Multiple uses for old and new recordings: perspectives from the multilingual community of Warruwi

Isabel O’Keeffe
Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney
1 Conservatorium Rd. Sydney NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA
[isabel.okeeffe@sydney.edu.au]

Linda Barwick
Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney
1 Conservatorium Rd. Sydney NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA
[linda.barwick@sydney.edu.au]

Carolyn Coleman
Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney
1 Conservatorium Rd. Sydney NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA
[colemancarolync@gmail.com]

David Manmurulu
Warruwi Community
South Goulburn Island, via Winellie, NT 0822, Australia
[warruwimusicians@gmail.com]

Jenny Manmurulu
Warruwi School
PMB 90, via Winellie, NT 0822, Australia
[jenny.manmurulu@ntschools.net]

Janet Gardjilart Bumarda Mardbinda
Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney
1 Conservatorium Rd. Sydney NSW 2006 AUSTRALIA

Paul Naragoidj
Juninga Centre
113 Dick Ward Drive, Coconut Grove, NT 0810, Australia

Ruth Singer
School of Languages & Linguistics, University of Melbourne
Babel (Building 139), The University of Melbourne, Parkville, VIC 3010, Australia
[rsinger@unimelb.edu.au]

Abstract
This paper reports on collaborative research by a team of linguists, musicologists, elders, educators and young people from the multilingual Indigenous community of Warruwi (South Goulburn Island, Northern Territory, Australia). A key aim of the various projects has been to make recordings available to the community and to equip and empower community members to be involved in the documentation and to control how old and new recordings are used.

In this paper, we report on the repatriation of archival recordings of language and song at Warruwi and discuss how the Warruwi community uses these recordings—and more recent recordings by the research team—for maintenance or revitalisation purposes. Different perspectives will be provided by various members of the community. We demonstrate
the need for researchers to have ongoing discussions with community members to inform collaborative research and to ensure communities are empowered to have control over recorded materials and determine priorities for ongoing documentation and revitalisation projects.

**Collaborative documentation of the linguistic and musical diversity of Warruwi**

The western Arnhem Land region of the Northern Territory of Australia is highly multilingual. In the community of Warruwi on South Goulburn Island, most adults speak between three and eight languages and most children grow up speaking at least two Indigenous languages (Singer and Harris 2016:1-2). Figure 1 shows a reconstruction of the pre-contact associations between land and language in the western Arnhem Land region, with the languages spoken at Warruwi underlined. In a regional creation story, the ancestral female creator being, Warramurungunjиде, is said to have placed these languages into the landscape, and then placed people there to speak the languages (Evans 2010; O’Keeffe 2017).

![Figure 1: A reconstruction of pre-contact land/language associations in western Arnhem Land](image)

Warruwi is also one of the centres of musical diversity in the region. Many different song-sets (repertoires) of manyardi—a genre of public dance-songs from western Arnhem Land performed by men and accompanied by didjeridu and clapsticks—are still being performed, composed and learned by younger people (Barwick et al. 2007; Brown 2016; Brown et al. in press; O’Keeffe 2017).46 These song-sets are inherited from male relatives and associated with particular language varieties of the region. At least 14 different manyardi song-sets have been recorded at Warruwi since the 1940s (see details in Brown et al. forthcoming; Brown 2016; O’Keeffe 2017). These include recordings of D. Mannmurulu’s Injalaarrku ‘mermaid’ song-set, made in collaboration with him and his family (Barwick et al. 2011-2015; Brown 2016; O’Keeffe 2017).

For over a decade, a team of linguists, musicologists, Indigenous ceremony holders, educators and young people have been working together on projects documenting different languages and songs at Warruwi.47 These projects have involved repatriating archival recordings, as well as creating new ones, and build on the Warruwi community’s engagement with researchers and language work over the previous two decades, particularly during the bilingual program from 1974 to 1998. For example, Naragoidj was a teacher in the Mawng bilingual program at the Warruwi school and, as well as producing Mawng materials for this program, he worked closely with Coleman to create Kunbarlang materials and the draft Kunbarlang dictionary (Coleman n.d.).48 In the current Kunbarlang project, funded by ELDP, Coleman and Naragoidj are working together again, along with others, to check and

---

45 Map by Chandra Jayasuria (University of Melbourne) commissioned by Isabel O’Keeffe and edited by David Bickerdike. Based on various linguistic data compiled by Mark Harvey, and Binjin Gunwok dialect information (written in uppercase on the map) by Evans (2003).

