TELEMANN, THE FAITHFUL MUSIC-MASTER:
TELEMANN PERFORMANCE AND RECEPTION IN AUSTRALIAN MUSIC CULTURE SINCE 1981

Dennis Dorwick

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of Requirements for the degree of Master of Music (Musicology)
Sydney Conservatorium of Music
University of Sydney
2017
Abstract

Why has Telemann’s music, better known and accepted during his lifetime than that of his contemporaries, fallen away in the awareness of the today’s general listening public and many musicians? This project was prompted by that question. Early exploration of this topic showed there are signs his music is being reassessed by both Australian musicians and audiences alike. In order to more clearly establish the place of Telemann’s music in today’s Australian musical culture it became clear that documentary evidence is scant but that talking with those engaged within this culture may help to develop a clearer picture.

In this paper, I explore the complex and changing reception of Telemann’s music through a historiographic analysis, as well as a multi-sited ethnographic study of eighteen Australian musickers to investigate the place of his music within their life-histories. Through their stories and memories we can better understand something of the changing place of early music in Australian musical culture. Participant birth years range from the 1940s through to the 1990s while their birth places include seven different Australian cities and three other countries (Bahrain, Germany, New Zealand). Rather than base this study within the broadly heterogeneous world of tertiary music institutions, I aimed instead to discover how the work and interests of a broader range of participants have influenced the knowledge and reception of Telemann’s music within Australia.

While the pathway of each participant is unique, this research also shows that intersecting pathways may form networks through which knowledge, enthusiasm, and collegial sharing flows, producing surprising results. I claim that amongst those who know and understand Telemann’s music as well as the history and culture from which it sprang, it is becoming core repertoire ripe for wider revival. This is happening, in part, through the agency of exactly the kinds of people interviewed for this research.

Keywords: Telemann, Early Music, Historiography, Multi-Sited Ethnography, Musickers, Reception.
Preface

Approval for this research project titled: “Georg Philipp Telemann: a survey of performance of this music in Australia since 1981” was granted by The University of Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee. This project was assigned the identifier: HERC Project No. 2014/582 (Appendix A). Eighteen participants granted permission in writing for semi-structured interviews to be recorded, transcribed, and used in the writing up of this research. All participants also granted permission in writing for their names to be recorded in the reporting of this research. I warmly thank them for their kind and generous act.

The participants are:
Acknowledgements

A number of people and institutions have guided and supported my efforts. I am grateful for the calm and wise assistance of all these people. Dr Alan Maddox invariably responded to my worried queries with sensible advice and often with a gentle prompt to consider looking at matters more deeply or more broadly. Associate Dean Kathleen Nelson helped me through the early stages of being a postgraduate student again and reassured me as I faced administrative hitches. Professor Linda Barwick suggested I read five classics of ethnomusicology which helped me to position this project with greater confidence. Dr Michael Webb broadened my understanding of ethnomusicology. Brian Taylor kindly guided me, as a novice, through the thickets of academic German translation.

To these people engaged in the daily creation of a healthy and engaging music education institution, I give thanks: Dr Rachel Campbell, Marie Chellos, Timothy Crowe, Dr David Larkin, Dr Neal Peres Da Costa, Professor Anna Reid, Ludwig Sugiri, Dr James Wierzbicki, and Stephen Yates.

To fellow Telemann enthusiasts, Steven Zohn and Brian Stewart, who have generously shared ideas and suggested threads to useful resources, thank you.

To libraries and cultural institutions and their staffs who sustain our Australian culture, maintain living collections for research, and provide quiet rooms and well-lit desks, thank you: Sutherland Shire Library (especially its Reference Collection), the State Libraries of New South Wales, Tasmania, and Victoria, the Australian National Library, University of Sydney Fisher and Conservatorium Libraries, University of Melbourne (Balliol Library and the Louise Hanson-Dyer Music Library), and the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (especially ABC Classic FM).

To dear friends who have sustained and comforted me, opened their homes during my travel, and enabled this research, thank you: Sue Ennis, Pixie Errey, Robin Errey, Diane and Roger Gabb, Bruce and Elaine Henry. To Nigel Kellaway, actor, theatre-maker, and musician with whom I first explored Telemann’s Methodical Sonatas, thank you.

And to my wife, Catherine Errey, without whom none of this would have even been considered, thank you.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. ii
Preface ..................................................................................................................................... iii
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................... iv
Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1

Scope and Methodology – Ethnomusicology and Musicology ........................................... 2
Early Music... terminology ................................................................................................. 5
Limitations ............................................................................................................................ 6
Claim ...................................................................................................................................... 6

Chapter 1 – Telemann and Historiography ........................................................................ 8

Telemann Alive - (1681-1767) ......................................................................................... 8
After Telemann - from 1767 – Changes begin ..................................................................... 11
Changes in aesthetic ideals and their long-lasting effects .................................................... 12
After Telemann – from WWII: Other ways of thinking – then and now ......................... 15

Chapter 2 – Seeger’s cake: Telemann in today’s world ...................................................... 21

Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 21

A few words about words – early music ........................................................................... 22
Historical Musicology – early music story-tellers ................................................................. 23
Historically-Informed Performance (HIP) – Practice & Criticism ....................................... 25
Musical Aesthetics ................................................................................................................ 29
Ethnography – a tool for musicologists ............................................................................... 31
Conclusion ............................................................................................................................ 35

Chapter 3 – Methodology ................................................................................................. 37

Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 37

Methodology ........................................................................................................................ 37
Selection of Participants ....................................................................................................... 37
Interview transcription and analysis .................................................................................... 38
Limitations ............................................................................................................................. 40
Semi-structured Interview Schedule Design ............................................................................40
A Few Words About What Follows ..........................................................................................41
Chapter 4 – Kenner und Liebhaber – connoisseurs and enthusiasts ........................................42
Introduction ................................................................................................................................42
Looking Back to Telemann ........................................................................................................44
Pathways – Telemann & Today? ...............................................................................................48
Reading the data: Questions arising .........................................................................................48
Questions about reception ..........................................................................................................48
Reframing an analysis: from historiography to ethnology ........................................................49
But first the statistics ................................................................................................................50
Chapter 5 – Reading the Data – Part 1 ....................................................................................51
Birth Years 1940s & 1950s ........................................................................................................51
Hans D. Schroeder – entrepreneur & President of Australian Bach Society ..........................52
Rosalind Halton – musicologist (early Italian Baroque), harpsichordist and teacher ..........57
Peter Webb – oboist and cor anglais player (retired), composer and conductor ..................61
Janice (Jan) B. Stockigt – musicologist, Honorary of Melbourne Conservatorium of Music ....64
Ruth Wilkinson – recorder and viola da gamba player and teacher ......................................67
Greg Dikmans – baroque flute and recorder, teacher ...............................................................70
Lyn & Peter Hawkins – president and secretary, respectively, of The Early Music Society of Victoria ................................................................................................................................................73
Chapter 6 – Reading the Data – Part 2 ....................................................................................78
Birth Years 1960s, 1970s, 1990s ................................................................................................78
Birth years 1960s ......................................................................................................................78
Sue Collins – Coordinator of Strings and Orchestral Music and teacher of violin at the
Conservatorium of Music, University of Tasmania .................................................................79
Anne-Marie Forbes – Graduate Research Coordinator and Senior Lecturer in Musicology,
Conservatorium of Music, University of Tasmania .................................................................79
Gary Ekkel – Secondary school music teacher, choral director, baroque flute player ..........87
Hans-Dieter Michatz – teacher, recorder player ......................................................................87
Samantha Owens – musicology and baroque oboe – New Zealand School of Music

Neal Peres Da Costa – historical keyboard and musicology – Sydney Conservatorium of Music

Phillip Sametz – Presenter ABC Classic FM, singer

Stephen Yates – Administrative Assistant - Sydney Conservatorium of Music, composer

Birth decades 1970s & 1990s

Megan Lang – baroque flute player and teacher at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music; teacher of Sadler

Liane Sadler – baroque flute player, honours graduate of Sydney Conservatorium of Music; student of Lang

Conclusion

Pathways – a summary

Telemann, networks, pathways – a convergence

Chapter 7 – Telemann, Pathways, Networks – a concluding essay

Prelude

Overview

Seeger’s tools for musicology

Setting the scene – Handel and Telemann – deux hommes galants

Toward Telemann’s smile? – outcomes of a qualitative study

Telemann on the fringes

Telemann returning

Telemann at the core

From Pathways to Networks

Closing

Appendix A - Semi-structured Interview Schedules & HREC Project Approval letter

Interview Schedule A1 – 3 September 2014

Interview Schedule A2 – 7 March 2015

Interview Question Schedule (Supplement)

HREC Project Approval Letter – 29 August 2014

Appendix B – Participant Interview Summaries
Introduction

In 1980 the Australian musicologist, Janice Stockigt, received a Master of Music degree with a thesis on the problems of editing and performing Baroque music with a special focus on Telemann’s *der getreue Music-Meister*, the first German music periodical intended for amateur musicians (1728).\(^1\) The title of this thesis is based on an English translation of it. Seven years earlier Telemann, the faithful music-master, had arrived in Hamburg, a city with a growing middle class keen to make music *themselves*. This is a study of how his music has fared over time and to assess its place in today’s Australian musical landscape.

In 1985, five years after Stockigt’s thesis appeared, Brian Douglas Stewart opened his PhD dissertation on Telemann in Hamburg with this observation:

> Of all 18th-century composers, Georg Philipp Telemann is surely the most paradoxical. He is a figure surrounded by contradiction and plagued by misunderstanding. His contemporaries considered him to be the greatest composer in living memory, but today he is regarded at best as a minor master. He was once renowned for his great oratorios and cantatas, but now he is known for little but chamber music. He experimented throughout his life with the newest musical styles and genres, yet today we hear few but his most conservative pieces. He was a man deeply committed to the ideals of the Enlightenment, but modern scholars insist on calling him ”Baroque.” Enigmatic and misunderstood, Telemann has not weathered the storms of history well. It is time to find out why, and to take a fresh look at this man who was called the Orpheus of his day.\(^2\)

This paradoxical contradiction is played out in a Lee Lorenz New Yorker Magazine cartoon of 1982 of advertising signs outside a concert hall promoting “ALL THE GEORG PHILIPP TELEMANN YOU CAN STAND”.\(^3\) Just a few years after the cartoon’s publication, Stewart writes that Telemann’s music was then known principally for a small number of chamber works giving the public an unjust and incomplete impression.\(^4\) Recent and extensive work of Telemann scholars Steven Zohn, Jeanne Swack and others, institutions such as the *Telemann Zentrum Magdeburg*, and many new recordings and live performances of his music have

---

helped to give us a clearer understanding of Telemann's gifts. However, it is still not uncommon to hear slighting comments about its quality made by respected musicians. The purpose of this study is to clarify why this is so and, by way of ethnographic interviews with Australian musicians, scholars and others, to establish a clearer understanding of educational and cultural factors which either promote or limit Telemann's place in today's teaching and performance repertoire.

From these preliminaries three questions arose:

- Why was Telemann, such a well-known and respected composer at the time of his death, so dismissed by following generations?
- What are the factors which now make it possible for audiences to hear and musicians to play a much wider range of his repertoire and to enjoy it?
- Considering the time since the Telemann tercentenary in 1981, what can now be said about the reception of his music in Australia? What research methods can best help to answer this question?

**Scope and Methodology – Ethnomusicology and Musicology**

Australian research on Telemann has largely been focused on studies of particular works or repertoire and not on issues of reception. It is timely, therefore, to hear of the history and practices of living Australian performers, scholars and other musickers in order to better understand Telemann's present place in the web of our living musical culture. Taking the Australian scene, with its international links to American and European strands of musical practice and therefore somewhat more broadly representative as a case study of a discrete and manageable project, offers a cohort of musickers through whom to analyse the reciprocal relationships between performance, research, and changing aesthetic ideals which have had such an influence on the reception of Telemann's music.

---


6 Phillip Sametz, an ABC Classic FM programmer and presenter, spoke of the steady increase in the number and quality of new recordings of music of Telemann. (Interview with this author, 2015) The mildly flippant comments about Telemann's music were made to me in 2014 by senior Australian music academics. Out of discretion I conceal their identities.

7 Christopher Small, *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998). The terms 'musicking' and 'musickers' were conceived by Small to encompass a broader range of roles of those involved in the music-making endeavour than solely performers, but can also include listeners, librarians, reviewers, managers, and so on.
While ethnographic research is often conducted using principles of anonymity for participants, the broader purpose of this research is to contribute to a history of those involved in recent early music performance and scholarship in Australia. All eighteen participants have generously agreed to be named in the reporting of this research. Other similar ethnographic music performance research studies based in Europe and America can be found in the work of Finnegan, Cottrell, Shelemay, and Sherman. Studies of individuals in the Australian cultural environment such as Patricia Duke's 2005 thesis on early music performers in Melbourne to 1970 have been rare. This research will extend the record of musickers involved with early music beyond 1970 and the geographic locus of her study to other cities of Australia. The year 1981 marked the tercentenary of Telemann's birth, a 'hook' used by early music groups and soloists. A search during early stages of this project revealed two such groups established in 1981, each named 'The Telemann Ensemble', one based in Melbourne and the other in Townsville, Queensland. Neither group was then aware of the other. Aside from this curiosity, documents such as concert programs or reviews of recording or concerts are rare in major Australian collections although TROVE (an online archive of the National Library of Australia) is increasingly offering surprising finds.

It seemed, however, that a richer resource would be found in the memories of musicians and others such as those who have contributed to this project. This research is based, therefore, upon a multi-sited ethnographic survey of the experience and practices of a wide range of Australian-based musickers. Over sixteen months (September 2014-December 2015) seventeen semi-structured interviews were conducted with eighteen participants. To get a sense of how things have changed over the period 1981 to the present and how the Australian scene looks from a variety of points of view, a particular effort was made to balance gender, a broad range of ages and educational experience, diverse skills and roles, and both professional and amateur musicians. Most interviews were held in the participants’ home cities: Sydney, Melbourne, Hobart, Newcastle (NSW), Geelong (Victoria). One interview with a participant in Brisbane (Queensland) was conducted via Skype. Most but

---


11 Two participants, Lyn and Peter Hawkins, are a married couple and together are engaged in music-making and administration of the Early Music Society of Victoria.
not all are musicians engaged in some way with historically-informed performance practice (HIP). They include performers with established careers in HIP, teacher/performers at both secondary and tertiary levels, a radio presenter and programmer (ABC Classic FM), an early-career baroque flutist, teachers of period instruments, keen amateur musicians long engaged with the Early Music Society of Victoria, musicologists, a composer who edits and prepares performing scores and parts from on-line music archives such as IMSLP, and a cultural entrepreneur with a special interest in J.S. Bach.

In semi-structured interviews I began with questions about their early experience of music and how they became attracted (or not) to the music of the eighteenth-century. More detailed questions then flowed naturally on to include some of the themes below:

- influences of parent, teachers, mentors, colleagues, listening habits,
- early training, location, institutions, styles, instrument or voice, repertoire played or sung,
- changes in performance styles and practices,
- their performing history and awareness of the music of Telemann,
- what sustained their work in performance/study,
- changes of their roles or interests,
- audience and listener responses to Telemann’s music,
- the responses of musical colleagues to Telemann’s music,
- shifts of the nature of their repertoire over time.

It is important to note that outcomes of qualitative research cannot be confidently predicted, however, patterns and links between the actions and histories of these participants did begin to emerge as the data analysis progressed. Key findings and conclusions appear in Chapter Seven.

All interviews were approved by and conducted under the ethical guidelines of the University of Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee (HERC). This project is identified as HERC 2014/582.
Early Music... terminology

Many participants consider themselves as having worked or are presently working within the realm of early music, a term which encompasses complicated cross-currents. Bruce Haynes acknowledges this in his list of terms and concepts:

Early music: see HIP, Period style, and Rhetorical music (all valid simultaneously). 12

Stephen Cottrell, writing on musical performance in the twentieth century, also acknowledges the slippery quality of the term.

The performance of “early music” (a rather nebulous term whose meaning changed much over the latter part of the century) was particularly subject to reappraisal, in the context of what was originally known as the authenticity debate. It was felt by a small group of musical pioneers that attempting to recreate the original sounds of music from earlier periods would give greater insight into what the music might have meant for its original audiences, as well as different understandings of the performance of that music for contemporary audiences. 13

Many participants found it quite natural to use the term ‘early music’ when referring to their experience and understandings so I will use this term throughout the paper. The concept of rhetorical performance is also at the core of changes related to reception of much of early music. By contrasting rhetorical music with later musical idioms Bruce Haynes puts it neatly.

Rhetorical music had as its main aim to evoke and provoke emotions—the Affections, or Passions—that were shared by everyone, audience and performers alike. Canonic music, by contrast, was usually autobiographical in some sense, often describing an extreme experience of the artist-composer: cathartic or enlightening, but above all solitary and individual. Another difference is that in a performance, the Baroque composer was better off alive, because in that way, they could help make their music work well by playing along. The Romantic artist-composer, on the other hand, was best dead, because that seemed to make it easier to appreciate their genius. Another difference was that while Rhetorical music was temporary, like today's films—appreciated, then forgotten—Canonic music was eternal and enduring. Rhetorical music was transient, disposable, its repertoire constantly changing. Canonic music was by definition stable, repeatable, and orthodox. 14

14 Haynes, p. 8.
Limitations

While the fifteen hours of recorded interviews with the extraordinary individuals which formed the basis of this project yielded rich data, it also suggests that there is still much interesting research to be done on the early music movement in Australia. It is also clear that borders between ethnomusicology and historical musicology are no longer as clear as they may have been in the past. Drawing on both ethnological interviews with participants and traditional methods of historical musicology may bring greater depth and richness to our understandings of both the past and our present musical culture.

The research of Brian Stewart quoted above is based upon his extensive knowledge of German-language sources. Dorotya Fabian in her 2001 study of the early music movement reminded English-speaking scholars that much of what may have seemed new often had been aired by German-speaking scholars. While some of that research has informed the present project, this material is not directly relevant to the Australian focus of this research.

Finally, while an effort was made to draw on a wide variety of participants, most are instrumentalists although Philip Sametz, Anne-Marie Forbes, and Gary Ekkel are notable exceptions with their experience of solo vocal, and choral performance.

Claim

In the opening of his classic book What is History, E. C. Carr in discussing historians of the past, wrote that the British historian Sir George Clark (1890-1979) ‘contrasted the “hard core of facts” in history with the “surrounding pulp of disputable interpretation” – forgetting perhaps that the pulpy part of the fruit is more rewarding than the hard core’. In this paper I argue that both are indispensable for the uncovering of reasons for changes in Telemann’s reputation and his place within today’s Australian music culture. Historiography, when applied to the historically-distant falling away of Telemann’s reputation, can provide, in Clark’s terminology, the ‘hard core’ of facts; but as we look at his place within our present musical culture it is, indeed, the ‘pulpy part’ of ethnological research that is then more rewarding. In this focussed case study, based on personal stories and memories drawn from seventeen semi-structured interviews of eighteen diverse musickers, I have investigated the social and cultural pathways and networks crucial to establishing the reception of

---

15 Stewart.
Telemann in recent Australian musical culture. This culture, while strongly based on a European cultural inheritance and, at the same time, existing on the periphery of Western culture, is enriched by the habit of travel for further study by many Australians who return with fresh knowledge and ideas. Participants in this study include immigrants from Germany, New Zealand, Bahrain and Australian-born musickers whose birth years extend from the 1940s to the 1990s. This diversity makes this case study different from what might emerge from a similar study in the UK, other European countries, or the USA. It may, therefore, cast light on the specific ways in which European cultural heritage, and particularly that of art music, is negotiated in a diverse, hybrid, post-colonial society.

Within this context I claim that, while there are understandable cultural and historiographic reasons for changes in Telemann’s reputation, it was only after today’s musicians were able to draw on a musical dialect inflected by rhetorical performance, and an appreciation of the mixed taste as proposed by Quantz and others, that Telemann’s musical voice could be more clearly expressed. I further argue that the experience of a diverse range of Australian musickers engaging with Telemann’s music shows that it is being reassessed and welcomed to many teaching studios and performance platforms, and that listeners have often been surprised and delighted. However, this greater appreciation of Telemann’s music has not been consistent across Australia’s complex musical culture which is still sometimes affected by a culturally-embedded preference for figures of Romantic genius, even when associated with J. S. Bach and others of the Baroque period. Finally this research suggests that recent changes in the reception of Telemann in Australia are not the result of any one person’s work or ideas but rather the outcome of a subtle web of interactions between a wide range of musickers.

Chapter 1 – Telemann and Historiography

As stated above, Telemann’s changing musical reputation reflects broad changes in cultural history. Rarely are such changes the result of actions or statements of a single individual but more often they reflect the natural rise and fall of aesthetic ideals. The purpose of this chapter is to illustrate how these have influenced our present and evolving knowledge of Telemann and his music.

The long history of changes in reception of Telemann’s music is not remarkable. As with other composers of the time it goes along these lines: A composer is honoured during their lifetime. Manuscripts and parts are scattered or forgotten after their death while living memories of friends and colleagues fade. There follows a period of silence until, sometime later, an archivist turns a dusty page and thinks ‘Perhaps...?’ Musicologists say to themselves, ‘Let’s see what we’ve got here’. Performances are arranged and listeners may ask, ‘Who is this composer and why don’t I know more?’ What distinguishes Telemann’s story from this familiar pattern, however, are extremes of acclaim and disdain. What follows is a survey of work done by Telemann scholars on issues of reception history of Telemann’s music, the effects of historiography on our present understanding, and the influence of recent developments in performance practice. The story is best framed in three distinct parts: Telemann’s reputation during his lifetime, the period following his death, and a reassessment of his music since World War two.

Telemann Alive - (1681-1767)

For anyone exploring the life and works of Telemann, the work of Steven Zohn continues to be the best place to begin for research in English.\(^\text{19}\) The brief biographical sketch here is largely drawn from his work. Telemann was in his fortieth year at the time he took up his role in Hamburg (1721) as Kantor of the Johanneum Lateinschule and music director of the city’s five main churches. In his previous positions in Leipzig (1701), Sorau (1705), Eisenach (1708), Frankfurt (1712) he had developed skills to suit the needs of church and court (including entertainments, ceremony and opera). He came well prepared to Hamburg, a port city of great wealth and great expectations. Less than a year after his arrival he began producing concerts of chamber music in his home which became so popular they were moved to the Drillhaus, large enough to seat 300. Within a short time, the demands of overseeing Hamburg’s opera house, producing music for religious and civic occasions, training his young singers of the

\(^{19}\) Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."); Swack.
Latin school, and innumerable other tasks drove him to consider an alternative appointment. In 1722, only one year after beginning his Hamburg appointment, Telemann became aware that Leipzig was in need of a new Thomaskantor. He arrived on 1 August 1722 to audition for the position. There were six applicants. Even with his refusal to teach Latin to the boys of the Thomasschule, Telemann received the council’s unanimous approval. He wrote to the council in Hamburg asking to be released from his position; their reply did not come. Leipzig’s good working conditions were attractive, so he wrote again to Hamburg’s council asking for improvements to his pay to which the council finally agreed. He then wrote to Leipzig’s council turning down the position. After several months’ delay, they installed their third choice, J. S. Bach. This well-known story is worth retelling because it illustrates Telemann’s exceptional reputation as well as his broad musical interests, his skills and industry, not to mention good business sense and an ability to negotiate.

Later in 1740, after constant and intense work for nearly twenty years in Hamburg Telemann, then in his fifty-ninth year, negotiated a reduction in his work limiting his role to providing music for church and civic occasions. During this breathing-space he was able to more freely engage with Hamburg’s intellectual elites whose ideas were infused with the ideals of the German Enlightenment. Then in 1755, perhaps inspired by the writing of new German-language poets, he again returned to the production of new works, particularly solo vocal and choral cantatas. Ten years later, the 84-year-old Telemann welcomed Johann Wilhelm Hertel (1727-1789), the son of his old friend, Johann Christian Hertel (1697-1754). The young visitor was impressed by Telemann’s acuity and perceptive questions about compositional theory. Zohn, placing Telemann in his historical context at the time of this visit, writes

Telemann had simply outlived his era. Few of the musical friends and colleagues he had known since early in his career were still alive: Bach, Fasch, Graupner, Handel, Hebenstreit, Heinichen, Keiser, Mattheson, Pisendel, Stölzel, and Zelenka – most of whom were born after Telemann – were all long gone.

Here, even before his death, we see a common pattern being played out. The listening public’s attention had begun to move on.


21 Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."

Brian Stewart discusses issues of Telemann reception in his 1985 PhD thesis in which he points out that the most well-known in that list, J. S. Bach and G. F. Handel, are figures whose musical judgement we might trust.\(^23\) They had clearly recognised Telemann’s musical gifts. Handel, who had maintained a life-long correspondence with Telemann, was one of the 206 subscribers to his Tafelmusik (1733) and Bach, who had asked Telemann to be godfather to his son, Philipp Emanuel, was one of 294 subscribers to the Paris Quartets (1738) and is known to have made copies of several of Telemann’s cantatas.\(^24\) Johann Mattheson (1681-1764), one of those long-gone friends, and also a resident of Hamburg, is less well-known today, but was then known as a composer, singer, and an influential writer on music theory and aesthetics. It was he who persuaded Telemann to write two of his three autobiographies.\(^25\) In a tribute to Telemann, Mattheson wrote ‘Lully is celebrated and Corelli is lauded, but Telemann alone is raised above all praise.’\(^26\) Keith Chapin, writing of the eighteenth-century battle between ‘the Ancients’ (who valued counterpoint as the highest goal) and the Modernes (for whom a singing melody was the ideal), quotes Telemann, a self-described Moderne, who wrote ‘Singing is the foundation in all matters.’\(^27\) For Telemann, his delight in a singing style was not dependent alone upon the setting of a text but was also an ingredient in his instrumental music. As Chapin summarises it, ‘it symbolized a certain simplicity and fluidity of texture and delighted the public.’\(^28\)

It is clear that Telemann’s reputation did not depend solely upon the support of friends. Today he would be recognised as a prosperous entrepreneur. He supplied the burgeoning amateur musical market with musical periodicals such as der Getreue Music-Meister (1728) which provided both repertoire and instruction. His self-published chamber works also served musical establishments and friends scattered across Europe who wished to astonish and delight their audiences with the ‘new’.\(^29\) Walter Bergmann writes that during

---

\(^{23}\) Stewart, p. 3.

\(^{24}\) Ibid. Stewart, writing in the early 1980s, states that several of these have been mistakenly attributed to Bach.; Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."

\(^{25}\) These autobiographies were incorporated into two of Mattheson’s publications on music. The 1718 autobiography, Lebens-Lauff, the work of a thirty-seven-year-old galant Homme writing as one of the ‘Modernes’, appears in the form of an introduction to Grosse General-Baß-Schule (Hamburg, 1731). The 1740 much more overtly autobiographical appeared in Mattheson’s biographical dictionary of German musicians, Grundlage einer Ehren-Pforte (Hamburg, 1740). A much shorter autobiography was published by Johann Gottfried Walter in his Musicalisches Lexicon (Leipzig, 1732).

\(^{26}\) Stewart, Johann Mattheson in “Grundelage einer Ehrenpforte” (Hamburg, 1740), p. 369. Translation by Stewart.

\(^{27}\) Keith M. Chapin, “Counterpoint: From the Bees or for the Birds? Telemann and Early Eighteenth-Century Quarrels with Tradition,” Music & letters 92, no. 3 (2011): p. 378. Chapin also argues that the terms Moderne and Ancient were used differently over the period of the controversy. He makes it clear that musicians of Telemann’s time described themselves as Moderne through their rejection of contrapuntal style and their attraction to the delights of melody.

\(^{28}\) Ibid., p.379.

Telemann’s eight month visit to Paris, from 1737-38, he arranged performances by well-known court musicians of a set of six quartets now known as the Paris Quartets (TWV 43), also a favourite of many participants of this research project. This set was published by subscription in two parts (1730, 1738). The list of 133 subscribers included many well-known musicians including ‘M. Bach de Leipzig.’ In summary, Telemann was well known across Europe through his encounters with musicians passing through Hamburg, by way of his publishing enterprise, through his sharing of music with other musicians across Europe (including Pisendel in Dresden), and through his extensive correspondence. Throughout his long professional career his interests extended beyond a solely musical life and, particularly within the rich cultural environment of his Hamburg years, he gave as much as he received.

**After Telemann - from 1767 – Changes begin**

Following Telemann’s death in 1767, his grandson, Georg Michael Telemann (1748-1831), who had been living as an orphan under the care and musical training of his grandfather, took on the responsibilities of maintaining the musical establishment in the churches of Hamburg until the appointment and arrival in 1768 of the new Kantor, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach. Although Georg Michael continued to arrange performances of his grandfather’s works, including twenty-one performances of the Passions, he also altered the scores to accommodate his more conservative theological perspective and to direct listeners’ attention to the religious text rather than to the music. Other friends and admirers also helped to sustain interest in Telemann by arranging for performances of his music. Zohn records that the last of these, until the 20th century, was of a performance of Der Tod Jesu in Vienna in 1836. However, while the influence of those who knew the man himself faded, other cultural changes were developing which have had on-going consequences still being worked out in today’s musical culture.

---

32 Stewart.
Changes in aesthetic ideals and their long-lasting effects

The following has to do with the way shifts in ideas about beauty, and the influence of the Enlightenment affect ideas in our time about Telemann’s music. One of the principal challenges of historians working to clarify cultural changes is to identify and analyse the flow of complex interactions, a constant drifting from one way of doing and thinking to another. This is the central idea of Michel Foucault’s The Archeology of Knowledge (1969), in which he considers ways in which we think and what we do can be affected by hidden assumptions. Often these are so deeply embedded that a culture can be unaware of them. Foucault writes in its introduction

Beneath the great continuities of thought, beneath the solid, homogenous manifestations of a single mind or of a collective mentality, beneath the stubborn development of a science striving to exist and to reach completion at the very outset, beneath the persistence of a particular genre, form, discipline, or theoretical activity, one is now trying to detect incidents of interruptions. Interruptions whose status and nature vary considerably.  

As Foucault suggests, we may ‘read’ history imagining an underlying teleological continuity but instead we are confounded. Accepting that unpicking the past is impossible, nonetheless, it is worth looking at the subtle and large shifts in musical styles, cultural criticism, and aesthetic preferences going on in Europe near the end of the eighteenth century. Major shifts in ideas and understandings brought new ways of doing. Telemann, it seems, was very aware of this. Ideas of the Enlightenment were discussed in the many English-style coffee houses of Hamburg. Stewart points out the remarkable change in Telemann’s writing after he resumed composition in 1755 after fifteen years of somewhat lighter duties.

Most of the texts to Telemann’s late works are devotional, but they now reflect the Enlightenment-rationalist approach to religion currently in vogue, with a strong emphasis on allegory and didacticism.

... the musical style associated with Telemann’s late works is primarily the mid-century Italianate idiom which is the immediate predecessor of the Classical style.

Telemann’s regular correspondence and sharing of new musical works with many musical figures such as Carl Heinrich Graun (1704-1759) in Berlin and Johann Georg Pisendel (1687-

---

37 Stewart, pp. 177-78.
1755), leader of the court orchestra of Dresden, shows that he was alert to changes of musical fashion enjoyed by court and public audiences.\(^{38}\)

While the name Christoph Daniel Ebeling (1741-1817) may not be much known today, the effect of his writing has been remarkable. In 1770, three years after Telemann’s death, Ebeling, a Hamburg Professor of History and Greek, published his brief assessment of Telemann’s work. It is worth quoting Zohn’s summary because it appears that his critique has had a significant and long-lasting effect.

Ebeling found much to praise in the composer’s melodic inventiveness, “inexhaustible” store of ideas, contrapuntal skill in choruses, rich instrumental accompaniments in vocal works, excellent declamation in recitatives, sacred cantatas, and oratorios from after 1730, comic operas, secular cantatas, and songs. But he also judged Telemann guilty of excessive word painting (though he acknowledged both the complicity of poets in this respect and the composer’s uncommonly “strong strokes” when such musical devices were appropriate), and of selecting “wretched” or “mediocre” texts, a fault Telemann shared with “most German church composers” of his time. Most damaging of all was his estimation that “in general, [Telemann] would have been greater had it not been so easy for him to write so unspeakably much. Polygraphs seldom produce many masterpieces.”\(^{39}\)

It seems the effect of that final sentence has had a greater effect than the preceding lines of qualified praise. But why? Admittedly, the times had changed and the new Classical style had become more acceptable, but it also appears that he was one of those whose opinion mattered. He had many influential musicians among his friends. C. P. E. Bach, for example, had become a Hamburg resident and colleague. Further, it was Ebeling who arranged a welcoming concert for the 1772 visit of the English music historian, Charles Burney. While his industry was remarkable (it included a seven-volume study of the new country of America and he was, for eighteen years, librarian of the Hamburg Staatsbibliothek), Ebeling was also deaf.\(^{40}\) Whether he was hard-of-hearing or quite deaf is unclear but it seems possible his affliction may have influenced his music criticism. As a Hamburg resident perhaps Ebeling recalled the earlier, industrious Telemann and may not even have heard the later works.\(^{41}\) Nevertheless, by the end of the century the current was running against Telemann.


Zohn traces the Ebeling ‘effect’ through Ernst Ludwig Gerber’s 1792 *Historisch-Biographisches Lexicon der Tonkünstler* in which Gerber’s critique follows the pattern set by Ebeling.\(^\text{42}\) A century later, in 1890, an entry on Telemann echoing Ebeling’s dismissive critique appeared in the newly published *A Dictionary of Music and Musicians* produced by Sir George Grove.\(^\text{43}\) The entry signed by Herr A. Maczewski, concert-director at Kaiserslautern, appeared without change in four subsequent editions up to and including the 1954 edition edited by Eric Blom. Like Ebeling, Maczewski begins with measured praise but follows with acid judgements. It is worth looking at a few lines to imagine the effect this may have had on musicians, students, teachers, and others. Maczewski wrote of Telemann that

> Handel, who knew him well, said that he could write a motet in eight parts as easily as anyone else could write a letter, and Schumann quotes an expression of his to the effect that “a proper composer should be able to set a placard to music”; but these advantages were neutralised by his lack of any earnest ideal, and by a fatal facility naturally inclined to superficiality. He was over-addicted, even for his own day, to realism; this, though occasionally effective, especially in recitatives, concentrates the attention on mere externals, and is opposed to all depth of expression, and consequently to true art. His shortcomings are most patent in his church works, which are of greater historical importance than his operas and other church music. The shallowness of the church music of the latter half of the 18\textsuperscript{th} century is distinctly traceable to Telemann’s influence, although that was the very branch of composition in which he seemed to have everything in this favour—position, authority, and industry. But the mixture of conventional counterpoint with Italian opera air, which constituted his style, was not calculated to conceal the absence of any true and dignified ideal of church music.\(^\text{44}\)

Even in the mid twentieth-century, students engaged in university-level music study found little to entice them to explore the music of Telemann. For many music students of the 1960s and 1970s the standard tertiary-level English language music history survey was based on Donald J. Grout’s *A History of Western Music* (1960) the index of which mentions Telemann only four times.\(^\text{45}\) While the dismissive opinions of the past are gone, readers still found only a few scraps: that Telemann wrote chamber cantatas; that in 1704 he established the Collegium Musicum in Leipzig; that in 1721 he turned down an attractive offer of the position of Kantor at Leipzig, a position then offered to J. S. Bach; and finally, that he wrote a great deal of music.

The revised edition of 1973 and the third edition with Claude V. Palisca (1980) follow this

\(^{42}\) Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."
\(^{43}\) "Images of Telemann: Narratives of Reception in the Composer’s Anecdote, 1750-1830."
pattern with no significant changes. In none of these do we find an assessment of Telemann’s music.

Finally, in the fourth edition (1988) under the editorship of Claude Palisca, the place of Telemann’s music receives a modest re-evaluation. With the same four elements of previous editions there appears the first critical assessment of Telemann’s place in the musical world of his time. Palisca writes ‘He was noted for the vividness with which he interpreted the imagery and affections of this texts.’ We read also that ‘Johann Adolph Scheibe (1708-76), a critic of J. S. Bach’s excessive artfulness and tendency to overelaborate inner parts, found Telemann’s tunefulness, harmonic directness, and simpler accompaniments more natural and appealing.’

Eight years later, in the fifth edition (1996), Palisca expands the focus slightly to include the Brockes-Passion as a good example of the German enthusiasm for dramatic Passions. Now in its ninth edition (2014) under the editorship of Peter Burkholder, Telemann’s place is secure. Readers will now find a two-page concise biography including an evaluation of music such as the Paris Quartets (1730, 1737) now also linked to an accompanying anthology.

After Telemann – from WWII: Other ways of thinking – then and now

The question arises, given the influence of English language resources mentioned above and the general lack of awareness of his music among both musicians and audiences by the turn of the twentieth century, what was it in his music that caught the attention of those drawn into the postwar European early music movement? It seems it may have been the very qualities which made him so successful across Europe during his lifetime. Both Steven Zohn and Brian Stewart make persuasive claims that Telemann was able to sustain his creative and financial success through his use of a mixed style juxtaposing several national styles (French, German, Italian, and unusually, Polish). This is most evident in his instrumental music but Stewart also claims that in his late solo vocal and choral works he moved toward styles we now associate with Gluck and the even the early works of Haydn. As changes in historical performance practice gained greater influence along with increasing listings of his music in publishers’ catalogues and on concert platforms, and as Romantic or Modern styles became less common as ‘default’ performance practices, musicians and listeners found they liked this music full of charm, great beauty and wit. By the middle of the twentieth century it might have been

48 Stewart, pp. 178-94. After a semi-retirement of 15 years, Telemann over the next 9 years produced nine major oratorios and many other vocal works.
possible to hear three quite distinctive styles of performance (Modern, Romantic, and Rhetorical or HIP) of the same work by J. S. Bach or Handel, for example, on successive evenings. The purpose of this research is to document how some Australian musicians of today interrupted the persistence of earlier styles of performance and helped to restore Telemann’s music to its place in the core repertoire. Below I will examine the nature of these complex cross-currents.

Glimmers of change – midstream

Pointing to the work of Katherine Ellis, John Butt has written that it was during the nineteenth-century that the ‘seeds of the historical performance practice movement – cultivating not only the music of the past, but also its manner of performance – were sown in France’. Nevertheless, the complex Janus-faced art music culture of that century also developed the German notion of Werktreue, or ‘individual, fully formed and authoritarian pieces of music’. The significant consequence of this was to judge historical works by modern criteria; Handel’s oratorios, and Bach’s Passions and organ fugues were easily characterised as autonomous works of genius. Telemann’s music, with its galant sensibility, was not. With the turn to a new century still infused with the spell of Romanticism, two writers exemplify the action of interruption suggested by Foucault: the writer Romain Rolland (1866-1944) who as a citizen of France may have been less influenced by the German narrative of greatness, and Richard Petzold (1907-1970) writing later during the time of the postwar German Democratic Republic (DDR). In 1908 Rolland published a collection of charming, humanising essays in French on musicians of the past including Telemann, while in 1967 Petzold, writing in German, published a book for the general reader devoted to the life and works of Telemann.

After receiving the Nobel Prize for Literature (1915) Rolland became a figure well-known to English-speaking readers with translations of the first four novels from his ten-volume Jean-Christophe. The eponymous character, a composer of genius, is a blend of Beethoven, Wagner, and Berlioz. While Rolland’s early years were devoted to philosophy and history, his doctoral dissertation was on the history of opera in Europe before Lully and Scarlatti. From 1902 to 1911 he served as director of a new music school at the Ecole des Hautes

50 Butt, p. 16; ibid.
Etudes Sociale and became the first chair of music history at the Sorbonne from 1903.\textsuperscript{53} Given this experience it is likely Rolland’s criticism and essays on music were based on substantial knowledge. His essay, ‘Telemann: A Forgotten Master’, suggests he was not following on from the dismissive judgement of Christoph Ebeling.\textsuperscript{54} The essay opens with a sympathetic and warm-hearted biographical sketch which may have been based on Telemann’s autobiographies of 1718 or 1740. Rolland, the dramatist, creates charming imagined scenes for his main character. We ‘overhear’ Telemann’s correspondence with the conservative Carl Heinrich Graun (1703 or 1704-1759).

He [Telemann] is a modern in the great quarrel between the ancients and the moderns, and he believes in progress. “One must never say to art: Thou shalt go no further. One is always going further, and one should always go further. If there is no longer anything new to be found in melody,” he writes to the timorous Graun, “it must be sought in harmony”. Graun, the arch-conservative is alarmed: “To seek fresh combinations in harmony is, to my mind, to seek new letters in a language. Our modern professors are rather abolishing a few”. “Yes,” writes Telemann, “they tell me that one must not go too far. And I reply that one must go to the very depths if one would deserve the name of a true master. This is what I wished to justify in my system of Intervals, and for this I expect not reproaches, but rather a gratias, at least in the future.”\textsuperscript{55}

Rolland was writing to entice listeners and musicians to consider the music of Telemann. There follows a passage on Telemann’s works for the stage. Here, for instance, are a few lines from his description of the comic opera The Patient Socrates (Der geduldige Sokrates). ‘The subject is the story of Socrates’ domestic misfortunes. Considering that one bad wife was not enough, the librettist had generously allowed him two, who quarrel on the stage while Socrates has to appease them.’\textsuperscript{56} The rest of the essays in the collection, including two long essays entitled ‘A Musical Tour to Eighteenth-Century Italy’ and the second a ‘Musical Tour to Eighteenth-Century Germany’ exude the same enthusiasm and charm. While it is unclear just what effect these essays had on the reading public, they were published during the early stages of the early music movement in England. At its centre, the Dolmetsch family encouraged a growing number of amateur musicians engaged in learning and performing early music


\textsuperscript{54} Rolland, pp. 121-44.

\textsuperscript{55} Ibid., p. 133 While correspondence between Telemann and Graun was published in Briefwechsel (1972) it would not have been available to Rolland. He may have invented this exchange based upon the two Autobiographies and his knowledge of the music.

\textsuperscript{56} Ibid., p.135.
repertoire, with Telemann a strong element.\textsuperscript{57} Appearing in 1967, Richard Petzoldt’s short biography and treatment of Telemann’s works received an enthusiastic British review by Walter Bergmann.\textsuperscript{58} Perhaps looking to exploit a market of keen amateurs, Petzold supplements his biography with a survey of works, comments on style and influence, a brief bibliography, and a list of available published works. Walter Bergmann’s enthusiastic 1976 review suggests that the growing number of amateur early music players were looking for ways into his music.

\textbf{Sprechen Sie Deutsch?}

This review has, so far, focussed entirely on writings for English-speaking readers covering issues of historiography and shifts in cultural and musical preferences. However, the foundations of modern research on Telemann and cultural history are largely grounded in work done in Germany, both East and West, since World War II. Stewart, Zohn, and Fabian have all pointed to resources in German.\textsuperscript{59} While this project is set within the English-speaking Australian cultural context, the work done by those and other scholars has been foundational. In today’s English-speaking world, anyone wanting to know more of the life and work of Telemann will come across a limited number of names. In her 1992 bibliography of Telemann research Jeanne Swack expresses surprise that at that time, except for the appearance of the 1974 translation of Richard Petzold’s generalist biography and a few PhD dissertations, no other book-length studies on Telemann had appeared. With the exception of Steven Zohn’s book devoted to instrumental music, \textit{Music for a Mixed Taste} (2008), to be considered below, that is still largely true.\textsuperscript{60} Special mention must be made of Brian Stewart’s 1985 thesis, mentioned above, which points to the diligent and productive work done by scholars in the former East Germany. His work helps us to understand why Hamburg was such a fruitful environment enabling Telemann to produce such abundant and diverse music over more than forty years.\textsuperscript{61} Other historians, also writing in English, have drawn on German resources to explain the unusual economic, social and governmental basis for Hamburg’s supportive environment at the time Telemann was living there.\textsuperscript{62}

\textsuperscript{59} Stewart; Zohn, \textit{Music for a Mixed Taste: Style Genre, and Meaning in Telemann’s Instrumental Works}; Fabian.
\textsuperscript{60} Swack; Zohn, \textit{Music for a Mixed Taste: Style Genre, and Meaning in Telemann’s Instrumental Works}.
\textsuperscript{61} Stewart.
Dorotty Fabian’s 2001 historical study of the Early Music Movement and issues of authenticity reminds readers delighted or surprised by ‘new findings’ appearing in English language journals that German scholars had previously cleared many of those paths. Steven Zohn and Jeanne Swack actively work from within American historical musicology. Zohn’s astonishingly broad and deep scholarship appears in his Grove Music Online entry, regularly updated, his richly detailed book *Music for a Mixed Taste: Style, Genre, and Meaning in Telemann’s Instrumental Works* (2008), and regular reviews and articles. Jeanne Swack has produced extensive and meticulous bibliographic work on Telemann. Her 1992 article ‘Telemann Research Since 1975’ with its extensive coverage of German scholarship has recently been followed by an updated bibliography (2013) in the Oxford Bibliographies series (with online access available by subscription though not yet available in Australia). As well as bibliographic details, Swack includes a good summary of work done through the *Zentrum für Telemann−Pflege und –Forschung* based in his birthplace, Magdeburg. She also pays tribute to the essential work of Martin Ruhnke, editor of the three volume thematic catalogue *Telemann-Werke Verzeichnis (TWV): Instrumentalwerke* (1984-1999) and Werner Menke’s two volume thematic catalogue *Thematisches Verzeichnis der Vokalwerke von Georg Philipp Telemann* (1982). The Telemann Zentrum has, since 1963, organised triennial Telemann festivals involving both music performance and musicological events with many papers available on the website of the *Zentrum*. Swack continues to keep English-speakers aware of recent German scholarship through reviews, most recently of an edited volume of revised essays presented at the 2004 Telemann Zentrum conference.

Finally, during the preparation of this thesis, the first international Telemann conference to be held outside Germany was announced to be held in Philadelphia (USA) in October of 2017 with presentations in both English and German. Along with a growing


63 Fabian.


65 Swack.


catalogue of recordings both here in Australia and elsewhere, it seems to be one of many recent signs of welcome for Telemann performance and research.

**Looking ahead**

By following changes in the reception Telemann's music from his lifetime to the present we can better understand why, even now, musicians and the general listening public express such a range of opinions and judgements. What follows is a brief survey of the effects on today’s musical community by developments in the domains of historical musicology, historically-informed performance (HIP), and musical aesthetics and style. Researchers in these areas have also begun to look to ethnomusicology to explore the subtle links and influences within musical cultures which together can help us to understand how these domains are expressed in day-to-day music-making.
Chapter 2 – Seeger’s cake: Telemann in today’s world

Introduction

In Chapter One I described the impact of historiography on the reception of Telemann’s music. In order to understand why his music is increasingly welcomed by musicians and audiences, two further areas must be considered to place the outcomes of this project in context. The first has to do with the impact of recent changes in performance practice and their foundation in eighteenth-century musical aesthetics and style. Secondly, to discover how these changes are expressed within the Australian context, it became clear that an ethnographic survey of musickers would best draw out subtle and complex interrelations between academic scholarship and the practice of music-making. Recent work done by ethnomusicologists offers good models for doing this. Below is a discussion of links between musicology and ethnomusicology underpinning this project.

Charles Seeger (1886-1979) who established the first musicology course at the University of California Berkeley, spoke in 1935 of a division of orientations within musicology. Speaking of earlier times, he said, ‘The historical orientation could be defined as the viewing of things as they were – the cake cut vertically; the systematic, as they are – the cake cut along the layer, horizontally, as it were.’69 [Seeger’s emphases] Towards 1900, Seeger claimed, it became evident that the two orientations impinged upon each other.

History, for instance, instead of being regarded as a mere succession of events, or a story of them, worked for the uncovering of the processes of which the events were the way-points. System, instead of regarding its material as a mere complex of points, fixed for all time, discovered it as a process, and hence connected with other complexes of points and other processes. History became more and more involved in the question: "how things came to be as they were". System, similarly, came to ask: “how things come to be what they will be”.70

Seeger’s ‘cake’ illustrates emerging complexities within positivist musicology which was then devoted largely to documenting, measuring, analysis and the finding of ‘facts’. Recent work of musicologists and musicians has shown that, however much musicians may know about performing early music or how composers might have wished it to sound, there can still be a gap between knowledge and musical outcomes. Many musicologists have analysed the nature

70 Ibid.
of this gap and attempted to build connections between one area of knowledge and another to discover, in Seeger’s words, ‘how things come to be what they will be’. Naturally, there continue to be areas of contention, although some have suggested ways forward. I have organised a theme-based rather than a purely chronological survey. The first of these themes has to do with the much contested area of terminology. Just what is early music? This is followed by a broad survey of the practice and criticism of historically-informed performance (HIP), musical aesthetics of the past and today’s musical performance, and the relationship between ethnomusicology and musicology.

A few words about words – early music

The participants of this research have all been affected by extensive postwar (1945–) cultural changes including patterns of musical education, listening through recordings or public broadcasting, their instrumentarium, and repertoire. Listeners and audiences, providing some of the enthusiasm and financial underpinning for new ventures, are also part of these cultural changes. However, the notion of early music is not a new one. During the late eighteenth century composers like Mozart revered the music of J. S. Bach. Even earlier, in 1726, amateur London enthusiasts founded the Academy of Ancient Music, although the ‘ancient’ church music they sang may have been no more than twenty years old. From the late 1960s the term ‘early music’ began to broaden beyond its common usage referring to repertoire. Haskell sensibly acknowledges this change in usage.

Early music:
A term once applied to music of the Baroque and earlier periods, but now commonly used to denote any music for which a historically appropriate style of performance must be reconstructed on the basis of surviving scores, treatises, instruments and other contemporary evidence. The ‘early music movement’, involving a revival of interest in this repertory and in the instruments and performing styles associated with it, had a wide-ranging impact on musical life in the closing decades of the 20th century.

For the purposes of this study I have considered publications appearing since 1945. The topics fall broadly in four areas: 1) historical musicology, 2) historically-informed performance (HIP), 3) musical aesthetics, and 4) ethnomusicology. Some sources fit neatly within one of these areas while others are based on interrelationships between two or more of these areas. Nick Wilson, for example, in his study of professionalised British early music groups, The Art of Re-

---

71 Ibid.
72 The date 1726 can be found in the ‘Academy of Ancient Music’ entry in Oxford Music Online. Haskell (1988) gives the later date of 1731. Christopher Hogwood founded the modern ensemble so named in 1973.
enchantment: Making Early Music in the Modern Age (2014), summarises a complex of ingredients affecting the uptake of repertoire by music listeners and performers.

Musical works are dependent upon the potential relationships between different agents and structures, including the performing musician, audience, musicologist, editor, publisher, promoter, record company, critic, and so forth. It follows from what has been said so far that in reviving ‘early music,’ those involved were, through their many practices, breathing new life into musical works that to all extents and purposes had otherwise ceased to exist—they were no longer recalled, known about, discussed, critiqued, and, most importantly, performed.74

Wilson’s highlighting of patterns of interrelationship between ‘types’ of those involved in the cultural complex of ‘early music’ reflects what is also being played out on the Australian scene studied in this research. It is clear, too, that Wilson is working within Seeger’s systematic, or ‘horizontal’ orientation (looking at a culture of ‘now and here’, for example) of the musicologist’s cake. Drawing on the areas of sociology and the broader world of cultural history he writes as a ‘native ethnomusicologist’, that is, as a researcher of a musical community in which he is active. He studied music at Cambridge and vocal performance at the Royal College of Music and is now senior lecturer in Cultural and Creative Industries at King’s College, London. With his valuable updating of the history of the British history of early music roughly since 1970 he does indeed deal with making early music pay.75 The final section, ‘Making Early Music in the Modern Age’, concludes with an analysis of what it might mean to re-enchant the experience of making early music.76 There are many ingredients in making that particular cake and I will return to Wilson’s proposals in the final chapter of this thesis.

Historical Musicology – early music story-tellers

In the context of this project I use the term ‘historical musicology’ in relation to those who produced narrative histories of early music movements. The most useful histories also engage with analyses in areas of social, economic, philosophical, and broader cultural history. Harry Haskell’s 1988 The Early Music Revival: A History is in the first category, that is, a narrative history. It remains an excellent source on the major players starting with Mendelssohn in 1829 and covering largely European developments up to the early 1980s. Haskell’s detailed and engaging history covers the influence of major figures like Dolmetsch and Landowska as well

75 Ibid., See especially Part Three, pp. 123-73.
76 Ibid., pp. 177-228.
as lesser known leaders of developments in France, Latin America and North America. We read, for example, of Landowska’s outraged defence of her playing.

The idea of objectivity is utopian. Can the music of any composer maintain its integrity after passing through the living complex – sanguine or phlegmatic – of this or that interpreter? Can an interpreter restrict himself to remaining in the shadow of the author? What a commonplace! What a joke? 77

Notions of authenticity, not then encumbered by a capitalised initial letter (of which more below), became more common after World War II. German-born but US resident Paul Hindemith (1895-1963) was delighted to be invited to join the staff at Yale University in 1941 where he established the Yale Collegium Musicum which performed using what we would now call historically-informed performance practice. 78 Haskell notes the increase of professional ensembles of the early 1980s including many specialised period-instrument orchestras and smaller groups, then and now mostly based in Europe. Haskell describes the professionalization of these groups: ‘The familiar image of the early musician as an eccentric counterculture figure eking out a living on the fringes of the musical world is increasingly out-of-date.’ 79 The surprisingly low number, but increasing in recent years, of professional early music groups in the United States is mentioned in Tom Moore’s review of Nick Wilson’s *The Art of Re-enchantment.* 80 Thomas Forrest Kelly’s *Early Music: A Very Short Introduction* (2011) covers much the same ground as Haskell which, while limited by its format, also includes a helpful list of significant instrument collections as well as discussions of the growth of early modern opera and the institutionalisation of the training of early music musicians. A brief bibliography includes many of essential sources. 81 In Australia, Patricia Duke’s PhD thesis on the history of early music in Victoria between 1920-1969 shows how Dolmetsch, Landowska, and other influential musicians, predominantly British, inspired the growth of an amateur-based early music scene in Melbourne. 82 In her account, interest in early music was not initially based within academic institutions but, rather, in community groups, schools, churches, and musical societies. This first flush of activity was led by a few very active, inspiring individuals.

