right [effect], if that makes sense (Interview: 17.12.2018)

Because of individual arrangers meeting the needs of specific corps and their resources, cross-over music arrangements within The Salvation Army Australia are varied between each corps expression. For some, these arrangements looked and sounded like a large brass band, contemporary worship ensemble, songster brigade, and worship leaders all music-making at once. For others, cross-over music involved layering a horn section into contemporary worship ensemble arrangements giving it more depth and colour. Either way, all attempts of cross-over music provide examples of salvationists striving to capitalise on various music-making tropes that make Salvation Army music ‘Army’. The cross-over music, and the celebration of inclusivity, not only brings music groups together in moments of worship it provides a glimmer of hope into an imagined future where the music, and therefore the health of the corps, continues.

In many cases, younger corps do not carry the burden loosing ‘traditional worship’. Rather, they start from a place of newness, informed by the experiences of older corps and older members but not held accountable to it. Because of this, younger corps tend to settle on contemporary worship music as their primary worship expression. The following vignette provides an example of a congregation that has chosen contemporary worship music as their primary worship expression,

On the platform are two large television screens held up on stands for the congregation to read off (rather than a projector) and a contemporary worship band set-up that fills the rest of the platform (acoustic drums, keys, bass guitar, acoustic guitar, and singers). A smaller riser is placed in front of the platform as an extension for people to speak from (instead of talking from/with the band).

We are welcomed warmly and advised that the congregation turns up at [“local time”] 5 to 10 minutes after the scheduled meeting time. As the worship group finish their rehearsal, I make my way into the hall. The meeting opens with two worship songs led by one of the singers. They play acoustic guitar and seems to lead the other singers (three of them), band and congregation where they want the song to go. It seems that the leader and keyboardist are the stronger leaders of the group, and the band and singers follow (like other worship band organisation). The rest of the singers are not as loud as the worship leader, make less eye contact with the congregation, and are less engaged with leading or encouraging the

congregation in worship. Some improvise basic harmony, but at times are unsuccessful.

What is particularly noticeable with this group is that it is intergenerational. Not all of the participants are young adults even though the songs are current worship hits. The band incorporates people from teenagers to those north of fifty and all participants seem unfazed by the choice of music. The two opening songs, *Where the spirit of the Lord is* (Hillsong, 2013) and *Good, Good Father* (Chris Tomlin, 2016) are repeated ‘prayerfully’ – in the sense that the band follows the leader of the group rather than the strict outline of the chart. The leader seems to “feel” when to sing each section and if a prayerful moment needs to be held longer, he indicates this by repeating a chorus or bridge. To do so, he sings the first few words of a section and the rest of the band follows, allowing the tech team time to change the words on the screens and for the congregation to continue singing. The repetition of these two songs with a few prayers interspersed, is a ten-minute segment before the welcome to the service and announcements.

(ethnographic notes 21.10.18)

Whilst the majority of corps negotiate the delivery of blended worship, some corps expressions chose to champion one expression over the other. The example of vignette two presented at the start of this chapter presents how one corps settled on a traditional worship expression that suited their corps community. More commonly however, corps who gravitated towards one expression over the other tended to settle for the sounds of contemporary worship. Generally, ‘non-uniformed’ corps, such as the previous example, were newer corps communities that had not experienced long histories dating back before the worship wars, and therefore, had not experienced the loss and lament surrounding traditional Salvation Army worship practices. Although many of the older members attending these corps (some continued to wear uniforms) carried the experience of the worship wars, there is an acceptance that this community only uses contemporary worship music.

In collaboration with corps officers, these contemporary worship bands exercised more flexibility around form and delivery within services. In the previous example, the meeting is opened with a ‘praise and worship’ segment that continues for approximately ten minutes. Within ‘standard’ blended services praise and worship segments are common, however during

the time of observation, most worship leaders led the congregation through three or four songs with few spontaneous repeats. In contrast, this opening segment relied on two songs primarily lead by the guitarist as the worship leader guiding the ensemble, congregation, and technical team through verbal cues. During moments of prayer and meditation, the keyboardist continued the chord progression suspending the congregation in the moment. Rather than standing and singing between bible readings, prayers, kids time, and other segments, the same two songs were used to start and finish the meeting. Although less music was used throughout this meeting, there seemed more flexibility surrounding the engagement of these songs and an understanding that these were moments set aside for worship in song.

The use and reliance on technology in worship will be explored in the following sections, however, it is worth noting here that there is a significant increase of technological use within meetings compared to traditional services. In non-uniformed corps, generally a team of salvationists are required to support the meeting, a large portion of it dedicated to the contemporary ensemble. Within a traditional context, words may be projected on a screen, however, this use of technology does not impact the playing of music.

This section has explored the salient features surrounding music delivery within corps communities in The Salvation Army Australia. Grounded in fieldwork data, congregational music-making may gravitate to either blended worship expressions or primarily 'traditional' or 'contemporary'. Most corps observed throughout the research period involve a unique blend to their worship music specific to their corps expression. Where the ratio of traditional to contemporary may shift from place to place, 'cross-over' music may act as a bridge bringing all music expressions together. Although many cross-over arrangements are developed for specific corps, arrangers throughout the Army share their resources often in favour of other publications produced by The Salvation Army. However, some corps gravitated towards one worship expression over the other. Many newer corps engaged with contemporary worship music with little impact of the worship wars or lament over a decrease of traditional Salvation Army music-making. This allowed for a freedom to change the approach to a musical worship experience outside of the 'worship chorus' segment often set aside for the young people in the corps to engage with. Regardless, local corps strive to organise worship music expressions that complement their local sensibilities. The following section continues the discussion focusing on the logistical practices that salvationists employ

to organise worship music-making within their local corps communities and how both organisation and musical preference inform on another.

### **5.6 Organising music-making for congregational worship**

The organisation of worship music ensembles falls within the complexities of negotiating traditional and contemporary worship preferences and maintaining music-making in general. The previous section explored how the delivery of worship music was observed during the fieldwork period. This section discusses some of the challenges corps leaders and music-makers encounter throughout the organisation and development of worship music within their local Salvation Army expressions. What became evident during fieldwork were the challenges corps faced regarding meeting congregational expectations within the limitations of attendance, available participants, commitment to rehearsals, and the accessibility of appropriate resources. In many ways, these challenges are the determining factors that shape who, what, when, where, and how worship music is delivered within the worship spaces.

Choosing music for worship is generally determined by the corps officer(s) or worship leader(s) rostered on for Sunday services. Generally, songs are guided by the theme of the service,

We try to choose tunes to go along with the theme, try to carry the theme throughout the meeting, and as a myriad of Salvation Army tunes, there are themes put on, some are bit short, but generally they can be covered. Whether we use traditional Salvation Army hymns which of course aren't just Salvation Army hymns, there are Wesleyan hymns, and all sorts of hymns sang in many churches, and modern-day videos, contemporary music as well, to stay with the theme if we can to draw that theme, so we very much theme-based, subject-based we choose tunes (Interview: 18.02.2019)

Our Corps Officers send the leaders (band, songsters and music team) their theme for the following Sunday so we can choose appropriate theme related music. This is then rehearsed at our weekly rehearsals (Questionnaire: No. 6)

Service theme as a guide is not unusual for most church services. However, many officers and worship leaders are highly aware of their music-makers and congregational worship



preferences. This juggle involves understanding how each musical section works within the corps whilst attempting to maintain a balance of style and/or delivery. For example, officers and worship leaders selecting worship music for blended worship consider the ratio of traditional to contemporary song in conjunction with how and who is performing on a weekly basis. Questions such as, is a contemporary ensemble available or is the congregation reliant on contemporary worship videos? Are there enough members to form brass band ensemble this week or is congregational song supported by piano only? Is a contemporary worship video appropriate in this segment or is it best to choose an older Salvation Army chorus the congregation is comfortable with? And so on, are the types of considerations that shape how congregations will be led in corporate worship. For many corps, these questions were answered during rehearsals as corps officers and worship leaders found ways to adapt to the ensemble collection of people available on a week-to-week basis.

During fieldwork corps music ensembles tended to fall within two categories: those with an abundance of music-making salvationists and those without. Although this may seem simplistic, these two dynamics impacted the creation, organisation, and delivery of congregational worship music in significant ways. Some corps had enough music-makers that brass bands, singing groups, and contemporary worship bands were a non-issue. Often these corps relied on rostering apps to organise their worship teams weeks in advance, allowing for unforeseen variations such as work or illness, as one member explained,

[Our corps] is quite lucky that we have an overabundance of people who are available to be on the worship team in various capacities. We only have like a couple of piano players for example. But in terms of the whole team, there're many singers and many guitars and drums and all sorts of things like that, which means that we can be very flexible if we want to be on the program that we used to be scheduled on, we can block out dates that we're not available, and then we can also pick up extra ones if we are available and a position needs to be filled, we can pick it up. We never feel pressured to do that (Interview: 26.10.2018)

In this context, corps music-making for worship is stable and predictable for both leaders and congregation. Within arrangements such as these, worship ensembles have the time and support to come together and learn new songs, collaborate, develop arrangements, and plan for future services and events,

The first week of each month we also have a team night for the whole team to worship together, learn new songs and catch up. It's the responsibility of the weekly worship leader to liaise with the preacher to see if there are any requests for songs, response time, items, etc. Otherwise, the worship leader will pray and reflect on the preacher's topic and pick songs they believe will work well. (We also keep in mind if there are newish songs we want to introduce or reinforce). It's also their responsibility to make sure the songs are added to the Meeting Lead in [the rostering app] by the Wednesday prior to the service/s. Then it's the team's responsibility to make sure they know what's on the lead. As part of [the rostering app], we use [a sheet music] app as the vast majority of our musicians use tablets rather than paper. (Those wanting paper can still print theirs off this way). The app stores chord charts and lead sheets and also can include reference links (e.g., Youtube) for songs to help with learning and practising. Saturday team meets from 4.30 pm to sound check and rehearse, and Sunday team meets from 8 am. During this time the team will run through any sound checks required by AV team and then run through the songs as directed by worship leader. We walk through the run sheet with the whole team (av, preacher, etc) and pray together prior to the meeting. At each month's team night, the Worship leadership team meet beforehand to debrief on how things are going and what is coming up (Questionnaire: No. 13).

What is notable in this example is the sharing of leadership responsibilities, expectations on members to learn and engage with the music, and the ability to meet and plan for future services. Members have access to YouTube clips and charts in advance of the worship meetings as meetings are planned one month ahead. This is significant as it provides members in music groups the opportunity to not only learn but also engage creatively with content, develop new ideas around arrangements, and lead the congregation with confidence and coherency. Some members note that learning the songs beforehand has become part of their prayer and meditation for the week leading up to worship services. Part of this process is including officers, admin staff, music team members, AV team, preaching team, and support team in the same rostering system, effectively preparing a sacred time and space well before the commencement of the meeting/s. It is important to note that this type of rostering system tends to be reserved for contemporary worship ensembles. Brass bands, songsters, and

timbrel brigades can involve large groups of people; however, the expectation continues that participants will attend rehearsals to (the best of their ability) on a weekly basis. For many members within groups such as these, regular attendance is a continuous struggle as the demands of twenty-first century life impact participants in new ways. Consequently, rostering is counterintuitive where the difficulty lies in sustaining numbers rather than rostering participation.

For corps with smaller congregational numbers or less music-making salvationists, multiple variations of the same type of worship teams are unfeasible. The spectrum of this dilemma is large varied, spanning from corps involving all Salvation Army music-making traditions and contemporary worship band to a congregation led in worship by one guitarist (or pianist) and a singer. To begin with, corps with Salvation Army music-making traditions function differently. As was previously stated, brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades can involve large groups of people, they rehearse in formalised environments, and engage with music differently than contemporary worship ensembles. Because of this, worship music preparation is negotiated differently, as one member explains,

The brass band practices for an hour and a half on Wednesday evenings, but normally doesn't rehearse the common hymns for Sunday. Instead, focus is put on a lively prelude and a more contemplative band message. These pieces are not sung along to and are designed to inspire people and provoke a spiritual/emotional response, through the Holy Spirit. Additionally, the band will spend time working on larger pieces for upcoming events, but these aren't worship based. The contemporary ensemble rehearses on Sundays following worship services for an hour, with a run-through each Sunday morning before the meeting. This group focuses on building a large repertoire that officers can select suitable pieces from (Questionnaire: No.14).

Due to the nature of brass bands and songster brigades, most music-making salvationists can read music and learn notes quickly. There is less reliance on recordings and YouTube clips when determining worship style and older Salvation Army choruses are easily accessed via the *Salvation Army Tune Book* and *The Songbook of The Salvation Army*. Within the research period, many brass bands and songsters either sightread traditional Army choruses in the meeting or familiarised themselves with the lyrics and tunes by playing or singing through

them once during rehearsal beforehand. This kind of practice tended to be reserved for brass bands or songsters with young learners,

Traditionally, if someone's playing in a brass band, they have to read music. Therefore, what you can do with them is quite significantly different. There is a certain base level – call it a baseline of understanding that you have to have if you're going to play in a brass band. And you can't just turn up in a brass band and say, "No, sorry, I only read chords," because – I mean, yes, they may move things around to work for you, but generally speaking, there's a certain level there. So, a rhythm section comes with a whole lot of other complexities. Let's say a brass or a vocal group does it, and in a choir, the expectation particularly with Songster Brigades over the years (and various different ones I've worked with) is that you will be able to give them a song on sheet music and they'll be able to read it and sing it, whether they know it or not. So, the age old discussion ... in a worship team rehearsal, "That's not how it went on the CD," is negated. This is the chart. This is what we're doing. So that does make the direction side of things a little easier. You all know where you're going. Working with a Songster Brigade with a wide range of ages, as I was lucky to be able to do for a long time, for me meant that I just had to be careful about what I selected (Interview: 27.12.2018)

Due to these expectations, engaging with contemporary worship music within traditional expressions can change the nature of learning for these groups. As was explored regarding cross-over music, arrangements concerning contemporary worship songs for brass band and worship ensemble have been published. Contemporary worship music has been included in the 2015 *Salvation Army Tune Book* and songbook for brass band and congregational worship. However, not all published arrangements are written in the style or language innately understood by brass bands or fulfill the worship style anticipated by the worship leader and congregation. Because of this, contemporary music-making for brass band groups either requires more attention during rehearsal or those songs are passed on to the contemporary worship ensemble or pianist. Regardless, the process of engaging with contemporary worship music in both brass band and many songster<sup>24</sup> rehearsals require more

---

<sup>24</sup> Songster brigades that continue in the traditional worship styles find Contemporary worship music difficult to engage with. Other choirs who sing Contemporary worship music more often, pick it up quicker.

time, consideration, and planning reinforcing the barrier between traditional and contemporary worship music-making. Cross-over arrangements strive to address these challenges; however, a secondary problem lies in maintaining participant numbers.

A common arrangement throughout Salvation Army corps is the participation of Army music-makers in more than one worship music expression. Within the structure of the blended worship context, some members will move from one group to another to contribute to worship in different ways and fulfill musical roles. For some, this is a positive exchange between traditional and contemporary worship music where the boundary of participation is dissolved, as one member described,

I think it helps that all but one of the people or two of the people in the ensemble are also in the band. So it's not one group against another group. It's just them using different things in different ways, which I think is probably unique as well. That's probably unusual to other corps to have the same people doing both things and that's because a lot of our young adults are very talented and can play more than one thing. So, I think it is unusual but I think that's how it should be... I think also it's my understanding that [our new bandmaster] was kind of brought in on the understanding that he was there for young people and that he was to be innovate and he was to try new things... (Interview: 04.04.2019).

The participation of members across multiple music groups speaks to a shift in perception and appreciation of contrasting worship styles and the attitudes towards music-making within The Salvation Army itself. The value of participating in music-making within The Salvation Army in any capacity is closely associated as a form of service; a way of contributing to and supporting your community. In many corps, however, the doubling up of members across music groups can impact the delivery of worship music across meetings or on a week-to-week basis. In the ethnographic case study above, music-making salvationists were spread across two meetings limiting the scope of worship styles experienced by both congregations. In many corps, holiday periods, occasions (such as weddings, dedications, and enrolments), and illness can alter the quantity of participants leaving worship leaders limited to an assortment of music-makers, one style of worship music, or no live worship music at all<sup>25</sup>.