46 Manyardi is the term used in Mawng and Iwaidja and by some Kunbarlang speakers (other Kunbarlang speakers use the term mandulenge). The term kun-borrk is used in Binjin Gunwok and the term borrk is used in Burarra. We use the term manyardi throughout this paper.

47 Projects include Singer’s PhD project researching Mawng (Singer 2006; Singer 2016), the Mawng dictionary project (Singer et al. 2015) and her DECRA research project ‘What makes a multilingual community?’, ‘The Western Arnhem Land Song Project’ funded by the Hans Rausing Endangered Language Documentation Programme led by Barwick, Marett and Evans (Barwick et al. 2011-2015); PhD research projects on songs by Brown (2016) and O’Keeffe (2017); Kunbarlang documentation projects by Singer, O’Keeffe and Coleman funded by the Endangered Language Documentation Programme; an ARC Discovery Project led by Barwick, Marett and Thomas (‘Intercultural inquiry into a trans-national context: exploring the legacy of the 1948 American-Australian Scientific Expedition to Arnhem land’). Mardbinda has been a research assistant on a number of these projects and Naragoidj, J. Mannmurulu and D. Mannmurulu have been consultants and advisors.

48 Coleman was Regional Linguist for the Northern Territory Department of Education from 1989 to 2001, and previously wrote a sketch grammar of Kunbarlang for her Honours thesis (Coleman 1989). She notes that, although the bilingual program at Warruwi was officially Mawng, the principal and teacher-linguist fully supported work on other community languages. Kunbarlang materials created include numerous short illustrated stories for teaching children, including one now available on the Living Archive of Aboriginal Languages website (see Naragoidj 1998).
expand the dictionary and to empower young people to be involved in the documentation and maintenance of Kunbarlang.

Recordings made as part of the different research projects have been archived in various places including AIATSIS, ELAR and PARADISEC. All these newer recordings, plus many archival recordings discovered during the projects, are currently on the Warruwi Language Centre computer.

In the following sections, we report on some of the ways that these are being used by members of the Warruwi community, their hopes for the ways they can be used in the future and a consideration of some ways to ensure community control of recordings and their uses.

Multiple uses for recordings

In discussions over the years, and in recent interviews, community members at Warruwi have expressed their views about the multiple uses they would like from recordings. An overarching theme about using recordings is that they want them to be used to teach young people their languages, songs and cultural practices, so they can maintain them and keep them strong.

As D. Manmurulu pointed out in an interview with Mardbinda and Singer:

> What’s the main thing [I want from recordings]? … Like for me it’s talk about the song and recording and also teaching the young generation. That’s my main thing (D. Manmurulu, RS1-488 00:01:34.000 - 00:02:13.100).

Similarly, Naragoidj’s focus is young people. Speaking in Kunbarlang and English to O’Keeffe about the way he wanted recorded materials to be turned into books, he said:

> Ngarrkikimarnbunj bibudbe for the young people. Ngudduburlurbunj kanjbaddangunjdje read and write kanjbaddarnanj nayi djurra. La kirnda ngorro kayuwa kuyi kanjbaddaburlurbunj.

We’ll make it [a book] for the young people. You know, when they read and write they’ll see that book. And it will be there and they’ll know it [i.e., learn from that book] (Naragoidj, 20150413IOv01 00:09:56.488-00:10:11.903).

Old recordings are considered particularly valuable for teaching young people. As Mardbinda and Manmurulu discuss:

> I think they [the old recordings] are good for me to listen to the old people, they were telling the story, and [I’m] transcribing them in Mawng and Kunwinjku as well. Sometimes in Kunbarlang. But especially in Mawng. They speak the old Mawng or something (Mardbinda, RS1-488 00:04:06.050 - 00:04:26.750).

Yeah, I think that the old one is very important for us and the new generation to teach them (D. Manmurulu, RS1-488 00:04:26.700 - 00:04:38.500).