There are six musicians who stand out as pioneers of early music performance in Melbourne. They are Mancell Kirby (1897-1996), harpsichordist; Frank Higgins (1915-1977), recorder teacher; Frederick Morgan (1940-2000), recorder maker and player; Alastair McAllister (1942-) and Mars McMillan (1944-), harpsichord builder. Leonard Fullard (1907-1988), organist and choir director, founded the Oriana Madrigal Choir in 1948, the Bach Festival in 1950, and The Dorian Singers in 1952.  

**Historically-Informed Performance (HIP) – Practice & Criticism**

The two areas of practice and criticism do not always travel along the same path or at the same rate. For some during the post-war period, it was the *playing* while for others it was the *thinking about playing* that was the key. Among the former, the Liebhaber or keen amateurs led the way, although as the repertoire of early music expanded some realised that all players would benefit from access to primary sources. While Arnold Dolmetsch’s publication, *Interpretation of the Music of the 17th and 18th Centuries* had appeared in 1915, the publications of Thurston Dart (1954) and Robert Donington (1963) became the more popular sources for players.  

Harpsichordist Rosalind Halton, a participant in this study, said of her university music training in 1968: ‘When we did our music course, although early music hadn’t “happened” in Dunedin [NZ] yet and we hadn’t heard of “performance practice”... we had Thurston Dart’s *The Interpretation of Music* [1954] to read as a set book.’ [Halton] Two of her teachers were also students of Dart. Among the amateurs of that time, Lyn Hawkins, another participant, recalled learning viola da gamba using a facsimile of Christopher Simpson’s *Method* published in 1659. Others added the writings of Geminiani, C.P.E. Bach, Quantz and many others to their shelves. Performers came to realise that playing this music required more than merely making a nice sound. These and a growing number of other primary sources became central to their musical lives. Another participant, the baroque flute and recorder player Hans-Dieter Michatz, described what became the core of his approach to playing: ‘People *still* nowadays go for melody, and beauty of tone, and all that sort of stuff. I think, in the end, it boils down to a musical oration. I think in my generation we got... we really honed in on that newish discovery that *that’s* where you want to be.’ [Michatz]

---

83 The death of Mars McMillan (11 October 2016) was reported in the final stages of preparing this thesis.

84 Duke, p. 8. Duke tells the story of the young Lyn Williams and her father, Kenneth Williams who made instruments for both Lyn and later, her husband Peter, both participants in this project. p. 38-41.

Turning now to issues of criticism, while Haskell, Kelly, and Duke offered welcome accounts of extraordinary musical outliers and eccentrics pursuing their paths in spite of many difficulties, embedded within these histories is also the story of major shifts within the broader culture threaded through areas of education, politics, sociology, economics, popular culture, musical aesthetics, and so on. While some listeners and musicians still enjoyed Baroque music played by a large orchestra or sung by huge choirs, the influence of Modernism and a desire to leave Romanticism behind led musicologists, critics, reviewers, musicians, audiences and a burgeoning amateur early music culture to challenge the earlier paradigm.

Much of the work of musicologists of the 1945 post-war period was devoted to finding and editing this music for performance. Many skilled amateur musicians, including participants in this project, searched for newly published Urtext scores, the work of positivist musicologists based upon the best available sources and cleared of Romantic-era expression markings. Some, however, rejected the new playing style. Theodor W. Adorno had been resident in New York during Hindemith’s Yale years but then returned to Germany, to Frankfurt in 1949. He rejected the of use of old instruments and reduced forces for performance of J. S. Bach’s music, the one composer of the Baroque period who, he felt, could fulfil Germany’s need for models of genius. In his notorious essay, ‘Bach Defended against his Devotees’, he wrote

Mechanically squeaking continuo-instruments and wretched school choirs contribute not to sacred sobriety but to malicious failure; and the thought that the shrill and rasping Baroque organs are capable of capturing the long waves of the lapidary, large fugues is pure superstition. Bach’s music is separated from the general level of his age by an astronomical distance. Its eloquence returns only when it is liberated from the sphere of resentment and obscurantism, the triumph of the subjectless over subjectivism. They say Bach, mean Telemann and are secretly in agreement with the regression of musical consciousness which even without them remains a constant threat under the pressures of the culture industry.  

Adorno’s phrase ‘They say Bach, mean Telemann...’ suggests the immense distance he felt separated the two. Some of his criticism may have been a result of the limited number of works of Telemann then known or played. As musicians who have played the music of both composers, several participants [Ekkel, Forbes, Lang, Michatz, Owens] have worked against the paradigm of Bach-exalted and Telemann-dismissed. Laurence Dreyfus modified Adorno’s essay title with his 1983 article ‘Early Music Defended against Its Devotees: A Theory of Historical Performance in the Twentieth Century’ in which he pursues the distinction between

---

the musical culture associated with mainstream classical repertoire and the enthusiasm of the
then largely amateur-driven (at least in America) early music movement. He characterised
those of the latter group as marked by their ‘sobriety and superiority’. While he has a great
deal of fun at the expense of the frowningly serious practices of early music musicians of the
early 1980s, he also identifies the dilemma then facing both groups. Conservatory-trained
musicians with music on the stand played what was there and no more. Their professional
careers depended upon it. Dreyfus claimed that early music players, aware of the need for free
ornamentation, might do their best to do so but the result was, at the time, equally dull
without ‘restoration and critique’. Peter Walls’s Waynflete lectures (2000) further explore the
value of both musicological underpinnings as well as imagination in the performance of early
music. I will return to Walls’s contribution to this debate below.

Dorottya Fabian’s often cited 2001 article ‘The Meaning of Authenticity and the Early
Music Movement: A Historical Review’ briefly covers the history of early music in which she
acknowledges the work of English-speaking musicologists but also points to the largely
ignored work of German scholars. While not a significant element of this essay, the strength
of Fabian’s work continues to be her analysis of what recordings of performers can tell us
about shifts in performance style. While this approach is not as common as the study of
documents and manuscripts, it offers musicians epistemological evidence for what might
otherwise be instinctual claims.

The term ‘Authenticity’ carried a resonance of controversy during the late twentieth-
century which can be found below in Haynes’s wry comment.

There was a time when “AUTHENTIC” sold records like “ORGANIC” sells tomatoes. Musicians
didn’t usually make up the liner notes that went with their recordings, and if they were
described as “authentic” when they were really “an attempt to be authentic”, it seemed like
quibbling.

All paths ‘Authentic’ also lead back to Richard Taruskin’s Text and Act: Essays on Music and
Performance. In one of his many jibes at those claiming authenticity he wrote ‘talk of
authenticity might better be left to moral philosophers, textual critics, and luthiers’. At the
core of his criticism, however, was the claim that what performers were attempting was not a 
return to an imagined past but the applying of a modernist overlay to a musical score about 
whose original performance style we could know very little. Taruskin argued that in terms of sound what they were producing was similar to what Stravinsky was then demanding of 
conductors and orchestras, that they simply play accurately what they found on the page. 
While Taruskin’s arguments had the effect of drawing wry smiles or exasperated sighs they 
helped to stimulate an on-going dialogue between musicians, listeners, musicologists and 
critics. The best among them are Kenyon, Kivy, Butt, Walls, and Cook. 94

Shortly after the turn of the new century two writers made significant contributions to 
explore issues associated with the controversies. John Butt focussed on philosophical 
implications arising from the notions of music performance and authenticity while Peter 
Walls charmed listeners with the methodical analysis of his 2000 Waynflete lectures, 
published later as the very readable History, Imagination and the Performance of Music. 95 
Considering Walls’s contribution first, he writes that he had planned to name his book 
Historically Inspired Performance. The difference may seem subtle but goes to the core issue. 
While the book is a detailed analysis of the intersection between musical research and 
performance, it is clear that for Walls, ‘being historically informed shapes and stimulates the 
imagination’. 96 John Butt is a philosopher-musicologist as well as a skilled historical keyboard- 
player and director of a highly successful ensemble, the Dunedin Consort. In the final chapter 
filters several possible musical authenticities through the lenses of philosophy (both 
modernism and postmodernism), history, sociology, musicology, the heritage revival and 
politics. In his final chapter, Butt focusses particularly on the British Heritage movement (the 
try to preserve architecture, gardens, traditions and institutions of the past) and its 
resonances for HIP. He closes with an expression of optimism in the face of innumerable and 
complex difficulties.

HIP serves to ground us in the present through renewed engagement with the past and in a way 
that has never been possible or necessary before. This involves a loosening of traditional 
categories and an accessibility to history and historical thought that is quite unparalleled in the 
past; in this sense, HIP can be justified precisely because the pasts to which it alludes are gone 
for ever. Whether this all reflects the “democratisation of history” or the liberation of our

94 Nicholas Kenyon, “Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium” (Oxford; New York, 1988); Peter Kivy, Authenticities: 
Philosophical Reflections on Musical Performance (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995); Butt; Peter Walls, History, 
Imagination, and the Performance of Music (Woodbridge, Suffolk; Rochester, N.Y: Boydell Press, 2003); Nicholas Cook, 
95 Walls.
96 Ibid.
thought from preconceived narratives about the past, I believe that the net benefit greatly outweighs the disadvantages.97

What Butt seems to be suggesting to musicians engaged in historically-informed performance is that they broaden their gaze beyond the musical work and its associated rules and to be aware also of the musical culture from which it emerged. This notion is becoming more common among other writers, musicologists, and performers and may be at the core of renewed interest of audiences and listeners. Although his slightly knotty manner of expression requires quiet contemplation to interpret, what is at its core is the importance of the notion of rhetorical expression within a broad understanding of culture, ours and that of the past.

A significant recent new book, *The Pathetick Musician: Moving an Audience in the Age of Eloquence* (2016), has appeared during the last stages of writing this paper. It is based upon drafts by Bruce Haynes done before his death in 2011 and upon discussions and further work of his friend and fellow baroque oboe player, Geoffrey Burgess.98 With a focus particularly on the music of J. S. Bach, it is written for performers engaged in HIP to broaden their understanding of the intersections between music and oratory, dance, gesture, poetry, painting, and sculpture. Like Haynes’s earlier *The End of Early Music* (2007), it is supplemented with on-line audio examples.

**Musical Aesthetics**

Baroque and modern flute player Megan Lang, a participant in this study, spoke about the complex of issues which come with a shift from playing the modern flute and baroque flute. They encompass more than technique and repertoire but also matters of aesthetics. Speaking about the music of Hotteterre and Blavet she said: ‘The French style was completely new to me. I’d never played any of that music because on modern flute you can’t... can’t play it really. Not really.’ [Lang] This section looks at how a deeper understanding of eighteenth-century musical aesthetics has become such an important ingredient in playing and understanding Telemann’s music, so firmly imbedded in *galant* culture and sensibility.

With all the focus on minute details of early music performance traditions by those of the post-war generation of early music musickers, it might be easy to miss a development which began during the 1970s. Musicologists and historians began publishing the writings of eighteenth-century European aestheticians, philosophers, musicians, poets, and critics who

---

97 Ibid., p. 217.
identified changes in the way music was being made and listened to within a culture undergoing radical changes. Their work, almost an undercurrent, has slowly been absorbed into the culture of early music performance.

Among the earliest in English was the American musicologist, David A. Sheldon, who writes about the world of French eighteenth-century aesthetic notions in two long articles, ‘The Galant Style Revisited and Re-Evaluated’ (1975) and ‘The Concept of Galant in the 18th Century’ (1989). Sheldon offers a finely detailed history focussed largely on the French cultural experience and later exported to other places across Europe, as expressed in theatre, poetry, philosophy, costume, design, and manners. Following on after the second of these articles, Edward Lippman’s four-volume Musical Aesthetics: A Historical Reader began appearing and was followed by A History of Western Musical Aesthetics. These offer musicians and others access to essential writings by musicians, composers and aestheticians arranged period by period. In the second of his publications Lippman provides readers with an outline of the developing ideas and writings published between 1713 to 1739 of Hamburg resident and friend of Telemann, Johann Mattheson (1681-1764), the influential eighteenth-century theorist and aesthetician. While France was clearly an early locus of the galant style, Lippman instead follows largely German controversies about the responsibilities of the eighteenth-century composer to move or entertain his listeners, adding a discussion on the work of Christian Gottfried Kraus in Berlin (1719-1770) whose 1752 treatise dealt with the problem of combining poetry and music, and a look at the conservative defender of J. S. Bach, Johann Abraham Birnbaum, Professor of Rhetoric at Leipzig. Mark Radice’s useful article, ‘The Nature of “Style Galant”: Evidence from the Repertoire’ (1999) homes in on the nature of musical expression of the galant style through examination of musical examples.

Since the turn of the twentieth century, new and significant works on galant aesthetics have appeared. Daniel Heartz’s Music in European Capitals: The Galant Style 1720-1780 (2003) gives the reader a comprehensive and fascinating guide to the history, cultures, and differences between European musical establishments of the time. Other scholars, such as Judy Tarling, expand the resources available to musicians and musicians-in-training working

102 Ibid., p. 67-74.
in the area of historically-informed practice and the musical implications of rhetoric.\(^{105}\) Further practical help for performers can also be found in Robert Gjerdingen’s *Music in the Galant Style* (2007) in which he gives guidance for those wishing to learn of the harmonic schemata upon which keyboard improvisation and continuo-playing is based.\(^ {106}\) In his review-essay Vasili Byros writes:

> This book is not about a “transition” stylistic anomaly, standing midway between Baroque and Classical, but about the style of eighteenth-century music writ large: *galant* is a qualification of that style, of a generalised eighteenth-century “code of conduct”... *Music in the Galant Style* is an argument for rethinking and rehearing eighteenth-century music as *galant* by way of its own concepts: schemata.\(^ {107}\)

Gjerdingen’s book is a modern introduction to the harmonic and melodic schemata which pervades all *galant* music. He writes that he intends both musicians and listeners ‘to reconstruct a distant or lost musical culture – to restore the colour which has faded with the passing of time – so that a present-day listener might experience a more colourful picture of eighteenth-century music.’\(^{108}\) This contrasts with what he calls our ‘black-and-white image of what constitutes the *galant* style’.\(^ {109}\)

What we have, therefore, in these writings appearing over a period of nearly forty years, enriches our understanding of the multifaceted *galant* sensibility, a style which had before been merely the ‘bit in between’ the Baroque and the High Classical.

**Ethnography – a tool for musicologists**

**Ethnography:**

The study of the culture and social organisation of a particular group or community, as well as the published result of such study (an ethnography).\(^ {110}\)

In the final part of this survey I will focus on one of the elements in our living music cultural landscape, that is, the lives and human relationships of today’s music-makers. This is a survey of the writings of musicologists who suggest that the methods and principles of ethnography can help to understand our histories and ways of doing and acting together.

---


\(^{108}\) Gjerdingen, p. 4.

\(^{109}\) Ibid.

Bruno Nettl (1930- ) in ‘Contemplating Ethnomusicology: What Have We Learned?’ and Nicholas Cook (1950- ) in ‘We Are All (Ethno)musicologists Now’ have as their themes the origin of and developing history of ethnomusicology, the changing nature of the focuses of study, and its past problematical relationship with its sibling, musicology.\(^{111}\) Nettl describes the passing of some of ethnomusicology’s historical quests, such as the search for the ‘essence of musical beauty among fundamental issues of comparative musicology’ [an early label for ethnomusicology].\(^{112}\) He notices too how the growth of World Music has changed earlier expectations that non-Western and folk music might maintain their consistency. More important for this study, however, is his conclusion that ‘Ethnomusicologists have on the whole changed from being principally students of products to being students of processes.’\(^{113}\) [In passing, it is worth noting that Nettl, born in 1930, continues to be a student of process as can be seen in the recent publication of his entirely revised and expanded classic *The Study of Ethnography: Thirty-Three Discussions* (2015).]\(^{114}\)

This theme is also taken up by Nicholas Cook in his classic chapter ‘We are all (Ethno)Musicologists Now’.\(^{115}\) In examining what he calls ‘the new fieldwork’, Cook draws on Jeff Todd Titon who describes ethnomusicology as ‘the study of people making music [with] an emphasis on understanding (rather than explaining) the lived experience of people making music (ourselves included) is paramount’.\(^{116}\) The difference between understanding and explaining is the key. To understand one must listen and observe with patience and a willingness to let others tell their stories in their own time. Well-known and often cited articles and books by Finnegan (1989), Shelemay (2001), and Cottrell (2004), provide good models.\(^{117}\) Finnegan, who with her team, devoted five years studying previously ignored field of amateur music-making in a regional town of the UK, and Kay Kaufmann Shelemay and her team, who spent four years studying early music ensemble activities in Boston, have shown how the study of complex data of human interactions can reveal greater understandings of what often has been previously unnoticed. Finnegan’s and Shelemay’s large-scale projects involving ethnographic interviews with early music musickers inspired this, albeit much more limited, Australian-based project. Others less well known but helping to inform this project


\(^{112}\) Nettl, p. 185.

\(^{113}\) Ibid., p. 186.


\(^{115}\) Cook, “We Are All (Ethno)Musicologists Now.”


\(^{117}\) Finnegan; Shelemay; Cottrell, *Professional Music-Making in London: Ethnography and Experience.*
include Tyson Jr (1988), Duke (2005), Shull (2006), De Fazio (2010), and Nooshin (2014). Nooshin's introductory essay is a foundational guide for readers new to the field. Using a similar methodology of semi-structured interviews as this study, De Fazio's is an ethnological case study of a localised early music culture in Arizona yielding a richly-textured understanding of its community and changes over time. Patricia Duke's study of the foundations of early music in Melbourne to 1970 helped the writer of this paper to better understand the Australian musical culture in which many participants grew and developed.

**Geertz – thick description**

Just as musicology broadened its borders from restrictive positivism, so did ethnomusicology move from nineteenth-century collecting of instruments and melodies from distant places to studying music within cultures. Ethnomusicologists began to listen and observe musical cultures with greater empathy, care and patience. Geertz's much cited phrase 'thick description' is at the core of recent ethnographic studies. Like other tightly packed but powerful ideas it is hard to describe simply. In an often quoted statement Geertz made about it he wrote

> The aim is to draw large conclusions from small, but very densely textured facts; to support broad assertions about the role of culture in the construction of collective life by engaging them exactly with complex specifics.\(^{119}\)

Geertz writes openly about the challenges of ethnography and the impact of acts as well as speech or text.

> Doing ethnography is like trying to read (in the sense of “construct a reading of”) a manuscript—foreign, faded, full of ellipses, incoherencies, suspicious emendations, and tendentious commentaries, but written not in conventionalized graphs of sound but in transient examples of shaped behavior.\(^{120}\)

But of course, mere description offers only a list or catalogue of the ‘said’ or the ‘act’. What follows the ethnographer’s observations is an interpretation to evoke understanding.

---


120 Ibid., p. 10.
Our double task is to uncover the conceptual structures that inform our subject’s acts, the “said” of social discourse, and to construct a system of analysis in whose terms what is generic to those structures, what belongs to them because they are what they are, will stand out against the other determinants of human behavior. In ethnography, the office of theory is to provide a vocabulary in which what symbolic action has to say about itself—that is, about the role of culture in human life—can be expressed.121

Geertz himself described his habit of accepting complexities and contradictions without trying too quickly to uncover an underlying or hidden pattern. It was his habit, he said, to zig-zag. Others accused him of a maddening reliance on otoh-botoh (on-the-one-hand, but-on-the-other-hand) but the core idea of thick description and its associated assumptions have provided many researchers a model for creative and powerful studies. In the case of this project involving extended interviews, the data offers more than that which might be discovered through questionnaires. Those who accused Geertz of qualities of ‘otoh-botoh’ may have misunderstood the patient and delicate process of analysis, the foundation of probing and understanding human action and thought.

Marcus – multi-sited ethnography

As a ‘child’ of anthropology and sociology, ethnography grew from a tradition of immersion in the field, often for some years. As economic and social effects of globalisation became more prominent, researchers realised that their field might no longer be confined to a single place or group of people. Economic interdependency, be it strong or weak, between distant people or groups demanded a new model of study. George E. Marcus, in 1995, proposed the concept of ‘multi-sited ethnography’.122 This has become a key to the analysis of the data produced in this study. While Marcus’s concept initially has been used for studies to ‘follow the thing’, such as the movement of hot sauce or papaya along trade routes and the consequent economic or cultural effects on local communities, for this project it provides a model for studying ‘hidden’ relationships between musickers in many Australian locations engaged in several ways with the world of early music.123

The use of multi-sited ethnography, as a tool for analysis of the data of this study with participants living in several cities and engaged in a range of musicking, has helped to extend

121 Ibid., p. 27.
the findings beyond merely a collection of anecdotes or biographies. The challenge Ruth Finnegan and her team faced with five years’ engagement within a community of amateur musicians, was to find a model or a tool which might help them see below the surface. Over time Finnegan was able to identify patterns of behaviour among the musicians. After considering terms such as ‘worlds’ to describe these patterns, she chose the term ‘pathways’.

No term is perfect, but the idea of “pathways” seemed to me a better one to capture and summarise aspects of musical practice missed in other approaches... These “pathways” more or less coincided with the varying musical “worlds”... but avoid the misleading overtones of concreteness, stability, boundedness, and comprehensiveness associated with the term “world”.  

That is, Finnegan wrote about particularities and peculiarities of individuals and groups without trying to smooth them down into a pre-existing type. Finnegan, and Shelemay provide a clear path for musicologists fascinated by the today’s living musical culture and those engaged within it. I give the last word to Shelemay’s eloquent defence of the place of ethnography within this often complex and confusing world.

Ethnographies of living traditions thus provide a rich opportunity to enhance understanding of musical life traditionally viewed only through the lens of written historical sources; as such, they can help guide the music historian, bringing into focus transmission processes and musical meanings as situated among real people in real time. Ethnographies of “Western musics” may serve to collapse both disciplinary and musical boundaries. For historical musicologists, they could provide a venue in which the assumptions of scholarship can be tested and disputed. For ethnomusicologists, ethnographies of “Western music” provide a lively field in which power relationships are largely symmetrical, putting to rest ethical issues of longstanding concern. Such research agendas can only be mounted through negotiation, with the ethnographer subject to many of the same pressures and constraints as the “subjects” of any study. For both music historians and ethnomusicologists, many if not most of whom grew up performing historical European repertoires, ethnographies of “Western music” render the fieldwork intensely reflexive. Bringing “Western music” into the picture renders ethnographic training a necessary rite of passage not just for ethnomusicologists, but for music historians as well.

Conclusion

Looking again at Seeger’s cake sliced vertically, musicologists have habitually tried to clarify the past for use in the present. For example, in this chapter I have explored the influence of

---

124 Finnegan, pp. 305–6.
125 Shelemay, pp. 23–24.
the interrelated areas of historical musicology, historically-informed performance practice, and the shifting of musical aesthetics and styles on today’s musical culture. Seeger, Shelemay and others mentioned above have pursued the notion of a quite different orientation. By looking at texts and acts within a limited time-frame as well as a restricted musical culture – Seeger’s cake cut horizontally – musicologists can draw on the ethnomusicologists’ methods and ways of observation and interpretation. It is this orientation which is at the basis of this study. The following chapter will detail the methodology and the process of analysis which have helped to interpret the rich and complex data gathered for this project.
Chapter 3 – Methodology

Introduction

As has been observed, researchers in the area of music performance and reception can draw on the two domains of historical musicology and ethnomusicology in order to develop a clearer understanding of our present Australian musical culture. In chapters one and two I have outlined the effects of historiography as well as recent changes in the musical and the broader culture influencing the reception of Telemann’s music. The tercentenary of his birth in 1981 provided a hook for some musicians and ensembles to add his music to their repertoires. What has happened since that time, however, has been difficult to establish with any clarity solely through a documentary survey. It seemed clear that the memories and experiences of a variety of musickers active on the Australian musical scene might best help to fill this gap. After taking into account the complexities of the qualitative research process and developing a detailed research project I applied for and gained approval from University of Sydney Human Ethics Committee for a series of semi-structured interviews of musickers.

Methodology

Selection of Participants

This project is based upon seventeen ethnographic interviews with eighteen participants (a married couple, long active in early music as performers and organisers, were interviewed together). Prompted by a personal interest in the flute music of Telemann and a sympathetic understanding of early music, I initially chose those with whom I already had some link. Naturally some of these were flute players (both modern and baroque). However, after the

first tranche of five interviews was completed I saw that, in order to dig more deeply into the texture of Australian musical culture, it would be necessary to look beyond conservatorium and professional platforms. While not randomly selected, those invited represented a variety of ‘types’ of musickers and were not previously known to me. In the end, participants included amateur musicians active in the early music scene, secondary and tertiary-level teachers of music including a singer, instrumentalists, conductors, musicologists, a university honours student of baroque flute, a classical music radio presenter and producer, an editor-researcher preparing parts and scores for performance, and a retired business-person who drew on his growing enthusiasm for J. S. Bach in establishing the Australian Bach Society. The aim was to discover the place of Telemann’s music in as wide a range of musical domains as possible within the limits of this research project. Limiting the focus of participants only to those who were most likely to know (and perhaps love) Telemann might have been interesting but would have been unlikely to reveal much about the reception of his music in the wider Australian musical culture.

Most interviews were held in participants’ home cities (Sydney, Melbourne, Newcastle NSW, Hobart TAS, Geelong VIC) although a Skype interview was arranged with a participant in Brisbane. While some participants knew other participants personally or by reputation, most did not regularly work or perform together. All participants have generously allowed their names to be recorded in the reporting of this research and thus are contributing to a richer knowledge of Australian musical culture.

**Interview transcription and analysis**

Using a small digital recording device, all interviews were recorded with the knowledge and the written approval of participants. For very large ethnographic projects, it is not uncommon for transcripts to be prepared by others, however, for this project all recordings were transcribed by this writer. As well being a focussed-listening review, it also enables the researcher to note (and highlight in the transcript) emotional markers such as delight, hesitation or sadness which might, for example, be signalled by a deep breath. A detailed transcript can, therefore, be more than a mere record of a conversation. For this project, the slow, meticulous listening required gave this researcher a sense of key moments in a participant’s life such as a personal encounter, a moving musical experience, or even a period of childhood boredom or transporting delight.

---

127 These recordings (saved as .wma files) have been transferred for safe-keeping to digital disks and are kept under secure conditions by Dr Alan Maddox acting on behalf of the University of Sydney the Human Research Ethics Committee with this project identified as HERC 2014/582.
An essential part of the process involves the checking of details of family, friends, colleagues, place names, dates, references to musical works, documents, and so on. Thus, the preparation of the transcript is actually the first stage of analysis. All completed transcripts were then loaded as an electronic database into the qualitative analytical computer program, NVivo 11. A second level of analysis involves the development of thematic categories, here called nodes. Below is a table of nodes for this project. Each transcript is ‘marked up’ or coded using these nodes to help identify themes, ideas, concepts, which may be shared or not between participants. The list of references indicate the number of times each node appeared in the transcripts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nodes</th>
<th>Sources (participants)</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early Music</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony and theory</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recording companies</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editing &amp; Sources</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amateurs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voice</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audience response</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Places</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools &amp; Universities</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance Styles</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening &amp; Repertoire</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research &amp; Musicology</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruments &amp; Voice</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges &amp; Difficulties</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Places</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools &amp; Universities</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cities &amp; Regions</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telemann</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching material</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repertoire</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Composers</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.S. Bach</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Groups</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The fifteen hours of interview recordings of this project naturally produces many threads to be followed. In the preparing of interview summaries (Appendix B) overall patterns began to become apparent. While allowing for each participant’s unique experience, the notion of pathways and networks began to emerge. An introduction to these concepts can be found in Chapter four with a full treatment of data and analysis in Chapters five and six.
Limitations

While the number of participants might be said to be somewhat limited, nonetheless, analysis of the data demonstrates a surprising range of experience and ways of engaging within the frameworks of early music repertoire, performance practice, and musicological research as related to the music of Georg Philipp Telemann. The accounts of these participants are remarkable for their unveiling of many previous untold stories, not all of which, regretfully, could be included. It is clear that further ethnological research within the art music domain may open other equally rich but as yet undocumented paths. For example, Hans Schroeder’s role as an independent cultural entrepreneur linking musicians and scholars together within and outside Australia, may be unique within the Australian musical setting.

Finally, over the life of this project, it has become clear that while ethnography brings the possibility of a richer understanding of living musical cultures it also creates challenges for the musicologist seeking to draw on it for his or her project. As with all research, it is crucial to be alert for the need for change or refinements.

Semi-structured Interview Schedule Design

An early semi-structured interview schedule of detailed questions was slightly modified by sorting them into three broad groups: 1) their musical experiences from childhood to early adulthood, 2) their awareness of early music, and 3) the place of Telemann (or not) in their musical lives. This helped participants to have a clear sense of the flow of the interview while this interviewer was able to draw on more detailed questions of the schedule as appropriate for each individual. Copies of both schedules can be found in Appendix A.

All participants were sent a copy of the Participant Information Statement (PIS) and a Participant Consent Form (PCF). Participants read it, were invited to ask questions, and were asked if they were willing to be named (or not) in the writing up of the research. All participants willingly gave their consent for the interview and record by signing the PCF.\(^{128}\) Summaries of all interviews can be found in Appendix B.

\(^{128}\) In the case of a Skype interview, recorded consent was given vocally and was noted by signature of this writer and a copy sent to the participant by post. All signed consent forms, digital audio recordings of interviews and full transcripts are held by Dr Alan Maddox on behalf of the University of Sydney.
A Few Words About What Follows

In order to develop a conceptual framework for the presentation and analysis of data (Chapters 5 & 6), the following (Chapter 4) sets the scene. Its focus is the growing musical interests of eighteenth-century amateur musicians in Germany (the Liebhaber) compared with trained musicians (the Kenner) and Telemann’s role in providing for both groups. Just as today’s performers and listeners are enriching their experience of early music by engaging with the history and cultures of the past, so too can knowledge of the past inform an analysis of recent Australian music culture.
Chapter 4 – Kenner und Liebhaber – connoisseurs and enthusiasts

Introduction

Before presenting and analysing data drawn from participant interviews (Chapters 5 & 6) it will be useful first to consider eighteenth-century musical culture within which Telemann lived and worked. Is it possible, for instance, that today’s revival of interest in his music might be mirrored in the complex reciprocal relationships between north German musical and cultural life, and Telemann’s gifts and skills? To attempt an answer and to prepare for an analysis of the data of this study, this chapter is devoted to a brief look at that earlier time.

In Hamburg of 1721 when Telemann arrived, and in other musical centres across Europe, significant economic and broader cultural changes were occurring. For example, as we shall see in greater detail below, the burgeoning German-speaking middle-classes of the early eighteenth century were not only keen to spend their coins at the new public concerts but also wished to make music themselves. Composers attuned to the aesthetics of the galant (from about 1720) welcomed music of a lighter, melody-focused style instead of the polyphony heard in sacred settings expressive of theological perfection. The categories of Kenner (trained musicians) and Liebhaber (amateur musicians or connoisseurs) became problematic as the categories later broadened to include listeners. As we shall see below, ‘skilled listeners’ were able to focus their attention on counterpoint as against those less able or just not interested in such an intense and sustained focus.

Johann Mattheson (1681-1764) in his 1713 publication Das Neu-Eröffnete Orchestre wrote specifically for the galant homme whom he ‘sought to protect from what he regarded as the lamentable effects of dry, mathematical theorizing about music’. Later in the century Johann Nikolas Forkel (1749-1818) gave public lectures intended to guide listeners at weekly winter concerts he arranged at the University of Göttingen. The musicologist, Matthew Riley, writes of Forkel that ‘He believed that the modern proliferation of inexpert listeners was dragging musical culture down to the level of “savage” peoples and threatening to unravel the

---

129 Zohn, “Georg Philipp Telemann.” ‘Telemann typically avoided extremes of technical difficulty in his music so as to encourage the widest possible dissemination, and in fact many of his publications found favour both in private homes and at Germany’s courts...’

progress that had been painstakingly achieved over millennia of music history.\textsuperscript{131} Others, like Telemann and C.P.E. Bach, saw commercial and musical opportunities in supplying both groups with music to suit their desires. Below, in brief summary, we will see how this clash was played out among eighteenth-century aestheticians, musicians, teachers, and a keen listening public. This sketch of a somewhat knotty area of study will help us to be aware, as we look at the data presented in the following chapters, of how this binary may also be reflected in our own Australian culture.

Several broad themes and analytical tools have emerged for focussing on the central question of this project: Why may Telemann’s music, once better known and accepted than his contemporaries only to fall away in the awareness of the general listening public and trained musicians, be again finding its place in the repertoire of listeners and musickers alike? The questions or themes are –

1. May looking at changes in musical style and the broader culture occurring during Telemann’s lifetime help us to better understand the place of his music in today’s musical culture and the experiences of musickers here in Australia?
2. Is the division between amateurs (\textit{Liebhaber}) and professional musicians (\textit{Kenner}) mentioned above still a factor in understanding the taking up of concepts at the heart of early music performance, study, and listening?
3. Further, have recent changes in historically-informed performance, as identified by John Butt, Peter Walls, Bruce Haynes, Nick Wilson and others, contributed to changes in the reception of the music of Telemann on the Australian musical scene, and if so, in what ways?\textsuperscript{132}
4. The Northern Ireland born British anthropologist Ruth Finnegan developed the notion of pathways as an analytical tool for her study of rarely researched amateur music-making in Milton Keynes (UK).\textsuperscript{133} She described how, for example, children growing up in a family active in local brass bands might, understandably, expect that they too would become brass players. In considering the complex data gathered \textit{for this} project, could Finnegan’s idea of pathways be broadened to include links or networks of connection between participants, their roles as teachers, broadcasters, musicologists, and so on, or even the place of musical

\textsuperscript{131} Ibid., p. 415. Forkel produced the earliest biography of J. S. Bach (1802) in which he ascribed the quality of ‘genius’ to a composer who others at the time thought of as ‘old fashioned’.

\textsuperscript{132} Butt; Haynes; Haynes and Burgess; Wilson; Walls.

\textsuperscript{133} Finnegan.
works in the active repertoire? That is, have unrecognised networks affected changes in reception of the music of Telemann?

Looking Back to Telemann

In considering the first of these questions (comparing Telemann’s time with our own) and how it may help in framing an analysis of the recent Australian musical and cultural scene, let us look at the musical culture of Telemann’s Hamburg and his response to opportunities he found, not only through compositional skills but also through what we now might call his entrepreneurial nous. Brian Stewart has also pointed to the remarkable changes in his writing as he followed developments in European literature, poetry, theatre, and philosophy.\(^{134}\) Even today general audiences are more familiar with the largely contrapuntal matrix of J. S. Bach’s style and the later Classical style of Haydn and Mozart without much awareness of music written during the intervening period. What some may imagine would have been a period of busy and agreeable music making in eighteenth-century northern Europe also had, like today, its controversies.

Consider the influences of the Kenner and the Liebhaber on musical culture of German Enlightenment.\(^{135}\) The question of exactly what was the purpose of music – to delight or to deepen the human experience – is at the core of the controversies about musical aesthetics of the time. Edward Lippman’s helpful survey of the history of Western musical aesthetics helps us to better understand the issues.\(^{136}\) In writing about eighteenth-century Galant aesthetics, he focusses initially on the publications of the Hamburg music theorist and aesthete, Johann Mattheson (1681-1764). Lippman describes the tension between two poles of eighteenth-century German musical principles.

The ideal Mattheson espouses and expounds is really derived from opera, the genre, itself international, that was favored both by Mattheson and Hamburg. But aesthetics seems to thrive on controversy, even to demand it: on the conflict, typically, of new and old and of simplicity and complexity. Thus, Germany, with its powerful tradition of church polyphony on which there impinged the attractive new style of secular melody, was fertile ground for aesthetics.\(^{137}\)

What was the core of these disputes? Lippman gives us a sense of the intense conversations we might have heard at that time in the English-style coffee houses of Hamburg.

\(^{134}\) Stewart.

\(^{135}\) Heartz. In Heartz’s monograph, patterned after Charles Burney’s musical grand tour and therefore covering a broader geographical scope, he points out that generally the focus of music-making was shifting from court grandees to city audiences.

\(^{136}\) Lippman, A History of Western Musical Aesthetics.

\(^{137}\) Ibid., p. 64.
Contrapuntal technique and complexity continually called forth critical attacks that served as the foil for newer ideals. Mathematics was pitted against rhetoric, craft against taste, and learning against the galant... Thus, in galant aesthetics, rhetoric is connected with melodic style and contrasted with the mathematics of polyphony as good taste is to bad.\(^\text{138}\)

Through the music of J. S. Bach and others, we are familiar with the notion that moral culture could be bound up with the Protestant religious foundation of north German communities. It is not surprising, therefore, to find a similar linkage between the German understanding of the musical expression of the *Galant*, and its influence on the soul. Aestheticians like Mattheson, however, believed that music’s effect came through the sense of *hearing* rather than the intellect. Lippman here summarises Mattheson on the issue:

> Thus, the true goal of music is an honest pleasure that resides in hearing. Understanding participates in the judgement of music, but hearing must play the first, best, greatest, and final role. Music accordingly contains its own sensuous purpose of loveliness and grace, which is not to be identified with its moral purpose; the first is its external aim, the second its inner one, which is more an effect than a true intention. The *pleasure of hearing in itself, Mattheson believes, inclines the soul to virtue.*\(^\text{139}\) [This writer’s emphasis.]

Thirty-one years after Mattheson’s 1721 publication we find in the writing of the Berlin theorist Christian Gottfried Krause (1719-1770) his conclusion that ‘Intellectual music will please musicians, but not amateurs “who judge only the impressions of the ears and of the heart”.’\(^\text{140}\)

Mattheson, Krause and many others continued to consider these matters. In 1739 Mattheson published *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, in which he advised readers on melodic composition and the writing of counterpoint and polyphony. Lippman summarises Mattheson’s description of the features of a well-shaped melody in this way:

Mattheson takes up four basic properties in turn: accessibility, clarity, fluidity, and loveliness. To these there must be added an affecting or moving nature, which the four properties help produce.\(^\text{141}\)

Mattheson then details thirty-three rules for the composer to produce a melody which would successfully exhibit these properties. On considering these prescriptions and the general nature of a growing preference for music of the *Galant* one might ask if a push-back from others in the German musical scene might have also been occurring. The answer is yes. That position was most clearly expressed by Johann Abraham Birnbaum (1702-1748), professor of

\(^\text{138}\) Ibid.
\(^\text{139}\) Ibid., p. 62. Lippman has drawn these ideas from Mattheson’s 1721 *Das Forschende Orchestre*.
\(^\text{140}\) Ibid., p. 68.
\(^\text{141}\) Ibid., p. 64.
rhetoric at the University of Leipzig, who was known for his defence of the music of J. S. Bach. He felt that the secular cosmopolitanism of the *galant* style was distasteful and that polyphony, associated with the church, ought not be forgotten or dismissed.\(^{142}\)

It is clear that Telemann, arriving in Hamburg in 1721, (the year of the publication of Mattheson’s *Das Forschende Orchestre*) was already known across Europe as someone who was comfortable with the views of Mattheson and the Moderns and whose music was well known among both professional musicians, and gifted amateurs. Shortly after taking up his new post in 1721 as Kantor in Hamburg, Telemann established a *collegium musicum*, a series of weekly concerts held during the winter months in his apartment. By 1724 they became twice-weekly events and needed to be moved to the city’s Drillhall to accommodate the increased numbers attending.\(^{143}\) Consider the text from a cantata presented at the first concert of the winter collegium musicum in both 1721 and 1722. Telemann’s text tells listeners what they would hear at these concerts.

\[\text{The flattery of Italy’s pieces,} \]
\[\text{The unrestrained liveliness} \]
\[\text{That flows from French songs;} \]
\[\text{Britain’s leaping, obliging nature;} \]
\[\text{Yes, Sarmatia’s exquisite pleasure,} \]
\[\text{To which the notes’ jesting is devoted:} \]
\[\text{German diligence combines all this} \]
\[\text{To the honor of its country,} \]
\[\text{All the more to please the listener here} \]
\[\text{Through pen, mouth, and hand.}^{144}\]

While he was well known in Hamburg, the geographical spread of Telemann’s fame during his lifetime was remarkable. Zohn writes:

\[\text{Two published subscription lists demonstrate that Telemann’s music was admired not only in German-speaking lands, but also in Holland, Switzerland, Belgium, France, Italy, England, Spain, Norway, Denmark and the Baltic lands. For the *Musique de table* (1733) 52 of the 206 subscriptions came from abroad, 33 of them from France. Handel sent an order from London, and in several subsequent compositions he borrowed and reworked many themes from the}\]

\[^{142}\text{Ibid., p. 75.}\]
\[^{143}\text{Zohn, ”Georg Philipp Telemann.”}\]
\[^{144}\text{Music for a Mixed Taste: Style Genre, and Meaning in Telemann’s Instrumental Works, p. 4. Giving a whiff of the exotic, the Sarmatians (6th-4th c. BCE) migrated from central Asia finally settling in European Russia and eastern Balkans.}\]
collection. The *Nouveaux quatuors* (Paris, 1738) attracted 294 orders (not 237 as is usually stated), including one from J.S. Bach and no fewer than 155 from France.\(^{145}\)

What made this broad reach possible has as much to do with Telemann's ability to write music well suited to the distinctive sound and technical challenges of each instrument as much as to the varying abilities of the players. The growth of the middle classes of Hamburg during Telemann's time has been extensively documented by Brian Stewart and Mary Lindemann.\(^ {146}\) Along with wealth came their desire to experience music as a players as well as listeners. Telemann was quite willing to support the *Liebhaber* with the appearance of the first periodical (bi-weekly) publication, *der Getreue Music-Meister*, which offered musical works as well as instruction. The journal's title page, here in Zohn's translation, promised to open many doors for enthusiasts.

The *Faithful Music-Meister*, who proposes to present all types of musical pieces for singers and instrumentalists, suited for various voices and almost all instruments in use, and which consist of moral, operatic, and other arias, trios, duets, solos, etc., sonatas, ouvertures, etc., as well as fugues, counterpoints, canons, etc., therefore most everything that may occur in music according to the Italian, French, English, Polish, serious, lively, and amusing styles, little by little in a lesson every fourteen days through Telemann.

Turn the page and you find he has only just begun. The opening page begins thus

> Gentle Reader!

The present work, the contents of which are already adequately described by the title, would have remained without a preface had I not thought to decorate the space of this empty page with a few black letters....\(^ {147}\)

This fascinating story of a musical world of permeable and shifting boundaries between amateur enthusiasts and the more refined and sensitive connoisseurs can be found in greater detail in the work of Matthew Riley.\(^{148}\) For the purposes of this study we need only keep in mind that distinctions between, for example, Johann Nikolaus Forkel’s (1749-1818) notion of ‘expert listeners’ and ‘untrained listeners’ has influenced ideas of aesthetic hierarchies which are still being played out today.\(^ {149}\)

---

\(^{145}\) Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."

\(^{146}\) Stewart; Lindemann.


\(^{149}\) Johann Nikolaus Forkel (1749-1818), described by Matthew Riley as the first academically-based musicologist in the modern sense, presented public lectures at the University of Göttingen to guide listeners attending weekly winter concerts.
Pathways – Telemann & Today?

What pathways do we find in the accounts of Telemann’s times and life in the material above? Clearly, changes in ideals of aesthetics, the place of religion in relation to secular culture, growing political and economic independence from former centers of power and their underpinnings in philosophical ideas, all converged to produce, for instance, new audiences and opportunities for composers alert and keen to exploit them. Telemann undoubtedly possessed the skills and personality to do so. His self-publishing and wide distribution of new works, his engaging with Europe’s most renowned musicians as well as the Liebhaber, his self-promotion through public concerts and recitals, his delight in keeping listeners engaged (and paying) through his use of the mixed style, and musical settings of moving, colourful, or even amusing texts based on common human experiences all helped to ensure his place across much of musical Europe.

As we look at the remarkable success of Telemann’s career we need also to be alert for ways in which today’s musickers may be drawing on some of the same elements of creativity and imagination, commercial judgement, networks of friends and colleagues over a wide geographical area, and a broad awareness of developments in other arts including links to philosophy, education, and the stage. Could these elements also be influencing the reception of Telemann’s music in today’s Australian musical culture? As readers might imagine, answers to this grab bag of questions may not be found in neatly wrapped parcels. It is the nature of ethnological research that a greater understanding of processes and outcomes is based upon living personal stories whose textures are just as complex and intertwined as the questions themselves.

Reading the data: Questions arising

Questions about reception

Before delving into the methodology of ethnomusicology it may be helpful here to restate the themes mentioned above. Seen in relation to the reception of Telemann’s music in Australia since 1981, in two broad categories they are –

1. Changes in historically-informed performance practice in Australia – what role has this played in reception? Might we better understand the place of Telemann’s music in today’s Australian musical culture if we look at changes occurring during his lifetime?

for which he also was responsible. He had firm ideas about the proper goal of listening involving a good knowledge of music theory and counterpoint. In this musical world J. S. Bach held pride of place.
2. Pathways of individuals and networks between Australian-based musickers engaged in differing roles – have these been factors in reception? That is, can changes in the repertoire of musicians over time be explained in terms of individual pathways or webs of interactions or shared knowledge?

Reframing an analysis: from historiography to ethnology

We have seen how Telemann’s reputation during his life was remarkable and that from the early twentieth century his reputation when compared to others like Handel or J. S. Bach, is not what it might be expected to be. As outlined above in Chapter 1, the methodology of historiography based on documentary evidence helps to explain this. Looking at our own time, it stands to reason that it should be possible to develop a more nuanced picture of Telemann’s reception. At this point, however, the use of written records and documents is less useful and we need to switch to the methodology of ethnography, that is, by hearing directly from musickers engaged in playing, listening, studying Telemann’s music. To make sense of these changes we need now to develop a more fine-grained analysis of the Australian scene today.
But first the statistics

Those born in a particular decade or in a particular place are naturally often influenced by cultural patterns of those times and places. Below is a summary of participant birth years by decade and places.

Participant birth years by decades:

- 1940s – 6 – Hawkins (Lyn & Peter), Schroeder, Stockigt, Webb, Wilkinson
- 1950s – 2 – Dikmans, Halton
- 1960s – 8 – Collins, Ekkel, Forbes, Michatz, Owens, Peres Da Costa, Sametz, Yates
- 1970s – 1 – Lang
- 1980s – nil
- 1990s – 1 – Sadler

Participant birth places:

- Australian cities – Adelaide (Forbes), Geelong VIC (Ekkel, Webb), Melbourne (Hawkins L & P, Stockigt), Newcastle NSW (Collins, Yates), remote northern Tasmania (Lang), Sydney (Dikmans, Sadler, Sametz, Wilkinson),
- Bahrain (Peres Da Costa)
- New Zealand – Dunedin (Halton), Christchurch (Owens)
- Germany – Bad Bentheim (Schroeder), Salzgitter (Michatz)

This framework has been used in the preparation of the following two chapters which are devoted to the presentation and analysis of interview data. Chapter 5 is focused on those born during the 1940s and 1950s. Chapter 6 is focused on those born in 1960s, 70s, and 90s. The second of these chapters closes with a consideration of findings of all data, especially in relation to individual pathways of participants as they relate to the reception of Telemann’s music. More general conclusions regarding Telemann’s music in recent Australian musical life including the effect of the networks between participants, their types, and Australian musical culture is the focus of chapter seven.

---

150 Birth years, in some cases, have been approximated based on known schooling and other dates.
Chapter 5 – Reading the Data – Part 1

Birth Years 1940s & 1950s

Looking at the stories of these participants roughly by decades naturally also coincides with changes, large and small, in performance practice of early music. This chapter collects the stories of those born during or shortly after the cataclysm of World War II. Leaving aside the earlier influence on the growth of the amateur early music scene of outlier musicians such as Arnold Dolmetsch (1858-1940), and Wanda Landowska (1879-1959), those in this group entered their early adulthood as the early music world was becoming more professionalised. Nick Wilson in his framework, the ‘seven ages of early music’, describes this period as ‘Infancy (from c. 1967)’\(^{151}\) – the time of the social phenomenon, the Summer of Love in San Francisco, the 400\(^{th}\) anniversary of the birth of Monteverdi, and the founding of the Early Music Consort of London. On the heels of this period comes Wilson’s second age, ‘Growth (from 1973)’, when those groups formed before 1973 became the core of a growing number of early music groups appearing on concert and festival platforms. Central figures like Christopher Hogwood and Trevor Pinnock drove the professionalisation of their musical groups. During this same period, the Netherlands also became a strong centre for performance and study of early music. Gustav Leonhardt (1928-2012), for instance, was mentioned by some participants as being especially influential. Several participants also had links to the Kuijken brothers, Wieland (b. 1938), Sigiswald (b. 1944), and Barthold (b. 1949), who all strongly influenced changes to music education, instrument making, playing standards, and the broadening both of academic foundations and the refining of Baroque performance practice.

Many of these participants, having either retired or changed the focus of their established careers, are now broadening their involvement with performance and community music-making, on-going research or in one case, musical entrepreneurship along with the developing of links between scholars and musicians in Germany and Australia. Participants with links to academia, performance, teaching, recording and concert-making (the Kenner) have largely continued to follow these pursuits while others, self-taught active and enthusiastic amateur musicians (the Liebhaber), describe their opportunities as diminishing rather than growing. Lyn and Peter Hawkins, with their long involvement in an active early music society, are in the Liebhaber (amateur or enthusiast) category. The contrast between the two groups is fascinating and worth further study.

\(^{151}\) Wilson, p. 19-36.
Finally, readers attuned to the place of Telemann in the stories of these participants will notice that his music has either been at the core of their playing or study (often because he wrote enjoyable and playable music for their instruments suitable for beginners through to advanced levels) or that it was almost entirely absent from their awareness. For nearly all, however, the growing early music movement with its broadening scope of repertoire interlinked with musicological and cultural research provided new opportunities and challenges which may have opened the door for Telemann’s music.

The following entries based on memories and observations of participants along with analysis are presented not by arbitrary birth year or alphabetic ordering but, rather, are connected by thematic elements often resonant from one participant to another.

They appear in this order:

- Hans D. Schroeder
- Rosalind Halton
- Peter Webb
- Janice (Jan) B. Stockigt
- Ruth Wilkinson
- Greg Dikmans
- Lyn & Peter Hawkins

Each section is followed by a brief interpretative paragraph focussed particularly on the notion of pathways. A discussion of how these pathways sometimes have intersected to form either subtle or more clearly formed networks can be found in Chapter 7. More complete individual participant interview summaries can be found in Appendix B.

Hans D. Schroeder — entrepreneur & President of Australian Bach Society

Before considering Hans Schroeder’s story beginning in northern Germany in 1941, it will be useful first to reflect on the powerful shifting cultural influences present in postwar Europe. The effect of the flow of time between Telemann’s time and ours inevitably tinges our present with cultural residues. Ideas like democracy or monarchy do not arise anew with each generation. Likewise, our musical culture is a blend of past traditions and conventions with newer challenging and proud assertions of change. As Bruce Haynes and others have observed, the aesthetic of genius, the Romantic notion of composers as isolated and heroic figures, continued to affect musical decisions about style and repertoire even into the mid-
We hear of this, for instance, in the memories of Hans Schroeder as a young student studying chemistry in Berlin from 1962. The divided city was still recovering, so the arts were important to the government and the citizens. It was natural for both musicians and audiences to want again to hear music which reflected times of calm, security and the nation’s past honour. Schroeder recalled:

The reason was simply, West Berlin, was called an island in the Soviet empire, was heavily sponsored by government and cultural life was extremely important. For poor students like us the department of culture offered cheap tickets for only a few Marks [in] that day. And at this stage I organised it for my chemistry colleagues and had the chance to pick up very good cheap tickets. So I had the experience for three or four years to listen to the most fascinating concerts by the Berlin Philharmonic and many, many other ensembles.

We shall see later that Schroeder’s arranging of tickets for his fellow students foretells what has become typical of his actions as an entrepreneur. Recalling these concerts Schroeder mentions that the music of nineteenth-century Germany and Russia formed a cultural platform for the city and the nation’s restoration as well as a way of looking beyond the experiences of the recent past.

I did not deliberately avoid Baroque music. It was perhaps was not performed as frequently as it’s done today... so all the other great pieces of German and international music, Russian music, were more important in a way. We’ll come to talk about Bach, because I remember in a performance, Weihnachts-Oratorium (Christmas Oratorio) which is a must in Germany, done in the Berlin Philharmonie by von Karajan. I didn’t like it. So early music of that kind was not my “cup of tea” as we say. It was more the repertoire of the Romantic period, well maybe starting with Mozart, Beethoven all the way around the classical period. The same with opera. More traditional.

Readers familiar with recordings of Bach from the early career of Herbert von Karajan with the Berlin Philharmonic will know of the Romanticised style of these large-scale performances. Some performances of Bach, even today, can annoy Schroeder as we hear him compare a recent Melbourne professional ‘main-stage’ performance of the B-minor Mass with other early music style Christmas Oratorio performances.

152 Christine Manteghi Goulding, “From "Witz" Culture to Cult of Genius: Lessing and Eighteenth-Century Aesthetics,” Monatshefte 92, no. 2 (2000). Goulding’s fine-grained account of the early glimmers of this through the influence of the German philosopher, dramatist, and critic Gotthold Ephraim Lessing (1729-1781) describes this move from the concept of Witz (wit) to Genie (Genius) by 1767 in his publication of his Hamburgische Dramaturgie (1767-69). Writing of Lessing’s ideas, Goulding states ‘Witz is a form which inherently represents static states of affairs’ whereas ‘tragic genius’ is for Lessing the specific ability to represent cause-effect relationships for the purpose of arousing compassion.” (p. 120).
And now we see that... even... I am afraid to say the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra performs the B-minor Mass with chorus of 120 people. That – is – not – Bach. [Said with some force.] You can do it with Wagner and Mahler and similar symphonies but not with Bach.

Given his present enthusiasm and awareness of changes in performance of Baroque music, Schroeder puzzles over why it did not take his interest in those early days in Berlin of 1961.

I know the Christmas story very well which is reflected in the Christmas Oratorio but somehow, the Baroque music, the instruments of that did not appeal to me. It’s hard to put it into words but, in general, it didn’t leave a lasting impression. And so later on, I did not deliberately avoid Baroque music.