---

<sup>25</sup> One Sunday during fieldwork a Salvation Army wedding had occurred the night before involving many in the contemporary worship band. These members did not attend Sunday morning worship leaving the band very small for the morning.

Although frustrating at times, moments such as these can lead to opportunities of collaboration and creativity,

Before the meeting begins, the worship ensemble slowly sets up and talks about the songs chosen for the day. This group is made up of drums, bass guitar, acoustic guitar, keyboard, trumpet, and two singers. A couple of members are in summer Salvation Army uniform, however, most of the ensemble are in casual “civvy” attire. Once a couple of microphones have been set up and amplifiers plugged in, the group play through the first song, *Great South Land* (Bullock 1993). After playing through *Great South Land*, the group decides to play it one more time for the keyboardist – a young guy learning how to play on the spot, and the singers decide on a few harmonies (generally parallel thirds). They gently encourage him and suggest he plays block chords with the guitarist before moving on to *Worthy is the Lamb* (Hillsong/Zschech 2000), *Turn your eyes upon Jesus* (Lemmel 1922), and *His kingdom come* (Bullock 1995). During each song, the worship leader tells the group how the song will be used in the meeting suggesting how they should approach the “intensity of the song”. The leader notes that “it’s okay, I know we have many people away today, but we have a nice group here that are still going to bless our meeting today...” and encourages the trumpeter to “play around and do what you feel is best”. When the worship leader notices that people have begun to arrive for the meeting, he quickly thanks the group for their commitment, leads them in a short prayer before heading out to meet and greet...

(ethnographic notes, 14.10.18)

As illustrated in this example, absent participants impact the shape and sound of a worship ensemble and potentially the songs chosen for the morning meeting. The songs for this worship meeting are older choruses that are well known by most of the players and the congregation. Structurally each song has clear verse, chorus, and bridge sections that the congregation can follow without the need of lengthy repetition. In this example it is unclear if the music chosen was to suit the ensemble, however, in other rehearsals observed (and experienced), unfamiliar songs may be swapped for a familiar equivalent if it suits the theme of the meeting.

Last minute rehearsals before a worship meeting occur in many corps. Some places use it as a way to warm up, refresh songs, sound check, and help participants who may have missed a rehearsal. However, during fieldwork, a lot of these rehearsals were used to (re)learn the songs for the meeting, decide on the order of verses and choruses, and settle on an arrangement biased on the participants and their instruments of the day. At times the confinement of players allowed for moments of creativity where players explored different ways of approaching songs the congregation was already familiar with. It is important to note that these music-makers were afforded more cultural capital to suggest small changes. Nevertheless, more commonly, a weekly frustration surrounding the uncertainty of players resounded through smaller corps observed throughout the research period. As one member notes,

...we had the same people there, and we have talent and we have ability and we have people who can do stuff and we just – I feel like we kind of settled for mediocre for a while there, like if we can pull off a modern song, then yeah, we'll just run it through before the meeting and that'll be fine. And I guess I got a bit tired of that. I think I saw that also we were using our people in divisional events and they were doing these great things, and I thought, "Why are we not doing that in our own Sunday services? Why are we not using that more regularly?"

(Interview: 04.04.2018)

The uncertainty of players and their commitment to practice and rehearsals is a continuous frustration experienced by many worship leaders. The desire to maintain a certain level of quality and engagement continues, however, as congregations experience a general decline in attendance and members struggle to regularly commit to rehearsals and services, this dilemma is an unceasing battle. For some congregations, contemporary worship bands are useful as they do provide live music for worship. However, a few older members feel as if they have been cornered into accepting contemporary worship bands due to the smaller size of the ensemble; and with that, contemporary worship music. During fieldwork, what became evident was the impact of worship delivery and the instability many small corps experienced on a weekly basis,

Let's face it, your average small churches probably on the hunt for musos constantly. So, for the most part, you have to adapt what you're doing firstly to

who you've got to play it, then secondly to what your church is interested in singing, what your congregation would like. And then I guess lastly, the competency, I suppose of the leader, which in a lot of cases could very well be the corps officer who may have a heap of musical knowledge or who may have absolutely none. There's a stack of factors in there, really. But I would absolutely say that what music is used and the way it's used, we have to be very much specific to the location (Interview: 27.12.2018)

This section has explored the challenges many corps face in organising worship music ensembles post-worship wars. A lack of personnel, creativity, understanding the demands of twenty-first century life, whilst meeting the needs and expectations congregations are only a few of the difficulties corps officers and worship leaders are faced with when organising and managing worship music groups within all corps throughout The Salvation Army Australia. Although some corps rely on the employment of organisational apps, these corps tended to enjoy contemporary worship bands as their primary worship expression rather than sustain large groups of people for brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades. Corps balancing variations of blended worship experienced the impact of absence and general decline more acutely. However, where corps find it difficult to reach the needs of their congregations, technology may be used in lieu of these challenges. Understanding that both print media and digital technology cannot exist in isolation and must be understood within the sociocultural contexts of the congregants themselves. The following section explores the impact and importance of technology within musical expression as observed throughout the research period.

### **5.7 Technology within the worship space**

The introduction of digital audio-visual technology within the worship space has (re)shaped how most congregations engage with worship. This part of the chapter presents how digital audio-visual technology and social media informs engagement, accessibility, and the overall “worship experience” within the ethnographic fieldwork period<sup>26</sup>. By the early 2000s, the integration of digital audio-visual technology into worship services became ‘standard practice’ as corps throughout The Salvation Army Australia (and other Christian denominations) began to invest in computers, laptops, and digital projectors to project lyrics,

---

<sup>26</sup>At the time of writing is Post-COVID19 Australian lockdowns where engagement has changed.



bible readings, prayers, announcements, and videos to aid worship. Soon after the introduction of blended worship practices, many congregations sought to include digital audio-visual technology with the hope that it would appeal to a younger generation just as contemporary worship music could (Ingalls 2018: 178). These changes intersect with a shift in personal worship practices, where worship turned towards a more individualistic and commodified experience (Hoover 2002: 2). Because of this, Hoover suggests that ‘religion’ and ‘media’ are not “separate and separable entities” (ibid: 1). Rather, the discussions surrounding religion and media should involve an understanding of the interconnectedness of congregational worship and media, and how congregations (re)interpret change within the worship experience by (re)creating meaningful moments (ibid). In this sense, as participants (*habitus*) actively engage and (re)create meaning through the convergence of digital audio-visual technology, social media, and congregational worship practices, each element informs the greater social *field* (Bourdieu 1980: 52; Hoover 2002: 2 – 3). From this perspective, this section explores the interconnectedness of digital audio-visual technology, social media, and the creation of space and connectedness as a practices and processes within The Salvation Army Australia (Nekola 2021: 41). For the ease of discussion, the topic of technology and connectedness has been grouped from two perspectives. The first explores how technological processes and practices create and frame worship experiences in person. The second observes how technological processes and practices include congregants external to the event via social media and live streaming.

### 5.7.1 Perspective One

This chapter begins with three vignettes exemplifying contrasting worship spaces, soundscapes, and experiences observed within the fieldwork period. However, regardless of ‘tradition’ or ‘contemporary’ music-making practices, each example involved the use of digital audio-visual technology. So pervasive is the use of digital audio-visual technology that all corps observed throughout the fieldwork period relied on digital projection for even the simplest of uses such as lyric projection. Digital projection provides the scope for including the congregation in song, bible readings, responsive prayer, announcements, and videos. For corps with large congregations, this is an opportunity to share information en masse. For small congregations with few music-makers, digital audio-visual technology provides another way of including congregational singing in the worship experience,

During set-up the corps officer shows me how the corps uses *Easy Worship*. This is a program that connects the words and music in the slides with colourful backgrounds for digital projection. “You choose the songs, arrange the lyrics, save for the meeting, and someone else can just click away and it’s in order”. The officer mentions that for traditional songs they rely on brass band recordings and shows me a large stack of Salvation Army brass band CDs. “If it hasn’t been uploaded already, we take a track from the CD and lay the track with the slides. The program does this really well as the old song book is already uploaded into the system”.

They are still waiting for the correct patch to upload the new songbook (2015) but finding recordings to sing along with can be difficult, “no one’s really done just simple tune book recordings. They’re all fancy and end up going too high for our congregation to enjoy”. The officer the notes, “even though our congregation doesn’t sing that much, they will stand and kinda mumble along with Hillsong songs. And that stuff you can find on YouTube with pictures and everything”

...during the meeting the officers encourage the congregation to sing a couple of choruses. One officer plays guitar and the other sings. The congregation sing quietly along following the words projected on the screen. The rest of the music throughout the meeting is pre-recorded and played over the speakers...

(ethnographic notes: 17.02.19)

This caption speaks to the importance of technology for small corps. Where some corps enjoy the sounds of a live worship band, corps with little or no music-makers are completely reliant on pre-recorded tracks to sing with. Colloquially referred to as ‘YouTube worship’, videos such as these fill the space of live worship music. Officers and worship leaders can stream these videos for free and even download them in preparation for the worship meeting. However, as the caption highlighted, there are times recordings are not appropriate for congregational singing, as the following officers in conversation noted,

Officer 1: Some recordings have – even though if you play it, [the congregation] would sing with you, because it’s not a difficult song, if you play a recording,

because it's got other people singing harmonies and a bit of extra light and shade perhaps in the recording, then it immediately loses [the congregation].

Officer 2: If there are bridges in the songs, so you get eight bars of an instrumental or something, they've lost it. You've got to have verse course, verse course, verse, sing, sing, sing. If you got an instrumental or bridge, they switch off and they stand around, staring at the ceiling and talking to each other and they've lost it. So, I find they love to sing but the song has to be sang, not left open (Interview: 18.02.2019)

Part of the difficulty of 'YouTube worship' is the sensation of maintaining space and continuity. As was exemplified in the ethnographic case study, the second meeting relied on pre-recorded music to replace the contemporary worship band. The congregation listened but did not engage as well as with the live brass band. Although lyrics were projected on the screen and the congregation followed without the visual of a band and the sensation of feeling personally led as both individuals and community, moments of disconnection and disengagement occur quickly. This occurs even in the sincerest moments where worship leaders try to bring a worship experience together,

...at the moment, this particular congregation hasn't had any [live] music...for about three years, so they used to sing to tracks or video tracks projected onto the wall, so nothing live.... I think one of the meetings we got a third of the way through the meeting before we could get the first song to work. So from a creative, just trying to get some momentum happening within the journey of your worship time to go, "We're going to stand and sing our first song together. Let's join in with what's on the screen," nothing, "Let's just go to the Bible reading and kids' time. We'll come back to it next minute," it starts playing, "Okay, we'll go back to the first song." And that's difficult too because I mean you're putting people under pressure in the tech, and they're helping out. I don't think they're not experienced technical people (Interview: 27.04.2019)

Although imperfect, digital audio-visual technology affords the delivery of pre-recorded worship music to locations with little to no live worship music-making. In this way, smaller congregations continue to meet and engage in corporate worship ‘making do’ with what resources are available and in doing so, express a *salviness* that speaks to their local context.

In larger corps and events, technology can play multiple roles. Although digital projection continues to take centre stage, worship spaces may be framed through the use of lighting, staging, and sound production. Each avenue provides a way to create a space that draws a congregation together by making space “special” (Steuernagel 2021: 137). Generally, contemporary worship bands require more sound production support as the instruments involved require amplification. Because of this, worship meetings often require technical support before, during, and after the service. For some corps or music groups, technical support roles are integrated within the fabric of the worship team or music expression. They are involved in the mixing and recording of performances and play a vital role often from the back of the worship hall. However, some places find it difficult to attract personnel to the role,

...there have been some people from our corps that have done the Tech Support elective [at music camp] but for some reason no one has offered to be involved in Tech. This seems to be a universal problem in countries I have visited. I have asked a couple of people in our corps that I know, one person does lighting at a local theatre and one person that did help in Tech for a couple of weeks.

The response was that they enjoyed it but did not want to do it on a Sunday because they wanted to be with their friends. I have not found a solution for that one. I can understand up to a point as Tech can be messy and involves setup and pack-up time as well as being operational for the duration of the service. However, I would have thought the more people that got involved the more you could have a Sunday off to worship and be with friends.

I recall one time that a young man was looking for an avenue of service and the band sergeant at the time said to me that he was going to teach him how to play an instrument and that I was “to keep my hands off him” for Tech Support. I have

also approached the CO to suggest that I train bandsmen for a few weeks at a time to use the FOH mixing desk but that came to nothing (Questionnaire: No.8)

In conversation during fieldwork, another participant in tech support noted the invisibility of the role suggesting that although it is an integral element to worship services, “people in this job don’t get thanked very much because we’re just up the back in corps shirts. Not the singers on the stage under *our* bright lights” (ethnographic notes, 13.10.18). The frustration behind these comments brings to the fore the expectations laid upon these members as they too engage in musicking. However, some music groups observed within the fieldwork period recognised the value and importance technical support personnel contributed to the overall worship experience.

As well as sound production, technical support teams build the lighting and staging that frame worship meetings. Drawing on the qualities of music concerts, the use of lighting transforms worship spaces by drawing attention to the platform by dimming house lights and highlighting the platform with stage and backing lights, as illustrated by the following Saturday night worship concert,

People slowly make their way in through the front of the hall and are met by colourful lights that highlight the platform. This is an evening with a songster brigade that is visiting for the weekend. Their contemporary worship band is made up of electric piano, electric drums, and bass guitar. The songster brigade is mic’d as well. A large temporary technical setup comprised of sound mixing equipment and cameras sits at the back of the worship hall. As the worship concert begins the house lights are dimmed and the congregation take their seats. The first song is accompanied by the contemporary worship band with backing track. The members of the band wear headphones to play with a click track and backing track. As the songsters sings, a video of the group is projected above them for the congregation to enjoy in conjunction with the song...the majority of sound and visual production is controlled by the tech members from the back of the hall as they experience and adjust the sound and visual elements throughout the concert. This concert is also live streamed to social media...

(ethnographic notes, 08.09.18).

In this example, the application of various technologies (re)frames a worship space that is experienced differently to a normal Sunday morning worship service. The use of stage lights and dimmed house lighting draws attention to the platform whilst creating a sense of quietness and intimacy for the congregation. While there are some world building qualities similar to the sociocultural performance practices Christopher Small disentangles in his book (such as the use of technologies to create a separateness from the outside world), the use of digital audio-visual technology erases the sense of distance between audience (congregation) and performers (songster brigade and contemporary worship band) created by lighting and staging (1998: 26). Although digital projection is used within Sunday services, this technology is (re)contextualised within a space that is made 'new'. Digital projection is used preceding and during the concert as an avenue to welcome and introduce the visiting music group to the congregation. Throughout the worship concert, bible readings and other supporting content are shared on the screen, as well as the lyrics for the songs encouraging audience participation and contemplation. Worship concerts blur the boundaries between performance as entertainment and evening worship services as the content (worship songs, short message, testimony, bible reading etc) and masters of ceremonies (worship leaders) move to and from positions of presentation and inclusion. The ease of this exchange was observed more frequently during worship concerts involving contemporary worship music or cross-over music rather than evenings with more traditional forms of music expression or a series of musical items. In this ethnographic snapshot, the application of digital projection (the visual sharing of content) drew together the contemporary worship band, songster brigade, and congregation neither interrupting the flow of the worship concert nor taking over moments of corporate meaning-making; it simply informed the specialness of space making (Steuernagel 2021: 138).

Perspective one has touched on the qualities technology can bring to worship spaces and how it can contribute or detract from the worship experience. For corps with small attendance numbers, pre-recorded worship music can fulfill a role where there are little to no live music-makers. Perhaps at times an imperfect solution, the application of programs such as *Easy Worship* for smaller congregations provides an avenue for the continuation of corporate worship engagement. In larger spaces, a technical support team is required to facilitate the set-up, pack-down, and management of sound, lights, and projection throughout worship services and events. In many places, this form of service may be underappreciated, however, as was observed during fieldwork, some music groups actively encourage and support their

‘tec teams’ in equal measure. Many corps and divisional or national events observed during the fieldwork period successfully balanced the use of digital audio-visual technology within the worship experience. The final ethnographic snapshot provides an example of the integration of technology and space where technology brought together the contemporary worship band, songster brigade, and congregation neither interrupting the flow of the worship concert nor taking over moments of corporate meaning-making. Worship meetings, concerts, and events such as these are mediated through the expertise of technical support teams as they employ various technologies to facilitate worship experiences, rather than disrupt, confront, and dishonour the technologies of the past. The second perspective explores how live streaming and social media can connect and include salvationists physically separate from the live events.