For community languages such as Mawng and Bininj Gunwok that are still being learned by children, recordings are largely used to help with maintenance. However, J. Manmurulu argues that recordings may need to be used for revitalisation purposes in the future, new recordings need to be made and kept safe and languages need to be used in various contexts:

> J. Manmurulu: In our school or out in the community we still talk to our kids strong in our language to keep our language strong … We still need those languages to continue to keep it strong for the next generation and for our future. So if we do die well our children will speak, continue speaking and teaching. Well they have to record and put it away somewhere safe where maybe one day these people will say, “oh how bout we go back and look that language where our ancestors were talking, so we’ll try and learn …

> […]

> D. Manmurulu: But here on Goulburn Island we keep our language very strong

> J. Manmurulu: We keeping it strong. But yes, as you say, it might die sooner or later. That’s why we teaching our kids not only teaching but the parents are strong to teach in Mawng … Language it’s really important … This is what we arguing for: we want to teach our kids in language in the school, at home, under the tree, where you go camping, so keep our language strong (D. Manmurulu et al. 2014a).

Warruwi Language Centre computer archive

The Warruwi Language Centre is situated on the Warruwi School grounds and came about through a partnership organised by Singer between the school and the University of Melbourne. The Centre houses all the old readers and teaching materials produced during the bilingual program. On the Language Centre iMac computer are hundreds of recordings of stories and

---

49 AIATSIS Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies; ELAR Endangered Languages Archive; PARADISEC Pacific and Regional Archive for Digital Sources in Endangered Cultures.
songs, including archival recordings repatriated from
the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait
Islander Studies (AIATSIS) and more recent recordings
(such as those by Barwick, Brown, Mardbinda,
O’Keeffe and Singer in collaboration with community
members). Some of the songs and narratives are
organised into playlists in iTunes. Community members
can listen to recordings at the Language Centre and
make copies of materials onto USB thumbdrives.

Although there is no current funding for ongoing staff at
the Language Centre, it continues to provide a base for
ongoing research projects: Mardbinda does much of her
research assistance work from the Centre, and J.
Manmurulu uses it to source resources for the
Indigenous Language and Culture program she teaches
at Warruwi school.

Mawng Ngaralk website and Facebook page

The Mawng Ngaralk (‘Mawng language’) website was
designed by Singer with Marion Singer and built by
Robyn Loughman. It was initially funded by an
Indigenous Languages Support grant in 2014 with the
aim to support community languages spoken at
Warruwi and to make research recordings accessible to
the community (Singer et al. 2017). Numerous videos
are available in Mawng, along with an online and
downloadable version of the Mawng dictionary (Singer
et al. 2015). Videos also represent other community
languages including Kunbarlang and Kunwinjku. Singer
also created a Mawng Ngaralk Facebook page, which
has regular links to different videos and other
information on the website. Mardbinda has been
involved in creating some of the videos and transcribing
and translating videos to create subtitles.

The website and Facebook page have had a very
positive reception. As D. Manmurulu expressed in an
interview with Mardbinda:

I think it’s very useful … to put [recordings] on
the website so people can see, so they will
think, ‘ah, this is what the old people were
doing and all that,’ you know, yeah. (RS1-488
00:04:49.550 - 00:05;16.950)

Mardbinda also thought it was good that people could
watch ‘The Nowhere Girls’ drama series that she helped
to create with filmmaker Liz Langslow:

It’s numalal [‘good’] for them to see it [the
‘Nowhere Girls’ drama series] on the website
(Mardbinda, RS1-488 00:25:28.950 -
00:25:33.250)

The website and Facebook Page have also helped
Mawng speakers who do not live at Warruwi to
maintain their language:

I love following this page [Mawng Ngaralk
Facebook page]. I love how I come across it
and it shows me the very little things we have
in our language that sometimes I forget about.
It’s hard living away from home and don’t get
me wrong but I do sometimes forget some
words, not because I’m losing my language but
because I have nobody to talk to as much in
maung [Mawng] at home than usual … We are
lucky to have Ruth Singer as our linguist, she
spent a lot of time working with the elders and
put in so much work and determination into
getting the Mawng dictionary, putting it
together, our language is important and we
should keep it alive! (Geraldine Narul,
comment on a Facebook post on the Mawng
Ngaralk page, 28/8/17, quoted with
permission).

