Journal Pre-proof

Assessment of microbial risk during Australian industrial practices for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh cut-cos lettuce: A stochastic quantitative approach

Hayriye Bozkurt, Tina Bell, Floris van Ogtrop, Kim-Yen Phan-Thien, Robyn **McConchie**

PII: S0740-0020(20)30280-X

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2020.103691>

Reference: YFMIC 103691

To appear in: Food Microbiology

Received Date: 14 May 2020

Revised Date: 20 November 2020

Accepted Date: 23 November 2020

Please cite this article as: Bozkurt, H., Bell, T., van Ogtrop, F., Phan-Thien, K.-Y., McConchie, R., Assessment of microbial risk during Australian industrial practices for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh cut-cos lettuce: A stochastic quantitative approach, *Food Microbiology* (2020), doi: [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2020.103691) doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2020.103691.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2020 Published by Elsevier Ltd.

Assessment of microbial risk during Australian industrial practices for *Escherichia coli* **O157:H7 in fresh cut-cos lettuce: A stochastic quantitative approach**

Hayriye Bozkurt* , Tina Bell, Floris van Ogtrop, Kim-Yen Phan-Thien, Robyn McConchie

ARC Industrial Transformation Training Centre for Food Safety in the Fresh Produce Industry,

Sydney Institute of Agriculture, Faculty of Science, The University of Sydney, NSW 2006, Transformation Training Cente for Food Safety in the Trest
te of Agriculture, Faculty of Science, The University of Syc
Australia
greens; season; irrigation water; irrigation type; manure ame

Australia

Keywords: leafy greens; season; irrigation water; irrigation type; manure amended soil; QMRA.

Declaration of Interest

None

*Corresponding author: Hayriye Bozkurt, Tel:+61 2 8627 1187 E-mail:

hayriye.bozkurt@sydney.edu.au

Abstract

Escherichia coli O157:H7 risk associated with the consumption of fresh cut- cos lettuce during Australian industrial practices was assessed. A probabilistic risk assessment model was developed and implemented in the @Risk software by using the Monte Carlo simulation technique with 1,000,000 iterations. Australian preharvest practices yielded predicted annual

mean *E. coli* O157:H7 levels from 0.2 to -3.4 log CFU/g and prevalence values ranged from 2 to 6.4%. While exclusion of solar radiation from the baseline model yielded a significant increase in concentration of *E. coli* O157:H7 (-5.2 -log fold), drip irrigation usage, exclusion of manure amended soil and rainfall reduced *E. coli* O157:H7 levels by 7.4, 6.5, and 4.3-log fold, respectively. The microbial quality of irrigation water and irrigation type both had a significant effect on *E. coli* O157:H7 concentrations at harvest ($p<0.05$). The probability of illness due to consumption of *E. coli* O157:H7 contaminated fresh cut- cos lettuce when water washing interventions were introduced into the processing module, was reduced by 1.4-2.7-log fold (p<0.05). This study provides a robust basis for assessment of risk associated with *E. coli* O157:H7 contamination on fresh cut-cos lettuce for industrial practices and will assist the leafy green industry and food safety authorities in Australia to identify potential risk management strategies. λ coli O157:H7 concentrations at nativest ($p \le 0.05$). The probability λ coli O157:H7 contaminated fresh cut-cos lettuce when was eintroduced into the processing module, was reduced by 1.4 and provides a robust bas

1. Introduction

Changes in consumers' behaviors and attitudes towards healthy diets over the last two decades have resulted in increased consumption of fresh produce (Rekhy and McConchie, 2014). Concomitantly, increased number of foodborne outbreaks linked to consumption of fresh produce have also been reported. Fresh produce is often eaten raw, receiving no or minimal processing, resulting in significant potential for pathogenic contamination across the value chain and thus, illness upon consumption. According to peer-reviewed literature collated from 1980 to 2016, fresh produce was involved in 571 outbreaks, which resulted in 72,855 cases of illness around the world (Machado-Moreira et al., 2019). While most of these outbreaks and cases of illness were recorded in North America and Europe (Machado-Moreira et al., 2019), the proportion of produce-linked outbreaks and cases of illness in Australia were less than 5% and

11%, respectively (Li et al., 2018). The most common type of fresh produce implicated in these outbreaks was leafy greens, which accounted for more than 50% of reported outbreaks (Machado-Moreira et al., 2019). A risk assessment conducted by the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations, ranked leafy greens as the highest priority in terms of the safety of fresh fruit and vegetables (WHO, 2008).

The etiological agents identified in outbreaks linked to leafy greens ranged from bacteria (*Escherichia coli, Salmonella* spp., *Shigella* spp., *Staphylococcus* spp., *Bacillus* spp*., Clostridium* spp.) to viruses (hepatitis A virus, human norovirus) and protozoa (*Cyclospora* spp., *Cryptosporidium* spp.) (Herman et al., 2015). *E. coli* O157:H7 was the most commonly implicated contaminant, while cos lettuce was the most commonly implicated vehicle (Turner et al., 2019). Frequent involvement of *E. coli* O157:H7 in outbreaks linked with leafy greens makes this pathogen-commodity combination the highest risk concern for government agencies, industries, and the public in terms of produce safety (Anderson et al., 2011). Salmonella spp., Shigella spp., Staphylococcus spp., Bacilla
epatitis A virus, human norovirus) and protozoa (Cyclospor
spp.) (Herman et al., 2015). E. coli O157:H7 was the most connonly implicated
minant, while cos lettuc

Australia has had a moderate rate of reported outbreaks and recalls related to leafy greens compared to the European Union and the United States (Li et al., 2018), and a very low prevalence of pathogenic bacteria in leafy greens (NSW/FA, 2007). However, cognizance of fresh produce-linked outbreaks in other nations, not only highlighted the existing potential for foodborne pathogens to be present on leafy greens in Australian production conditions, but also the urgent need for a rigorous risk assessment (Forum, 2018). To this end, Australian government officials have adopted a pro-active approach, and requested Food Standards Australia New Zealand (FSANZ) to identify appropriate regulatory and non-regulatory measures for Australia to manage food safety risks in leafy greens (Forum, 2018)*.*

3

To minimize the risk associated with microbial hazards of leafy greens, effective food safety intervention strategies need to be implemented throughout production, processing, distribution and storage (Gil et al*.,* 2015). As with other fresh produce, foodborne pathogen contamination of lettuce can occur anywhere along the supply chain. It is known that warmblooded animals such as cattle are a natural reservoir for *E. coli* O157:H7 (Berry and Wells, 2010), and the use of cattle manure as a soil amendment could induce migration of *E. coli* O157:H7 not only into fresh produce but also into water supplies through soil (Russell and Jarvis, 2001). Even though Australian cattle manure has a very low prevalence of *E. coli* O157:H7 (1.7%) (Barlow and Mellor, 2010) compare to those of Florida (9%),an intense agricultural production region in the United States (Baker et al., 2019), it poses a significant health risk to consumers when used as a soil amendment in the production of leafy greens. While contaminated irrigation water and manure-amended soil are the main sources of preharvest contamination (Gil et al., 2015), interactions between produce and infected food handlers, contaminated surfaces or water, and imperfect postharvest conditions (i.e., retail and home storage temperature), are critical factors in postharvest contamination (Pang et al., 2017). Therefore, appropriate risk management strategies rely upon the proper understanding of each of these factors. y into fresh produce but also into water supplies through soi
en though Australian cattle manure has a very low prevalence
(Barlow and Mellor, 2010) compare to those of Florida (9%
action region in the United States (Baker

An enhanced understanding of food safety can be achieved through the usage of a risk assessment and risk management approach that comprises hazard identification and produce consumption scenarios in probabilistic modeling known as quantitative microbial risk assessment (QMRA). To address the complexity of food safety issues in the application of QMRA, the World Health Organization (WHO), and the FAO of the United Nations, both have a crucial role in the deliberations of international standard-setting bodies (Dennis et al., 2002). QMRA has