### 5.7.2 Perspective Two

I guess technology on the whole – there’s no denying that technology has made the world smaller. And not only has it made the world smaller, it’s opened our eyes to a bunch of stuff (Interview: 27.12.2018)

The ability to live stream, connect, and share content over social media has, as this participant noted, made the world smaller. For salvationists, the conceptualisation of the mission as first national, and second international, hovers on the edge of Benedict Anderson’s imagined communities (2006). Historically, Australian salvationists were engaged with territorial and divisional events throughout the year. Many of these events were opportunities for salvationists to gather in large groups, reunite with one another, meet likeminded people, worship, and “be salvo” together. Although members understood that these were not *all* salvationists in the territory or division, primary, first- and second-degree connections were made allowing for a certain kind of connectivity between members. Although one large event was organised during the fieldwork period, territorial (becoming national in December 2018) and divisional events lessened or were organised as smaller events to be live streamed online. The motivations and decisions surrounding these changes fell outside purview of this study, however, the results of such choices were observed online. The accessibility to live streaming afforded music groups, territory, division, and later local corps, the opportunity to stream their worship concerts and Sunday morning services live to social media, as well as upload supporting content such as photos, video clips, and advertisements in the hope of reaching not only other salvationists but also the wider public.

By organising events as smaller gatherings and live streaming, the members who would have travelled to attend such gatherings were removed from attending events in person and relocated to “attending” online. It is in this grey area is where Anderson’s *imagined communities* lies. In reference to nationhood, Anderson suggests that nation-ness is “*imagined*, because even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion” (2006: 6). This imagined connectivity is informed by a membership to a movement that is organised into tiers of corps (local), divisional (state), territorial (national), and international, as Anderson continues “all communities larger than primordial villages of face-to-face contact (and perhaps even these) are imagined” (ibid). In this sense, part of *salvonness* has been (re)moved from the face-to-face village to an online platform where more members can access divisional and territorial events at the cost of decreasing the live face-to-face village where community and connections are made in person and in real time. For example,

As website link has been sent out to salvationists throughout the territory. Upon clicking the link, it takes the viewer to a glossy website dedicated to the event. Footage from past territorial worship services and events play across the website, edited together to convey the bigness and energeticness of the upcoming celebration. Across the top of the website are links to information such as “program” and “live stream”. A streaming schedule is published on the live stream page to help viewers at home attend in real time or watch the event later.

I click to view one of the evening events as I was unable to stream live or attend in person. Sound, image, and streaming quality is immediately striking as these videos are not compressed to fit the requirements of social media streaming services. Digital audio-visual technology is employed throughout the event taking up most of the back wall of stage and filmed directly onto the broadcast. Throughout the event, VT rolls are projected onto the screen supplementing the live on-stage activity. These video packages are also broadcast via the live stream allowing congregants separate from the event to feel included in the moment. As a point of access, this is an interesting way to engage with live events such as this. However, rather than the immersive experience of attending the event, I am able



to control the progress of the event, talk over the top of it, and text freely without distracting other congregants as I find myself disengaging frequently...

(ethnographic notes, 08.12.18)

In events such as these, congregants following on the live stream are encouraged to imagine themselves as connected and included in a communal moment separate from their physical time and space. Although congregants viewing from the comfort of their own homes may know and recognise certain salvationists captured in the live stream, the removal of the congregation reinforces the *imaginedness* of community and a different way of engaging with *salvonness* as a national Salvation Army expression. Whilst divisional and territorial events have moved their audiences online, Salvation Army music groups have used live streaming and social media to connect with audiences (or congregations) outside of their local congregation. The example in perspective one presented the start of a Saturday night worship concert that was simultaneously live streamed to social media. Just as the live stream link was posted, members in the songsters were encouraged to share the link on their own pages to reach a larger audience. The live stream is controlled by the technical support team from the back of the hall as they video, mix the sound, and video packages just like the previous event. However, this group includes lyrics at the bottom of the screen as the songsters sing including audience participation at home. During the worship concert, the live stream is referred to on occasion acknowledging the presence of a congregation outside of the concert space. Although this approach seems more inclusive, one member notes the difficulties of engaging with an online audience,

I suppose it changes the way you make music because it's being delivered in a different medium and being delivered down a medium that we're now competing with every other form of entertainment available in someone's lounge room or in someone's pocket – Netflix, sports, you name it. And there's the whole argument that gets bandied around – “No one will come out to a Saturday night band program anymore.” And it's pretty accurate, but why? There are thousands of other factors I'm sure and a big part of them is that people's availability is much less than it used to be. But there're also a billion other things vying for your attention that 35 years ago weren't on a Saturday night. Everything was shut on a Saturday night except for maybe the cinema and a bowling alley or something and there was nothing else to do, whereas [now] you can sit at home on your lounge

and have a myriad of entertainment options. You don't have to leave the house. So how do we leverage that? How do we make music that is attractive and obviously there's a lot less places to hide in a broadcast stream. So how do we make music of quality and make a product that's of quality that we can offer to people into their own lounge rooms that will compete with Netflix and Stan and free-to-air television and whatever? (Interview: 27.12.2018)

The difficulties surrounding live streaming involve sustaining online engagement. However, on the social media platforms utilised by many Salvation Army music-making groups, viewers are able to comment during the live stream, share the worship concert or meeting on their own pages or to friends, and view the video again at a later date. Where some visual and sound qualities may be lost in relying on social media platforms, it does afford sharing content quickly without mediation from divisional or territorial Salvation Army governance. A secondary challenge discussed by the previous interviewee lies in the delivery of music-making and creation of tangibility,

But I guess if your question is – how does that impact the way we make music – I think it's no longer ephemeral, whereas when I grew up, your average concert was very much ephemeral. Unless somebody was recording it or they had a tape player or something, it was what it was at that moment. And music made – music being so emotive, music being so able to traverse all of the senses, then being present for it was – I don't know – arguably 80 percent of the performance – being there, the way you felt, the temperature, the [room], the week you had, whatever and people might talk about... “Oh, you remember when so and so played that song or so and so sang that song that night? It was magic.” Often if you go back and listen to a recording of that, it wasn't as great as you think. However, all of the other factors that went in there, all of the emotion that was attached to it made it that much better. So how does that transfer to the small screen or to the big screen? How do we do that? How do we make music in a manner that is now no longer ephemeral, and someone might watch it at a time or they might watch it later? And so, we have to make music in a manner that transcends that. And that's a challenge (Interview: 27.12.2018).

In the introduction to *Congregational Music-Making and Community in a Mediated Age*, Anna Nekola speaks to the challenges expressed above, noting that music, media, and faith are often negotiated as separate rather than approached as co-constructed. This wholistic approach addresses the online transmission as an event in its entirety, rather than peering through a digital window mediated by video and sound technicians. Approaching live streamed events as a service unto itself allows online congregants more agency “and more possibilities for re-imagining communities and re-creating their ideological and theological belief systems” (2021: 11). Therefore, how meaning is made through the engagement of the small screen is determined by worshipers themselves as they determine how, where, when, and why they choose to click and spend time on a lengthy worship meeting. Being physically distant themselves changes the relationship to the worship experience as the experience is no longer framed by the immersive context of stage lighting and dimmed house lights, live music, and the choice on what to concentrate on (which is mediated through camera angles). *Salvones* is enacted when online congregants (re)imagine their connection to the individuals in the meeting, their association with the music groups, live congregation or place, an affinity to the sociocultural practices enacted in the meetings, and a personal acknowledgement of like-mindedness with The Salvation Army as ‘being salvo’. The strength of this affinity, or oneness (*salvones*), is so pervasive that some corps turn to streamed events for evening worship or Sunday morning meetings. Drawing upon the historical practice of mass gatherings (such as congresses and commissionings), some corps (especially rural and coastal corps) project live streamed events during times of worship in the hope of encouraging a sense of connectivity to the wider vision of The Salvation Army Australia or The Salvation Army International without leaving their local corps expression.

It is worth noting that although a long-term social media ethnographic study fell outside of the scope of this research, it was observed that salvationists share footage, photos, and memories, bringing attention to meaning these moments meant to them, whilst reliving the impact of each moment with fellow salvationists who can speak to the event. Groups subgroups form around mutual topics of interest concerning Army life such as brass bands, songsters, sexuality and gender, history etc. Clearly there is scope to investigate the impact of online connectivity and community building that is interactive, imagined, and regenerative of certain histories, mythologies, and specific kinds of *salvones*. What is evident for many Salvation Army music groups engaging with live streamed worship concerts and services, video clips, live interactive moments on social media and other content, is the hope that the

message from their songs, prayers, testimonies, and sermons, will be passed on to “the people who need to hear it”.

## **5.8 Conclusion**

Chapter five explores how salvationists negotiate the challenges surrounding worship music-making in the aftermath of the worship wars and decline of church attendance. Since the worship wars, worship music may be conceptualised in two main categories, ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’. Although corps may also be categorised with these terms, most corps find themselves in positions of (re)creation and (re)imagination as they continuously engage with the demands of twenty-first century life, a lack or change of resources, and the expectations and needs of congregations. This chapter presented a series of vignettes, a small ethnographic case study, and supporting clips illustrating the diverse challenges, successes, sounds, and spaces that corps continue to explore within their worship expressions. Importantly, digital technology presents alternative solutions for including worship music during services where live music-making may not be viable. Although it fulfills an important role in worship, congregations tend not to engage with ‘YouTube worship’ as enthusiastically as with live worship music-making. However, the application of programs such as *Easy Worship* for smaller congregations provides an avenue for the continuation of corporate worship engagement. Interestingly, digital technology has opened opportunities to connect with congregations online via the use of social media and live streaming. This type of engagement has altered who, where, how, and when salvationists worship as they assert agency over their personal worship experiences.

## Chapter 6 - Community Music-making

### 6.1 Introduction

This chapter explores how salvationists engage with music-making as community building and bonding experiences internally and externally of The Salvation Army, and how these frameworks allow for contrasting interpretations of Army music within the twenty-first century Australian context. As has been established, the presence of music-making within Salvation Army life may be experienced and observed as all encompassing. To engage with music is to engage with Salvationism, its history and legacy, doctrine and theology, mission, and service. In other words, music-making is regarded by many as the very essence of Salvationism. Talking about *musicking* within The Salvation Army is a dense, multifaceted activity that pushes and pulls against deep religious and historical roots, sociocultural expectations and traditions, and often strong personal convictions. It is within this tension that salvationists negotiate the social and cultural rules (*doxa*) of the social *field* and their place within it. With this in mind, this chapter turns to community music theory to present diverse expressions of *musicking* within The Salvation Army Australia that connect members throughout the organisation. Understanding Salvation Army music-making as community music allows us to explore how salvationists organise and manage different musical groups within the mission, community music programmes for the wider public, and moments of intersectionality where ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ music-making converge. Therefore, this chapter explores the porous boundaries between ‘inside’ and ‘outside’ community music-making within The Salvation Army Australia and how the shifts concerning inclusivity have changed the sights and sounds of *salvoness*.

### 6.2 Community Music

Music in community has the power to bring together a local tapestry of individuals made up of “social factors which include aspects of identity, heritage, group solidarity, healing, bonding, celebration, and other factors” (Veblen 2013: np; see also Dykema 1916). The organisation of community music comes in a myriad of forms, however at its core, community music practitioners attempt to maintain a set of culturally democratic values to educate, validate, and encourage participants in an environment that provides equal opportunities for all peoples (Bartleet and Higgins 2018: 3 – 4). However structured or seemingly spontaneous, both Veblen and Dykema stress that “community music is socialised music” (Veblen 2013: np; Dykema 1916: 218), shaped through particular “frameworks of meaning” that are created and informed by the experiences of practitioners and participants

(Veblen 2013: np; Boeskov 2017: 86). These frameworks are the physical, cultural, and social spaces where community actors meet, collaborate, debate, struggle, (re)create, and perform “the very stuff of human social life” through, in this case, the process of making music (Carrithers 1992: 9). In other words, community music has the power to facilitate creative social spaces where individuals come together to create meaningful moments infused by the sharing and exploration of identities and culture, traditions, beliefs, and social relationships (Boeskov 2017: 87; Bartleet and Higgins 2018: 2; see also Pearce et. al, 2010).

In Chapter Four the importance of Christopher Small’s concept of *musicking* with the sociocultural context of The Salvation Army Australia was noted. Throughout the existing literature concerning community music, Small’s *musicking* has become an important contribution to the theoretical framework surrounding community music for researchers and practitioners. His emphasis on all participants taking part in music-making extends the scope of what it means to ‘music’ and to contribute to impactful moments of meaning-making (1998: 11). In this sense, ‘to music’ becomes an inclusive verb that involves all aspects of making, developing, producing, supporting, and contributing to the musical events itself. From the volunteers serving tea and coffee during break time, the cleaner who vacuums the floors and puts the chairs out, the manager who opens the hall each week or sells tickets at the door, to the musicians themselves, all contribute to one transient musical event. Within community music spaces, it is often these people who make such events possible, many of whom play in the musical group as well. This inclusiveness not only encapsulates the breadth of *musicking*, but also highlights the value of each contribution as equal. It is this holistic perspective that rings true to the ethos of community music. Although idealistic for some (see Boeskov 2017), Small’s *musicking* presents a framework where performance and participation may be observed from the perspective of communal relationships and their placement within an intricate web pervaded by specific sociocultural histories, traditions, structures, and expectations, rather than only from the music itself,

The act of musicking establishes in the place where it is happening a set of relationships, and is in those relationships that the meaning of the act lies. They are to be found not only between the people who are taking part, in whatever capacity, in the performance; and they model, or stand as metaphor for, ideal relationships as the participants in the performance imagine them to be: relationships between people and person, between individual and society, between

humanity and the natural world and even perhaps the supernatural world (1998: 13).

In this way, Small suggests a holistic approach that champions creative and inclusive interactions performed throughout musical events. *Musicking* as a theoretical framework is particularly suited to the social *field(s)* of The Salvation Army Australia, as *musicking* is so pervasive that almost all members within the denomination may consider *musicking* as an intrinsic element of *salviness*.

### 6.2.1 Categories of Community Music

Community music entails diverse forms of music-making, sociocultural expression, and organisational delivery. Music has been a natural response to events and meaningful moments of community life the world over (Schippers 2018: 23). From formalised rituals to passive everyday living, the ubiquitous nature of *musicking* makes it difficult to clearly articulate what is meant by ‘community music.’ To address this problem, Lee Higgins recognises three broad perspectives community music can be organised into:

1. community music as the “music of a community”
2. community music as “communal music making”
3. community music as an active intervention between a music leader or leaders and participants (2012: 1).

Higgins considers the first perspective, “music of a community”, as music that is embedded throughout a community’s culture, heritage, and identity. “As a descriptor for a musical identity beholden to a particular group of people”, these individual styles of music are often enmeshed within the everydayness of their lives without great distinction between formal and informal *musicking* (ibid: 4). The second perspective gravitates towards communal musical moments where *musicking* is performed for and by the people. Musical events like a Celtic bush band at a town dance or a local German choir for expatriates, involve people of a community who come together to (re)create and (re)experience traditions, identities, specific social interactions, and histories shared together (ibid). Although similar to the first perspective, “communal music making” suggests a far more conscious effort to bring community together for the purpose of “being a part of, or exposed to, that music” as they “stive to bind people together through performance and participation” (ibid). Perspective

three describes community music groups that are prepared by a musical leader or facilitator. These groups are often the product of intentional outreach to the wider community (ibid). Musical leaders or facilitators develop opportunities such as music ensembles, weekly classes, and education programmes, to connect with new participants of all ages and all walks of life (ibid). The development of these opportunities arises from a myriad of institutional and personal motivations such as addressing systematic social problems, providing safe communal spaces, and offering free music education with a focus on the value of maintaining a set of culturally democratic values to educate, validate, and encourage participants in an environment that provide equal opportunities for all peoples (Bartleet and Higgins 2018: 3 – 4).