The Mawng bird app

J. Manmurulu and Singer, along with other researchers,
have been involved in the project ‘Getting in touch:
language and digital inclusion in Australian Indigenous
communities’ (Carew et al. 2015). This has included the
development of different mobile applications, including
the Mawng bird app, Karlurri pata kwawurlurrangken
dawa (‘Birds’), available on iTunes and
Google Play. Singer and Mardbinda linked Mawng
words with the English and scientific names and used
Coleman’s comparative list of bird names in western
Arnhem Land for initial checking of the names of the 50
birds (and calls) in the app. The app is one of a number
of Indigenous bird apps built on the open-source Jila
framework, created by Thoughtworks, and there is a
template ready to use for the Kunbarlang bird app
(Carew et al. 2015).

J. Manmurulu points out the importance of using new
technology to engage the younger generation in learning
and maintaining their languages:

Because in the 21st Century, our kids will be
digitalised kids, digital kids, we’re changing
new things, trying out new things that really
suits us and suits the kids (D. Manmurulu et al.
2014).

J. Manmurulu and Singer have trialled the app in one of
the classes at Warruwi school, and J. Manmurulu plans

50 Coleman remembers that there was a similar computer
dedicated to Language work maintained by the principal and

51 The previous iMac Language Centre computer (provided by
the ‘Western Arnhem Land Song Project’ funded by ELDP)
had a CD/DVD burner; however, most people now prefer
copies of materials on USB thumbdrives so it does not appear
to matter that the new iMac does not have a CD/DVD burner.
(This computer was donated by St Leonards Brighton, a
school with an exchange program with Warruwi School).

52 Ongoing maintenance of the website now relies on a small
grant for research into how digital media can support
Indigenous languages.
to use it with other classes next term as part of the Indigenous Language and Culture program she runs. O’Keeffe with Coleman, Mardbinda, Naragoidj and others plan to create a Kunbarlang version over the next 12 months.

**Performance practices**

Recordings have been used by community members to help teach and revive old songs, as well as integrate them into new hybrid performances.

As D. Manmurulu pointed out in responding to Singer’s question about old recordings of songs:

Singer: Do you think people use the recordings of old files to learn them again?

D. Manmurulu: This what we trying to do, to bring young people in and teach them the old songs, who the old people were singing, so they can sing (00:30:28.300 - 00:31:28.800).

Barwick, Brown and O’Keeffe have all seen examples of musicians listening to archival or more recent recordings of songs before practicing them.

Recordings of D. Manmurulu’s songs have also been used for a young boys’ dance competition performance that began with traditional Inyjalarrku music and dancing then changed to hip hop music and dancing:53

Yeah, she [the dance teacher] asked me if I could come and sing for those boys, but I told her there’s a recording somewhere. So, they got it and I was here with them and first was Inyjalarrku first singing on the recording, singing stopped, then that [hip hop] music, same time. And they came out and they danced standing and painting themselves and then they started dancing. And this is how when they went to Darwin, they won! (D. Manmurulu, RS1-488 00:15:08.950 - 00:16:18.850)

D. Manmurulu as the songman custodian of the Inyjalarrku songs was appropriately consulted and was closely involved in the use of the recording for this dance competition, including teaching the boys the correct Inyjalarrku dancing.54 However, he is concerned about the interest in using his recordings by people outside the community, because manyardi are supposed to be performed by the appropriate songman custodian and his male relatives.

This [American ballet] mob now ... what I've heard is they wanted Inyjalarrku to record and make that song for those other [ballet] mob to sing and dance on balanda ['white people’] side, that's why we going to Melbourne [for the Indigenous Music Symposium] to talk about that too. But this is important for us, it's a spiritual song. Otherwise I'm not too sure, maybe they'll [the ballet company] get sick if they play around with this Inyjalarrku, they get sick, or I get sick. It's a spiritual song ... we say nyunyuk ['sacred']. That's why I just told them ‘no, you can't do that’. You can record and hear it, but not for making up [dances] yourself or get kids to dance, no that's not it. Like in balanda [white people’s] song that's ok, you can, anyone can dance to put that music and dance, but not manyardi, Inyjalarrku no, that's main one. They can't mucking around with it! (RS1-488 00:19:47.250 - 00:22:02.350)

We are therefore considering together the best ways to make manyardi recordings accessible, but to provide warnings to safeguard them from being used in the wrong ways.