4

been widely applied in leafy greens across the value chain for *E. coli* or *E. coli* O157:H7 in many countries such as Japan (Koseki and Isobe, 2005), Netherlands (Franz et al., 2008), Canada (Ottoson et al., 2011), United States (Danyluk and Schaffner, 2011; Pang et al., 2017), and Spain (Allende et al., 2018; Castro-Ibanez et al., 2015; Franz et al., 2010; Rodriguez et al., 2011; Tromp et al., 2010), India (Kundu et al., 2018). To date, there is no published QMRA model of preharvest and postharvest practices in Australia for *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce. The unique geographical location of Australia offers a wide range of weather conditions and agricultural practices for leafy greens to be grown and harvested all year around. Concomitantly, daily exposure to environmental and climatological factors have been known to induce changes in microbial community structure in the phyllosphere during primary production (Vorholt, 2012). For example, there is greater emission of ultraviolet radiation in the Southern hemisphere than at an equivalent locations in the Northern hemisphere because the former receives 7% more solar radiation intensity and has cleaner air. (Gies, 2003). In a recent meta-analysis, Dao et al*.* (2020) found that environmental conditions have an important effect on the die-off rate of *E. coli* in manure-amended soils. Considering the higher levels of solar radiation and hours of sunlight in Australia than at an equivalent location in Northern hemisphere where the majority of the risk models have been developed, the generation of risk models from local data is essential so that the effects of agricultural and processing practices on the microbial safety of leafy greens can be assessed appropriately. The outputs of this model for lettuce may assist in the design of preventive measures and intervention strategies to reduce microbial risks for the Australian leafy green industry. Thus, the objective of this research was to develop a quantitative microbial contamination model to evaluate the impact of different preharvest practices and conditions (i.e. seasonality, solar radiation, rainfall, manure usage, irrigation water quality, and irrigation type) Solida Vest plactices in Adstralia for *E.* Colo O197.117 lifes provided in Adstralia offers a wide range of weather conditions and pre-proof of Australia offers a wide range of weather conditions are approximated all year

and postharvest practices (washing, retail, postharvest and home storage) on the levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 associated with fresh cut-cos lettuce. The model simulation focused on conditions in Sydney, Australia as a representative example of an intensive agricultural region for leafy greens production in Australia.

2. Material and Methods

2.1. Overview of the model

Exemplar risk models that were developed in the Spain (Allende et al., 2017), and the United States (Pang et al., 2017) were used with modifications in distributions to mirror the Australian industrial leafy green practice to estimate the likelihood of *E. coli* contamination of leafy green. To this end, the QMRA model developed by Allende et al. (2017), was considered as a solid baseline to assess the effects of different agricultural practices and weather conditions on contamination of lettuce by *E. coli* O157:H7 (CFU/g) at preharvest level, whereas the QMRA model generated Pang et al. (2017) was used as a baseline to evaluate postharvest practices for fresh-cut cos lettuce in Australia. The probabilistic model that comprised industrial preharvest and postharvest activities for cos lettuce grown in Australia was built in Excel and executed in @Risk software (V 7.3.1. Palisade Corporation, US). of the model
risk models that were developed in the Spain (Allende et al
ng et al., 2017) were used with modifications in distribution
rial leafy green practice to estimate the likelihood of *E. coli*
is end, the QMRA mod

2.2. Baseline scenario

The baseline model was of cos lettuce planted in an open field in Sydney during summer (December-February) and assumed constant environmental conditions (Table 1). The summer plantation period (number of days between sowing and harvest) was provided by a commercial lettuce producer (Table 1). The average days of rain for each season over the last two decades were obtained from The Australian Bureau of Meteorology database (BOM, 2020). Due to the availability of vast amounts of meteorological data, a PERT distribution (min, most likely, max) was used for rainfall and solar radiation (Table 1). Based on the results from previous studies (Allende et al., 2017), the prevalence of *E. coli* on leafy greens during crop cultivation was assumed to be constant, and contamination through manure-amended soil and irrigation water were assumed to be steady throughout the growing period.

Recorded levels of *E. coli* in irrigation water and manure-amended soil in Australia were included as an input of the model (Table 2). The number of *E. coli* O157:H7 in irrigation water and manure-amended soil was predicted using the estimated ratio of *E. coli* O157:H7 to *E. coli* from Ottoson et al. (2011). Since overhead sprinkler irrigation is the most common irrigation method used by producers in the Australian leafy green industry, it was selected for the baseline scenario of cos lettuce production. Fall and solar radiation (Table 1). Based on the results from [fall and solar radiation (Table 1). Based on the results from [17], the prevalence of *E. coli* on leafy greens during crop constant, and contamination throug

2.3. Risk factors for the preharvest module

In the preharvest module of the QMRA model, the level of *E. coli* O157:H7 was calculated on a daily basis considering the effect of growing time, rainfall, solar radiation, and microbial quality of irrigation water and manure-amended soil during the whole season (Table 1). Daily contamination arising from irrigation or rainwater splashing was calculated from the

occurrence of irrigation or rain. The total load for each consecutive day was calculated by running a loop summing the daily amount of contamination of *E. coli* O157:H7 from manureamended soil, irrigation water, rain, and irrigation water splashing, and harvest tools, and subtracting the number of bacteria inactivated due to daily solar radiation. The output of this part of the model was the daily concentration of *E. coli* O157:H7 associated with cos lettuce during a growing season up to the final day of harvest as described by Allende et al. (2017).

2.3.1. Manure-amended soil

The distribution of the *E. coli* in the manure-amended soil was assessed from 72 samples collected during cultivation in Australia (Table 1) (data not shown). Aseptically collected samples were transported to National Association of Testing Authorities (NATA) accredited laboratory in Sydney within 24 hours and maintained at <10°C. Analysis of samples for *E. coli* followed ISO 16649-2 pour plate method modified by using ChromID medium (bioMerieux, Australia) incubated at 37°C for enumeration with a detection limit of 100 CFU/g. A RANDBETWEEN function between 0 and 1 (or 0 and 100% of the samples) was described and applied to the manure-amended soil data. The usage of a RANDBETWEEN function allowed a random number to be generated for each simulation within given intervals (from 0 to 1). A certain fraction (30/72) was above the detection limit (2.0 log CFU/g). Based on the value generated being above or below (30/72), an IF function was used to determine the concentration of *E. coli* O157:H7 in manure- amended soil (Table 1). In this model, it was assumed that *E. coli* O157:H7 contamination of cos lettuce from manure-amended soil occurred through splashing from rain and irrigation water and from harvest tools (Table 1). Data related to the quantitative transfer of bacteria from manure-amended soil to plant tissue through splashing was not mended soil
mended soil
mended soil
mended soil
thution of the *E. coli* in the manure-amended soil was assessed
tultivation in Australia (Table 1) (data not shown). Aseptica
asported to National Association of Testing Au

available for Australian conditions and was therefore taken from Allende et al. (2017). The probability of rain splashing was assumed to be 100%, indicating that there was always splashing from manure-amended soil during rainfall. Similarly, in the absence of quantitative data describing the transfer rate of *E. coli* O157:H7 from harvest tools to cos lettuce under Australian conditions, data was taken from Yang et al. (2012) (Table 1).

2.3.2. Irrigation water quality and irrigation type

The distribution of the *E. coli* levels in the irrigation water (Table 1) was based on 2062 samples taken in Australia (data not shown). Water samples were tested for indicator bacteria by Australian Standard/New Zealand Standard (AS/NZS) 4276.7 2007 for thermotolerant coliforms and *E. coli* using membrane filtration with a detection limit of 1 CFU/100 mL. A RANDBETWEEN function between 0 and 1 (or 0 and 100% of the samples) was again described and applied to irrigation water data with a detection limit of 1.0 log CFU/ml (Table 1). gation water quality and irrigation type
bution of the *E. coli* levels in the irrigation water (Table 1) v
Australia (data not shown). Water samples were tested for in
and/New Zealand Standard (AS/NZS) 4276.7 2007 for the

In addition, using overhead irrigation as the baseline, the impact of drip and furrow irrigation were also assessed by using data given in Stine et al. (2005) (Table 5).

2.4. Risk factors for postharvest module

2.4.1. Washing

Washing of cos lettuce in Australia typically involves water and a sanitizer such as chlorine, peroxyacetic acid (PAA), or both in combination. The efficacy of water washing, chlorine, and PAA to decontaminate *E. coli* reduction of O157:H7 from cos lettuce leaves was modeled using uniform, normal, and PERT distributions, respectively, based on the experimental data generated in this study (Table 1).

2.4.2. Cross-contamination during processing

Cross-contamination among individual lettuce heads during processing was modeled by using data from Perez-Rodriguez et al. (2011) to calculate the number of *E. coli* O157:H7 transferred during washing. Calculation details are presented in Table 1.