Later his personal delight as a listener developed into a desire to share his enthusiasms with others. After completing his studies in chemical engineering he began a long career with the large German-based pharmaceutical company now known as Merck KGaA. Like many other major European businesses which support company musical groups, Merck had (and still has) a chamber orchestra. However,

Merck had this wonderful institution and in 1979 they were on the brink of being dissolved and finished for funding reasons. The conductor who was a good friend of mine working in the research department, Dr Zidenek Simane, stuck our heads together and got the brilliant idea, I think, to bring this orchestra to Vienna. In [the] Vienna Hofburg, this wonderful palace of arts in Vienna. [It] was a place for an International Congress of Chemistry of Diagnostics attended by around 5000 people from around the world. So we managed, somehow, to get this orchestra, the chamber orchestra, to Vienna, to the Hofburg, to the stage as part of the opening ceremony. And my competitors in the field, mostly American companies, other Europeans, were fuming because Merck was mentioned all the time. So as a part of the marketing mix, in today’s words, and it was really wonderful.

Readers reviewing the history of Telemann’s early years in Hamburg, for instance, may recognise the similarity in Schroeder’s delight of finding a new audience to sustain the Merck chamber orchestra, to Telemann’s ability to develop a new audience for his music. After his arrival in Hamburg in 1721 he arranged regular chamber music concerts which became so popular that they had to be moved from his apartment to a much larger public room. While Schroeder describes himself as a non-musician, since his retirement, he has become the founder and president of the Australian Bach Society. He takes great joy in drawing together

---

153 Schroeder said of it ‘It’s the oldest pharmaceutical company in the world. It celebrates 350 years last year [2014]. So it pre-dates Bach’s birth.’

154 Zohn, "Georg Philipp Telemann."
scholars, early career musicians, experienced performers (singers and instrumentalists) to learn by sharing knowledge and experience between here and Bach's home of Leipzig.

During his long career with Merck he often travelled to consult and oversee many of their international enterprises. His hosts, knowing that he enjoyed music, always ensured that concerts and recitals were on his program.

There was always a chance to be invited to a concert. I remember Buenos Aires and after, Cologne. I remember Tokyo. That was an event where a Suzuki orchestra of young people played music very well. In the United States, well it was an American partner that invited me to the Lincoln Center and a most brilliant performance. And later, [as] a more frequent visitor to New York, to musicals and other things. And Mexico and, of course, Europe. So it all added up to that mix of cultural experiences from around the world.

It is surprising to hear that, at this time, Baroque music was not 'on his radar'. Schroeder, then still based in Germany with a growing family, explains that he was not aware of changes occurring in early music repertoire and performance practice. After retiring, his family moved to Melbourne where he found a spiritual home in that city's German Lutheran Church. Thus he linked two great passions: the works and lives of J. S. Bach and Martin Luther. Schroeder describes his deepening connection with Bach and the subsequent founding of the Australian Bach Society.

My experience with Bach [began] in 2006, less than ten years ago. My wife and I travelled extensively in Europe. I have been to Leipzig before when it was GDR times [German Democratic Republic, 1949-1990] of those Soviet-dominated times, and in Leipzig I met Thomas Kantor [music director of St. Thomas's church] Christoph Biller, the sixteenth successor of J. S. Bach. We met, Christoph Biller and his wife Ute. But there was a special reason why I wanted to meet him. Because, he was in Melbourne, two years before in 2004... well, I became involved early in my retirement in the German Lutheran Church. I was invited to organise concerts, became very much involved with the reformation of the congregation, but that's another chapter.

Through his activities arranging concerts he got to know Professor Graham Lieschke (Professor of Medicine) the music director of St John's Lutheran Church, Southgate, located in the centre of Melbourne's arts district. Under Lieschke's direction the church has, for twenty years, been integrating Bach cantatas into weekly services.

I had a first meeting with him and said, “I've been in Leipzig.” He said, I must meet Christoph Biller. "He's a very nice fellow. He's a Pastor at St Thomas, Leipzig.” So that's how I met Bach's successor.
From that time Schroeder has drawn on his habit of making links between musicians, academics, and places (Melbourne and Leipzig in particular).

We started to talk about Bach in Australia. My knowledge was very, very limited at that time, 2006. But, again with other people... you mentioned the name Jan Stockigt before, she was part of that first meeting. We had Douglas Lawrence who's also very well known in Melbourne and elsewhere, helped me along the way and at the end of the three weeks, Christoph Biller told me... well, we agreed at that time Bach has not probably arrived in Australia. And I've repeated this provocative sentence a few times since then. I'm starting now to modify it a little bit. Anyhow, he said [Christoph Biller] “You are experienced in business and marketing. You are retired. You have time to do something about it.”

They agreed on a course of three actions:

- To bring the St Thomas' Boys Choir to Australia (which happened in 2009).
- To begin exchange programs for musician-scholars. To Leipzig: these have included Michael Leighton Jones (Trinity College Choir director visiting twice); Anthony Halliday (first Australian organist to perform at St Thomas, 2013). From Leipzig: St Thomas organist Ullrich Böhme (2011); St Thomas assistant organist, Stephan Kiessling (2014); the vocal group Ensemble Nobiles, five former members of St Thomas' Boys Choir (2015).
- To establish regular Melbourne-based Bachfests modelled after the Leipzig Bachfest. The first was launched in 2012 with twenty events. The second Melbourne Bachfest (2014) also included a two-day Melbourne Bach Forum with Australian Bach scholars and the internationally-known Bach scholar, Christoph Wolff.

While Schroeder is stimulating greater interest in the music of Bach he is, at the same time, aware of Bach’s contemporaries, among them Christoph Graupner (1683-1760) and Telemann but admits his knowledge is limited.

I don’t even know anything at all about Telemann in Australia as such. I’m still sometimes flabbergasted about the limited knowledge about Bach in Australia. And even for people who pretend to be Bach aficionados, I wish they would be a little more curious and look beyond the Melbourne or Sydney boundaries. Telemann... well, of course, through Bach I know quite a lot about. It’s a fascinating story about Telemann’s refusal to become Thomas Kantor in Leipzig. Graupner, by the way, he was in Darmstadt. That’s where my professional life began. I know the Graupner Weg [Road]. it was a very special part of the Darmstadt city. I didn’t know who Graupner was. I learned that later on. So he also said, “No thanks.”

Through his many connections with musicians and scholars, however, he continues to search for openings to share and develop this ‘hidden’ repertoire with others. Schroeder, in discussing
Bach’s appearance at the 1722 audition held in Leipzig for the position of Kapellmeister, recalls a suggestion made by the Melbourne musicologist Jan Stockigt. His response encapsulates his joyous and imaginative way of drawing together scholarship, musicians, and audiences.

Jan Stockigt and someone else [possibly Samantha Owens] at a meeting we had suggested that in Melbourne we should organise a presentation of the three cantatas that were presented by the three guys [J. S. Bach, Graupner, and Telemann] and leave it to the audience to decide which was the best one [laughs]. It’s still spinning in my head. I hope we can do it, one day but it’s a long ride. It’s a long ride. It’s a fantastic topic.

**Pathways**

That final story brings Telemann back into view. It is an example of Schroeder’s resourceful and open-hearted leadership which helps others to think how good ideas might generate delightful events. By following Schroeder’s story we can see how his early drive for education, his desire to share the musical gifts of postwar Berlin, his easy manner of developing diverse friendships and acquaintances through travel, his instinctive professional entrepreneurial and organisational skills, his habit of assuming that all sorts of difficulties can be met and overcome by drawing together others with diverse talents and gifts, and his charm and generosity... all these taken together mark him as a person of rare gifts. As a self-described non-musician Schroeder reminds us of many of Telemann’s own (non-musical) skills, and that suggests changes in Australian musical culture can also be influenced by life pathways other than those based upon ten-thousand hours of musical practice. His story suggests a prompt: might we who are caught up within musical institutions be missing other fruitful pathways or links?

**Rosalind Halton – musicologist (early Italian Baroque), harpsichordist and teacher**

While, for Hans Schroeder, music did not play a big part in his early life, Rosalind Halton became aware of music early in her childhood during the 1950s in Dunedin on the south island of New Zealand. Its cultural life was enriched by the presence of European refugees, many of whom were musicians. In 1957, on her family’s return to New Zealand from a year in Edinburgh, she began ballet lessons inspired by having seen the Scottish National Ballet.

I went to dancing lessons so my first experience of music actually, was an amazing one – a dancing teacher who was from Indonesia, a Dutch Indonesian. Her pianist was a wonderful pianist, Johannes Giesen, who was a student of Gieseking, [Walter Gieseking 1895-1956] so we danced to him playing Chopin, to everything. He was a wonderful pianist. We danced along to Chopin Etudes and Waltzes beautifully played.
As the broader post-war cultural life again began to be re-established in New Zealand audiences welcomed travelling soloists and chamber groups.

I went to every concert that was given in Dunedin. Once I was told I wasn’t going to go and hear Pierre Fournier play because I had got a German exam the next day. I just went out anyhow. There was an active concert life of chamber music, quartets, symphony... yeah, the symphony orchestra would come down from Wellington fairly regularly.

By the end of her secondary schooling it was clear that she would pursue music.

I said to my father I’m not going to study history, which was his subject, but I wanted to study music. He approached the Professor of Music who is a very notable person in my life, Professor Peter Platt.155

Halton had begun her time at the University of Otago, Dunedin, in 1968. New ideas about early music had begun to percolate through to musicians, audiences, and academics in New Zealand.

It was starting to develop because one thing that happened under Peter Platt and maybe in association with the Chamber Music Society, was that there was early music coming to Dunedin. For example Syntagma Musicum [founded 1963] from that early Dutch [school]. They did a very early repertoire, you know, 13th and 14th century music. And also in the university when we did our music course, although early music hadn’t “happened” in Dunedin yet and we hadn’t heard of “performance practice” and stuff like that. We had Thurston Dart’s [1921-1971] *The Interpretation of Music* [1954] to read as a set book. So I already knew that music sounded completely different from the Romantic style of playing Bach and Handel. So I already had that idea from Thurston Dart’s book. And two of our teachers were direct students of Thurston Dart.

After completing a degree in music in New Zealand, Halton went straight on to further studies at Oxford in 1972. It was here, she tells us, that her path was changed.

I was lucky to get a scholarship which took me to Oxford. In Oxford I met original instruments, early music performance, and in first year I went to a performance of St John Passion conducted by [Gustav] Leonhardt [1928-2012]. And this changed my life.

While Halton played a bit of violin in ensembles she also became known as a reliable pianist-accompanist.

I very soon met an influential friend who was my contemporary at Oxford, Kate Eckersley, who was a singer. She said come along to the Baines Consort. Anthony Baines [organologist, 1912-

---

155 Peter Platt was then Professor of Music at the University of Otago, Dunedin and later took up the same role at The University of Sydney and where he taught another participant, Neal Peres Da Costa.
1997], who wrote books about wind instruments, the history of wind instruments. He was floating around and talked to us all. I went and played harpsichord and that was the end of me.

It was along with her friend, Kate Eckersley, and others of the Baines Consort that she began her association with Telemann,

We invited singers, sometimes very fine singers, to perform with us and we performed many Telemann cantatas, during that period. We probably did about six or seven. Kate loved Telemann. The way he wrote for voice sat right in the middle of her range which was... a sort of high mezzo. We also worked with a wonderful tenor who went on to make a good career.

When we both left the Baines Consort we had our own little group. We played with different flautists. So the cantatas were first.

Halton’s experience as a classically-trained trained pianist did not entirely prepare her for continuo-playing. To learn to ornament a musical line, for example, she recalls 'I used to listen to, say, recordings of Leonhardt playing in a group and I would write down, like jazz people do, what I heard and used those as ideas.' During her time at Oxford she was invited to fill that new role for a production of the Handel opera, *Agrippina*.

It was really my first big continuo work. For a certain number of arias, I had time to write stuff down to play. But by the third act I was just improvising. Then I found that I had to improvise my way through anything that went wrong, [or] that the singers omitted. One of them completely forgot to do his da capo, so I just played sort of... embellishments on his line. From those experiences it was my joy to play continuo.

In reflecting on her experience of piano playing and harpsichord playing she said, 'Although I always felt nervous as a pianist, I never felt nervous as a continuo harpsichordist.' Asked about that sense of freedom and if that was the right word, Halton paused before replying.

It is the right word. [then slowly] It... is... a feeling of looking forward and anticipating so much with enjoyment what you can add, which you’ve never heard or played before and which will help the group to hang together. It’s something of that Beatles guitar-playing thing. That you can play something which is noticeable to people with “sharp ears” but doesn’t get in the way, and that rhythmically allows everybody to “gel” and also that changes their sound. That exchange is [with emphasis] something... and that’s why people that you perform with very well may ask for you, if they do. Or thank you very much. They know that it contributes. And it is a kind of secret pleasure because not everybody gets it but the people to whom it’s directed do get it.

Halton notices also that audiences respond to these experiences.
There are things in early music that the audience can’t articulate, for example, intonation. They
don’t know they are listening to pure thirds, for example, but they enjoy them. And I can’t tell
you the number of times that people have said to me after a concert “Enjoyed your twiddles” as
they often describe improvisation. Somebody will notice it and they realise it contributes
something.

After six years in Oxford without a fixed income, Halton thought it might be time to apply for
a job in Australia. It wasn’t long before two offers arrived within twenty-four hours. After a
year in Melbourne she took up a lectureship in Armidale (1986-1999) at the University of New
England (NSW). It was the presence of Professor Cath Ellis (1935-1996) that particularly
attracted her there.

Her speciality was Aboriginal music but also how we perceive and learn music. She was deeply
interested in how music is learned in different cultures and, also, biologically. You see, Cath
Ellis was an integration person. That was her “thing”. Integrating performance and research.
That was why I went there.

With Halton’s meticulous and thoughtful consideration of these issues, she has opened up
questions about how humans ‘hear’, how we focus our listening. As she thinks about how
musicians enable listeners to hear Telemann ‘afresh’, she recalls work done during her Oxford
years.

Maybe this is where my thesis comes in... that was about how phrases work together and how
music is constructed.\textsuperscript{156} How cadences are made, approached, avoided, timed... so one needs a
feeling of ‘jokes’ that are concealed in the music... of timing. The dialogue between
instruments... there’s an element of humour in the way that parts exchange ideas and ‘bat’ off
each other. I’m also thinking of some very profound emotive movements of Telemann in which
not just the harmonic structure but also the textures, the use of register and colour are
understood and, therefore, are acted out.

These skills of subtle analysis may not be available to young or untrained musicians which
may be why, she suggests, Bach or Handel are preferred over the less heard Telemann or
Scarlatti ‘... because everybody can put on good recordings of it so you can copy those good
recordings.’

In 1999 Halton took up a position as Associate Professor at the University of Newcastle
(NSW) where she continues to work on collaborative research projects, teaches, and performs.

---

\textsuperscript{156} Rosalind J. Parsonson (now Halton), "Symphonic Style and Structural Tonality in the Late Eighteenth Century with
http://solo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/OXVU1:tSCOP_OX:oxfaleph012211117.).
**Pathways**

Halton’s memories of postwar New Zealanders keen to re-establish education, music and dance cultures enriched by the contributions of refugees, touring ensembles and soloists, evoke a time and a place when it was the desire of many to make up for lost time. While she had a taste of early music developments as an undergraduate it was during her time in Oxford that she became an harpsichordist and formed strong links with other like-minded musicians in that place. With a strong desire to link research with teaching and performance she arrived in Australia as boundaries between disciplines, at least in some places, were becoming less fixed. At the University of New England (Armidale) there was a strong interest in Aboriginal music and musical cognition. As can be seen in her DPhil thesis (Oxford) her subtle way of thinking below the surface of music, whether instinctual or analytical or both, has helped establish her reputation as a welcome musical collaborator and teacher. As discussed above, it is just this sort of thinking that can enliven performances grounded in subtle gestures of the *galant* style of Telemann and others. Halton, clearly a *Kenner* as well as someone with the instincts of a good teacher, suggests, for example, the persistence in musical culture of the music of Bach and Handel over Telemann and Scarlatti may be based partly on the easy availability of recordings of the former when compared to the latter; but the reception of Telemann and Scarlatti may be pushed along with the continuing and growing number of stylishly effective performances and recordings of their music so that young musicians and those among the *Liebhaber* too may absorb the spirit and style of the *galant*. Halton’s teaching as well as her playing and recordings may be helping to open this pathway.

**Peter Webb – oboist and cor anglais player (retired), composer and conductor**

Most but not all participants in this group have strong links to early music and historically-informed performance and are familiar with the music of Telemann. For Peter Webb, however, whose training finally led to an orchestral career, Telemann appeared later. While Webb’s playing career was shortened by noise-induced hearing loss, that did not stop his musical-making altogether. In 2007 he was awarded the Medal of the Order of Australia “for services to the arts as a conductor, composer, teacher, and musician”.

Webb, speaking about the moment *his* course was set, recalled hearing the Australian oboist, David Wooley (1924-2005) who held principal positions with professional orchestras in Melbourne, Sydney, and London. Wooley, a former art student of Webb’s father at The Geelong College, presented a recital at the school before moving from Melbourne to Sydney.
I thought this was the most astonishing, wonderful thing that I’d ever heard. This oboe being played, *magically*, in front of me.

Webb’s path did not, however, take him through to the standard conservatory training. Rather, he completed a Bachelor of Music and Philosophy degree at Melbourne University (1965).

I did three years teaching in a Victorian country town and so the oboe was just a "hobby". And at the end of those three years I thought, if I’m ever going to become a professional player I need to get on with it. Because more kids who can play more semiquavers are stacking up behind me. [Laughs] So I practiced hard... I got into a group which now doesn’t exist but in those days was called the National Training Orchestra in Sydney run by the ABC, the Australian Broadcasting Commission as it was then. I was successful and got in and then in 1973 I resigned from teaching.

The repertoire was pretty standard orchestral fare.

Because of my great love of orchestral music I knew every work we played. I knew the sound of it and the style of it. Brahms symphonies, Beethoven symphonies, whatever. Apart from an occasional little one I came across that I didn’t know.

The ‘little ones’ he mentioned included works Turina, Copland, and less often played works like Ravel’s *Alborada del Gracioso*. After a three-month stint with the Elizabethan Trust Sydney Orchestra he found a position as second oboe and cor anglais player with the Tasmanian Symphony. During this period, the early 1970s, he and his viola-playing wife together with a few others formed a chamber music group called *Ayres Baroque* which naturally played a great deal of Baroque music. Here he speaks of the rich pickings in this literature for the oboe player.

If you look at the oboe repertoire the bulk of it is Baroque, you know Telemann, Vivaldi, Bach, Handel. These are the guys that you played all the time.

For Webb, his wife and friends, this chamber music repertoire offered a refreshing break from orchestral playing.

But if you’re a student or you’re an advanced student or you’re a person who does a lot of playing at concerts of varying degrees of significance [you do it] because you want to... A third or half of your program is always going to be Baroque music. In a way, I suppose, it’s an easy fix. Nice to listen to. Nice to play. Doesn’t take your accompanist six months to prepare it. [Laughs] It’s *not* the Richard Rodney Bennett concerto. And it’s very gratifying to listen to. Vivaldi and Telemann, Handel concertos... really, really beautiful, gracious, gratifying works to play.
He and his wife moved to Adelaide in 1975 where took up a position as Principal Cor Anglais player with the Adelaide Symphony eventually retiring from that position in 1995. Chamber music, however, continued to be an important part of their musical lives with the establishing of a new group, still under the name Ayres Baroque. Webb was aware of recent developments in early music playing although he had little opportunity to explore them in depth. Here he speaks about his awareness of today’s of depth of understanding of early music among experienced performers or scholars.

These days the Baroque specialists that’ll tell you how to do turns and... whether you do an inverted mordant or a straight one, what decorations you put on, and there’s the Urtext and there’s the decorated text, you know. That sort of thing. I didn’t get too much into that. I’d put in trills and if I did a repeat I’d do melismas and things between... I did do a little bit of work with an oboe player [Jillian Streater, a student of Heinz Holliger] from England who came out and played in Adelaide for a while. She gave me some insights into Baroque ornamentation. One of them was a Vivaldi concerto for two oboes and orchestra which we did with keyboard. We played it together and we got all the turns together and everything. It was fantastic.

Pathways

As with other many participants music was, for Webb, welcome in his home and school environments. Like Roslyn Haynes, as a youth his musical path seems to have been set after an especially powerful musical experience: a recital at his school by the visiting oboist, David Wooley. Later, his musical pathway took him to the University of Melbourne for a degree in Philosophy and Music, perhaps signalling his independent streak. After some years of teaching he decided he wanted to try for an orchestral career. At that time, in the early 1970s, it was possible but it required determination and grit. He was following the music style path of most professionals of the time which Bruce Haynes calls the ‘modernist’ archetype. Like other orchestral players, chamber music was for Webb a welcome change and a way to link with local communities. Telemann’s music naturally formed part of their repertoire. While he was aware of developments in early music performance practice, he drew on these in a somewhat limited way. For Webb and many other Australian musicians working within the mainstream musical mould between the 1970s and the 1990s Telemann’s music was charming and useful in filling programs, but at that time its reception may have been affected by the then limited understanding of *galant* style upon which it clearly depends for its most potent musical effects.

---

157 Haynes, pp. 48-51.
Janice (Jan) B. Stockigt – musicologist, Honorary of Melbourne Conservatorium of Music

Born in Melbourne where she began piano lessons, the family soon moved to the pretty country town of Bright, Victoria, three hundred kilometres away, where she continued to play. The local high school didn’t offer the senior levels so she spent a year working in a bank.

In the meantime I always played a harmonium in the Bright Methodist Church, every Sunday morning and every Sunday night. I could only play in three keys: C, G, and F-Major so everything had to be transposed. I did that myself simply because I couldn’t play in other keys but I learned a lot about harmony and chords in that I knew the seventh of a dominant seventh should fall and the third should rise. I just knew that.

After returning to Melbourne to finish high school she was inspired to take up oboe after hearing Jiří Tancibudek, former principal oboist of the Czech Philharmonic. He had arrived in Australia in 1950 after turning down an offer from the Chicago Symphony because his American visa would not include his wife, the pianist, Vera née Hašková.

During that time I went to my first concert. Jiří Tancibudek... was playing the Haydn Oboe Concerto and I decided that was what I wanted to do. My first teacher was Tamara Coates, the daughter of Sir Albert Coates. She was a cor anglais player in the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra.

About half-way through her four years at the Melbourne Conservatorium of Music she became a student of Tancibudek.

He was a very natural player and I remember the problem... I didn’t have vibrato so I asked him “How does one acquire vibrato?” He said [that] he was just playing the slow movement of the Beethoven 3rd Symphony “And it came.” So he couldn’t tell me.

The issue of vibrato came up much later during the writing of her Master’s thesis on the editing and performing of Baroque music.¹⁵⁸

I went through every reference made by Charles Burney (1726-1814) in “To Good Taste”¹⁵⁹ and it has to do with ornamentation and the thing I learned was that vibrato... was applied. It wasn’t part of sound. You’re right about the mechanical nature of vibrato. I don’t like it and of course when I went to baroque oboe, which is much later [in her career] I had to get rid of it.

¹⁵⁸ Stockigt.
Before writing her thesis (on Telemann’s *Der getreue Music-Meister*) she heard a performance of *Messiah* quite unlike the typical large-forces versions. This occurred just before she and her husband, Richard ‘Jim’ Stockigt (1938-2012), moved to San Francisco.

Just before we left we played in a Messiah performance conducted by Graham Bartle (1928- ) who was attached to the University Conservatorium. He used a very small choir and a very small orchestra. The tempi were totally different from anything I’d ever experienced before. He *could* because of the smallness of the ensemble. I was just enchanted. I thought this was wonderful.

It is worth including an extended passage here from Stockigt’s recollections of that time in San Francisco of the late 1960s for it gives us a sense of the new ideas about early music playing at the time.

Because that’s where it really all happened. Where, with all of those Nonesuch Records and the playing of Baroque music... This is the late ‘60s. And I should tell you that I met Bruce Haynes. We lived the first year in San Francisco and then we moved to Berkeley. Bruce had just made his first baroque oboe. And he asked me to try it out. Well, I didn’t have reeds...

Bruce Haynes has become well-known to those studying changes in performance styles of early music. Stockigt continues her story.

Yes I did a lot of Baroque chamber music. There were some very interesting people living in San Francisco and Berkeley at that time. The first time I played with a harpsichord was with Jean Nandi who was the daughter of Hovhaness, the composer [Alan] Hovhaness. It was said in Berkeley at that time that if you were “anybody” you had a Volvo and a harpsichord. Before we went to America we had joined something called the International Chamber Music Players Association. You ranked yourself as a player, what sort of music you liked to play and what you played, and there was a directory, a very big directory so you could go anywhere in the world and play chamber music. We looked up San Francisco and we found Citret Coleman (- d. 1984) who was a flute player. He was a surgeon and he had a harpsichord. [Laughs] At his house we played chamber music with Jean Pierre Rampal, Coleman’s good friend because they used to get in the kitchen and cook together.

After a spell in London, where she continued to be an active chamber music player they returned to Australia where she continued teaching and playing. In 1975 Nikolaus Harnoncourt (1929-2016) brought his period-instrument ensemble, Concentus Musicus Wien, to Australia. Hearing the group play was a signal moment for Stockigt.

---

160 Haynes; Haynes and Burgess.
I found that listening became a conscious thing. Listening to these instruments you actually had to concentrate to listen. It wasn’t... it didn’t come at you. You were part of the... almost the process because you really had to listen. And at that time I decided I just had to play baroque oboe.

The experience Stockigt describes was not uncommon because, as we will hear from other participants, these sounds, the music, and the whole sensibility of early music playing at that time was uncommon in Australia. Her hesitations (indicated by ellipses) suggest that her experience remains fresh in her memory.

I had to really listen. I really had to listen to... but it was just... it was just wonderful... it was just a wonderful experience to hear baroque instruments orchestrally. I hadn’t heard this in the flesh before.

Stockigt remains a delightful, vivacious scholar and is a welcome presenter at many conferences. During the long research interview she reached for her copy of the Telemann Correspondence. One of her favourite lectures is based upon these letters to friends such as Pisendel and Handel. Through her deep knowledge of the music, the people, and the period she offers listeners a rich experience of those bound together.

**Pathways**

Like Webb and Halton, Stockigt was also strongly affected by the musicality of postwar immigrants. Her path to early music was also strongly influenced by a small-forces performance in Melbourne. Through her subsequent to the USA and the UK put Stockigt in touch with others engaged in establishing careers the early music culture. After her return to Melbourne it was at a concert led by Nicholas Harnoncourt that she experienced a new way of hearing music of the Baroque: the transparency of colours and textures demanded greater aural and mental awareness. Over a long professional career, focussed mainly on musicology, she has drawn on her enthusiasm for sharing deep scholarship within networks of like-minded musickers both here and Europe. Her joyful suggestions couched in phrases like: ‘Do you know about this....?’ or ‘Have you heard such and such?’ make her a welcome conference participant and colleague. Several participants in this study have mentioned how they have been nudged in just such a way. While best known for her work on Zelenka, Telemann has long been core repertoire as well.

---

161 Telemann. *Briefwechsel.*
Ruth Wilkinson – recorder and viola da gamba player and teacher

Wilkinson, born in the Sydney area (Hornsby), grew up in musically rich home and school environments studying piano, became a self-taught recorder player, and embarked on playing double bass.

That’s introduced me to an awful lot of music that maybe I’d not have got to play if I’d specialised only in recorder. That multi-instrumental idea that you’d get in the 17th and 18th century which is quite common is one that I’d fostered I guess. I grew up studying the piano which I’m very grateful to have done because I have a good sense of harmony and it’s held me in good stead.

Arriving at the University of Queensland in 1962 to begin a bachelor of music degree she continued playing both piano and bass as a double major and also found opportunities to play recorder. After a spell of music teaching at The Geelong College (Victoria) Wilkinson travelled to Basel, Switzerland to attend the then recently established early music centre Schola Cantorum Basiliensis. She was accepted as a recorder player studying under Hans-Martin Linde (1930–) but soon her experience on double bass was also recognised. The three years there (1974–1976) occurred at a fruitful time in European early music movement.

I also then got to study because of my double bass playing. They wanted a baroque bass player so they got me on to violone [a lower pitch viola da gamba]. It was all serendipity really. I started that with Jordi Savall. That was a great miracle really. A lot of my Basel experience was really introducing me first of all to Medieval music with the Studio for Early Music with Thomas Binkley, Andrea von Ramm [mezzo soprano] and those people...

On her return to Australia in 1977 Wilkinson soon found others who were keen to perform this ‘new’ repertoire. One group, La Romanesca, focussed on Medieval music while the other, Capella Corelli, drew on the rich trio and solo sonata repertoire. The latter group, with harpsichordist John O'Donnell, and baroque violinist Cynthia O'Brien included a good amount of Telemann's music on their programs.

Cynthia and I, I think, would know every single trio sonata there was over the years... violin and recorder of course. I have performed a lot of Telemann recorder solos, because yes, audiences always respond well to Telemann, especially the trio sonatas. We would often end a program with a Telemann trio sonata because it was a bit of a crowd pleaser.

162 Wilkinson took up the role of music teacher at The Geelong College following on from the countertenor Hartley Newnham with whom she later formed the early music ensemble, La Romanesca and where she met the then student, Gary Ekkel, now music teacher, choir director, baroque flute player and a participant in this project.

163 Binkley went on to establish what became a similarly renown early music centre at the University of Indiana where another participant, Sue Collins, came across him.
Asked about what it is that audiences liked about these chamber works, Wilkinson said...

I think there’s a great melodic beauty in them. [Pause] The harmonic interest in them [with] lovely harmonic passage work in Telemann. [Pause] It’s that aspect of Telemann where he has a step in [to the world of] the galant. It’s often not really Baroque. He’s experimenting with the new classical style that’s emerging, isn’t it. Compared to Bach it’s easy listening. But it’s very skilfully composed.

As a performer of long experience she considers the ‘shelf-life’ of often repeated repertoire. Does chamber music of Telemann which may delight an audience on a single hearing begin to pall if played many times over a season? What is the experience of a musician?

Cynthia and I were involved at one stage Capella Corelli with Musica Viva’s school programs and we would have done 300 programs... even more really... around NSW. In that program we took a variety of Baroque pieces to introduce to the kids. We always played a Telemann trio sonata. We had two or three we would change... We never got sick of them... [repeating to stress] We never got sick of them. Three hundred playings of a work in a six-week period. I think that says a lot. Sometimes we might have got a bit... blasé about playing them because we were just plain tired... three concerts a day... but our love of the music never waned. I think that says something about their strength. We often revisit those particular sonatas and find new things and they’re quite virtuosic too. They require a lot of skill to do, in the semiquaver passages. The interpretation of them is interesting. Like in the flute Fantasias there’s a movement between the abstract sonata kind of movement and then the dance combined with [another] dance. I think that’s part of his gift, he’s able to incorporate the French influence together with the Italian influence and create this... merged style. He gets the best from both. What was being produced from the 17th century he takes into the 18th century in that High Baroque sense. I love it when he goes into a French mode. You get a Sarabande and not a Sarabanda and you get a Courant and not a Corrente. And having to interpret that through Telemann’s music. I think that’s really interesting.

As the discussion broadened to consideration of the place of Telemann among her students and colleagues, she expressed her delight and passion for his music.

All my colleagues I’ve ever played with... we all love it. Certainly the audiences do and I’ve played to a very broad audience from the fairly formal, stiff Musica Viva subscription series in the big concert halls (too big I might add) to the little, local concert. People do love it. The students love playing it. I do a lot of Telemann with my university students just to get them relaxed, to get them to enjoy the music. They’re good for sight-reading, of course. You know, as a teacher [you might say], “Let’s read this in the original... transpose it a minor third.” That was my first lesson with Hans-Martin Linde. He put a Quantz duo in front of me and said, “Let’s play together.” I thought, “This’ll be nice.” And I looked at it and of course [he said] “and we’ll
transpose it a minor third” with a twinkle in his eye. And I thought, “Jeepers, how do you do this?” You know... [she recalls] shrinking. As soon as he explained, being a double bass player, thank god, I could read the bass clef very well. That was such an eye-opener. So I’ve used Telemann for that purpose.

Finally, in recalling the responses of audiences in Europe to Telemann’s music she spoke of the tours of Capella Corelli. She also notes how, even today, there may still be a division between the Kenner (connoisseurs) and the Liebhaber (keen audiences and amateur musicians).

We’ve taken Telemann with us and surprisingly people don’t even know it in Europe as well. You know we’ve played it in Vienna, you know centre of all music, and a lot in Italy. We’ve played it in Germany. We’ve played in Belgium. On the Continent the audiences come up and are so refreshed by this lovely music. [But] if you went to the conservatories, if you played in Basel that would be another matter, and Amsterdam, and The Hague, and the big centres and probably Berlin these days... Bremen. [However] for the general public that’s going to concerts... first of all, they’re fascinated with early music. It’s still a “new” thing, unfortunately. The music speaks to people. The humour speaks to people.

Pathways

Like Halton in New Zealand, and Dikmans in Australia, Wilkinson’s pathway reflects the experience of others among the first postwar generation of early music performers, the Kenner. For most of those in this cohort, Australian tertiary music institutions were not then places for early music playing or study. For most travel was essential. For Wilkinson it was Basel, Switzerland. Wilkinson’s study of recorder, piano, and contrabass resulted in her unusual position as a multi-instrumentalist (recorder, viola da gamba) although she has pointed out it was common among players of the Renaissance and Baroque periods. Travel to Europe continues to be an important element of her professional musical life and allows her to work with colleagues. Travel also enables her to gauge evolving audience responses to their performance repertoire including Telemann. His music regularly receives good responses from general audiences, although reactions in European music centres with busy concert schedules can be more muted. Without more evidence it would be hard to determine why this is so although it may be the lingering effect of an earlier ideal of greatness. It is surely reassuring, however, that both she and her colleagues who have played and recorded Telemann’s music during long careers regularly return to it with pleasure.
Greg Dikmans — baroque flute and recorder, teacher

Like other musicians of the time, Greg Dikmans taught himself to play recorder during his school years. While still a student at Sydney Grammar School he recalls the appearance of European early music mail-order recordings in Australia.

I’d convinced my dad to join the World Record Club [active 1955-65]. They had an old, old recording with Hans-Martin Linde (1930- ) and Ragossnig [Konrad Ragossnig (1932 - )] playing lute which had some Telemann recorder sonatas. So I was learning those, the Telemann recorder sonatas in the early 1970s while I was still at school, my final two years of school (1971-72).

At that time the Australian early music scene, while active, drew from a limited number of players so opportunities to be involved in performances fell to those who could play with accuracy and confidence.

It was kind of weird because I was still at Sydney Grammar and Peter Seymour (1932-1987) was the head of music there. He put on a Purcell opera because he ran the Philharmonia choir in Sydney. It was at modern pitch and Winsome [Evans (1941- )] was playing harpsichord and I was playing recorder. Two arias... It was huge for me to be involved in something like that and she invited me to come a play in the Renaissance Players while I was still at school.

It was during his playing with Renaissance Players based at Sydney University that he began playing baroque flute. After entering the University of Sydney playing the modern flute he asked to change to baroque flute.

Halfway through my Bachelor of Music I wanted to swap from modern flute to baroque flute and recorder as my principal [instruments]. And they thought “What a nutcase.” The Associate Professor, Professor Gross [Eric Gross (1926-2011)], bless his heart, took me aside and said, “Well, there’s no repertoire is there and we can’t let you do it.” Well, I did it anyway.

He found support, however, from his teacher, flute player Margaret Crawford.

The problem was there wasn’t a baroque flute teacher but Margaret Crawford very kindly allowed me to play baroque flute in my lessons with her. She’s a good musician so we were working it out together. But she’d also studied recorder in Europe and Howard Oberg at some point [was] on the scene as a recorder player so I was having some lessons with him.

Clearly Australia didn’t then offer those interested in early music performance the standard of teaching found in the conservatories so, like others, he travelled to one of the active European centres, the Royal Conservatorium in Brussels, Belgium where his teacher was Barthold Kuijken. The leap to Europe, however, had been prepared much earlier as a result of the
postwar arrival of refugees to Australia with a love of music, many of whom were musicians. Musica Viva, the performing arts organisation established in 1945, had been arranging concerts of visiting artists for a generation by the time Dikmans was asked for his advice by its director, Kim Williams.

I started to play Musica Viva concerts with a lute player called Max Hynam [called the Early Music Duo, 1980-1982]. We did a lot of Renaissance – early Baroque stuff with recorders and lute and some stuff with flute. That’s when Kim Williams was the General Manager of Musica Viva. He asked me, “Who are the top people in Baroque music in the world?” The only way we’d hear about it was by buying recordings (LPs). There were a couple of music stores that had Classical sections. We’d order in anything we saw. “Just order it in and we’ll buy it.” I had Franz Brüggen, a big influence as a recorder player and then the Kuijkens… Leonhardt, and Kim Williams asked “Who are the best guys?” I said, “If you want to get the best, get the Kuijkens to come out.” [Sigiswald Kuijken and Wieland Kuijken] They did a number of tours in the late 1970s, early 80s.

Because of that personal connection when a page-turner was needed for one of the concerts, it was Dikmans that Kim Williams called. The artists involved were Gustav Leonhardt with Sigiswald, Wieland and Bart Kuijken. Dikmans recalls the experience.

In one of the Sydney concerts, Kim asked me to turn pages for them in the concerts. So I asked Bart Kuijken [baroque flute] about having lessons. He said, fine. Come over. I think my grandfather died around 1979 and I inherited a bit of money so I was able to go to Europe for three months during the summer. There were some summer courses going. I went and had some lessons with Bart privately. Then I went back home [to Sydney]. The first piece I played in a lesson for him was one of the Telemann Fantasias. Because it’s such a wonderfully varied collection of music, it covers everything. I’m still learning stuff about those pieces. It’s just extraordinarily rich repertoire for flute, and the violin ones and the keyboard ones.

The three months proved to not be enough but again events conspired to make a more sustained effort possible.

I was doing more Musica Viva concerts till I finally got a Churchill fellowship followed by an Australian Council grant. I was then able to go study with Bart Kuijken officially, full time. I was living in The Hague, but commuting down…well I arrived and he said, “Come and audition in Brussels” because he taught in [both] The Hague and in Brussels so I could fit in more easily there [Brussels]. It was an hour and a half on the train once a week to go down and that was it. I spent two wonderful years…

Following two years in Brussels (1983-4) Dikmans returned to Australia where he established himself as a teacher (Early Music studio, University of Melbourne) and player (soloist and
founding member of the *Elysium Ensemble*). He is further engaged in PhD studies focussing on the use of rhetoric in aspects of early music performance practice at the University of Melbourne. Scholarship continues to inform his performance. With baroque violinist, Lucinda Moon, they have developed a recital based on demonstrating the effect that pitch plays in sound.

So these different flutes that have different constructions. I would describe them as three flutes, three pitches, three sound-worlds. People are really appreciative when [they] hear it in concert, one after another. It turns out the violin can cope quite well, it’s quite used to it, especially if you start at a lower pitch and work your way up. And we play these duets and we each play some solos. Two years ago we did a series of concerts at the Salon at the Melbourne Recital Centre with the title *Dialogue: the Art of Elegant Conversation*.

With his deep knowledge of Baroque styles, especially the Italian and the French, he gives much to both students and audiences. Telemann’s music, along with that of other German, Italian and French composers, serves both groups well. Students in his Baroque period performance class at the University of Melbourne still are surprised and delighted by this “unknown” composer.

In the later years we started to let some singers join. The first thing I’d do was to pair them up with a violin or a flute and a keyboard player and tell them to go to the library and look through *der Harmonische Gottesdienst* and select a cantata... The students were always blown out by that because they’d never heard of him. They know Bach and they know that Bach wrote all these cantata cycles. I said to them, “Well, you know, Telemann did the same. But he did for the little towns where they didn’t have a full orchestra and that it’s absolutely wonderful music.” I’ve yet to hear one that’s no good. They are very interesting musical... educationally because it draws on many skills for the performer. Lot of problems to solve. And it’s good because you’ve got the text. Usually the singers are more comfortable with German. I start with that and the next thing I get them on to some French which freaks them out a bit more because they don’t do a lot of stuff in French.

Dikmans, for thirty years, has led his students through this material, largely unmediated by an editor’s pen.

I do the same with all the instrumental students. I very early introduce them to reading from facsimiles which means reading different clefs and playing French style. To play Bach and Telemann you have to understand French style equally as good as Italian style. When they start blending the things you’ve got to be able understand the difference. And understand when they’re trying to be French, when they’re trying to be German. That’s why the Telemann *Paris Quartets* are so fascinating because he consciously writing for the French taste at that time. It’s
funny because he doesn’t quite always get it right. It’s a really good attempt of a non-Frenchman writing French style. Some of the movements are very French in character, while some of it could be Beethoven or something much later.

When asked how audiences respond to the music of Telemann he replied...

[With enthusiasm] They love it. They love it. They love it. They think, “Oh God, that’s so beautiful.” The Paris Quartets, it’s real chamber music. If you came in from the more traditional string quartet—that’s obviously really high quality music. But for people who’ve never been to a chamber music concert they get... I mean they get just as excited because there’s amazing things... the interplay between the instruments... all that. But also in the early days when I was playing flute things in restaurants, some of the Telemann recorder sonatas... people would love that. Because it’s very charming music...it’s very good music.

Pathways

Dikmans’s development as a young Australian musician was encouraged by the enthusiasm among early music players of the amateur let’s-have-a-go atmosphere of the 1970s. On entering university to study music, it was as a modern flute player. He and a sympathetic teacher helped to open up the option for baroque flute. By haunting record shops and checking listings of new recordings he built up a knowledge of who the influential players were and happened to form a link with the touring Kuijken family. Being in the relatively small pond of Australian musicking may have been a factor in Dikmans development but, given his on-going musical success, he has also focused on many aspects of the early music world: the galant style incorporating the mixed style, the principles of rhetoric, the study of temperament, developments in instrument-making, and on the list goes. Telemann’s music has a secure place in his playing and study. Like Telemann, Dikmans has established and maintained links with many other musickers, both local and distant. His pattern of developing ideas collaboratively with other artists and researchers puts him among the Kenner but he also offers students new ways of playing and audiences new ways of listening.

Lyn & Peter Hawkins — president and secretary, respectively, of The Early Music Society of Victoria

In her study of amateur music-making in a community of the UK, Ruth Finnegan has demonstrated that, at least before the mid-1980s, musicologists and ethnographers had largely focussed on the working lives and education of professional, conservatory-trained musicians.164 Readers will see that, with a few exceptions, most participants of this study are

164 Finnegan.
also largely drawn from this cohort. Therefore, these two participants, Peter and Lyn Hawkins, with long experience of high-level music making as members of the Early Music Society of Victoria (holding positions of secretary and president), serve as exemplars of what Finnegan termed ‘hidden musicians’. Their early musical experiences, however, are no less remarkable.

Lyn Hawkins described her father (an architectural draftsman) as a very good keyboard player who found it somewhat limiting so about 1958 he joined an adult education recorder class. She recalls hearing recordings of Wanda Landowska playing early music.

I was hearing it when I was four or five. Including Telemann, I mean because he was interested in recorder and trio sonatas. We had recordings that were done by all those early musicians... Gustav Leonhardt and all those...

Peter Hawkins’ formative music experiences were quite different from Lyn’s. While there was music in the family – his grandfather had played cornet in the Victorian country town of Ararat, his mother and an aunt had played piano, his uncle had been an oboist in an orchestra run by the Australian composer, Dorian Le Gallienne (1915-1963) – sadly, he never heard any of them play. Instead his musical influences came via the radio.

I was a fan of Buddy Holly and all those sort of things and I wanted more than anything to play guitar... I started learning guitar at Downbeat in Russel Street. It was a sort of jazz club. The guitarist there was Barry Ellis. He was a jazz guitarist who dabbled in classical [guitar]. Our heroes in those days were Charlie Byrd... My interest somewhat shifted to classical guitar ‘cause of Barry, I suppose. So I joined the Guitar Society in the year it was founded [1964]. I think it was during the Segovia visit.

Lyn’s father, hearing that her school was to hold an Elizabethan festival the next year, had clear ideas of what should be included.

My father went up to the school and said, “Well, you can’t do an Elizabethan pageant without including things like a viola da gamba and a harpsichord.” So my father then said, “Right, you’ll have to have a viol.” So I borrowed a bass viol from Mischa Schneider, from the Budapest String Quartet [then in Australia for a concert tour] and learnt how to play it for a year. I went to a cello teacher, Kathleen Tuohy, who knew harpsichordist Mancel Kirby who was the friend of Mischa Schneider. Miss Tuohy used Christopher Simpson’s *The Division Viol* written in 1659 using a facsimile. So [we] went through this book from page one.

---

Lyn’s father, Kenneth Williams, got drawings and measurements of a division viol from the Boston Museum of Fine Arts, which has a large collection of instruments and, in 1962, made an instrument for her. This story gives us a sense of the eagerness among those then hearing recordings and concerts of early music groups. Lyn and Peter got together to play duets (recorder and guitar) but soon Peter took up the lute. From the early 1970s the number of amateur players in early music groups grew in Melbourne and their audiences were fascinated.

We played with groups of musicians on crumhorns and other Renaissance and Baroque [period] instruments and we’d give concerts. People would come because it was a pretty special time, you know. There weren’t a lot of authentic instruments being used at that time.

At the time of the professionalisation of the early music movement was in what Nick Wilson calls the ‘Growth’ stage, amateurs too began travelling to workshops, summer schools, and to European venues such as the Dolmetsch festival in Surrey (UK). While in England in 1972 Lyn had viol lessons with Cécile Dolmetsch, daughter of Arnold Dolmetsch, while Peter took up the lute.

PETER - We made a day of it each time we went down... maybe once a month. I went to Diana Poulton for lute lessons. She was Arnold Dolmetsch’s first lute student.

While there they bought a pardessus [pardessus de viole], a small treble viol.

PETER – So in our long winter evenings up in Northampton, Lyn attempted to teach me to play the pardessus and so we played duets.

About the same time, professionally-trained orchestral musicians also began to think that it might be to their advantage to know something of these ‘new’ instruments, techniques and repertoires. Lyn’s observations of how their training affected their playing are remarkable.

LYN- Well, the thing about professional players is they came to early music from a later era. They were all trained in modern instruments and music practice first. From modern violins, some modern cellists, modern flautists and they took up an early instrument, so they were going backwards in period. For most of the amateur musicians, they didn’t do it that way. They went forwards. They started on recorder or they started as madrigal singers or some other route than that.

PETER – And if amateurs picked up the viol it would be their first stringed instrument.

166 Further details of Lyn’s and Peter’s stories and Kenneth William’s remarkable instrument-making can be found in Appendix B under the entry for Lyn and Peter Hawkins and in the PhD thesis (University of Melbourne, 2005) of Patricia Duke.

167 Wilson, p. 28-29.
LYN – Modern string players have been brought up in the orchestral mode. It’s the way they start phrases. The way an orchestra would start… You see an orchestra starting and they go… [demonstrating a firm down bow] and you see a professional early music group and they don’t. They look at each other’s eyes or… it’s much more among themselves.

During this same period of the early 1970s early music festivals drew enthusiastic audiences. Lyn and others of the Early Music Society of Victoria along with Professor Ian Donald (Monash University) started the Early Music Unlimited (EMU) festival which continued for twelve years. This Melbourne home-grown festival was based on a mixture of local amateur groups with one or two ‘name’ professional groups. Another festival, the Melbourne International Festival of Organ and Harpsichord (MIFOH) established in 1971, also pulled in crowds.

LYN – So MIFOH sort of grew. It took the place when ours stopped. We held the festivals for quite a while and then we just got sick of it. You know… we’d bring people out for it. It was a big deal. It was also to help emerging groups here to have a venue to play at. By the time the last EMU festival happened the groups could organise themselves. They were becoming more professional and they didn’t need us. They could do it [all] themselves.

Both Lyn and Peter spoke about the decreasing numbers of amateur early music musicians while the number of professional early music groups has increased markedly. While the standards of both local and international groups have risen, so have ticket prices. Peter, speaking about a recent concert given by the Canadian group, Tafelmusek, said…

PETER – Yes, there was “The House of Dreams”. That was two weeks ago. Last week we had the Brandenburg Orchestra doing an all Handel program. William Christie was down this week, Les Arts Florissant… and what was the other group?

LYN – If we had gone to everything, it would have been six or seven hundred bucks! That week!

While Peter and Lyn recognise that the role of amateur musicians in the revival of early music has sadly faded, Lyn also spoke about the music of Telemann remaining a consistent element in her repertoire. She has been involved in a Melbourne-based group whose focus is Baroque cantatas. Their programs were often drawn from Telemann’s der Harmonischer Gottes-Dienst (The Harmonious Church Service). Each of these seventy-two cantatas calls for one solo singer, one obligato solo instrument and continuo and so were intended for churches with limited musical resources.

LYN – He composed so many pieces and they’re all so different… and all so entertaining. That was Telemann’s genius and that’s why he’s done so well in the modern era. There’s such a wide variety of music styles, especially in the cantatas.
Lyn, as an instrumentalist, is also aware of Telemann’s skill in writing well for each instrument.

LYN – Because it’s accessible, that’s the other thing. Telemann writes specifically for each instrument. You know those Paris Quartets, those are just brilliant. Because he writes the cello parts for a cello, the gamba parts for a gamba and flute parts for a flute. You pick up your flute... you can play those parts. You pick up your gamba... you can play those parts. You pick up the cello... the cellos have difficulties playing the gamba parts. The gamba have difficulties playing the cello part. He just knew his instruments. He was a master of his craft.

Pathways

In contrast to professionally-trained Kenner, Lyn and Peter Hawkins are firmly within the Liebhaber category. As an example, Lyn’s father was a model of the fervent enthusiasm and radical bent of early music amateurs of the 1960s. He and other serious enthusiasts established associations and clubs, often associated with adult education institutions. Similarly, Lyn’s viol teacher, herself a cellist, used an unmediated seventeenth-century facsimile for teaching. In contrast, Peter’s pathway, started with mid-1950s rock-and-roll leading to jazz guitar. The playing of Segovia soon led him to the lute. Like others of the time, they were drawn to Haslemere where they had lessons with members of the Dolmetsch family, an example of the open-door nature of the early music movement of the 1970s. Shortly after their return to Melbourne they joined with others in establishing an astonishing range of associations, festivals, forming travelling links with players in other countries and so on. Through Lyn’s long experience of playing viola da gamba among fellow amateurs she has developed a deep knowledge of suitable repertoire, with Telemann holding a favoured place because of his knowledge of what best suits each instrument. Now, with the decline of community-based early music societies, Lyn and Peter are saddened as their roles have largely vanished to be replaced by professionalised institutions and organisations. While localised pockets of enthusiasts remain, the shift away from the once important role of the Liebhaber appears to be nearly complete. Those who once played on the stage have moved to the stalls, if they can afford it.
Chapter 6 – Reading the Data – Part 2

Birth Years 1960s, 1970s, 1990s

Birth years 1960s

While participants introduced above had quite diverse working lives, those in this group are somewhat more homogeneous working mostly within educational institutions and chiefly at the tertiary level. Many of this cohort entered tertiary education during the early 1980s, a period characterised by Nick Wilson in his framework of the seven ages of early music performance as the period of ‘Independence (from c. 1980)’. He writes ‘This is a time characterized by searching for life purpose, and testing of boundaries.’\textsuperscript{168} Repertoires of early music ensembles were being extended to ‘the passion and angst of later musical styles’.\textsuperscript{169} Some in this group might be considered to be among the second generation of early music musicians. As students of the creators of the postwar early music movement, they too were looking for opportunities to establish their own careers. Many continued on to postgraduate education thus taking them into Wilson’s ‘age’ of ‘Maturity (from c. 1986).’\textsuperscript{170} In Europe, many musicians left behind the strictures of mainstream playing only to find that, on entering the profession, political top-down organisational structures of many early music ensembles were still present. As a response, in 1986, the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment (OAE) was founded on quite a different model.

The orchestra was an idea born out of the performers’ own frustrations with the limitations of the HIP scene. From the outset the orchestra emphasized its collective credentials, giving all the players a say in its decision making... This was the first time that such an organizational policy, wholly in keeping with the underlying HIP principle of democratic control, had been acted out on such a scale within the movement.\textsuperscript{171}

As we shall see below in accounts of this cohort, many returned to Australia as a growing number of musical schools or conservatoria began to offer thorough-going training in early music.

Participants in this study were invited in an effort to find a diverse sample of musickers. Those considered in the previous chapter had largely dissimilar pathways and so were presented in separate entries. In examining the pathways of participants for this chapter,

\textsuperscript{168} Wilson, p. 30.
\textsuperscript{169} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{170} Ibid., pp. 31-32.
\textsuperscript{171} Ibid., p. 32.
the resonances of their experience and roles suggested they might logically be grouped by pairs. By acknowledging these similarities it might help tease out distinctions in their choices, actions, and responses.

They appear in this order:

- **Sue Collins** (violin) & **Anne-Marie Forbes** (musicology and music history)
- **Gary Ekkel** (baroque flute, choral conducting) & **Hans-Dieter Michatz** (baroque flute & recorder)
- **Samantha Owens** (musicology & baroque oboe) & **Neal Peres Da Costa** (musicology & historical keyboard)
- **Phillip Sametz** (broadcaster ABC Classic FM) & **Stephen Yates** (Admin. Sydney Conservatorium of Music).
- **Megan Lang** (modern and baroque flute, teacher) & **Liane Sadler** (modern and baroque flute, early career musician).

Comments about their shared characteristics precede their individual entries which are followed by notes about their pathways. Networks between participants and others will be discussed in the final chapter. Observations about the place of Telemann’s music in their individual musical lives can be found within both the paired entries and comments about pathways. As in the previous chapter, entries here are not intended to be full summaries of the research interviews which can be found in Appendix B.

**Sue Collins** – Coordinator of Strings and Orchestral Music and teacher of violin at the Conservatorium of Music, University of Tasmania

**Anne-Marie Forbes** – Graduate Research Coordinator and Senior Lecturer in Musicology, Conservatorium of Music, University of Tasmania

- Undergraduate studies in Australia: Collins (Sydney) and Forbes (Adelaide)
- Initial Postgraduate studies in American universities: Collins (performance - violin) and Forbes (performance – voice; musicology).
- At each of their respective universities they found vibrant early music units in which they were welcomed.