Salvation Army music-making involves aspects all of Higgins' community music perspectives with many groups seamlessly moving from one state to another as they draw upon the qualities of each category. As discussed in Chapter Three, music within The Salvation Army grew out of the popular music-making practices of the nine-tenth century working classes of England. Shaped by a religious autocratic system, musical expressions were governed by orders and regulations that framed music-making as an expression to be gifted and recognised as a form of service (Holz 2006: 89). Throughout the development of The Salvation Army, the deep-rooted ideological trope of 'service', to gift your skills to support and encourage others, finds itself analogous to the motivations of community music practitioners. Identifying a need within their communities and addressing that need via creative and practical ways is the 'bread and butter' of The Salvation Army and its members. Therefore, this approach to community music-making fits the social conventions (*doxa*) of The Salvation Army as members realise and repurpose the personal and sociocultural qualities (capital[s]) their involvement with the denomination has afforded them.

Due to the permeable nature of community music, this chapter will apply Higgins' three perspectives as a framework to approach community music-making observed within the fieldwork period. The first perspective briefly explores how some members of the Salvation Army experience 'traditional' worship music as an innate expression of *salvonness*. The second perspective, "communal music making", speaks to how salvationists blur boundaries around certain ways of *musicking* and how this has changed the sights and sounds of some music groups. The chapter concludes with a discussion surrounding facilitated community music programmes and community outreach informed by perspective three.



### 6.3 Perspective One: Music of a Community

‘How music of The Salvation Army informs *salviness*’ has been discussed at length in the fourth chapter of this thesis. However, from the perspective of community music making, the experience of traditional Salvation Army music oscillates between “music in the community” and “communal music making”. Although most music-making within Army contexts falls within Higgins’ second and third perspective, some salvationists may argue that the sounds of the mission are unique to their expression of Christianity and therefore perform “as a descriptor for a musical identity beholden to a particular group of people” (Higgins 2012: 5). Up until the early 1990s, the segregated nature of Salvation Army music helped to produce compositional styles that reinforced specific expressions of Salvationism. Although composers and musical leaders within the denomination stretched the margins of Salvation Army *music*, a collection of musical tropes (such as instrumentation and language) continued to reinforce what Salvationism sounded like. These traditions afforded many salvationists the opportunity to develop social, cultural, and skills capital in Salvation Army music-making that provided the ability to move between social *fields* throughout the mission. In this way, these sounds bound people together in worship, mission, and a community that stretched further than their local corps expressions.

Rohwer explains that religious music permeates the boundary between Higgins’ first and second perspectives as faith and worship is “interwoven” as “church music may have a different feel than other community groups, with an emphasis on an external, unifying force making the activity look more like a service endeavour than a leisure activity” (2010: np). Within the Australian context, members who described music-making as an embedded cultural experience tended to be older and referred to ‘traditional’ Salvation Army music-making expressions. Brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades playing and singing to jaunty nineteenth-century vaudeville or folk tunes, intuitively evoked an understanding of togetherness for these salvationists,

*What is it about Army music (its sound in particular) that makes it “Salvo”?*

As the brass band has been a significant factor in worship there is a certain power to worship that makes it typical. The use of bright, happy songs that focus on the joyous Christian life are the essence of TSA.

*When you hear a Salvation Army band do you feel different? Why/Why not?*

I do. It stirs my soul and as it accompanies a song one is lifted

(Questionnaire: No. 4)

Many participants noted the sensation of a 'liftedness', stirring, or feelings of being moved at the sounds of a brass band and songster brigade. However, whilst many members identify with the sounds of brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades as 'theirs', most engage with Army music expressions within the sociocultural world of The Salvation Army. Although the sounds of 'traditional' *salvo*ness may be accessed via compact disk, radio, and online streaming services at any time, the majority of participants approached worship music according to personal taste rather than cultural affinity. Certain sounds may evoke "a musical identity beholden to a particular group of people", however, music-making within The Salvation Army tends to be approached as "communal music making", an activity that is attended to on a regular basis (Higgins 2012: 5). The following section explores how members in The Salvation Army come together in small communities to make-music as they (re)negotiate certain ways of *musicking* to reflect their wider community.

#### **6.4 Perspective Two: Communal Music-making**

As early as 1916, Peter W. Dykema recognised the importance of engaging with community music-making with intentionality, "that 'man shall not live by bread alone' is a statement which implies that while it is entirely proper that man's physical needs be taken care of, his life is incomplete, his development stunted, if only these needs be provided" (p 218 – 219). Perhaps hyperbolic to the twenty-first century reader, Dykema's sentiment speaks to the importance of creativeness and connectivity music-making provides as, "community music is socialised music" (ibid: 218). Within The Salvation Army, communal music-making is an essential way of 'being salvo' within a denomination that prizes its unique musical heritage, and the values music groups foster throughout the mission. As many music groups have responded to change, the boundaries surrounding communal music-making have blurred, altering the image, sounds, and personnel involved in music-making at present. Higgin's second perspective speaks to these changes as music-making throughout The Salvation Army Australia continues to be made communally as it permeates a set of long held boundaries and ideas that have shaped Army music-making for decades.

Since its inception, General Booth was quick to prescribe how music was to be framed within the mission (Holz 2006: 89; Cox 2011: 66). Although both Catherine and William Booth were keenly aware of the power congregational singing and instrumental music had by attracting a crowd and introducing the gospel to the masses, William Booth was highly precautions of the vices group music-making could foster (Cox 2011: 25). As was discussed in chapter two, the early stages of brass bands and ensemble music-making were quickly governed by a set of orders and regulations outlining the parameters for service and music-making. These rules would set in place a structure of governance for Salvation Army music groups for decades to come (Herbert 1991: 47 – 48). As late as the year 2000, the *Regulations and Guidelines for Musicians* produced by the Territorial Headquarters, London, included certain regulations such as,

### 1. Membership

All commissioned musicians must:

- a) Be soldiers of The Salvation Army.
- b) Undertake their responsibilities as members of the group with integrity, having a clear understanding of current regulations and a respect for the position and authority of their section leader.
- c) Be committed to regular financial support of their corps through the systematic giving scheme.
- d) Accept the responsibility of subscription to sectional funds, thereby sustaining the ongoing ministry of the section.
- e) Regularly attend rehearsals and sectional activities, informing of absence when unable to attend.
- f) Conform to the required uniform code applicable with the corps (which will in turn operate under territorial guidelines as issued from time to time).
- g) Be prepared to speak, sing, play or pray as opportunity arises.

h) Young people who have already been commissioned as musicians in junior music sections/groups may be commissioned in senior music sections/groups at any time subsequent to their becoming senior soldiers (p 8 – 9).

Unlike Booth's original rules and regulations, members were permitted to participate in music-making groups outside of The Salvation Army, if it "does not conflict with Salvation Army principles and service" (ibid: 12). The restriction of participation in corps music-making groups perpetuated the outsider/insider dynamic of the late nineteenth century into the twenty-first century. However, as the internal dynamics of local corps expressions responded to the impact of the worship wars and external pressures, many 'traditional' music groups turned to include 'non-uniformed' personnel in their musical communities. For many small corps, this shift was an obvious adjustment in the name of inclusion and survival. Brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades reframed participation in these groups as an opportunity to minister to non-uniformed members, especially new members who were musical but may not have a relationship with Jesus. One officer commented,

... in the old days, if you weren't a uniformed member you couldn't be in the band either, and that's changing across [corps], so I think that's because brass band instruments have lost popularity in general, and desperate times call for desperate measures. So they say, well, 'if you can play a brass instrument, you can be in the band', whether you're in the uniform or not and if your heart is in it, then great. So it's a changing world. Sometimes I think we're clutching at straws but in the other time I think it's great. There are some old salvationists that would still turn their nose up at the fact that they are non-uniform members in a band. But I think it's great. Just because you're not a member of the Salvation Army, it shouldn't mean you can't play your instrument and praise the Lord. So, it's a new world!  
(Interview: 18.02.2019)

During the fieldwork period of this thesis, most brass bands, songsters, and timbrel brigades had diversified involving the participation of non-uniformed members and young music-makers. Many brass bands and songsters from larger 'traditional' corps observed during this period sustained a senior soldier (or uniformed) majority as non-uniformed members wore similar attire without epaulets (often black pants and white shirt). Of these larger corps, most supported a brass ensemble and singing group for young people and new players to encourage learning and the next generation of senior music-makers. However, most brass

bands supporting worship meetings included new music-makers of all ages, often placed between more seasoned players to help them along. For example, during fieldwork, one small brass ensemble led the congregation in worship for the upbeat songs. However, half of this ensemble involved young beginners,

The band slowly gathers on the platform as they turn up for Sunday morning meeting. Eventually, there are eight in the brass band involving four primary school aged children (three girls and one boy), three older soldiers (all men), and one of the corps officers... contemporary or quieter songs are led on piano by one of the corps officers leaving the song book tunes to the band... (ethnographic notes, 10.04.19).

Instances such as these will be explored further in this chapter, nevertheless, this example of formal and informal learning process has been passed down throughout The Salvation Army's educational history as experienced players who grew up in the denomination recount their early music encounters,

My father plays cornet as well and he's always been an active member in both Salvation Army bands and community bands. So he introduced me to brass banding. He's always been my cornet teacher. I started playing cornet probably around the age of seven or eight, and in the end, so he was my gateway into the band. I also have a lot of other family members, male family members who have always been in the band as well, and grandparents, uncles and cousins, and extended family. So it's just been a part of my culture, I guess, brass banding (Interview: 24.06.2018).

Whilst this thesis has previously touched upon the music educational experiences members engaged with as young players, this participant highlights a common educational process within The Salvation Army. Participants report learning from family members and older members in the band, songsters, and timbrel brigades who took the time to tutor one-on-one or small groups before and after rehearsals. Regardless of the formality or informality of these groups or one-on-one lessons, salvationists have passed their singing and playing traditions from one generation to the next (Sutton 2010: 3 – 4). That was, until a generation experienced the conflict and interruption of the worship wars and other wider institutional decisions made around creative worship expressions,

Well, the brass band has been a significant part of the Salvation Army for quite a number of years and it seems to be under decline. Now, I think that there are a number of factors for that. First of all, I have to be careful how I say this, but I'll be honest with you, I think the administration or corps offices in general have not necessarily supported that because – so the Army was a sense of basic learning for young people. I mean apart from – they learn the gospel and they learn how to worship through the music they're doing. It doesn't happen at any church, but it happens in the Salvation Army, and that training has slowly been dissipated because there hasn't been the same support I don't think (Interview: 10.08.2020).

The decline of the 'traditional' succession of salvationist music-makers has left a group of retired aged salvationists nostalgic for the past and the following generation lamenting what some feel the Salvos promised, but many feel they missed. The latter generation experienced the endings of large brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades, and formal music education,

Music for many people is hard because it requires practice, requires studying, learning, and putting it into practice. I mean we stopped training theory a long time ago. I went to music camp when I was, way back when, I don't know that there was colour in the world back then. Still grey and white back then. You didn't get a chance to choose an elective, so you did one of the main electives at that time and, again, that was the old school [...] So your main streams, you picked one of them. You get a chance to do an elective until you're done [with] fourth-grade theory (27.04.2019).

Although the shift in music education within The Salvation Army Australia has been explored previously in this dissertation, the lack of investment identified by many participants throughout this study speaks to an important shift in how music made with a community was prioritised. Importantly, it highlights how a cohort of salvationists negotiated communal music-making whilst the wider institution changed how it prioritised the creative arts,

The brass versus concert band became a thing and because of the status and the standoff that was something that transitioned one to the other. Fortunately, schools

and many children have benefited from good music education through their school, but because the Army hadn't kept up with the changes and they hadn't looked into what opportunities there were to work alongside it closely, it wasn't as well-transitioned through the 80s and 90s...

January 1994, it was only then did the International Music Board allow music non-Salvation Army sources to be played by the Salvation Army, so in some ways we actually actively excluded outside teaching content being allowed in. So, because of that isolation, we've really done ourselves disservice and I think we're still recovering from that today (30.07.2020).

For participants such as these, leading, supporting, and committing to 'traditional' forms of Army music-making led to opportunities of creativity and inclusion as it simultaneously led to moments of frustration. How music was taught, transmitted, and organised between generations no longer 'fit' a certain expression of *salviness*. The lives of new Salvation Army music-makers involved a shift of roles and values within their work, family, and personal lives. Regardless of 'contemporary' or 'traditional' worship music expressions, the clash between what was considered 'commitment' and 'dedication' has been a space of conflict where the values and demands present no longer align with those of the past. Rohwer and Rohwer report similar complications for Welsh men's choirs in their research (2012). A strong communal music-making tradition in itself, Rohwer and Rohwer note that the demands of family, employment, health, and financial pressures were common obstacles participants found it difficult to join the choir and attend regular rehearsals (ibid: np). As these factors impinge on the recruitment and retainment of members, these choirs continue to explore how they may attract new younger members to their ranks (ibid). For salvationists, offering the opportunities for non-uniformed members to participate was one step towards inclusion, diversification, and a blurring of 'inside/outside' music-making practices.

#### 6.4.1 Blurring the boundaries

Ethnographic vignette:

*Whilst I chat with the older folk of the corps over our morning coffee, members of the brass band and 'worship band' quickly rehearse in the hall next door. We hear them stop and start on certain sections as they pick up on problems and discuss the order of the song (how many verses, this is when we go to the chorus, we'll repeat the chorus three times as the end...). By*

*10.35am they run through the songs one last time as the congregation make their way in. Although this is not the prelude, the congregation don't seem fussed that the service is running a little behind.*

*Like many urban worship halls, this hall is a 1950s brown brick building with wooden veneer decal throughout. The platform is deep and spans the width of the hall allowing for band, a baby grand piano, contemporary worship ensemble, small lectern, and room to gather. Unlike most corps, the 'brass band' includes an assortment of instruments including flute, clarinet, and alto and tenor saxophone. Approximately 70% of the band are in senior soldier or officer uniforms, the rest being in a white shirt or Salvation Army t-shirt and black pants combination. The ages of the players range from primary school aged children to retirees. This band is a real mix of generations, music proficiently, instruments, uniforms, and cultural background. The first song, Holy, holy, holy (Nicaea, Herber, and Dykes TB: 771), is introduced by the band. Although there is no conductor, the band is led by an older man on cornet who plays the melody and gestures to the group when to start, stop, and slow down. As they play each verse, a few of the younger players seem to forget fingering or get lost a few times. These players are supported by older participants who point out where the band is up to on the music and demonstrate correct fingering as they play. The overall sound is loud, raucous, and colourful. The congregation sings and claps along with the band. Some play along in the choruses on hand drums or timbrels... (ethnographic notes: 10.02.2019).*

Almost all local corps expressions observed throughout the research period were in the midst of exploring how 'traditional' Salvation Army music and contemporary congregational music complemented their milieu. However, all of them shared a set of qualities that blurred the boundaries of Army music-making. The ethnographic vignette above presents an example of the qualities most corps had incorporated throughout their negotiations of worship music practices. Most corps expressions that supported 'traditional' Salvation Army music-making practices had dismantled the boundaries that maintained senior brass bands, songster brigades, and timbrel brigades as separate from the community. The diversification of membership, musicality, and instrumentation opened the opportunity for non-uniformed members to participate regularly in bands and singing groups whilst maintaining music-making that appealed to traditional salvationist sensibilities. These changes lead to an important shift regarding inclusivity as music groups turned to involve young music-makers in both 'brass' bands, songsters, timbrels, and contemporary worship band as soon as



possible. In doing so, these musical groups transformed into places of education, connection, and community for members of all kinds and ages.