2.4.3. Conditions during storage and transportation

Nine cases containing nine 300 g of ready to eat fresh-cut lettuce were instrumented with a Hygrochron iButtonTM (DS1923; Thermodata[®] Pty. Ltd.) temperature and RH sensor to measure conditions surrounding the produce; a thermistor probe (Tinytag Plus 2 TGP-4020; Hastings Data Loggers Ltd.) to measure produce temperature; and a GPS tracker (SU-6800 Mini; Simply Unified Pty. Ltd.) to track, locate, and measure distance travelled by the produce in realtime. Each instrumented case were placed in three key pallet levels (top, middle, and bottom) as described previously McKellar (2014b) across three different pallets. Time and conditions (temperature and RH), and GPS readings were recorded at 15-, and 5-min intervals, respectively. Four separate trials were carried out for retailers' supply chain operations for every season over a year, although some data was lost due to tracker loss or malfunction. Consequently, reliable temperature profiles were obtained for 32-casesof lettuce. The collected data were fitted to a PERT distribution to describe retail storage temperature for cos lettuce (Table 1), with an Example 1.1 (2011) to calculate the number of *E. c*
g washing. Calculation details are presented in Table 1.
s during storage and transportation
soortaining nine 300 g of ready to eat fresh-cut lettuce were
attonTM (

assumed maximum duration of 10 days, an average of 7 days, and a minimum of half a day. Home storage time was modeled on US data from Pouillot et al. (2010). The temperature and duration of transportation from retail to home was estimated using calculations in a risk assessment study by Pang et al. (2017).

2.5. Microbial kinetics of E. coli O157:H7 on cos lettuce

For the preharvest module, the effect of solar radiation level (W/m^2) on the inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 in the field during cultivation in Australia was defined by the following dieoff model;

$$
\log N_t / N_0 = -k * t \tag{1}
$$

where *t* represents time (days), *k* is the die-off rate (log CFU/g/day), and where N_0 is the initial number of survivors, and N_t represents the number of survivors at a certain time (t) (Ottoson et al., 2011). Inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce was calculated for Australian field conditions based on the relationship between die-off rate and solar radiation levels determined in previous studies (Allende et al., 2017; Ottoson et al., 2011) (Table 1 and 5). whences by *E*. Con O157.117 on cost centred (W/m²) c
eharvest module, the effect of solar radiation level (W/m²) c
17 in the field during cultivation in Australia was defined by
 $_0 = -k * t$
stime (days), *k* is the die

 To consider the dynamic nature of environmental conditions on survival of *E. coli* O157:H7 on fresh cut-cos lettuce in the postharvest module, a threshold temperature of 5° C was used as the cut-off between growth and inactivation (McKellar et al., 2014; Pang et al., 2017). While inactivation of *E. coli* O157:H7 was defined with a die-off model at temperatures below 5°C (Eq. 1), a growth model was used to determine the increase in *E. coli* O157:H7 numbers at temperatures above 5°C (Eq. 2) as proposed by Ratkowsky et al. (1982).

$$
\mu = b(T - T_{min}) \tag{2}
$$

In Eq. 2, μ is the growth rate (log CFU/g/h), *b* is the temperature coefficient, *T* and T_{min} are temperature (°C), and theoretical minimum growth temperature, respectively (Table 3).

2.6. Dose-response relationship and risk characterization

The daily dose of *E. coli* O157:H7 (*D*, *log CFU*/*day*) that the consumer is exposed to was defined as described by Hamilton et al. (2006);

$$
D (CFU/day) = C_H \times M_{body} \times M_i
$$
 (3)

where C_H is the *E. coli* O157:H7 concentration in cos lettuce at home (log CFU/g), M_i is the daily consumption amount for the fresh cut-cos lettuce per person (g.person⁻¹.day⁻¹), and M_{body} is the human body mass (kg).

The Beta-Poisson dose-response model used in this study was based on animal studies, and first reported by Haas (1983). The risk predicted by the Beta-Poisson dose-response model was concordant with illness rates evidenced in foodborne outbreaks (Haas et. al 2000), thus it was found adequate to describe the human morbidity risk of a highly virulent pathogen like *E. coli* O157:H7 (Teunis et al. 2008). Concomitantly, the selected dose-response model was used in many risk assessments, including a QMRA for *E. coli* O157: H7 in leafy greens by Danyluk and Schaffner (2011) and Pang et al. (2017). scribed by Hamilton et al. (2006);
 day)=C_H × M_{body} × M_l
 \therefore coli O157:H7 concentration in cos lettuce at home (log CF $_{coll}$ × M_{body})
 \therefore coli O157:H7 concentration in cos lettuce at home (log CF $_{coll}$ × M_l)

$$
P_I(\lambda) = 1 - \left(1 + \frac{p}{\beta}\right)^{-\alpha} \times \text{Prev}_{AP} \tag{4}
$$

In Eq. 4, $P_I(\lambda)$ is the probability of illness per day, *D* is the number of organisms ingested per day (i.e,. a dose), and α (0.267) and β (229.2928) are model parameters reported by Cassin et al. (Cassin et al., 1998) (Table 4).

An estimate of the annual risk of infection in Australia was calculated based on the assumption that irrigation of fresh produce and consumption of those fresh products is a daily event which occurs year-around (*n*=365) (Haas, 1983) (Table 4);

$$
P_I(A)(\lambda) = 1 - [1 - P_I(\lambda)]^n
$$
\n(5)

 An estimate of the annual number of cases of illness in Australia was calculated as the product of the annual risk of infection and the population of Australia.

2.7. Scenario analysis

To assess the effect of different preharvest and postharvest practices on levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce in Australia, 17 scenarios were evaluated (Table 5). Summer harvest was considered as the baseline scenario (Table 1) and modification in distributions were used to compare the outcome of each scenario (Table 5). The effects of different growing times, harvest seasons, rain events, and solar radiation were evaluated using six scenarios (Scenario 1 to 6). Another set of scenarios was used to evaluate the impact of agricultural practices with variable irrigation water quality and type (Scenario 7 to 12) and manure quality (Scenario 13). A final set of scenarios (Scenario 14 to 17) were used to evaluate the efficacy of water washing and the use of chlorine and PAA. and itse of intection and the population of Australia.

1991 analysis

the effect of different preharvest and postharvest practices c

lettuce in Australia, 17 scenarios were evaluated (Table 5).

5

baseline scenario (Tab

Preliminary analysis was used to determine the number of iterations required to provide an acceptable degree of stability in percentile risk estimates where repeated simulation runs with different numbers of iterations were performed and the output reproducibility as considered for the mean, median, and high-end (90th, 95th and 99th percentiles) forecasts. Each simulation was repeated five times to examine the output stability. While the minimum number of iterations

required to constantly stabilize high-end forecasts at $< 0.5\%$ variance was $\sim 100,000$ for preharvest module, it was ~200,000 for postharvest module. For each preharvest and postharvest scenario, to assure precision in high-end forecasts, the developed model was simulated five times by using @Risk, Version 7.3 with the Monte Carlo simulation technique using 1,000,000 iterations for each run by Latin Hypercube sampling.

3. Results and Discussion

Under Australian industrial preharvest practices, the developed probabilistic QMRA model predicted annual mean *E. coli* O157:H7 levels from 0.3 to -3.4 log CFU/g, and prevalence values ranged from 2 to 6.3 %. Based on the meta-analysis performed by Elias et al. (2019) on *E. coli* O157:H7 prevalence and concentration in lettuce, using available worldwide data, average preharvest practices yielded a higher prevalence (5-7.8%) and concentration values (from 0.48 to 3.04 log MPN/g) than Australian industrial preharvest practices. The results of this study highlights that a large variation of the prevalence and concentration of *E. coli* including O157:H7, VTEC, STECin lettuce between developed countries such as Sweden (Soderstrom et al., 2005), Spain (Castro-Ibanez et al., 2015), and Germany (Fiedler et al., 2017), and developing countries including Iran (Khandaghi et al., 2010), Malaysia (Kuan et al., 2017), and Pakistan (Shah et al., 2015) and Australia might be attributed to different agricultural production environments, in particular meteorological differences. Even though it's been known that meteorological and environmental conditions have an important impact on the amount of *E. coli* O157:H7 on leafy greens at harvest, (Allende et al., 2017; Castro-Ibanez et al., 2015; Oliveira et al., 2012; Park et al., 2015), employment of a universal risk management strategy for in-field food safety management systems, may not be ideal under certain environmental conditions, and may either underestimate or overestimate microbial risk. This indicates the importance of An *Discussion*
stralian industrial preharvest practices, the developed probal
nnual mean *E. coli* O157:H7 levels from 0.3 to -3.4 log CF
sranged from 2 to 6.3 %. Based on the meta-analysis perfor
O157:H7 prevalence and

conducting further studies focusing on specific agricultural production environments over different seasons for reliable risk model development.