**Future uses for recordings**

People have also expressed their interest in creating books and films from existing and new recordings. As D. Manmurulu and Mardbinda said in responding to an interview question by Singer about future uses of recordings:

Put it [the recordings] in a... mainly on book or video [DVD]... So sometimes like if you forget, then put it on video [DVD], see it. If no, if video [DVD] break, then book, yeah. Both ways, so book can last bit longer (D. Manmurulu, RS1-488 00:53:53.000 - 00:54:31.900).

I think it's nungmalal ['good'], like put it on a book or something ... And make a CD, like on the back or something, maybe with a book and CD (Mardbinda, RS1-488 00:54:36.200 - 00:54:57.300)

Similarly, Naragoidj has spoken in Kunbarlang about wanting to make nayi narlengbinbin djurra ['a big/fully grown book'] and said ngamahulunj kurleng stories ['I want lots of stories [for it]'] (20150413IOv01). He is also keen to see the completion and publication of the Kunbarlang dictionary.

The research teams plan to continue working consultatively with community members so that new materials can be created from the existing and new recordings.

**Community control of recordings**

Along with making recordings available to community members, another key aim of the various projects has been to equip and empower community members to be involved in the documentation and to control how old

---

53 A video of the performance is on YouTube: [https://youtu.be/DOK3wE3syNC](https://youtu.be/DOK3wE3syNC)

54 A video of D. Manmurulu teaching the boys is on YouTube: [https://youtu.be/WaCUClQeELo](https://youtu.be/WaCUClQeELo)
and new recordings are used. For example, Singer and O’Keeffe have been providing training and mentoring for Mardbinda and other community members to learn to use various recording devices and transcription software. Mardbinda has also assisted with consultation with speakers, family members and others in the community about which recordings can be put on the Mawng Ngaralk website. D. Manmurulu, J. Manmurulu and Naragoidj, along with other community members, have been closely involved in advising researchers on community protocols around recording, archiving and accessibility of recordings. These protocols include the need to restrict some materials to people of a particular gender, or restricting materials after the death of the speaker or singer.

The Mawng Ngaralk website includes a section ‘Women and girls only’ holding narratives that are not supposed to be heard by men or boys. In Singer’s consultation, the speaker and other women were confident that the label ‘Women and girls only’ would be respected by men and boys. In contrast, some women at Maningrida who had been happy to record a women’s only story in Kunbarlang with Aung Si (a male researcher) told Coleman and O’Keeffe that they did not want this story on the website at all, but were happy for it to be archived with restrictions on access.

Across Australian Indigenous societies, there are some common protocols about restricting recordings or images of a deceased person for a period of time determined by the relatives of the deceased. The periods of time determined by relatives can vary considerably, from around six months to up to four years, and there appear to be some cultural shifts to less restrictions in some Indigenous communities (see for example the discussion about this in the Warumungu community of Central Australia by Christen 2012:333). At Warruwi, some individuals have been saying that they are happy for their families to not restrict their images and voices, but others want recordings to be restricted for a much longer period of time after a person’s passing. Given the varying views of different individuals and families within the Warruwi community (and communities across western Arnhem Land). D. Manmurulu explained that it is important to take images and voices off websites when someone is newly deceased because of the conflict that can occur if people are shocked or upset by seeing or hearing these.

Mardbinda: Can you explain why it is important to take photos/videos/recordings off the website when a speaker/singer passes away?

D. Manmurulu: … yeah, you can do that because, you know, lately when like still new [newly deceased], when the person die and then somebody might put it [recordings] on to website and some families don't know, long as they see through website and they get shock there and they get bit upset and they start talking, you know, they say 'who put this on website?' Sometimes we just big argument now, big fight, yeah. Something like that (RS1-488 00:37:33.750 - 00:39:15.000).