The power of intergenerational music-making has played an integral role within the field of community music. The term ‘intergenerational’ refers to the inclusion of multiple generations interacting and collaborating with each other (Darrow et al. 2001: 43; Varvarigou et al. 2011: 208; Beynon and Alfano 2013: np). For community music practitioners, intergenerational interactions and collaborations within musical groups have fostered significant learning opportunities for both young and old, altered potential prejudices held by both groups, brought together diverse life experiences, and helped shape positive communities (ibid). Darrow et al., explain that,

Participation in musical organisations provides many of the same benefits afforded by other intergenerational programming – the creation of interpersonal attachments, the development of mutual concern and caring for one another, and the dissolution of stereotypes. Music can also serve as a means of integrating diverse populations and peoples of diverse abilities (2001: 44).

Many of the music programmes referenced in the community music literature centre around “community music as an active intervention between a music leader or leaders and participants” (Higgins 2012: 1). These programmes often involve intergenerational choirs, bands, and school education programmes. However, the outcomes of intergenerational music-making cited in the literature are prevalent within Salvation Army music groups throughout the territory. As the ‘traditional’ educational progression from beginner bands, singing, and timbrel groups through to senior music groups have become concentrated in one band, choir, timbrel brigade, or contemporary worship band, generational interactions have naturally become far more interwoven. The ethnographic example above captures a diverse group of music-makers no longer bound by the status of membership, age, or ability. By engaging with diverse membership, the congregation engages in worship and community with a sound that is authentic to them.

Although many beginners were learned from their interactions in the main band, separate beginner bands were represented during the fieldwork period. These bands were often initiated by a handful of enthusiastic corps members who valued brass bands and the music

education within the lives of these young players as well as looking to the future of brass banding itself. Some of these bands were facilitated as after school actives whilst a handful of bands coincided in the general Friday night youth programme. Most of these bands were supported by seasoned players who reinforced the group to provide a strong foundation. Participants in these groups were often school aged students from corps families or students from ‘the community’ that had been invited to participate. In this way, the nature of beginner bands such as these straddle the boundary of formalised community music programmes (perspective three) and communal music-making (perspective two). An example of this boundary crossing was observed during fieldwork during a brass band workshop and performance day,

The concert was split into two sections. First the beginner ‘young people’s’ (YP) bands played a few songs. Many of these bands were either beginner bands run by local corps or *Just Brass* groups. Their band leaders were asked questions about their musical upbringing. All of them noting a Salvation Army bandsman who had taught them at an early age and how bands had fostered their formative music educational experience. The bands comprised of school students (some in school uniforms) often supported by older players. The first half of this concert lasted an hour before the second half of the concert comprised of senior corps bands. One corps timbrel brigade played with a march with the combined band at the end (ethnographic notes, 27.07.2018).

This workshop and performance day brought together senior brass bands, corps beginner bands, and programmed beginner bands in the same space. Beginner bands were combined throughout the day to workshop new songs under different band leaders starting from early music to much challenging pieces. It is important to note that within this space, wind players were included as several corps YP bands embraced flutes. Although these players were invited, they were not catered for within the brass space when learning difficult music. These players were often left waiting for the following piece as they either did not have music provided or the transposed part was too difficult, as one participant noted in passing, “this is the only bad thing about playing flute in church, they don’t let you play in band much and I get left out” (ibid). In many ways, the boundaries of Salvation Army music-making were continuously negotiated and (re)affirmed throughout the day. For example, although beginner bands involving students from both within and outside of The Salvation Army were celebrated

and encouraged throughout the day (boundaries blurred), diverse instrumentation was not always considered (boundary held). Many senior bands involved non-uniformed members (boundaries blurred) yet performed the second half of the concert entirely separate from the beginner bands (boundary held). In many ways, the event provided a unique snapshot of the challenges brass banding faced within a specific urban milieu, the boundaries participants were willing to blur, and the music-making practices senior bands continue to gatekeep.

As salvationists have altered their communal music-making practices to better reflect their communities, Higgin's second perspective helps to frame how the boundaries shaped Salvation Army *music-making* have become blurred. In some places, these boundaries are non-existent and of little concern to expressing *salviness*. In others, these boundaries continue to be tested as local corps negotiate how communal music-making serves their community both inside and outside of their hall walls. The next section explores Higgin's third perspective and how The Salvation Army Australia has begun to explore this community music-making approach.

### **6.5 Perspective Three: facilitated community music programmes**

Whilst perspective one speaks directly to internal Salvation Army music-making and perspective two highlights the blurring of the boundaries surrounding Army music-making, Higgin's third perspective approaches community music from the standpoint of facilitated music programmes for the community. The overall intention of facilitated community music programmes is to systematically address social problems, provide safe communal spaces, and offer accessible music education (Bartleet and Higgins 2018: 3). Within the twenty-first century context of Australia, perspective three fits seamlessly within the sensibilities of The Salvation Army. A somewhat 'natural' expression of Salvationism, social programmes developed to support and connect to local communities are the bread and butter of the organisation. Built upon the foundation of service, many corps strive to identify local needs and how they can best serve their communities. Services such as these are often provided by salvationists and are based on the skills that corps folk bring to church each week.

Community programmes such as visual arts and craft groups, after school homework clubs, sports ministry, kids cooking clubs, and many more, can be found from corps to corps. As explored in previous section, corps facilitated beginner bands straddle the boundary between perspective two and three. However, one programme designed and implemented by The Salvation Army falls well within the purview of facilitated community music-making.

### *Just Brass*

The brainchild of two salvationists, *Just Brass* is a manualised music programme offered to schools without a music programme in place (McFerran and Higgins 2019: 2). Often these schools reside in low socio-economic areas where the price of private music education is too high and difficult to access (ethnographic notes, 10.08.2017). Leaders within the programme are equipped with a toolkit that helps with programming, resourcing, and teaching that is scaffolded far more than corps run beginner bands (McFerran and Higgins 2019: 2 – 3). Depending on the school, students receive one-on-one lessons at school during the week before meeting at the local corps hall for band practice. In places with many participants, students are organised into bands according to skill levels and at the end of the term, may graduate to the next band up (Morris 2017: 14). If several schools are engaged with the *Just Brass* programme within a region, weekly band practices involve students from different schools coming together as their own community (ibid).

During fieldwork *Just Brass* rehearsals were not attended. However, an information session with one of the founding *Just Brass* salvationists was included in the dataset, as well as *Just Brass* performances during public concerts. What makes this programme particularly ‘Salvo’ is the motivation behind student engagement. This programme relies heavily on corps support and participation,

Long before the ragtag bunch of kids arrive, bandmasters are setting up, grandparents are cutting fruit slices for afternoon tea, and parents are making themselves comfortable in the lounge. The sense of community is palpable, and I soon discover that there is only one band leader on staff who also teaches weekly lessons at four primary schools. Everyone else is a volunteer, either a member of the corps or a family member, who believes in the mission of Just Brass (Morris 2017: 16).

In this feature article Morris describes the in-depth *musiciking* that is involved to facilitate this programme. In addition to accessible music education, the programme involves intergenerational investment from family and corps members to maintain the programme. Students are supported by a chaplain (generally the local officer) who shares a five-minute message with them each week. These messages centre around themes of respect, consideration, and looking after one another (ethnographic data 17.08.2017). Ultimately, it

requires buy-in from a community that understand the wider implications for these students coming together each week. During the information session it was noted that for some students, afternoon tea could be their biggest, healthiest meal of the week (ethnographic notes, 10.08.2017). For others, this community music programme helps to encourage inclusion and build self-confidence, leadership attributes, and resilience within a safe, supportive environment (McFerran and Higgins 2019). In this sense, the musical heritage of The Salvation Army and the qualities it has fostered are transformed into a facilitated community music-making programme that employs the skills and resources of seasoned salvationists and their wider communities.

## Chapter 7 – Are we still Salvo?

### 7.1 Introduction

This research study has explored how Australian salvationists continue to worship and connect to their wider communities through music-making and how diverse expressions of *salvonnness* is brought into being through a continuous negotiation between ‘traditional’ (inside) and ‘contemporary’ (outside) *musicking*. Each chapter within this dissertation approached a series of overarching themes that intersect throughout the complex and multifaceted question,

*How do salvationists maintain their salvonnness, or their social and personal investment in an internally coherent sense of collective identity through music-making activities, and what forms these may take at present?*

While music-making within this international denomination carries with it a set of rich histories and mythologies, Salvation Army music is steeped in a set of practices that have perpetuated specific *ways of being* for over a century (Herbert 1991: 47). Understanding the sociocultural tropes that defined Salvation Army music and the conflicts of the worship wars on worship music enables us to gain a deeper understanding of the challenges faced by many salvationists. For some, these challenges are a thing of the past. For others, these challenges live on today in their local corps expressions, their band rooms, and their contemporary worship bands. However, within the context of twenty-first century Australian life, most Salvation Army expressions within the Australia Territory find creative ways of encountering *salvonnness* through *musicking* that resonate with their local communities.

This study broached the question of what it means to be a music-making salvationist during a time of significant institutional change. Because of this, many salvationists were keenly aware of their histories and the institutional decisions of the past as they anticipated the future. For most participants, the discussion surrounding music-making within the context of The Salvation Army Australia spoke to more than the dichotomy of ‘traditional versus contemporary’ worship music. Often, the various states of music-making experienced by participants provided a framework to articulate significant sociocultural shifts within their local corps expressions through to wider institutional frustrations, concerns, and successes. Participant discussion surrounding the treatment of making music within the denomination

illustrated a series of broader themes that shaped who, when, where, and how Australian salvationists continued to maintain their *salvones*.

Throughout the research, the sociocultural world of The Salvation Army in Australia presented itself as a unique assemblage of salvationists engaged with creating authentic worship experiences in their immediate communities and wider denomination. To understand the interconnectedness of this world, Bourdieu's concepts surrounding the reproduction of culture within social *fields* (and *subfields*) has provided a theoretical framework essential for conceptualising the intricate musical, cultural, and social world of The Salvation Army. In doing so, the framework provided a methodology suitable for disentangling the structural relationships continuously negotiated between individuals, groups, and the wider institution. By approaching the complexities of these relationships via Bourdieu's social *fields*, we have been able to make visible a series of qualities maintained within the social *field* of The Salvation Army as they continue to mould certain *ways of being* throughout the denomination. This is of particular importance as participants continuously demonstrate "varying degrees of integration and tension, depending on the character and compatibility of the social situations over time" (Wacquant 2005: 319). Habitus, therefore, continues to encounter conflict and attempt to find resolution as participants clash and renegotiate a series of social tropes (*doxa*) that afford participants a combination of cultural, social, symbolic, and skills capital. By applying Bourdieu's theoretical framework, we are able to dismantle and explore a series of themes that revolve around a continuous renegotiation of what Salvation Army music is and how music-making salvationists respond to the sociocultural demands of the past, changes in sound and expression, institutional frustration, and the general everydayness of the *salvones* within twenty-first century life.

It is important to note that the application of Bourdieu's theoretical framework has shaped the overall structure and approach to this research. By doing so, the research focused on music-making practices rather than an analysis of musical works. This is partly due to the attention Salvation Army brass band music has already gained within the denomination and the academy. However, it is also due to the conversations observed surrounding musical-making practices and systematic complexities during fieldwork rather than the music itself. As noted previously, music-making experienced by participants provided a framework to articulate significant sociocultural shifts within their local corps expressions through to wider institutional frustrations, concerns, and successes. Uncovering how Salvation Army music is

and was performed in certain ways was essential to understanding why tensions continue throughout music-making groups at present. Delving into the institutional decisions and practices of The Salvation Army's past allowed for a greater appreciation of the lived and mythologised histories many salvationists perform to date. Although many participants were aware of the historical beginnings of William Booth's autocratic system of governance, a proud history involving social justice, the strength of brass banding, and the impact of worship wars, most participants were unaware of the sociocultural tropes that continued to inform *how* and *why* musical practices were performed in certain ways. For example, where many older salvationists could recount the Fry family myth, some players were unaware of these historical roots yet had been fully immersed within the *field* for their entire lives (Interview: 02.03.2018). In some *subfields*, this issue has grown in importance as music-makers unknowingly contend with deeply embedded sociocultural forces that continue to dictate how *musicking* is performed. To understand these tensions, chapter two offers insight into the historical and mythological roots that shape and underpin the experiences of Salvation Army music-makers within the Australian context and how *salviness* is mediated by a set of organisational discourses that have slowly weathered by time, generational inheritance, and sociocultural change. Although many music groups have moved away from 'strict' traditional Salvation Army music-making practices, an understanding of the sociocultural tropes that inform 'the world' of The Salvation Army has highlighted a series of themes, sensibilities, and *ways of being* that remained present in these groups.

The results of this study were informed by a consistent emergence of themes experienced by salvationists in various music-making expressions. Salvationist participants largely spoke to three primary themes that eventually shaped the direction and presentation of the research project. Each theme addressed the research question from different angles and perspectives as they continuously intersect and inform one another. These themes circled around a negotiation of individual and institutional identities, the performance and treatment of traditional and contemporary worship musics, a need to sustain a relatable presence to their wider communities, and the maintenance of *salviness* during a period of flux. This chapter will further discuss the research question, themes, and the implications of the study's results. Lastly, this chapter concludes with a reflection on the state of Salvation Army music-making in Australia, and the need of further research in a post-COVID19 lockdown world.



## 7.2 Approach to the research question

The overarching research question came out of a series of encounters all converging on a similar crisis: *are we still salvo?* To address the complexities of the question, this research project involved long-term fieldwork that spanned over a 22-month period from 2017 to 2020. It involved 66 fieldwork sites, 18 in-depth semi-structured interviews, 20 questionnaires, and live streamed events. Data analysis commenced once a substantial amount of data had accumulated. A process that continued throughout research period. To collate qualitative data, computer assisted qualitative data analysis software (CAQDAS) was employed throughout the research project. Handling the data in such a way provided an important glimpse into the musical lives of many music-making salvationists during a time of great change and challenge. This process allowed for the emergence of unifying themes that presented themselves as strands of inquiry allowing me, as the researcher, to “gently and tentatively, pick up one strand and see where it leads, and then follow that strand on to the next and beyond, and, in the process, begin to loosen the whole knot” (Carrithers 1992: 3 - 4).

I approached the research question from the unique standpoint of an organisation insider and outsider. As I have explored previously, my experience with The Salvation Army as an organisational member has not been life-long. My engagement with the denomination involved a conscious learning experience. First, learning the social *field* of the organisation, accumulating capital(s) within certain *subfields*, and, like many salvationists, encountering tensions evoked between autonomous actors and the social *fields* they are shaped by (Bourdieu 1977: 72). Therefore, grounding the study in Bourdeusian theory allowed for the establishment of a firm foundation, a baseline of Australian Salvation Army culture, and a place to anchor the overall analysis. In doing so, I continued to check the data collected against one theoretical framework to assure readers of their own interpretations regarding the conflicts, crisis, frustrations, and successes salvationists manage within the everydayness of their *salviness*.

As the accumulation of data hit multiple points of saturation, each topic and theme revealed multiple perspectives surrounding the interconnectedness and idiosyncratic nature of music-making within The Salvation Army Australia. For example, during semi-structured interviews, participants moved seamlessly from one theme to another as they drew together multiple strands of experience, understanding, and expertise into a knot comprised of histories, conflicts, compromises, and at times, contradictions. It became apparent that for

many, *salviness* sits within a perpetual state of flux where the parameters of ‘being salvo’ continuously shift according to each *subfield* they engage with. Salvationists within Australia have move on from placing expressions of *salviness* on a linear spectrum from ‘traditional’ to ‘contemporary’. Rather, *salviness* as a highly adaptable expression of Salvationism, responds to limitless variations of ‘The Salvation Army’ and the sociocultural tropes (*doxa*) that are interwoven into the fabric of each *subfield*. Consequently, the finer deliberations between the opinions of individuals, local expressions, and the wider institution became evident in the loosening of the knot as members oscillated between feelings of lament and excitement, loss and progress, and community and isolation. Within this knot, the tendrils of music-making extended to almost all facets of *salviness* as Small reminds us, *musicking* is an activity that involves “all participation in a musical performance, whether it takes place actively or passively, whether we like the way it happens or whether we do not, whether we consider it interesting or boring, constructive or destructive, sympathetic or antipathetic” it bonds the corps folk in community (1998: 9).