For Australia, the developed model predicted that the season in which cos lettuce was harvested had a significant influence on risk of *E. coli* O157:H7 contamination in the field (Figure 1a). For example summer harvest of cos lettuce occurs under a relatively high mean ambient temperature (23 \pm 0.9°C), a mid number of rainy days (6 \pm 2 days), and after the shortest growing cycle (35-45 days). These harvesting conditions yielded a mean predicted *E. coli* O157:H7 level of -1.1 log CFU/g with a prevalence value of 6.3% (Table 6). Even though summer harvest of cos lettuce had the highest solar radiation intensity ($(370\pm13 \text{ W/m}^2)$ and longer sun hours (10.4±1.7 h), spring harvest of cos lettuce yielded the lowest mean predicted level of *E. coli* O157:H7 with a value of -3.4 log CFU/g at harvest (Table 6). The lowest predicted levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 in spring harvest of cos lettuce might be attributed to individual or a combination of meteorological and environmental factors including the second highest solar radiation intensity $(312.5 \pm 20.4 \text{ W/m}^2)$ and sun hours $(9.3 \pm 1.1 \text{ h})$ and most importantly, longer growing cycles (55 to 65 days) than the summer season. On the other hand, a winter harvest scenario with longest growth cycles (70-80 days) only reduced the mean number of *E. coli* O157:H7 by 0.6-log fold compared to summer season (p <0.05). Even though in winter, increased bacterial decay would have been expected due to longer growing cycles season, the low temperature (13.7 \pm 0.7°C) and lowest solar radiation intensity (69.4 \pm 15.7 W/m²) might be the factors that have been associated with enhanced microbial survival (Oliveira et al., 2012). Interestingly, an autumn scenario yielded the highest mean levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 compared to other seasons ($p < 0.05$) and showed an increase of -0.2 -log fold relative to summer 3-45 days). These harvesting conditions yielded a mean precise 1.1 l log CFU/g with a prevalence value of 6.3% (Table 6).
5-45 days). These harvesting conditions yielded a mean precise 1.1 l log CFU/g with a prevalence va

harvest (p>0.05) (Figure 1a). The combination of highest number of rainy days (10.3 \pm 2.3 days) and second lowest solar radiation (104.2 \pm 23.2 W/m²) might be factors associated with the highest mean levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 at autumn harvest. This finding is in agreement with others (Allende et al., 2017; Castro-Ibanez et al., 2015; Machado-Moreira et al., 2019) in which rain events and solar radiation intensity were identified as the most significant weather related factors that lead to an increase in level of pathogens in fresh produce at autumn harvest. Overall, the large variation in the mean predicted *E. coli* O157:H7 levels on cos lettuce over different seasons might be influenced by a range of individual and interacting meteorological and environmental effects, such as solar radiation intensity and rainfall, and highlights the importance of further studies that explore the impact of each individual factors.

Further investigations of the effect of key weather-related factors in Australia on the survival of *E. coli* O157:H7 at preharvest level were performed by excluding solar radiation and rainfall from summer harvest as the baseline model (Figure 1a). The results revealed that both rainfall and solar radiation intensity have been identified as critical factors that affected the mean predicted *E. coli* O157:H7 levels on cos lettuce (p<0.05) in comparison to baseline model. While summer harvest with no solar radiation yielded a significant increase in mean predicted numbers of *E. coli* O157:H7 (5.8 log CFU/g with a -5.3 -log fold change), exclusion of rainfall reduced the mean number of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce by 6.5-log fold relative to summer harvest (baseline model) (Table 6). High solar radiation intensity is linked with greater rates of die-off of enteric bacteria under both shady and sunny conditions (Sidhu et al., 2008). However, the limited data on the contribution of a rain event on the frequency and magnitude of pathogen transfer rate in field, highlights the importance of future studies focusing on these themes for precise characterization and management of microbial risk. To this end, the majority of fresh at lead to an increase in level of paintigens in fiesting produce
variation in the mean predicted E. coli O157:H7 levels on c
might be influenced by a range of individual and interacting
fects, such as solar radiation int

produce safety management guidelines rely upon the microbial die-off rate between the last water application and harvest at a rate of 0.5 log CFU/day, for up to four days (FDA, 2015) with no consideration for any location based weather-related factors such as solar radiation intensity, number of rain events, etc. Moreover, the scarcity of the data on the quantification of microbial behavior in the field at specific growing locations other than the United States (where the die-off rate of 0.5 log CFU per day is based on), highlights the importance of risk model development based on local data and reflects the diversity of prevailing meteorological and environmental conditions.

In comparison with other vegetable production regions in Australia, Tasmania, an important producer of fresh produce in the country**,** is characterized with cool temperate climate with four distinct seasons, along with highly differentiated rainfall and available sun hours (Holtz et al. 2010). Thus, it is of great interest to assess the *E. coli* O157:H7 risk associated with the cultivation of cos lettuce in Tasmania. To this end, the impact of rainfall, solar radiation, and available sun hours on the *E. coli* O157:H7 levels at harvest in Launceston, Tasmania over summer season was evaluated using cos lettuce cultivated in Sydney (summer) as a baseline. In general, the predicted mean *E. coli* O157:H7 levels in cos lettuce that was cultivated in Tasmania were higher (95%CI=-1.91,6.34 Log CFU/g) with a -2.2%- log fold change than those of Sydney as baseline (Supplementary Figure 3). Eq. and reflects the diversity of prevailing meteorological and
ta and reflects the diversity of prevailing meteorological and
ison with other vegetable production regions in Australia, T
er of fresh produce in the countr

The variation of the concentration of *E. coli* O157:H7 in Tasmania might not only be attributed to meteorological differences between sites but also spatiotemporal heterogeneity of farm and freshwater environments in the region. It further underscores the importance of risk

management strategies considering meteorological factors and spatiotemporal heterogeneity of the region for a reliable risk assessment.

Among agricultural practices, manure-amended soil and irrigation water are both major reservoirs for foodborne pathogen transfer to fresh produce and thereby, have an important effect on the microbial load on fresh produce at harvest (Cevallos-Cevallos et al., 2012; Girardin et al., 2005; Keraita et al., 2007; Monaghan and Hutchison, 2012). To this end, the removal of manure amendment from the QMRA model resulted in the lowest mean predicted level of *E. coli* O157:H7 with a value of -7.1 log CFU/g $(95th, 99th$ and 99.9th percentiles; -3.5,-2.4, and -1.4 log CFU/g, respectively), and reduced the level of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce 6.5-log fold relative to that of summer cultivation levels (baseline model) (Table 6 and Figure 1b). The significant reduction in the mean level of *E. coli* O157:H7 levels at harvest when manure amended soil was excluded from baseline model (6.5-log fold) highlighted the fact that manure amended soil has an overarching effect on risk of *E. coli* O157:H7 in lettuce at harvest. This indicates that organic amendment quality should be monitored to eliminate future foodborne incidences, recalls, or outbreaks linked to leafy greens. at, 2007, Montghan and Tracenson, 2012). To ans end, are
the QMRA model resulted in the lowest mean predicted lev
value of -7.1 log CFU/g $(95^{th}, 99^{th}$ and 99.9^{th} percentiles; -3.
ely), and reduced the level of *E. co*

The impact on the irrigation water quality on the level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce was also assessed by using different sources of water in the QMRA model. Irrigation using tap water, surface water, or reclaimed water reduced the mean number of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce by 3.5, -0.7, and -0.4-log fold relative to summer cultivation (baseline model), respectively (Table 6). As expected, there was significant difference among the irrigation water types used in this QMRA at selected conditions $(p<0.05)$ (Figure 1b). The usage of tap water resulted in the lowest mean predicted *E. coli* O157:H7 levels on cos lettuce at summer harvest (- 3.9 log CFU/g), followed by surface (0.8 log CFU/g), and reclaimed water (0.4 log CFU/g).