**Susan Collins**

In terms of family pathways, those of Susan and her brother Brendan, may seem to have been inescapable. He became a professional trombonist and composer while she, at the age of fourteen, became the youngest soloist (on violin) to make a professional appearance with the
Sydney Symphony Orchestra. Her father, Errol, a performer and violin teacher with broad interests including jazz, had also experimented with the ‘new’ baroque bows then becoming available. She had, however, to keep her broader interests in jazz and early music to herself when she arrived at the University of Indiana to study with the formidable violin teacher Yuval Yaron (1953-).

Now the really interesting thing in Bloomington was that the traditional modern violin teachers... a lot of them were more open to different styles but the one I chose to study with [whispering as if sharing a secret] was a really great violinist. When Yuval had a recital, the recitals prior to his would always be full because people wanted to be sure to have a seat.

Among the jazz and early music students and faculty, however, she found a warm welcome. She particularly noticed that something called ‘fun’ could be a part of music-making.  

I was doing my minor in jazz and was involved in the early music department... Those two departments had a great relationship with each other. The Baroque Early Music professor, Austin B. Caswell (1932-2006) was one of the best lecturers I’ve ever had in my life. He would always be there listening to the jazz improvisation sessions and vice-versa, they all had really great connection. The modern players were quite distinctly serious and were less involved in the fun of music-making that I saw between these other two departments. The connection [jazz and early music] was just having fun.

The difference between the mainstream conservatory training and that available in the other units of jazz and early music is worth noting.

Upon acceptance into the Baroque orchestra you’re given a baroque violin and all the accompaniments. They really look after you. They gave you lessons. My modern violin teacher was not so interested in early music performance practice, experimentation, or research. He was very much a modern violinist and great for that. He was also very strict. He taught in that path.

The university clearly felt that the early music unit should be open to all. She recalls how this affected her playing of Bach.

Absolutely and it did affect my interpretation of... all of the Bach works but also any other... I’d been working on Locatelli sonatas. My interpretation is very much altered by having done that although when I perform on a modern instrument it may not appear... [pause] I’m certainly not trying to create an ‘effect’ of a Baroque interpretation. But which notes I bring out and how

---

172 The early music unit of the University of Indiana was among the first in the US. Perhaps the most well-known of its teachers was Thomas Binkley (1932-1995), founder of the Early Music Quartet (known earlier as Studio der Frühen Musik) producing nearly fifty recordings. Binkley, a lutenist and musicologist, was based from 1973-77 at the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis (Switzerland) and then founded and directed the Early Music Studio at the University of Indiana (USA) from 1979 until his death in 1995.
tempi are affected. I play the Chaconne [from Violin Partita No 2 in D-minor, BWV 1004] faster and I play it with the second beat as the main beat. I just feel it a little differently. It wouldn’t be noticeably Baroque style.

Her study of baroque violin playing may have helped her to look more deeply into all repertoire. In thinking again about that early experience Collin’s reflects

I think it’s now probably it’s just a matter at looking at the music and finding what’s in it... [lowers her voice, almost whispering] Maybe my baroque violin teachers...[pause] drew my attention to how much I can find in the music? [longer pause] Maybe I would have anyway? Who knows. [laughs] But it was certainly a lot of fun. We worked on... lots and lots of repertoire in that orchestra. We put on a production of *Amadigi* [Handel, *Amadigi di Gaula*, HWV 11, (1715)] which was probably the most fun I’ve ever had in music-making because we were all involved in the production... It was a student production. We didn’t have a budget but it was always exciting. That’s probably what got me into the Baroque era anyway because I had been to performances [there]. They just looked so fun.

After her return to Australia she played as a casual player with the Sydney Symphony Orchestra before taking up the position of deputy concertmaster at the Australian Opera. She recalls the immersive experience of being in the pit for certain operas.

*A Meistersinger* day was perhaps the best day of all. Because *Meistersinger* is performed as two calls, which is the maximum number for musicians in the orchestra, you’d begin work at 5 pm... When you stop for dinner at 7, you feel as though you’ve had a great workout. Then at 8 pm you’re back in the pit for another three hours of divinely beautiful music... and then the day’s over.

Now, of course, her role in Hobart is quite different. When asked about the place of Telemann in her playing repertoire she reflects about violin teaching traditions and repertoire:

Bach has been in the standard repertoire about the last hundred years. I’m afraid I didn’t have a teacher who suggested that I learn Telemann. It was Bach and then it was Paganini and then it was Ysaïe. And, I should admit that J. S. Bach is one of my greatest inspirations.

In her role as an examiner for the Australian Music Examination Board she is quite aware of what students are now playing. There is some Telemann listed in the syllabus but, she says, ‘students almost invariably choose Bach if they think they’re advanced enough to deal with Bach... or Vivaldi, if Bach isn’t going to show them at their best.’ She also notes that the easy availability of both sheet music and recordings of Bach and Vivaldi continues to influence the choices of students.
Perhaps prompted by this research project interview she muses about how Telemann’s music might now find a place in her teaching. She has used the *Concerto for four violins* [Concerto in D-major, TWV: 40:202] and would be keen to explore other Telemann works ‘to offer the students extra incentive, through the independent and soloistic roles within the ensemble.’

**Anne-Marie Forbes**

Anne-Marie Forbes’s youth and secondary education was also filled with music, especially as a violinist and singer at the Marryatville Special Music School in Adelaide. She had been, as well, a church chorister from the age of eleven. Entering the Elder Conservatorium in 1979 she became the only undergraduate voice student of David Galliver (1925-2001), Elder Professor of Music (1966-1983). He expected her to quickly pick up the skills of early music performance practice.

My lessons were with the harpsichord. He had a very strict regimen. He’d give you a piece of music and you had to have it by memory the next week. Or he’d throw something new at you and he’d say, “Right, let’s do this…” and you’d be sight-reading and then [he said] “Now the da capo and ornament.” [She replied...] “You what?”... [laughs] “But you didn’t teach me...” [He’d say] “Just do it. Just do it.”

So this inexperienced but diligent seventeen-year-old student found recordings in the music library to use as models. But that got her into trouble as well.

If you went in and you did what was on the recording, you got into trouble. [Forbes] “Yeah, but that’s what so and so does... It’s like...” [groans and laughs]. [Galliver replied] “Emma Kirkby does that. Didn’t you write anything?” So he was very much of the view that you had to be able to be... [pause] so familiar with the style that you could ornament without thinking about it. That it was natural in the same way that you might improvise in jazz.

Having begun singing as a young chorister, she arrived at the conservatorium as a soprano since that’s what she had been singing from a young age in her church choir. Her first year was marked by an unexpected development.

My voice, broke, the way a boy’s voice breaks. It did all the strange things. One day I was singing *The Queen of the Night* and the next day I [clears her voice... ummm] I couldn’t get any of those notes. Not even the first one. I went along to my teacher and said “Something’s gone”. They were all very interested at what was happening. It took probably about a year to settle down and then it was quite clear actually, you know. It had more of the quality of countertenor rather than contralto, but it was in that range. All those notes I used to sing, all the repertoire I’d learned... no good. So...
While her voice settled down she took up the study of musicology. “So I was doing a double major. I did both voice and musicology units.” There were in Adelaide at that time a number of individuals engaged either in teaching or performing early music repertoire. The chair of musicology was then Andrew McCredie (1930-2006) but as a singer Forbes was also drawn into the orbits of two others: the director of music and organist, David Swale, at the Anglican cathedral and James Gavenlock (1918-1984) the director and organist of the Catholic Cathedral.

David Swale was very interested in early music. He mounted a performance of Dido and Aeneas. It would have been the beginning of January 1979, just before I started [at university]. I sang in that performance. It was done to be as historically correct as he could manage at the time.

The other person who was more interested in Renaissance music was James Govenlock. He taught us counterpoint and fugue... He used to get me to go from where I normally sang over to him because he wanted me to sing in his choir, so I used to sing in two choirs on a Sunday. But again, you learn a lot of repertoire by doing that.

Forbes recalls that under the direction of Govenlock she sang a lot of Palestrina, Lotti, Bach, a little bit of Handel and ‘much more of the Italian repertoire, Vittoria. Oh... and Morales we did with him. I learned a different repertoire.’

It may seem surprising to hear of the richness of the early music offerings then available in Australia to anyone not familiar with the history of the early music movement of that time. In considering where she might begin her postgraduate work, Forbes looked beyond the UK or European music institutions more commonly chosen by young Australian musicians. She chose the University of Iowa. Leaving Adelaide in 1981 during December’s heat (41C) she arrived in the bitter cold (-30F) of 1982. Musically, however, what she found there was equally remarkable.

I was working with Sven Hansell. He was, probably still there, musicologist, rather eccentric, harpsichord player. I was his graduate assistant and I did music history, theory, and also voice. I managed to convince them I wanted to continue with voice so I was studying with Jocelyn Reiter... I was also part of the Collegium.

Her first impression of the unit, directed by Ed Kottick (1930- ), reflects the enthusiasm with which the new instrumentarium and repertoire were being taken up in America and Europe.

Oh it was huge. I’d never seen anything like it. We had everything. We had sets, chests of crumhorns and sackbuts. You name it... you wanted to play it... it was there. We had concerts, regular concerts and he built harpsichords. We used to go over to his house... [laughs] and play with bits of harpsichords as they were being put together. It was actually a vibrant time. I sang with a small group which was part of the Collegium but mostly it was instrumental. I wasn’t
involved in playing the instruments although if I’d put up my hand and said “I want to play crumhorn.” [whispering] Who does that? I’m sure I would have been given one but that thought never crossed my mind. We sang a lot of madrigals and that was my first experience of singing Gesualdo. We did lots and lots of early music as part of that group. We did Hassler, a beautiful piece of Hassler, just gorgeous. And French chanson. We sang quite a bit of Josquin. We even did the Machaut Mass.

After completing a degree at Iowa she moved to Kansas State University with her husband who was pursuing a doctoral program. With her fledgling MA in musicology she was offered a teaching position while working on a MMus in Performance (Voice), the only option since they didn’t offer a PhD program. The flat, farming state of Kansas and its university held other musical surprises for the keen. Forbes was offered a role in Britten’s comic opera *Albert Herring*. The librettist, Eric Crosier and Nancy Evans, the mezzo soprano who had sung the role of Nancy in the original production, arrived to help prepare the production. Crosier was shocked by the flat vowels of the Midwest.

[Crosier speaking to Forbes] “How come you can speak English and the rest of them can’t?”
[Forbes] “I’m an Australian.” [Crosier] “Mmm, I didn’t think they could speak English either.”

All performances were sold out. For a singer at Kansas there was plenty to do. John Aldis (1929-2010) was brought out for a couple of seasons to conduct the choir. Armed with her matter-of-fact Australian boldness she said to Aldis, who liked to introduce musical items to his audience, ‘Dr Aldis… Ave Maria, gratia plena doesn’t mean “Hail Mary, thank you very much.” It means “Hail Mary, full of grace.” “Oh”, he said. “Right then…” It was also at Kansas State University where, as a member of the staff Concert Quartet, she regularly sang cantatas and other vocal works of Handel and Bach, often taking on what would have been a countertenor role.

Her voice teacher, Gerry Langenkamp, encouraged her to explore more Baroque vocal repertoire.

Because I had a voice well suited to doing the countertenor-type pieces. I did a lot of Handel and a lot of Bach. Telemann did come on my radar. It just wasn’t something that I sang. But again, I was hearing Telemann from the instrumental players. I was aware of Telemann. I knew that Telemann had written a lot of … [pause] cantatas and the Passion settings. But we’d never done them.

As with any other cultural movement, the history of the modern early music movement was not characterised by a smooth and constant progress in scholarship, instrument-making, performance practice, recordings and so on, but rather was a multifaceted composite of
actions and notions resulting in uneven developments. Here is Forbes speaking about a period of intense focus on one aspect of Baroque vocal performance. During her time in Iowa (1982-4) she was working with Professor Sven Hansell (1934-2014) on the application of articulation patterns in German Baroque vocal music based upon Italian sources.

I was getting more and more... [hesitates] concerned about it. Because I didn’t quite understand what we were doing. So I eventually screwed up my courage because he was... a bit irascible. So I said to him “Well Sven, you know I don’t quite understand how this works. Because these patterns obviously work for Italians because Italian is a fairly regular language from a poetic point of view but when you try to apply them to a German source the German language isn’t like that. It doesn’t have the same regular articulation patterns so can you explain to me the premise? I just don’t understand how this works and what we are doing here.

There was this long silence... He looked at me and he said, “You mean... [pause] Oh, so what you are telling me is my research is... shit.”

[Anne-Marie recalling her response] “No...No...I’m not saying that...No....No... I’m not....I’m really not saying that.” [Switching ‘voice’ to that of her teacher, Hansell.] “No, no, I think you’re right, I think it is.” and he stopped doing it, suddenly, just like that and he started writing musicals. [laughs] I was horrified because basically all I’d done was to ask a question saying, “Just explain it to me. I’m just not getting this.” [pause] So after that I got... mmm... [voicing her remembered hesitation]... I’m a bit nervous about this. I was quite happy to perform Baroque music but I really didn’t want to research it [laughs].

Later, however, in her teaching of music history and musicology, at the University of Tasmania, she found her experience of analysis and reading of early manuscripts quite useful. The growing on-line archives now available to students and scholars has had an significant effect on her teaching. In their third year, her musicology students in Hobart now easily draw on these resources.

One of the students did a piece of editing. It was a violinist. So they were editing some of Telemann but more and more the students are actually going toward choral music and editing Renaissance and early Baroque choral repertoire. Obviously Lotti, Leo [Leonard Leo (1694-1744)], Anerio [Giovanni Francesco Anerio (1567-1630)]. All sorts of bits and pieces, little unusual things. They come up with this because they’ve found the manuscript on the Web and they say, “Can I edit that?” And I say, “Yeah, sure why not.” Five years ago those things weren’t available. We’ve got access to resources that were just unthinkable. Things like the DdT [Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst] have been scanned in and put up on IMSLP [International Music Score Project] so we’ve got access to all of those scores which we mightn’t have had.
before. Unless you pick something really obscure you can get access to scores. So Telemann should be coming to the fore.

Finally, through her long career as a singer she has developed strong opinions about strengths and weaknesses in the vocal writing of Telemann, Handel, and J. S. Bach. She considers first Telemann’s setting of text.

I think from a sense of compositional sense, he has a good relationship between text and music. I’m not talking about word painting. The line, the way in which it is phrased is appropriate to the words. And he puts the emphasis in the right places. It’s not always true with Bach. It’s almost as if the music comes first and he [Bach] fits the words in later. I don’t know whether in fact Telemann worked like that. He may have written the music first. But there is a sense in which the sense [that] the words were informing the way it worked and it does work quite well.

In discussion about Telemann’s vocal writing Forbes considers also the challenges of vocal writing for the singer of Handel and Bach. Telemann, she says ‘has a sense of line. It’s a bit more lyrical.’

Handel obviously has a very good sense of line and writes well for voice. Every so often he has a “moment”. [He] writes runs... well you think... if we could do circular breathing... maybe. But otherwise... no... I’m going to break it, and I think the singers did break it, but it still makes sense.

J. S. Bach, however, comes in for a bit more pointed criticism for his vocal writing.

Often you find you are halfway through a run of Bach and you think... no... I’ve just lost my way... Well, we’re not an oboe, but in the voice it just does not... it sits badly. It’s in the wrong part of the voice. I’ve trying experimenting with some of the Bach cantatas where my theory of why it didn’t fit in the voice was that it was the wrong voice. If it was really written for countertenor then the tessitura would be slightly different, so I changed pitch... just moved the whole thing to [the key of] C to see if it works... but it still doesn’t. Because the run goes right over... it wouldn’t matter what voice type it was, it goes over the break and it’s awkward. I’m sure [Bach] must have listened to a lot of performances and saying... “Ach, I’ll write another one.” [laughs] Because it’s really hard. It’s really, really hard. And the more you sing it, it doesn’t get any easier... It just doesn’t work.

As asked for her assessment of Telemann, she explains that the relative absence of available scores during her education was a factor.

Look I would rate Telemann really highly. He’s under-performed for his significance. I think of Telemann as being of the same ilk as Vivaldi. And of the same significance. But massively under-performed. It may be the case that the scores just weren’t available. There wasn’t much Telemann available in the library at the University of Adelaide when I was there. There were a
few bits and pieces but not a great deal. I think we had a couple of Passions. At the University of Queensland we had some Telemann in the library but there wasn't a huge amount, like the way you had collected editions, of multiple volumes of everything by a lot of the composers. That was part of the problem at that time. And there weren't probably many recordings either. Now there are more scores and recordings available there's nothing that really stops you.

Pathways

Having grown up in musical families, then progressing to advanced musical studies, Collins and Forbes might be thought of as being among the Kenner. While their training exposed them to a grounding in early music, they are both working as musicians and teachers within a modernist musical idiom albeit inflected by their experiences. Looking more closely at those experiences, their time in several American musical institutions was during a period of great enthusiasm for early music. Collins's experience with a baroque violin has affected the way she now plays Bach on her modern instrument.

Forbes, who studied musicology in Iowa and a year later went to Kansas to teach music history and study voice, also works within a broad scope of history and repertoire. She draws on her knowledge of early vocal and choral manuscripts now available from online archives. Students with examples of music which may not have been heard in Australia ask, 'Can I edit this?' Her reply is, 'Yes!', and she shows them how. Telemann too has a place in her teaching.

Learning of Telemann's fame during his lifetime, her students are surprised not only by the quality of his music, but also by his commercial shrewdness and industry.

Gary Ekkel – Secondary school music teacher, choral director, baroque flute player

Hans-Dieter Michatz – teacher, recorder player

- Immigration. Ekkel (parents from The Netherlands) and Michatz (from Germany).
- Baroque flute training in Europe. Ekkel (The Netherlands) and Michatz (Germany).
- Careers in music performance and teaching. Michatz (instrumental) and Ekkel (instrumental and choral conducting).

Gary Ekkel

Gary Ekkel, from his early years at The Geelong College, had music teachers who would themselves become significant figures in the story of early music performance groups in Australia during the 1980s and 90s: counter-tenor Hartley Newnham and the music teacher

---

173 Ekkel was a flute student of this writer for the final years of his secondary education.
who followed him, Ruth Wilkinson (also a participant in this project) later formed the Renaissance music ensemble, *La Romanesca*.

I went to Geelong College [to study music] under Hartley Newnham. That was where my initial interest in early music was kicked off. Already we’d talked about getting a baroque flute and I met Fred Morgan (1940-1999) [Australian recorder-maker]. I did a Bachelor of Arts with a music stream all the way through, at the University of Melbourne. In my third year of that course there were definitely some antics involved here. I’d ordered a baroque flute from Holland and I changed my instrument, so the first two years I’d been doing [modern] flute as my musical-performance instrument. In third year I was allowed to do baroque flute but I had to *call* it ‘a recorder’. That was under Ruth Wilkinson [recorder]. I was under Thomas Pinschof for the first two years doing modern flute and then Ruth Wilkinson for the third and fourth years. I did, in fact, do some recorder as part of that but the majority was playing baroque flute. I did a Masters in performance and that was on baroque flute. As far as I am aware that was the first Masters [student] on baroque flute at the University of Melbourne. Then half way through that time I received a Netherlands government scholarship to study under Barthold Kuijken in Holland.

Ekkel had not experienced the European-style conservatory class method although he had taken part in a few master classes under Greg Dikmans (a participant in this project). He arrived in The Hague during the years 1986-87. Speaking of those baroque flute classes, Ekkel recalls what can often be a competitive atmosphere.

So I think initially that shakes your confidence a bit before it picks up again. But it was absolutely wonderful the time that I had over there. And most of the people [who came from] Australia have studied there. Some in Amsterdam but nearly all of them have studied at Den Haag conservatorium. It has a really strong influence on the music movement in Australia. But I think it’s very Den Haag influenced, as opposed to the Amsterdam school, as opposed to the French school.

While there, Ekkel worked on applying Telemann’s ornaments of the Methodical sonatas and in the Quantz *Versuch* (1752) to other Telemann sonatas but it was French Baroque music that opened a new musical path for him.

I had a small ensemble there that did French cantatas... things like Clérambault [Louis-Nicolas Clérambault, 1676-1749]. A singer, flute, and harpsichord. Even now, looking back at it, the concerts I enjoyed doing most were things that involved a singer as well as the instrumentalist.

Looking a little further ahead we will see that his interest in vocal and choral music has become one of his principal interests. But on his return to Australia he first built on the work he did in the Netherlands with the establishment of the early music ensemble *Il Pastor Fido* based in Melbourne.
I think most of my playing of Telemann was in that decade from 1981 to 1992... That was when I was in the *Il Pastor Fido* ensemble [baroque oboe, flute, violin, cello and harpsichord] and in my Master's program which was entirely of Telemann.

Ekkel also recalled the pleasure of this group’s performance of some of the 72 Telemann solo cantatas from *die Harmonische Gottesdienst* for solo singer, obligato solo instrument, and continuo.

With Ekkel’s focus now on conducting choirs, including being foundation director of the Choir of Newman College (University of Melbourne), and director of choral music at St Michael’s Grammar School (Melbourne), he draws less often on the music of Telemann. However, with a strong link with the musicologist Jan Stockigt he keenly pursues links to composers and works that she has suggested.

I think she [Stockigt] would be absolutely central to everything... Since then she’s become not only the major researcher for Telemann but the major researcher for Catholic Baroque composers. It’s a roundabout answer but because I’ve had a lot to do with her research. We know her well [and] we’ve often been the group [Newman College choir] that has performed the music she has been researching. So we’ve done quite a lot of Zelenka [Jan Dismas Zelenka (1679-1745)] and composers of that period... I do like linking it to active research that’s going on. I suppose that’s why it’s been more a tendency has been more towards Zelenka and Heinichen [Johann David Heinichen (1683-1729)] over the last few years, but now it’s obvious... we’ll put Telemann down too... [laughs].

Finally in choosing music for his school choir’s European tour (2014) he recalls challenging them with Telemann’s multi-movement motet *Singet dem Herrn ein neues Lied* (TWV 7:30). Asked how he ‘winkled’ this rarely heard work out, Ekkel replied

> It was via the internet. I suppose that’s what I see as one of the missions of [this] new time. Not just to [program] works regularly performed and well known, but to bring to light pieces that are really interesting but people haven’t necessarily heard before.

As a good teacher he used its very difficulty to draw out the effort of his students. Their response, he said, was very positive.

> It involves a couple fugues and even a more dense than usual Telemann fugue. It took a lot of learning so it was a case of... which I like to do... winning them over with the fugue. There were certainly looks of “How on earth are we going to do this?” It’s the sort of thing that I feel that I can bring out. If they have been chosen for a European choir tour... “This is what you have to do if you get a position in the choir.”

The response of German audiences was remarkable.
We did the complete work. And it’s quite long, it’s a bit longer than I actually had thought when I looked at the music beforehand. It is spread out over nine movements. I think initially we were going to do only the choral movements but we ended up having another staff member, an alto, so it meant we could do all of the movements. We had a tenor soloist and an alto soloist with us so... [laughs]. Their reaction, interestingly, was “Schools in Germany don’t do this anymore.” and “Isn’t it fantastic that people from Australia bring this music of such great heritage back to us.”

Of such great heritage. It is also this sense, I think, that people there will have known Telemann since it was a reasonably well-educated audience. But there’s always that element of surprise that everybody who sings thinks that Singet dem Herrn of Bach is one of the greatest choral works. They are surprised by the depth of the music in Telemann.

**Hans-Dieter Michatz**

For Hans-Dieter Michatz, a recorder player from his youth, Telemann has been a consistent presence in his musical life. Having begun having recorder lessons and finding success it was not long before, even as a youth, he thought music might be his path.

First it was within a group and then pretty soon individual [recorder lessons] and then I thought, well, because music might be the way I’m going I had better learn piano as well.

If he turned up unprepared for his piano lesson his teacher, wisely, thought it shouldn’t go to waste.

The piano teacher I got was very interested... he went way back... he’d worked with the Vienna Boys’ Choir. [He was] very interested in early music. Because I was often lazy on the piano he would then ask “Have you got your recorder with you?” He had a wall full [shelves] of music of all those early editions of recorder music. So we played through one sonata after another at a very early time amongst which was a lot of Telemann.

Thinking back to his kind and wise piano teacher Michatz recalls becoming aware of the structure and quality of these works.

He was always saying, “I don’t get why Telemann was so... badly spoken of [as if he] is somebody who just wrote a lot of stuff and a lot of it is not good.” He [his teacher] knew what he was doing even though he grew up totally isolated from an early music movement as such. He was a very good accompanist. Ja? Non-pretentious, and all that. He knew that the bass line counted.

Through this early experience of playing through these Telemann sonatas for the first time Michatz began to get a clear sense of their quality. Now, many years later, he remains an
enthusiast. Before pursuing this line of thought further, let’s return to the younger Michatz as he moves on to tertiary music training.

It was his piano teacher who said to the promising young musician, ‘You’ve got to go there and move on from here.’ Here was Salzgitter, a small town in north central Germany, while there was Hannover, a large regional city to which he travelled by train for recorder lessons with Professor Ferdinand Conrad (1912-1992) whose reputation in Germany was similar to Arnold Dolmetsch’s in England. Like Michatz’s piano teacher, Conrad recognised his gifts and advised him to broaden his skills.

“Recorder’s all very well for you but you should actually go to baroque flute.” He somehow recognised something so he very carefully manipulated me into first learning modern flute and then going for baroque flute and then I went over to The Hague and studied there with Bart Kuijken. That’s how it all happened.

After completing his music teaching and performance degree in Hannover, the transition to studying with Barthold Kuijken at the Royal Conservatorium in The Hague (Netherlands) was untroubled.

It was relatively smooth because... one thing I have to say for all my teachers, and especially Ferdinand Conrad, was that there seemed to be a lot of talk about them being in a camp of their own – “There’s a Dutch camp, and there’s a German camp.” – The teachers themselves were actually more open than their disciples. [laughs] They were actually quite appreciative of what other people were doing. It was mainly about Franz Brüggen... who just presented a totally different way of playing the recorder. But I think Ferdinand Conrad just saw it as an on-going process, that’s where it was going. And the two of them actually “got on”. So I think there was respect basically. He said to me “Look, go to The Hague. It’s the person [Kuijken] to study with.”

During his three years at The Hague he had met many Australian musicians which prompted him to visit this country in 1983. ‘That’s when I met people who actually said, “You could... you know... live in Australia”. ’ He soon discovered other musicians in Melbourne who were forming one of the growing number of early music performing ensembles.

I got tutoring at the Conservatorium from ’84 onwards basically and then we founded a group called the Melbourne Collegium... the first kind of baroque [ensemble] at that stage. We expanded to orchestra size later on as well. So there were quite a lot of people who played with
us and then went on overseas and did their own thing. We did quite a lot of performances of rarely heard works. We did, for example, a whole Zelenka thing for Jan Stockigt at the time.\(^{174}\)

After introducing himself through a solo concert for the Early Music Society of Victoria he also formed links with other performers including Paul Dyer who was putting together an early music group to do a round of school’s concerts in New South Wales. Having been trained as both a teacher and performer. The idea, he says ‘appealed to me because, after all, I’m more a teacher than anything else’.

Since that time he has continued in both roles. Like Telemann himself, Michatz understands that classrooms, studios, and concert halls may well draw both Kenner and Liebhaber.

Hamburg is a kind of burgher society… He actually wrote for Kenner und Liebhaber… those who are in the know but [also] those who are also just amateurs. They love their music. He doesn’t write any lesser music for amateurs, I don’t think.

In discussion about why Telemann is so appealing for audiences as well as musicians Michatz muses...

When you really get stuck into it, everything is really good. It’s not all “deep and meaningful” music but it is very well composed, it is appealing, often very simple, and it follows a certain pattern, you know: a very pleasant opening movement, something a bit deeper and a bit stronger in the second, and what I love most, and you will probably agree in the Methodical Sonatas, the third movements are the most sublime movements in them, really. Those minute forms of, like, two lines and it’s the best music ever written.

Over his career Michatz has played a great number of Telemann’s instrumental pieces for large and small ensembles as well as solo works.

If he writes for a wind instrument you can trust that it works. Or if he writes a simple duet for flute and violin you can just play that and it’s conversational. It’s got a lot of beautiful moments in it. It’s just a musician’s music, I think.

As he thinks more broadly Michatz compares Telemann’s writing with that of J. S. Bach.

I mean, [J. S.]Bach is not like that. You really have to work hard at it. Maybe in the end he [Bach] says more on more different levels than Telemann does. Maybe… But I think when Telemann wants to he can also speak that complex language. So for me he’s just incredibly well-written. It’s never excessively virtuosic but it can be challenging and it’s entertaining. Every single piece people love to hear when it’s actually played in that vein [style or affect] and not

---

\(^{174}\) Jan Stockigt is a musicologist based in Melbourne and a participant in this project. She is the author of the entry ‘Jan Dismas Zelenka’ for Oxford Music Online.
just “rattled” off. So, we’ve just uncovered a few things like a viola d’amore and flute trio sonata and that sort of thing which we’ve played with the Sydney Consort. And they’re always the favourite item on the program.\textsuperscript{175}

In preparing for the discussion, Michatz had been thinking about the wide range of Telemann’s music he has played. It includes vocal works such as the solo cantatas from \textit{Der Harmonischer Gottesdienst}, innumerable chamber works, solo sonatas, and concertos, the comic opera, \textit{Pimpinone} (TWV21:15), and, among many larger orchestral works, the Suite \textit{Wassermusik: Hamburger Ebb und Fluth} (TWV 55:C3) and the \textit{Ouverture-Suite des nations anciennes et modernes} (TWV 55:G4) about which he recalls

It was a... discovery for me... how he sets one slow Gavotte against a fast Gavotte and gets these effects! It’s total mastery, craftsmanship of the material. Yeah. What else can you say for a musician? [laughs].

\textbf{Pathways}

In spite of their differing birthplaces, there are a surprising number of resonances within their stories. Some are clear-cut: each of them experienced early music as young musicians; both studied with the Dutch baroque flute player Barthold Kuijken; each earned tertiary degrees in both education and music performance; and each have performed with early music ensembles. Other resonances, however, are less obvious such as their links with musicologist, Jan Stockigt, who has suggested rarely-performed repertoire.

Michatz, a skilled and knowledgeable player of eighteenth-century music, has since the early 1980s played with a number of Australian-based ensembles which keep expanding their repertoire of orchestral and chamber works of Telemann. Like his colleagues, Greg Dikmans and Ruth Wilkinson, his playing is grounded on a mastery of the \textit{galant} style based on the principles of rhetoric. Telemann’s music, in this musical setting, is likely to satisfy both performers as well as listeners.

While Telemann’s instrumental music is a growing part of our musical culture, his vocal and choral music has received few Australian performances. Ekkel’s selection of the complete Telemann motet \textit{Singet dem Herrn ein neues Lied} (TWV 7:30), a work rarely heard in either Australia or in Germany, is unusual. Given the number of his \textit{Passions}, cantatas, and operas extant, the question as to why we hear so few of these in Australia remains unanswered. On the other hand, the solo cantatas, \textit{Der Harmonischer Gottesdienst} have often been cited by participants of this study. Ekkel’s persistence in looking for rarely performed

\textsuperscript{175} Trio Sonata in b-minor, TWV42:b4 from \textit{Essercizii musici} (1739-40).
works, and then seeing that they are performed may be a good model for other innovative and keen choral conductors.

Samantha Owens – musicology and baroque oboe – New Zealand School of Music

Neal Peres Da Costa – historical keyboard and musicology – Sydney Conservatorium of Music

- Immigration & travel – Owens (New Zealand – Germany – Australia – New Zealand); Peres Da Costa (Bahrain – Australia – UK – Australia).
- Postgraduate studies in musicology. Owens (New Zealand) and Peres Da Costa (UK).
- On-going research. Owens (including early modern German court music) and Peres Da Costa (including historical keyboard instruments and repertoire of the 17th, 18th, and 19th centuries).

Samantha Owens

Like many musicians, Owens's first instrument was piano but at the age of thirteen she also took up the oboe. Two years later she was playing with the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra (NZ). Having established a good school record she was able to skip the final year of her secondary schooling to begin a Bachelor of Music course at Victoria University of Wellington where she studied with Ronald Webb, principal oboe of the New Zealand Symphony Orchestra. During her Honours year (1991) Professor Peter Walls, her thesis supervisor and a baroque violinist, handed her a newly arrived baroque oboe to try out. There weren't other players around to guide her so, with a fingering chart in hand, she began her work. Playing both baroque and modern instruments, however, presented some unexpected problems.

While I was doing my PhD (I was still based in the music department at Victoria) they had what they called the ‘Baroque Workshop’, because they've got quite a collection of baroque instruments there. When Peter was there... he was encouraging lots of the students to try playing the instruments. We’d often do public performances. But, you know, I was still playing in the university orchestra by that stage but it just got too confusing. I would have been practising a piece with a Baroque [music] group and some baroque strings or something and maybe a singer one hour and the next hour I’d go to a university orchestra practice and I’d play the ‘A’ for everyone to tune to and I’d play it at A=415. [laughs] You can do that on an oboe because it’s quite flexible. I’d look at the tuner and realise what I was doing... It was too hard. Psychologically it was quite difficult to cope with.

Owens recalls that it was not only matters of pitch that drew her to the baroque instrument.
By that stage I just liked the sound of the baroque oboe much more, as well. You know the modern oboe... Oh, it’s so piercing and, I don’t know... windy. I ended up doing my PhD research on music at the court of Württemberg and Stuttgart so I went and lived in Stuttgart for nine months (1993-94) as part of the research for it. I tried to have lessons from various baroque oboists when I could fit that in. For example, I had some lessons with Bruce Haynes in Montreal (Canada).176

As many musicians have found, living and working in such a milieu, playing chamber music together can be a source of delightful relief from the largely solitary work of thesis writing. She recalls that Telemann’s music was often to be found on their music stands.

When I was in Wellington we used to get together quite regularly with a recorder player and a harpsichordist. We’d sight-read a lot of music, just for fun you know, in the evenings with a glass of wine. We played a lot of Telemann. When I was still in Wellington, a friend of mine, a singer, who later went to study [early music voice] in Holland... I remember we did a concert with an organist that was just [a few] Telemann cantatas from the Harmonische Gottesdienst.177

Some of the friendly atmosphere comes through in her memories of other music of Telemann they played.

I guess being an oboist I’ve played quite a lot of Telemann chamber music and certainly all of the.... what’s it called?... die kleine Kammermusik that Telemann published in 1716? They’re suites but they’re for oboe and basso continuo and they’re one of the earliest collections written specifically for the oboe. He dedicated it for four very famous oboists of the time in Germany. That is a quite central, important collection. When I think of Telemann I think of the kleine Kammermusik collection. I did play quite a lot of chamber music by him from that Essercizii Musici [1739-40]collection which we always used to call the ‘extra cheesy’.

In thinking about what it is that makes these works so attractive Owens contrasts them with music of J. S. Bach.

When I think of Telemann, for the oboe anyway, you know he knows what he’s doing when he’s writing for it. Which makes it just much more satisfying to play. The music can still be challenging to play but not in a ridiculous way like... I mean Bach’s fantastic, of course, but some of the stuff, it’s just beyond the pale. [laughs] You know? With Telemann you can be sure that he’s given the instrument more thought. He played a whole range of instruments. He knew what he was doing.

---


177 Der Harmonischer Gottesdienst, a cycle of 72 cantatas for solo voice with an obligato instrument and continuo published 1725-6.
As a baroque oboist Owens is often invited to play in early music performances of choral works such as the St Matthew Passion.

People always need baroque oboists. So, for example, I’m playing next week. It’s two Bach cantatas. I think the concert’s called “The Nightwatchmen.” [The conductor is] this guy, Gary Ekkel. He’s directing it at Newman College Chapel. I’ve played with them [last year], a Zelenka Mass. Then I’ve also agreed to play a St Matthew Passion at Ballarat. I said I’d do that because, you know, he needs four oboists.

Oh, and I play occasionally with Graham Lieschke [Director of Music, St John’s Lutheran Church Southgate, Melbourne, Victoria]. He has a Bach cantata series for which they quite often use original instruments.

As a teacher of musicology she notices her students respond with both curiosity and surprise as they hear of Telemann’s music and his clever tailoring of it to both Kenner and Liebhaber. Here she speaks of his opera *Orpheus* (1726).

I think they’re very interested in it. Interested in this concept of bring the styles together. I think they’re also quite interested in Telemann for the “commercial” perspective. This whole business about him publishing his own music and that sort of thing. I find that they often find that quite fascinating.

**Neal Peres Da Costa**

A scan of the entry for Neal Peres Da Costa in the Interview Summaries (Appendix B) will show that his work in performing, teaching, and musicological domains is rich with events, and interactions with gifted students, fellow musicians, scholars, traveling soloists looking for a skilled and sympathetic keyboard player, and publishers. This entry here, however, must be more tightly focussed.

A good place to begin is with the vibrant atmosphere of the Music Department of the University of Sydney when he arrived in 1982. Although then a pianist, his introduction to the harpsichord under the guidance of Winsome Evans was remarkable.

The very next thing I remember was being introduced to a harpsichord by Winsome [Evans] and her handing me C. P. E. Bach’s *Essay* 178, this very copy [reaching for the book] which I think she might have even bought for me, and [her] saying “Right, we’re going to be playing some Bach on the harpsichord.” I was thinking “Oh, my God. What is this. I heard a harpsichord on vinyl recordings, *Brandenburg Five* on a 1950s pretty unhistorical harpsichord but that’s just extraordinary.

---

As within other musical educational institutions of the time, opinions were divided about the place of early music.

My first day at university was such a rich one because I was handed the C.P.E. Bach, I saw the harpsichord, and then I went to my piano lesson and I said to my “next” piano teacher, Neta Maughan, “Oh, my goodness. I was introduced to the harpsichord and... look at this book! It’s amazing!” And she said, “Oh yes, that’s right. That’s what they do to you at university. They’re going to give you these other instruments, and they’re going to give you this book. You’ll have to do all that stuff for them at university, but when you come here you just forget all of that.”

Peres Da Costa’s somewhat breathless description of that first day of university music studies in the early 1980s carries with it the excitement which other young musicians were experiencing on their first exposure to early music: the instruments, an expanding repertoire, as well as documentary evidence which could, in the words of Nick Wilson, ‘re-enchant music of the past’.¹⁷⁹

These remain the core of his work which is based on an awareness of shifts in performance practice over time which can inform both how we play and listen to music of the past. After completing a music degree at the University of Sydney (with its then new Professor of Music, Peter Platt) he travelled to England where, as he gained postgraduate degrees at Guildhall School of Music and Drama, City University of London, and a PhD at the University of Leeds, he immersed himself in the vibrant European early music scene of the early 1990s.

I don’t know why I chose London at that time. I thought English was going to be needed to be able to speak and if I went to Holland I wouldn’t be able to understand, etc. etc. It was all rubbish of course because the Dutch speak fluent English and I ended up deciding to go to London.

While Peres Da Costa chose the Guildhall for its music training and teaching staff, he also acquired essential skills to be able to prosper in a professional musical world more complex than the Australian music scene of the early 1990s.

I learnt a lot about other things to do not just with period instrument playing or HIP as we call it now. Even just how to survive as a musician. The skills you need to be a business person, a good organiser. How do you research? How do you teach? How do you mix all of this in to your [career]?

Recorder player Philipp Pickett, then at the Guildhall and member of the New London Consort, taught ‘good business sense and how to be slick on the stage and produce a really marketable product.’

¹⁷⁹ Wilson.
Amidst a somewhat frenetic performing life, he and others established the early music chamber group *Florilegium*.

I met a baroque flute player called Ashley Solomon [who] had just finished his undergrad degree at the Royal Academy... Ashley and I got on like a house-on-fire. We did some concerts together. We both realised that with the London scene being this huge scene and so many players around... There were so many harpsichordists, so many recorder players, it would be very difficult for us to be absorbed into any of the established groups. So he said “Why don’t we just start our own group? Why were we waiting around?” We were watching others of our cohorts just [straightaway] be asked to play in the Academy of Ancient Music and John Elliot Gardiner’s English Baroque Soloists.

After a couple of years the group had a recording contract with the Dutch-based company *Channel Classics* with their first disk being several of the Telemann *Paris Quartets* and *Fantasies* [Channel Classics 13598 (1998)]. In the next ten years the group produced a further four disks devoted exclusively to the music of Telemann with a sixth in the series including music of both Telemann and J. S. Bach. The group became so successful, with many appearances that Peres Da Costa, who was managing the group and so was responsible for all the practical details, asked himself if he could sustain the effort. They were soon noticed by the cellist Peter Wispelwey who arranged to record with them.

We ended up recording Haydn Cello Concertos and Vivaldi Sonatas with him as a soloist. His agent in Holland took us on and started getting us concerts on our own. And we had a French agent, a German agent. It accelerated to the point where we were almost out of control and didn’t have time. We [were] travelling all the time and it was high burnout and high pressure actually... higher and higher pressure because we were starting to play in some really [amazing places] like the Concertgebouw [Amsterdam] and Teatro Colón in Buenos Aires. It was quite a fairy tale thing to happen. With all of that there’s the pressure “Am I ready for this?” “Have I actually got all the skills I need to put on concerts at this level?” And the answer to that is sometimes yes and sometimes no.

Their recording engineer offered some unfiltered advice.

“Okay, guys. That wasn’t the best way to do that. Go off and have some lessons with this person. Sort that little bit of the technique out...” In retrospect, you know, it was a wake-up call. It was a good thing to happen, hard as it was at the time it was happening.

Playing with Florilegium and other musicians he came to know the chamber music of Telemann quite well, however, performances of the larger choral works were less common. In
1992 he was asked to play continuo in a Stuttgart performance of Telemann’s *Brockes Passion*.\(^{180}\)

It was an unbelievable number of rehearsals. Something like ten days of rehearsing. That’s what the Germans do. They rehearse every detail. We sort of went away to a holiday camp to do it. It was out in the countryside somewhere. It was an eye-opener for me. The music was a total eye-opener of Telemann’s amazing talent. And all the arias, the different types of arias with different obbligati instruments... I mean such a variety of things!

Peres Da Costa’s memories are also inflected by the German method of preparation.

It was also an eye-opener into how Continental groups run the show, how they rehearse... very different to the English... very detailed, lots of discussion. So much detail that by the time you get to the performance you’re detailed out. The two performances we did, one in Stuttgart and one in Leipzig... didn’t go as well as I’d hoped for or expected. They seemed rather ragged at the edges as if people had almost switched off because too much time had been spent rehearsing and “navel-gazing”. English musicians get on with it... just get on with it and play the music.

After fifteen years working in Europe, Peres Da Costa and his partner Daniel Yeadon, returned to Australia in 2002 where he took up a position at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music. Now, with his playing and teaching career of nearly three decades largely given over to early music performance practice and research, Peres Da Costa can speak with clarity and precision about the qualities of the music of Telemann and his place within our broader musical culture.

When his music is amazing it’s super amazing. It’s the most delightful. It’s the most inventive. It’s melodious. It’s very exploratory in rhythm and harmony. It’s got this incredible combination of things which, of course, made him famous. You want to tap your toes to it. You want to dance to it. You want to sing to it.

At the same time, Peres Da Costa, is also quite aware that Telemann’s standards did sometimes vary.

At the other end of the scale he also churned out a lot of music and some of it isn’t of that quality. Sometimes we come across those pieces and think, “Oh no. We’re going to have to do that.” So we tried to avoid that and we tried to do just the quality things.

When asked to be more specific about those elements of Telemann’s music which did consistently give him pleasure he speaks about details.

In chamber music settings, the combination of instruments. His ability to combine flute and viola da gamba, and violin and flute. Always something interesting. In the music you often you

\(^{180}\) Grant Telemann’s *Brockes Passion* TWV 5: 1, (1716), was one of many settings of the popular dramatic poem by Barthold Heinrich Brockes (1680-1747).
get these conversations between instruments which are entirely charming. Also challenging. Some incredibly challenging writing. Not just the upper strings but sometimes also continuo. I think we sometimes felt, both Danny and I as continuo players, that sometimes the Telemann was ‘geared’ toward the upper parts.

As he developed and refined his continuo-playing he realised that just as ornamentation of upper parts is assumed, so it is in continuo parts.

Compared with, say, [J. S.] Bach where you were really challenged in all departments, with Telemann could sometimes end up feeling like you were in a subordinate, accompanimental role. However, one of the things I realised, and I realise it even more now, is that those simple bass lines that are often there, [pauses] do not give away the complexity of playing a very, very fine continuo realisation. For that, when you start looking into what was required as a continuo player, you realise, “Oh my goodness.” What was on the page was so much the starting point and you were required to do so much more.

As he pursues these thoughts, he pauses, and then expands on the role of good continuo playing.

Some people say that Telemann required just a simple accompaniment. But if you read books on figured bass accompaniment of the time you’ll find out that to really bring this music to life from the continuo point-of-view you had to be able to play up from one… from tasto [the bass line only without adding harmony] up to eight notes in the part, changing your textures to suit the music, creating melodic lines that go with or against the other part, and a whole range of things. It was much more complex than one first imagined. And that sort of led us to the more outlandish in our accompaniments. Even to the extent that Danny [Yeadon] would start improvising on the cello line and even adding chords, now and then, like he might on the gamba.

This fresh enthusiasm added to the attraction for audiences. Asked what caught the ‘ears’ of their listeners, Peres Da Costa adds

For an audience, we’ve always found they’ve loved his music. In London at the Wigmore Hall we often did [Telemann] and they always felt there was something very energetic and enjoyable about it but also he could change your mood very, very quickly. Take the E-minor Paris Quartet, the number six, It’s so heartfelt in the final movement. It’s almost like ‘Dido’s Lament’, you know… [it is] just beautiful.

This ‘freshness’ may be the result of his international style, that is, Telemann’s use of the mixed style.

They may not understand exactly what he’s doing but they get the feeling of it and the variety and I think it’s understandable. It’s very understandable music.
Finally, Peres Da Costa speaks about Telemann’s range of writing for a wide range of abilities and its place as teaching repertoire.

I think Telemann will always be music that people who are studying early music will turn to. It’s like a curriculum in itself. You can find pieces at every stage right up to the finishing point, but also simple pieces that will really work. He’s a perfect composer for learning how to ornament. You get examples of ornamentation in his music... the beautiful *Methodische Sonaten*. They’re fantastic for learning. So we’ve always got this Telemann going on in this building [Sydney Conservatorium of Music]...There’s always some Telemann going on somewhere.

The core of his performance approach can be found in this final statement.

The fundamental thing that I’m living with now is what did that score mean to the composer and to his circle. What did it trigger when they saw [it].

**Pathways**

Like Ekkel or Collins, the early playing life of these two musicologists, Owens and Peres Da Costa, began along familiar paths playing modern instruments followed by a shift to their historical types. Peres Da Costa experienced pockets of resistance to historical performance practice during his early tertiary music education but Owens’s transition to early music was within a supportive and encouraging institution. Among the *Kenner*, Peres Da Costa has developed a deep knowledge of performance practices of earlier periods upon which he draws for his active playing and teaching. Much of Owens research is focused on establishing a clearer understanding of musical cultural settings as they influence historical performance practices. Like Lyn and Peter Hawkins or Peter Webb, Owens has played Telemann’s chamber music largely for pleasure. In this sense she might be thought of as being among the *Liebhaber*. In her role as a musicologist, however, she often works collaboratively in areas of study which contribute to a deeper knowledge of eighteenth-century German cultural settings which may further strengthen our understanding of Telemann’s music in his culture. Here, Owens, is among the *Kenner*.

**Phillip Sametz — Presenter ABC Classic FM, singer**

**Stephen Yates — Administrative Assistant - Sydney Conservatorium of Music, composer**

- Education – both well-grounded in music through secondary school followed by interrupted tertiary studies.
Each intensely involved in life-long learning.

Each has an active musical life outside their principal role – Sametz (singer and manager of the swing era group, the Mell-O-Tones) and Yates (active composer).

**Phillip Sametz**

In his role as a broadcaster presenting the weekday three-hour morning classical music for ABC Classic FM, Phillip Sametz is well aware of the broadening and deepening of the music listening experience of multitudes of both *Kenner* (trained musicians) and *Liebhaber* (amateurs) in his audience. He is particularly aware of the interests of the *Liebhaber*.

I’m just reading at the moment Howard Goodall’s book *Big Bangs: Five Musical Discoveries* (2000) because in our line of work when you’re broadcasting music-based programs, you need to be reading the kind of thing the listener is reading. If you were an interested layperson that’s what I would be reading.

Earlier, as a producer of the Mornings classical music program for then presenter, Christopher Lawrence, they wanted to bring outcomes of recent musicological research, new or revived repertoire, and refreshing performing styles from around the world to the attention of listeners.

The brief of the Mornings is try to keep the listener informed about what is going on in the world of music now. It wasn't my job to program Beethoven symphonies conducted by Otto Klemperer. If I was going to play a Beethoven symphony it should really be under Philippe Herreweghe [Belgian b. 1947-] or the *Orchestre des Champs-Élysées*.

As well as following changes in performance styles, Sametz also is aware of the influence of the sounds of early instruments such as those made for the ‘first’ generation of early music players of the 1970s and the now more refined instruments.

What’s happened when you listen to the *Freiburger Barockorchester* [Germany] or *Ensemble Zefiro* [Italy], or indeed some of the groups coming out of Finland who are amazing, you realise that we now serve two generations in terms of teaching and playing. Also in terms of replicating the instruments, in terms of instrument building. So when someone plays a replica oboe the oboe makers have had several decades of [refinement]. “Oh... that's a much better way of doing this.”... We have now gone past the point [saying] “Well, that’s a different way of hearing this piece.” Now we can think really carefully about style, embellishment, and phrasing. That was always there but the level of confidence on the instruments is such that now you’re moving into areas of really interesting interpretation.

---

As a producer and now as a radio presenter he is quite aware of the broadening of concert and recorded repertoire of early music.

They don’t need to do [only] the Handel Concerti Grossi and the Brandenburg Concertos any more. We are now moving on to composers like Hasse [Johann Adolf Hasse (1699 - 1783)], Beck [Franz Beck (1734 - 1809)], and Kraus [Joseph Martin Kraus (1756 – 1792)]. [He was] born the year before Mozart and died the year after. I thought, this is the tip of the iceberg. They’ve only just started creating performing editions of his stuff. So you think... how much more is there?

Like musickers of this project he came early to music. His grandparents were an influence. His grandmother ‘had recordings of the Tchaikovsky Piano Concerto and Scheherazade and things I got to hear for the first time’ while his grandfather was a subscriber to the opera and Sydney Symphony. His school, the Woollahra Demonstration School, ran a choir where ‘there was a sense of discipline about it. You learned something about the basics of singing in harmony and of listening to other people. So I brought that with me when I went to high school.’ At Sydney Boy’s High School, under his teacher Peter Crane, he continued music study through his senior years.

Unlike many other participants, however, he did not enter tertiary music studies but instead was offered one of the rare journalist cadetships in the Sydney offices of News, Ltd. For the next eight years he had a range of jobs in journalism, after which in 1987 he entered the University of Sydney to do an Arts degree with a particular focus on history. After a year of studies he was offered the position as publicity coordinator for ABC concerts which was responsible for managing the six state-based orchestras including ‘scheduling, programming, contracting, [and]... coordinating all the tours around Australia’. He recalls being torn between the two paths.

So I spoke to all the lecturers I could and said “I’ve loved [this]. I had good marks in [my] first year. I said to them “I have an opportunity to take this job but the work I’m doing here is important to me. I’m really conflicted.” And they pretty much all said, “You can finish this anytime. You should do this if you really want to do it.” Of course, I’ve never been back. That was my first job in the performing arts and that was 1988. I’ve been working in the business ever since in one way or another.

As Sametz thinks about his work as a broadcaster he reflects on the network of those whose contributions, often unrecognised, have brought these recordings to his desk.

When you are producing fifteen hours of music on the radio a week and you are hearing so much music that was not previously known to you. You realise how important scholarship is.

It’s all very well to say, “Why doesn’t anybody do this?” Then you think, what if the arts were a
mess? What if we only have the score? What if no one’s actually opened this for a hundred and fifty years? What if it’s unperformable until someone does the spade work?

Given his detailed and extensive knowledge of recorded music he places the music of Telemann in context with some confidence. Below he recalls choosing Telemann for the ‘The Pedestal’, a week-long focus on the ABC Classic FM Breakfast program.

What the newer ensembles are doing is bringing out something that was probably always there on the page. But that it would have been very difficult to hear if you’d heard a [mainstream] symphony orchestra play it. Which is his liveliness... he could come up with another good idea in five seconds if he really wants to. And his tremendous ear for colour which is smoothed out too much... If you went back to hear an attempt to do a Telemann piece of Tafelmusik in the early 1960s...by Herman Scherchen or somebody it would probably sound very boring. Partly because Telemann’s music really depends on performers who are well informed about the period, about the context in which he was writing, about what his contemporaries were doing. Matters of articulation are the critical thing. But I think the physicality of it, the instruments they are playing, to be honest with you... I think that is one of the reasons why Telemann thirty years ago to the average music lover was [just] a name.

Sametz is aware of depth of knowledge now expected of today’s musicians performing Telemann and other composers of the period.

If you look at a piece of Baroque manuscript there’s a great deal that was “understood”. It’s a bit like looking at a jazz score. All you’ve got is the solo [line] and chords. The assumption is that the soloist will know what to do. In the same way when Telemann puts a tempo marking or a dynamic marking knows that his musicians know what he means. That doesn’t mean that a contemporary player knows that. So there’s some reinterpretation to do I’m sure for even a well-intentioned modern player on an original instrument or a replica. So I think it’s a conjunction of all of those things... and somebody like Telemann... that have made listeners much more aware of him and how good he was.

Naturally, Sametz has given a good amount of thought as to why sometimes quite adventurous Baroque music is welcomed by so many listeners.

It does strike me that in a sense this has become a kind of “other new music” [to] people who don't enjoy contemporary music. It’s like an [to] alternative contemporary music if you don't like contemporary music, which is great but also quite dangerous at the same time.

Asked why this attitude might be dangerous, Sametz replies

Well, because it means “I’m hearing something I don’t know which saves me bothering from having to listen to music by someone who’s still alive.”
As the conversation concludes he offers this thought about the expanding number of listeners and performers engaging with early music.

Fortunately in Australia we have enough performers who engage in this music so that the recordings and performances are feeding off one another and gradually creating a wider circle of people who are enjoying the music.

**Stephen Yates**

In asking Stephen Yates how best I might describe his role at the Sydney Conservatorium I suggested the phrase, ‘independent scholar’ but he gently rejected the title, reminding me that he was employed as an administrative assistant. Others at the ‘Con’, however, recognise and value his unusual mixture of skills and knowledge which go well beyond the standard ‘backroom’ tasks.

While music was a part of his childhood – his mother was a singer and his grandmother, living next door, had a good collection of records of popular classics – his natural curiosity helped him to open other doors. He listened to music on ABC Radio, regularly tape recording programs and took up the violin at thirteen. He remembers, however, an early fascination with the piano. When ten-years-old he made a cardboard keyboard and taught himself music notation. Later it was sensation of the effects of harmony which attracted him. ‘I was getting increasingly bored with the violin and just seduced by harmony and keyboard repertoire.’ His violin repertoire included the Baroque masters including Corelli and Handel. To his playing and listening he added reading.

I read biographies... Handel, Bach, Beethoven... Mozart, Haydn. I was curious about what they did. I was also very curious about the time itself, so I read widely... all sorts of things, [about] the visual arts of the time, literature.

He has continued to pursue this interest in eighteenth-century culture begun in his early years.

The eighteenth-century was the century. I was perplexed by listening to Bach and Beethoven. There was only a hundred years, give or take, between [them] but [wondered] what happened in the middle of the century? It was the mid-century music that was looked on as inferior and just dismissed. What music I did hear... glimpses of it... I was really impressed by. I thought it was great music and I haven’t been proven wrong. So that was the fundamental question I started out with and that’s what generated [my] whole interest. Of course, the early nineteenth century... [pause] Ah... these things lead in either direction... so [from] the 17th century and into the 19th. So [it’s] a very eclectic way of doing things.
As any teacher of long experience will know, young students can have rich but somewhat hidden lives, and may wonder how they will go within the highly-structured academic challenges ahead. Yates, after starting degrees in music education and then music performance (violin) at the University of Newcastle, withdrew from each. ‘I dropped out of both of them, which I’m quite proud of still. Then I moved to Sydney in 1980 and began a… composition degree [from] which I dropped out again.’ And yet, he persisted in following his curiosity through more reading and listening.

I’ve always been motivated by my interests. I’ve always been that way. I began to read very, very early. That’s why I’ve got glasses [spectacles]. So I’ve never had any problems being motivated and it’s never left me. After that… [pause] it was my years in the wilderness. I began making a living doing… it was bits and pieces. But that’s when I realised that I really had [to] sort of fill in those gaps, like repertoire and what have you… consolidate I think is the [term].

The ‘filling in’ was based on his idea that understanding the history and culture of the past is a multilayered, complex business. His work gave him time to read.

I used to do gigs for weddings and I had two Palm Court ensembles. I was unemployed for quite some time. Which was great at the time because it meant I had time to read great literature… eighteenth-century and nineteenth-century literature in English [and] translated French authors… a lot of French authors. I was a bit bored by the English, actually. Ah… Balzac, Voltaire, Rousseau… French culture was [a] huge fascination. Still is… the furniture, the objet d’art, and the social structure and how it worked. And the political events too. And gradually tying them all in. Every ten years there are significant changes. It’s a transition century. Most centuries are like that. But [the 18th century] was a particularly dramatic one, ending with a bang. And the French Revolution too was a major fascination. So yeah, I’m an eighteenth-century nerd I suppose.

In 1987 Yates joined the Sydney Conservatorium in his administrative and support role and gradually began to draw on his rich and uncommon education.

When I first started here early music was a very shadowy presence, but things changed gradually until we had Paul Dyer [now director Australian Brandenburg Orchestra] which would have been early nineties.

During these early years, before the easy availability of music on digital archives such as the IMSLP/Petrucci Music Library (www.imslp.org), Yates found ways to build up his own library.

Ah… well, before I got hold of Petrucci [est. 2006] I started amassing a library of scores. I had a large collection before that. If anyone [asked] “Have you got the score to…blah…blah…blah?” [I would say] “I think I have.” Now… with Petrucci there’s all this music which I’ve been desperate
to find full scores of. Before it was a hit or miss affair. There might be someone in town here and I would think, “Oh… I haven’t got that concerto…I’ll make a copy of it.”

Neal Peres Da Costa, who a couple years after his appointment established the Con’s Historical Performance Unit, found that Yates was helpful in finding scores for his ensembles. Yates knew the collections held in the Con’s library and his own, both of which were growing. He was also often drawn into designing programs for concerts of the larger early music groups.

Oh he leaves me a very open hand. He’s told me “We’ve got four concerts.” I don’t touch the seventeenth century because it’s not my area of expertise. I’ve got a very superficial knowledge of it. He’s [Peres Da Costa] used [me] in Baroque and Classical programs which is definitely up my alley. A lot of it is governed by logistics. How many flutes we’ve got and oboes… things like that. He gives me [a] free hand. I go away and dream up a program. Or in some cases search for a work which I don’t know [but] which may be suitable. It may be just a set of parts which means I have to [build] a score and then copy the parts.

The music of Telemann, with his interest in a variety of instrumental colours, naturally often appears on these programs. Yates, however, recalls that he was disappointed by what he heard of Telemann during his youth.

There was a lot of music being broadcast. On reflection… a lot of it was a bit dull actually. That could have been me and, I think with certain works they didn’t play the greatest music. By the same token, they did play excellent music of the period [on ABC FM]. According to the performance standards of the day because no one knew any different.

Yates notices that even with recent touring ensembles the works of Telemann chosen have been limited.

You get this handful of concertos being played over and over again and [they are] not acquainting the public with the… sheer diversity and inventiveness of Vivaldi or Telemann which is a shame. You have groups touring out here and they play very safe programs. So you come across “Oh, not Telemann again.” Plus, there’s problems with the sheer vastness of what has come down to us. [This] makes it a very formidable thing to get your head around. It’s taken me years and years and years [quiet laugh]. So I’m trying not to be unfair. It’s no one’s fault. It is unfortunate.

As the discussion draws to a close the comparison between J. S. Bach and Telemann comes up. Yates has strong opinions about Bach.

I very seldom listen to Bach these days and Mozart for that matter. Handel and Haydn are still welcome people… and great friends. Bach…. I have less time for. Not much time for it at all…
To understand this, it is helpful to recall his interest in periods of historical transition. He explains it this way.

I like to call myself a [eighteenth]-century modernist because I was interested in the modern music of the time. Bach doesn’t to a degree, doesn’t really “fit” that bill. He just sort of stopped. And consequently is of less interest to me. But still I’m interested in what was new in music of the time [around] 1730 or 1750 or 1780. That is, what was breaking the “mould” at each of those times.

In a somewhat enigmatic remark about the relationship between the performer and the composer and these two composers Yates concludes.

You seduce rather than impose your style on the performer. [It’s the] difference between Bach and Telemann.

Pathways

The early musical pathways of Sametz and Yates began differently. Sametz’s musical education was based in a school known for offering musical choices including choral singing and thoroughgoing teaching into the senior years, while Yates’s musical experience was focussed on violin lessons and, later, piano with his listening enriched through the broadcaster ABC FM. Yates built up a collection of recordings taped from radio broadcasts, a habit he extended as an adult to collecting scores of rarely performed works from touring music ensembles. Before today’s easy availability of online music archives Yates was often the first ‘port of call’ for musicians searching for music not held in local libraries.

Both Phillip Sametz and Stephen Yates have found a place within musically influential organisations (Sametz – ABC Classic FM, Yates – Sydney Conservatorium of Music). Each has come to these positions from atypical backgrounds with Sametz’s largely based in journalism plus a year as an Arts student (University of Sydney) and Yates’s thoroughly independent autodidactic reading and a rich aural-memory-history. Each continue to practice music-making with Sametz singing and Yates composing. They each actively follow developments in the world of early music performance, recording, and repertoire. Although on differing paths, their independence and clarity of purpose have led to remarkable on-going contributions to Australian musical life.
Birth decades 1970s & 1990s

**Megan Lang** — baroque flute player and teacher at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music; teacher of Sadler.

**Liane Sadler** — baroque flute player, honours graduate of Sydney Conservatorium of Music; student of Lang.

**Megan Lang**

Megan Lang describes her childhood and early education, on the north coast of Tasmania, as being close to the earth.

I grew up with no electricity and no running water and all that sort of thing for a while. And lots of animals and things like that. I picked up the flute... my father played flute. He liked Jethro Tull, Ian Anderson.

In describing her early years of flute playing she recalls it was not the sound of the flute nor the music itself which drew her on in flute playing.

It became a more consuming interest, I suppose... playing the flute. More in terms of actually playing the *instrument* rather than the *music*, I'd say. It was more about the actual practicing and playing.

But it worked. She progressed and was supported by her parents. By age thirteen or fourteen her father drove her to Hobart for regular lessons with Douglas Mackie, principal flute of the Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra. For tertiary music study she chose Elder Conservatorium in Adelaide, where she studied flute with Zdenek Bruderhans.

I had no exposure to baroque [flute]. So I became a modern flute player. I did lots of practice. Hours of practice.

The French School principles of flute playing based on technical fluency, accuracy, and expressive sound were, of course, common across conservatory training during her years (1990-1994) at Elder Conservatorium.\(^\text{182}\) However, achieving perfection required ever-more intensive work. Following her honours year in Adelaide, Lang went to Frankfurt am Main, Germany, where she studied with the modern flute player and teacher Henner Eppel.

It was the... the modern flute pedagogy... just more practice, more practice, more practice... *more*. Of course, I did, being the diligent student that I was.

---

\(^{182}\) Dorothy Glick, “Paul Taffanel and the Construction of the French Flute School” (University of Kansas, MM Thesis, 2014).
She played all the standard repertoire. Everything... the Ibert Concerto... the Prokofiev sonata... all the really hard 20th century things... the 19th century virtuoso things. Yeah, playing all the things you play as a modern flute player. And looking back... I had some anxiety around the flute because I didn't feel like I had a good sound. My technique was very, very good. I [felt] like I could play everything but in concerts it often broke down. I had problems carrying through a technically difficult passage and things like that.

During her eleven years in Germany she became a casual flute player in a theatre orchestra near Dusseldorf, a position she enjoyed. Aware of the healthy German early music scene she eventually bought a baroque flute as a kind of hobby and looked for a teacher.

It just happened that a man named Michael Schmidt-Casdorff lived around the corner and was married to one of the opera singers at the Opera. He's amazing... the most inspiring person... incredible flute player. He plays with Harnoncourt and [is] a beautiful, beautiful player. He's the kind of flute player who... his sound just fills up the... it's an enormous sound.

This proved to be a transformative experience. I'd go there for an hour lesson and I'd come back five hours later.... staggering... he'd let me go. He was incredible... he opened my eyes to a whole new world of... [pause] thinking about music. It wasn't about the flute. It wasn't about how you get a nice sound and how you do this or that. It was all about the music. “What do you want to do with your music?” [laughs].

She describes the difference between the two instruments (modern and baroque) first in emotional terms.

It was such a different experience to modern flute and right then and there I thought “I don't love the old...[her modern instrument]” I didn't know it but I never loved it. Not like I love [gesturing to her baroque flute]... this.

Describing the differences she homes in on the relationship between player and instrument.

[Describing modern flute playing] ... The whole thing worrying about whether my vibrato was okay. Worrying about whether I got that one [note or phrase] clean. Instead I’m worrying about the [musical] gesture. Of course you have to worry a little bit about the sound and whether it’s working but it’s in the service of the music and what you’re trying to create.

The key to her playing since then has been less to do with pursuing an ever-receding perfection and more to do with a focus on the music itself through the means of an instrument which itself seems to share in the process of creation.
[Baroque] flutes speak for themselves. You don’t have to make a sound. The sound is in the instrument and I liked that a lot. It took away the anxiety. That’s really the bottom line. I suddenly felt free. I felt free to make my own choices instead of worrying that I was doing it wrong which I always felt with modern flute, even though I was at a very high level. I always felt that I didn’t actually know how to interpret and be right.

Through summer school lessons with other baroque flute players, among them Karl Kaiser and Linde Tutz [Linde Brunmayr-Tutz], Lang discovered delight in music-making.

They were all of this same ilk. They all just loved it... They loved it. The aesthetic as well. The aesthetic of the beautiful [baroque] flute and the difficulties that they give you. And everything around it. It wasn’t so functional. Modern flute’s a sort of functional instrument in my mind anyway. And the aesthetic is different and I liked it a lot... so it suited me. Before long I wasn’t playing modern flute much... unless I had to.

The details of Baroque styles, the French, Italian, German and so on, offer a sensitive player creative options. Lang describes how this changed her way of performance preparation.

With Baroque [style] you can do it one way... or this way... or that way. We know some things because of what’s been written but we don’t know all that much really. So it’s actually a huge freedom playing that music. I found myself just playing things over and over and over again until I formed a really strong idea of what I wanted with it. That took away the nerves when I performed because I was so sure about what I wanted to do. I didn’t really care about what they said about it because I was happy.

The pressure of imagining what an audience might be thinking is also reduced.

It’s for the audience but it’s not at their mercy, whereas with modern flute I always felt it was at their mercy, that I was part of this huge competitive mass and there was only one way to do it. One way to get it right and you had to nail that or it wasn’t good.

As a teacher and player, J. S. Bach and Telemann remain part of her core repertoire. She does, however, respond differently to them. Generations of conservatory-trained musicians have either tended to play Bach veering towards a Modernist purity uninflected by gestures, or warmed by sustained Romantic emotions. Musicians within the recent early music world remember that Bach, too, was an improvising musician.

I have just an emotional feeling... two different [emotions] about Telemann and Bach. Bach for me is a bit tied-up. I have had to break free of... the misconception that he’s [pause]...God and you can only play exactly what’s on the page and it has to be just as it is. Of course, I came [to] the realisation at some point that that’s not how it was at all. He would never have played the same thing twice. [He was] a working musician just like Telemann and very practical. Since that
time I’ve become a lot freer about Bach but I still have a kind of *dark* feeling about his music. It’s austere in my mind, even though, it’s actually not, of course. But Telemann’s a lot friendlier [laughs] in my feeling because there’s so little pedagogy around him. There’s so [few] preconceived ideas [like] the twentieth-century or nineteenth-century of putting them on pedestals and saying “That’s set in concrete now.”

Lang hits on a rare thought: it might not be such a bad thing for a composer to have been forgotten and then recently rediscovered. Telemann’s music can now arrive ‘fresh’ to both performers and audiences. Thinking about Telemann, Lang mentions one particular work which, for both her and the audience, reliably works its magic.

I haven’t played that much Telemann in public, actually. I don’t tend to perform the [solo] Fantasias because they’re so hard [laughs]. They’re really difficult to perform and not that successful as performance pieces I always think. But the Paris Quartet, the E-minor (TWV 43:e5) that I did a couple of years ago. That has had quite a lot of good responses... The music hadn’t been heard before, but it’s very, very beautiful. I will have that played at my funeral. He’s at his best. He was showing off to the French public. They’re very warm pieces. Even when it’s got some *dark* sort of affect going on there’s always a melancholic sort of thing. It’s not like Bach where it’s heavy. It’s still warm and human. It’s *human* music.

**Liane Sadler**

Liane Sadler, recently a student of Megan Lang, also began as modern flute player driven to ever higher standards of playing. As a young teen she found a teacher who demanded much and which then suited her desire for improvement.

Sometimes there were entire lessons that I spent on just doing long notes because she wasn’t happy with the work that I’d done. So I had to work really hard on those things so I didn’t have to spend a whole hour on just doing one scale.

With hopes to enter the performance course at the Sydney Conservatorium she prepared a big program of pieces for her final year school exam, the Higher School Certificate.

I did six units of music so I was doing... *Lots*. I was doing Music Two and [Music] Extension so I was doing six pieces of music for my final exam. I used that repertoire and did my Associate in Music, Australia [known as the AMusA] recital at the end of the year, 2009. Then I took a gap year to get better at flute again.\(^{183}\)

---

\(^{183}\) Exams up to diploma levels are offered in music, speech, and drama by the Australian Music Examinations Board (AMEB), an independent organisation established in 1887 to encourage high-level music teaching and playing across the entire country. Sadler refers to the AMusA (Associate in Music) and below, the LMusA (Licentiate in Music) exams.
Sadler had auditioned near the end of 2009 for entry to the performance course at the Sydney Conservatorium but was, instead, offered entry to the music education course. Therefore, she took a gap year (2010) to prepare for a Licentiate in Music, Australia [LMusA] exam and for a second attempt to be accepted into the Sydney Con’s performance course. Instead she was again offered a place in music education which she accepted.

I was really devastated about it and then I got here and there were seventeen flute players in my year. So I didn’t really have a chance because only about five of them got into performance.

During that first year (2011) Sadler began flute lessons with Elisabeth Pring at the Sydney Con. The effect of the change in teaching styles was remarkable.

By the time I got to the end of my teens [her previous teacher’s] “hard line” had started to wear me down. It was a great thing when I was younger because she wouldn’t let me get away with stuff, but by the time I was older I was a bit more sensitive and it just started to wear me down. I just thought really badly of myself and my playing. Libby built me up a bit. She was honest and didn’t let things go. She wasn’t being easy on me but it was just a different style of teaching. She was honest but kind.

In preparing an essay about the changes in flute design from baroque to modern, she decided to take a few lessons with Megan Lang on the baroque flute. She brought a few misconceptions with her.

I went in thinking “Oh, baroque flutes aren’t very good.” [Her previous teacher had said] “They’re not very good instruments so we won’t worry about them.”

Sadler’s first question was about intonation.

Everyone says baroque flutes play out of tune. How do you deal with that? She [Lang] said, “Well, they don’t play out of tune. First of all, you are always adjusting the tuning on any instrument when you play.”

They then moved on to issues of temperament or the non-equal tuning of scale intervals.

I suddenly realised it’s not a case of an instrument being better than the other one. We sort of see the modern flute as being the culmination of an evolutionary development of the modern flute. It’s not that. It’s just a different instrument and [the modern flute] meets the demands that people have nowadays and the baroque flute meets the demands that people had during the Baroque period. And I went… “Oh… Ah… that makes sense.” [Laughs] So I thought, I want to try this instrument.

Over the next few weeks Sadler experienced a transformation in her expectation of what her musical future might be.
[After a few] lessons with her in November 2011 and literally within a couple of weeks, I was like… “This is what I want to do…This is amazing!” It’s such a beautiful instrument and it’s so organic and earthy and natural. It just felt really natural. And the approach to the music was just so much different and it felt more natural for me. You look at what’s on the page and you keep in mind the historical considerations and you come up with something that’s interesting and comes alive. And it’s not you being this great “artist”. It’s about giving something to the audience and bringing the music alive for them.

As her teacher, Lang recognised that Sadler seemed to have taken a path similar to her own. Lang said:

“I know that Liane was talking about how my influence on her changed everything. The same thing happened for me with Michael [Schmidt-Casdorff] and it was quite deliberate, from my side. To give her that, because I’d experienced it myself and I wanted to give it to her. Liane had exactly the same frustrations that I did. She was anxious and she didn’t know if what she was doing was “right”. I gave her the freedom of being able to make her own choices, [to] read and listen and build her own knowledge and make her choices.”

Meanwhile Sadler was still in the midst of her first year within the education stream. She had been preparing an audition to switch to the modern flute performance course for her second year in 2012. Now, suddenly, she had a dilemma as to how to navigate the demands of cut-off dates and administration. Did she really want to make the change? She was reassured by Libby Pring, her flute teacher. Sadler remembers her saying, ‘I think this is what you should do. It just suits you. You should do baroque [flute]. It’s your thing.’ She talked it over with her parents and made lists of pros and cons. Finally, still in a turmoil, she went to talk with Neal Peres Da Costa, then Head of Historical Performance.

I turned up to Neal Peres Da Costa’s office in tears saying […in a pleading voice] “I want to do baroque flute. I can’t do modern anymore.” He said, “Okay”. He pulled some strings and I transferred to baroque. Yeah… [sighing with a deep breath].

In late 2014, Sadler performed her honours recital using three quite different early flutes. Every flute is so different. You have to get into the right mind-set to play on each flute and also the styles that you’re going to be playing on each flute. It’s quite tricky and it’s not recommended to do it too much.

Telemann’s music has been part of her repertoire throughout. While she recalls playing some of the twelve unaccompanied flute Fantasies (TWV 40: 2-13) once she started on baroque flute

---

184 This quotation of Megan Lang is from her research interview for this project.
(2012) it was natural for her to add some of the *Methodical Sonatas*. (TWV 41, Hamburg 1728, 1732).

He really understood the instruments he was writing for. It’s good to play because it “works” really well with the instrument you are playing on. The Methodical sonatas are really good because in the first [slow] movement he’s written out the plain [unornamented melody] and then he’s ornamented it so you learn about the ornamentation style of the time as well.

With the need for finding music for student-run concerts, the Sydney Baroque Festival, Sadler also found Telemann’s wide range of instrumentation for his larger orchestral works helpful.

[Violinist] Meg Cohen organised the festival but I got involved with repertoire. It was the Table Music’, *Tafelmusik*, the E minor *Overture-Suite* (TWV 55:e1). It just sounded so cool. E-minor is a particularly nice key to play in. I really just loved the sound and also there were two solo flute parts.

This year [2014] we’re doing the festival again and I have more of an involved organisational role this year. I picked Telemann again, the *Overture-Suite* for two trumpets and strings (TWV 55:D17) because we had these two trumpet players and we were trying to figure out how to include them in the program. And Telemann was so versatile, he happened to write a suite for two trumpets which is unusual because normally they use three. It’s quite an interesting *Suite* [with] its national styles and that’s why I picked that.

The response of her fellow students to this music was encouraging.

The trumpet *Overture-Suite* is in D major (TWV 55:17), a very sort of triumphant key. That works really well with trumpets because they sound triumphant. It’s a suitable key for them to play in and it’s not going to be crazy difficult for them to access. He really understood the instruments.

At the time of the interview, November 2014, Sadler was planning to go to Germany to continue her baroque flute studies. One player particularly caught her attention, Christoph Huntgeburth, baroque flute player with *Akademie für Alte Musik Berlin*. It was his playing of a sonata by Frederick the Great which moved and inspired her.

[It was] the most amazing thing I’ve ever heard. His tone was incredible. The way he manipulated the rhythms and rubato was amazing.

So, with her list of European baroque flute players ready she will continue the pattern of Australians who, having begun their early music studies here in Australia, travel to listen, play and absorb what’s fresh and new in instrument-making and baroque flute playing, along with scholarship, repertoire, history, and culture. It seems likely she will continue her habit of making links with other musicians of this new generation.
Pathways

Lang and Sadler travelled similar paths as modern flute players swapping to baroque flute. After this transition their musical goals were no longer measured against an unattainable and ever-retreating ideal but rather they each developed a stronger sense of their shared creative role with a composer within a rhetorical framework. As a teacher, Lang’s role has been that of a co-creative mentor rather than a ‘gatekeeper’ for Sadler and other students. Both Lang and Sadler have said that musical colleagues as well as audiences respond with delight to music performed upon these practices. Compared with Lang’s long period playing within the Modernist idiom, Sadler, with the support of both her educational institution and her gifted teacher, made that same transition much earlier in her career. It prompts the question, how might other young performers, growing up with similar encouraging early music experiences, change the future of Australian musical life? Might they develop a broader understanding as to what it means to be a musician?

Conclusion

Ruth Finnegan, in her five-year ethnographic study of amateur music making in a regional town of England, explains how the concept of pathways in people’s lives helped to draw out some coherence and patterns. Most amateur musicians of that community did not recognise that their musicking (of all sorts) had produced unrecognised or ‘invisible’ pathways. The purpose of this study, while based on a much broader geographical range than Finnegan’s and with participants who, taken together, represent fifty years of changes in musical culture, is similar. The pathways of participants in this study provide a vivid picture of the complex influences on and challenges for musickers of many types and from many places.

Pathways – a summary

As with any qualitative study, there may be a number of loose threads, any one of which might suggest a major case study, a publishable biography, or a monograph. Participants’ connections to place, family, teachers, mentors and colleagues, institutions, and fellow participants, if charted or mapped in detail, would result in complex webs from which we may

---

185 Finnegan.
not be able to draw any firm conclusions. While some findings are divergent, seeming to point in opposing directions, it is possible to make some statements supported by clear data. They are listed here by categories related to two of the three broad interview questions, that is, 1) music in their youth and early adulthood and, 2) the place and nature of early music in their experience. A discussion of the place of Telemann’s music in their histories will be left for the following, concluding chapter.

Musical experiences of childhood and youth

For most participants, schools were rich musical environments. In many cases, but not all, they were able to pursue musical studies right through secondary school, thus enabling a smooth transition to further studies. For some a teacher, parent, or relative encouraged or guided them, although two participants had somewhat limited exposure to music as children [Schroeder and Peter Hawkins]. Among Australian and New Zealand participants growing up in the postwar period of the 1940s or 1950s the musical influence of refugees or immigrants evoked strong and fond memories [Halton, Stockigt]. Several recalled the impact of radio broadcasts of classical music contributing to their knowledge of repertoire, new soloists or early music ensembles, along with changed performing practice [Dikmans, Forbes, Sametz, Webb, Yates]. Some started their record collections with purchases from the few Australian record stores and mail-order clubs offering classical disks in the 1960s and 1970s [Dikmans, Peres Da Costa, Yates]. During their youth most participants began on modern instruments although two carried their childhood delight with recorder into their adult lives [Michatz and Wilkinson]. One participant’s early musical experience was predominantly within church choirs [Forbes].

Kenner – (Advanced Musical Training & Travel)  

Excepting Hans-Dieter Michatz, born and trained in Germany, those in this category were trained in Australia or New Zealand but many developed links beyond those places as they travelled to North America or Europe for advanced training or research. Through travel, most formed networks of friends, teachers, and colleagues which still contribute to their musical, intellectual, creative, and imaginative well-being [Dikmans, Halton, Owens, Peres Da Costa, Schroeder, Stockigt, Wilkinson]. While for some early music repertoire and performance practice has been limited in their present roles [Collins, Webb], for many it is through these networks that their interest in early music repertoire, performance practice and broader

186 Nevertheless, a diagram of many participant links can be found in Appendix C.

187 While the category, Kenner, has its source in the eighteenth-century, it is used somewhat more freely in this context.
cultural history is sustained. Many participants enliven concerts and recitals with rarely heard works and composers or ways of presentation. Some in this group point to aspects of eighteenth-century life and history which may shed new light on previously ‘established’ history [Dikmans, Ekkel, Halton, Owens, Peres Da Costa, Stockigt]. The final name in the table below [Yates] holds a position among the Kenner which may be unique. While he proudly maintains an independent sensibility, he has the respect of many musicians and scholars for his rich and useful knowledge of eighteenth-century history and cultural life as well as his meticulous editing and preparation of performing scores. The table below summarises the location for participant tertiary music education and travel they have undertaken for further study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kenner</th>
<th>1st degree</th>
<th>Advanced training or research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Collins, S.</td>
<td>Newcastle NSW</td>
<td>Indiana USA, Wollongong NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dikmans, G.</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Belgium, Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekkel, G.</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Netherlands, France, Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forbes, A.</td>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>Iowa, Kansas USA, Brisbane Q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Halton, R.</td>
<td>Otago NZ</td>
<td>Oxford, Newcastle NSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lang, S.</td>
<td>Adelaide</td>
<td>Germany, Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michatz, H-D.</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owens, S.</td>
<td>Wellington, NZ</td>
<td>Germany, Wellington NZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peres Da Costa, N.</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>London, Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sadler, L.</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stockigt, J.</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Germany, Czech Republik,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webb, P.</td>
<td>Melbourne</td>
<td>Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilkinson, R.</td>
<td>Brisbane, Q.</td>
<td>Basel, Switzerland,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yates, S.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sydney</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Liebhaber – (Amateurs, Enthusiasts)**

Compared with those above, several participants [Lyn & Peter Hawkins, Sametz, Schroeder] for whom music training was not through a mainstream conservatory training, nevertheless have made remarkable contributions to Australian musical culture. Lyn and Peter Hawkins represent those amateur enthusiasts who were largely responsible for the growth of the early music movement in English-speaking countries from the 1960s. Like other enthusiasts working outside tertiary music education institutions, they gathered fellow enthusiasts, arranged regular meetings, concerts, and festival events, prepared newsletters, imported sheet music and instruments, arranged tours of musicians and ensembles, worked with instrument-makers, sought out sheet music of rarely heard works and drew on facsimiles of original treatises for their self-education. The pathway of amateur music-making has faded away with
the growth of professional ensembles and early music units within universities. Sametz’s musical pathway led to ABC-Classical FM where he presents a wide range of music including Telemann to listeners of all kinds. Schroeder also holds an unusual position by arranging exchanges and discussions between Australian and German performers and musicologists with a view to deepening knowledge and understanding of J. S. Bach’s life and music. His influence extends from church congregations to general audiences. Telemann, he has said, is now ‘on his radar’. Finally, while the number of Australian Liebhaber may have declined, the histories of these participants suggests the power of their drive and imagination might still serve as models for others.

Early Music awareness

Regardless of their eventual standing as either Kenner or Liebhaber, many participants’ earliest awareness of Baroque repertoire was largely limited to J. S. Bach, Handel, and Vivaldi with other composers usually appearing from their later teen years. For recorder players Michatz and Wilkinson a wide range of Baroque music was a natural part of their training. Lyn Hawkins, who began playing viola da gamba as a student, might also be considered an exception. With the foundational repertoire for most instrumentalists being notoriously conservative, many participants first experienced early music through radio broadcasts or by attending concerts rather than playing it. However, as a young choral singer Anne-Marie Forbes sang works from the Renaissance onward. Schroeder, as a university chemistry student in Berlin, heard but didn’t enjoy Romantic-style performances of J. S. Bach. His awareness of the potential of early music performance practice developed most remarkably after his retirement in Melbourne through a chance meeting with the Leipzig Thomaskantor Georg Christoph Biller (1955-).

Performing Styles: From modern to early instruments or styles

After a study of the range of experience of these participants, especially those engaged in music performance or teaching, it is possible to make a few general remarks. It is clear that for Telemann’s music, so dependent on an understanding of mixed styles and its interlocking partnership with rhetoric, those who have developed a deep knowledge of them with their enlivening and moving effects on listeners are best able to contribute to the restoration of his music to our core repertoire. Where the Modern or Romantic playing styles prevail, as they still do in the playing of many professional orchestras for example, much of the detail which gives Telemann’s music its life disappears. This may be less marked when considering his
chamber works where musicians usually have a greater degree of autonomy which may account for his honoured place in the repertoire of many Liebhaber.

In many cases the transition from playing modern instruments to early instruments (such as from modern flute to the baroque flute) was accompanied by a complete change in participant’s understandings of the role of a musician [Dikmans, Halton, Lang, Lyn Hawkins, Michatz, Peres Da Costa, Sadler, Wilkinson]. The core of this remarkable change has to do with the rhetorical foundation of much of early music. As participants recalled discovering this new mode of musicking, their relief and delight was reflected in speech patterns ranging from hesitations and pauses to easily flowing memories or even quiet whispering. Among those working within mainstream performance styles or teaching, the principles of early music performance and its repertoire are becoming more broadly understood and accepted although many spoke of the limitations imposed by modern instruments or professional playing expectations.

**Telemann, networks, pathways — a convergence**

The following chapter returns to the person and music of Georg Philipp Telemann as a prelude to considering how these pathways and networks may have helped or hindered the reception and performance of Telemann’s music in Australia since his tercentenary in 1981.
Chapter 7 – Telemann, Pathways, Networks – a concluding essay

Prelude

The intention of this final chapter is to draw together the various threads of this research: Telemann’s remarkable success as a composer during his lifetime, changes in the reception of his music after his death, the growth of the modern early music movement with all its complex underpinnings, the life stories of a number of Australian musickers gathered through ethnographic interviews, and an attempt to assess the reception of Telemann’s music within today’s Australian musical culture.

Overview

Three questions posed in the Introduction have helped to focus this research.

• Why was the music of Telemann, a well-known and respected composer at the time of his death, so dismissed by following generations?
• What are the factors which now make it possible for musicians to play and for audiences to hear a much wider range of his repertoire and to enjoy it?
• Considering the time since the Telemann tercentenary in 1981, what can now be said about the reception of his music in Australia? What tools or methods can best help to answer this question?

To answer the first of these questions I have drawn on the method of historiography (Chapter 1). In considering the second and third interlocking questions I have drawn on two separate areas of investigation: a) a brief survey of developments within the domain of historical performance practice, and b) a multi-sited ethnography using semi-structured interviews of Australian musickers (Chapter 2). While the use of historiography can yield answers about reception with some clarity and confidence (albeit with the usual academic caution), the qualitative approach at the basis of ethnographic research inevitably requires interpretation of what is often intensely complex data. Drawing on this data I argue that after a period of understandable absence of his music in recent Australian musical culture as well the persistence of the broad cultural forces of Romanticism and Modernism, we can now, through the memories of these participants, identify factors which have enabled remarkable changes. These include the growing availability of well-edited musical scores, a number of enthusiastic
musicologists eager to suggest repertoire to performers who are attentive to the richness of the mixed style of the eighteenth century and the underlying principles of rhetoric. Through revitalising performances and recordings audiences, many hearing this music for the first time, are surprised by the beauty, energy, and wit of the music of Telemann. To show how this came about in recent Australian music culture I drew on the methodology of ethnomusicology.

**Seeger’s tools for musicology**

Prompted by Charles Seeger’s proposal (detailed in Chapter 2) that researchers consider two orientations (historical and systematic), this project is based on a desire to contribute further texture and depth to Australia’s musical history by recording the experiences and memories of these musickers, and also to better understand how their individual pathways and mutual networks may have affected the reception of Telemann’s music in Australia. The goal of this research is, therefore, to establish how ‘things came to be’ as well as ‘how they might be’. Seeger made it clear that this was what he was looking for in his challenge to colleagues in 1935.

> The musical present – our musical present – is the one part of the field almost completely ignored. One runs into the old faith there. The lack of adequate systematic study of our own musical life and of our own personal parts in it stares us in the face – a great gap between the creative musical life of our day and the creative linguistic approach to music we call musicology.188 We have no well-organized idea of what the relationship of a knowledge of history or of comparative musicology is to the person who lives in a musical life in our own culture.189

It is the very texture of the musical present of these Australian musickers upon which this project is based. Before we look more closely at this texture, consider this letter from Handel to Telemann. Imagine overhearing their conversation as if we were ethnographers. What does it tell us about their relationship and their culture?

---


189 Seeger, p. 124.
Setting the scene – Handel and Telemann – *deux hommes galants*

Extract from a letter from Handel in London to Telemann dated 25 December 1750. I congratulate you on the perfect health you enjoy in a fairly advanced age, and I wish you a heartfelt continuation of all kinds of prosperity for many days to come. If passion for exotic plants etc. might prolong your days, and sustain the vivacity which is natural to you, I myself offer with a tender pleasure to contributing to it in some way. Therefore I make to you a present, and I’ve sent you (by the address attached) a crate of flowers, which the connoisseurs of these plants assure me of being exquisite and of a charming rarity, if they tell me truly, YOU WILL HAVE THE BEST PLANTS OF ALL ENGLAND, the season is still suited to have flowers; You will be the best judge, I am waiting your decision. However do not make me languish a long time for Your pleasant reply to this, since I am, with the most tender friendship and perfect fondness, Monsieur, 191

Your very humble and very obedient Servant

Georg Frideric Handel. 192

This charming extract is from the first of two surviving letters in which Handel informed his friend of a shipment of rare plants. One can only imagine Telemann’s smile as he unpacked the plants, for he was a keen gardener in a city famous for its English-style gardens shops as well as its coffee-houses. It appears here because it says much, not only about their deep friendship established as early in 1701 as young, somewhat unwilling, law students, but also because it gives us a sense of the characteristic sensibility of the *Galant Homme* of the time. Keith Chapin, in his article on Telemann’s response to the *Querelle des Anciens et des Modernes*, writes about Telemann’s stance.

While Telemann dedicated himself to generating delight rather than to creating and imitating character, he subscribed to a version of *galant* aesthetics in which ethical issues of character played a vital role. For him and his contemporaries, these ethical issues were located in the act

---

190 Malcolm Freiberg, “Going Gregorian, 1582-1752: A Summary View,” *The Catholic Historical Review* 86, no. 1 (2000). Handel’s precise style of dating showed both the New Style ‘NS’ calendar dates while Hamburg was using the Old Style ‘OS’ or Julian calendar. Handel wrote in England on the 25th (NS) while, while in Hamburg it was the 14th (OS).

191 “Je Vous felicite de la parfaite Sancté que Vous jouissez dans un Age assez avancé, et je Vous souhaite de bon Cœur la Continuation de toute sorte de prosperité pendant plusieurs Ans a l’avenir. Si la passion pour les Plantes exotiques etc. pourroit prolonguer Vos jours, et soutenir la vivacité qui Vous est naturelle, Je m’offre avec un sensible plaisir a y contribuer en quelque maniere. Je Vous fais don un Present, et je Vous envoie (par l’adresse cy jointe) une Caisse de Fleurs, que le Connoisseurs de ces Plantes m’assurent d’étre choisies et d’une rareté Charmante, s’il medissent le vray, VOUS AUREZ DES PLANTES LES MEILLEURES DE TOUTE L’ANGLETERRE, la saison est encore propre pour en avoir des Fleurs ; Vous en serez le meilleur Juge, j’attens Vôtre decision la dessus. Cependant ne me faites pas languir long temps pour Votre agréable Repose a celle cy [celle-ci], puisque je suis avec la plus sensible Amitie, et passion parfaite Monsieur ... ” [My translation.]

192 Telemann. Briefwechsel, pp. 342-3

193 Zohn, “Georg Philipp Telemann.” Telemann met Handel several times in Halle as he, Telemann, passed through on his way to Leipzig from Magdeburg.
of composing or performing music, that is, the musician’s persona rather than in the music itself.\textsuperscript{194}

Chapin, in the following sentence, encapsulates what it seems to me, is at the heart of the attraction of today’s musicians and listeners to Telemann’s music.

In his scorn for pedantry and his cultivated stance towards the popular, the \textit{galant} musician avoided what were perceived as pitfalls for the individual spirit: disciplinary routine and popular fashion.\textsuperscript{195}

Those two deadening factors – routine and fashion – seem to be what was suggested by the caption of Lee Lorenz’s New Yorker cartoon of 1982, ‘ALL THE GEORG PHILIPP TELEMANN YOU CAN STAND’.\textsuperscript{196} However in today’s early music scene, with a growing understanding of the place of rhetoric in musical performance based on the reciprocal relationship between composer, performer, and audience we can see remarkable outcomes in the musical lives of many of these participants. Telemann himself has strewn flowers of musical delight for today’s musicians and it is through their ‘voices’ as much as his music that it again comes to life.

**Toward Telemann’s smile? – outcomes of a qualitative study**

We are \textit{not} the same musicians, mentally \textit{nor} the same human beings, and not being the same, it \textit{is} very difficult to read an old music treatise in its proper meaning and context. The solution, of course, is to read less about music and more about context.\textsuperscript{197}


Frans Brüggen’s advice was given at a time when an important task of musicologists was to establish scholarly critical editions for study and performance. Like Brüggen – Haynes, Burgess, and others have proposed that in order to enrich understanding of this music, musicians could broaden their inquiry to include such areas as fine and decorative art, literature and history, opera and theatre, aesthetics and philosophy – that is, the very rich human culture of the past.\textsuperscript{198} A scan of the postwar history of early music performance reveals that this move from \textit{text} to \textit{act}, in Taruskin’s terminology, has been fruitful.\textsuperscript{199} We find in the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{194} Chapin, p. 380.
\item \textsuperscript{195} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{196} Lorenz.
\item \textsuperscript{197} Quoted in Haynes and Burgess, p. xii.
\item \textsuperscript{198} Nicholas Cook, "Editing in Music," \textit{Contemporary Theatre Review} 25, no. 1 (2015). Even so, as Nicholas Cook claims, the art of editing can still reveal new insights that convey ‘a quite new sound image’. p. 119.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
words of some participants, however, that the living quality of some music-making depends also upon making links across boundaries between types of musickers. Among travelling musicians and academics such link-making may seem commonplace, but among those whose pathways have been outside of conservatory musical training many hitherto unrecognised links have been important. A final comment about the material below – this is not an attempt to draw on all the memories of all participants but rather to point out stories or events which exemplify broad trends within this data. All participant comments have been drawn from research interviews with names indicated by square brackets.

**Telemann on the fringes**

Leaving aside the notion of networks for the moment, it is time to focus on how individual pathways of participants relate to the reception of Telemann’s music in today’s Australia. For some, Telemann’s music has been an accepted and even growing part of their core repertoire for teaching, musicological studies, radio broadcasting, and performance; but for others, even those with high-level music training, Telemann’s music remains on the fringe of their repertoire. This may be more an effect of the afterglow of Romantic and Modernist cultural preferences rather than an individual explicit dismissal. A glance back to Australian musical institutions of the 1970s reminds us of the power of those preferences. Listen, for example, to Neal Peres Da Costa who, after arriving for a lesson with his new piano teacher, recalls her response to his excitement about C. P. E. Bach’s *Versuch* and his first experience of a harpsichord.

"Oh yes, that’s right. That’s what they do to you at university. They’re going to give you these other instruments and they’re going to give you this book. You’ll have to do all that stuff for them at university but when you come here you just forget all of that." [Peres Da Costa]

Or note that Greg Dikmans, after entering Sydney University in 1975 as a modern flute player, wished to swap to baroque flute. The response from an Associate Professor seems not to have been unusual during the mid-1970s. “Well, there’s no repertoire, is there? We can’t let you do it.” Well, I did it anyway.’ [Dikmans] For Peter Webb, who during the 1970s became an oboe and cor anglais player trained largely outside the conservatory system, Telemann was primarily chamber music repertoire. He found Telemann and other Baroque music ‘useful’ as well as enjoyable to play, in that it could be worked up quickly and was attractive to concert-goers. Immersed in his professional playing role, he had little time to explore the subtleties of historically-informed practice.
Returning to the present, for many Australian conservatory-trained musicians, teachers, and their students, the music of Telemann is still largely on the fringes of their listening and playing repertoire. The violinist Susan Collins (University of Tasmania), speaking about her role as an AMEB music examiner, says that while Telemann’s music is now in revised exam syllabuses, she hears more J. S. Bach than Telemann. Bach’s technical challenges may be the prime influence. ‘People almost invariably choose Bach if they think they’re advanced enough to deal with Bach, or Vivaldi if Bach isn’t going to show them at their best.’ [Collins] The easy availability of music scores of Bach and Vivaldi and others, innumerable recordings or broadcasts, and the influence of their teacher’s own musical history can also be strong influences. Collins also spoke about the effect of past generations’ valuation of the ‘depth’ of Bach’s music in comparison with Telemann and other composers of his period. ‘Certain very religious people would have seen that to mean, “Ah yes, it doesn’t have the depth. We’ll listen to Bach”.’ [Collins]

**Telemann returning**

While during the 1970s and 1980s Telemann may not have found a secure place within Australian conservatories, among the Liebhaber, the enthusiasts, his music was being restored to core playing and listening repertoire. In Peter Webb’s terms it was ‘useful’ and it had attractive qualities. Musicologist Samantha Owens (New Zealand School of Music) describes evenings playing trio sonatas. ‘We’d sight-read a lot of music, just for fun you know, in the evenings with a glass of wine. We played a lot of Telemann.’ [Owens] Like some other participants, she compared Telemann’s instrumental music with that of J. S. Bach. Telemann, she said, knew what he was doing when he wrote for the oboe. ‘The music can still be challenging to play but not in a ridiculous way... Bach’s fantastic, of course, but some of the stuff, it’s just beyond the pale.’ [Owens] The singer and musicologist, Anne-Marie Forbes, had similar things to say about the vocal writing of the two, J. S. Bach and Telemann. She described Bach’s vocal lines as often presenting insoluble problems for the singer. ‘Bach’s writing for voice is just... [lowering her voice] awful. From a singer’s point of view, it’s just horrible.’ [Forbes] But when introducing Telemann to her students she tells them that his music was not “bad Bach” but [was] quite distinctive. He had a sense of line, particularly in the cantatas [where] you recognise that he was quite kind to the voice.’ [Forbes]

Taking the notion of Telemann’s music returning literally, Gary Ekkel, prompted by a suggestion from musicologist Jan Stockigt, recently toured with his St Michael’s College choir to Germany where they sang the complete Telemann motet, *Singet dem Herrn ein neues Lied*
[TWV 7:30]. Listeners remarked that schools in Germany don’t do this any longer. ‘There’s always that element of surprise that everybody who sings thinks that [Bach’s] Singet dem Herrn is one of the greatest choral works. They’re surprised by the depth of the music in Telemann.’ [Ekkel]

In Australia many younger audiences were introduced to Telemann through Musica Viva schools concerts. Ruth Wilkinson (recorder and viola da gamba) spoke about her fellow musicians as well as the reactions of their listeners.

All my colleagues I’ve ever played with... we all love it. Certainly the audiences do and I’ve played to a very broad audience. From the fairly formal, stiff Musica Viva subscription series in the big concert halls... to the little, local concerts. People do love it. Students love playing it. [Wilkinson]

If we shift our gaze from those of the professional musician/musicologist cohort to those self-taught amateur musicians who formed the postwar foundation (1945-) of the Australian early music movement, we see that Telemann has always provided core performing and learning material. Participants Lyn and Peter Hawkins (both playing viola da gamba) provide a case study with their shared long leadership of the Early Music Society of Victoria. Speaking of her university days in the 1960s Lyn described the lively mixture to be found in such groups. As a member of an informal early music group at Monash University, the Wednesday Consort led by Professor of English Harold Love, she spoke of the place of Telemann on monthly concerts. ‘On an average program there would be maybe a Telemann trio sonata... maybe not every time but more than anybody else and then choral works as well.’ [Lyn Hawkins] In her role at the core of Melbourne amateur early music playing in the 1970s and 1980s she explained why his music was so often programmed. ‘It’s the calibre. It fitted into that semi-amateur performance model and it’s not hard.’ [Lyn Hawkins] There was also a close relationship between musical groups and their audience who were often also fellow amateur musicians. ‘But that’s the catch... we’re in our little fishbowl. So everybody I know would have heard of Telemann.’ [Lyn Hawkins] Sadly, Peter and Lyn Hawkins, recognise that the roles they played at the centre of such groups of the Early Music Society of Victoria (NSW) are disappearing with the continuing professionalisation of this culture. Travelling professional groups no longer need their home-grown festivals but have moved to the main stage. Early music units now have secured places within Australian universities.
Telemann at the core

We have seen above (Chapters 5 & 6) that many musicians enjoy playing or singing Telemann and that several factors may be at play. These include fine recordings as well as growing numbers of well-edited scores and online music archives from which several participants draw on for repertoire suited to their needs. Baroque flute player Liane Sadler spoke of the delight of her fellow players in a student-led Baroque music festival. Speaking the reaction of her fellow players to an Overture-Suite she recalled, “They said, “Oh this is so good. Telemann is so good”, whenever you play his music.’ [Sadler] Beyond the issue of Telemann’s imaginative use of instrumental colours, often cited by participants, there is also his ability to tailor his writing to the instruments. Even his most brilliant writing suits the nature of each instrument or voice. Amateur viola da gamba player Lyn Hawkins makes just this point in reference to his Paris Quartets. ‘You pick up your flute, you can play those parts. You pick up your gamba, you can play those parts. You pick up the cello... The cellos can’t play the gamba parts. The gamba can’t play the cello part.’ [Lyn Hawkins]

But there are other factors not yet touched on which suggest that the resurgence of interest in his music is based upon more than the increasing availability of music scores and recordings and Telemann’s clever technical writing. Many participants returned from European or American studies with their music-making remarkably changed by way of an immersion in eighteenth-century culture expressed through the subtle and complex idiom of galant style. When interwoven with the principles of rhetoric, many participants spoke of the delighted reactions of their audiences, especially those largely unfamiliar with Telemann’s music. Not only were they hearing ‘new’ musical works but the idiom and approach to performance did not put up barriers they might have experienced from a ‘Modernist’ performance of Bach, for instance, as an example of German genius.

These new understandings, embedded in the playing of experienced early music players, are also influencing many mainstream players and teachers. Sue Collins, after playing Bach on a baroque violin during her time at the University of Indiana, said that she now plays Locatelli and Bach on her modern instrument with greater emphasis on rhythmic or harmonic stresses and with different tempi. Several participants, players of both modern and early instruments, acknowledged the limitations of modern instruments when playing early music. Megan Lang, recalling her transition from modern to baroque flute, explained that only the baroque instrument offers the subtleties of sound production and technique required to fully realise French Baroque music.
Hearing the thoughts of musickers in transition from rule-bound to greater freedom in their music-making suggests that it might be useful at this point to come back to Nick Wilson’s notion of ‘re-enchantment’. While his argument is complex, at its core is the desirability of ‘play’ and the leaving behind of concepts of centralised, objective notions of the ‘work’. Wilson proposes:

First, a process of decentering; second, the provision of an expanded play space; and, third, the process of holding the play space open.\(^{200}\)

I close this brief survey with the thoughts of Neal Peres Da Costa who, with his long experience as a continuo player of Telemann’s music, has thought deeply about these issues. Speaking about its convivial quality he said:

In the music you often get these conversations between instruments which are entirely charming. Also challenging. Some incredibly challenging writing. Not just the upper strings but sometimes also continuo. I think we sometimes felt, both Danny [Yeadon] and I as continuo players, that sometimes the Telemann was “geared” toward the upper parts compared with Bach where you were really challenged in all departments. [Peres Da Costa]

But, as with a swan swimming on a smooth-surfaced pond, there is more going on below than may be apparent from the surface. In listening to moving performances of Telemann we may be hearing the work of many year’s contemplation, experimentation, or even play by performers like Peres Da Costa. Extending his thoughts about the role of continuo players he said:

[With] Telemann... you could end up feeling like you were in a subordinate, accompanimental role. However, one of the things I realised, and I realise it even more now, is that those simple bass lines... [Pause] do not give away the complexity of playing a very, very fine continuo realisation. When you start looking into what was required to do as a continuo player, you realise, “Oh, my goodness.” What was on the page was so much the starting point and you were required to do so much more.

It is this... these understandings which, it seems, are essential to the continued restoration or re-enchantment of Telemann’s distinctive voice to today’s musical world. His music can be played through a musician’s entire career from youth to artist but the greatest of it demands the same concealed technical wizardry, wit, wisdom, and spiritual grounding as others we honour with the title ‘genius’.

\(^{200}\) Wilson, p. 219.
From Pathways to Networks

Ruth Finnegan’s notion of pathways, as detailed above, is based on local groups of musicians centred around particular genres of music-making.\(^{201}\) Pathways, used in this sense, suggest how individuals might progress over time within a particular musical setting such as church choirs or folk clubs. Elizabeth Ozment and other sociologists use the idea of networks to tease out interpersonal relationships within distinctive musical communities.\(^{202}\) For this study, the term networks describes interrelationships both within closely-bound musical communities as well as those that exist over time like links to a particular school, or over distance like connections between colleagues who may not work regularly together but, nevertheless, share ideas or research from time to time. While these links or networks may be more subtle or diffused they can still influence the reception of neglected composers like Telemann and others.

If we consider first our culture’s common focus on individual musicians whose careers or pathways were established by arduous training with one or two particular teachers we might think their achievements as being unique. In the context of early music Nick Wilson puts it neatly, reminding us of their extraordinary range of skills and knowledge.

Of course, much of Early Music’s success is attributable to the musical and performance-related skills of the talented individuals the movement has attracted. But this is by no means the whole story. Also underlying the success of Early Music has been the practical capacity of its principal cast of players to reconcile the apparently contradictory on a day-to-day basis – being a scholar and a performer; an artist and an artisan; a professional and an amateur; a musician and a cultural entrepreneur; a magician, enchanter, and the enchanted.\(^{203}\)

Hidden within Wilson’s list is a phrase, ‘the cast of characters’, suggesting a broader canvas reminding us that few can do it all but many, together, can do much.

We have seen that for many but not all participants, Telemann’s music is core repertoire. Yet, in looking at interconnections between types, across time, distance, roles, countries, and so on, it seems that some ‘sequences’ of interconnection have been especially fruitful in restoring Telemann to the centre of Baroque music repertoire. That is, his music may again flow if the roles that Telemann himself played, his ‘musical persona’\(^{204}\) along with his ability to attract local supporters, communicate with distant colleagues, follow and

---

\(^{201}\) Finnegan.


\(^{203}\) Wilson, p. 212 - 13.

\(^{204}\) Chapin, p. 380.
respond to changes in aesthetic ideals, in community development and music education, in commercial music printing and distribution, and local and regional politics, poetry, opera, religion and philosophy... his music may again flow as today's musickers draw on the synergy of networks encompassing some or all of these roles.

The table below illustrates a few of the more remarkable links between the diverse range of musickers, participants in this study, who have explored, developed, or extended their roles within networks. Most of these links were not known by this writer before research commenced. Some networks below suggest possible direct influence on Telemann reception while others illustrate how they may clear the way for further developments.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Network Nodes</th>
<th>Network links</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forbes</td>
<td>Musicology students</td>
<td>Forbes teaches her students how to use online archives of early music manuscripts and to edit performing scores. Thus, the range of musical options for performance expands and they gain fine-grained knowledge of reading musical autographs along with an understanding of interpreting thoroughbass symbols.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peres Da Costa</td>
<td>Recordings of artists of the past</td>
<td>By meticulous analysis of early recordings Peres Da Costa connects today’s performers to empirical evidence about performance practice of music from mid-nineteenth-century Europe. The group, Ironwood, extends these links into concert and recital halls of Australia and beyond through recordings. Telemann appears often on recital and concert programs of students and ensembles at the Sydney Conservatorium. He maintains links to many international musical friends and colleagues who offer local masterclasses and concerts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sametz</td>
<td>ABC Classic FM listeners, Research supporting new recordings, Fellow presenters and programmers</td>
<td>Drawing on his ability to entice listeners with rarely heard composers, music, new performers, and his interest in the broader culture of their time, Sametz develops an audience for both the music and concerts and recitals of Australian and international musical groups. As a presenter he tells listeners about current research helping to place music in its historical context. Sametz brings Telemann and other early composers ‘to the table’ and thus may be directly influencing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schroeder</td>
<td>Stockigt</td>
<td>Schroeder, president of the Australian Bach Society, invites local musicians and musicologists into his project to enrich Australian knowledge of Bach’s life and music. With strong links to Germany, he has developed travelling exchanges of academics as well as musicians and choral ensembles. He ensures that the board of The Australian Bach Society is based on a sharing of their talents and imagination. While Telemann is not his particular focus, through his active links to German and Australian academics and musicians, he helps to broaden knowledge of eighteenth-century German musical culture including Telemann.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owens</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekkel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German and Australian musicians and scholars</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stockigt</th>
<th>Michatz</th>
<th>Jan Stockigt, musicologist, has suggested rarely performed repertoire to Michatz and Ekkel which they and their musical groups have then performed. Early discussions with Schroeder about J. S. Bach have helped the Australian Bach Society to develop links with other musicologists. Following on from her early work on Telemann, she continues sharing her knowledge of his life and music. She maintains life-long links to European and Australian scholars through international conferences.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ekkel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schroeder</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Links to international and Australian scholars</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yates</th>
<th>Peres Da Costa</th>
<th>Yates draws on his deep knowledge of eighteenth-century musical culture and history. As a composer with a detailed knowledge of musical instrument strengths and weaknesses, familiarity with online music archives and other sources of music manuscripts, he supports teachers and students to find and prepare music (often including works of Telemann) for performance by historical performance unit ensembles. Students, like Liane Sadler, are learning how they too can draw on these online resources.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lang</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sadler</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-led ensembles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audiences hearing rarely performed music</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kuijken &amp; the ‘Dutch’ school of baroque flute</th>
<th>Dikmans</th>
<th>All three were students of Barthold Kuijken. Megan Lang also studied with Michatz on her return to Australia. Ekkel spoke</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ekkel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>players</td>
<td>Michatz</td>
<td>of many Australian baroque flute players being influenced by the ‘Amsterdam school’ as opposed to the ‘French school’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Geelong College (Vic)</td>
<td>Ekkel, Webb, Wilkinson</td>
<td>Geelong College, a school known for its active musical life, was were Ekkel and Webb, at different times, were students. Wilkinson taught music there to the young student, Ekkel who later studied baroque flute with her at the University of Melbourne. The countertenor and teacher, Hartley Newnham who preceded Wilkinson at the school, later formed together with her the Renaissance music ensemble, <em>La Romanesca</em>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Closing

In summary I have shown how, until recently, dismissive critical assessments of Telemann’s music as well as the effect of mainstream Romantic and Modernist aesthetics on music performance have restricted our culture’s understanding and enjoyment of Telemann’s music. With the continuing growth, depth, and diversity of the early music performance world, Telemann’s music is again being played and heard in arresting and persuasive rhetorical performances. Further, this study has shown that since the postwar years (1945–) several generations of musickers in Australia have contributed to this development; however, there are still factors which continue, even within some Australian music conservatoria, to hinder these hopeful developments in the reception of Telemann. Involvement of the Liebhaber, amateur musickers who during the 1970s and 1980s built local societies, clubs, and festivals largely through local contacts, is now reduced although some of these activities have been taken up by the Kenner who are mostly professional musicians or ensembles, and teachers within universities. Participants in this study who play or sing Telemann spoke of the pleasure they get from his music with its galant beauty, charm and wit, imaginative musical textures and instrumentation, and his enjoyably singable and playable musical lines. For many, J. S. Bach remains among the geniuses although some quietly criticise his unreasonable technical vocal and instrumental demands.

Through the contributions of these and many other Australian musickers our musical culture is now a richer environment for better understanding and enjoying Telemann's music and the culture in which it was created. This has been achieved through the work and imagination of extraordinary people and through the intersection of pathways and networks contributing unexpected and surprising results within as well as beyond the walls of concert halls, classrooms, and music studios. In Seeger’s words, we have seen ‘how things came to be as they were’ and also ‘how they might be’.205

---

205 Seeger, p. 123.
Appendix A - Semi-structured Interview Schedules & HREC Project Approval letter

Interview Schedule A1 – 3 September 2014
Interview Schedule A2 – 7 March 2015
HREC Project Approval Letter – 29 August 2014
### Interview Schedule A1 – 3 September 2014

**Participant’s musical training and development history –**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Notes by interviewer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What was your musical training?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>When did you begin to take an interest in Early Music repertoire? What prompted this?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Were there particular teachers, mentors, performers that influenced your decision to pursue working in the area of Early Music?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Instrumentalists: Can you tell me about your instrument(s)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Scholars/musicologists/editors: What is the nature of your interest in Early Music?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Participant’s knowledge of and performing history of the music of Telemann --**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Notes by interviewer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>What do you recall about your first encounter with the music of Telemann?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Did you form a judgement about his music at that time?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Do you continue to explore the music of Telemann for pleasure or for performing?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>What are the challenges, difficulties, rewards of playing his music?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>What is the process of developing a performance?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>If you have played in an ensemble which has performed works of Telemann what was the feeling of other members of the group of the work in particular or Telemann’s music in general after a performance?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Has your assessment of Telemann’s music changed after having studied or performed it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Will you consider playing other works by Telemann? Are there particular works you would like to study or perform?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some musicians may have been influenced by European or American teachers. Who? How did they contribute to their formation?
# Interview Schedule A2 – 7 March 2015

## Interview Question Schedule (Supplement)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **1** | Participant’s musical training and development history—  
  • Place  
  • Teacher(s)  
  • Instruments or voice  
  • Mentors  
  • Performers  
  • Music heard – radio, recordings, concerts  
  • Repertoire played/sung  
  • Travel |
| **2** | When did you begin to be aware of “Early Music”.  
  • What Instruments?  
  • Repertoire  
  • Were performing groups an important element?  
  • How did you become aware of historical performance practices? |
| **3** | Participant’s knowledge of and performing history of the music of Telemann— |
| **4** | Many musicians working in the Early Music area have been doing so for a number of years.  
  • What has contributed to sustaining your work in performance/study of this music?  
  • Have there been times when the path ahead was clouded?  
  • Has the nature of your involvement or your role changed over time? |
| **5** | How do audiences, listeners, students or colleagues respond to the music (particularly that of Telemann)? Are you aware of any differences based upon age? |
| **6** | Have you ever been surprised by your or others’ responses to the music? Can you tease out what qualities of the music might have led to this? |
| **7** | Has music in your repertoire (either playing or listening) changed? Why? |
Friday, 29 August

2014 Dr Alan Maddox
Musicology Unit; Sydney Conservatorium of Music
Email: alan.maddox@sydney.edu.au

Dear Alan,

I am pleased to inform you that the Conservatorium of Music Low Risk Subcommittee has approved your project entitled “Georg Philipp Telemann: a survey of performance of his music in Australia since 1981”.

Details of the approval are as follows:

**Project No.:** 2014/582

**Approval Date:** 28 August

2014 First Annual Report Due: 28 August 2015

**Authorised Personnel:** Maddox Alan; Dorwick Dennis Marvin; Nelson Kathleen;

**Documents Approved:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Uploaded</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Document Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Interview Questions</td>
<td>Interview questions revised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Interview Questions</td>
<td>Telephone/Skype Script</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Other Type</td>
<td>Follow-up email script questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Participant Consent Form</td>
<td>PCF revised to reflect requested changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Participant Info Statement</td>
<td>PIS revised to reflect requested changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/08/2014</td>
<td>Questionnaires/Surveys</td>
<td>On-line Questionnaire script</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/08/2014</td>
<td>Recruitment Letter/Email</td>
<td>Letter/email of invitation revised and corrected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HREC approval is valid for four (4) years from the approval date stated in this letter and is granted pending the following conditions being met:

**Condition/s of Approval**

- Continuing compliance with the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Research Involving Humans.
- Provision of an annual report on this research to the Human Research Ethics Committee from the approval date and at the completion of the study. Failure to submit reports will result in withdrawal of ethics approval for the project.
• All serious and unexpected adverse events should be reported to the HREC within 72 hours.

• All unforeseen events that might affect continued ethical acceptability of the project should be reported to the HREC as soon as possible.

• Any changes to the project including changes to research personnel must be approved by the HREC before the research project can proceed.

• Note that for student research projects, a copy of this letter must be included in the candidate’s thesis.

Chief Investigator / Supervisor’s responsibilities:

1. You must retain copies of all signed Consent Forms (if applicable) and provide these to the HREC on request.

2. It is your responsibility to provide a copy of this letter to any internal/external granting agencies if requested.

Please do not hesitate to contact Research Integrity (Human Ethics) should you require further information or clarification.

Yours sincerely

Dr Helen Mitchell
Chair
Conservatorium of Music Low Risk Subcommittee
Appendix B – Participant Interview Summaries

INTRODUCTION

The eighteen participants can be grouped into two broad categories: **musician – scholars**, that is, musicians who support their performance with an active interest in the contributions of musicologists and researchers and **scholar – musicians**, that is, those whose main focus is research and who may also be or have been active musicians as well. Some participants have described times when they have shifted from one general focus to the other. The boundaries of these categories can be fluid. Only one participant described himself as **not** being a musician although his work as a musical entrepreneur demonstrates a strong desire to follow and support musical research and outcomes in performance. I have, therefore, included this participant among the ‘scholar – musicians’. The summaries are based upon the broad categories of the interview schedule [See Appendix A]:

- their early introduction to music. In most cases participants began instrumental music lessons or singing in childhood. Parents, other family members, friends, neighbours, or teachers were often influential;

- their first awareness of early music, particularly music of the Baroque period, and its effect on their musical lives;

- the place of Telemann in their experience.

These summaries are not intended to be full-blown biographies nor can they always fully represent the complete nature of what, in many cases, were extended discussions. I am grateful for the unfailingly generous participation of all participants. All participants have given permission to be named in this thesis. For many, their stories have not before been told and may well prompt further research and publication.
Musician – Scholars

Dr Sue Collins
Greg Dikmans
Dr Gary Ekkel
Dr Rosalind Halton
Lyn Hawkins
Peter Hawkins
Megan Lang
Hans-Dieter Michatz
Dr Neal Peres Da Costa
Liane Sadler
Peter Webb
Ruth Wilkinson

Scholar – Musicians

Dr Anne-Marie Forbes
Dr Samantha Owens
Phillip Sametz
Hans D. Schroeder
Dr Jan Stockigt
Stephen Yates

Note: To facilitate ease of use all participant interview summaries are presented below alphabetically by surname.
Dr Sue Collins – ‘The Baroque Early Music professor, Austin B. Caswell, was one of the best lecturers I’ve ever had in my life. He would always be there listening to the jazz improvisation sessions. The jazz and early music departments were wonderfully connected at IU.’

Interview recorded 17 September 2015

1985-1988 Sydney Conservatorium of Music – DSCM, violin
1990-1991 Indiana University, Bloomington USA – Master of Music.
2005 University of Wollongong – Awarded Doctor of Creative Arts

Collins grew up in a household of musicians. Dorrilyn, her mother, taught both piano and violin and was leader of the Newcastle Orchestra (NSW). Her violin-playing father, Errol, hoped she might share his enthusiasm for jazz as well as the classical repertoire she preferred. He also experimented with baroque bows which were then becoming available during the growth of the early music movement. Both these modes of music-making, jazz and classical, would become part of her musical life during her postgraduate studies. After completing her Diploma of Violin performance at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music in 1988, Collins looked to an American university, the University of Indiana, to continue her studies. There, she was able to pursue both a major in violin performance, studying with Yuval Yaron, and a minor in jazz studies to which she added further work in the early music unit which had an impressive reputation. In describing her impression of her violin teacher, Yuval Yaron, she said, ‘I was just in awe of his precision, his ability to play perfectly.’

[Recitals] were back to back but when Yuval had a recital, the recitals prior to his would always be full because people wanted to be sure to have a seat. It didn’t matter what... a first year student who was scheduled that afternoon beforehand... they had an absolutely packed audience.

206 ‘IU’ - Indiana University (USA)
While her major study was classical violin, she also found an open and welcoming atmosphere in other areas of Indiana's Jacobs School of Music, the jazz and early music units.

Those two departments had a great relationship with each other. The Baroque Early Music professor, Austin B. Caswell [1932-2006], was one of the best lecturers I've ever had in my life. He would always be there listening to the jazz improvisation. The jazz and early music departments were wonderfully connected at IU.  

Without telling Yaron, her violin teacher, she experimented with playing the Bach D-minor Partita on a baroque violin. Within the early music unit, both instruments and training were easily available.

Upon acceptance into the Baroque Orchestra you're given a baroque violin and all the accompaniments. They really look after you. They gave you lessons. My modern violin teacher was not so interested in early music performance practice, experimentation or research. He was very much a modern violinist and great for that. He was also very strict. He taught in that path.

She recalls quite different attitudes of the students as well. ‘At that time, the modern violin players were quite distinctly serious and were less involved in the fun of music-making that I saw between these other two departments. The jazz and early music departments were just having fun.’

On her return to Australia she played with the Sydney Symphony Orchestra as a casual player but soon took up the position of deputy concertmaster at the Australian Opera.

I felt very lucky, because there's something wonderful about playing an opera from beginning to end as your working-day. A Meistersinger day was perhaps the best day of all. Because Meistersinger is performed as two calls, which is the maximum number for musicians in the orchestra, you'd begin “work” at 5pm. The music is extraordinary, of course. Also, I found it physically exhilarating to play. When you stop for dinner at 7, you feel as though you've had a great workout. Then at 8pm you're back in the pit for another three hours of divinely beautiful music (In spite of what you hear about that pit, for me it was a familiar and protected place where I could devote myself entirely to my own contribution to a great art form). And then the day’s over.

Almost all operas are great. On the whole, I believe composers have put their best work into operas. For me, playing a complete work, a small yet complete universe, as a performance...

Each day I knew what I was looking forward to.

---

207 Austin B. Caswell (1932-2006) was chair of musicology of the Jacobs School of Music, University of Indiana. Thomas Binkley, lutenist and musicologist, whose remarkable career encompassed teaching at the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis, Switzerland from 1973-1977, a visiting professorship at Stanford University (1977, 1979), and finally founded and directed the Early Music Institute at the University of Indiana from 1979 until his death in 1995.
When asked to consider the place of Telemann in her repertoire she said

   Bach has been in the standard repertoire about the last hundred years. I’m afraid I didn’t have a
teacher who suggested that I learn Telemann. It was Bach and then it was Paganini and then it
was Ysaïe. And, I should admit that J.S. Bach is one of my greatest inspirations.

As an examiner for the AMEB [Australian Music Examinations Board] she is very aware of
what students are playing. She believes there is some Telemann in the syllabus but ‘students
almost invariably choose Bach if they think they’re advanced enough to deal with Bach... or
Vivaldi, if Bach isn’t going to show them at their best’. Bach also still continues to overshadow
other composers in terms of his religious music. Collins, imagining the judgement of those
influenced by the religiously-influenced censorship of film and the general culture of the
previous century, says [with a ‘superior’ voice] ‘Ah yes, it doesn’t have the depth. We’ll listen to
Bach.’ She spoke also about the effect of persistent, damning judgements on both Telemann,
and the subject of her Doctoral thesis, the Sydney-based composer and teacher Raymond
Hanson (who experienced the disapproval of those from ‘established’ musical culture of his
time). ‘Once one respected scholar writes something damning, nobody seems to have the
courage to write something different. It’s just repeated and repeated. Same thing more or less
happened with Hanson.’

   While ready availability of recordings and sheet music of the music of J. S. Bach and
Vivaldi continues to influence students, Collins has introduced them to some music of
Telemann (though she is now embarrassed at how little). She mentioned, particularly, the
Telemann Concerto for four violins in D major [TWV: 40:202] which she has done with her
students. Collins also tells of her own search for less well-known Baroque sonatas but had
focussed on Locatelli. She admits Telemann hadn’t crossed her mind. ‘Perhaps he was just one
of those composers who wasn’t appreciated in the right way at the right time.’ Thinking about
how Telemann violin concertos might be performed by her chamber ensemble, the Jan Sedivka
Camerata (named after a much-loved violin teacher in Hobart), Collins said that she would be
keen to explore the Telemann works ‘to offer the students extra incentive, through the
independent and soloistic roles within ensemble’. Like many other musician-teachers
considering possible repertoire for her students, she may be recalling the effect of her own
formative experiences. Remembering her time in the early music unit at the University of
Indiana she recalled...

   It was certainly a lot of fun. We worked on lots and lots of repertoire in that orchestra. We put
on a production of Amadigi [Handel, Amadigi di Gaula, HWV 11, (1715)] which was probably the
most fun I’ve ever had in music-making because we were all involved in the production. And
the musicians were on stage. Sometimes we were trees... sometimes we formed part of the set. It was a student production. We didn't have a budget but it was... always exciting. That's probably what got me into the Baroque Orchestra. I had been to their performances. They all looked to be having so much fun.

**Greg Dikmans** – ‘I wanted to swap from modern flute to baroque flute and recorder as my principle [instruments]. And they thought “what a nutcase”. Associate Professor, Professor Gross, bless his heart, took me aside and said, “Well, there’s no repertoire is there and we can’t let you do it.” Well, I did it anyway.’

1975 – 1978 University of Sydney – Bachelor of Music
1982 – 1984 Conservatoire Royal de Musique de Bruxelles – Postgraduate Diploma in Traverso Flute
1988 – 1991 La Trobe University – Master of Music (Historical Performance Practice)

Interview recorded 9 September 2014

[The interview was conducted at his home in Melbourne. When I arrived, he had a number of his period flutes set out on the table. For thirty-one years Greg Dikmans has been an Associate Lecturer at the Melbourne Conservatorium where he teaches and directs ensembles at the Early Music Studio. He has also been the artistic director for the *Elysium Ensemble* (Melbourne) for thirty-one years.]

Greg Dikmans grew up in post-war Sydney. His mother was Swiss and his father Dutch. He was a keen self-taught recorder player who persuaded his father to subscribe to the World Record Club which was, in the early 1970s, issuing recordings of European players such as Hans-Martin Linde. Dikmans recalls playing recorder in a production of a Purcell opera with Winsome Evans on harpsichord. ‘It was huge for me to be involved in something like that and she invited me to come and play in the *Renaissance Players* while I was still at school.’ What became known as the early music movement of the 1970s grew not within established musical education institutions, but instead out of the efforts of musicians who were excited by both the new sounds and instruments, and a new repertoire. Halfway through a Bachelor of Music degree at the University of Sydney, Dikmans wished to switch from modern flute to recorder and baroque flute.

They thought ‘what a nutcase’. Associate Professor, Professor [Eric] Gross [1926 -2011], bless his heart, took me aside and said, ‘Well, there’s no repertoire, is there [?], and we can’t let you do it.’ Well, I did it anyway. The problem was there wasn’t a baroque flute teacher but Margaret Crawford very kindly allowed me to play baroque flute in my lessons with her. She’s a good musician so we were working it out together. But she’d also studied recorder in Europe, and
Howard Oberg at some point was on the scene as a recorder player so I was having some lessons with him.\textsuperscript{208}

After graduating from the University of Sydney in 1978 he formed a duo called \textit{La Fontagara} with lute player, Robert Clancy. Two years later, after Clancy left for Europe to pursue musical opportunities, Dikmans and another lute player, Max Hynam, played concerts as the \textit{Early Music Duo} for Musica Viva. Kim Williams, then General Manager of Musica Viva, knowing Dikmans kept up with the European early music scene through his record purchases, then the only way to hear much of this music, asked him, “Who are the top people in Baroque music in the world?” Dikmans didn’t hesitate.

I said if you want to get the best, get the Kuijkens to come out. So Gustav Leonhardt with Sigiswald, Wieland and Barthold Kuijken toured here. Then in one of the Sydney concerts, Kim [Williams] asked me to turn pages for them in the concerts. So, I asked Bart Kuijken about having lessons. He said, fine. Come over.

With this invitation, Dikmans went to Holland for one of the summer short courses offered and began his strong connection with Barthold Kuijken, eventually completing two years’ study with him. Dikmans commuted to Brussels from The Hague for his weekly lessons with Kuijken who taught in the European manner with flute classes. Students listened to one another play and to Kuijken teach.

I’d go down to Brussels for the day and Bart was quite happy for us to sit in on each other’s lessons. In fact, you’d learn a lot about teaching by observing him explaining stuff he’d been trying to teach you. And often in three different languages. He’d include you in the lesson. I tried that at Melbourne Uni and the students said, in principle, great but no one was willing to spend a whole day. I learned more [in Brussels] by just sitting in and I got to know all the students.

Kuijken broadened the repertoire permitted for the first-year technical examinations to include Telemann \textit{Fantasies} as well as the Bach \textit{Flute Partita in A minor}.

I played a Telemann \textit{Fantasia}, some Quantz studies, and [an aria with] obbligato with a singer, a French big flute solo-y sort of thing. Pieces of music rather than scales and arpeggios. You know, the Quantz \textit{Caprices}, there’s a lot of those. It was terrific. The following year you had your performance exam. So, Telemann \textit{Fantasies} were big on the agenda there too. I think the first time I played the \textit{Paris Quartets} of Telemann was in Holland, in the chamber music

\textsuperscript{208} Howard Oberg (1947-) taught recorder and baroque flute from 1974 at the NSW State Conservatorium of Music until his retirement in 2001. From 1977 he also began making recorders and traverso flutes for his students.
classes. First, it’s terrific music and you get to play with four or five people – it’s great. It’s never hard to find musicians to play Paris Quartets with you because everyone’s got such a good part.

Dikmans received the 1st Prize in baroque flute at the Conservatoire Royal de Musique de Bruxelles in 1984. After returning to Australia he returned to performance, further study at La Trobe University, and teaching early music performance at Melbourne University where he is in his thirty-first year of work at the Early Music Studio. Since 1985 he has also been the artistic director of the early music group, Elysium Ensemble. Like others engaged in both research and performance he has developed a refined awareness of the interrelationship between pitch, instruments, and repertoire.

We’re doing a concert next weekend; we’ve been doing the program around the place. I play on three different flutes. I start with my Hotteterre flute at about A= 390 HZ. Lucinda [Moon] either uses her violin, or she’s also got a viola d’amore which she had made years ago for doing some work with Tafelmusik in Canada. But it never would stay in tune, it didn’t like being up at 415 HZ. It’s something to do with the length of the instrument and the string length. She’s been researching different types…it’s wire strung. Suddenly, you tune it down to 390 HZ and it just loves it. It just stays. It sounds beautiful.

Temperament and tuning is a central issue among those playing early music. Dikmans and his colleagues have been working to refine this aspect of their playing.

We’ve been doing a lot of work trying different temperaments. The age-old problem when you’ve got a violin and a flute. Do you tune the fifths ‘pure’? Not in all the temperaments are the fifths ‘pure’. You have to temper them. But there was one of the Rameau tunings from the early 18th century and now we’ve got tuning machines with this already programmed in. If you start the temperament on Bb rather than C, then you get a tuning where the fifths on the violin (g-d-a-e) are all a bit narrow (or tempered) but almost ‘pure’. In equal temperament, the fifths are quite wide. Violinists are usually happy although they usually tune their E a bit lower and then you get a lower F# which is good for the flute. You get pure thirds in the main chords (tonic, dominant, sub-dominant) in keys like G major, D major, C major and their relative minors – keys that work for most of the repertoire we are playing.

The question arises, “Do audiences notice or care?” The Elysium Ensemble has tested it.

So [I play] these different flutes that have different constructions and pitches. We use the tag line: “Three Flutes, Three Pitches, Three Sound-Worlds”. People are really appreciative when they hear it in concert, one flute after another. It turns out the violin can cope quite well with the pitch changes, it’s quite used to it, especially if you start at a lower pitch and work your way up. And we play duets by Quantz, Boismortier and Telemann, and we each play some solos. Two years ago, we did a series of concerts at the Salon at the Melbourne Recital Centre with the
title “Dialogue: The Art of Elegant Conversation”. Mainly because we’d been working on this duo repertoire over the five concerts we each played three or four Telemann Fantasias and I played the Bach Partita. Lucinda [Moon] also did some solo Bach. I played some C. P. E. Bach Solos as well as the duo repertoire. We did two concerts with a harpsichord as well so it was all fascinating.

Telemann, by publishing music suitable for a wide range of performer abilities, also has served the needs of Dikmans’ students at the Melbourne Conservatorium where he has taught for thirty-one years.

You know the Getreue Musik-Meister, there’s all those collections, there’s all those trio sonatas. I did a lot of that with the students. In the later years, we started to let some singers join the Baroque Ensemble. The first thing I’d do was to pair them up with a violin or a flute and a keyboard player and tell them to go to the library and look through the Harmonische Gottesdienst and select a cantata... The students were always blown away by that because they’d never heard of him. They know Bach and they know that Bach wrote all these cantata cycles. I said to them, ‘Well you know Telemann, he did the same. But he did [them] for the little towns where they didn’t have a full orchestra and its absolutely wonderful music.’ I’ve yet to hear one that’s no good. They are very interesting musically and educationally because they draw on many skills for the performer. Lot of problems to solve. And it’s good because you’ve got the text. Usually the singers are more comfortable with German. I start with that and the next thing I get them on to some French which freaks them out a bit more because they don’t do a lot of stuff in French.

He also introduces instrumental students to Baroque mixed styles (French, Italian, German, and Polish) as found in Telemann’s music.

I do the same with all the instrumental students. I very early introduce them to reading from facsimiles which means reading different clefs and playing French style. To play Bach and Telemann you have to understand French style equally as well as Italian style. When composers start blending the styles you’ve got to be able understand the difference. And understand when they’re trying to be French, when they’re trying to be German. That’s why the Telemann Paris Quartets are so fascinating because he was consciously writing for the French taste at that time. It’s funny because he doesn’t quite always get it right. It’s a really good attempt of a non-Frenchman writing French style. Some of the movements are very French in character, while some of it could be Beethoven or something much later.

With his long performing experience, Dikmans is particularly aware of the responses of audiences who may be more familiar with string quartets, piano trios or solo recitals.
[Speaking with enthusiasm] They love it. They love it. They think, ‘Oh God, that’s so beautiful.’ The Paris Quartets... it’s real chamber music. If you came in from the more traditional string quartet. That’s obviously really high quality music. But for people who’ve never been to a chamber music concert they get... I mean they get just as excited because there’s amazing things... the interplay between the instruments... all that. But also in the early days when I was playing in restaurants, some of the Telemann recorder sonatas... people would love that. Because it’s very charming music... it’s very good music.

**Dr Gary Ekkel** – *‘It involves a couple fugues even more dense than the usual Telemann fugue. So, it took a lot of learning, which I like to do... win them over with the fugue. There were certainly looks of “How on earth are we going to do this?”’*

[Speaking of preparing a musically challenging Telemann motet with his school choir.]

Interview recorded 10 September 2014

1979  The Geelong College, Victoria – Higher School Certificate
1980–1984  University of Melbourne – Bachelor of Arts (Honours)
1988  University of Melbourne – Diploma of Education (Music)
1990–1997  University of Melbourne – PhD (Musicology)
1996–present  Director of Choral Music – St Michael’s Grammar School, Melbourne
2002–present  Director of the Choir of Newman College, University of Melbourne
2009–present  Artistic Director – Melbourne Advent Festival

[The interview was conducted in a somewhat noisy café in Geelong, Victoria, Gary Ekkel’s home city. When he was a secondary school student this writer was, for three years, his modern flute teacher.]

Gary Ekkel’s parents, from Holland, raised their children with a respect for music and those who taught it. Ekkel began playing the modern flute and, following a move to The Geelong College where his general music training was guided by Hartley Newnham (countertenor and a founding member of the early music group, La Romanesca) his musical awareness was broadened to include recorder and baroque flute as well as a range of early music. Even on modern flute, however, he recalls playing the Fantasias and a few of the sonatas by Telemann. During this time, he also met the instrument maker Fred Morgan (known particularly for his recorders) and was already considering purchasing a baroque flute. He entered the University of Melbourne for an Arts (Music) degree studying modern flute.
In my third year of that course there were definitely some antics involved. I'd ordered a baroque flute from Holland and I changed my instrument. The first two years I'd been doing [modern] flute as my musical-performance instrument. In third year I was allowed to do baroque flute but I had to call it 'a recorder'.

Ekkel studied baroque flute under Ruth Wilkinson. During the years 1986-87 he continued at Melbourne University with a Master of Performance degree with a focus on Telemann, again studying baroque flute and recorder, having then switched teachers to Hans-Dieter Michatz. Half-way through he received a Netherlands government scholarship to study with Barthold Kuijken. Both his teacher, Michatz as well as Greg Dikmans (also a baroque flute player), had been students of Kuijken. Even so there were some surprises.

I think I was [prepared] for the overseas experience of actually living there but just being in the situation where you are only one of seven international students and every lesson is a masterclass lesson... I think initially that shakes your confidence a bit before it picks up again. But it was absolutely wonderful, the time that I had over there.

While Kuijken taught at both The Hague Conservatorium and in Brussels, Ekkel studied with him in The Hague.

Most of the people seemed to come from Australia have studied there. Some in Amsterdam but nearly all of them [Australian students] have studied at Den Haag conservatorium. It has a really strong influence on the early music movement in Australia. But I think it's very Den Haag influenced. As opposed to the Amsterdam school or the French school.

Ekkel has a natural researcher's approach to music.

In Holland I recall doing some of the Methodical Sonatas with Bart Kuijken, looking at the ornaments and what you could do with them. I also experimented taking the style of ornament described in Quantz [Versuch]\(^{209}\) and applying those to other Telemann sonatas that didn't have all the details... [as are found in the Methodical Sonatas]. I think, that when I was in Holland, that was all I did with Telemann. I have to say when I was in Holland my main concentration was French music. I had a small ensemble there that did French cantatas like Clérambault [1676-1749] (singer, flute, and harpsichord). I suppose even now, looking back at it, the concerts I enjoyed doing most were things that involved a singer as well as an instrumentalist.

For a decade from 1981, the music of Telemann was in the repertoire for Il Pastor Fido, an early music group which he and others formed. They presented three or four programs each year.

---

\(^{209}\) Johann Joachim Quantz, *Versuch einer Anweisung die Flöte traversiere zu spielen* (1752).
I think, in a sense, he was the composer that best suited our ensemble which consisted of flute, violin, cello and harpsichord at that stage. I think... for me the most exciting ones [programs] were the ones where we included a cantata or two from the *Harmonischer Gottesdienst*. [Telemann’s seventy-two solo voice church cantatas with obbligato instrument and continuo written between 1725-26.]

His fascination for vocal and choral music has become central to his teaching and conducting. He spent two years, 1993-94, engaged in research and analysis of Renaissance choral music at the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris and the Centre d'Études Supérieures de la Renaissance in Tours, France for which he received a PhD from Melbourne University. He then took on the roles of director of choral music at both St Michael’s Grammar School, Melbourne, and Newman College, University of Melbourne (from 2002). He often bases decisions about choral repertoire on work being done by Australian-based musicologists such as Dr Jan Stockigt (University of Melbourne).

She’s become not [just] the major researcher for Telemann but [also] the major researcher for Catholic Baroque composers. It’s a roundabout answer but because I’ve had a lot to do with her research, and we know her well. We’ve often been the group [Newman College Choir] that has performed the music she has been researching. We’ve done quite a lot of Zelenka [1679-1745] and composers of that period. German composers of that period are very high on our list, but I do like linking it to active research that’s going on. I suppose that’s why it’s been more a tendency has been more towards Zelenka and Heinichen [Johann David Heinichen 1683-1729] over the last few years, but now it’s obvious... we’ll put Telemann down [on our list] too.

His work with secondary students at St Michael’s Grammar School has also borne fruit. The choir regularly tours European countries. Ekkel speaks of a recent decision to program a Telemann Motet for the tour:

This was in June and July this year [2014]. I think the most interesting response was in Germany itself. We did the complete work [*Singet dem Herrn ein neues Lied*, TWV 7:30]. And it’s quite long. It’s a bit longer than I actually had thought when I looked at the music beforehand, but it is spread out over nine movements. I think initially we were going to do only the choral movements but we ended up having an extra two staff members, an alto and tenor soloist, so it meant we could do all of the movements. [The audience] reaction, interestingly, was that schools in Germany don’t do this anymore, and that “Isn’t it fantastic that people from Australia bring this music back to us... [Music] of such great heritage.” There is also an element of surprise: when people think of *Singet dem Herrn* they think of Bach’s outstanding setting. They expect the Telemann to be inferior in comparison. The German audience were genuinely surprised by the depth of music in Telemann’s setting.
Educators also know that sometimes students will accept a challenge if they are confident their teacher knows how to guide them there. Asked about the reaction of his students to Telemann’s motet, Ekkel said:

It was very positive. *Singet dem Herrn* involves a couple of fugues even more dense that the usual Telemann fugue... It took a lot of learning, so it was a case of... which I like to do... winning them over with the fugue. There were certainly looks of “How on earth are we going to do this?” It’s the sort of thing that I feel that I can bring out. If they have been chosen for a European choir tour, this is what you have to do if you get a position in the choir.

Dr Anne-Marie Forbes — ‘One part may make a change but you can’t have multiple parts making a change. It’s not going to happen. Singers don’t do that.’

Interview recorded 15 September 2015

Marryatville Special Music High School in Adelaide
1981 - Bachelor of Music, Elder Conservatorium University of Adelaide
1984 - MA in Musicology, University of Iowa USA
1985 - MMus in Performance, Kansas State University USA
1993 - PhD in Musicology, University of Queensland

[The interview was conducted in her office at the Conservatorium of Music of the University of Tasmania, where she is Graduate Research Co-ordinator and Senior Lecturer in Musicology. While this summary records her student years as a singer in many Adelaide choral groups and postgraduate work at three institutions, interactions with several influential musicians and teachers have been reluctantly omitted as being beyond the general focus of this research.]

Dr Anne-Marie Forbes grew up in Adelaide, South Australia, among singers.

I guess it was the girl equivalent of having been a boy chorister. In those days you couldn’t be a cathedral chorister but in the Methodist church you could be part of the choir and I was dragged along because my sister was in the choir and she took along her little sister. Because I could sing in tune they said, “Okay, go sing in the sopranos...” which was kind of how I ended up being a soprano.

Those who not only sing in-tune but can also sight-read become a valuable addition to any choir and Forbes was drawn into more than one as a young woman. After some years singing in the Maughan Church choir, Forbes joined the Pilgrim Uniting Church choir as well as the St Francis Xavier under the direction of its organist, James Govenlock (often singing in both on a Sunday). While these choirs generally sang standard English choral repertoire, some directors like Govenlock were, in the late sixties, introducing Palestrina, Lotti, J. S. Bach, Vittoria, and
Morales. With David Swale, organist at St. Peters’ Cathedral (Adelaide), she also sang in Purcell’s *Dido and Aeneas* in an early historically-informed performance (1979).

After her secondary schooling, Forbes entered the Elder Conservatorium (University of Adelaide) as a singer. Recalling her early voice lessons with David Galliver, she described the moment when they got to the *da capo* section of an aria. He said ‘Now the *da capo* and *ornament.*’ Shocked, Forbes replied, ‘You want me to do *what*?! But you didn’t teach me.’ His reply was, ‘*Just do it. Just do it.*’ It was, however, singing as a *soprano* that presented an unexpected difficulty.

Well, yes. My voice, broke, the way a boy’s voice breaks. It did all the strange things. One day I was singing ‘the *Queen of the Night*’ and the next day... I couldn’t get any of those notes. Not even the first one. I don’t understand. I went along to my teacher and said... “Something’s gone”. They were all very interested at what was happening and it took probably about a year to settle down and then it was quite clear. It had more of the quality of countertenor rather than contralto but it was in that range. All those notes I used to sing, all the repertoire I’d learned... no good.

That unexpected interruption to her vocal studies allowed her time to consider another area of music. She finished her time at the Elder Conservatorium with a double major of voice and musicology.

After graduating in December 1981, she arrived in Iowa (University of Iowa) in January 1982 to begin a MA degree in Musicology. Forbes continued to sing and met Ed Kottick (University of Iowa, Music 1968-1992) who had established a lively early music *Collegium Musicum*.

Oh it was huge. I’d never seen anything like it. We had everything. We had sets, chests of crumhorns and sackbuts. You name it, you wanted to play it... it was there. We had concerts, regular concerts, and he built harpsichords so we used to go over to his house and play with bits of harpsichords as they were being put together. It was actually a vibrant time. I sang with a small group which was part of the *Collegium* but mostly it was instrumental. We even did the Machaut *Mass*. Ed did an arrangement of it. I’m still not convinced about his *musica ficta*.210 We had arguments about *musica ficta*... It was like... No... I don’t think so... That’s not the way I read those rules.

Through her years of singing Forbes had developed an instinct about how voices work together to realise a performance.

---

210 *Musica Ficta*, editorial or improvised semitone alterations of pitch in medieval vocal music used to avoid unacceptable intervals between voices.
It’s always a problem when you’re making an edition. Adding those things because in performance you can’t make multiple changes. One part may make a change but you can’t have multiple parts making a change. It’s not going to happen. Singers don’t do that.

After completing her Masters of Musicology at Iowa with a study of Vaughan Williams’ *Pilgrim’s Progress* (1951) she continued her vocal studies at Kansas State University where she sang in a production of Britten’s *Albert Herring* and had the courage to correct visiting conductor, John Aldis, who liked to introduce the music to the audience. Before the concert, Forbes said to him, 'Dr Aldis, I don’t think you should introduce the piece like that, because *Ave Maria, gratia plena* doesn’t mean “Hail Mary, thank you very much.” It means “Hail Mary, full of grace.” “Oh”, he said. “Right then...” It was at Kansas State University, as a singer in the staff *Concert Quartet*, that she regularly sang cantatas and other vocal works of Handel and Bach, often taking on what would have been a countertenor role. Telemann appeared then ‘on her radar’ through the playing of instrumental groups there.

After her return to Australia in 1985 where Forbes began work in 1989 on her PhD thesis (on Celticism in British opera) at the University of Queensland. While she maintained interest in choral music, Forbes also taught a unit on Baroque music focussed on music of J. S. Bach, Handel and Vivaldi. Students may have been surprised to also find Telemann among the vocal repertoire they considered.

I used to spend a bit of time talking about Telemann, particularly in the context of how his style was quite distinct and recognisable but it wasn’t as some people suggested ‘bad Bach’ or even worse, ‘Vivaldi’. [Laughs] But it was quite distinctive and he had a sense of line, particularly in the cantatas. You recognise that he was quite kind to the voice but Bach really wasn’t. Telemann had much more a sense of vocal line than Bach. Bach’s writing for voice is just... [spoken quietly] awful. From a singer’s point of view, it’s just horrible. Very hard.

After some years in the field of musicology she considers Telemann’s place now:

Look, I would rate Telemann really highly. He’s under-performed for his significance. I think of Telemann as being of the same ilk as Vivaldi. And of the same significance. But massively under-performed. It may be the case that the scores just weren’t available.

Forbes recalls that musical scores of Telemann were rare during her time at the Elder Conservatorium and, later in the 1990s at the University of Queensland. Her own students, however, may well be helping correct this problem. Her third-year musicology students in Hobart are developing skills in editing early manuscripts, including those of Telemann, by

---

211 Anne-Marie H. Forbes, "Celticism in British Opera of the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries" (PhD diss., University of Queensland, 1992).
drawing on the riches available through the on-line resource IMSLP (International Music Score Library Project). Forbes speaking as both a singer and a musicologist who has worked with a great deal of music of the Baroque period, considers Telemann and concludes:

Telemann should be coming to the fore. I think from a compositional sense, he has a good relationship between text and music. I’m not talking about word painting. The line, the way in which it is phrased, is appropriate to the words. And he puts the emphasis in the right places. It’s not always true with Bach. I shall probably be shot down for saying this. It’s almost as if the music comes first and he [Bach] fits the words in later. I don’t know whether in fact Telemann worked like that. He may have well have worked like that. He may have written the music first. But there is a sense in which the… what the words were going to be was informing the way it worked, and it does work quite well. My experience is limited I have to say, but it does seem to be that he has a good vocal sense.

Dr Rosalind Halton — ‘I found that I had to improvise my way through anything... that the singers omitted. One of them completely forgot to do his da capo, so I just played sort-of-embellishments on his line. From those experiences, it was just my joy to play continuo.’

Interview 24 September, 2015

1973-1979 Oxford University – D.Phil., Music
1986-1999 Senior Lecturer – University of New England, NSW
1999-present Associate Professor – University of Newcastle, NSW

[The interview was held at the Newcastle Conservatorium, NSW.]

As quite a young child, Rosalind Halton, in Dunedin New Zealand with her music-loving parents who were second-generation New Zealanders of UK descent, she was attracted to the sound of music. There was an upright piano in the home as well as musical instruments suitable for children.

I remember a green xylophone. I also remember, before five, being at my grandparents’ place and there being a diagram of the keyboard with all the names of the notes. So I got that all ‘inside’ straight away.

In 1957 the family spent a year in Edinburgh where her father had a sabbatical. ‘I was always pleading to be taken to the ballet. I saw many ballets, aged five.’ When they returned home to New Zealand, Halton insisted on having ballet lessons. The teacher was a Dutch Indonesian, also a member of Dunedin’s postwar immigrant community.
Her pianist was a wonderful pianist, Johannes Giesen who was a student of Walter Gieseking [1895-1956], so we danced to him playing Chopin. He was a wonderful pianist. We danced along to Chopin *Etudes* and *Waltzes*, all beautifully played.

About the age of nine she was asked to choose either music or ballet. She chose music. 'I was a very unruly student in that from the first year I started going along with Beethoven sonatas.' She and her elder sister went to the local piano teacher, Mrs. Anderson. 'My sister was getting on very well with piano, and I started piano a few years later and she said... “Oh, you don’t even practice your scales”.' Like many other gifted young students, she could sight-read easily. By the age of fourteen she had got through to grade seven in the Associated Board of Royal Schools of Music exams.

I hated the exams because I felt there was something very 'colonial' about it. I couldn’t articulate it at that age but I *felt* colonised, having a British examiner telling me if I was being taught right. I did feel that, so that was my first experience of nerves when I used to go to exams.

Halton also had begun on violin about the same time. She recalls being told to use vibrato but being reluctant to do so.

A strange thing is that after I did discover ‘early music’ I found that what I would have liked to do is to make that early music sound. I even used to argue with my teacher about vibrato. “*You must do vibrato on this note.*” That teacher was also a musician from the World War II refugee population in Dunedin. They were very important in Dunedin artistic circles. These people who had just escaped the war somehow and had achieved a great deal and brought a European culture to Dunedin. So she had me playing unaccompanied Bach – *with* vibrato.

Halton’s general music education was also broadening to include concerts and special music classes.

I went to nearly every classical concert that was given in Dunedin. Once, I was told I wasn’t going to go to hear Pierre Fournier play because I had a German exam the next day. I just went out anyhow. There was an active concert life of chamber music, quartets, symphony. The New Zealand Symphony Orchestra would come down from Wellington fairly regularly.

When I was fourteen, a local pianist and teacher set up a Saturday morning class for secondary school students who had been identified as musically gifted and had got to grade six in theory. She wanted to go away from the division between theory and practical [music]. So [it was] a wonderfully progressive idea which had the blessing of the Otago Music Department. We composed, we did melodic and harmonic dictations and from that, I also wanted to continue this type of music study in my last year of school (the equivalent of year twelve here). I said to my father “I’m not going to study history”, which was *his* subject, but I wanted to study music.
He approached the Professor of Music who is a very notable person in my life, Professor Peter Platt. He said he would take me through the scholarship syllabus for music which was harmony, counterpoint, and twentieth-century music.

Peter Platt, who subsequently went on to become Professor of Music at the University of Sydney, guided Halton to prepare for scholarship exams for entry to university. ‘I did get [a scholarship] on the basis of my music mark because I already had no fear of writing harmony and counterpoint and writing about music.’ The general musical environment in Dunedin also continued to be enriched by several early music touring groups.

It was starting to develop because one thing that happened under Peter Platt and maybe in association with the Chamber Music Society, was that there were early music groups coming to Dunedin. For example, Syntagma Musicum. They did a very early repertoire, you know, thirteenth and fourteenth-century music. In the university when we did our music course, although early music hadn’t ‘happened’ in Dunedin yet and we hadn’t heard of ‘performance practice’ and stuff like that, we had got Thurston Dart’s The Interpretation of Music [1954] to read as a set book. So I already knew that Baroque music sounded completely different [in its time] from the Romantic style of playing Bach and Handel.

Halton also identifies this period as the ‘Beatles period, late Beatles period’ who, she says, were also influential. ‘I enjoyed the forms and the originality of their music and the improvisational quality of the accompaniments and the freedom of it.’ After four years at Dunedin she received a scholarship to Oxford. ‘In Oxford, I met original instruments, early music performance, and in first year I went to a performance of St John Passion conducted by Gustav Leonhardt. And this changed my life.’

And I very soon met an influential friend who was my contemporary at Oxford, Kate Eckersley who was a singer. She said ‘come along to the Baines Consort’. Anthony Baines [organologist, 1912-1997], who wrote books about the history of wind instruments, was there as Director of the Bate Collection. He talked to us all about performance practice. I went and played harpsichord and that was the end of me as a pianist! I became a harpsichordist after that. Kate and I were both graduate students at Oxford, started the same year, got into the same things, had the same passions for music and we subsequently did a lot of research and performing together.

Asked what she, as a harpsichordist, was focussed on Halton said:

Well, working with people playing original woodwind instruments. That was mainly what the Baines Consort was. They were allowed to take these originals home and play them. Whereas these days they just beep you when you go up to them [Museum collections protected by security devices].
... and singing. Singing is very central to what I do and think about here. My own research was not that connected to my own playing. It was not taken for granted in those days that you were going to be researching performance and writing a thesis about it. I knew a lot of string players, several now Professors in the UK. We had a little string group called the Albinoni Ensemble. It wasn’t original instruments. Nobody thought about bows or gut strings or anything like that but we played Baroque concertos to enthusiastic audiences in Oxford.

Halton, well known as a sensitive and imaginative continuo-player, explains how this experience helped to build knowledge and confidence as she extended her knowledge of harmony and counterpoint.

I used to listen to, say, recordings of Leonhardt playing in a group and I would write down, like jazz people do... what I heard and used those as ideas. And then, I’ve just remembered something else that was pivotal for me. I was asked to play continuo. First, one Handel opera, Agrippina, which was being performed in Oxford and then several others after that. It was really my first big continuo work. For a certain number of arias, I had time to write stuff down to play. But by the third act I was just improvising. Then I found that I had to improvise my way through anything that went wrong, [or] that the singers omitted. One of them completely forgot to do his da capo, so I just played sort of... embellishments on his line. From those experiences it was just my joy to play continuo.

In reflecting on the difference between piano playing and harpsichord playing she said, ‘Although I always felt nervous as a pianist, I never felt nervous as a continuo harpsichordist.’ On being asked, ‘What is it about it that offers that freedom, if that is the right word?’ she paused – then speaking as though to herself, said:

It is the right word. [Slowly] It... is... a feeling of looking forward and anticipating so much with enjoyment what you can add, which you’ve never heard or played before and which will help the group to hang together. It’s something of that Beatles guitar-playing thing. That you can play something which is noticeable to people with ‘sharp ears’ but doesn’t get in the way and that rhythmically allows everybody to ‘gel’. And also that changes their sound. That exchange is something... and that’s why people that you perform with very well may ask for you, if they do. Or...[they] thank you very much. They know that it contributes. And it is a kind of secret pleasure because not everybody gets it but the people to whom it’s directed do get it.

Halton notices also that audiences respond to these experiences.

There are things in early music that the audience can’t articulate, for example, intonation. They don’t know they are listening to pure thirds, for example, but they enjoy them. And I can’t tell you the number of times that people have said to me after a concert... what on earth do they
say? “Enjoyed your twiddles” as they often describe improvisation. Somebody will notice it and they realise it contributes something.

During her thirteen years at Oxford (six as a student) she was influenced by other musicians. I met Colin Tilney, the harpsichordist, who has become my life-long mentor in playing. And after going to classes by him I started to play solo concerts which I hadn’t done before. I went to other masterclasses. Ton Koopman, [for example], was a really big influence because he taught me how to make more sound and shape the sounds on the harpsichord, so that was exciting. So that was good. For those six years I was being an unemployed vagrant musician starting to do recitals.

Halton found the unpredictable nature of a jobbing musician in the UK somewhat wearing so began to look for teaching opportunities in Australia. ‘I applied for jobs and, finally, after six years of not really having any fixed income I had got two job offers in twenty-four hours.’ She chose a tutorship at the University of Melbourne but, after a short time, took up the other, a Lectureship at the University of New South Wales in Armidale. There she met the creative and imaginative Professor Cath Ellis (1935-1996).

Her speciality was Aboriginal music but also how we perceive and learn music. She was deeply interested in how music is learned in different cultures and, also, biologically. That was a fantastic place for me, particularly for me because she ran a visiting lectureship program. It was somewhat controversial because the local teachers wanted a fixed, resident ensemble, but she insisted [on having] a budget that could be dispersed around many different forms of music-making. And then after a while, after five or six years of being there I thought, “Oh, maybe it’s time for me to play some shots?” so I asked her if it was possible to get residencies on baroque violins, a singer, people that I’d worked with. That became the basis of my performing and later, recording cantatas of Alessandro Scarlatti.

After the untimely death due to illness of Professor Ellis in 1996, Halton found the atmosphere became less conducive to experimentation.

Then in ’99, that was when I applied for the position [at the University of Newcastle] that I’ve had since, which was in research and performance which I tried to maintain even when university structures make it difficult. You see, Cath Ellis was an integration person. That was her ‘thing’. Integrating performance and research, that was why I went to Armidale, although it was at the time off the beaten track for Baroque music.212

---

212 Halton notes that Armidale has had a biennial Bach Festival since about 2003 - it has become notable for international and nationwide events in Baroque music, and particularly recorder, led by Zana Clarke.
While Alessandro Scarlatti has long been the focus of her work, the music of Telemann has also been threaded through her teaching and performing career. She recalls during her Oxford years doing six or seven of der Harmonischer Gottesdienst cantatas with her friend the singer, Kate Eckersley.\footnote{Telemann published a collection of seventy-two solo cantatas each with an obbligato instrument and continuo. These were intended for liturgical use in German churches with limited musical resources.}

Kate loved Telemann. The way he wrote for voice sat right in the middle of her range which was, she was a high mezzo. We also worked on Telemann cantatas with Richard Morton, a wonderful tenor who, like Kate, went on to make a fine international career. With Kate we did a number of Telemann cantatas and also when we both left the Baines Consort we formed our own little group, Le Stravaganze. We played with different baroque flautists, violinists, and oboists so we had a wide range of the cantatas to choose from.

Halton also played in performances of Telemann trio sonatas including several with obbligato harpsichord in which Telemann wrote the second treble part for the right hand of the player. ‘We used to call these ‘obble-gobble’ pieces [for oboe and obbligato harpsichord] and with a friend of ours, a very good baroque oboist, Gail Hennessey, we performed pieces with oboe.’ In her teaching, Halton has used the 12 Methodische Sonaten, written and published by Telemann in 1728 and 1732 with the solo part of each slow movement presented in both its simple version and also with Telemann’s highly ornamented version to help musicians to learn the principles of ornamenting.

I use this material in teaching in the Baroque [music] performance course [a first-year elective at the University of Newcastle]. The wind players particularly are encouraged to learn one. Then sometimes they write one themselves, if you get someone going that far. If not, they analyse it and play it. Telemann’s composed ornaments are so idiosyncratic, I think. You know, he comes up with ideas that normally you wouldn’t think of yourself. That makes it very valuable. Telemann is always used in teaching. Like the bassoon sonata which several of our students have presented for their recitals here, using the facsimile editions to get them used to playing from parts.

Thinking about the puzzle of why Telemann’s music is not more well-known, Halton said:

Telemann has been a mainstay of my teaching here [in Newcastle]. You have to think, “Why is Telemann never ‘box office?’” Now, if you say you’re going to perform the Wedding Cantata, everybody queues up for that or Handel… Messiah, of course. Everybody is there. Why do we content ourselves with not knowing the big works of Telemann? A student recorder player here,
about fifteen years ago, was very keen to study his opera, *Orpheus*, which she had heard on the radio but we couldn’t get a score at the time.  

After some discussion about the change of style in Telemann’s compositions after nearly fifteen years of his ‘retirement’ (1740-1755) we consider the colourful orchestration to be found in the later works such as the cantata cycle, *Die Tageszeiten* (1757). Halton thinks about the reasons for Telemann’s place in today’s musical culture.

I think orchestration with Telemann is not very well known. And the fact that he bridged the Baroque period and the early Classical. I hear much which is ‘Classical’ in his way of planning and thinking. I also wonder if the fact that Bach is the icon of counterpoint diminishes response to Telemann’s compositional technique. But there is also something really memorable about his [Bach’s] tunes I guess. *That* [Bach’s tuneful writing] attaches itself to people’s [memories] and then it keeps on being performed and therefore the more performances you get of a particular work, the more known it is and there a sort of group memory of it. When that doesn’t happen in the case of a composer that is wonderfully imaginative and unique like Telemann, it’s sort of like it happens in a negative way: the less that it is heard, the less anybody demands to hear it.

Halton has also noticed changes in performance practice which may be a factor. She considers performances from the 1970s which may have been based upon more enthusiasm than knowledge or refinement.

... when one hears Telemann performed indifferently, without ‘punctuation’ and dynamics. Just sort of trudging along [demonstrating with her hand on the table... tap... tap... tap] till you get to the end. This is the sort of experience that nobody needs to repeat.

In thinking about the challenges for student musicians faced with ‘Urtext’ or unmarked scores, she mentions the fortepianist, Malcolm Bilson’s lectures, *Knowing the Score*, in which he talks about this problem.

His point is “Do we know how to play from Urtext editions?” Most of the editions we have of Telemann are *not* actually highly marked up. This is much harder for amateur or student groups to play from because they only see the notes and few markings. They are so conditioned to respond to the extra editorial bits that they see it as only notes and I’ve heard performances like that. So most of what we’ve learned in HIP [Historically Informed Practice] and classes I’ve been to, studying with great performers has been how to listen to and process music *inwardly* so you can then... give it out.

---

214 Halton adds “YouTube and IMSLP [a data base of musical scores and parts] have changed issues of access, if not interest and audience demand.”
In considering the questions, “What is it that musicians, performers nowadays, add to Telemann? What is it that enables us to hear it afresh?”, Halton paused for a time and then drew out thoughts about what these elements might be and the challenges for players new to this repertoire.

It’s fascinating. It’s quite a difficult question. Well, I believe that [with] any performance that’s going to be worth listening to, the music is understood in its punctuation and how the phrases work together. Maybe this is where my thesis [Halton’s D.Phil. Oxford] comes in. That was about how phrases work together and how music is constructed, [about] how cadences are made, approached, avoided, timed. So one needs a feeling for the jokes that are concealed in the music... of timing. The dialogue between instruments and how this has got an element of humour in the way that parts exchange ideas and bat off each other. [Pause]

I’m also thinking of some very profound emotive movements of Telemann in which not just the harmonic structure but also the textures, the use of register and colour are understood and, therefore, are acted out. Why I say this is [comparatively] easy to do with Bach and Handel is because everybody can put on good recordings of it, so you can copy those good recordings [as a performer]. But with music, [it] applies to Alessandro Scarlatti as well... with music that is not so much in the folk memory, you might sit down and play a piece that you haven’t heard. For an amateur group to do that... with an unmarked score... [If they have] not learned how to mark up their score or have a feeling of what are they going to listen to... To make sure a ‘significant moment’ comes over as an event in the music and that they don’t miss it as it goes past, [They might use] any of those things: cadences, sequences, unexpected introduction of a theme, or as I read in a student essay yesterday, unsuspecting harmonic progressions... And particularly textures that are original and have got a meaning... And if one doesn’t have enough knowledge of other repertoire to... find that context...?

Rosalind Halton leaves that question hanging, unanswered.

Lyn & Peter Hawkins — ‘LYN - And that’s how we met. PETER - And so we... LYN - Because my father also played guitar. PETER - And so he was... LYN - He was a man of many talents. PETER - The guitar beat your father I think because... LYN - He was not much chop at it. He came home one day because there’s this person at the Guitar Society who wants to...

PETER - So we got together and here we... LYN AND PETER – are!’

Interview recorded 14 March 2015

Parsonson (now Halton). Halton’s dissertation was submitted under her married name.
[Husband and wife Peter and Lyn Hawkins, both viola da gamba players, have long been involved with the early music movement. Lyn is president and Peter membership secretary of The Early Music Society of Victoria. The interview was conducted at the University Café, Carlton, a noisy street café on the weekend of the Melbourne Gran Prix motor race.]

Lyn Hawkins’s father, Kenneth Williams, an architectural draftsman, discovered there was little musical education at her primary school so, already a good keyboard player, he attended an adult-education recorder course in Melbourne and then offered recorder classes at the school. It was the late fifties when LP records of musicians such as Wanda Landowska began to be imported to Australia. Lyn remembers hearing these at home. After moving to a new school, Tintern Grammar, music became a greater part of her education. In her year 11 (the year before a student’s final year in Victoria) her father learned that the school was to present an Elizabethan pageant following year.

LYN - My father went up to the school and said “Well, you can’t do an Elizabethan pageant without including things like a viola da gamba and a harpsichord.” So my father then said. “Right, you’ll have to have a viol.” So I borrowed a bass viol from Mischa Schneider, from the Budapest String Quartet, [then in Australia for a concert tour] and learnt how to play it for a year. [I] went to a cello teacher, Kathleen Tuohy, who knew harpsichordist Mancel Kirby who was the friend of Mischa Schneider. Miss Tuohy used Christopher Simpsons’s The Division Viol written in 1659.... using a facsimile of it. So Miss Tuohy and I went through this book from page one.

Lyn’s father got drawings and measurements of a division viol from the Boston Museum of Fine Arts, which has a large collection of instruments and, in 1962, made an instrument for her.216 ‘So I had my own bass viol and was able to give Misha Schneider back his. Her parents became active in the recorder guild and Lyn went to Frank Higgins’s CAE advanced recorder classes and met other recorder players interested in chamber music. A musical group from these classes was formed with Lyn playing bass viol. Their repertoire included many Peters edition trio sonatas and other chamber works, especially those of Telemann. In an arrangement unthinkable nowadays, during the late 1970s classes were suspended on Wednesday afternoons at Monash University where Lyn was a student. Students and staff interested in playing early music got together each week and once a month performed as The Wednesday Consort. They performed under the leadership of Professor of English, Harold

216 Further details of Lyn’s father, Kenneth Williams who made many copies of early instruments including her first viol, a division viol, can be found in Patricia Duke’s PhD thesis, Foundations of Early Music in Melbourne: Leonard Fullard and Other Pioneers (University of Melbourne, 2005).
Love who, while at Cambridge in the early 1960s, had played recorder with David Munrow, Christopher Hogwood and the choral scholar, Simon Carrington.

During the late 1960’s Lyn was sought out by Harold McDonald, choirmaster of St Peter’s Eastern Hill (Melbourne). He had formed the music ensemble, *Melbourne Renaissance Players*, and had heard that Lyn played viol.

PETER - [Harold McDonald] was organising a series of concerts featuring items including Telemann, trio sonatas. He wanted Lyn to play viol da gamba as a continuo...
LYN - It included people like Libby Shade & Fred Shade. This was the late ‘60s.
PETER - Following playing in these concerts, Harold McDonald invited us to join the St Peter’s Music Society which he had set up.217

From the early 1970s the number of amateur players in early music groups grew in Melbourne, and their audiences were fascinated by the sounds of early instruments and rarely heard music.

PETER - I played the lute and Lyn played the viol. We played with groups of musicians on crumhorns and other Renaissance and Baroque instruments and we’d give concerts. People would come because it was pretty special for the time, you know. There weren’t a lot of authentic instruments being used at that time.

Festivals of early music became quite successful with Lyn and Professor Ian Donald (Monash University) … organising the *Early Music Unlimited (EMU)* festival for twelve years. The *Melbourne International Festival of Organ and Harpsichord (MIFOH)*, established in 1971 (by Sergio di Pieri), also drew performers and crowds. Peter and Lyn noticed the gradual professionalization of the music-making.

LYN - So MIFOH...sort of grew... [it] took the place when ours stopped. We held the festivals for quite a while and then we just got sick of it. You know, we’d bring people out for it. It was a big deal. It was also to help emerging groups here to have a venue to play at. By the time the last *EMU* festival happened the groups could organise themselves. They were becoming more professional and they didn’t need us so they could do it themselves.

Peter Hawkins’s formative music experiences, also in Melbourne, were quite different from Lyn’s. While there was music in his family—his grandfather had played cornet in the Victorian country town of Ararat, his mother and an aunt had played piano, his uncle had been an oboe player in an orchestra run by the Australian composer, Dorian Le Gallienne—he never heard any of them play. Instead his musical influences came via the radio.

---

217 After a several name changes the present-day Early Music Society (Victoria), no longer formally linked with St Peter’s Eastern Hill, was established in 1979. Peter and Lyn Hawkins remain strongly involved with this society.
PETER - I was a fan of Buddy Holly and all those sort of things and I wanted more than anything to play guitar. And so eventually I had enough money from holiday jobs and I bought a guitar. I started learning guitar at *Downbeat* in Russell Street. It was a sort of jazz club. The guitarist there was Barry Ellis. He was a jazz guitarist who dabbled in classical. Our heroes in those days were Charlie Byrd as well as some of the other jazz guitarists. My interest somewhat shifted to classical guitar, 'cause of Barry I suppose. So I joined the *Guitar Society* in the year it was founded. It was 1964. I think it was during the Segovia visit.

The two of them, Peter and Lyn, speak about how they met.

LYN - And that's how we met.
PETER - And so we...
LYN - Because my father also played guitar.
PETER - And so he was...
LYN - He was a man of many talents.
PETER - The guitar beat your father I think... because...
LYN - He was not much chop at it. He came home one day because there's this person at the *Guitar Society* who wants to play duets... *Schott* put out editions of trio and solo sonatas for recorder or flute with guitar as accompaniment in place of harpsichord.
PETER - So we got together and here we...
LYN AND PETER - are. [They laugh.]
LYN - But at that stage I was playing flute.... recorder and flute. So that worked really well.

Helen Richmond, then secretary of St Peter's Music Society, began to import instruments from an East German cooperative in *Markneukirchen*, a village in Saxony.

PETER - The cooperative is called *Migma*. And so Helen flew instruments out here extraordinarily cheaply. Woodwind, old curtals [progenitor of the bassoon]. The viols were under a hundred dollars.
LYN - They were heavy. They were built to last. Peter didn’t play viol then.
PETER – No, I played lute which I bought through Helen...
LYN - When we first met I didn't tell him I had a viol. I was playing viol with another group. When we were going seriously I said, “I'm sorry I can't go out on Tuesdays as I play with this other group. I play viol.” “What's a viol?”, he said. So he came and listened once and said, "That sounds... absolutely awful.”
PETER - [laughs].
LYN - I said, "If you don’t like the sound of it, if you played it yourself, you wouldn’t have to listen." And that's why he took up the viol. [They laugh.] So he didn't have to listen.
In 1972 they travelled to England where they had lessons from two teachers involved in the early music movement: Cécile Dolmetsch (viola da gamba) based at Haslemere and Diana Poulton (lute) in Islington.

PETER - When we were in England... I left my guitar behind, deliberately and took my lute. Lyn brought her treble viol along and... Lyn had lessons with Cécile Dolmetsch [daughter of Arnold Dolmetsch] in Haslemere.
PETER - There is a green book, *The Viola da Gamba: Its Origin and History, Its Technique and Musical Resources* by Nathalie Dolmetsch with a picture of seven of the Dolmetsch family all playing viols. This time we lived in Northampton.
LYN - It was miles from Haslemere.
PETER - We made a day of it each time we went down ...maybe once a month. I went to Diana Poulton for lute lessons. She was Arnold Dolmetsch’s first lute student.
LYN - He would drop me off at Cécile’s...
PETER - She [Poulton] was the professor of lute at the Royal College of Music, and very... she's dead now. She was a very significant person. She wrote a wonderful book on the music of Dowland.
LYN - [She was] very stern. But anyway, she was the person you had to go to.
PETER - And at Haslemere we bought a pardessus [*pardessus de viole*], a small treble viol.
LYN - A tiny viol. We bought it from Cécile.
PETER - So in our long winter evenings up in Northampton, Lyn attempted to teach me to play the pardessus and so we played duets.

On their return to Australia they settled in Sydney where they met and played gamba with Donald Peart, foundation Professor of Music at the University of Sydney, but an economic downturn in the electronics business in which Lyn was working encouraged their return to Melbourne.

PETER - My job in Sydney was tenuous so I got a job down in Melbourne, and we moved back down to Melbourne in 1976. And we've been here ever since.
LYN - Like elephants...we've come home to die. [Laughs]
PETER - So the Early music Society was...
LYN - It was almost dead when we came back. We'd been back a week and we were contacted by previous friends in St Peter's Music Society. "Ah...you're back in Melbourne! Just in time!"
[It was] in steep decline. So we helped revive it.

With the increasing professionalisation of the early music scene of the early 1970s came differences in style of playing. Lyn observed

---

Well, the thing about professional players is they came to early music from a later era. They were all trained in modern instruments and music practice first. From modern violins, some modern cellists, modern flautists and they took up an early instrument... so they were going backwards in period. For most of the amateur musicians they didn't do it that way... they went forwards. They started on recorder or they started as madrigal singers or some other route than that and so...

PETER - And if amateurs picked up the viol it would be their first stringed instrument.
LYN - Modern string players have been brought up in the orchestral mode. It's the way they start phrases. The way an orchestra would start. Whereas people who were brought up doing chamber music play differently.
LYN - Yes, you see an orchestra starting and they go. [demonstrating a firm down bow] and you see a professional early music group and they go [demonstrating the same firm down bow]. You see an amateur early music group and they don't. They look at each other's eyes or... it's much more among themselves.

With their history as chamber music players it is not surprising that Telemann was among their repertoire but Lyn is also involved in a Melbourne-based cantata group which often programmed cantatas from Telemann's set of 72 cantatas, Harmonischer Gottesdienst (harmonious church services). Each cantata calls for a single singer, one obbligato instrument, and continuo and so were intended for churches with limited resources.

LYN – He composed so many pieces and they're all so different. You know how he wrote for the church obviously... and so he was churning this this music out. He was churning it out at some ridiculous rate. It is just gobsmacking how fast he could write something down and get it out. And the variety! So you can have a program that has two Telemann full cantatas in it... so it's four arias and two recits. or whatever they are, and they're all different. And all entertaining. So that was Telemann's genius and that's why he's done so well in the modern era. There's such a wide variety of music styles, especially in the cantatas.

Lyn, through her playing experience, is especially aware of Telemann's skill in writing well for particular instruments.

Because it's accessible, that's the other thing. Telemann writes specifically for each instrument. So you know those Paris Quartets...those are just brilliant. Because he writes the cello parts for a cello. He writes the gamba parts for a gamba [and] flute parts for a flute. You pick up your

---

219 The cantata group grew out of an idea of Peter Brereton and his wife, Lyn Casey Brereton, singer and director of the Melba Conservatorium from 1987-1998. It has performed regularly at yearly concerts titled Ancient Musik Miscellanie run by the Early Music Society of Victoria.
flute... you can play those parts. You pick up your gamba... you can play those parts. You pick up the cello... The cellos have difficulties playing the gamba parts... the gamba have difficulties playing the cello part. He just knew his instruments. He was a master of his craft.

In drawing the interview to a close Lyn and Peter spoke about the contrast between the time when amateur early music groups were very active and the present with the growth of many professional groups. The Canadian group, Tafelmusik, had just given concerts in Melbourne.

PETER - Yes, there was [the concert titled] “The House of Dreams”. That was two weeks ago. Last week we had the Brandenburg Orchestra doing an all Handel program. William Christie was down this week, Les Arts Florissant... and what was the other one?
LYN - If we had gone to everything, it would have been six or seven hundred bucks! That week!
PETER - There was another famous group. Oh yeah, it was The Sixteen. Well they just slipped under the radar.
LYN - That’s the other thing about the gentrification. The ticket prices are so high. When they built the recital centre here it was supposed to be for smaller groups because ticket prices were going through the roof to get the Concert Hall in Melbourne. Nobody was happy with the Town Hall having an orchestra jammed... so the recital centre was going to fill that gap. Now there’s the studio for small groups and then there’s the Elizabeth Murdoch hall. The ticket prices are still expensive.
PETER - Over a hundred dollars.
LYN - Now we went to the Handel the other day and that was $120 each or something.
PETER - And that was C-reserve.
LYN - This is serious money. You have to be old in order to be able to afford it.

Megan Lang — 'I’d go there for an hour lesson and I’d come back five hours later... He was incredible... he opened my eyes to a whole new world of thinking about music. It wasn’t about the flute. It wasn’t about how you get a nice sound and how you do this or that. It was all about the music and “What do you want to do with your music?”.'

Interview recorded 22 May 2015

1990-1994 Elders Conservatorium, Adelaide – Bachelor & Honours in Music Performance
1994-2004 resident in Germany including study at Hochschule für Musik und Darstellende Kunst, Frankfurt am Main
2005 returns to Australia completing a Master’s degree in Period Flute performance at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music.

[The interview was held in the Sydney Conservatorium where Megan Lang teaches both modern and baroque flute and is engaged in research into the role of concepts of self and identity in performance.]
After being asked if she came from Sydney, Megan Lang said:

No, no. I’m from Tasmania. The north coast of Tasmania, quite isolated. My parents moved there to move away from the city and to be self-sufficient. So I grew up with no electricity and no running water and all that sort of thing for a while. And lots of animals and things like that. I picked up the flute… my father played flute. He liked Jethro Tull, Ian Anderson.

After some time learning from a nearby teacher and playing in a school band, her father began driving her, then about thirteen, to Hobart for lessons with Douglas Mackie, principal flute of the Tasmanian Symphony Orchestra [TSO]. Asked what it was that attracted her to the flute she explained:

It was more about practicing it and being able to achieve something… Yeah, it was more that, than an emotional connection thing, apart from the fact that my father played. And because my interest grew I started having lessons with the TSO solo flute player… which is three and a half hours away… They were city people and I wasn’t. Sort of that difference. So that was the beginning. It was the whole action, of driving down, spending time with my father, getting fish and chips on the way back, my sister was there as well. That sort of family thing.

Lang then went to the Elder Conservatorium (University of Adelaide) for a performance degree studying with flute player, Zdenek Bruderhans. ‘He was my teacher on modern flute. I had no exposure to Baroque. So, I became a modern flute player. I did lots of practice. Hours of practice.’ After completing an Honours year in 1994, she left Australia for Germany, entering the Hochschule für Musik und Darstellende Kunst at Frankfurt am Main, as a modern classical flute player. ‘I studied with Henner Eppel there. He’s not a very well-known player [there]… he’s quite a well-known teacher. He was a good teacher.’ Asked about the repertoire she was studying, Lang said:

Everything… the Ibert Concerto… all the… the Prokofiev Sonata… all the really hard 20th century things… the 19th century virtuoso things. Playing all the things you play as a modern flute player. And looking back… I had some anxiety around the flute because I didn’t feel like I had a good sound. My technique was very, very good. I could feel like I could play everything but in concerts it often broke down… like I had problems carrying through a technically difficult passage and things like that.

Her experience has since led her to research on performance anxiety but then, she was focused on:

the modern flute pedagogy… just more practice, more practice, more practice…more… and then I met someone who was visiting Cologne and I was with him for eight years. He was an oboist…
He got a job in Mönchengladbach in the theatre orchestra. Mönchengladbach, it’s near Dusseldorf. [It was] a theatre orchestra and I played casual there for a number of years... I did a lot of work there. The second flute was chronically ill and I was constantly being [available]... Well, at three days’ notice which is really great experience... it’s beautiful music and it was great fun. And then I started to get bored... I enjoyed the music but I didn’t love the whole thing... I decided to pick up baroque flute as a side as a hobby so I bought one.

Although Lang was aware of the baroque flute world in Germany she had not yet explored it as a player. She asked about a teacher and discovered the baroque flute player and teacher, Michael Schmidt-Casdorff, lived just around the corner.

He’s amazing... the most inspiring person... incredible flute player. He plays with Harnoncourt. And [is a] beautiful, beautiful player... His sound just fills up the... it’s an enormous sound. ... and [he’s] very, very tall with an... “air”... Around the corner! I’d go there for an hour lesson and I’d come back five hours later... staggering... he’d let me go. He was incredible... incredible energy and he opened my eyes to a whole new world of thinking about music. It wasn’t about the flute. It wasn’t about how you get a nice sound and how you do this or that. It was all about the music and “What do you want to do with your music?”. Differences between the styles, modern and historically-informed practice and even her emotional responses, quickly became apparent to Lang.

It was such a different experience to modern flute and right then and there I thought “I don’t love the old...” I didn’t know it but I never loved it [the modern flute]. Not like I love... this. [the baroque flute] Because it was such a different approach... and the whole thing’s different... The whole thing [of] worrying about whether my vibrato was okay. You know? Worrying about whether I got that one “clean” or something like that. Instead I’m worrying about the “gesture”.

Lang also spoke about her new interest in eighteenth-century French repertoire.

[Composers like] Hotteterre and Blavet and people like that. The French style was completely new to me. I’d never played any of that music because on modern flute you... can’t play it, really... There’s too much missing so I’d never come across it because I guess my teachers had never considered it to be of anything of any great value.

Over the eleven years in Germany, Lang also went to summer schools studying with traverso players Karl Kaiser and Linde Brunmayr-Tutz.

They were all of this same ilk. They all just loved it... They loved it. The aesthetic as well. The aesthetic of the beautiful flute and the difficulties that they give you. And everything around it. It wasn’t so functional. Modern flute's a sort of functional instrument in my mind anyway. And the aesthetic is different and I liked it [the baroque flute] a lot so it suited me. Before long I wasn’t playing modern flute much, unless I had to. The [baroque] flutes speak for themselves.
You don’t have to “make” a sound. The sound is “in” the instrument and I liked that a lot. It took away the anxiety. That’s really the bottom line. I suddenly felt free. I felt free to make my own choices instead of worrying that I was doing it wrong, which I always did with modern flute, even though I was at a very high level. I always felt that I didn’t actually know how to “interpret” and be “right”.

In 2005 Lang returned to Australia and began a Master’s degree at the Sydney Conservatorium studying period flutes with Hans-Dieter Michatz and Melissa Farrow. Musical performance, its challenges and understandings, remains a focus.

[A baroque flute performance is] “for” the audience but it’s not at their mercy. Whereas with modern flute I always felt it was at their [the audience’s] mercy. [I felt] that I was part of this huge competitive mass and there was only one way to do it. One way to get it right. And you had to nail that or it wasn’t good... One of my favourite performances I’ve ever heard in my whole life was in a lounge room with an amateur harpsichordist who was just crashing through something he’d been working on and it was the most intimate “present” of a performance that I’d ever had... That was the most... the most memorable performance that I’ve ever been to or ever experienced. And there were only two or three of us in the lounge room with this person. That’s the kind of experience that I would like to be able to give.

As a player of period flutes, Lang does sometimes get the opportunity to play in larger ensembles as well as in chamber groups.

In Germany, it’s mostly Passions that I played before I left. You know, the Christmas Oratorio and the Passions... things like that. That was a lot of bread and butter stuff with really amateur choirs and you just went in and played, really. They wanted it at 415 [tuning]. It wasn’t really stylistically particularly “Baroque” but they wanted it at that pitch and those instruments. Here is kind of similar but every now and then someone tries to do something special and they get some really top players and they pay the money and then it’s.... it’s wonderful then. Because the transparency of the instruments allows you... It’s just so much more easy to communicate [within the ensemble] really because it’s not overpowering, especially for a flute player. Whereas for a modern flute player, depending on the orchestral setting you’re often not heard at all unless you’ve got a solo. [With] the baroque ones, the colours are always there. It’s a very different experience. And that said, I did do all of the Christmas Oratorios with the ACO [Australian Chamber Orchestra] not long ago. They were amazing.... They play on gut [strings] but not at all stylistically what you’d call correct I suppose. But they have the freedom of performance where they all... on the spur of the moment, in performance, they will all do a huge rubato or something like that and you’re just carried along with this incredible musicianship that is really, really strong. So, that is an absolute exception in my experience.
from modern players but it’s not that unusual I suppose with the Baroque ensembles. They’re more open to that sort of thing.

Lang spoke about the influence of the French Baroque repertoire on her playing and this also brought up Telemann’s music.

Well, at first he was an easy composer to play on modern flute. You know... nothing special... just easy and nice... pretty stuff. But on baroque [flute] it’s a different story. Michael [Schmidt-Casdorff] released a CD of the Sonatas [TWV 41], not the Methodical ones but the other ones which are very, very expressive and very beautiful. I like them a lot. And that opened my eyes a bit and then I went back to the Fantasias which I’d already played on modern flute of course. I got myself the original edition, the Amadeus edition with the original facsimiles in the front which are almost unreadable but lovely. Telemann’s about gesture and... dance... But yeah, the Fantasies and the Sonatas... they’re beautiful. Probably my favourite things are the Paris Quartets. I love them very much. I’d love to play more of them. They’re lovely.

Much of the Baroque repertoire of modern players is built on the music J. S. Bach. In comparing his music with that of Telemann, Lang said:

I have just an emotional feeling... about Telemann and Bach. Bach for me is a bit tied-up. I have had to break free of the, you know, the misconception that he’s you know... God, and you can only play exactly what’s on the page and it has to be just as it is. Of course, I came [to] the realisation at some point that that’s not how it was at all. He would never have played the same thing.

In considering Bach as an improvising musician Lang responded:

Absolutely. Absolutely, and a working musician just like Telemann and very practical. Since that time I’ve become a lot freer about Bach but I still have a kind of dark feeling about his music. It’s austere in my mind, even though, it’s actually not, of course. But Telemann’s a lot friendlier [laughs] in my feeling because there’s so little pedagogy around him. There’s so little preconceived ideas.

In thinking about the response of an audience to Telemann’s music Lang speaks about her experience.

I don’t tend to perform the Fantasias because they’re so hard [laughs]. They’re really difficult to perform and not that successful as performance pieces I always think. But the Paris Quartet, the E minor one that I did a couple of years ago, that has quite a lot of good response. More in terms of the music. The music hadn’t been heard before, but it’s very, very beautiful. I will have that played at my funeral and things like that. It’s very, very lovely. He’s at his best. He was showing off to the French public... they’re very warm pieces. Even when it’s when it’s got some
“dark” sort of Affect going on there’s always a melancholic sort of thing. It’s not like Bach where it’s “heavy”. It’s kind of still warm and “human”. It’s “human” music.

**Hans-Dieter Michatz** – *“We know you can play the difficult stuff. Now play something totally easy. We want to see what you can do with a Schickhardt sonata.”*

Interview recorded 23 September 2015

1978 Graduated in secondary school music education and instrumental teaching from the Staatliche Hochschule Für Musik und Theater, Hannover.
1983 Emigrated to Australia

[The interview was held at the independent arts school (AIM Sydney) for tertiary students where Hans-Dieter Michatz is Classical Music Coordinator, a teacher of recorder, and teaches the performance studies course. He is also teaching recorder at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music.]

Unlike many other early music performers who, as students, began on modern instruments and then shifted their earlier versions, Hans-Dieter Michatz, aged seven or eight, began on recorder at his home in Salzgitter, ‘which is a very insignificant place right now. It used to be a centre of steel industry. It is close to Hannover, even closer to Wolfenbüttel where Praetorius Library is.’

They had a local music school. I put my hand up when one of the representatives came in to my school to actually ask who wants to learn the recorder... My parents consented to my little whim and actually let me go there.

Even at this early stage he was aware that music was ‘it’ for him ‘and then I thought, well, because music might be the way I’m going I had better learn piano as well’. If Michatz arrived for his piano lessons somewhat unprepared his teacher had a strategy for that too.

The piano teacher I got was very interested in early music. Because I was often lazy on the piano he would then ask “Have you got your recorder with you?” He had a wall full of music of all those early editions of recorder music. So we played through one sonata after another at a very early time amongst which was a lot of Telemann. Then I went to a recorder teacher whose teacher was the main Professor in Hannover. He then very soon said to me, ‘You’ve got to go to my teacher.’ So I went to Hanover and it all went from there.

In summary, by 1962-3 Michatz had begun studying at the local music school and, by the early 1970s, had entered a local pre-tertiary preparation school program to which he was travelling
regularly the sixty kilometres by train to Hannover for recorder lessons with Professor Ferdinand Conrad (1912-1992). Professor Conrad became aware of Michatz’s potential.

He [Professor Conrad] was a very eminent person at the time. He said, “Recorder’s all very well for you but you should actually go to baroque flute.” He somehow recognised something, so he very carefully manipulated me into first learning modern flute and then going for baroque flute and then I went over to The Hague and studied there with Bart Kuijken [Barthold Kuijken].

Michatz was surrounded by like-minded students, including the recorder player Michala Petri, also a student of Conrad in Hannover.

We were ourselves a little enclave there. We thought it was pretty established and an early music studio and all that sort of thing. I was kind of the “third generation” in that sort of thing. At least, if not more.

There was a natural flow of students between the two centres of early music, Hannover and The Netherlands. Michatz recalls meeting the Australian, Greg Dickmans, who was then preparing for entry to the Brussels Conservatorium.

And, of course, because I was interested in recorder I took little trips to Amsterdam and visited friends of mine who actually did the ‘BLOKs’ [an intensive program of ten units of five day’s study and performance of the Amsterdam Conservatory] and stuff with Franz Brüggen and Walter van Hauwe. So it was pretty intense.

Asked if the transition from Hannover to The Hague, from one teacher (Conrad) to another (Kuijken) was a challenge, Michatz said:

It was relatively smooth because… one of the things I have to say for all my teachers, and especially Ferdinand Conrad, was that there seemed to be a lot talk about them being in a camp of their own… “and then there’s a Dutch camp, and there’s a German camp”. The teachers themselves were actually more open than their disciples. And they were actually quite appreciative of what other people were doing. Of course, it was mainly about Franz Brüggen, of course and his career, who just presented a totally different way of playing the recorder. But I think Ferdinand Conrad just saw it as on on-going process, that’s where it was going. And the two of them actually got on. So I think there was respect basically. He said to me “Look, go to The Hague. Bart is the person to study with.”

Michatz’s three year’s study of baroque flute under the guidance of Barthold Kuijken was thorough.

The Dutch conservatoria are not easy institutions to study at because they asked a lot of you. But [they] also gave very good guidance. Of course, you meet people from all over the world who do the same thing. People who are now out there doing their stuff but they’re all in my
immediate circle. No, it was pretty good. They basically told you if you messed up. I still remember one of the most significant events was [that] I could play pretty difficult things and one of the directors for one of the sort of intermediate recitals said, “We know you can play the difficult stuff. Now play something totally easy. We want to see what you can do with a Schickhardt sonata.” So [to see] if you understand the language, basically. I think that was the best thing that ever happened to me. [They wanted] to see if you understand how Baroque music works. [That] the language is being “spoken” correctly. That you “get” the affect, that you “get” the rhetoric, that you get… basically every element of it.

People still nowadays go for melody, and go for a beauty of tone, and all that sort of stuff. I think in the end it boils down to a musical oration. I think in my generation we got… we really honed in on that newish discovery that that’s where you want to be.

During his three years at The Hague he had met many Australians so he thought it would be good to do something out of the ordinary. ‘I came here [Australia] for a few months on a holiday visiting and all that. That’s when I met people who actually said, “You could... you know... live in Australia” [laughs].’ Arriving in 1983, Michatz quickly became known in Melbourne as an early music player and soon came to be one of the founding members of the Melbourne Collegium (established in 1984). ‘We did quite a lot of performances of probably rarely heard works. We did, for example, a whole Zelenka thing for Jan Stockigt at the time.’ By 1989-90 Michatz found that work was a little less available in Melbourne so was attracted to an offer from Paul Dyer who was:

... putting a group together for Musica Viva school’s concerts in New South Wales. I thought it would be a good idea and this schools concert concept actually appealed to me a lot because after all I’m more a teacher than anything else. But then in ’90 – ’91 I basically settled in Sydney. That was just before Paul Dyer went on founding Brandenburg [Australian Brandenburg Orchestra] and I was in that sort of ‘birth’ process of that... Yeah, [I] got a lot of stuff to do here and teaching. And went back to modern flute and did a lot of modern performances with people who realised how difficult it was to get an early music ensemble together that could play at the same standard as people who knew about early music practices but realised them on their more familiar modern instruments. So I played my Matthew Passions and that on modern flute [laughs]. I also [played with] the Opera Orchestra and State Orchestra. So that was a very good time.

With these groups and others such as the Sydney group, Sounds Baroque, his reputation grew. An early project was his recording of the Telemann Methodical Sonatas for Move Records. He recalled hearing an early recording by the Dutch recorder player, Marijke Miessen.
I looked at these sonatas and I thought, wow, these are amazing. At a recorder festival, it might have been '94 – '95, I'm not sure, I asked Ann Morgan [harpischord player] if she would like to play. She accompanied me in a “demo” concert because nobody had done them basically. So we did a few of those and then it all went to “sleep” for a while then I thought, no, we might as well record some of them. My friend, Linda Kent, agreed to do this and we recorded the first set. And I never quite recovered from that [laughs].

Michatz spoke of the question of what to do with Telemann’s ornamented version. [Telemann published the slow movement of each of the twelve sonatas with both the unornamented manner and with Telemann’s own highly ornamented line. Some players play Telemann’s ornaments complete while others treat them as a catalogue of possibilities.]

Yeah…you can make your own ornaments but if they’re not better than Telemann… [laughing] why would you do that? And it’s hard to “better” them because once you discover what they are you actually discover what the language really is. Anyway it just appeared that at the same time that I was doing them Bart Kuijken was recording all twelve of them, so it was a bit of a revival then. So then the next step would be the Scherzi and Trios [Trietti und Scherzi] because not many people have done [them] either.

The period of the 1980s were marked by experimentation in instrument-making, new repertoire, and an astonishing revolution in performance practice expectations of both performers and audiences. Michatz reflects on the that period and the experience of performers today.

I think nowadays people know a hell of a lot. And they are above all, all those younger players, incredibly good on their instruments. We struggled to… still with the instrument makers, you know, we were working with them to actually develop the instruments. Nowadays you order one and it works! It wasn’t like that in the early ’80s [laughs]. So we still had our struggles with the actual “hardware”. And all these discoveries were relatively new. But nowadays people, even more than us, are prone to imitation a little bit more than we were. We were experimenting. Yeah? And [they] basically get told how it works. There’s a danger in that in which things get a little bit more “flat-lined” I think. I think we were a little more extreme, in terms of what we did. You can hear that in recordings as well. They were much rougher in those days with what people did with the music. In terms of instrumental technique, also in terms of... interpretation. Now it’s all very, very beautiful but well... what is it actually saying? It again just distinguishes the few that really know, that really go into the... into the principles of it. That it is actually strong music-making.

Michatz feels strongly about the issue of the greater refinement of today’s early music players and the expectations of audiences.
Maybe Europe has retained a little bit more of the energy? But I think it’s also a matter of it not being “new” anymore. So, we’ve done it all and Australia suffers a bit from the fact that you have to repeat the favorite items over and over again. If you come up with something new people are initially not that interested until it becomes “main-stream”. Yeah... all these Passions that were written at the same time as Bach and, I think, before. They speak the same language. Bach did it exceptionally well but somebody did a Stölzel Passion recording and everything’s there! [Gottfried Heinrich Stolzel, 1690-1749] And it’s beautiful music, and Telemann of course, being a dramatic musician, did something else with the text again.

When pressed to consider what it is about Telemann’s writing that attracts him, Michatz has much to say.

I think it’s a combination of things. I mentioned my association with my piano teacher playing a lot of Telemann. He was always saying, “I don’t get why Telemann was so... badly spoken of [as if he] is somebody who just wrote a lot of stuff and a lot of it is not good.” When you really get stuck into it, everything is really good. It’s not all deep and meaningful music but it is very well composed, it is appealing, often very simple, and it follows a certain pattern, you know: a very pleasant opening movement, something a bit deeper and a bit stronger in the second, and what I love most, and you will probably agree in the Methodical Sonatas, the third movements are the most sublime movements in them, really. Those minute forms of, like, two lines and it’s the best music ever written. Also because he writes well for the instrument. And yet you can play it on all kinds of instruments and it’s still well-written. If he writes for a wind instrument you can trust that it works. Or if he writes a simple duet for flute and violin you can just play that and it’s conversational. It’s got a lot of beautiful moments in it. It’s just a musician’s music, I think. I mean, Bach is not like that. You really have to work hard at it. Yes, you have to understand... and more maybe in the end. He says more on more different levels than Telemann does. Maybe... but I think when Telemann wants to, he can also speak that complex language. So for me he’s just incredibly well-written. It’s never excessively virtuosic but it can be challenging and it’s entertaining... every single piece people love to hear. When it’s actually played in that vein and not just “rattled” off. So, we’ve just uncovered a few things like a viola d’amore and flute trio sonatas and that sort of thing which we’ve played with the Sydney Consort. And they’re always the favourite item on the program.

Asked about Telemann’s writing for larger ensembles Michatz says

Yeah...but the Suites, that we did with Melbourne Collegium, for example, we did Overture-Suite des nations anciennes et modernes and it was a ...discovery for me! How he sets one slow Gavotte against a fast Gavotte and gets these effects. It’s like total mastery, craftsmanship of the material. Yeah...what else can you say for a musician [laughs]?

Telemann’s audience in Hamburg clearly had an influence on his success.
Hamburg is a kind of burgher society. It’s not there for the elite but he actually wrote for Kenner und Liebhaber, those who are in the know and those who are also just amateurs. They love their music. He doesn’t write any lesser music for amateurs, I don’t think. Even the Methodical Sonatas are dedicated to an amateur.

Near the end of the discussion, Michatz refers to an extensive list of Telemann’s works of all types of he has performed. He concludes:

It’s just an awful lot. With Sydney Consort we’ve done the G-major duet with violin and various trios. Trios with gamba and recorder/flute. And then, of course, Harmonische Gottesdienst [church cantatas] all over. Not the whole thing but quite a lot of the favourite cantatas there. So that might not be all I’m afraid. Basically you have the experience with that [much] material over the full range of the instrumental, vocal, orchestral, opera, all of that.

Dr Samantha Owens — ‘It took this very naïve Kiwi to come along and actually bother to have a look.’

Interview recorded 18 November 2014

BMus (Hons), PhD Victoria University of Wellington, LTCL, FAHA

[The interview was conducted via Skype. Samantha Owens was at the time based at the University of Queensland. She has now, as of late 2015, taken up her post as Associate Professor of Musicology, Victoria University of Wellington, NZ.]

While a young student in Christchurch, New Zealand, Samantha Owens began her musical training on piano before taking up the oboe at age thirteen. Two years later she was playing in the Christchurch Symphony Orchestra. ‘That’s the thing about being an oboist, you know it’s a bit rare.’ Owens’s attraction to the instrument resulted in quick progress so she skipped sixth-form, the final year of high school, to go to Wellington where she studied with Ronald Webb, then principal oboe of the New Zealand Symphony Orchestra. At the end of her third year of a Bachelor of Music degree at Victoria University of Wellington, she began an Honours Year (1991) that included a thesis on Mozart and the oboe. Her supervisor, Professor Peter Walls, Head of Music and a baroque violinist, handed her a baroque oboe to try out. There weren’t other baroque oboe players who might guide her so, with a fingering chart in hand, she began her work. [Peter Walls was instrumental in establishing a Baroque Workshop in which students, using these ‘new’ baroque instruments, prepared regular public performances.] Throughout her undergraduate years she had also taken classes in music history so she
decided to continue with a postgraduate program (still at Wellington) in musicology with a
thesis focussed on the ducal court of Württemberg near Stuttgart, Germany.

I wanted to write a thesis about the introduction of the oboe into Germany just around the
time when it was first developed into the baroque oboe, so around 1680. I basically looked in
New Grove in all the articles that were about German locations to see what composers were
working in the courts in those places. Once I had a list of the composers’ names I looked at the
entries on the composers to see what repertoire still survived. Then had to figure out the
repertoire that included oboes and the repertoire that included oboes that no one had edited or
looked at yet and whether that still survived and where that was.

In preparation for the work in Germany, Owens took some German language classes at the
Goethe Institute in Wellington. On arriving in Stuttgart she was not prepared for the shock
she experienced when she received her first bundle of manuscripts. ‘It’s all in this
indecipherable handwriting... I literally couldn’t read a single word of it.’ After regrouping she
went to the State Library, found tables of the letters of the handwriting and learned how to
read eighteenth-century German script... and eventually found material that even German
scholars find surprising.

I ended up in Stuttgart and thank goodness there turned out to be heaps of archival material
that survived and no one seemed to have looked at it. So it took this very naïve Kiwi to come
along and actually bother to have a look. I still meet German musicologists that know my work
and are really surprised that no Germans had done this.

During her time in Wellington, Owens recalled regular chamber music evenings with friends.

I guess being an oboist I’ve played quite a lot of Telemann chamber music and certainly all of
the Kleine Kammermusik that Telemann published in 1716. They’re Suites but they’re for oboe
and basso continuo and they’re one of the earliest collections written specifically for the oboe.
He dedicated it to four very famous oboists of the time in Germany. That is a quite central,
important collection.

She also recalls a singer and friend who had returned to Wellington after some time studying
early music in Holland. ‘I remember we did a concert with an organist that was just Telemann
cantatas from the Harmonischer Gottesdienst.’ She has also drawn on his music for her music
history students. She is especially interested in his operas and wishes modern and facsimile
editions were more available. In discussing Telemann’s opera, Orpheus, she said:

Yes, it’s fantastic. And I used a bit of that in my teaching actually, and I wish there was a
modern edition of it. Particularly because it’s got stuff in different languages in it. This idea of
bringing together different national styles which he does really well. From a teaching point of view, it’s perfect for that.

When comparing Telemann with J. S. Bach she has clear opinions based on her own playing and teaching experience. Considering Telemann’s writing for oboe she said:

He knows what he’s doing when he’s writing for it. Which makes it just much more satisfying to play. The music can still be challenging to play but not in a ridiculous way. I mean Bach’s fantastic, of course, but some of the stuff, it’s just beyond the pale. You know? With Telemann you can be sure that he’s… given the instrument more thought. He played a whole range of instruments including the oboe, I think. He knew what he was doing.

Thinking about her students’ impression of Telemann, Owens concludes:

I think they’re very interested in it. Interested in this concept of bring the styles together. I think they’re also quite interested in Telemann for the “commercial” perspective. This whole business about him publishing his own music and that sort of thing. I find that they often find that quite fascinating.

Dr Neal Peres Da Costa — “Get on the next train. Here’s the ticket. You’re going to be playing in this Edinburgh Festival production in a week’s time.” What?!”

Interview: Sydney, New South Wales, 19 August 2015

University of Sydney
Guildhall School of Music and Drama – Postgraduate Degree in early music
City University of London – Master of Music Performance
2002 - PhD - University of Leeds

[The interview was held in his studio filled with historical keyboards at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, University of Sydney where he is Professor of Historical Performance.]

Like others who arrive in Australia as immigrants, Neal Peres Da Costa’s parents wanted him to have opportunities they did not have, so at the age of six he began piano lessons with Sister Dorothy Dolehenty at the local Catholic School in Summer Hill, a neighbourhood of Sydney. ‘I was lazy. I didn’t like practising so mum would make us practise. She’d set the timer and sit with us and all that sort of stuff. A wise mother.’ With a change of school to a Christian Brother’s school in grade five he soon began lessons with Lyudmila Morozov with whom he studied right through to year twelve.
We used to go to her place in Croydon every Friday evening and have our lessons and it was wonderful. She’d studied with a student of Liszt, so she had a picture of him on the piano. Liszt was always beaming down on [us]. It was during that time that I really suddenly was inspired by music.

Listening to classical music on ABC radio also provided a remarkable experience.

It was during the time with her that I heard on the radio my first C.P.E. Bach, in fact [it was] *Flute Concerto in D-minor*, probably on the ABC one morning at breakfast. I thought, that’s it, I have to be a musician, listening to this. I even recorded it off the radio I remember. It was sort of hair on the back of your head standing up [experience].

Like other young enthusiasts he began collecting LP recordings.

Having pocket money, I used to make a regular trip into Sydney, the big smoke, a long way from Strathfield and Ashfield. And would go to Dymocks and Palings and look for the latest [recordings]. One of the first things I bought was Zubin Mehta conducting the Israel Philharmonic and it was Mozart 40 and 41 [symphonies] and I was just totally blown away.

However, it was playing violin in the school orchestra which offered him the change to feel part of a community of musicians. His hope to pursue music at university concerned his parents who were, however, persuaded by an AMEB eighth-grade piano exam report by examiner Frank Taranto who Peres Da Costa recalls wrote ‘... Would strongly recommend a musical career for this person.’ He entered Sydney University in 1982 as a student in the Music Department based at the Seymour Centre. Professor Peter Platt was then Head of Music.

It was a brilliant department, just mind-blowingly awesome to use a very modern term, in terms of the breadth and scope of what was offered. Just to give you an idea, the very first meeting we had, the first day, Monday of term, Peter Platt sat in the Old Darlington School cross-legged with his shoes off which I wasn’t [expecting] to see, with a sitar in his hand.

It was here that he was introduced to the burgeoning world of early music.

The very next thing I remember was being introduced to a harpsichord by Winsome [Evans] and her handing me C. P. E. Bach’s *Essay*....and her saying “Right, we’re going to be playing some Bach on the harpsichord” and I was thinking “Oh, my God. What is this?” I’d heard a harpsichord on vinyl recordings, *Brandenburg Five* on a 1950s pretty un-historic harpsichord but that’s just extraordinary.

He recalls, however, that his new piano teacher at the university, Neta Maughan (1938– ), said “Oh yes, that’s right. That’s what they do to you at university. They’re going to give you these other instruments and they’re going to give you this book. You’ll have to do all that stuff for them at university but when you come here you just forget all of that.”
Along with preparing recitals on modern piano he continued work with Winsome Evans, who also introduced him to an eighteenth-century Viennese action fortepiano, and the musicologist and conductor Nicholas Routley.

In my Honours year, I did the Rachmaninoff Paganini Variations with orchestra, with the University Symphony Orchestra, which was amazing... from memory. God knows how I did that. I couldn't do it now. I did Mozart Concerto in A-major, K. 414 on fortepiano, directing, well, semi-directing a period instrument ensemble [of] single strings. Winsome found money to pay these professionals to do that, and I also did Eric Satie's stuff from the Sports et Divertissements piece with an actor on stage reading out poetry.

Having chosen the Guildhall School of Music and Drama (London) he discovered, to his surprise, that it was not all that he had expected. The course was offered to students without any experience of early music as well as students like Peres Da Costa who had played the instruments, much of the music, and knew the treatises.

In previous years, students had not been turning up because they were home students who were just dabbling. Within a month of being there I clubbed together with a wonderful American lutenist... There's this by-law that if you weren't happy you could get your money back so we called the ‘Revolution’. We got something like twelve people. We said, let’s club together. We’re going to boycott the course within the month. We were all internationals and they’ll have to give all the money back. In two days the course was running.

Peres Da Costa was immersed in music in London at a vibrant time in the early music scene.

I learnt a lot about other things to do not just with period instrument playing or HIP as we call it now. Even just how to survive as a musician. The skills you need to be a business person, a good organiser. How do you research? How do you teach?

Having completed his first year at the Guildhall and receiving a scholarship for his second he ‘moonlighted’. ‘I secretly moonlighted and went and did a Masters in Music Performance at the City University in London which had connections with the Guildhall School. So, I actually effectively did two courses at the same time.’ His finishing recital had included both the Mozart and Beethoven Piano and Wind Quintets using a fortepiano and period winds. He recalls with warmth the kindness of his parents who, when he told them he needed his own instrument, bought a fortepiano for him from Trevor Pinnock. At the end of the two-year’s study, he realised he needed to stay in Europe which he did, for fifteen further years.
Nick Wilson, in his monograph on the periods of the early music movement, refers to this period, the late 1980s, as the period of Maturity. Peres Da Costa had many models to study. He recalls Philip Pickett, director of the then very active and successful New London Consort – ‘They were doing Proms and Wigmore Halls and he taught us good business sense and how to be slick on the stage and produce a really marketable product.’ During his early years of this period Peres Da Costa also travelled to Bruges, Belgium for the fortepiano competitions and had some lessons in Holland from Stanley Hooglan, known as ‘a great fortepiano guru’. In 1989, after finishing at the Guildhall, he got a call from the Royal Academy of Music (R.A.M.). Their fortepianist, Melvyn Tan (1956- ), had become too busy and unable to teach his students. Peres Da Costa recalls that he got a phone call saying:

“Could you please come and give some fortepiano lessons here at the R.A.M.?" and I ended up walking into that job. They just kept me on and at the same time they asked me to teach some performance classes to the undergrads. I suddenly found myself being a lecturer at the R.A.M.

About the same time, Peres Da Costa became acquainted with a recorder and baroque flute player, Ashley Solomon. He describes their thoughts about young early music performers trying to make their way in the crowded scene in London.

We both realised that with the London scene being this huge scene and so many players around. There were so many harpsichordists, so many recorder players, it would be very difficult for us to be absorbed into any of the established groups. I mean, God, how did I even expect that. So he said, “Why don’t we just start our own group? Why were we waiting around?” We were watching others of our cohort just immediately be asked to play in the Academy of Ancient Music and John Elliot Gardiner’s English Baroque Soloists. [String players] were just getting absorbed and some of them hadn’t even done much study. They were just putting gut strings on modern instruments.

The two of them decided to gather other players also just starting out to put on an orchestral concert. They gave two concerts to which some of their teachers came who said, ‘This is really extraordinary’. However, with England in a recession, they (Peres Da Costa and Solomon) realised such a large enterprise could not survive economically, so they formed a chamber ensemble, with violinists Rachel Podger (1968- ) and Anna Macdonald, a couple of lute players, and baroque cellist and viola da gamba player, Danny Yeadon. Thus, in 1991, Florilegium was born. Within a couple of years, the group had a recording contract with Channel Classics and produced their first disk, entirely of Telemann’s music, Telemann

---

220 Wilson. The Art of Re-enchantment.
Concerti da Camera (Channel Classics 5093, 1993). The group became so successful, with many appearances across the world that Peres Da Costa, who was also manager and so responsible for all the practical details began to ask himself if he could sustain the effort.

I mean it was quite a fairy tale thing to happen and of course with all of that there’s all the pressure, “Am I ready for this? Have I actually got all the skills I need to put on concerts at this level?” And the answer to that is sometimes “Yes” and sometimes “No”. There were crunch moments, for example, when our recording producer would take us aside and say, “OK, guys. That wasn’t the best way to do that. Go off and have some lessons with this person. Sort that little bit of the technique out... sort this out.” He was quite pushy like that. In retrospect, you know, it was a wake-up call. It was a good thing to happen, hard as it was at the time it was happening.

When asked about how the group developed their approach to performing repertoire Peres Da Costa said:

The understanding... was [that] what we were actually doing... we were trying to be the composer by learning the composer’s expectations... if we could find them by reading as much as we could in books of the time, written sources and all that.

It was a chance encounter with Clive Brown who, suddenly needing a fortepianist for the main Edinburgh Festival production, called on Peres Da Costa at a week’s notice.

The agent rang me to say “Get on the next train. Here’s the ticket. You’re going to be playing in this Edinburgh Festival production in a week’s time.” What! I turned up to Edinburgh train station and there was Clive with a pile of books. And it was all these unbelievably difficult pieces of studies, [Beethoven’s] Diabelli Variations, Liszt’s pieces, and I had four days to learn them and I couldn’t do it actually. So my experience of meeting Clive was incredible and from that came the offer of doing a PhD with him in the area of nineteenth-century performance practice. He knew I was interested and he knew I had a particular interest in Brahms and about how that would have sounded. Clive said, “Oh yeah. There’s this wealth of historic recordings and Joachim’s one of many things you could listen to. Are you interested in going further with this?” Eventually that’s what happened.

Still playing with Florilegium, he began his PhD at Leeds University where he held an 0.5 teaching position as artist-in-residence.

I walked around for four years, literally with a backpack on my back with all my books that I was reading, and trying to research. Everywhere we’d go... I’d go to Dubrovnik, for example, and I’d be in the hotel room instead of going swimming with everyone else. I’d be there doing my

---

221 Florilegium produced at least ten disks, including several of Telemann’s music, over a ten-year period.
PhD. I had to travel up to Leeds once a week when I was back in London. I’d get the train up there and I’d be with Clive. It was unbelievably wonderful to do but it was also quite hard.

Even after finishing his PhD and flying back to Australia in December of 2002 he kept up some university teaching and playing with Florilegium with frequent flights to London and back. After a time, however, it became clear that he and his partner, Daniel Yeadon, would have to make a break and establish their careers based in Sydney. In assessing the effect of this move Peres Da Costa said:

What’s happened out of it, of course, is this here at the Conservatorium and a wide range of performing activities, probably wider than we would have had, had we stayed in the UK. We might have ended up just being jobbing continuo players. We’ve experienced HIP [Historically-Informed-Practice] in a wide array of formats from playing in modern settings but using HIP principles, to within Ironwood [Sydney-based ensemble], our group for example, really being experimental... more and more experimental and trying to get into the composer’s head and asking the question. The fundamental thing that I’m living with now is what did that score mean to the composer and to his circle. What did it trigger when they saw [their parts]?

In both the UK with Florilegium and Australia with Ironwood and other groups, Telemann has been core repertoire. As an educator, he understands Telemann’s ability to write music to bring the musicians along from beginner to advanced levels.

I think Telemann will always be music that people who are studying early music will turn to because he gives you... it’s like a curriculum in itself. You can find pieces at every stage right up to the finishing point. But also simple pieces that will really work and he’s a perfect composer for learning how to ornament. You get examples of ornamentation in his music. And you know the beautiful Sonaten Methodische. They’re fantastic for learning. So we’ve always got this Telemann going on in this building [SCM].

He recalls one of the few large choral works, the Brockes Passion of Telemann, a performance of which he has been involved. While still living in Europe, ’92 or ’93, he played continuo for a performance in Germany.

It was an unbelievable number of rehearsals. Something like ten days of rehearsing. That’s what the Germans do. They rehearse very detailed. You sort of almost went away to a holiday camp to do it. I remember it was out in the countryside somewhere in this centre [of Germany]. But it was also an eye-opener into how Continental groups run the show, how they rehearse... very different to the English. As I said, very detailed, lots of discussion. Interestingly enough, however, so much detail that by the time you get to the performance you’re detailed out. I actually thought that the two performances we did, one in Stuttgart and one in Leipzig... didn’t go as well as I’d hoped for or expected. They seemed rather ragged at the edges and as if people
had almost switched off because too much time had been spent rehearsing and navel gazing. And that’s interesting because the English attitude towards the way the Continent does these things... yes, all terribly navel-gazing... [the English] get on with it. Just get on with it and play the music.

Over many years he came to understand the nature of Telemann’s writing for the continuo which some have thought to be less ‘important’ than the upper lines.

I think we sometimes felt, both Danny and I as continuo players, that sometimes the Telemann was ‘geared’ toward the upper parts. You know compared with, say, Bach where you were really challenged in all departments. Telemann could sometimes... you could end up feeling like you were in a subordinate, accompanimental role. However, one of the things I realised and I realise it even more now, is that those simple bass lines that are often there do not give away the complexity of playing a very, very fine continuo realisation. For that, when you start looking into what was required to do as a continuo player, you realise, “Oh my goodness...” What was on the page was so much the starting point and you were required to do so much more. But if you read books on figured bass accompaniment in [of] the time you’ll find out that to really bring this music to life from the continuo point-of-view you had to be able to play up from one... from tastò [to play the bass line only without chords or harmonic parts] to eight notes in the part, change your textures to suit the music, create melodic lines that go with or against the other part, and a whole range of things.

With long experience as a chamber music player in both Europe and Australia he finds audiences respond well to Telemann’s music.

For an audience, we’ve always found they’ve loved his music. In London at the Wigmore Hall we often did it and they always felt there was something very energetic and enjoyable about it but also he could change your mood very, very quickly. Take the E-minor Paris Quartet, the number six, It’s so heartfelt in the final movement. It’s almost like Dido’s Lament, you know... just beautiful. He was one of these people because he borrowed styles, he’s international in his style. I think for audiences now it’s almost the same. They may not understand exactly what he’s doing but they get the feeling of it and the variety and I think it’s understandable. The other thing I think they like is that he is one of these programmatic writers... Don Quixote and Ebb and Flow. You get these titles and he’s trying to show that in the music.

As for his own response to the music Peres Da Costa said:

... when his music is amazing it’s super amazing. It’s the most delightful. It’s the most inventive. It’s melodious. It’s very exploratory in rhythm and harmony. It’s got this incredible combination of things which, of course, made him famous. You want to tap your toes to it. You want to dance to it. You want to sing to it. At the other end of the scale he also churned out a
lot of music and some of it isn’t of that quality. Sometimes we come across those pieces and think, “Oh no. We’re going to have to do that.” So, we tried to avoid that and we tried to do just the quality things. What did I love about it? As I say, it’s the rhythm, the melody, the harmony and also, in chamber music settings, the combination of instruments. His ability to combine flute and viola da gamba, and violin and flute. Always something interesting. In the music you often, as you know, you get these conversations between instruments which are entirely charming. [Also,] some incredibly challenging writing.

Liane Sadler – ‘I turned up to Neal Peres Da Costa’s office in tears saying [speaking in a pleading voice] “I want to do baroque flute. I can’t do modern anymore.” And he was like, “Okay”.’

Interview recorded 12 November 2014

2014 Sydney Conservatorium of Music – Bachelor and Honours of Music Performance

[The interview was conducted in the music library of the Sydney Conservatorium of Music where she was finishing her Honours year. She was active within the Historical Performance unit, producing several student-run Baroque Festivals for which she prepared performance editions of rarely heard works including those of Telemann.]

Liane Sadler’s mother had been a musician who’d played violin and flute. Liane, as a seven-year-old, wanted to play violin like her mother, but there was no string program at her local primary school in Carlingford (Sydney) so she chose flute. The instrument was in poor condition so her music teacher, Daniel Smith (now a conductor) suggested a new instrument. She was keen, worked hard, and learned quickly. About the age of thirteen she changed flute teachers. Her new teacher...

was really tough and beat me into shape. Sometimes we’d do the entire hour and a half doing a chromatic scale because she wasn’t happy with the work that I’d done. She was just really, really tough. Yeah, so that was really good in the early years, actually.

Sadler did six units of music for her final year of secondary school.

I was doing six pieces of music for my final exam which was a really big program. And I used that repertoire, worked even [harder] then and did my A.Mus. [AMEB Associate Music diploma] recital at the end of the year, 2009. So then I took a gap year [a year taken off before beginning at university] to get better at flute again.

The reason for that gap year had to do with her plans for entering the Sydney Conservatorium of Music for a performance degree. After auditioning she was offered a place in music education, not the performance course. Disappointed, Sadler opted for a gap year instead during which she applied more hard work and determination to the cause. Near the end of
that year (2010) she was successful at highest level of AMEB exams, the LMus (Licentiate exam). She again auditioned for a place in the performance course of the Conservatorium but was again offered a place in music education.

They actually put me in education again which I was really devastated about and then I got here and there were seventeen flute players in my year. So I didn’t really have a chance because only about five of them got into performance and it was very strange.

Her transition to tertiary level education also involved a change of flute teachers. She found, like many other musicians, that what was just right for her at an earlier age needed to be reassessed at a later age. She changed to a flute teacher based at the Sydney Conservatorium.

Libby [Elisabeth Pring] built me up a bit and she was honest and she didn’t let things go. She wasn’t being easy on me but it was just a different style of teaching. She was honest but kind. Anyway, so then I auditioned again for performance at the end of my first year which is 2011 and I finally got into performance but during that summer I started getting baroque flute lessons with Megan Lang because I became interested in the idea of baroque flute playing. “What was it like?” I wasn’t sure.

Self-doubt had shadowed Sadler’s feelings about the modern flute but with this ‘new’ instrument, the baroque flute, she was exposed to new ways of thinking about the nature of performance and to its repertoire.

So I did an essay on the differences between period and modern instruments for my history subject. I interviewed Megan Lang for that to find out what she thought because she’s a period flute player. I went in to it thinking “Oh, baroque flutes aren’t very good”. So I kind of went in to it thinking that but Megan was talking about “Oh, it’s just different”. One of my questions was “Everyone says baroque [instruments] play out of tune. How do you deal with that?” She said, “Well, they don’t play out of tune. First of all, you are always adjusting the tuning on any instrument when you play.”

Speaking about her understanding of eighteenth-century temperaments or tunings, Sadler said:

Yes, it was a new concept to me. I suddenly realised it’s not a case of an instrument being better than the other one. We sort of see the modern flute as being the culmination of an evolutionary development of the modern flute. It’s not that. It’s just a different instrument and meets the demands that people have nowadays and the baroque flute meets the demands that people had during the Baroque period.

After a few lessons on a period flute in November 2011 with Megan Lang, Sadler experienced a sudden transformation in her ideas and plans.
Literally within a couple of weeks, I was like... “This is what I want to do... This is amazing.” It’s such a beautiful instrument and it’s so organic and earthy and natural. It just felt really natural. And the approach to the music was just so different. It felt more natural for me. You look at what’s on the page and you keep in mind the historical considerations and you come up with something that’s interesting and comes alive. It’s not you being this great artist [putting on a haughty tone] “Oh, I’m so artistic.” It’s about giving something to the audience and bringing the music alive for them.

Sadler was quite aware of the contrast between her recent musical past playing the modern flute and historical performance practices of early music with its performance traditions for particular pieces or genres. In speaking about modern flute performing traditions she said:

“No, you do it like this... and there was no reason why... just you do it this way because that’s the way it’s done.” Whereas Megan would guide me into making my own musical decisions based on this and that and intuition. “So Quantz says this and Mattheson says that... and then think about the effect this has on the audience and the listener when you’re playing it, and what Affekt you want to bring across.” I feel more able to play a piece of music than I could before [laughs].

Asked about the relationship between freedom and responsibility she describes how she now understands the need for balance. She began talking about the source of her own musical ideas.

Well, it felt like they’d been kind of suppressed, like they weren’t allowed to come out. And Megan showed me that I can trust myself musically, but to keep searching. To keep working hard to find new information and not settle for anything, but also to trust my musical instincts which is a very self-empowering thing. I guess that another element of baroque flute for me. It’s an incredible instrument and I love the approach to the music and I love the repertoire. But it was also much more a self-empowering experience of playing music than I’d ever had before.

This sudden transformation came during her second year, after she had finally been admitted to the performance course, on the modern flute.

I transferred to performance on modern flute and then within about two weeks, I think, I realised I couldn’t juggle the two. Some people are able to but I just couldn’t juggle modern and baroque and get the right amount of practicing in. I always felt guilty, if I was practicing baroque I was, like... well my degree is on modern flute. If I was practicing modern... but I don’t want to do this, I want to do baroque [flute]. I talked to Libby [her flute teacher] about it, and she [said] “I think this is what you should do, it just suits you. You should do baroque. It’s your thing.” And I thought about it a lot. I talked to my dad a lot and I wrote down lists of pros-and-cons and I went “I just love baroque flute. I just have to do it. It will make me happy.” I turned
up to Neal Peres Da Costa's office in tears saying [speaking in a pleading voice] “I want to do baroque flute. I can't do modern anymore.” And he was like, “Okay”. He went and pulled some strings and I transferred to baroque. Yeah… [taking a deep breath as she remembers the experience].

After speaking about her growing collection of instruments and her honours recital in which she played three of them, each quite different, she said:

Every flute is so different. You have to get into the right mind-set to play on each flute and also the styles that you’re going to be playing on each flute… It’s quite tricky and it’s not recommended to do it too much.

In talking about the repertoire for her baroque instrument she considered Telemann’s music. The Fantasies were a constant in her playing from her earliest lessons with her first flute teacher to the present. ‘So that’s the first time I played Telemann and I really enjoyed it because it was quite free music and it sounded really nice.’ But drawn to reflect more deeply about his music now that she has had more experience, Sadler said:

He really understood the instruments he was writing for, so it’s good to play because it “works” really well with the instrument you are playing on. And especially the Methodical Sonatas are really good because in the first movement he’s written out the “plain” and then he’s ornamented it so you learn about the ornamentation style from the time as well. So it’s a really good way of learning.

She and other students at the Sydney Con have produced several Baroque music concerts for which they selected the music, sourced manuscripts (parts or scores, often from on-line collections such as IMSLP), prepared performing copies, and managed rehearsals.

[For a recent concert] I picked the Overture-Suite for two trumpets and strings because we had these two trumpet players and we were trying to figure out how to include them in the program. And Telemann was so versatile, he happened to write a suite for two trumpets which is unusual because normally they use three. It’s quite an interesting Suite [with] its national styles.223

Asked about the reaction of her fellow musicians, Sadler said

There are always people who say, “Oh this is so good. Telemann is so good,” whenever you play his music. It’s very satisfying music to play. He’s just a very clever man. He really had total mastery of every kind of major style of the time.

222 Professor of Historical Performance, Sydney Conservatorium of Music.
223 Telemann, Overture-Suite in D major for two trumpets, strings and continuo TWV 55:D17.
At the time of the interview Sadler was hoping to travel to Berlin to audition for baroque flute lessons with Christoph Huntgeburth.

But if not [him] there are other incredible teachers in Europe. For example, Karl Kaiser who’s a fantastic player and teacher. Of course there’s Kate Clark and Barthold Kuijken, and Megan’s old teacher, Michael Schmidt-Casdorff. He’s known to be a very, very good teacher. You know, you can’t really go wrong in Europe, I think. There are lots of amazing people there to study with but I’m particularly interested in going to Berlin because of Christoph Huntgeburth.

Phillip Sametz — ‘Yeah, there are other ways to play this music.’
Interview recorded 12 March 2015.

[The interview was held in the café at the ABC Melbourne studios where Sametz is a producer and presenter on ABC Classic FM.]

Although Phillip Sametz is a semi-professional singer, many Australians know his voice better as a presenter and programmer for ABC Classic-FM. His love of singing and, more generally, what we call ‘classical’ music has long been part of his life. He remembers hearing his grandmother’s record collection from a young age and was often taken to concerts by his grandfather. Growing up in Sydney, he sang in the Woollahra Demonstration School choir where, he says, ‘there was a sense of discipline about it. It wasn’t simply “fun”, although it was fun. You learned something about the basics of singing in harmony and of listening to other people.’ He entered Sydney Boys High School well prepared to continue to study music. Peter Crane, who taught the elective music classes, ‘would take a couple of works every term and give them to you for analysis. There was [also] some basic composing taught.’ Although his exam results were easily good enough to admit him to university he had applied for a journalist cadetship with News Ltd. Sametz recalls that, of the approximately 700 applicants, he received one of the ten cadetships offered. For about eight years he worked in journalism of one sort or another until, in 1987, he was admitted to Sydney University as an Arts degree mature-age student.

A year and a half later a job came up at what was then called ‘ABC Concerts’, a unit which managed and supported all six Australian symphony orchestras, then still under the umbrella of the national broadcaster. He was then faced with the decision either to take up the offered job or to continue with his university studies. Sametz recalls asking his lecturers for advice. One of them was the great historian of Spain, Graeme Harrison. Sametz spoke with

224 Since 1998 Phillip Sametz has been the leader and vocalist of the swing-era band, Mell-O-Tones.
warmth and affection about Harrison who taught Early Modern European History. ‘I had good marks in first year. I said to them [his lecturers] that ‘I have an opportunity to take this job but the work I’m doing here is important to me... I’m really conflicted.’ They pretty much all said, “You can finish this anytime.” Since that time, 1988, Sametz has worked in the performing arts. His belief in life-long learning remains a foundation of all his work.

I’m just reading at the moment Howard Goodall’s book Big Bangs: Five Musical Revolutions (2000) because in our line of work when you’re broadcasting music-based programs, you need to be reading the kind of thing the listener is reading. If you were an interested layperson that’s what I would be reading, because it is an attempt to explain some of the most important discoveries in the history of music.

Graeme Harrison’s view of history writing still resonates in Sametz’s approach to his work.

I said, “Graham some of these scholarly texts are really impenetrable, so much of it is very difficult to get to.” He said, “You should never ever dismiss the work of these specialist texts because, that’s what informs a general history.” If the work isn’t done at this level, then you can’t have television histories that deal with this properly.

Given the nature of his role as a classical music presenter and programmer, Sametz’s thoughts about early music focus largely on the effect of particular performances or recordings. His school musical education included the studying of the Brandenburg Concertos using both musical scores and recordings of ‘high-cholesterol’ performances such the Berlin Philharmonic. His experience of singing in the chorus of a performance of Handel’s Alexander’s Feast, directed by Roger Covell with an orchestra led by violinist Dene Olding, led to his continuing fascination with the power of musical performances.

He [Covell] was thinking about style as much as one could before a lot of the scholarship had been done. And before a lot of what we would now think of as “appropriate” editions were available. I think of those performances with a lot of fondness and I really fell in love with the piece.

Sametz says of these performances ‘They were my seminal early music experiences. [It was] the opportunity to actually get close to something as opposed to turning the radio on and thinking ‘that sounds nice’. His record-buying reflected the changing trends in the early music movement. Of a record of music by C. P. E. Bach played by the Concentus Musicus Wien (ca. 1980) Sametz remembers thinking:

Ah, this doesn’t sound like the old Menuhin recordings I used to know. [It was] springier, leaner, and because it was all string symphonies you didn’t have the issues you heard from the early days of the period instrument movement when wind and brass tuning could be
problematic. There wasn’t any of that because it was all “stringy”. But I do remember thinking, “Ah... there are other ways to do this?” Yeah, there are other ways to play this music.

As a programmer, Sametz has closely followed developments in the performance practice history of early music. Recalling his work as producer of ABC Classic FM presenter Christopher Lawrence's Mornings program, he observed:

When you listen to the Freiburger Barockorchester or Ensemble Zefiro or indeed some of the groups coming out of Finland who are amazing, you realise that we are now two generations on in terms of teaching and playing. And also in terms of replicating the instruments, in terms of instrument building. So when someone plays a replica oboe, the oboe makers have had several decades of [thinking] “Oh...that’s a much better way of doing this.” So what it means is that we have now gone past the point of “Well, that’s a different way of hearing this piece.” Now we can think really carefully about style and embellishment, about phrasing. That was always there but the level of confidence on the instruments is such that now you’re moving into areas of really interesting interpretation.

The two of them, Lawrence and Sametz, developed an idea of focussing on one composer each week. He speaks here of Telemann’s week on the ‘Pedestal’ of the ABC Classic FM Mornings program. Both modern performance practice and its supporting scholarship are important. He began thinking about the reasons older recordings of Telemann are so different from those of today.

The over-arching thing is that what the newer ensembles are doing is bringing out something that was probably always there on the page. But that it would have been very difficult to hear if you’d heard a symphony orchestra play it. Which is his [Telemann’s] liveliness. And his tremendous ear for colour, which can be smoothed out too much on modern instruments. When you go back now and hear a work you know well... Let’s say for example the Hamilton Harty version of Handel’s Water Music well, I can enjoy it now in a much more informed context than I would have when I first heard it, when I thought that was how the “Water Music” [Handel] went. Well, in the same way, if you went back to hear an attempt to do a Telemann piece of Tafelmusik in the early 1960s...by, say, Herman Scherchen it would probably sound rather dull. Partly because Telemann’s music really depends on performers who are well informed about the period, about the context in which he was writing, about what his contemporaries were doing, about matters of articulation. But I think [it’s also] the physicality of it, the instruments they are playing, to be honest with you. I think that is one of the reasons why Telemann thirty years ago to the average music lover was [just] a name.

Sametz concludes with this reflection on the crucial interrelationship between academic study and musical performance.
You are dealing with a combination of commercial, cultural, musical circumstances that collide. The other thing is, of course, Telemann scholarship. When you are producing fifteen hours of music on the radio a week and you are hearing so much music that was not previously known, you realise how important scholarship is. It’s all very well to say “Why doesn’t anybody do this?” Then you think, “What if the parts are a mess? What if we only have the score? What if no one’s actually opened this for a hundred and fifty years? What if it’s unperformable until someone does the spade work?” So that’s the other critical [element]... they’re all part of the same equation, I think.

Phillip Sametz is one of those doing the spade work for many ordinary listeners.

**Hans D Schroeder – ‘Europe is discovering [that] Bach is known in Australia.’**

Interview recorded 19 December 2015

[This interview was conducted in the refectory of Trinity College, University of Melbourne. Hans Schroeder describes himself as an entrepreneur with an interest in the music and life of J. S. Bach although his working career was as a chemist working for the German pharmaceutical company, Merck, based in Darmstadt.]

Born in Germany near the border of the Netherlands early in WWII, Hans Schroeder pursued chemistry as a young man instead of the family tradition of plumbing. ‘I’m extremely grateful for my parents, they gave me all the freedom because our priority was to rebuild Germany after WWII.’ It wasn’t until his study at the Technische Universität Berlin, beginning in 1962, that he had the opportunity to take an interest in music. For a few Deutschmarks, he heard many performances including the Berlin Philharmonic and the Deutsche Oper Berlin. Most of the repertoire was from the Classical and Romantic periods. He recalls, however, hearing Bach’s Weihnachts-Oratorium in the Berlin Philharmonie conducted by Herbert von Karajan. ‘I didn’t like it. So, early music of that kind was not my ”cup of tea” as we say.’

He soon joined the Darmstadt-based chemical company, Merck (now known as Merck KGaA), for whom he later travelled to oversee the work of Merck’s international subsidiaries. During these visits he was often taken to concerts and other musical events. In 1979, his strong interest in music drew him into conspiring with the Head of Clinical Chemistry, Dr Zidenek Simane, then also the conductor of the company’s chamber orchestra. (There is a strong business tradition of support for ‘in-house’ musical organisations in Germany. Members of these groups typically held jobs in the company.)
In 1979 they were on the brink of being... dissolved and finished for funding reasons or whatever. The conductor who was a good friend of mine working in the research department, Dr Simane, stuck our heads together and got the brilliant idea, I think, to bring this orchestra to Vienna.

The Merck Chamber Orchestra played for the opening ceremony of the International Congress of Clinical Chemistry attended by around 5000 people. ‘My competitors in the field, mostly American companies, other Europeans, were fuming because Merck was mentioned all the time.’

Schroeder drew on his skills as an entrepreneur with imagination and drive after he arrived in Australia in 1990. In 1994, after retiring from his position as CEO of Merck (Melbourne), he became active in the German Lutheran Trinity Church, East Melbourne. In arranging concerts to help to develop the profile of this historic church community he developed links with another nearby Lutheran Church, St John’s Southgate. Its musical director, Professor Graham Lieschke (also a clinical and research haematologist at Monash University and Royal Melbourne Hospital.), has established a tradition of regular performances of Bach cantatas in their original liturgical setting. Schroeder’s retirement has also enabled him to make regular visits to Germany where he has developed friendships with musicians and scholars of Thomaskirche Leipzig. In 2006 Christoph Biller, the 16th Kantor of the Thomaskirche after J. S. Bach, visited Melbourne. Schroeder describes this encounter:

We started to talk about Bach in Australia. My knowledge was very, very limited at that time, 2006. But, again with other people... you mentioned the name Jan Stockigt [Honorary, Melbourne Conservatorium of Music] before, she was part of that first meeting. We had Douglas Lawrence [organist and director of music at Scot’s Church] who’s also very well known in Melbourne and elsewhere. [They] helped me along the way and at the end of the three weeks, Christoph Biller told me... “Well, we agreed at that time Bach has not properly arrived in Australia.”

Schroeder and Biller agreed on three actions:

- To bring St Thomas’s Boys Choir to Australia (which happened in 2009).
- To begin exchange programs for musician-scholars. To Leipzig: these have included Michael Leighton Jones (Trinity College Choir director visiting twice); Anthony Halliday (first Australian organist to perform at St Thomas, 2013). From Leipzig: St Thomas organist Ullrich Böhme (2011); St Thomas assistant organist, Stephan Kiessling

---

225 The Deutsche Philharmonie Merck is now a fully professional orchestra based in Darmstadt, still the home of the Merck company.
(2014); the vocal group Ensemble Nobiles, five former members of St Thomas’ Boys Choir (2015).

- To establish regular Melbourne-based Bachfests modelled after the Leipzig Bachfest. Established in 2012 with twenty events. The second Melbourne Bachfest (2014) also included a two-day Melbourne Bach Forum with Australian Bach scholars and the internationally-known Bach scholar, Christoph Wolff.

Early in this flurry of activity, Schroeder and others decided ‘to give it a proper foundation, organisational, entrepreneurial, also fundraising-wise, we established a Bach society’. The Australian Bach Society [ www.bach.org.au ] was established in October 2011. It has since produced concerts and recitals, fireside chats, seminars, and performances of Weihnachts-Oratorium [Christmas Oratorio]. Early-career musicians, supported by the Society, have also developed recitals which expand the repertoire beyond J. S. Bach. Schroeder is quite aware of other German composers of the period including, of course, Telemann.

But of course, we would like to do more about Telemann but, you see, it’s Bach but it’s not limited to Bach. In our constitution, it covers a lot, but more immediately I would like to have more focus on Telemann especially, and in the other direction, Mendelssohn-Bartholdy. But I sometimes have to slow down because there is, really, a process which takes much longer than I expected. And I cannot jump ahead. I have to do it the careful way.

Hans Schroeder, remembering the 2006 discussion with St Thomas Kantor, Christoph Biller, said:

Well, we agreed at that time Bach has not properly arrived in Australia. And I’ve repeated this... provocative sentence a few times since then. I’m starting now to modify it a little bit. Anyhow, he [Christopher Biller] said “You are experienced in business and marketing. You are retired. You have time to do something about it.”

Recalling his delight at the success of the two-day Melbourne Bach Forum (2014), the plans to publish the proceedings under the title ‘Bach Research in Australia’, and the on-going travel of Australian Bach scholars to conferences such as those of the Bach UK Network, Schroeder smiled and said, ‘I enjoy these moments when there is... fresh light. Europe is discovering [that] Bach is known in Australia.’

**Dr Jan Stockigt** — *The first time I played with a harpsichord was with Jean Nandi who was the daughter of Hovhaness, the composer Alan Hovhaness. Now, she was an expert in fish physiology.*

Interview recorded 11 March 2015
[The interview was held in her office at the Early Music Studio, Melbourne Conservatorium of Music, University of Melbourne where she is an Honorary Principal Fellow.]

It seems that musicians drawn to musicology accept complexity and chance as necessary strands of their lives. Like many others, Jan’s early musical experiences involved piano lessons (these in Melbourne) but with the family’s move to the country town of Bright, Victoria, she had fewer opportunities than some others of her age. The local high school stopped after year ten so she spent a year working in a local bank. However, she built upon her piano skills by playing hymns on a harmonium for the Bright Methodist Church.

I could only play in three keys: C, G, and F Major. So everything had to be transposed. I did that myself simply because I couldn’t play in other keys but I learned a lot about harmony and chords. I knew the seventh of a dominant seventh should fall and the third should rise. I just knew that. Well, actually, playing hymns is a very good introduction to four-part harmony.

After the family returned to Melbourne, she recalls after hearing the Jiří Tancibudek play the Haydn Oboe Concerto, deciding that she would play that instrument. ‘My first teacher was Tamara Coates, who was the daughter of Sir Albert Coates, and she at that time was a cor anglais player in the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra.’ She continued with Coates as her teacher during her first two years of study at the Melbourne Conservatorium of Music and then became a student of Tancibudek. Asking about how she could develop a vibrato he told her that ‘... he was just playing the slow movement of the Beethoven 3rd Symphony and it “came” so he couldn’t tell me. He was just one of the beautiful natural players.’

After finishing her studies, she began five years of teaching during which she married. She and her husband, Jim Stockigt, travelled to San Francisco where he pursued postdoctoral studies in medicine. They arrived at a good time for exploring new musical paths. It was said in Berkeley at that time that if you were “anybody” you had a Volvo and a harpsichord. The first time I played with a harpsichord was with Jean Nandi who was the daughter of the composer Alan Hovhaness. Now, she was an expert in fish physiology.

The early music movement there in the late 1960s was in full bloom. Still playing the modern oboe, Stockigt and her husband, a bassoonist, joined an international association for chamber music players [now called the ACMP - Associated Chamber Music Players]. She recalls meeting and playing with Jean Pierre Rampal, a friend of a neighbor, Coleman Citret, also a flute player. Bruce Haynes (author of The End of Early Music 2007) was also then resident in the San Francisco Bay area and had just made his first baroque oboe and asked her to try it out. From the West Coast of the US they travelled in 1971 to London where she played for the London Bach Choir and continued to enjoy playing chamber music. Two years later, 1973, they
returned to Melbourne where Jan took up a job at Hawthorn Teachers College helping prospective teachers to build up their musical experience and skills. Her playing included events such as the Melbourne International Festival of Organ and Harpsichord, gigs with the Victoria State Opera (with Richard Divall (1945-1977) directing Gluck and Handel operas) and the Astra Orchestra (including a performance of Telemann’s Concerto for three oboes and three violins).

Two events however, one before leaving for the US and the other after their return, have had a long-lasting effect on her musical career. The first was a performance of Messiah in 1968 under the direction of Graham Bartle in Melbourne.

He used a very small choir and a very small orchestra and the tempi were totally different from anything I’d ever experienced before. And he could use very fast tempi because of the size of the ensemble. I was just enchanted. I thought this was wonderful. That was a sort of milestone in my musical development I think.

The second was the 1975 Australian tour by Nicholas Harnoncourt and Concentus Musicus Wien for Musica Viva.

I went to the concert and I found that listening became a conscious thing. You actually had to concentrate to listen. They didn’t come at you. You were part of the process because you really had to listen. And at time I decided I just had to play baroque oboe.

This led her, in the late 1970s, to take an oboe (made by the Australian instrument maker, Fred Morgan) to Vienna where she had another made by Paul Hailperin, then second oboe with Concentus Musicus Wien. Jürg Schaeftlein, their principal oboist tried Morgan’s instrument and made comments for Stockigt to take back to him. On her return to Australia she began playing the baroque oboe with others who formed one of the earliest groups to publicly play these ‘new’ old instruments. With the tercentenary of Telemann’s birth coming up in 1981, they formed a group called The Telemann Ensemble. Playing the instrument, however, presented new challenges.

It was just a whole new experience. And the first time I played it publicly it was terrifying because I saw ‘A♭’ and I went to put out my little finger [for the Ab/G# key on a modern instrument] and there’s nothing there. It’s like having an amputation.

Telemann remained a central topic of her early research as well. She completed her Master’s thesis in musicology on the editing of the music of Telemann in 1980. While Stockigt is now best known for her work on Jan Dismas Zelenka (1679-1745) she also knows well the world of

Handel, Pisendel (Dresden, 1687-1755), and others of that interwoven eighteenth-century German musical culture.

But Telemann went to Dresden in 1719 when there were huge celebrations held for the return of the Elector Prince with a Hapsburg bride. Telemann used to supply music to the Dresden court whose composers probably gave him music in return for his own compositions because that’s how a music director would build a library. He would exchange music with colleagues. But Telemann was so prolific. There is a lot of music by Telemann in Dresden. And all of that has become recently a big project. You can see it all on line now in the Schrank II project.\(^{227}\) [Much of it in the International Music Score Library Project.]

She recalls living in Berlin during 1980 and going to the library there. ‘You could take things like Telemann’s publication of his *Musicalisches Lob Gottes* (Nürnberg, 1744) from the shelves in the Conservatorium there. The *originals!*’ Stockigt points out how greater awareness of security in archives and libraries has changed access since then. In presenting papers on Telemann she has often drawn on Telemann’s correspondence published in 1972, a rich source of his wit and charm and the more practical matters of his relationship with the Hamburg councillors, his employers.\(^{228}\)

In considering the differing ways in which she responds to the music of Telemann, J. S. Bach, and Handel she says:

Telemann has a humour. Bach can be humorous and he tries to be in some of his secular cantatas, but Telemann is witty. He is playing jokes all the time. When you listen to Telemann he brings a smile in a way that Handel doesn’t.

Considering what has contributed to sustaining her work she said much of her enthusiasm comes from working with colleagues across the world who bring *their* enthusiasms to gatherings. ‘I have very good international colleagues. All these people that I meet at conferences sustain me.’

I sit here writing most of the time. And I’m now into a very narrow field but that’s okay. I think that’s what happens in life. You narrow it down to what really interests you. And it’s this catalogue that interests me at present.\(^{229}\) I’ve just written the paper to be given in Zerbst (Germany, birthplace of Catherine the Great of Russia). It’s about a *Mass* by Alessandro Scarlatti once held in Dresden by Zelenka, but now it’s missing there.

\(^{227}\) https://hofmusik.slub-dresden.de/en/themes/schrank-ii/


Peter Webb — ‘I've heard lots of Telemann since and it’s quite extraordinary. Very witty, very clever and yet never, even when he’s being funny or witty or pointed, he never loses his grip on accuracy or stylistic consistency or beauty of sound.’

Interview: Queen’s College, University of Melbourne, 9 January 2015

Schooling: The Geelong College
1969 University of Melbourne, Bachelor of Arts in Philosophy
1970 Secondary Teachers’ Certificate
1975-1995 Principal Cor Anglais, Adelaide Symphony Orchestra
1983-present Conductor Unley Symphony Orchestra, South Australia
1997-present Conductor Choir Cecilia, South Australia
2008-present Director, South Australian Music Camp

[The interview was held during a Yearly Meeting of Australian Quakers, one of Peter Webb’s many interests. His playing career as a professional oboist and cor anglais player was shortened by noise-induced hearing loss, although that has not limited his musical involvement in community and educational commitments for which, in 2007, he was awarded the Medal of the Order of Australia “for services to the arts as a conductor, composer, teacher, and musician.”]

Peter Webb’s father, an art teacher, was raised in a household in which a broad range of arts were respected. He recalls his older brother playing records of popular classics as he was going to sleep. His interest in music was further supported at his school, The Geelong College, where he sang in choirs and played recorder. As in many school music programs, students were encouraged to choose an instrument once they entered middle school. He chose oboe because he remembered, some years before, hearing the playing of a visiting old scholar of the school, David Woolley. Out of gratitude to the school where he had been a gifted art student of Peter’s father, Woolley returned to the school to play a recital before leaving Melbourne, where he had been a member of the Victorian Symphony Orchestra (predecessor of the Melbourne Symphony), to take up his new position as principal oboe in Sydney.

I started on the oboe and there weren’t any oboists in Geelong, so I learnt from a clarinet teacher. He was careful and conscientious and looked after me well and gave me a supply of reeds from an oboe player he knew and played with in Melbourne. Quite good reeds as I recollect.

After a few years, the clarinet teacher suggested he find an oboe player to teach him, so he began with Jack Shepherd, then second oboe in the Victorian Symphony. When Shepherd went overseas, Webb then started with a member of the Air Force Band, Edwin Denton, or
‘Eddie’ Denton, who soon after got a job with the Victorian Symphony. Nancy Simons, cor anglais player of the Victorian Symphony, then became his teacher during his final two years of high school and into his time at Melbourne University, studying Arts and teaching.

I did three years teaching in a Victorian country town and so the oboe was just a ‘hobby’. At the end of those three years I thought, if I’m ever going to become a professional player, I need to get on with it, because more kids who can play more semiquavers are stacking up behind me. I practiced hard and auditioned and got into a group which... in those days was called the National Training Orchestra in Sydney run by the ABC, the Australian Broadcasting Commission. I was successful and got in, and then in 1973 I resigned from teaching and played in the National Training Orchestra.

Those in the Sydney-based training orchestra received a scholarship and a modest living allowance.

I could pay the bills and pay the rent. I think the living allowance was $40 a week which in those days was okay. You could survive on that via op-shops. The orchestra was set up for players in the gap between being graduates from a tertiary institution and becoming professional players in an orchestra... It was a big jump in the standard from what I had [done]. And I wasn’t a graduate in the instrument. I’d just worked hard. Because of my great love of orchestral music, I knew every work we played. I knew the sound of it and the style of it. Brahms symphonies, Beethoven symphonies, whatever. Apart from an occasional little one I came across that I didn’t know. Webb began getting an occasional call from the Sydney Symphony and then had a three-month contract with the Elizabethan Trust Sydney Orchestra, now called The Australian Opera Orchestra.

We did Don Giovanni. We did La Boheme. We did of Jenůfa of Janáček... fantastic opera. We did Tales of Hoffmann which was the first opera that Joan Sutherland did when she came back to Australia to live permanently. So I was in that.

During his earlier time with the training orchestra he had met a viola player, Julie, who became his wife. Their next move was to Hobart, Tasmania where, from the end of 1974 to early 1975 they played with the Tasmania Symphony Orchestra. This gave him more opportunities to play cor anglais. ‘I really loved playing the cor anglais, so that gave me the opportunity to play that instrument which I wasn’t getting in the opera orchestra where there were three players and I wasn’t the designated ‘cor’ player.’ In March that same year, 1975, they moved to Adelaide where he became the principal cor anglais player, holding that position for the next twenty years.
Chamber music for many orchestral musicians remains a constant in their careers. While in Sydney, he and his wife had been part of a group called Ayres Baroque.

We were part of an evening series of concerts at St Philip’s Church in Sydney. [Now merged with Holy Trinity Church or the Garrison Church, and known as the Church Hill Anglican Church] We did evening concerts or we’d be part of an event. There’d be the opening of an event and we’d go along and, you know, play a couple of trio sonatas and a few solo pieces ourselves. We were the entertainment. And so we played a lot of Baroque music because it’s good stuff, small groups, solo and ensemble music, good to listen to, good to play and you didn’t need to prepare it for months on end.

After leaving Sydney on their musical journey Webb and his wife revived the name Ayres Baroque with a new group of musicians in Adelaide. Baroque repertoire remained at the core of their playing. Recalling his chamber music experience while still a student, Webb said:

I was becoming a reasonably proficient player in year twelve or in the late secondary school years. I got into a group of musicians in Geelong. One of them was a flute player [Stephen Brockman]. And I’m still friends with him after fifty years. We played trio sonatas together and we’d do little concerts around Geelong for the Music Society.

The repertoire of those chamber groups drew heavily on music of the Baroque era which pleased both performers and audiences.

Vivaldi, Handel, and Telemann would be the three composers and you can just pull a new sonata off the shelf every week. They’re still discovering sonatas by Vivaldi and Telemann. It’s fantastic. I always put Vivaldi and Telemann together because they would do unexpected things. You get a nice tune and it would be all beautifully conventional then suddenly they’d go off at a tangent. When you’re playing it or when you’re listening you suddenly think, “Oh, what’s that? What’s he done there?” I used to love it when they did that. And I’ve heard lots of Telemann since and it’s quite extraordinary. He’ll go off atonally for some reason or other, perhaps because he’s describing a village band. So it’s just funny stuff, some of it. Very witty, very clever and yet, never, even when he’s being funny or witty or pointed, he never loses his grip on accuracy or stylistic consistency or beauty of sound. It’s always beautifully done.

Webb was aware of the changing world of early music performance practice and scholarship, and in his performances he drew on patterns of ornamentation in music of the Baroque and early Classical periods.

These days Baroque specialists tell you how to do turns and whether you do an inverted mordant or a straight one, what decorations you put on, and there’s the Urtext and there’s the decorated text, you know. That sort of thing. I didn’t get too much into that. I’d put in trills and if I did a repeat I’d do melismas and things between.
He recalls meeting and working with the British oboist Jillian Streater during her time in Adelaide.

She had done quite a lot of training in Baroque style and ornamentation. So I went through some sonatas with her and we did ornamentation together. She gave me some insights into Baroque ornamentation. One of them was a Vivaldi Concerto for two oboes which we did with keyboard. We played it together and we got all the turns together and everything. It was fantastic. My impression is that a lot of the Baroque [period] players wouldn't have pre-calculated it. They’d have in their mind a sort of set of drawers and you’d pull out this drawer do some kind of ornament and you’d pull out this drawer and they’d do it spontaneously as they felt like it.

Webb speaks of the music of this period as being at the core of oboe repertoire. In developing a chamber music program:

A third or half of your program is always going to be Baroque music. In a way, I suppose, it’s an easy fix. Nice to listen to. Nice to play. Doesn’t take your accompanist six months to prepare it. It’s not the Richard Rodney Bennett Concerto. And it’s very gratifying to listen to. It’s lovely. Vivaldi and Telemann, Handel concertos... really, really beautiful, gracious, gratifying works to play.

As the conversation returns to the music Telemann, Peter concludes:

I think he knew that to be relevant, music had to entertain. Puccini it was who said music has to be “moving, interesting, or surprising”.
Ruth Wilkinson — ‘That was my first lesson with Hans-Martin Linde. He put a Quantz duo in front of me and said, “Let’s play together”. I thought “This’ll be nice”. And I looked at it and of course [he said] “and we’ll transpose it a minor third” with a twinkle in his eye. And I thought, jeepers, how do you do this?’

Interview recording 13 September 2014

Hornsby Girls’ High School  
1962-1967 University of Queensland BMUS (Hons)  
1974-1976 Schola Cantorum Basiliensis, Switzerland  
1999-2005 Teaching including:  
- Director of Music, Junior School St Michael’s Grammar School  
- Recorder and Historical Performance Practice, the Early Music Studio, University of Melbourne

[The interview was held at the Melbourne home of Ruth Wilkinson, a performer on recorders, voice flute (a tenor recorder in D, matching the range of the baroque flute), viola da gamba and its low pitched member of the family, the violone. She has long been active with performances in Australia, Asia and Europe. She has performed with many early music ensembles: Ensemble of the Fourteenth Century, Elysium Ensemble, La Romanesca, Capella Corelli, Ludovico’s Band, Consort Eclectus, and Trio Avium. She often takes part in festivals and workshops.]

While as a youth Ruth Wilkinson had formal piano lessons, it was hearing the recorder that set her musical course. ‘I just loved the sound of recorder which I heard at school. I didn’t have lessons but my mother bought me a recorder and I taught myself so I always played the recorder.’ Wilkinson’s reputation as a multi-instrumentalist was established during her high school years when she also began playing double bass. At the University of Queensland, she majored in both piano and double bass, and received encouragement to continue her work on recorder. She began teaching music at The Geelong College following Hartley Newnham (countertenor and fellow member of La Romanesca), where she also first met the then student Gary Ekkel (a participant in this study). After a few years’ teaching she heard about the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis, then a recently established early music centre in Basel, Switzerland. She auditioned as a recorder player and was accepted as a student of Hans-Martin Linde. Her three years there, 1974-1976, occurred at the time of a European revival of interest in early music.

I also then got to study because of my double bass playing, they wanted a baroque double bass player so they got me on to violone. It was all kind of serendipity really. I started that with Jordi Savall. That was a great miracle really. He wasn’t such a famous man then but, of course, he was a wonderful man, a wonderful teacher. A lot of my Basel experience was really introducing me first of all to Medieval music with the Studio for Early Music with Thomas Binkley [later at the University of Indiana], Andrea Van Ramm [mezzo soprano] and those people... There was a lot
of emphasis on 17th century music: Fontana [Giovanni Battista Fontana, (- d. ca. 1630), Castello (Dario Castello, 1590-1658) on the recorder and introducing me to French music... I did do some Telemann with Hans-Martin Linde, but the greater interest of these people was on this earlier repertoire [which] was really being rediscovered then. Not everyone was playing that stuff. And less so on the later Baroque. I guess my biggest surprises and influences were the 17th century and the French repertoire... I’d never played any of it and I loved that.

On her return to Australia in 1977, Wilkinson soon found others who were ready to perform this new repertoire. One group, La Romanesca, focused on Medieval music while the other, Capella Corelli, drew on the rich trio and solo sonata repertoire. The latter group, with harpsichordist John O’Donnell, and baroque violinist Cynthia O’Brien who had just returned from nine years in Vienna, played a great deal of the music of Telemann.

Cynthia and I, I think, would know every single trio sonata there was over the years, violin and recorder of course. We would adapt some of them, violin and oboe, which you can play on voice flute and the solo violin sonatas which were just weren’t being played... I would have performed a lot of Telemann recorder solos... because yes, audiences always respond well to Telemann, especially the trio sonatas. We would often end a program with a Telemann trio sonata because it was a bit of a crowd pleaser. They’re lovely to play.

Asked about what audiences liked about these chamber works of Telemann, Wilkinson said

I think there’s a great melodic beauty in them. [she pauses] ... The harmonic interest in them. [Those] lovely harmonic passages work in Telemann I think. [pause] ... It’s that aspect of Telemann where he has a step in the galant. It’s often not really Baroque. He’s experimenting with the new Classical style that’s emerging, isn’t it? Compared to Bach it’s easy listening I really think. But it’s very skilfully composed.

Wilkinson then considered the ‘shelf-life’ of a work. Asked if music of Telemann which audiences enjoyed on first hearing, might pall or weary those who must play it many times, Wilkinson’s response is clear.

Cynthia and I [playing as Capella Corelli] were involved at one stage with Musica Viva’s school programs and we would have done 300 programs... even more really... around NSW. In that program we took a variety of Baroque [pieces] to introduce to the kids. We always played a Telemann trio sonata. We had two or three we would change. We never got sick of them. [repeating]... We never got sick of them. Three hundred playings of a work in a six-week period. I think that says a lot. Sometimes we might have got a bit... blasé about playing them because we were just plain tired... three concerts a day... but our love of the music never waned. I think that says something about their strength. We often revisit those particular sonatas and find new things and they’re quite virtuosic too. They require a lot of skill to do, in the semiquaver
passages. The interpretation of them is interesting. Like in the flute Fantasias there's a movement between the abstract sonata kind of movement and then the dance combined with [another] dance. I think that's part of his gift, he's able to incorporate the French influence together with the Italian influence and create this... merged style. He gets the best from both. What was being produced from the seventeenth century he takes into the eighteenth century in that high Baroque sense. I love it when he goes into a French mode. You get a Sarabande and not a Sarabanda and you get a Courante and not a Corrente. And having to interpret that through Telemann's music, I think that's really interesting.

In preparing for the interview, Wilkinson recalled how much of Telemann’s chamber works she has played over her career.

Yes, the Paris Quartets which I've also done with that group, Capella Corelli with visiting flute players over the years. I've played a lot of those. I've played a lot of those with Greg [Dikmans] in the past, not so much recently... Greg has also played the A-minor suite. I've been in the orchestra when he's played that... He's played it on recorder. And I have also played the flute Fantasias for many, many years on the recorder in the transposed versions and then in later years on the voice flute [also known as the flûte d'voix in D], because I have a voice flute now which enables me to play in the original keys which is much more satisfying.

Subtleties of temperament or early systems of tuning with which historical practice performers must contend are sometimes an unnoticed element of their playing. For Wilkinson, however, they seem to present almost a secret delight.

I now... now being about ten years ago... I can play these flute Fantasias at the proper pitch and, of course, I prefer to do that. Because, as you well know, the concept of key in the Baroque is important. If you are playing in F minor... is it Mattheson [Johann Mattheson 1681-1764] who tells us the colours of keys and the mood, the Affekt and the mood of the keys?... that depends upon what temperament you are playing in. I’m conscious of that... so with Telemann... You know that beautiful recorder sonata, it’s in der Getreue Musik-Meister, the F minor one that’s supposed to be for bassoon? [sings]... marked Triste and that's in F minor... We don't play in equal temperament so you can then indulge in the meaning of what these keys are. F minor is, say, in a Werckmeister or a Kirnberger tuning... does have some really quirky colours to it. So if you play the transposed version of a F-Minor Fantasia on the flute you don’t get that colour sense. It’s quite a sophisticated level of thinking about the Fantasias but I do think the keys are very relevant. So now I can play them in the proper keys. I do play them a lot. I love to play the violin Fantasias too. There are twelve Fantasias for violin. [She drops her voice as if telling a secret.] They're really interesting works. They fit on the voice flute.

Wilkinson and her friend, the baroque violinist Cynthia O'Brien, continue working through Telemann’s duos (in seven sets ranging from 1727 to 1759) for tours several seasons ahead.
We’ve spent days together playing all the Canonic Sonatas. Every single duo we can put our hands on. We’ve got a pile [of them], you know... the Berlin duos, there’s so many different collections of duos that Telemann wrote. The Berlin duos, they’re later. They’re very classical and very wide range... a huge range, much more that then the earlier works... Yes, they are traverso works but we do a lot of them for violin and voice flute. As I said, Cynth and I have sat in that room there [gesturing to another room] with piles of music. We’ve played through every single one of them. We’ve got ticks, we’ve got “good”, “very good”, “no this won’t work”, “maybe”, “2015 concert”, “2016” ...

The Methodical Sonatas remain an important part of her performing repertoire partly because of a consistent audience response. In considering the question whether to perform all of Telemann’s suggested ornamentation for each of the twelve slow movements or to improvise new ornamentations, Wilkinson goes with Telemann.

I have performed at least... in my performing repertoire... I would have about five of them that I get out regularly. They work well on the voice flute. I did three of them last year in a solo recital. People love them. They love the ornamentation. I do them all [all of Telemann’s ornaments]. But I just love playing them.

As the discussion broadens to consideration of the place of Telemann’s music among her students and colleagues, Wilkinson responds with an observation which clearly demonstrates her delight and passion for his music.

Yeah, yeah... All my colleagues I’ve ever played with... we all love it. Certainly the audiences do and I’ve played to a very broad audience from the fairly formal, stiff Musica Viva subscription series in the big concert halls (too big I might add) to the little, local concert. People do love it. The students love playing it. I do a lot of Telemann with my university students just to get them relaxed, to get them to enjoy their music. They’re good for sight-reading, of course. You know as a teacher [you might say], “Let’s read this in the original... transpose it a minor third.” That was my first lesson with Hans-Martin Linde. He put a Quantz duo in front of me and said, “Let’s play together.” I thought “This’ll be nice.” And I looked at it and of course [he said] “and we’ll transpose it a minor third”, with a twinkle in his eye. And I thought, jeepers, how do you do this? You know...[remembering] shrinking. As soon as he explained, being a double bass player, thank God, I could read the bass clef very well. That was such an eye-opener. So I’ve used Telemann for that purpose. It’s very much a didactic thing. He obviously was a great didactician [teacher] himself. There’s such evidence of that.

As she thinks further about the audience responses to Telemann, Wilkinson recalls European tours of Capella Corelli.
I know you are giving an emphasis on music in Australia but I have performed a lot in Europe too with Cynthia over many, many years. We’ve taken Telemann with us and surprisingly people don’t even know it in Europe as well. You know we’ve played it in Vienna, you know centre of all music, and a lot in Italy. We’ve played it in Germany. We’ve played in Belgium. We’ve played in England. Ah... not in England. The Telemann we haven’t taken to England. But certainly on the Continent, the audiences come up and are so refreshed by this lovely music. If you went to the conservatories, if you played in Basel that would be another matter, and Amsterdam and The Hague and the big centres and probably Berlin these days... Bremen. For the general public that’s going to concerts... first of all, they’re fascinated with early music. It’s still a “new” thing, unfortunately. The music speaks to people. The humour speaks to people. The melody speaks to people.

**Stephen Yates** – ‘There are some very bizarre things out there but nonetheless, that’s all right... we’re into diversity out there... can’t really go wrong with that.’

Interview recorded 28 November 2014

[The interview was recorded in the postgraduate room of the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, near Stephen Yates’s office where his job description is ‘Administrative Assistant’. With his vast knowledge of early music repertoire, his composer’s ‘ear’ and ‘eye’, and his familiarity with on-line sources for early musical manuscripts, he has expanded that role to include the sourcing of hidden or unknown repertoire and the preparation of parts and scores for the Conservatorium’s early music unit and other musical groups at the ‘Con’.

Growing up in Newcastle, New South Wales, Stephen Yates’s early awareness of music came from his mother’s singing and from his grandmother’s record collection. He recalls spending a lot of time listening to 78s records of popular classics as well as popular music of the day. Not having a piano at home, he taught himself the logic of musical notation by devising a cardboard keyboard. His first instrument, the violin, later led to playing viola and then to playing in musical groups. While he progressed well, his real love was piano. ‘I was trained as a violinist but I had a natural facility with the keyboard. I should have been a pianist actually.’ After leaving Newcastle in 1980 he came to the Sydney Conservatorium to study composition. However, like others of an independent spirit, Yates discovered this path did not suit him. ‘I didn’t drop out of composition... I dropped out of composition studies.’ He started two other tertiary programs (music education and performance studies in violin) but withdrew from these as well. Yates discovered that his independent streak opened other opportunities.

Ah... I learned very little here, in fact in all the tertiary education. I’ve always been motivated by my interests. I’ve always been that way. I began to read very, very early. That’s why I’ve got glasses. So I’ve never had any problems being motivated and it’s never left me.... I began
making a living doing... it was bits and pieces. But that’s when I realised that I really had to sort of fill in those gaps, like repertoire and what have you... consolidate I think is the term.

This consolidation was possible because he had *time*. ‘I used to do gigs for weddings and I had two Palm Court ensembles. I was unemployed for quite some time. Which was great at the time because it meant I had time to read great literature.’ He found he preferred reading eighteenth and nineteenth-century literature, especially French authors. ‘Ah... Balzac, Voltaire, Rousseau... French culture was a huge fascination. Still is... the furniture, the *objets d’art*, and the social structure and how it worked. And the political events too. And gradually tying them all in.’

Yates’s central focus remains the history of eighteenth-century Europe.

Every ten years there are significant changes. It’s a transition century. Most centuries are like that. But that eighteenth century was a particularly dramatic one, ending with a bang. And the French Revolution too was a major fascination. So yeah, I’m an eighteenth-century nerd I suppose.

Through his reading and listening, Yates built his knowledge of the musical, social, and cultural foundations of early music repertoire and history.

In those days you started with Bach, Handel.... Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven and then you went out from there... All of Haydn’s quartets and Mozart’s quartets and chamber music, yes.... And symphonies... that was a grounding. And I love score reading... to this day. It is the best thing, the most enjoyable thing I can imagine. And Vivaldi too, stood out amongst all that.

The well-known story of Telemann being offered the post of Kapellmeister at Leipzig in 1722 over one of the other candidates, J. S. Bach, was because of the Leipzig counsellors preference for music in a ‘modern’ style. Yates, too, is attracted to music which lives beyond the boundaries of the typical pantheon of greats.

I like to call myself an eighteenth-century modernist because I was interested in the *modern* music of the time. Bach doesn’t to a degree, doesn’t really ‘fit’ that bill. He just sort of stopped. And consequently is of less interest to me. But still I’m interested in what was new in music of the time... around 1730 or 1750 or 1780, that is, what was breaking the mould at each of those times.

Yates’s knowledge of the music of those times and his self-described role as a ‘bespoke’ composer has enabled him to expand his role at the ‘Con’ to include the sourcing of musical manuscripts and the preparation of performance editions (including parts and, when necessary, scores). Over many years, he has amassed a substantial collection of scores and
parts which now are supplemented by finds from on-line sources such as IMSLP (International Music Score Library Project). Working with Neal Peres Da Costa, Professor of Historical Performance, he often is given a free hand in developing a program. Yates said of the challenges:

Finding scores usually doesn’t take very long. Programming.... I don’t rush into programming. That doesn’t usually take very long. Putting a score together from a set of parts depends upon the size of the work. It could be a small string concerto of four parts. That's relatively unproblematic. Or it could be an Overture-Suite for two orchestras, six parts each. Seven movements.... which I did last year.

Like composers of the eighteenth century, he may be called on to do a little ‘adjusting’ of a work to suit a performing ensemble. ‘There’s a Vivaldi Sinfonia which only had oboes and horns, and horns we didn’t have so I composed ‘new’ parts for two flutes and two oboes. Very discretely and no one knew the difference.’ Yates has long been following changes in early music repertoire and styles of performance practice. In thinking about today’s musical world, he says:

I think we’re playing... not just Telemann’s music... but a whole range of music far better and closer to the music itself than it was in the seventies [1970s] or, indeed, the eighties, especially in string playing and in singing. In string playing a warmth... an interest in having a beautiful tone rather than this sparse over-stretched tight playing which we heard during the ‘60s and ‘70s... Harnoncourt and all that... And the vocal style too, the human warmth is coming out... a beauty of tone which may or may not be ‘authentic’. Who knows? We don’t know but it makes it much more pleasurable to listen to again and again.

No longer are early music musicians working toward one ‘authentic’ style. Yates concludes:

There’s good things in all of it, all of these approaches. I’ve just stated a particular preference on my part because I have been disappointed with some particular English performances of late. I was expecting something much more ‘interesting’ to tell you the truth. Plus, a lot of the music they play tends to be of less interest than, say, some Italians playing Tartini or Boccherini. It’s possibly an Anglo-Saxon thing too, they’ve ignored French and Italian music. Not just of the eighteenth century, nineteenth and twentieth centuries [but] also to a degree, French music. The Germans are guilty of this... The Germans are just as ego-centric too. Ideally I’d like a more cosmopolitan approach. And just let the music... ‘play itself’. It doesn’t need to be tampered with or forced. A natural performance when it speaks for itself, you know, is ideal. And some people, some groups are better than others. And there’s always a few eccentrics out there who, in my book, ‘take liberties’ with rhythm and tempo and orchestration... [Draws breath... to
express a ‘theatrical’ exasperation] ‘There are some very bizarre things out there but nonetheless, that’s all right... we’re into diversity out there... can’t really go wrong with that.’

CONCLUSION

In themselves, these summaries contribute to the cultural history of individual Australian musickers but, if considered from a wider perspective, they may be a resource for others to reflect on the ways in which a largely unnoticed web of musickers scattered over great distances can enable listeners again to hear the music of Telemann restored to its galant life.
APPENDIX C – Diagram of participant connections.

The following page illustrates, diagrammatically, connections mentioned by participants during these research interviews.
Bibliography