### **7.3 Discussion of themes**

The intention of this study was to explore how music-making salvationists maintain their sense of personal investment and connectivity through music-making activities, and what forms they may take at present. Throughout the research process, music-making salvationists brought to the fore key issues that impacted their individual expressions and experiences of *salviness* and an awareness of the wider implications and changes observed throughout The Salvation Army Australia. In this way, the research question offered a space for participants to highlight areas of concern, conflict, and celebration within their individual experiences of *salviness*.

The personal histories and stories shared by participants in chapter four, *A Music-making People*, brings together a collection of similar early music-making experiences shaped by the private sphere (family), community (corps), organisation (The Salvation Army), and spiritual life (Christianity). Most participants contributed a history recounting intergenerational participation and music-making experiences from an early age. However, older participants were able to quickly identify the organisation of gender roles within these music-making groups, “Girls played the Timbrel, guys were in the band” (LS). Although these gender roles were altered at times, some women noted this division as a missed opportunity subsequently impacting the number of women in ‘high level banding’ at present. For younger participants,

these boundaries have become less rigid allowing the diversification of participation in both timbrel and brass band music groups. However, music education and the fostering of music-making programmes within The Salvation Army conjured complex reactions from participants. This topic brought forth passionate opinions regarding The Salvation Army Australia's lack of institutional investment in supporting the creative arts. Participants could trace back through their music camp histories to when music theory was taught, trained musicians educated young people, and music programmes were delivered to foster the next generation of music-making salvationists. For older people, this shift signified lack of investment by The Salvation Army itself and the final recession of 'traditional' Salvation Army music as music students turned to school music programmes, external private lessons, and other creative spaces to develop their craft.

Although many participants reminisced over the splendour of the 'glory days', the change in community dynamics underscored concerns surrounding traditional music-making practices and general congregational decline. For these participants, the image of the past reflected a community of strength, relevance, and continuity where certain expressions of *salviness* reinforced their place and identity within the wider world. However, while Salvation Army music-making has changed, music groups continue to be recognised as small communities of fellowship, support, and social bonding, as well as avenues of service and outreach.

Participants noted the value of these groups as many rehearsals or gatherings set space aside for prayer, testimonies, sharing, and devotions. In doing so, these small communities of faith create moments of connection where expressions of *salviness* are (re)determined as music groups such as brass bands, songsters, timbrels, and other worship ensembles, negotiate what is meaningful, relevant, and important in their immediacy.

Throughout the research process participants noted how identity, loss and lament, nostalgia, place making, and relevance, coloured how they engaged with their music-making practices. Whilst this was not a conscious process for all participants, many salvationists were aware of the stories surrounding who *they* are as *musicking* salvationists and how these experiences informed both the performance of Salvation Army music-making in the past and present. As Frith reminds us,

Music, like identity, is both performance and story, describes the social in the individual and the individual in the social, the mind in the body and the body in

the mind; identity, like music, is a matter of both ethics and aesthetics (Frith 1996: 109).

As *musicking* salvationists perform their stories, they continue to (re)negotiate their individual and communal expressions of *salviness* applicable to their own worship halls. In this way, the performance of ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ worship music draws upon a myriad of histories and experiences as it pulls together the threads of the past, places it in the present, and projects potential futures. As it may be saddening for some, the anticipation of ‘what’s next’ is motivating and exciting for many members as they strive to create inclusive and meaningful worship experiences for their communities. It is within these moments of intersectionality that the negotiation of worship music finds its place within the world of The Salvation Army.

As a tangible expression of change and difference, the dichotomy of ‘traditional versus contemporary’ music practices dominated the articulation of difference within the social *field* of The Salvation Army Australia. In conversation, ‘traditional’ was often used as a shorthand to refer to concepts such as the past, old fashioned, comfortable, and inside, as opposed to ‘contemporary’ or ‘modern’ as new, foreign, different, uncomfortable, exciting, and outside. Understandably, many members relied upon these terms to frame their experiences, illustrate an atmosphere or mood of a place, or explain the organisation of groups. Along with visual cues such as the décor of the worship hall, variations in uniform, and engagement of digital technology, music-making embodied all facets of change, conflict, and creativity. Because of this, Monique Ingall’s conceptualisation of worship music as a “repository for individual memories and an enabler of the collective activities” became central to the research process (2018: 8). As the core of this research paper, chapter five draws together the threads of place making, music delivery, and the organisation of *musicking* all coloured by the concepts surrounding ‘traditional’ and ‘contemporary’ Salvation Army music.

During fieldwork, it became clear that the delivery of worship music was unique to each site making it difficult to reconcile ‘Salvation Army music’ as a unified concept. What is reconcilable are the common musical, sociocultural, historical, and communal threads that bind communities together in *salviness*. Through a series of ethnographic examples and participant contributions, chapter five steps through prominent music concerns that inform Salvation Army music-making experiences with the worship hall. Salvationists are quick to

recognise a decline in music-makers, how this decline effects the sound of their local (and national) corps expressions, and what strategies have been put in place to sustain live worship music. Where some are committed wholly committed to either ‘traditional’ or ‘contemporary’ music-making, most corps engage with some kind of ‘blended worship’ or ‘cross-over music’. What *is* universally acknowledged is a thankfulness for live music. Aside the complications surrounding music expressions, many participants noted that working with what is present, is better than relying entirely on ‘YouTube worship’. Although digital audio-visual technology has made worship music accessible, many find it difficult to maintain a worship space and engage the congregation in song. Digital audio-visual technology does, however, continue to provide high quality recordings for small corps without many music-makers in their congregations. In this sense, the qualities that bring music groups together exists outside of the ‘traditional/contemporary’ discourse. The primary concerns for members who valued live worship music had moved beyond a lament for the past. Rather, they recognised the value in coming together to create something new,

Actually, I don’t know what it looks like. I think it could be something completely new and I have no idea what that looks [like], but I think we have the opportunity to almost come up with the new thing, the new style of music that incorporates all different things [...] it’s premature to say that ‘cause I don’t know [...] what God is doing there, but I feel like we have the opportunity to do something new that uses all [of our musical] skills (Interview: 04.04.2019)

Salvation Army music as ‘community music’ held special regard for many members. For some, this was music that brought the community in from ‘outside’, it ministered to the streets during the season of Advent, and fostered opportunities of service. However, approaching Army music-making via Higgins three perspectives highlights the tensions between insider and outsider performance practices and how many local corps expressions have blurred these boundaries. In an effort to continue the traditional sounds of The Salvation Army, members have consciously modified long standing rules to engage with a more diverse membership. In some places, these boundaries are non-existent and of little concern to expressing *salviness*. In others, these boundaries continue to be tested as local corps negotiate how communal music-making serves their community both inside and outside of their hall walls. In doing so, the congregation engages in worship and community with a sound that is authentic to them.

An important expression of community music-making that has become popular in many corps throughout Australia is the implementation of facilitated community music programmes. As well as The Salvation Army Australia's official brass band programme for students, versions of community brass band and singing groups have become popular programmes offered by local corps. A somewhat 'natural' expression of Salvationism, social programmes developed to support and connect to local communities are the bread and butter of the organisation. These opportunities are often facilitated by older members of the brass band or songsters who are aware of the values music groups can foster. Where some may hope it continues the legacy of Salvation Army music in Australia, many members champion in these moments of inclusion as they offer opportunities to help young people build in self-confidence, leadership attributes, and resilience within safe, supportive environments.

#### **7.4 Conclusion: Are we still Salvo?**

The introduction of this thesis opened with the well-loved song, *'Mid all the traffic of the ways* by John Oxenham illustrating the inner and outer turmoil this research sort to explore (2015: 777). While the research commenced during a time of upheaval, the conflicts, challenges, and themes salvationists spoke to were as historical and present regardless of such significant institutional change. The negotiation of worship music practices, maintaining identity, and social and community bonding remained as a central concern for members throughout the research project. For many, these challenges were disconcerting. For others, conflict and change brought with it creativity and renewed engagement. Discussions surrounding decline in general congregational attendance reinforced the need for greater intentionality and the reassessment of what it means to 'be salvo' within the Australian twenty-first century context. However, these conversations were often met with enthusiasm as salvationists sort to find new avenues to adapt their creative worship expressions beyond the walls of their corps buildings.

Throughout this project many salvationist friends and participants checked in with me throughout the research process. Often, they wanted to know what I thought 'went wrong' with traditional Salvation Army music-making and what I thought the future could hold. Long conversations over tea and coffee regarding the themes explored in this project followed as members theorised for themselves who, what, when, where, and how The

Salvation Army Australia finds itself in the position it is in at present. What became clear was that this project presents a snapshot of the innerworkings of Salvation Army music-making within the Australian context. Although this project involved long-term ethnography, more research is required to explore further the overarching research question. For instance, the fieldwork portion of this research was conducted pre-COVID-19. During the COVID-19 pandemic lockdowns, all churches found themselves working with reduced personnel, online streaming services, and new ways of coming 'together' to make music. In Australia, these lockdowns were noteworthy in length and strictness. However, as churches responded and communities moved online, technology has taken on larger roles within the weekly engagement for congregational attendance. Where some corps have ceased streaming, many have continued to use this as a platform to connect with those outside of their immediate communities. Sharing in social media groups have become more prominent as brass bandmen, songsters, and timbrellists post old photos and video clips of traditional expressions of the past. This sharing and building of online communities fell outside of this research and requires greater investigation. Important subjects such as the musical influence and involvement of first nations peoples within The Salvation Army and their history is essential study that requires representation. Within The Salvation Army Australia are a number of Chinese and Korean corps that provide worship meetings and services in their linguistic and sociocultural languages. Sadly, these corps also fell outside of the scope of this project yet clearly add to the diverse musical soundscape of The Salvation Army Australia. Despite its exploratory nature, this research may serve as a base for future studies into the music world of The Salvation Army both in Australia and for the wider international Salvation Army mission. Regardless of the distinctive culture of the Army, this research may also prove helpful for other denominations experiencing similar crises and conflicts within their own unique cultural contexts. For the time being, the themes explored in this thesis continue to be as prominent as ever. Those who remain strive to find new ways of organising themselves as they continue to assess what is integral to their *salvoness* and how can they connect with each other and their wider communities through their love of making music in the spirit of worship.

## References

- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 1993. "Religion" in *Census Characteristics of Australia, 1991 Census of Population and Housing*. Commonwealth of Australia.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 2003. "X11 Religious Affiliation by Age" in *Community Profile Series, 2001 Census of Population and Housing*, Catalogue No. 2005.0. Commonwealth of Australia.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 2012. "X08 Religious Affiliation by Age By Sex (3 of 3)" in *2011 Census of Population and Housing, Expanded Community Profile*, Catalogue No. 2005.0. Commonwealth of Australia.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 2017. "G14 Religious Affiliation by Sex" in *2016 Census of Population and Housing, General Community Profile*, Catalogue No. 2001.0. Commonwealth of Australia.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 2022. "G14 Religious Affiliation by Sex" in *2021 Census of Population and Housing, General Community Profile*. Commonwealth of Australia.
- Aden, R, C. 1995. "Nostalgic Communication as Temporal Escape: *When It Was a Game's* Re-construction of a Baseball/Work Community" in *Western Journal of Communication* 59: 20–38.
- Anderson, B. 1983 (1991). "Introduction" in *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd ed.
- Anum, E, N, B, and Abdul-Hamid, M. 2013. "Christian & Muslim Leadership in Ghana: Maintaining a creative balance between fellowship & followership" in *British Journal of Art and Social Sciences*. Vol. 11, No. 2. British Journal Publishing
- Aull Davies, C. 2008. "Reflexivity and ethnographic research" in *Reflexive Ethnography: A guide to researching selves and others* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Routledge
- Australian Eastern Territory Mission Team. 2015. *Worship Arts Annual Review*. The Salvation Army Eastern Territory
- Australian Eastern Territory Mission Support Team. 2018. "2018 Executive Summary" in *WorshipArts Strategic Plan*. The Salvation Army Eastern Territory
- Ballentine, L. 2022 (1998). "'Mid All the Traffic" in *Salvation Army Music Index*. Online: <https://samusicindex.com/brass/mid-all-the-traffic/2643>
- Ballinger, B. 1976. We have come into His house *ALBUM* Universal Music Corp. and Sound III, Inc.
- Barbour, N. 1995. "Pursuing Relevance" in *The Musician*, March 25, p 3 & 6.
- Bartleet, B, L., and Higgins, L. 2018. "Introduction: An overview of community music in the twenty-first century" in *The Oxford Handbook of Community Music*. Oxford University Press: Oxford Handbooks Online, [www.oxfordhandbooks.com](http://www.oxfordhandbooks.com)



- Beynon, C., and Alfano, C. 2013. "Intergenerational Music Learning in Community and Schools" in *Community Music Today*. R&L Education.
- Blyth, A, J. 2015. *Music practice within The Salvation Army: its History, Significance and Relevance in the 21st Century*. [Masters dissertation, University of Salford].
- Boeskov, K. 2017. "The community music practice as cultural performance: Foundations for a community music theory of social transformation" in *International Journal of Community Music*, 10(1), p 85 – 99.
- Bolton, B. 1980. *Booth's Drum: The Salvation Army in Australia 1880 – 1980*. Australia: Hodder and Stoughton Pty Limited.
- Boon, B. 1966. *Play the Music Play! The Story of Salvation Army Bands*. London: Salvationist Publishing and Supplies, Ltd.
- Boon, B. 1978. *Sing the Happy Song! A History of Salvation Army Vocal Music*. London: Salvationist Publishing and Supplies, Ltd.
- Booth, W. 1877. "Good Singing" in *The Christian Mission Magazine*, 193 – 220.
- Booth-Tucker, F, D. 1892. *The Life of Catherine Booth: The mother of the Salvation Army Volume Two*. Fleming H. Revell Company
- Bourdieu, P. 1977. *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge University Press
- Bourdieu, P. 1980. *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford University Press
- Bourdieu, P. 1986. "The Forms of Capital" in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (first publ. 1983). Westport, CT: Greenwood Press p: 241–258.
- Bourdieu, P. 1996 [1979]. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. United States of America: Harvard University Press
- Bourdieu, P., and L, Wacquant. 1992. *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology*. The University of Chicago.
- Boym, S. 2001. *The Future of Nostalgia*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bridges, M., and Thring, G. 1851. "Crown Him with many crowns" in Public Domain.
- Brown, C, G. 2009. *The Death of Christian Britain: Understanding Secularisation 1800 – 2000*. United States and Canada: Routledge
- Bullock, G. 1993. "Great South Land" on *The Heavens Shall Declare*, Integrity Music.
- Bullock, G. 1995. "His Kingdom Come" on *Now is the time (the songs of Geoff Bollock)*, Integrity Music.