Considering that presence and persistence of foodborne pathogens in irrigation water sources are still major issues for public health (Liu et al., 2018), compliance with local guidelines is an important risk management practice. Australian Freshcare guidelines require irrigation water used in high risk produce (i.e., in which the edible parts are grown in direct contact with the soil or are consumed uncooked), including leafy greens, to have no more than 100 CFU generic *E. coli* per 100 ml of water (FPSC, 2019). Given the fact that the *E. coli* levels recommended by Freshcare standards (<100 CFU/100 ml) are lower than those of California Leafy Green Marketing Association in the United States (235 CFU/100 ml) (LGMA, 2013), compliance with Freshcare guidelines is good practice for the Australian leafy green industry in order to avoid potential contamination of fresh produce via irrigation water, and highlights the importance of risk characterization using locally acquired data. Also (<100 CFU/100 ml) are lower than those of California L
ds (<100 CFU/100 ml) are lower than those of California L
attion in the United States (235 CFU/100 ml) (LGMA, 2013
mes is good practice for the Australian leafy

In addition to the risks posed by manure-amended soil and irrigation water, the type of irrigation system also has an impact on the mean level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest. While summer harvest with overhead irrigation was used as a baseline, the impact of furrow and drip irrigation on mean level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest was also evaluated (Figure 1c). Drip and furrow irrigation resulted -8.2, and -6.1 log CFU/g of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest (Table 6), and compared to overhead irrigation they both reduced the mean level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest by 7.5, and 5.6-log fold, respectively (Figure 1c). In addition to being a reservoir for foodborne pathogens, irrigation water is also considered to be potential vehicles for pathogen transfer from manure-amended soil to fresh produce (Allende et al. 2017). The usage of drip irrigation reduces the potential for contamination from manure amended soil via irrigation splashing (Allende et al., 2017; Stine et al., 2005).While overhead irrigation is more likely to introduce pathogens than furrow or drip

irrigation, it has been used not only provide water for lettuce leaves (Moyne et al. 2009) but also to cool down them (Smith et al. 2011). The latter became particularly important for lettuce as a cool season crop, with an optimal growing temperature of 23.8° C during the day and 7° C during the night (Coloumbe et al. 2020), especially in exceptionally productive agriculture regions such as California, Arizona in the US, and Victoria, Queensland in Australia. Being a cool-season crop, lettuce is particularly vulnerable to heat stress, therefore at the high end of temperature range, lettuce may bolt, causing bitterness and loose, fluffy heads. For regions where, daytime temperature is above the optimal growing temperature, it's recommended to use overhead irrigation only if the water quality is well controlled and potable (Uyttendaele et al. 2015). In response to recent *E. coli* O157:H7 outbreak linked to romaine lettuce from the Yuma area, new water safety requirements under the LGMA were put in place, in which the use of untreated surface water for overhead irrigation during the 21 days prior to harvest has been banned (LGMA, 2019). Even though the type of irrigation method chosen by a grower depends on several issues, codes of practices are required to stress the importance of the quality of the irrigation water source for ensuring safety of fresh produce (Uyttendaele et al. 2015). book, causing bitterness and loose, fluffy heads. For region
ove the optimal growing temperature, it's recommended to the water quality is well controlled and potable (Uyttendaele
t *E. coli* O157:H7 outbreak linked to rom

The most important parameters and variables affecting *E. coli* O157:H7 levels on lettuce during preharvest practices using summer harvest as a baseline model were determined by Spearman's rank order correlation (Figure 2). Based on the results obtained from sensitivity analysis, sun hours (-0.44) and growing time (-0.21) were the most important input factors that were negatively correlated with contamination (Figure 2) In contrast, the amount soil transferred to produce by irrigation (0.53 and numbers of rainy days (0.32) were identified as the most important input factors that were positively correlated with predicted mean levels of *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce at harvest (Figure 2). Results revealed that among weather related

20

factors, sun hours, thereby, solar radiation was identified the most significant factor affecting the elimination of microbial risk, whereas rain event had the highest contribution to the increase of overall risk at preharvest level, and underlying the importance of locally acquired data usage. Since the amount soil transferred to produce by irrigation is dependent on the type of irrigation, selection of drip or furrow irrigation rather than overhead irrigation avoids the contamination from manure amended soil via irrigation water, and identified as an important risk management practices for growers to apply at preharvest level. Other influential factors that were positively correlated with predicted mean numbers of *E. coli* O157:H7 at harvest were *E. coli* concentration in manure-amended soil (0.11), amount of water transferred (0.11), bacterial transfer from soil to produce (0.09), and *E. coli* O157:H7 concentration after irrigation (0.06)(Figure 2). The corollary of these correlations is for implementation of good agricultural practices (GAP) to avoid contamination via manure-amended soil and is one of few factors within grower's control (Islam et al., 2004; Natvig et al., 2002). To this end, the Fresh Salad Producers Group - PMA Australia-New Zealand (Group, 2019) prohibits the use of untreated manure. and if untreated manure is applied, requires a 365 days exclusion period prior to production of leafy greens. For weather-related factors such as sunshine hours, growing time, and number of rainy days that growers have no control over and GAP cannot be applied to, growers are encouraged to assess their own risk, and take necessary actions to manage, eliminate, or reduce risk to an acceptable level. Fraction of via infiguron water, and dentified as an important
vers to apply at preharvest level. Other influential factors that
redicted mean numbers of E. coli O157:H7 at harvest were P
ed soil (0.11), amount of water

The baseline model of this QMRA predicted that the mean number of cases of illness per year in Australia due to consumption of fresh cut-cos lettuce contaminated with *E. coli* O157:H7 was 43. Due to the lack of epidemiological data for leafy greens linked *E. coli* O157:H7 illness in Australia, no formal model validation was performed. Thus, the total number of *E. coli*

Journal Pre-proof

O157:H7 illness associated with the consumption of other food commodities were used to make a comparison. The incidence of *E. coli* O157:H7 infections reported in Australia was 17 cases per year, which includes only foodborne cases (OzNet, 2020). Taking into account an underreporting factor of 26.1% used by Danyluk and Schaffner (2011), the predicted number of cases of illness per year in Australia came to 65, clearly surpassing the reported number of cases of illness per year in Australia. The mean probability of illness per year for the baseline study was 4.9×10^{-7} (90th, 95th, and 99th percentiles; 1.7×10^{-6} , 3.9×10^{-6} , and 7.0×10^{-6} , respectively). The mean probability of illnesses associated with the consumption of the *E. coli* O157:H7 contaminated lettuce reported by this study were similar with those of other developed countries including Canada (water rinsed lettuce; 1.0×10^{-7} per year), (Ottoson et al., 2011) and the United States (chlorine washed fresh-cut lettuce; 6.6×10^{-7} per year) (Pang et al., 2017). Even though a different dose-response relationship was used by Ottoson et al. (2011) and some important preharvest risk factors such as rainfall, solar radiation intensity along with contamination from manure amended soil through rain and irrigation water were excluded by Pang et al. (2017), the similarities between these findings could be linked to effective usage of food safety standards among these developed countries. Intervention strategies such as washing, differed significantly $(p<0.05)$ in their predicted capacity to reduce the number of cases of illness per year and probability of illness per serving due to consumption of *E. coli* O157:H7. According to the baseline model and relative to washing in water only, reduction in mean number of *E.coli* O157:H7 was greatest for the sequence of washing in water followed by washing in PAA (2.7 log fold reduction) or washing in water followed by washing in chlorine (2.2-log fold reduction). The reduction was lowest for washing in chlorine only (1.4-log fold reduction) or washing in PAA only (1.6-log fold reduction) (Table 7). The use of chlorine and PAA as sanitizers in wash ^h, 95th, and 99th percentiles; 1.7×10^{-6} , 3.9×10^{-6} , and 7.0×10^{-6}
of illnesses associated with the consumption of the *E. coli* C
uce reported by this study were similar with those of other d
(water rin

water have been studied extensively, and similar findings regarding the effectiveness of these sanitizers against *E. coli* O157:H7 on leafy greens have been reported by others (Lopez-Galvez et al., 2009; Petri et al., 2015; Veschetti et al., 2003). The enhanced efficacy of water washing, when followed by washing in PAA or chlorine, suggests that the use of sequential treatment would be a worthwhile focus of further research to optimize industrial cos lettuce washing practices.

A sensitivity analysis showed that the predicted number of cases of illness per year was most sensitive to retail storage temperature (0.14), home storage temperature (0.11), and washing (-0.10) among postharvest practices. Once a product is contaminated, exposure to abusive storage conditions during the postharvest stage may lead to microbial growth and a higher number of pathogens at consumption. Thus, postharvest temperature control was considered as one of the most important control measures affecting the predicted number of cases of illness cases per year and the probability of illness per serving due to consumption of *E. coli* O157:H7. Similar to others (Danyluk and Schaffner, 2011; Ottoson et al., 2011; Pang et al., 2017), this study highlighted the importance of environmental monitoring and maintenance of adequate postprocessing conditions to eliminate risk associated with presence of *E. coli* O157:H7. ity analysis showed that the predicted number of cases of ill
retail storage temperature (0.14), home storage temperature
stharvest practices. Once a product is contaminated, exposu
s during the postharvest stage may lead

The development of a QMRA model using local data that reflected Australian preharvest and postharvest practices for *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos (romaine) lettuce was a resource-intensive but invaluable activity as it enabled the generation of realistic estimates of risk. However, it was necessary to use several credible assumptions in the model due to a lack of specific data or knowledge. These assumptions included: steady contamination through manure-amended soil and irrigation water throughout the growing period (Allende et al., 2017); constant ratio between generic and pathogenic *E. coli* in irrigation water and manure-amended soil (Pang et al., 2017);

and constant environmental conditions during each season (Allende et al., 2017; Allende et al., 2018; Castro-Ibanez et al., 2015). Despite these limitations, the developed QMRA model remains useful because it provides, not only estimates of the risk, but also a baseline to compare different scenarios. This could aid Australian risk managers to mitigate and/or control risk involving *E. coli* O157:H7 in fresh cut- cos lettuce production.