D. Manmurulu also discussed the fact that he is happy for his images and voice to be unrestricted after his passing, and is telling his family this, but the decision will ultimately be for his family to make:

Like to me it's, that's ok … if I die and they can put it through whatever bluetooth or through website, like for myself dancing doing the giant dance or something like that, so if I pass away but still my photo gonna be there, yeah… that's up to my family if they want to do that [restrict images and recordings]. But when I die, before I die, I always tell them, I'll tell them that 'you leave my photo anything hanging on the wall, doesn't matter if I die but, they'll be our remembrance and things. But you can put it away if you want for maybe, not a year, but maybe for 6 months, then put it back on again, yeah’. But I will tell them before I die! (D. Manmurulu, RS1-488 00:41:51.450 - 00:43:30.600).

Naragoidj has also indicated that he is happy for all the recordings of him to remain public, even after he has passed away.

Researchers also need to be sensitive when repatriating archival recordings, because hearing the voices of deceased in older recordings can also provoke feelings of sadness, even if these feelings are mixed with more positive feelings about hearing the voices of their relatives and remembering back as Mardbinda and D. Manmurulu discussed with Singer:

Mardbinda: At first when I heard the recording of my wawa it felt like (like he passed away a

---

55 This builds on previous community engagement with language work and ensuring community control at Warruwi. For example, Coleman notes that Northern Territory Department of Education linguists and teacher-linguists in bilingual programs (such as Warruwi) insisted that statements of NT Government copyright to Indigenous language work, should include explicit reference to the intellectual property rights of traditional owners and speakers of Indigenous languages.

56 Georgia Curran also notes that this has been the case with her work at Yuendumu: ‘Warlpiri women’s desire to have their songs remembered seems to override these previously observed restrictions so that often songs are played with voices of deceased people quite soon after their death. This is also the case with images – sometimes at funerals now there is even a large portrait photo of the deceased person projected on to a big screen in front of everyone’ (pers. comm. 26/09/17).
few years ago) and when he made the recording I felt like, that's *numalal*, but I didn't want to do it, like transcribe it just yet. But then I would do it again [later].

Singer: How do you feel when you hear those old recordings from family who’ve passed away?

D. Manmurulu: Well I feel a bit sad, but I really wanted to hear more, yeah. I'm happy yeah. Sometimes when I hear it reminds me back when I was young boy and I was with him, singing, that's where I was learning that I was singing with my father (RS1-488 00:08:19.650 - 00:09:27.200).

Community members have advised Singer and O’Keeffe when materials need to be taken down from the website or restricted for a period of time in the archives and the different archive collections have metadata providing information about who to contact in the event of a speaker or singer’s death. However, further discussions are needed about the best way to be able to manage this and allow community control into the future. Coleman notes that debates in the 1990s in some communities centred around the need for communities to have control by keeping materials only in their community. However, various events such as natural disasters destroying materials at Language Centres and new staff at schools discarding materials from the old bilingual program convinced most people of the need for safekeeping in archives, provided there are appropriate access conditions.  

Conclusions

In this paper, we have shown that there are multiple uses for the old and new recordings at Warruwi. Given the range of different perspectives from members of the Warruwi community (and beyond) about the use of materials and ways they may or may not need to be restricted, we argue that researchers need to have ongoing discussions with community members to inform collaborative research and access protocols for recordings. This will be particularly important as we navigate changes in technology and new protocols for materials online. We argue that researchers need to ensure that communities are equipped and empowered to have control over recorded materials and determine priorities for ongoing documentation, maintenance and revitalisation projects.

Acknowledgements

We acknowledge the ongoing support of the Warruwi Community and Warruwi School. We also acknowledge the funding that has supported this research from: the Hans Raising Endangered Languages Programme, the Australian Research Council, the University of Sydney, the University of Melbourne, Batchelor Institute, and the Australian Government Indigenous Languages and Arts Program.

References


O’Keeffe, I. (2016-2019). *Comprehensive pan-varietal, ethnobiological, anthropological record of*
Kunbarlang.
https://elar.soas.ac.uk/Collection/MPI1032014