- Burnim, M. 1985. "Culture Bearer and Tradition Bearer: An Ethnomusicologist's Research on Gospel Music" in *Ethnomusicology*, 29(3), p 432 – 447.
- Caffull, D., and Caffull, R. 2022. *Salvation Army Music Index*. Online: <https://samusicindex.com>
- Camsey, T. 1994. "Uniformed or un-informed?" in *The Musician*, 47(3), p 1 & 4.
- Carrithers, M. 1992. "The Question" in *Why Humans Have Cultures: Explaining Anthropology and Social Diversity*. Oxford University Press
- Clearly, J. 2016. "Where are we now" in *Hope Rising*. Australia: The Salvation Army
- Cleary, J. 2006. "Salvationist Worship – A Historical Perspective" in *Journal of Aggressive Christianity*, 42(April – May), 33 – 48.
- Cleary, J. 2006. "1880 – 1920 The Wide Brown Land" in *Brass Bands of the Salvation Army: Their Mission and Music Volume One*. Streets Publishers. Pp: 273 – 331.
- Clifton, J., Clifton, N., Coke, K., and N, Coke. 2015. *Marching Towards Justice: Community Organising and The Salvation Army*. The Centre for Theology & Community.
- Cobb, S. 2006. *DMA Portfolio*. [Doctor of Musical Arts Portfolio, University of Salford]
- Coffey, A. 2021. "Introduction: The foundations of ethnography" in *SAGE Research Methods*. London: SAGE Publications, Ltd.
- Collins, M, E. 2015. *Sounds of the gospel: 125 years of the Melbourne Staff Band*. Australia: Salvo Publishing
- Connexus Church. 2022. *Connexus Church Homepage*. Online: <https://connexuschurch.com>
- Corry, W, J. 2016. *Performance Portfolio*. [Doctor of Philosophy Dissertation, University of Salford]
- Cox, G. 2011. *The Musical Salvationist: The World of Richard Slater (1854 – 1939)*. United Kingdom: The Boydell Press, Woodbridge.
- Crosby, F. 1875. "To God be the glory" in Public Domain.
- Cunningham, H. 1980. "The growth of leisure in the early Industrial Revolution, c. 1780-c. 1840" in *Leisure in the Industrial Revolution c. 1780-c. 1880*. United States: Routledge.
- Darrow, A., Johnson, C, M., Ollenberger, T., and Miller, A, M. 2001. "The effect of an intergenerational chour performance on audience members' attitudinal statements towards teens and older persons" in *International Journal of Music Education*, 38. P: 43 – 50.
- Davies-Kildea, J. 2017. *The Salvation Army and the Social Gospel: Reconciling evangelical intend and social concern*. [Doctoral Dissertation: Monash University]

- Deer, C. 2014. "Doxa" in *Pierre Bourdieu: Key concepts*. Taylor & Francis Group.
- Denscombe, M. 2010. *The Good Research Guide: For Small-scale Social Research Projects*. Maidenhead: Open University Press
- Denscombe, M. 2014. *Good research guide: For small-scale social research projects* (5<sup>th</sup> ed). McGraw-Hill Education
- Denscombe, M. 2008. *Good research guide: For small-scale social research projects* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed). McGraw-Hill Education
- DeNora, T. 2004. *Music in Everyday Life*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press
- DeWalt, K. M., & DeWalt, B. R. 2010. "Designing Research with Participant Observation" in *Participant observation: A guide for fieldworkers*. AltaMira Press.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. 2003. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. 2005. *Handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Draper, A, S. 2012. *Salvation Army Solo Repertoire for Euphonium and Piano: A Recording and Annotated Bibliography* [Doctor of Musical Arts Dissertation, Arizona State University]
- Dueck, J. 2017. *Congregational Music, Conflict and Community*. United States: Routledge
- Dykema, P, W. 1916. "The Spread of the Community Music Idea" in *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 67. Pp 218 – 223.
- Edge, L., & G, Morgan. 2017. *Partnering with God: Being a Missional Salvationist*. Australia: Wipf & Stock Publishers.
- Elder, C. 2007. 'Introduction' and 'The Cultural Nation: Art, cinema, and music' in *Being Australian*. Australia: Allan & Unwin.
- Endress, M. 2014. "Structures of Belonging, Types of Social Capital, and Modes of Trust" in *Social Capital, Social Identity: From ownership to belonging*. Germany: De Gruyter.
- England, A. nd. *Playing the Timbrel*. Melbourne, Australia: The Salvation Army Press.
- Eraut, M. 2000. "Non-formal learning and tacit knowledge in professional work" in *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 70. Pp: 113 – 136.
- Escott, P. 1996. *Church Growth Theories and The Salvation Army in the United Kingdom: An examination of the theories of Donald McGavran and C Peter Wagner in relation to Salvation Army experience and practice (1982 – 1991)* [Doctoral Dissertation: University of Sterling].

- Evans, M. 2006. *Open up the Doors: Music in the Modern Church. Studies in Popular Music*. London: Equinox.
- Finnegan, R. 1989. *The Hidden Musicians: music-making in an English town*. Cambridge University Press.
- Flethcher, D. 2020. “Not just a girls’ sport” in *Identity, Belonging, and Community in Men’s Roller Derby*. United States: Routledge.
- Flick, U. 2007. “What Is Qualitative Research?” in *Designing Qualitative Research*. London: SAGE Publications, Ltd, p 2 – 15.
- Freuchte, K. 2011. “Social Capital: The Glute That Holds a Community Together” in *Extension Extra*. United States: South Dakota State University
- Frith, S. 1996. “Music and Identity” in *Questions of cultural identity, edited by Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay*. London; Thousand Oaks, Calif. pp: 108-127.
- Fuchs, C. 2003. “Some Implications of Pierre Bourdieu’s Works for a Theory of Social Self-Organization” in *European Journal of Social Theory*, 6(4). Pp: 387– 408.
- Ganiel, G., & Mitchell, C. 2006. “Turning the Categories Inside-Out: Complex Identifications and Multiple Interactions in Religious Ethnography” in *Sociology of Religion*, 67(1). Pp: 3 – 21.
- Garrido, S., & J, W, Davidson. 2019. *Music, Nostalgia and Memory Historical and Psychological Perspectives*. Springer Nature Switzerland AG.
- Given, L, M. 2012. “Semi-structured Interview” in *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Gott, F. 1993. “What’s wrong with...excellence?” in *The Musician*, 46(6), p 6.
- Grainger, P. 1906. “Percy Grainger Collection” in *British Library*. Online: <https://www.bl.uk/collections/percy-grainger-collection>
- Grey, T. 2011. Are You on of Us? An Exploration of Discursive Identity Formation in The Salvation Army. [Doctoral Dissertation, The University of Technology Sydney]
- Guest, G., Namey, E, E., & Mitchell, M, L. 2017. “Participant Observation In: Collecting Qualitative Data: A Field Manual for Applied Research” in *Sage Research Methods*. SAGE Publications, Ltd
- Guy, D. 1994. “Worship or sanctified vaudeville?” in *The Musician*, 47(25), p 1.
- Hamilton, M, S. 1999. “The Triumph of Praise Songs: how guitars beat out the organ in the worship wars” in *Christianity Today*, July 12, 29 – 35.
- Hattersley, R. 1999. *Blood & Fire: William and Catherine Booth and Their Salvation Army*. United Kingdom: Time Warner Books.

- Herbert, T. 1991. *Bands: the brass band movement of the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries*. United Kingdom: Open University Press
- Herbert, T. 2000. ‘God’s Perfect Minstrels: The Bands of the Salvation Army’ In *The British Brass Band*. United States: Oxford University Press, pp: 187 – 216.
- Higgins, L. 2012. *Community Music: In Theory and Practice*. Oxford Scholarship Online: September 2012.
- Hill, H. 2006. *Leadership in The Salvation Army: A case study in Clericalisation*. Wipf & Stock Publishers.
- Hill, H. 2016. “Four Anchors from the Stern” in *Journal of Aggressive Christianity*, 101(Feb-March), 40 – 50.
- Hillsong United. 2013. “Oceans” on *Zion*, Hillsong.
- Hillsong Worship. 1994. “Shout to the Lord” on *People just like us*, Hillsong.
- Hillsong Worship. 2001. “Worthy is the Lamb” on *You are my world*, Hillsong.
- Hillsong Worship. 2013. “Where the spirit of the Lord is” on *Glorious Ruins*, Hillsong.
- Hillsong Worship. 2016. “What a beautiful name it is” on *Let there be light*, Hillsong.
- Hirabayashi, E. 2009. “Identity, roles and practice in ritual music” in *International Journal of Community Music*, 1(2), 39 – 55.
- Holz, R, W. 1981. *A History of the hymn tune, meditation and related forms in Salvation Army Instrumental Music in Great Britain and North America, 1880 – 1980. (Parts I and II)*. [Doctor of Philosophy Dissertation, The University of Connecticut]
- Holz, R, W. 2006. *Brass Bands of the Salvation Army: Their Mission and Music Volume One*. Streets Publishers
- Holz, R, W. 2007. *Brass Bands of the Salvation Army: Their Mission and Music Volume Two*. Streets Publishers
- Holz, R, W. 2007. *The Proclaimers: A History of the New York Staff Band*. Salvation Army
- Hooper, A. 1995. “Contact” in *The Musician*, April 8, p 6.
- Hoover, S, M. 2002. “Introduction: The Cultural Construction of Religion in the Media Age” in *Practicing Religion in the Age of the Media: Explorations in Media, Religion, and Culture*. Columbia University Press
- Houghton, C., Murphy, K., Meehan, B., Thomas, J., Brooker, D., & Casey, D. 2016. “From screening to synthesis: using NVIVO to enhance transparency in qualitative evidence synthesis” in *Journal of Clinical Nursing*. John Wiley & Sons Ltd, p 873 – 881.

- Ingalls, M. 2008. *Awesome in this place: sound, space, and identity in contemporary North American evangelical worship* [Doctorial Dissertation: University of Pennsylvania].
- Ingalls, M. 2018. *Singing the Congregation: How Contemporary Worship Music Forms Evangelical Community*. Oxford University Press.
- Joncas, M. 1977. “On Eagles Wings” on *On Eagles Wings*, OCP.
- Jones, E, J. 1899. “Power in the Blood” in Public Domain.
- Kanuha, V, K. 2000. "Being' Native versus 'Going Native" in *Social Work*, 45(5), p 439 – 447.
- Lemmel, H, H. 1922. “Turn your eyes upon Jesus” in Public Domain.
- Lingard, J. 1999. *A Discussion of Norman Bearcroft's 'Song of Exultation' as an Example of The Salvation Army 'Selection'* [Honours Dissertation, University of Tasmania]
- Markham, A, N. 2013. “Fieldwork in Social Media: What Would Malinowski Do?” in *Qualitative Communication Research*, 2(4). The Regents of the University of California, p 434 – 446.
- Maton, K. 2014. “Habitus” in *Pierre Bourdieu: Key concepts*. Taylor & Francis Group.
- McFerran, K, S., and Higgins, J. 2019. “The role of leadership and facilitation n fostering connectedness and development through participation in the Just Brass music programme” in *Approaches: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Music Therapy*. www.approaches.gr
- Mercer, J. 2007. “The challenges of insider research in educational institutions: wielding a double-edged sword and resolving delicate dilemmas”, in *Oxford Review of Education*, 33(1), p 1 – 17.
- Merton, R. 1972, “Insiders and outsiders; a chapter in the sociology of knowledge” in *American Journal of Sociology*, 78, p 9 – 47.
- Metrustery, D. 2016. *Saved Sanctified and Serving: Perspectives on Salvation Army Theology and Practice*. United Kingdom: Authentic Media Limited.
- Mills, A, J., & Durepos, G., & Wiebe, E. 2012. “Field Notes” in *Encyclopedia of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Montgomery, J. 1824. “Stand up and bless the Lord” in Public Domain.
- Moore, R. 2014. “Capital” in *Pierre Bourdieu: Key concepts*. Taylor & Francis Group.
- Morris, A. 2018. *A Practical Introduction to In-Depth Interviewing*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd
- Morris, J. 2017. “So much more than Just Brass” in *Others*, 2(1). P 14 – 17.
- Moyle, R. 1993. “And Miriam took a timbrel” in *The Musician*, March 27, p 3.

Muratore, R., & J, Willis. 2015. "Building Salvation: The Architecture of the Salvation Army in Australia" in *Fabrications: The Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians, Australia and New Zealand*, 25(1), p 62 – 83.

Murdoch, N, H. 1994. *Origins of the Salvation Army*. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press

Nash, J, E. 2012. "Ringing the Chord: Sentimentality and Nostalgia among Male Singers" in *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 41(5), 581 – 606.

Navarro, Z. 2006. "In Search of a Cultural Interpretation of Power: The contribution of Pierre Bourdeau" in *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin*, 37(6). Pp: 11- 22.

Nekola, A. 2013. "'More than just a music': conservative Christian anti-rock discourse and the U.S. culture wars" in *Popular Music*, 32(3), 407– 426.

Nekola, A. 2021. "Mediating religious experience? congregational music and the digital music interface" in *Studying Congregational Music: Key Issues, Methods, and Theoretical Perspectives*. United Kingdom, London: Routledge.

Nekola, A., and Wagner, T. 2016. "Introduction: Worship Media as Media Form and Mediated Practice: Theorizing the Intersections of Media, Music and Lived Religion" in *Congregational Music-Making and Community in a Mediated Age*. United States: Routledge.

New International Version. 2022. "Exodus 15:20" in *Bible Gateway*.  
<https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=Exodus%2015-20&version=NIV>

Nieuwhof, C. 2023. "5 Reasons Why Engagement is the New Church Attendance" in *CareyNieuwhof.com*. <https://careynieuwhof.com/5-reasons-why-engagement-is-the-new-church-attendance/>

O'Reilly, K. 2012. "Reflexivity" in *Key Concepts in Ethnography*. London: SAGE Publications, Ltd.

Oxenham, J. 2015. "777: 'Mid all the traffic of the ways" in *The Songbook of The Salvation Army*. The Salvation Army. United Kingdom: London

Pearce, E., Launay, J., Van Duijn, M., Rotkirch, A., David-Barrett, T., and Dunbar, R, I, M. 2016. "Singing together or apart: The effect of competitive and cooperative singing on social bonding within and between sub-groups of a university Fraternity" in *Psychology of Music*, 44(6). P 1255 – 1273.

Percey, M. 2012. *The Ecclesial Canopy: Faith, Hope, Charity* (1st ed.). Routledge.

Possamai, A., & D, Tittensor. 2022. *Religion and Change in Australia*. Routledge

Rapley, T. 2011. "Interviews" in *Qualitative Research Practice*. London: SAGE Publications, Ltd.

- Redman, M., and Angrisano, S. 2013. “10 000 Reasons (Bless the Lord)” on *Spirit & Song: Disc M*, spiritandsong.com.
- Rice, T. 2014. *Ethnomusicology: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford University Press
- Riches, T., & T, Wagner. 2012. “The evolution of Hillsong music: From Australian pentecostal congregation into global brand” in *Australian Journal of Communication*, 39(1), p 17 – 36.
- Robinson, R. 1758. “Come thou Fount” in Public Domain.
- Rohwer, M., and Rohwer, D. 2012. “How Participants Envision Community Music in Welsh Men’s Choirs” in *Research and Issues in Music Education*, 10(1).
- Rose, J. 2001. “Cultural literacy in the classic slum” in *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes*. Yale University Press.
- Rowden, M, L, J. 1996. *A History of The Salvation Army Chicago Brass Band, 1954 – 1994*. [Doctor of Education in Music Education, University of Illinois]
- Russel, D. 1987. “Music and social change” in *Popular Music in England, 1840-1914 : A Social History*. McGill-Queen's University Press
- Ruth, L. 2017. “The Eruption of Worship Wars: The Coming of Conflict” in *Liturgy*, 32(1), 3 – 6.
- Ruth, L., and Lim, S, H. 2017. *Lovin’ on Jesus: A Concise History of Contemporary Worship*. Nashville: Abingdon.
- Sandall, R. 1947. *The History of the Salvation Army Volume One 1865 - 1878*. United Kingdom: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd.
- Sandall, R. 1950. *The History of the Salvation Army Volume Two 1878 – 1886*. United Kingdom: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd.
- Schafer, M. 1977. “Noise in the city” in *The Soundscape: Our Sonic Environment and the Tuning of the World*. United States: Alfred Knopf, Inc.
- Schippers, H. 2018. “Community Music Contexts, Dynamics, and Sustainability” in *The Oxford Handbook of Community Music*. Oxford University Press: Oxford Handbooks Online, www.oxfordhandbooks.com
- Sharman, P. 2015. *The Synergy Between Salvation Army Music and Film Music* [Master of Philosophy Dissertation, University of Salford]
- Simpson, S. 2018. “Marching As One” in *Others Magazine*, 12(2), 16 – 19.
- Small, C. 1998. *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening*. Published: Hanover and London: Wesleyan University Press.