Conclusion

Generation of QMRA models to assess Australian preharvest factors including: seasonality (growing time, temperature), weather (rainfall, solar radiation), agricultural practices (manure amended soil and irrigation water quality), and irrigation types (overhead, drip, furrow) and postharvest practices (washing, distribution, and storage) for *E. coli* O157:H7 in fresh cutcos lettuce, will assist the leafy green industry and food safety authorities in Australia to identify potential risk reduction strategies. It was found that the level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest was significantly affected by a range of individual and interacting environmental effects, including solar radiation intensity, rainfall, growing time, manure usage, irrigation water quality, and irrigation types.While exclusion of manure and usage of drip irrigation reduced the level of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cos lettuce at harvest in comparison to the baseline model, the exclusion of solar radiation yielded the highest *E. coli* O157:H7 concentrations in cos lettuce at harvest. In order to develop reliable microbial risk assesment models, these findings also emphasized the usage of local data that take into consideration the unique environmental conditions, and agricultural practices. Our data suggests that the use of a sequential washing treatment, as part of Australian industrial practices, could reduce the public health risk associated with *E. coli* **usion**

In of QMRA models to assess Australian preharvest factors is

ing time, temperature), weather (rainfall, solar radiation), as

I soil and irrigation water quality), and irrigation types (over

ractices (washing, d

O157:H7 compared to water washing only. Meanwhile, temperature control was the most important postharvest control to reduce the predicted number of illness cases per year and probability of illness per serving due to consumption of *E. coli* O157:H7. Even though the QMRA presented here has a number of assumptions and limitations, it provides a valuable insight into the risk associated with leafy greens and provides a means for prioritizing risk management actions.

Funding

This research was conducted within the Australian Research Council Industrial Transformation Training Centre for Food Safety in the Fresh Produce Industry (Grant number: *IC160100025*) funded by the Australian Research Council, industry partners from Australia and New Zealand, and the University of Sydney. ng

Instants and Conducted within the Australian Research

Training Centre for Food Safety in the Fresh Produce Indu

Industry partners

I the University of Sydney.

Edgements

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Australian leafy green industry for providing data that was used in this study.

Author Statement

Hayriye Bozkurt: Conceptualization, Methodology, Data curation, Software, Writing- Original draft preparation, Reviewing and Editing **Tina Bell**: Writing- Reviewing and Editing. **Floris van** **Ogtrop**: Writing- Reviewing and Editing. **Kim-Yen Phan-Thien**; Writing- Reviewing and Editing. **Robyn McConchie**: Writing- Reviewing and Editing.

4. Declaration of Interest

None

5. References

Allende, A., Castro-Ibanez, I., Lindqvist, R., Gil, M.I., Uyttendaele, M., Jacxsens, L., 2017. Quantitative contamination assessment of *Escherichia coli* in baby spinach primary production in Spain: Effects of weather conditions and agricultural practices. Int.J. Food Microbiol. 257, 238-246. **ences**

ro-Ibanez, I., Lindqvist, R., Gil, M.I., Uyttendaele, M., Jacx

amination assessment of *Escherichia coli* in baby spinach prof

brownal Pre-productions and agricultural practices. Int.J. Food

hado, P., Lindqvis

Allende, A., Truchado, P., Lindqvist, R., Jacxsens, L., 2018. Quantitative microbial exposure modelling as a tool to evaluate the impact of contamination level of surface irrigation water and seasonality on fecal hygiene indicator *E. col*i in leafy green production. Food Microbiol. 75, 82- 89.

Anderson, M., Jaykus, L., Beaulieu, S., Dennis, S., 2011. Pathogen produce pair attribution risk ranking tool to prioritize fresh produce commodity and pathogen combinations for further evaluation. Food Control 22, 1865-1872.

ABS, Australian Bureau of Statistic, 2020.Avaialble at https://www.abs.gov.au/Population.ACcessed on january 12th, 2020.

Baker, C.A., De, J., Bertoldi, B., Dunn, L., Chapin, T., Jay-Russell, M., Danyluk, M.D., Schneider, K.R., 2019. Prevalence and concentration of stx+ *E. coli* and *E. coli* O157 in bovine manure from Florida farms. PLoS One 14, e0217445.

Barlow, R.S., Mellor, G.E., 2010. Prevalence of enterohemorrhagic *Escherichia coli* serotypes in Australian beef cattle. Foodborne Pathog. Dis. 7, 1239-1245.

Berry, E.D., Wells, J.E., 2010. *Escherichia coli* O157:H7: recent advances in research on occurrence, transmission, and control in cattle and the production environment. Adv. Food Nutr. Res. 60, 67-117.

BOM, Bureau of Meteorology , 2020. Historical weather observations and statistics, in: Australian Government Bureau of Meteorology (BOM) Available at: http://www.bom.gov.au/ . Accessed on January $2nd$, 2020.

Cassin, M.H., Lammerding, A.M., Todd, E.C., Ross, W., McColl, R.S., 1998. Quantitative risk assessment for *Escherichia* coli O157:H7 in ground beef hamburgers. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 41, 21-44.

Castro-Ibanez, I., Gil, M.I., Tudela, J.A., Ivanek, R., Allende, A., 2015. Assessment of microbial risk factors and impact of meteorological conditions during production of baby spinach in the Southeast of Spain. Food Microbiol. 49, 173-181.

Cevallos-Cevallos, J.M., Danyluk, M.D., Gu, G., Vallad, G.E., van Bruggen, A.H., 2012. Dispersal of *Salmonella Typhimurium* by rain splash onto tomato plants. J. Food Prot. 75, 472- 479.

Coulombe, G., Catford, A., Martinez-Perez, A., Buenaventura, E. 2020. Outbreaks of *Escherichia col*i O157:H7 infections linked to romaine lettuce in Canada from 2008 to 2018: an analysis of food safety context. J. Food Protect. 83(8), 1444–1462. atford, A., Martinez-Perez, A., Buenaventura, E. 2020. Out

20157: H7 infections linked to romaine lettuce in Canada from

afety context. J. Food Protect. 83(8), 1444–1462.

Chaffner, D.W., 2011. Quantitative assessment of

Danyluk, M.D., Schaffner, D.W., 2011. Quantitative assessment of the microbial risk of leafy greens from farm to consumption: preliminary framework, data, and risk estimates. J. Food Prot. 74, 700-708.

Dao, T., Bradburry, M., van Ogrtop, F., Bozkurt, H., Jones, B., McConchie, R., 2020. Environmental drivers for persistence of *Escherichia coli* and *Salmonella* spp. in manureamended soils: A meta-analysis. J. Food Prot.*In Press*.

de Oliveira Elias, S., Noronha, T.B., Tondo, E.C., 2019. *Salmonella* spp. and *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 prevalence and levels on lettuce: A systematic review and meta-analysis. Food Microbiol. 84, 103217.

Dennis, S.B., Buchanan, R.L., Miller, A.J., 2002. Microbial risk assessment: achievements and future challenges. Food Safety Magazine. Available at: https://www.foodsafetymagazine.com/index.cfm/magazine-archive1/december-2001january- $2002/microbial-risk-assessment-achievements-and-future-challenges/. Accessed on April $27th$$ 2020.

FDA, Food Drug and Administration., 2015. Standards for growing, harvesting, packing, and holding of produce for human consumption $(\S 112.45(b)(1)(ii))$. Available at: http://federalregister.gov, Accessed on March $27th$, 2020.

Fiedler, G., Kabisch, J., Bohnlein, C., Huch, M., Becker, B., Cho, G.S., Franz, C., 2017. Presence of human pathogens in produce from retail markets in Northern Germany. Foodborne Pathog Dis. 14, 502-509.

Forum, 2018. Australia and New Zealand Ministerial Forum on Food Regulation Final Communiqué. Available

at:https://foodregulation.gov.au/internet/fr/publishing.nsf/Content/ministerial-forumcommuniques. Accessed on April $1st$, 2020..

FPSC, Fresh Produce Safety Center, 2019 Understanding the Gaps: A Food Safety Literature Review, in: Center, F.P.S. (Ed.), Available at:https://producesafetycentreanz.files.wordpress.com/2015/01/understanding-thegaps.pdf.Accessed on March $1st$, 2020.

Franz, E., Semenov, A.V., van Bruggen, A.H., 2008. Modelling the contamination of lettuce with *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 from manure-amended soil and the effect of intervention strategies. J. Appl. Microbiol. 105, 1569-1584.

Franz, E., Tromp, S.O., Rijgersberg, H., van der Fels-Klerx, H.J., 2010. Quantitative microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella*, and *Listeria monocytogenes* in leafy green vegetables consumed at salad bars. J. Food Prot. 73, 274-285.

Gies, P., 2003. Australia has more than enough solar UV radiation. Clin. Exp. Optom. 86, 71-73. Gil, M.I., Selma, M.V., Suslow, T., Jacxsens, L., Uyttendaele, M., Allende, A., 2015. Pre- and postharvest preventive measures and intervention strategies to control microbial food safety hazards of fresh leafy vegetables. Crit. Rev. Food Sci. Nutr. 55, 453-468. The Estatemental control of the Mannettic and Estatemental Consumed at salad bars. J. Food Prot. 73, 274-285.

ustralia has more than enough solar UV radiation. Clin. Exp

M.V., Suslow, T., Jacxsens, L., Uyttendaele, M., A

Girardin, H., Morris, C.E., Albagnac, C., Dreux, N., Glaux, C., Nguyen-The, C., 2005. Behaviour of the pathogen surrogates *Listeria innocua* and *Clostridium sporogenes* during production of parsley in fields fertilized with contaminated amendments. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 54, 287-295.

Group, Fresh Salad Producers Group, 2019. Produce Marketing Association Australia-New Zealand. Standard for the use of fertilisers and soil additives in the production of ready-to-eat leafy salad crops - FSPG Fertilisers and soil additives Bolt-on Edition 1.

Haas, C.N., 1983. Estimation of risk due to low doses of microorganisms: a comparison of alternative methodologies. Am. J. Epidemiol. 118, 573-582.

Haas, C.N., Thayyar-Madabus, A., Rose, J.B., Gerba, C.P., 2000. Development of a doseresponse relationship for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. Int J. Food. Microbiol. 1748, 153-159.

Hamilton, A.J., Stagnitti, F., Premier, R., Boland, A.M., Hale, G., 2006. Quantitative microbial risk assessment models for consumption of raw vegetables irrigated with reclaimed water. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 72, 3284-3290.

Herman, K.M., Hall, A.J., Gould, L.H., 2015. Outbreaks attributed to fresh leafy vegetables, United States, 1973-2012. Epidemiol. Infect. 143, 3011-3021.

Islam, M., Doyle, M.P., Phatak, S.C., Millner, P., Jiang, X., 2004. Persistence of enterohemorrhagic *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in soil and on leaf lettuce and parsley grown in fields treated with contaminated manure composts or irrigation water. J. Food Prot. 67, 1365- 1370.

Keraita, B., Konradsen, F., Drechsel, P., Abaidoo, R.C., 2007. Effect of low-cost irrigation methods on microbial contamination of lettuce irrigated with untreated wastewater. Trop. Med. Int. Health 12 Suppl 2, 15-22.

Khandaghi, J., Razavilar, V., Barzgari, A., 2010. Isolation of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 from manure fertilized farms and raw vegetables grown on it, in Tabriz city in Iran. Afr. J. Microbiol. Res. 4, 9.

Koseki, S., Isobe, S., 2005. Prediction of pathogen growth on iceberg lettuce under real temperature history during distribution from farm to table. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 104, 239-248.

Kuan, C.H., Lim, L.W.K., Ting, T.W., Rukayadi, Y., Ahmad, S.J., et al., 2017. Simulation of decontamination and transmission of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella Enteritidis*, and *Listeria monocytogenes* during handling of raw vegetables in domestic kitchens. Food Control 80, 395-400.

Kundu, A., Wuertz, S., Smith, W.A., 2018. Quantitative microbial risk assessment to estimate the risk of diarrheal diseases from fresh produce consumption in India. Food Microbiol. 75, 95- 102.

LGMA, Califonria Leafy Green Marketing Association., 2013. Commodity specific food safety guidelines for the production and harvest of lettuce and leafy greens. Available at: http://www.lgma.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/California-LGMA-metrics-08-26-13- Final.pdf. Accessed on April 2nd 2020. E. W.R., Higg. 1. W., Kuatayaal, 1., Hamata, 5.2., et al., 2.5.
and transmission of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella* agenes during handling of raw vegetables in domestic kitchendles
tz, S., Smith, W.A., 2018. Qua

LGMA, Califonria Leafy Green Marketing Association., 2019. New, more stringent food safety practices adopted to prevent outbreaks. Available at: https://lgma.ca.gov/2019/04/new-practicesprevent-outbreaks/. Accessed on October 5th 2020.

Li, M., Baker, C.A., Danyluk, M.D., Belanger, P., Boelaert, F., Cressey, P., Gheorghe, M., Polkinghorne, B., Toyofuku, H., Havelaar, A.H., 2018. Identification of biological hazards in produce consumed in industrialized countries: A Review. J. Food Prot. 81, 1171-1186.

Liu, H., Whitehouse, C.A., Li, B., 2018. Presence and persistence of *Salmonella* in water: the impact on microbial quality of water and food safety. Front. Public Health. 6, 159.

Lopez-Galvez, F., Allende, A., Selma, M.V., Gil, M.I., 2009. Prevention of Escherichia coli cross-contamination by different commercial sanitizers during washing of fresh-cut lettuce. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 133, 167-171.

Machado-Moreira, B., Richards, K., Brennan, F., Abram, F., Burgess, C.M., 2019. Microbial contamination of fresh produce: what, where, and how? Comp. Rev.Food Sci.Food Saf. 18, 1727-1750.

McKellar, R.C., Perez-Rodriguez, F., Harris, L.J., Moyne, A.L., Blais, B., Topp, E., Bezanson, G., Bach, S., Delaquis, P., 2014. Evaluation of different approaches for modeling *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 survival on field lettuce. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 184, 74-85.

Moyne, A.I., Sudarshana, M.R., Blessington, T., Koike, S.T., Cahn, M.D., Harris, L.J. 2009. Fate of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in field-inoculated lettuce, Food Microbiol. 28(8), 1417-1425.

Monaghan, J.M., Hutchison, M.L., 2012. Distribution and decline of human pathogenic bacteria in soil after application in irrigation water and the potential for soil-splash-mediated dispersal onto fresh produce. J. Appl. Microbiol. 112, 1007-1019.

Natvig, E.E., Ingham, S.C., Ingham, B.H., Cooperband, L.R., Roper, T.R., 2002. *Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium* and *Escherichia coli* contamination of root and leaf vegetables grown in soils with incorporated bovine manure. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 68, 2737-2744.

NSW/FA, New South Wales Food Authority,2007. Microbiological quality of fresh cut vegetables - A survey to determine the safety of fresh cut leafy salad vegetables sold in NSW. Available at th incorporated bovine manure. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 6

outh Wales Food Authority, 2007. Microbiological quality o

rvey to determine the safety of fresh cut leafy salad vegetab

authority.nsw.gov.au/sites/default/file

https://www.foodauthority.nsw.gov.au/sites/default/files/_Documents/scienceandtechnical/micro biological quality fresh cut vegetables.pdf. Accessed on March $5th$, 2020.

Oliveira, M., Vinas, I., Usall, J., Anguera, M., Abadias, M., 2012. Presence and survival of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 on lettuce leaves and in soil treated with contaminated compost and irrigation water. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 156, 133-140.

Ottoson, J.R., Nyberg, K., Lindqvist, R., Albihn, A., 2011. Quantitative microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157 on lettuce, based on survival data from controlled studies in a climate chamber. J. Food Prot. 74, 2000-2007.

OzNet, 2020. Australian Goverment, Department of Health, National Notifiable Diseases Surveilance System. Available at: http://www9.health.gov.au/cda/source/rpt_3.cfm. accessed on May 2^{nd} , 2020.

Pang, H., Lambertini, E., Buchanan, R.L., Schaffner, D.W., Pradhan, A.K., 2017. Quantitative microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh-cut lettuce. J. Food Prot. 80, 302-311.

Park, S., Navratil, S., Gregory, A., Bauer, A., Srinath, I., Szonyi, B., Nightingale, K., Anciso, J., Jun, M., Han, D., Lawhon, S., Ivanek, R., 2015. Count of generic *Escherichia col*i on spinach at the preharvest level determined by the multi-factorial effect of ambient temperature, precipitation, farm management and environmental factors. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 81, 793- 814.

Petri, E., Rodriguez, M., Garcia, S., 2015. Evaluation of combined disinfection methods for reducing *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 population on fresh-cut vegetables. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 12, 8678-8690.

Pouillot, R., Lubran, M.B., Cates, S.C., Dennis, S., 2010. Estimating parametric distributions of storage time and temperature of ready-to-eat foods for U.S. households. J. Food Prot. 73, 312- 321.

Ratkowsky, D.A., Olley, J., McMeekin, T.A., Ball, A., 1982. Relationship between temperature and growth rate of bacterial cultures. J. Bacteriol. 149, 1-5. Rekhy, R., McConchie, R., 2014. Promoting consumption of fruit and vegetables for better health. Have campaigns delivered on the goals? Appetite 79, 113-123.

Rodriguez, F.P., Campos, D., Ryser, E.T., Buchholz, A.L., Posada-Izquierdo, G.D., Marks, B.P., Zurera, G., Todd, E., 2011. A mathematical risk model for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 crosscontamination of lettuce during processing. Food Microbiol. 28, 694-701.

Russell, J.B., Jarvis, G.N., 2001. Practical mechanisms for interrupting the oral-fecal lifecycle of *Escherichia coli*. J. Mol. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 3, 265-272.

Shah, M.S., Eppinger, M., Shah, A.A., Hameed, A., Hasan, F., 2015. Multidrugresistant diarrheagenic *E. coli* pathotypes are associated with ready-to-eat salad and vegetables in Pakistan. J.Korean Soc.Appl. Biol. Chem. 58, 267–273.

Sidhu, J.P., Hanna, J., Toze, S.G., 2008. Survival of enteric microorganisms on grass surfaces irrigated with treated effluent. J Water Health 6, 255-262.

Smith, R., Cahn, M., Daugovish, O., Koike, S., Natwick, E., Smith, H., Subbarao, K., Takele, E., Turini, T.2011. Leaf lettuce production in California, University of California Agricultural and Natural Resources, 7216, 1-6. Available at https://anrcatalog.ucanr.edu/pdf/7216.pdf. Accessed on October $1st$, 2020. E., 2011.11 Indiversion ISR inoter to Estable 101 Celettical contracts

1.5, G.N., 2001. Practical mechanisms for interrupting the or

1. Mol. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 3, 265-272.

1. Mol. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 3, 265-272.

Soderstrom, A., Lindberg, A., Andersson, Y., 2005. EHEC O157 outbreak in Sweden from locally produced lettuce, August-September 2005. Euro Surveill. 10, E050922 050921. Stine, S.W., Song, I., Choi, C.Y., Gerba, C.P., 2005. Application of microbial risk assessment to the development of standards for enteric pathogens in water used to irrigate fresh produce. J. Food Prot. 68, 913-918.

Teunis,P.F.M., Ogden, I.D., Strachan, N.J.C. 2008. Hierarchical dose response of *E. coli* O157:H7 from human outbreaks incorporating heterogeneity in exposure. Epidemiol. Infect. 136, 761–770

Tromp, S.O., Rijgersberg, H., Franz, E., 2010. Quantitative microbial risk assessment for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella enterica*, and *Listeria monocytogenes* in leafy green vegetables consumed at salad bars, based on modeling supply chain logistics. J. Food Prot. 73, 1830-1840.

Turner, K., Moua, C.N., Hajmeer, M., Barnes, A., Needham, M., 2019. Overview of leafy greens-related food safety incidents with a California link: 1996 to 2016. J. Food Prot. 82, 405- 414.

Uyttendaele, M., Jaykus, L., Amoah, P., Chiodini, A., Cunliffe, D., Jacxsens, L., Holvoet, K., Korsten, L., Lau, M., McClure, P., Medema, G., Sampers, I., Jasti, P.R., 2015. Microbial hazards in irrigation water: standards, norms, and testing to manage use of water in fresh produce primary production. Compr. Rev. Food Sci. Food Saf. 14, 336–356. https://doi.org/10.1111/1541-4337.12133.

Veschetti, E., Cutilli, D., Bonadonna, L., Briancesco, R., Martini, C., Cecchini, G., Anastasi, P., Ottaviani, M., 2003. Pilot-plant comparative study of peracetic acid and sodium hypochlorite wastewater disinfection. Water Res. 37, 78-94.

Vorholt, J.A., 2012. Microbial life in the phyllosphere. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 10, 828-840.

WHO, World Health Oraganization, 2008. Microbiological risk assessment series. Microbiological hazards in fresh fruits and vegetables., in: Organization, W.H. (Ed.).

Yang, Y., Luo, Y., Millner, P., Turner, E., Feng, H., 2012. Assessment of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 transference from soil to iceberg lettuce via a contaminated field coring harvesting knife. Int. J. Food Microbio.l 153, 345-350. 12. Microbial life in the phyllosphere. Nat. Rev. Microbiol.

alth Oraganization, 2008. Microbiological risk assessment s

azzards in fresh fruits and vegetables., in: Organization, W.I

.., Millner, P., Turner, E., Feng,

Figure captions

Figure 1. Cumulative density functions for *E. coli* O157:H7 levels at harvest for a)seasonality

(baseline(summer): (95%CI=-5.97,3.19); autumn:(95%CI=-4.46,4.44); winter:(95%CI=-

5.28,3.50); spring:(95%CI=-8.42,1.13), and meterological factors (no solar (95%CI=1.74, 9.19);

no rain:(95%CI=-8.64,-1.14) and b) agricultural practices (baseline(summer): (95%CI=-

5.97,3.19); no manure (95%CI=-11.90, -2.96); tap water:(95%CI=-8.21,-0.27) surface

water:(95%CI=-5.19,2.81); reclaimed water:(95%CI=-3.98,4.05), c)irrigation types

(baseline(summer-overhead irrigation (95%CI=-5.97,3.19); drip irrigation:(95%CI=-13.06,-

3.98) furrow irrigation:(95%CI=-10.98,-1.89).

Figure 2. Tornado graph indicating the most important parameters and variables affecting *E. coli*

O157:H7 levels on lettuce during preharvest practices. Spearman's correlation coefficients

obtained from @Risk sensitivity analyses are shown next to each bar.

Figure 1a.

Figure 1b.

Figure 1c.

Table 2. Concentration of *Escherichia coli* in irrigation water (IW) and manure-amended soil (MAS) used for the baseline model.

* F(x) refers to the cumulative probability F(x) =i/(n+1), here i is the rank of the observed data point and n is the number of data used.

Table 3. Overview of inputs and distributions for baseline model for *E. coli* O157:H7 levels on lettuce during postharvest practices in Australia. CFU – colony forming unit.

Journal Pre-proof

Table 4. Overview of inputs and distributions for baseline model for *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 levels on Australian lettuce consumption behavior. eline model for *Escherich*

Example 2018 Journal Pre-proof

Table 6. Overview of preharvest conditions influencing *E. coli* O157:H7 distribution on lettuce at harvest (Log CFU/g) in different simulated scenarios.

Table 7. Comparison of number of illness cases per year and probability of illness per serving due to consumption of *E. coli* O157:H7 contaminated lettuce in Australia predicted by the baseline model and other intervention scenarios.

Example 3 Journal Pre-proof

Highlights:

- Development of a QMRA model for *E. coli* O157:H7 on cos lettuce based on Australian practices.
- The usage of manure and quality of irrigation water were found to be very relevant on pathogen level.
- *E. coli* O157:H7 levels over seasons influenced primarily by solar radiation and rainfall.
- The implementation of GAP is an important mitigation strategy within growers' control.
- Postharvest washing, and temperature control were identified as important risk control steps.
- Interpretation of food safety guidelines for lettuce production varies between countries.
- Risk management strategies should be based on local data for reliable risk *E. COIT OTSTERT* levels over seasons inhuenced primarity by solar rad
The implementation of GAP is an important mitigation strategy within
Postharvest washing, and temperature control were identified as impo
steps.
Interp

Conflict of Interest and Authorship Conformation Form

- All authors have participated in (a) conception and design, or analysis and interpretation of the data; (b) drafting the article or revising it critically for important intellectual content; and (c) approval of the final version.
- This manuscript has not been submitted to, nor is under review at, another journal or other publishing venue.
- The authors have no affiliation with any organization with a direct or indirect financial interest in the subject matter discussed in the manuscript

Million Sydney Journal