- Smith, M, W. 2001. "Forever" on *Worship*, Reunion Records.
- Simpson, S. 2018. "Marching as One" in *Others: connecting Salvoes in mission*. 12(2). Pp 17 – 19.
- Souto-Otero, M. 2021. "Validation of non-formal and informal learning in formal education: Covert and overt" in *European Journal of Education*, 56, 365 – 379.
- Stanfield, N. 2007. "The Tambourine and the Salvation Army: Rebellion in the Service of Authority" in *Canadian Folk Music*, Winter 2007/2008, 41 (4), 7 – 19.
- Steadmen-Allen, R. 1965 – 1966. *The Evolution of Salvation Army Music*, The Musician.
- Steadman-Allen, R. 2001. "Salvation Army, music of the" in *Grove Music Online*.  
<https://doi-org.ezproxy.library.sydney.edu.au/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.46764>
- Steinmetz, G. 2011. "Bourdieu, Historicity, and Historical Sociology" in *Cultural Sociology*, 5(1), 45 – 66.
- Steuernagel, S, M. 2021. *Church Music Through the Lens of Performance*. United States: Routledge.
- Stowe, D, W. 2013. *No Sympathy for the Devil: Christian Pop Music and the Transformation of American Evangelicalism*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Suter, W. N. (2012). "Qualitative data, analysis, and design" in *Introduction to Educational Research: A Critical Thinking Approach*. London: SAGE Publications, Inc., p 342 – 386.
- Sutton, D, L. 2010. *Preparing Instrumental Teachers: A resource for volunteer, lay music teachers in Salvation Army churches* [Master of Arts in Music Education Dissertation, California State University]
- Swanson, B, C. 2012. "General John Gowans" in *The Salvation Army International*.  
<https://www.salvationarmy.org/ihq/news/inr081212>.
- Taiz, L. 2001. *Hallelujah Lads and Lasses: Remaking the Salvation Army in America, 1880-1930*. United States: The University of North Carolina Press
- Taylor, D. 2011. *English Brass Bands and Their Music, 1860-1930*. United Kingdom: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Tedlock, B. 1991. "From Participant Observation to the Observation of Participation: The Emergence of Narrative Ethnography" in *Journal of Anthropological Research*, 47(1), p 69 – 94.
- Tenzek, K, E. 2018. "Field Notes" in *Sage Research Methods*. SAGE Publications, Ltd
- The General of The Salvation Army. 2015. *The Salvation Army Tune Book Volume 1, Nos. 1 – 530*. United Kingdom: CPI Group (UK) Ltd.

The Salvation Army. 1980. "Collaroy music camp is twenty-one" in *The Musician*, 33(19), 1 – 2.

The Salvation Army. 1982. "Senior music camp at Collaroy" in *The Musician*, 45(20), 2.

The Salvation Army. 2022a. "Our services" in *The Salvation Army Australia*.  
<https://www.salvationarmy.org.au/about-us/our-services/>.

The Salvation Army. 2022b. "How did the Red Shield Appeal start?" in *The Salvation Army Australia*. <https://www.salvationarmy.org.au/about-us/our-story/our-history/how-did-the-rsa-start/>.

The Salvation Army International. 2017. *The Salvation Army Year Book 2018*. England: London.

The Salvation Army International. 2019. *The Salvation Army Year Book 2020*. England: London.

The Salvation Army International. 2023. "The Salvation Army Year Book" in *The Salvation Army International*. Online: <https://www.salvationarmy.org/ihq/yearbook>

The Salvation Army International. 2023. "Glossary of Terms" in *The Salvation Army International*. Online:  
<https://www.salvationarmy.org/ihq/2E8B895B1BBA4A0680256D4F00416D6B>

The Salvation Army International Headquarters. 2000. *Regulations and Guidelines for Musicians*. London

The Salvation Army International Headquarters. 2020. *The Salvation Army Yearbook 2021*. United Kingdom: Salvation Books.

The Salvation Army Territorial Headquarters. 2018. "Wake up call" in *Living Our Vision*. Australia.

The Salvation Army Western Territory. 2021. "The Best 18 Quotes from William Booth" in *Caring Magazine*. <https://caringmagazine.org/the-best-18-quotes-from-william-booth/>.

Thomson, P. 2014. "Field" in *Pierre Bourdieu: Key concepts*. Taylor & Francis Group

Thornton, D. 2020. "A match made in heaven: why popular music is central to the growth in Pentecostal Charismatic Christianities" In *Australian Pentecostal and charismatic movements*. Leiden: Brill

Tomlin, C. 2001. "His love endures forever" on *The noise we make*, Six Steps Records.

Tomlin, C. 2004. "How great is our God" in *Arriving*, Six Steps Records.

Tomlin, C. 2016. "Good Good Father" on *Never Lose Sight*, Six Steps Records.

Transmission. 2009. "Soldier's Hymn" on *The World for God*, Transmission Records.

- Turner, V. 1967 [2017]. *The Ritual Process: structure and anti-structure*. United States: Routledge.
- Tynan, J., & L, Godson. 2019. "Understanding Uniform: An Introduction" in *Uniform: Clothing and Discipline in the Modern World*. London: Bloomsbury Visual Arts, p 1 – 22.
- USC Libraries. 2022. "Organizing Your Social Sciences Research Paper" in *Organising Your Social Sciences Research Paper: Qualitative Methods*. The University of California. <https://libguides.usc.edu/writingguide/qualitative>
- Veblen, K, K. 2013. "The Tapestry: Introducing Community Music" in *Community Music Today*. R&L Education.
- Varvarigou, M., Creech, A., Hallam, S., and McQueen, H. 2011. "Bringing different generations together in music-making: An Intergenerational Music Project in East London" in *International Journal of Community Music*, 4(3). P: 207 – 220.
- Walker, P, J. 2001. *Pulling the Devil's Kingdom Down: The Salvation Army in Victorian Britain*. University of California Press
- Wacquant, L. 2005. "Habitus" in *International encyclopedia of economic sociology*. Taylor & Francis Group.
- Wacquant, L. 2016. "A concise genealogy and anatomy of habitus" in *The Sociological Review*, 64. Pp: 64 –72
- Wacquant, L. 2018. "Four transversal principles for putting Bourdieu to work" in *Anthropological Theory*, 18(1). Pp: 3 – 17
- Wall, W, B. 1913. "Shenandoah" in *Ships, Sea Songd and Shanties*. Glasgow: James Brown & Son, Publishers
- Webb, J. 1993. "Let's talk...to Joy" in *The Musician*, October 23, p 4 – 5.
- Webber, R, E. 1996. *Blended Worship: Achieving Substance And Relevance In Worship*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers
- Wells, J, C. 2020. "The Affect if Old Places: Exploring the Dimensions of Place Attachment and Senescent Environments" in *Place Meaning and Attachment*. United States: New York Routledge
- Wesley, C. 1739. "O for a thousand tongues" in Public Domain.
- Winston, D. 1999. *Red-hot and Righteous: The Urban Religion of The Salvation Army*. Harvard University Press
- Whitaker, M, E., & Atkinson, P. 2019. "Reflexivity" in *SAGE Research Methods Foundations*. London: SAGE Publications, Ltd.
- Wickham, P. 2013. "This is Amazing Grace" on *The Ascension*, Fair Trade/Columbia

Williams, A. M. 1895. "American Sea Songs" in *Studies in Folk-Song and Popular Poetry*. London: Elliot Stock, 62, Paternoster Row, E,C.

Wilson, J. L. 2005. *Nostalgia, Sanctuary of Meaning*. The United States of America: Lewisburg Bucknell University Press.

Winston, D. 1999. *Red-hot and Righteous: The Urban Religion of The Salvation Army*. Harvard University Press

Woods, C. "Bandmaster Speaks Out" in *The Musician*, 46(6), p 1 & 8.

## Appendix I: Participant Information Statement Example



Sydney Conservatorium of Music  
Discipline of Ethnomusicology  
Arts Music Unit

ABN 15 211 513 464

---

**Associate Prof Charles Fairchild**  
*Chief Investigator*

Room S442  
Seymour Centre J09  
The University of Sydney  
NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA  
Telephone: +61 2 9351 2923  
Facsimile: +61 2 9351 7340  
Email: [artsmusic.info@sydney.edu.au](mailto:artsmusic.info@sydney.edu.au)  
Web: <http://www.sydney.edu.au/>

**STUDY NAME:**  
MUSIC MAKING IN THE SALVATION ARMY

### **PARTICIPANT INFORMATION STATEMENT**

#### 1) What is this study about?

You are invited to take part in a research study **exploring how and why music is made in The Salvation Army Australia, today.**

You have been invited to participate in this study **because you participate in music-making activities in the Salvation Army, Australia.** This Participant Information Statement tells you about the research study. Knowing what is involved will help you decide if you want to take part in the research. Please read this sheet carefully and ask questions about anything that you don't understand or want to know more about.

#### **Participation in this research study is voluntary.**

By giving consent to take part in this study you are telling us that you:

- ✓ Understand what you have read.
- ✓ Agree to take part in the research study as outlined below.
- ✓ Agree to the use of your personal information as described.

You will be given a copy of this Participant Information Statement to keep.

#### 2) Who is running the study?

This study is being conducted by an internal investigator, Victoria Parsons (PhD Student) and will be the basis for the Doctor of Philosophy in Ethnomusicology at The University of Sydney under the supervision of Dr Charles Fairchild (Chief Investigator).

**3) What will the study involve for me?**

This study will involve participating in an interview about your involvement with Salvation Army music-making. These interviews will not necessarily follow a set structure and will be open to discussion on matters you consider to be pertinent to the topic. For the ease of conversation, your interview will be recorded and transcribed by Victoria Parsons. If you would like to review a copy of your transcript after your interview, please indicate by doing so on the Participant Consent Form and provide an email address for future correspondence.

This study will also involve the documentation of rehearsals, worship meetings, and music programs by taking photos, and video/audio recordings. This form of documentation will help to build a more in-depth, accurate picture of current Salvation Army music making in Australia today.

**4) How much of my time will the study take?**

The study will involve a minimum of one interview for the duration of one hour, however you may participate in as many discussions as you feel comfortable to partake in. If you are comfortable carrying on longer interviews, this can be arranged.

**5) Do I have to be in the study? Can I withdraw from the study once I've started?**

Being in this study is completely voluntary and you do not have to take part. Your decision whether to participate will not affect your current or future relationship with the researchers or anyone else at the University of Sydney.

If you decide to take part in the study and then change your mind later, you are free to withdraw at any time. You can do this by simply informing the researcher that you will no longer be involved.

**6) Are there any risks or costs associated with being in the study?**

Aside from giving up your time, we do not expect that there will be any risks or costs associated with taking part in this study.

**7) Are there any benefits associated with being in the study?**

We cannot guarantee that you will receive any direct benefits from being in the study.

**8) What will happen to information about me that is collected during the study?**

By providing your consent, you are agreeing to us collecting personal information about you for the purposes of this research study. This information will only be used for the purposes outlined in this Participant Information Statement, unless you consent otherwise.

Your information will be stored securely and your identity/information will be kept strictly confidential, except as required by law. Study findings may be published, but you will not be individually identifiable in these publications.

**9) Can I tell other people about the study?**

Yes, you are welcome to tell other people about the study.

**10) What if I would like further information about the study?**

When you have read this information, Victoria Parsons will be available to discuss it with you further and answer any questions you may have. If you would like to know more at any stage during the study, please feel free to contact Dr Charles Fairchild, Arts Music, University of Sydney. Dr Fairchild's details are at the top of this document.

**11) Will I be told the results of the study?**

You have a right to receive feedback about the overall results of this study. You can tell us that you wish to receive feedback by consenting to this on the consent form. This feedback will be in the form of a general description of the results of the study. You will receive this feedback after the study is finished.

**12) What if I have a complaint or any concerns about the study?**

Research involving humans in Australia is reviewed by an independent group of people called a Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC). The ethical aspects of this study have been approved by the HREC of the University of Sydney, No. 2017/379. As part of this process, we have agreed to carry out the study according to the *National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Human Research (2007)*. This statement has been developed to protect people who agree to take part in research studies.

If you are concerned about the way this study is being conducted or you wish to make a complaint to someone independent from the study, please contact the university using the details outlined below. Please quote the study title and protocol number.

The Manager, Ethics Administration, University of Sydney:

- Telephone: +61 2 8627 8176
- Email: [human.ethics@sydney.edu.au](mailto:human.ethics@sydney.edu.au)
- Fax: +61 2 8627 8177 (Facsimile)

**This information sheet is for you to keep**

## Appendix II: Participant Consent Form Example



Sydney Conservatorium of Music  
Discipline of Ethnomusicology  
Arts Music Unit

ABN 15 211 513 464

**Assoc Prof Charles Fairchild**  
*Chief Investigator*

Room S442  
Seymour Centre J09  
The University of Sydney  
NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA  
Telephone: +61 2 9351 2923  
Facsimile: +61 2 9351 7340  
Email: [artsmusic.info@sydney.edu.au](mailto:artsmusic.info@sydney.edu.au)  
Web: <http://www.sydney.edu.au/>

### Music Making in The Salvation Army

#### PERMISSION TO CONDUCT RESEARCH

I, .....[PRINT NAME], agree to give Victoria Parsons (PhD Student Researcher) permission to approach local Salvation Army corps and music groups to participate in her ethnographic study on the grounds of The Salvation Army, and to conduct research during territorial events within the research period: July 2017 to December 2019.

In giving my consent I state that:

- ✓ I understand the purpose of the study, what participants will be asked to do, and any risks/benefits involved.
- ✓ I have read the Participant Information Statement and have been able to discuss the involvement of the participants in the study.
- ✓ The researchers have answered any questions that I have had about the study and I am happy with the answers.
- ✓ I understand that being in this study is completely voluntary and that each participant does not have to take part. The participant's decision whether to be in the study will not affect their relationship with the researchers or anyone else at the University of Sydney or The Salvation Army now or in the future.
- ✓ I understand that each participant can withdraw from the study at any time.
- ✓ I understand that the participant may stop the interview at any time if they do not wish to continue, and that unless they indicate otherwise any recordings will then be erased and the information provided will not be included in the study. I also understand that each participant may refuse to answer any questions they do not wish to answer.
- ✓ I understand that the personal information about each participant collected over the course of this project will be stored securely and will only be used for purposes that they have agreed



to. I understand that information about the participants will only be told to others with their permission, except as required by law.

- ✓ I understand that the results of this study may be published, and that these publications will not contain the participant's name or any identifiable information about them.

I consent to:

- |                                                 |     |                          |    |                          |
|-------------------------------------------------|-----|--------------------------|----|--------------------------|
| • <b>Audio-recording</b>                        | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • <b>Video-recording</b>                        | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • <b>Photographs</b>                            | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • <b>Permanent archiving of study materials</b> | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • <b>Being contacted about future studies</b>   | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| • <b>Reviewing transcripts</b>                  | YES | <input type="checkbox"/> | NO | <input type="checkbox"/> |

.....  
**Signature**

.....  
**PRINT name**

.....  
**Date**

## Appendix III: Semi-structured Interview Questions and Questionnaire Examples

N.B: The questions for semi-structured interviews were based off the same questions of the questionnaire.



Sydney Conservatorium of Music  
Discipline of Ethnomusicology  
Arts Music Unit

---

**Victoria Parsons**

*PhD Candidate*

**T:** 0408 693 575

**M:** vpar7097@uni.sydney.edu.au

Hi “Participant”

Thanks so much for your interest and participation in my research. Here are a few questions and themes I’d love your comments on.

Some of them are quick to answer and others will be a little longer (and quite fun!) I’m very interested in your ideas about the past, present, and future of making music in The Salvation Army. I’m also really interested in your experiences as a Salvation Army musician and how you choose to engage with Salvation Army music-making within the community.

I have tried to categorise the questions as best as possible to try and keep it straight forward.

### **Questions and themes**

*A little bit about you...*

What kind of music-making activities are you involved with in The Salvation Army (TSA)?

How did you come to TSA and when/how did you get involved with music in TSA?

How old are you? And, do you feel like your age group is well represented in TSA?

Does gender influence the roles and opportunities of musicians within TSA?

*Just Brass and Community Music-making...*

What is the 'Just Brass' programme?

How did you become involved with this programme and what is your role?

What does this programme provide for the community?

How does *Just Brass* include members of the local corps?

*Salvation Army music yesterday, today, and tomorrow...*

What are your thoughts on Salvation Army music today and the state that we currently find it?

What is it about Army music (it's sound in particular) that makes it "Salvo"?

When you hear a Salvation Army Band do you feel different? Why/Why not?

Where do you think Salvation Army music is going and if you could change something, what would it be?

*Other thoughts...*

Please feel free to add thoughts, ideas, stories, facts (etc.) about Salvation Army music-making that you think may be important, interesting, meaningful, or fun here: