WIENIAWSKI’S CONTRIBUTION TO
THE CULTURE OF EXPRESSION

Understanding The Aesthetics Of Violin
Music In The Nineteenth Century

LIESL HIGGINS

University of Sydney
2016
In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
MASTER OF MUSIC (PERFORMANCE)

By Liesl Higgins
November 2016
This is to certify that to the best of my knowledge, the content of this thesis is my own work. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or other purposes.

I certify that the intellectual content of this thesis is the product of my own work and that all the assistance received in preparing this thesis and sources have been acknowledged.

Liesl Higgins
# Table of Contents

**ABSTRACT**

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Aims of and justification for this research

1.2 Outline: content overview and chapter layout

1.3 Overview of research methods

1.4 Literature analysis

1.5 Recording analysis

1.6 Music score analysis

1.7 Performance

Chapter 2 Expression

2.1 Introduction

2.2 Early concepts of expression

2.3 Romantic attitudes to expression

2.4 Definition of expression and its elements

2.5 Confirmation from the standard violin literature

2.6 The importance of expression for violin playing

2.7 Conclusion

Chapter 3 Context

3.1 Chapter Outline

3.2 The French Revolution

3.3 The impact of Beethoven on the nineteenth century

3.4 Beethoven reception

3.5 Beethoven’s impact on composers

3.6 Beethoven’s impact on musicians in general

3.7 Beethoven’s musical significance and the characteristics of his music

3.8 Beethoven’s impact on performance

3.9 Beethoven’s impact on Wieniawski

3.10 The French school
ABSTRACT

Numerous studies relevant to Henryk Wieniawski (1835-1880) have been conducted on context and performance aesthetics, and while many recording analyses of nineteenth-century violin repertoire have been undertaken, a gap between these two approaches exists. This research aims to investigate the link between eyewitness reports of Wieniawski’s performances of his own works and early recordings of Wieniawski’s music by performing artists who were contemporaries of the composer. From this discussion we can contextualize Wieniawski’s own performances via comments made by writers of the period to the recordings mentioned as the performing artists who recorded the composer’s works had a direct connection with Wieniawski. Based on concert reports, numerous eyewitnesses attested to the profound expressiveness of Wieniawski’s playing style. This study therefore explores the aesthetics and importance of Henryk Wieniawski’s violin music, particularly in the light of selected measurable expressive devices in performance. It is informed by literature analysis, recording analysis, musical analysis and reflective practice:

(1) The literature analysis contextualises this study by providing a broader understanding. It includes the exploration of both reports from Wieniawski’s performances and other documents contextualising nineteenth-century ideals and concepts of expression.

(2) The recording analysis analyses the interpretations of selected early recordings by violinists closely connected with Wieniawski’s musical performance practice, including specific observations facilitated by Sonic Visualizer.

(3) The musical analysis briefly identifies the expressive instructions enshrined in the scores, and their implications.

(4) The performance aims to explore and demonstrate the findings of this study practically.
The outcomes of this study should provide violinists with an improved understanding of Wieniawski’s position in the nineteenth century, while offering suggestions for the performance of his music.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere and heartfelt gratitude to all those whose mentorship, guidance and encouragement have made this possible. I am greatly indebted to my academic research supervisor, Associate Professor Goetz Richter. Your words of wisdom in directing the course of this research have been invaluable. My deepest thanks is also conveyed to my violin teacher, Associate Professor Alice Waten, who has been without doubt one of the greatest musical inspirations of my life. I will also remain grateful for the other staff members of the Sydney Conservatorium who have supported me throughout this journey, especially my associate artists Dr. Jeanell Carrigan and David Miller. It has truly been a privilege working with such amazing musicians. Last, but not least, thank you to my precious family for all your musical encouragement.

Liesl Higgins
WIENIAWSKI’S CONTRIBUTION TO
THE CULTURE OF EXPRESSION

Understanding the Aesthetics of Violin
Music in the Nineteenth Century
Chapter 1
Introduction

This study aims to explore the aesthetics of nineteenth-century violin music, particularly focusing on the importance of Wieniawski’s contribution to the culture of expression. This includes an investigation of selected measurable expressive devices in the performance of Wieniawski’s violin miniatures.

1.1 Aims of and justification for this research

The primary objective of this research project is an improved understanding both of Wieniawski’s contribution to the culture of expression and of his music in the context of the aesthetics of the violin music in the nineteenth century. It includes suggestions on how this understanding might impact on musicians today. While Arcos, Guaus and Ozaslan (2012) state that “the analysis and understanding of musical expressivity is still an open research problem” (p. 65), it has increasingly been a subject of investigation, and noteworthy studies have been conducted on aspects of expression (Arcos, Guaus & Ozaslan, 2012; Henver, 1935; Schrempel, 2010; Seashore, 1938; Silveira & Diaz, 2014; Woody, 2000; etc.) and on nineteenth-century performance practice and recording analysis (Brown, 2004; Cook, 2009; Da Costa, 2012; Milson, 2003; Philip, 1992; Wilson, 2014; etc.). Extant authoritative sources relevant to nineteenth-century violin playing reveal imperative elements for violin performance (Auer, 1921; Baillot, 1834; Flesch 1930; Galamian, 1962; Spohr, 1832; etc.). Numerous relevant early recordings have been preserved (Dessau, ca. 1910; Gregorowicz, 1909; Sarasate, ca. 1905; Viardot, ca. 1910; Ysaye, 1912; etc.), and reports exist describing Wieniawski’s playing (The
However, there appears to be a gap between them. This research aims to bridge this gap, exploring the integration of aesthetic and performance studies of nineteenth-century music with contemporary reports and subsequent recordings. It is hoped that this research will give violinists an improved understanding of Wieniawski’s contribution to the culture of expression, while offering valuable suggestions relevant to the performance of his works.

1.2 Outline: content overview and chapter layout

Chapter One briefly clarifies the methodological process for this study. It introduces the four methods of investigation used together with their corresponding application.

Chapter Two explores the culture of expression, tracing some of the crucial developments relevant to nineteenth-century performance culture and elucidating the general notion of expression. Through an examination of the literature relevant to an understanding of expression, both in the nineteenth century and in recent studies, it identifies and explores some of the key measureable elements imperative to musical expression.

Chapter Three is primarily concerned with the contextualisation of this research. This includes the impact of the French Revolution on musical culture through the rise of the bourgeoisie, and in particular Beethoven’s pivotal impact on nineteenth-century musical culture as a bridge with the Romantic era. This contextualisation also includes the simultaneous establishment of the Paris Conservatoire and the development of the salon
culture. These significant developments set the stage for Wieniawski’s emergence from the Paris Conservatoire as a highly expressive violinist, whose output consisted mostly of salon works, yet whose musical career gives evidence of Beethoven’s impact on him.

**Chapter Four** focuses specifically on Wieniawski. Along with a brief outline of his career, it includes eyewitness reports of his playing. Various studies have been conducted on performance interpretation and the aspects of it that are crucial to expressive performance, and numerous reports of Wieniawski’s performances exist. This research aims to bridge the gap between these, investigating the link between contemporary eyewitness reports of Wieniawski’s performances, and putting these in context with related comments from standard contemporary violin writers to enhance understanding relevant to expression in the performance interpretation of Wieniawski’s miniatures.

**Chapter Five** includes a more detailed examination of expressive aspects in relation to Wieniawski’s miniatures via recording analysis. It compares some of the earliest preserved recordings with more recent recordings by violinists who have performed and recorded Wieniawski’s works extensively. Recordings are used in this thesis as a more recently investigated form of primary evidence.

Concluding this study, **Chapter Six** outlines how an understanding of expressivity in Wieniawski’s music might affect performers today. While suggesting the implications of this research, it also outlines scope for potential future development.


1.3 Overview of research methods

In this research, four main methods will be used: literature analysis, recording analysis, music score analysis, and performance. The following discussion briefly investigates these methods and discusses how they will interrelate within this study. As both literature analysis and music score analysis represent long-established research methods, the discussion below deals primarily with establishing the more recent approaches: recording analysis and performance. In this project, both written and aural evidence will be compared, which will in turn inform the corresponding creative work (performance).

1.4 Literature analysis

This research investigates the stylistic expression and interpretation of Wieniawski’s miniatures. It aims to establish a dialogue between recent scholarly literature and other primary literature in order to arrive at an understanding of Wieniawski’s style, along with contextual issues underpinning this understanding.

Holistic musical investigation demands an understanding of context (Milsom, 2003). Milsom (2003) acknowledges that one serious obstacle to researchers exploring historically-informed practice is the limitations in surviving evidence. In many cases, existing evidence was simply recorded when it was extraordinary in its own time. This makes it challenging at times to differentiate which historical records accurately reflect the trends of the time, and which were simply significant enough at the time to be noted. He further suggests that we are often “left with an empirically challengeable process of imaginative guesswork” (p. 2). But though such studies may raise numerous questions
due to incomplete evidence, Milsom (2003) assures us that “a fuller understanding of an historical topic is reason enough for its continued study” (p. 3). He further suggests, “The error, in such a thought-world, lies in the naïve acceptance of evidence, not in the inclusion of incomplete evidence if that is all that survives” (p. 3). In the case of this research project, *Wieniawski’s Contribution to the Culture of Expression: Understanding the Aesthetics of Violin Music in the Nineteenth Century*, there is a gap in scholarly literature and an incomplete amount of primary evidence. Hence, this study is not a comprehensive analysis of expressive interpretation for Wieniawski’s works, but simply an attempt to uncover the existing evidence, while drawing conclusions and suggestions that may be helpful to performers. The outcome of this study will not be an authentic historic performance, but hopefully a more historically informed rendition (Milsom, 2003).

Carl Flesch (1930) urges the necessity of obtaining “a knowledge of the conditions under which a composition has come into being” (p. 60). In this project, investigating these conditions includes contextualising the culture of expression of Wieniawski’s day and exploring the social and cultural changes underpinning the selected compositions. This study is supported by literature relevant to Wieniawski’s performance style, along with his position and impact in the nineteenth-century.1

Jim Samson (2008) suggests the importance of taking as a basis a broad range of material, recognising that filling spaces between works and finding strategies to connect

---

1 Flesch (1930) advises students to seriously travel this road, leading to a deeper comprehension of the epoch itself. He proposes that even a lithograph can aid in an understanding of the stylistic approach to performance. This further suggests the significance of a holistic approach in order to obtain a more comprehensive understanding of the conditions underlying the compositions’ creation. A knowledge of these conditions can in turn inform the performance of the selected repertoire (Flesch, 1930, p. 61).
them is vital in historical studies. One such approach is that of intertextuality, which explores and connects works by virtue of their similarity. Samson recognises that this can lead to significant observations regarding the influence or similarity of composers, which guides stylistic genealogies. For this project, it includes tracing the connections between Beethoven and Wieniawski. This research also includes a brief exploration of the Franco-Belgian school to place Wieniawski in stylistic context. As early as 1834 Baillot implies that this kind of thorough study of context is imperative to enriching our understanding of compositions.

Performance treatises allow us to explore stylistic principles. However, there are significant limitations with such documents. For example, since many such documents were written by outstanding musicians, it can remain difficult to fully ascertain the extent to which the principles discussed in these documents were commonly observed in ordinary practice. Also, it can be difficult to establish whether the writer is describing common practices, or prescribing how things should be done. In view of such objections, this thesis primarily explores significant treatises, which at least would have had a wide influence (Milsom, 2003).

As Wieniawski frequently performed his own compositions, we have evidence of his performance style and technique from concert reports and other contemporary written documents. Valuable written reports of Wieniawski’s playing from eyewitneses have survived to the present day (Field, 2011; “Henryk Wieniawski,” 2013; Pilatowicz, 2001; Straeten, 1968, p. 384; Suchowiejko, 2011). These reports discuss aspects of his expression, bowing technique, stylistic character and tone production (“Henryk Wieniawski,” 2013; Pilatowicz, 2001). Duleba (1984) laments, “A great deal of
contradiction among the news and information published long after an occurrence also causes difficulties in verifying the unsystematic and barely reliable records of Wieniawski’s life” (p. 7). Despite their limitations, however, these numerous reports provide clues to understanding Wieniawski’s performance interpretation.

Robin Wilson’s (2014) research involving the interpretation of nineteenth-century performance practice provides valuable support to the modern violinist. Discussing the extant characteristic performance features employed, his related research focuses especially on the German\(^2\), as opposed to the Franco-Belgian school to which Wieniawski belonged. His discussions on nineteenth-century expressive performance practices are particularly relevant, as this research explores the background of the aesthetics of the nineteenth century in relation to expression. It establishes a framework for investigating how this relates to the performance of Wieniawski’s violin works.

1.5 Recording analysis

While written reports provide valuable insight into Wieniawski’s playing style, they have significant limitations. Unfortunately there are no recordings of Wieniawski’s playing to reveal exactly how he played, since the recording era only got underway after his death in 1889; the gramophone industry was born in 1887, just two years before (Patmore, 2009). Pablo de Sarasate was one of the first violin virtuosos to appear on early gramophone recordings (Leech-Wilkinson, 2009; Woolley, 1955). Sarasate and Wieniawski shared a large overlap in their career, and were well acquainted with each other. Sarasate was commencing his career in the 1870s while Wieniawski was still

\(^2\) German violin school representative Johannes Brahms, in particular, is a principal subject of this research.
touring as a virtuoso (Nishida, 1997). 

However, although we have no recordings of Wieniawski himself, it is of interest that several of the legendary violinists from the early recording era have left us recordings of his works. The violinists chosen for this study all had significant connections with Wieniawski or with the nineteenth century and the early recording industry in the performance of Wieniawski’s works. This includes the following particularly significant violinists:

1. Karol Gregorowicz (recording date: 1909), one of Wieniawski’s students, and thus to some extent an heir to Wieniawski’s musical legacy (Grabkowski, 1996);
2. Eugène Ysaÿe (recording date: 1912), another student of Wieniawski, whose career as a violinist was highly acclaimed;
3. Paul Viardot (recording date: ca. 1910), violinist contemporary with Wieniawski whose recordings also reflect the Franco-Belgian school;
4. Pablo de Sarasate (recording date: 1904–1908), friend and contemporary of Wieniawski, the first of the great violinists to appear on early gramophone recordings;
5. Bernhard Dessau (recording date: ca. 1910), contemporary of Wieniawski;
and

---

3 Wieniawski even dedicated his second violin concerto to Sarasate.
The connection of these violinists with the nineteenth century, the early recording era and with Wieniawski himself gives these early recordings of Wieniawski’s miniatures particular significance.

This thesis will briefly explore the historiographic technique of the inclusion of sound recordings. Several scholars have recently established the significance of studying early recordings in the light of past scripted traditions, since recordings may portray what cannot be clearly expressed in written documents (Hunter, 2009). In Recordings and Histories of Performance Style (2009), Daniel Leech-Wilkinson contends that, however vivid someone’s musical imagination may be, merely looking at a score has significant limitations. The score analyst is affected by the culture of the day, and hence, as Leech-Wilkinson further observes, early recordings present the only accurate evidence of historical performance style (2009). Recordings thus appear highly relevant to an improved understanding of the stylistic and technical demands of Wieniawski’s compositions (Da Costa, 2012).

The value of analysing recordings was considered early in the history of the recording industry. For example, Fritz Kreisler’s vibrato in a recording was written about as early as 1916 (Leech-Wilkinson, 2009). However, it has not been until quite recently that the potential of this comparatively new branch of research into recordings has been explored and significant studies undertaken (Leech-Wilkinson, 2009). Philip (1992) suggests that early twentieth century recordings are important as a bridge to understanding nineteenth century performance practice as illustrated in the following quote:
“The recordings have preserved the general performance practice of the period in great detail, and the detail includes habits which are scarcely mentioned, if at all, in written documents. The recordings therefore shed light on the limitations of documentary evidence in any period, not just in the early twentieth century” (p. 1).

Neal Peres Da Costa (2012) has also investigated early recordings more recently. In this research, Peres Da Costa reveals piano performance practices of the Romantic era. With Philip he argues that an examination of the early recordings of legendary musicians is imperative to an improved understanding of a range of established performing practices of the era.

Clive Brown (2004) proposes that performance/recording research is a pathway to making discoveries and rekindling the vitality of the music. The following observations pointed out by Brown further suggest the value of examining recordings to assist in increasing the interpretative understanding of music:

(1) our preconceptions are moulded greatly by the recording studio;

(2) recordings reveal performance interpretations that were not and could not be written down in the nineteenth century; and

(3) an awareness and knowledge of the matters which could not be written down, however speculative, increases performers’ understanding of the music.

David Milsom (2003) was influenced by Clive Brown, and explores renowned written treatises together with recordings in the aim of gaining a more holistic view of these
primary sources of evidence for his research. He explores both similarities and discrepancies between the written and recorded sources, considering such aspects as phrasing and staccato/legato. Some limitations of this study include the potential bias from the author’s individual reaction to the various recordings and the poor quality of the early recordings. While for a comparatively small portion of his study Milsom also used concrete data, graphically tracking such aspects as tempo fluctuations, much of the time his research is not entirely objective.

Nicholas Cook (2009) has taken a more technologically quantifiable approach involving concrete data. While acknowledging that divergent perceptions of recording analysis exist, he investigates several specific methods with his research, exposing a musicological orientation (2009). Cook observes that recent developments in technology open up new possibilities in the manipulation of recordings, expanding the resources for study beyond merely written ones. In this research, Cook includes discussion of the software possibilities now available to recording analysts (2009, p. 221-245). As suggested by such scholars, recordings offer highly valuable insights into this research project.

1.6 Music score analysis

Over the years that followed the composition of such works as Wieniawski’s miniatures, many interpretations have been explored (Brown, 2010; Grabkowski, 1996). Clive Brown (2004, p. 62) asserts that in the later eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, composers began to become increasingly particular as to how their pieces should be performed, rather than leaving performance interpretation in the hands of the performer alone, as was often the case prior to this time. This observation suggests the importance
of an accurate understanding of the stylistic requirements in performance interpretation. Although written documents and recording analysis provide valuable information in discovering the composer’s intentions, the examination of the scores themselves must not be overlooked (Bent, 1990; Cook, 1987). Hence, the established research branch of musical analysis will be included in this study to a limited degree, aiding in a comparison of how tempi and dynamics in early recordings correspond to written score indications.

1.7 Performance

As a holistic approach to musical performance requires representation in sound, this study includes the practice and performance of selected works relevant to an understanding of Wieniawski and his contribution to the culture of expression. Such practice was officially recognised as a research methodology in the early 1990s, and since then, numerous scholars have further established and supported this (Elliott, 1991; Hamilton & Jaaniste, 2010; Haseman, 2009; Hunter, 2009; Richards, 1992; Spiller, 2009; Wyman, 2009). Lynette Hunter (2009) contends that performance can be “a medium for exploring theory” (p. 230). In this study, performance is being used as a medium to explore the theories of style in Wieniawski’s miniatures relevant to performance.

Lydia Goehr (1994) contends that the inclusion of performance itself is crucial to a complete understanding in any musical study. She suggests the importance of considering all elements of music in their interrelations, rather than only looking at literature or scores without duly considering their acoustic representations (Goehr, 1994, p. 3). This adds significance and legitimacy to the use of performance within this
research project.

A phenomenological process involving first-hand study of the music itself aids in the exploration of the chosen field of research in a way that a written or logico-verbal process cannot (Snowber, 2012, p. 54-55). While the literature analysis provides scholarly insight into the music and furnishes historical information for the research project, and while the use of analyses can add further depth and understanding to the study, the integration of the practical component within the research adds a further layer. It provides opportunity to practically explore and demonstrate key concepts supporting the expressive performance practice relevant to Wieniawski’s musical culture. The performance is also an experiment, as it investigates the validity of one way of performing these works, as informed by this research. This could include experimenting with such performance aspects as tempo and dynamics in relation to expression.

The main purposes of performance within the context of my research are summarised as follows:

(1) it is an experimental demonstration of some of the key concepts within this study relevant to expressive interpretation in Wieniawski’s music;\(^4\)

(2) it endeavours to explore expression in the performance of Wieniawski’s violin miniatures first hand through phenomenology;

(3) the use of performance, integrated with literature analysis and recording analysis, adds another dimension to this study, assisting to present a more

\(^4\) In this research, the primary aim is not to replicate nineteenth-century performance trends precisely, but simply to enhance our understanding of them, adding greater historic awareness to the performance.
holistic view of the research; and

(4) as scholars have established that performance displays that which is impossible to adequately express in words or even musical scores, the addition of performance reveals my understandings from this research through music itself (Brown, 2004; Goehr, 1994).

In addition to the performance of a combination of selected miniatures by Wieniawski, the recital programs include other compositions that hold significance for the contextualisation of this project. Many of the works featured in the recital programs are directly connected with the Paris Conservatoire and reflect the salon culture of the era. As Beethoven held a significant place in Wieniawski’s life and crucially influenced him, selected works by Beethoven are also included for performance in this project. The following chapters first aim to contextualise this study further, before exploring more specific performance aspects along with their realisation in selected recordings and their implications for performance.
Chapter 2
Expression

2.1 Introduction

In 1911, Schoenberg stressed the indispensability of musical expression to Wassily Kandinsky: “One must express oneself! Express oneself directly!” (p. 23). This key quality in music, expression, has been highlighted and discussed widely throughout history. From debates amongst Greek philosophers regarding music’s political value due to its unique moving powers, to the Council of Trent, music’s power to move has been unanimously acclaimed (Scruton, 2016). Juslin (2003) further affirms, “expressivity is largely what makes music performance worthwhile” (p. 273). This statement reflects the widespread value placed on expression in modern times. From questionnaire results amongst teachers and performers, most musicians ranked expression as the element in music of highest importance (Laukka, 2004). The following discussion explores this valued musical quality.

2.2 Early concepts of expression

From early civilisation, it was believed that an enigmatic link existed between music and passion (Scruton, 2016). The varied early discussions and theories resulting suggest that the delineations of the subject of musical expression were vague at best (Baker, 2016).
Though Aristotle proposed that music was an imitation or reflection of nature, many increasingly conceived of a superior depth in music. James Beattie (1779) contended that music’s attractiveness lay not in its imitation of nature, but in its expressive power to move the hearer.

By the end of the eighteenth century, the expressing of passions was considered the highest attribute of music (Baker, 2016). Wackenroder (1799) observed that “between the individual, mathematical tonal relationships and the individual fibres of the human heart an inexplicable sympathy has revealed itself, through which the musical art has become a comprehensive and flexible mechanism for the portrayal of human emotions” (cited in Baker, 2016).

2.3 Romantic attitudes to expression

The *Oxford Dictionary of Music* describes nineteenth-century culture as one “in whose music emotional and picturesque expression appeared to be more important than formal or structural considerations” (‘Romantic’, n.d.). This highlights the strong connection between the culture of expression and the nineteenth century. Of all forms of art and music, instrumental music had an especially intimate connection with this culture, becoming regarded as the ultimate medium for expression (Paddison, 2016). In the context of music, such Romantic ideals were supported by the unique ability of instrumental music to portray emotions without being aided or distracted by poetry or text (Hoffmann, 1810).

While inward expression was especially valued as one of the highest purposes of art, the early Romantics further viewed art as the medium through which autonomy in free
expression was attained and correspondingly communicated (Swinkin, 2015). Around the turn of the nineteenth century, the autonomy of instrumental music combined with these new conceptions of musical expression to give music a new power and authority among the arts (Paddison, 2016). Paddison (2016) observes that at this time, instrumental music “came to be regarded as the most elevated of the arts, capable of expressing feelings and ideas beyond the limits of rational knowledge.” This new eminence gave music superiority over all other branches of art (Paddison, 2016). He further observes, “What had previously been seen as a disadvantage – that music without words could not convey definite meanings – now came to be perceived as its greatest advantage over all other forms of art.” (Paddison, 2016). Instrumental music has an intimate connection with expression. Romantic ideals viewed instrumental music as in some ways the ultimate medium for expression, as it portrayed emotions without being aided or distracted by poetry or text. E. T. A. Hoffmann (1810) expresses this in his following remark: “When we speak of music as an independent art, we should properly refer only to instrumental music which, scorning the assistance and association of another art, namely poetry, expresses that peculiar property which can be found in music only. It is the most romantic of all the arts, one might almost say the only really romantic art, for its sole object is the expression of the infinite” (p. 127).

Music also became increasingly viewed as a vehicle for emotion and a tool for expressing the infinite (Paddison, 2016). The famous Romantic writer E. T. A. Hoffmann considered music as a kind of infinite realm, an abyss of indescribable feeling. He writes, “Music discloses to man an unknown kingdom, a world having nothing in common with the external sensual world which surrounds him and in which
he leaves behind him all definite feelings in order to abandon himself to an inexpressible longing” (Hoffmann, 1810, p. 127).

Around this time, many theories related to musical expression became popularised. Arthur Schopenhauer was one of the most influential figures in establishing Romantic ideas about music’s expressivity. Schopenhauer (1819) asserted that music directly expresses the Will, and has a power above any other in liberating people from its hold. According to Romantic philosophies, music also gives embodiment to the otherwise inexplicable workings of the mind (Hoffmann, 1810; Scruton, 2016).

The exploration of such theories and their philosophical orientation is beyond the scope of this research. There are more tangible aspects of musical expression that are imperative for musicians today. After clarifying the term as used in this research, some of the more measureable elements of expression will be explored in the ensuing discussion.

2.4 Definition of expression and its elements

Concurring with nineteenth-century values, Robinson (2005) asserts that music is the highest artistic form of expression. This subject of expression is a problematic one, carrying with it conflicting and rather subjective ideas. Expression is also in some ways perhaps the hardest musical quality to define, as it is influenced by many of the ‘intangibles’ of playing (i.e. such as charisma, among others). However, there are more specific measurable qualities that have been identified as features of expression, and which will be the focus of this research. Juslin (2003) confirms this, asserting that, in
spite of the mysterious caveats surrounding an understanding of musical expression, it is both a possibility and a responsibility to identify how expressive results are attained.

In various musical traditions, studies document recognisable correlations between musical emotion and definite characteristics (Bowling, Sundararajan, Han & Purves, 2012). Carl Seashore (1938), a pioneer in the area of music psychology, concluded that expression is the result of “deviation from the regular” in such aural characteristics as volume, tempo, articulation and intonation (p. 9). Juslin (2003) likewise describes musical expression as a multi-faceted phenomenon, including “stylistic unexpectedness that involves local deviations from performance conventions” (abstract). Woody (2000) endorses these conclusions although, unlike Seashore, he focuses primarily on articulation, dynamics and tempo, perhaps largely since intonation deviations (portamenti) are generally considered a somewhat old-fashioned form of expression (Wilson, 2014). Schrempel (2010) concurs with Woody, advising musicians to “highlight expressive features through deviations in tempo, dynamics, and articulation” (p. iii).

Arcos, Guaus and Ozaslan (2012) are in accordance with these concepts, drawing the following conclusions:

“When musicians play a musical piece, they depart from a musical score and incorporate a lot of nuances not explicitly written in the score. This contribution of the musicians … is known as musical expressivity” (p. 65).
Thus, expressivity can be controlled largely by the performer’s use and manipulation of selected musical aspects (Olteteanu, 2010). This conclusion is affirmed by The Oxford Dictionary of Music’s definition of ‘Expression’:

“That part of a composer’s mus. such as subtle nuances of dynamics which he has no full means of committing to paper and must leave to the artistic perception and insight of the executant” (n.d.).

2.5 Confirmation from the standard violin literature

Quotations from the standard literature of the great violin pedagogues support such conclusions. Baillot (1834) expresses similar thoughts regarding the source of power to move listeners, and warns that when such details are neglected, “even the most clear-cut piece will lose its effect” (p. 352). The famous violin teacher Leopold Auer (1921) attached great importance to expressive shading, remarking, “the greatest amount of application, the most unfailing devotion, the most imposing and comprehensive mechanical control of the violin are all of them well-nigh valueless without soul, emotion: and you can only communicate the soul of your music to your auditors through the medium of nuance, of shading” (p. 147). According to The Oxford Dictionary of Music (n.d.), the term ‘nuance’ includes the gradations or shading of speed and intensity (i.e. volume, timbre, etc.). Auer’s (1921) remarks on this suggest that not only is nuance the key to playing with soul and emotion, but that all other skills as a violinist are valueless without the possession of this musical form of communication. Auer laments, “The average young violin student does not take to heart as he should the great importance of shading, of nuance”. He further recommends, “If you want to make a really favourable impression as a performer on the violin, you must
avoid monotony” (1921, p. 147). Similarly, Flesch (1930) asserts that dynamic and agogic shadings are “the two principal factors of expressive performance” (vol. 2, p. 58).  

2.6 The importance of expression for violin playing

While the above-cited studies do not directly relate to the music of the violin, their findings are relevant and highly applicable to violinists. For the violinist, expression is particularly important. Throughout the nineteenth century, this was viewed as one of the chief objectives in string playing (Milsom, 2003). The violin was hailed the chief expressive instrument due to its exceptional expressive possibilities and capability.

Highlighting the expressive possibilities, Berlioz observed, “The violin is capable of a host of apparently inconsistent shades of expression” (cited in Auer, 1921, p. 144). Auer (1921) suggests that the violin possesses this power of expressive variety above that of

---

5 These claims are also supported by neuroscience. Music’s expressive power is the result of its direct physiological effects (Robinson, 2005). While there are compositional aspects such as pitch, harmony and tonality that can contribute to expression (Bowling, Sundararajan, Han & Purves, 2012), neurological studies prove that there are key features that remain within the more direct control of performers (Chapin, Jantzen, Kelso, Steinberg & Large, 2010; Henver, 1935; Schubert, 2004). As this research focuses on expression in performance and looks at those aspects crucial to expressive interpretation, these results are of particular interest.

Chapin, Jantzen, Kelso, Steinberg & Large (2010) identify fluctuations in timing and intensity as tools performers use to produce emotional responses. Neuroimaging confirms that these musical fluctuations produce direct effects on the brain, with results showing that fluctuations in timing and volume in music produce limbic and paralimbic activations (Chapin, Jantzen, Kelso, Steinberg & Large, 2010). Schubert (2004) also confirmed neuroscientifically that musical variables are directly related neurologically to emotional responses.

Minah Choe (2014) highlights that in the nineteenth century, tempo fluctuations were considered imperative in the expression of emotion. Such observations hold particular interest in the light of recent neurological studies. For example, Kate Henver (1935) undertook research in which the objective was to compare different aspects of expression, and their effects on listeners. According to the results of her study and that of other researchers since, it has been suggested that tempo fluctuations may hold the largest sway on emotions (Henver, 1935; Rigg, 1964; Schrempel, 2010). Along with the effect of dynamics, this has since been confirmed neurologically. From an assortment of musical variables, tempo and volume seemed to arouse over 60% of the emotional response fluctuations, suggesting that these aspects hold particular significance in the study of musical expression (Schubert, 2004).
any other orchestral instrument, giving it a great advantage. He asserts that the violinist “can run the whole gamut of emotions on its strings – if he can translate feeling into the expressional terms of dynamics and nuance, into tone graduation and the tone inflection by means of rhythm, of stress, of musical shading” (pp. 144–145). Hoffmann laments that, “The most delicate expression of which the instrument [the piano] is capable cannot give to the melody that mobile life in thousands and thousands of shadings which the bow of the violinist or the breath of the wind-instrument player is capable of giving” (Hoffmann, 1810, p. 131). Going beyond this, Auer (1921) describes wind instruments as monotonous over time, regardless of how skilled the player. He goes on to claim, in contrast, that the violin “is capable of almost limitless variety in expression, if the tones are produced by a good player” (Auer, 1921, p. 146). He further claims the violin even has an advantage over the other instruments in the string family in this regard. Indeed, he compares the expressive possibilities of the violin to the orchestra itself as a collective unit. He speaks in glowing terms of the conductor’s role in playing upon the human keyboard (i.e. orchestra), “with the whole colourful and infinitely varied tone palette of modern orchestral combination responsive to his slightest indication”, and then goes on to assert that the violinist, despite its limitations compared with that of a full orchestra, has “almost equal opportunities for variety in expression” (Auer, 1921, p. 145).

These statements highlight the vast expressive possibilities of the violin. This extraordinary expressive capacity suggests the importance that violinists explore how to tap into this dimension, in order to more fully exploit the violin’s full possibilities for expressivity. Since the violin also has such power of fine control over so many
dimensions of sound (timbre, intensity, etc.), a study of expressive elements as set out in this research has considerable relevance for violinists.

### 2.7 Conclusion

This study aims to explore some of the more specific parameters underpinning Wieniawski’s effect on audiences and which he may have used in his playing, as represented in the standard nineteenth-century violin literature, along with more recent observations made by scholarly studies. Such statements suggest that expressive deviations are fundamental to expressive performance. This chapter also affirms that ‘putting in expression’ can include the incorporation of such elements as rhythmic flexibility and dynamic deviations in instrumental practice or performance (Baker, 2016).

Research into expression can have significant implications for music education, as Juslin (2003) suggests, “Research on expression could help to render the tacit knowledge explicit” (p. 274). Expression has been a subject of investigation in several recent research projects, as this chapter has briefly touched on. But in spite of some commendable attempts, exploration of this subject has been limited. Arcos, Guaus and Ozaslan (2012) acknowledge, “the analysis and understanding of musical expressivity is still an open research problem” (p. 65). Schrempel (2010) laments that in critical thinking, musical expression has been largely ignored (Schrempel, 2010). As recently as 2014, Silveira & Diaz suggested that much more research in the field of exploring and measuring expressive outcomes is needed. Subsequent chapters (especially Chapter Five) endeavour to explore this topic further, particularly in the context of Wieniawski’s music. Juslin (2003) contends, “it is on the basis of expressive features that we prefer
one performer rather than another” (p. 273). If this is true, it carries significant implications for Wieniawski’s popularity and esteem. Though there were evidently other non-musical aspects such as showmanship that may have affected the popularity of nineteenth-century violinists, reports suggest that it was precisely Wieniawski’s expressiveness in performance that set him apart.
Chapter 3
Context

3.1 Chapter Outline

Baillot (1834) recommended, “If we wish to study an art thoroughly, we must, in order to follow its development, try as hard as possible to learn its origin and to trace all the changes that time has brought to it” (p. 6). Modern scholarship supports this, affirming that to investigate any musical topic thoroughly, an understanding of context is crucial (Milsom, 2003). The following discussion traces a thread of pivotal historic developments underpinning nineteenth-century musical culture, crucial to an understanding of Wieniawski’s music and his position in that culture. It is beyond the scope of this study to examine all of the numerous developments relevant to the nineteenth century and particularly to Wieniawski’s performance style. Instead, this chapter limits itself to an exploration of some of the most significant initial catalysts that paved the way for the increased expressivity expected both through compositional notation and expected performance practice.

The launchpad for this process is the late eighteenth-century social and political upheaval that culminated in the French Revolution and impacted massively on musical culture and aesthetics. This chapter will also include discussion of Ludwig van Beethoven (1770–1827) due to the great influence he had both on Wieniawski and on nineteenth-century composition, expressive performance practice and musical culture in general. The remaining part of the chapter will briefly discuss the establishment of the Paris Conservatoire (Cox, 2008; Rink, 2002) and the corresponding development of the
These significant backdrops set the stage for Wieniawski’s emergence as a virtuoso from the Paris Conservatoire, whose output consists mostly of salon works, although his musical performances bear witness to the impact Beethoven had on him (Cardenas, 2011; DeNora, 1995; Kerman et al, n.d.).

3.2 The French Revolution

The end of the eighteenth century was a time of great turmoil and change (Carew, 2008). Many of the developments during this time were significant in paving the way for a new and exciting musical era that erupted in the nineteenth century (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006; Ellis, 2015).

The French Revolution of 1789 significantly impacted on existing class distinctions that governed musical composition and performance (Geoffroy-Schwinder, 2015). It was stimulated by Enlightenment ideals of equality in human rights, and a strong desire to reform the social status of the people and the political status of the constitution (White, 2009). In its motto “liberty, equality, brotherhood” (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006, p. 570) many saw the hope of freedom, the eradication of social class privileges for the elite, and democratic improvement (Ellis, 2015). Though the outcome was initially delayed, many continued to cling to the hope (McClellan & Trezise, 2015). The revolution transformed society (Charlton, 1992). It disenfranchised the aristocracy and metamorphosed workers and peasants into citizens. Socially, this time saw the virtual obliteration of the peasant class and corresponding rise of the bourgeoisie (Rink, 2001). This would become fundamental both to nineteenth-century values of equality in music and to its aesthetics (White, 2009).
As rank began to fade into insignificance, musical careers were increasingly opened up to anybody with talent (Geoffroy-Schwinder, 2015). Musicians were no longer obliged to seek work through aristocratic patronage (Musgrave, 2012). Instead, they could be free agents. Emergent opportunities included music teaching and public performing for a wider audience, along with commission-based composing and fulfilling the demands of publishers (Rink, 2001).

By the mid-nineteenth century, music had risen to a central position in the arts (Bowie, 2001; Paddison, 2008). The extent of this is suggested in Walter Pater’s observation in 1877: “all art constantly aspires towards the condition of music” (p. 51). This comment reflects the enormous transformation in the status of music. Instead of being regarded as meaningless amusement, music came to be regarded as a medium to which profound significance was often attached (Paddison, 2008). Such developments were related to the revolution’s impact on the wider accessibility and increased value of arts (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006).

In short, the French Revolution\(^6\) resulted in an increasing accessibility for the arts and a democratisation of musical taste, as the middle class became the driving force behind musical life. With this rise of the bourgeoisie came many other benefits to music, including new institutions to accommodate higher learning for this class (Ellis, 2015), the rise in popularity of salon music and the new status accorded musical career

---

\(^6\) White (2009) outlines the ideals underlying the French Revolution and the music of the emergent era: “Romanticism characterised the music of the French Revolution, as the driving ideas behind both are identical, focusing on freedom, emotional liberty and the importance of the individual” (p. 14). Here, “emotional liberty” is described as one of the fundamental objectives, both of the French Revolution and of the musical culture. This further supports the notion of a musical culture dominated by expression paramount at this time. The revolution appears to have been one of the catalysts of this new culture of expression (Geoffroy-Schwinder, 2015).
possibilities (Charlton, 1992; Rice, 2010).

The culture of expression was closely related to growing cultural freedoms and the insatiable thirst of a wider class of people for entertainment and expression (Ellis, 2015). It was during the revolutionary era that the idea of enhancing music’s expressive capacities became increasingly valued (Geoffroy-Schwinder, 2015).

### 3.3 The impact of Beethoven on the nineteenth century

Crucial to the musical advances made at this time was the rise of a composer who has significantly impacted western musical culture for two hundred years: Ludwig van Beethoven (Strunk, 1998). Born in Bonn in 1770, he rapidly developed under strict musical instruction. Upon being invited to study with Haydn, Beethoven set out for Vienna in 1792 (Arnold & Cooper, n.d.). That same year, Count Waldstein made the laudatory entry in Beethoven’s album: “You will receive the spirit of Mozart from the hands of Haydn” (cited in Rosen, 1971, p. 19). Beethoven rose to be regarded as one of the greatest composers of all time (Drabkin & Burnham, et al., n.d.).

Burkholder, Grout & Palisca (2006) contend that his career and music best reflects the turbulence and change witnessed around the turn of the nineteenth century. His attitude to music also reflected Enlightenment ideals (Dennis, 2000), as he appears to have been a composer with a political agenda (White, 2009), who espoused ideals of equality and human rights (Drabkin & Burnham, et al., n.d.). During his life, these ideals permitted him to fall in love with women of the nobility, who as a commoner, he was denied the right of marrying. The pursuit of similar ideas in music appear to have been much more
successful, however, and strongly influenced the rights of the musicians who followed him. Burkholder, Grout & Palisca (2006) express this as follows:

“Beethoven, and especially the critical reaction to Beethoven, changed everyone’s idea of what a composer is and does. The image he fostered of a composer as an artist pursuing self-expression who composes only when inspired continues to hold sway” (p. 594).

Beethoven was the first significant “democratic” composer (Arnold & Cooper, n.d.). This was in marked contrast to those composers of previous times, whose output was largely determined by the demands of courts or churches. Thus, Beethoven, as a composer who broke free from this model, epitomises ideals fundamental to the French Revolution – ideals which became pivotal for nineteenth-century musical life (Drabkin & Burnham, et al., n.d.).

Hailed as “probably the most admired composer in the history of Western music” (Kerman et al., n.d.), Beethoven has been revered and even idealised as representing a significant landmark for music and its interpretation. Eastham (2007) suggests that his violin writing may be a bridge to the nineteenth century, setting the stage for the rise of an increasingly broad range of skills and expressive possibilities. Beethoven’s compositional approach, including heightened focus on expression, more detailed directions for expressive devices in the scores, and freedom in form, impacted the music of the following generations. In this way, his music represents a link to the nineteenth century and its culture of expression (Cassedy, 2010).
3.4 Beethoven reception

The history of the reception of a person or thing is the history of how that person or thing becomes a formative force (DeNora, 1995). Beethoven’s reception demonstrates the formative force he and his music have had in the history of the music and musicians that have followed his time (‘Beethoven’, 2016). Richard Taruskin (2009) in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians labels Beethoven “the most admired composer in the history of Western music.”

During Beethoven’s lifetime, his compositions were frequently performed across Europe, while the demands from publishers for new compositions increased. By the time of his death, his influence was vast. On the day of his funeral, the Viennese schools were closed, and it is estimated that twenty thousand people gathered together, including every musician, singer, actor and poet in all of Vienna. Amongst the many was violinist Rodolphe Kreutzer, one of the founders of the French violin school and Paris Conservatoire, who was chosen as a pallbearer (Scott, 1974).

The wide acclamation Beethoven received in his day has only intensified over the years and impacted countless musicians since (Burnham, 2016). Amongst violinists, the unanimous regard for Beethoven’s works can be seen in the fact that almost every great violinist since his time have performed his compositions, especially his sonatas and string quartets (Loft, 1973). But his impact extended far beyond his violin works becoming part of the standard repertoire for two hundred years.

3.5 Beethoven’s impact on composers
Given that he was regarded as the greatest composer and leading musical figure of the early nineteenth century, his impact on the nineteenth-century composers was not surprisingly enormous (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006; Notley, 2000; Wagner, 1870). Johannes Brahms, like many other nineteenth-century musicians and composers, expressed how intimidating it was living in Beethoven’s shadow (Burnham, 2016). Brahms acknowledges that he did not venture to write a symphony for many years, and only wrote his first symphony after extensive study of Beethoven’s models.

In the nineteenth century, Beethovenian models can be seen to have inspired the compositions of numerous other composers (Kerman & Tyson, 1980). Indeed, many subsequent works have been attributed to the influence of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony alone, including Brahms’s First Piano Concerto, Bruckner’s Third and Ninth Symphonies, and Mahler’s Third Symphony (Notley, 2000). As Burkholder, Grout and Palisca (2006) put it, “his influence has been virtually inescapable” (p. 572). Kerman et al. (n.d.) also observes, “scarcely any significant composer since his time has escaped his influence or failed to acknowledge it.” Of Beethoven as a source of profound inspiration, Bloomberg (2007) goes as far as to say that “Every composer after Beethoven was somehow affected by his works” (p. ii).

3.6 Beethoven’s impact on musicians in general

While the specific effects of his works on later compositions was marked, even more

---

7 Berlioz was another of the many subsequent composers whose career as a musician was radically impacted by Beethoven (McClellan & Trezise, 2015). Berlioz had focused his attention on vocal compositions, until in 1828 he listened to performances of Beethoven’s Third and Fifth Symphonies. The spellbound musician found in these works an inspiration for a new calling in his own life. Berlioz’s symphonies are a direct fruit of Beethoven’s impact on him, inspiring him with the possibilities of purely instrumental music (Notley, 2000).
significant may have been the general trend he established for future musicians. As Beethoven himself was in strong favour of social freedom and reforms, he recognised and admired those who worked to liberate people and bring about social reforms. Beethoven himself worked to liberate music and reform customs relevant to the expectations he placed on musicians.

In 1809, Beethoven’s wealthiest admirers, the Archbishop Rudolph, the Prince Lobkowitz, and the Prince Kinsky, decided to provide Beethoven with an annual grant. Thus, Beethoven became the “world’s first independent composer,” paid as a musician who was free to compose at will. Along with the ramifications of the French Revolution, this helped pave the way for one of the significant aspects of nineteenth-century musical culture, through which the middle class, rather than church and gentry, would come to dominate musical life. As one of the first “free-lance” musicians, he was among the first to take advantage of the increasing freedoms in musicians’ lives that ultimately burgeoned in the itinerant virtuoso and musical culture of the nineteenth century. In this way, Beethoven helped to set a precedent for both contemporary and future musicians, demonstrating that musicians have the liberty to choose and exploit their form of livelihood at will (Kerman et al, n.d.). Through this, an attitude of freedom was explicitly articulated, encouraged and realised.

3.7 Beethoven’s musical significance and the characteristics of his music

Some of the initial literary reactions to Beethoven’s music branded him as bizarre and complicated (Dennis, 2000). Some feared the revolutionary nature of his style could result in the ultimate destruction of musical boundaries. The strong reactions from both audiences and critics in Beethoven’s day reflected the revolutionary changes Beethoven
was making in music. Despite early responses, the initial years of the 1800s saw reactions of profound honour elicited at the mere mention of his name – a near-unanimous respect maintained by musicians, music critics and audiences (DeNora, 1995; Wallace, 1986). The brief discussion below looks at some of the specific ways Beethoven left his imprint on music and laid the foundation for the culture of expression through his deviations from previous norms and heightened encouragement of expressive devices.

(1) Expression

In his book *Music, Imagination and Culture* (1990), Nicholas Cook observes, “The significance of music lies in what we perceive as we listen to it” (p. 5). One way Beethoven molded musical perceptions was through his increased focus on expression in performance. Cassedy (2010) observes that one of the effects Beethoven had on nineteenth-century musical composition was the exploitation of increasing contrast in mood and feeling. This was appreciated and its perception further encouraged by younger contemporaries. In reference to expression, Dennis (2000) makes the following observation:

“Scholars generally agree that common perceptions of Beethoven were strikingly – and permanently – colored by his young contemporaries, the Romantics. E. T. A. Hoffmann and Bettina Brentano urged listeners to interact emotionally with music, Beethoven’s in particular, seeking and expressing soulful responses instead of merely being entertained” (p. 293).

---

8 Lockwood and Kroll (2004) make the following observation regarding the reception of Beethoven’s sonatas for piano and violin: “The first performances of these works aroused strong reactions from both audiences and critics, and their influence on later generations of performers and composers remains profound. Revered by nineteenth-century violinists and pianists, they remain classic works in the recital programs of modern performers” (p. 1).
Nietzsche (1874) argued that it was only through Beethoven that music “began to discover the language of pathos, of passionate desire, of the dramatic events which take place in the depths of man … Beethoven was the first to let music speak a new language, the hitherto forbidden language of passion” (pp. 240–241). Thus in the discussion of the musical significance and characteristics of Beethoven’s music, expression plays a significant role. Notley observes, “Composers have quoted works by Beethoven to a number of expressive ends” (2000, p. 251).

On April 7, 1853, Joseph Joachim wrote to Woldemar Bargiel, “Music is the purest expression of feeling … Beethoven is the eternal example of this. He, more than any other, has a deep understanding of the human soul” (pp. 18–19).\(^9\) According to one of Beethoven’s students, expression was one of the most crucial components in playing. Beethoven was even known to grow angry at a lack in expression, remarking that omitted notes was accidental and suggesting that these could be overlooked, while a lack of expression revealed a fundamental deficiency (Forbes, 1991).

Through this obsession with expression, his influence contributed to the rise of the nineteenth-century’s culture of expressivity (Arnold & Cooper, n.d.). At the same time, the increased aesthetic value of his compositions encouraged in nineteenth-century musical culture a greater attention to aesthetics.

**(2) Greater specificity in compositional directions**

Composers following Beethoven increasingly began to assert their new authority by requesting that their notated performance instructions be followed precisely “to the

\(^9\) This provides another link in the expressive chain: Joachim. As his comment here implies, Joachim admired and inspired expressiveness among violinists.
mark” (Goehr, 1994, p. 224). In 1826, Beethoven wrote, “the performers must now obey the ideas of the unfettered genius” (Beethoven, n.d./1951, p. 254). As Beethoven was influential in encouraging composers to be more specific in their score directions, rather than leaving many important details in the hands of the performer, this highlights the value Beethoven placed on performance and interpretation. As a result, the importance of interpretation in performance was elevated, affecting those aspects of interpretation relevant to its expressive dimension.

Among other features, specific performance directions included his characteristic dynamic grandiloquence and contrast (Notley, 2011). His imaginative phrasing combined with the new level to which he took dynamics became fundamental to the expressive culture of nineteenth-century performers.

(3) Rhythm

In performance, Beethoven is said to have valued *rubato* for expressive purposes – an aspect largely left in the hands of the performers (Frogley, 2000). Upon watching Beethoven conduct, Ignaz von Seyfried observed that he urged “an effective tempo *rubato*” (cited in Thayer, 1964, p. 371). Rosenblum (1988) contends that it was “Beethoven’s use of tempo flexibility” that “set his practice apart from that of Haydn and Mozart, who preferred mostly strict tempi.” Hence, *rubato*, characteristic of the nineteenth-century culture of musical expression, owes its origins partially to performance ideals Beethoven encouraged.

(4) Freedom of form and attitude in general

---

10 In his writings, the contemporary composer Schindler implies that he spoke with Beethoven himself on the matter of tempo flexibility, which apparently Beethoven believed to be important.
Beethoven was also known for the turbulent way he manipulated forms (Schmitt, 1990). His impact on expansion and modification of forms, especially relevant to the symphonic and sonata model, was profound (Lockwood & Kroll, 2004), and broke with established tradition, reflecting attitudes characteristic of early nineteenth-century philosophic notions of autonomy. He encouraged an attitude of freedom that would be increasingly articulated and realised by subsequent composers. Beethoven changed the way that others thought about composition as well as the way they thought about performance.

His attitudes towards freedom were also seen in his obsession with politics (Dennis, 2000). DeNora (1995) suggests that Beethoven was “a ‘revolutionary’ composer, a pivotal force in the development of music.” Robert Schaffler’s biography of Beethoven, published in 1929, bears the title “The Man Who Freed Music”, expressing just this view of Beethoven’s impact on Western music. Louis Spohr (1784–1859) described Beethoven as someone who was constantly endeavouring “to be original and to open new paths” (1865, p. 188). Liszt observed in 1855 that Beethoven undeniably launched a new musical era, one characterised by the liberation of instrumental music and a liberated exploration of music’s expressive possibilities (Hepokoski, 2001).

3.8 Beethoven’s impact on performance

Beethoven’s impact on future musicians stretching across almost two hundred years since his time has been incomparable (Dennis, 2000). Frogley (2000) asserts, “The history of performing Beethoven is in essence the history of our entire Western culture of musical performance as it has evolved since the end of the eighteenth century” (p. 255). Margaret Notley (2000) observes, “Beethoven made instrumental music seem to
matter as it had not before … And, indeed, much of music history after Beethoven reads as a series of engagements – aggressive, inspired, ironic, elegiac – with his greatness and the potential that he had revealed” (p. 239). Beethoven was in the end the catalyst for many crucial developments both on a musical and a cultural level that were central for the nineteenth century.

3.9 Beethoven’s impact on Wieniawski

Amongst those profoundly impacted by these developments was Henryk Wieniawski. Following Beethoven’s example, Wieniawski lived his entire career as an independent musician, unfettered by church or state sponsorship of his musical career. Like so many musicians before and after him, Wienawski’s career reflects the social and professional autonomy Beethoven struggled to establish for subsequent musicians and composers.

On a musical level, both were connected to the French school. As Schueneman (2004) contends, “French School violin writing influenced Ludwig van Beethoven.” Wieniawski initially attended the Paris Conservatoire, and his playing throughout the rest of his career is said to have reflected the French violin school, or more specifically, the Franco-Belgian style. The following points suggest a few of the more specific ways Wieniawski was affected musically by the culture of expression Beethoven’s music reflected.

Beethoven’s impact on musical expression in increasing the contrast of mood and depth of feeling (Cassedy, 2010) is amply borne out by Wieniawski’s performance ideals. This will be explored in more detail in future chapters. Beethoven’s music explored new
avenues of expression (Nietzsche, 1874); Wieniawski was known for his extraordinary depth of expression.

The attitude of freedom that Beethoven initiated was exemplified in Wieniawski’s compositions as well as his performance style. This freedom and imaginativeness seem also to have been displayed in his maintenance of performance ideals relevant to the culture of expression in regard to flexibility of tempo and *rubato*.

It has also been suggested that Beethoven’s exploratory violin writing represented a bridge with the nineteenth century, helping to set the stage for the subsequent broadening of violin skills (Eastham, 2007). One of the chief features of Wieniawski’s compositions is his use of exploratory violin writing.

The connection between these composers is made more evident by following observations. Wieniawski was a member of the *Beethoven Quartet Society* in London and a prolific performer of Beethoven’s works (Duleba, 1984; Schwarz & Chechlińska, n.d.). Wieniawski’s admiration is further evidenced in his arrangement of Beethoven variations (Duleba, 1984). Early in his career, Wieniawski began to perform Beethoven’s sonatas for piano and violin (Duleba, 1984). Wieniawski’s activities as a Beethoven interpreter constitutes another important link between the two composers. Wieniawski was considered an authentic interpreter of Beethoven’s works (Wechsberg, 1973). As a performer of Beethoven and as a musician who recognised the individual styles of the composers he performed, this again connotes Beethoven’s influence on Wieniawski as a performer (Wechsberg, 1973). Furthermore, as the works they play can influence performer-composers, this lends credence to Beethoven having had a specific influence on Wieniawski.
3.10 The French school

Another important discussion among the influences on Wieniawski is the establishment of the French school. After the French revolution, the newly wealthy bourgeoisie came to hold an important position in musical life, especially during the second half of the nineteenth century (Scott, 2008). One of the places where this was seen most strikingly was in France (Carew, 2008). As the bourgeoisie became responsible for music education, the decision was made to provide an institution for them to learn (White, 2009). With France being central in the new movement towards democratisation, the Paris Conservatoire was founded upon the notion of equality in rights to supply this new demand (Ellis, 2015).

Thus in the wake of the revolution, the Paris Conservatoire was established in 1795 under the direction of Bernard Sarrette (Cox, 2008; White, 2009). This conservatoire become Europe’s largest school of its kind and exercised a lastingly profound influence, coming to be regarded as paramount in influencing early nineteenth century violin playing (Rink, 2002). Sarrette was successful in initially gaining government support, marking a revolutionary point in history, and making this school symbolic not only musically, but also politically (Cox, 2008). The 600 initial fully funded students came from all over the country (Rink, 2002). The reputation of the conservatoire spread rapidly, and by the 1820s, numerous other countries followed suit (Rink, 2002).

---

11 This is due to influence of the French Revolution.

12 Other national schools soon became associated with the French School, for example, the Russian School, while the Franco-Belgian School was an offshoot of the French (Schueneman, 2004). Thus, the French School not only became initially significant itself, but also was pivotal in the development of other important schools of violin playing.
Kolneder (1998) proposes that the profusion of nineteenth-century violin compositions may be related to the establishment of such institutions.

Closely identified with the Paris Conservatoire, the French violin school holds deep historical significance for the extent of its influence on the western music of the nineteenth century, and was integral to Wieniawski’s violin style. Along with its virtuosity, the French violin school was particularly known for its increased expressive qualities (Pace, 2012).

Though he was Italian, Giovanni Viotti (1755-1824) is considered the father of the French violin school and a key to this tradition (Schueneman, 2004). Viotti himself is regarded as one of the first great violinists to use the modern Tourte bow. This bow allowed wider dynamic control and greater expression, while also facilitating increased variety in bowing strokes, thus allowing new explorations in variety and style of expression (Schueneman, 2004). Viotti came to Paris in the 1780s, shortly prior to the establishment of the Paris Conservatoire, linking him closely with the initial formation of the institution and positioning it at the centre of early nineteenth-century violin playing (Rink, 2002). Since most important violinists of the nineteenth century trace their musical roots back to Viotti in Paris, it is of particular significance for early nineteenth-century violin music (Milsom, 2003).

3.11 The Franco-Belgian School

Simultaneously with the rise of the Paris Conservatoire, Andre Robberechts (1796–1866) began establishing a school for excellence in violin playing in Belgium. Hubert Leonard (1819–1890), who had previously studied in Paris, commenced teaching here,
giving rise to the Franco-Belgian school that essentially replaced what was previously referred to as the French school (Joachim & Moser, 1905). The notion of artist-as-hero was central to the Franco-Belgian violin school, giving rise to increased demonstrations of overt virtuosity (Wilson, 2014).

With the slow pace of travel in the early nineteenth century, many different states of Western Europe had developed a notable degree of distinct individuality. This was manifested in numerous aspects of living and the arts. Music was no exception. After the impact of Nicolo Paganini, violin music became stereotyped into just two main schools: the Franco-Belgian school and the German school (Dubourg, 1836; Joachim & Moser, 1905).

While the German school generally sought to preserve established classical traditions, like Beethoven, the Franco-Belgian school was more progressive in its approach. Another disparity between the two schools was that the German school appeared to represent a more intellectual approach to violin playing than the Franco-Belgian school, which in contrast, seemed inclined to look at the rational as a more subconscious aspect of playing. It is of interest to observe that Lussy, as a representative of the ‘Franco-Belgian’ school, speaks of expressive accents as instinctive, differing somewhat from the German approach. Milsom concurs with these sentiments, observing, “It is interesting to note that Joachim’s stated properties of such accents are relatively remote, (i.e. ‘physical’ and ‘intellectual’ characteristics), whilst Lussy’s are somewhat more redolent of ‘feeling’, rather than of ‘thinking’ apparatus” (Milsom, 2003, p. 33). He further implies that this may be one of the ontological distinctions dividing the ‘German’ and ‘Franco-Belgian’ schools.
Reports acknowledge that in addition to transcendent technique, the Franco-Belgian school was known for its rich tone and deep expression, especially in the use of vibrato (Cotte, 2015). Expressive dynamics also held an integral role in the portrayal of the French style in this school (An, 2013). Foremost among the violinists demonstrating the Franco-Belgian approach to expression to an outstanding degree was Wieniawski.¹³

The effect of this violin school and its style was lasting. As the twentieth century saw increased harmonisation between styles, or as Milsom (2003) puts it, the development of “a more ‘international’ style” (p. 16), it was the Franco-Belgian style that was to endure.¹⁴

### 3.12 Smaller forms: salon music

In addition to the founding of a new music school that was to have a unique impact, Paris is further significant for its ‘salon culture’, and hence, the emergence of salon music (Rosen, 1998). The salon culture was largely a result of the Revolution and its expansion of the middle class. The word *salon* is a French word, meaning literally “a big room,” and became associated with the culture of the *nouveau riche* to invite gatherings to their drawing rooms (Taruskin, 2009). For numerous homes in this expanded middle-class, evenings became a time for music making (An, 2013). They were entertained by the famous or skilful (Nagy, 2015; Taruskin, 2009), which included performing artists being hired for their prestige or for their entertainment. This further

¹³ To be further explored in the following chapter.

¹⁴ Milsom (2003) remarks, “The style to emerge in the early decades of the twentieth century, with its greater use of vibrato and tonal beautification, owed more to later ‘Franco-Belgian’ figures” than those of the German school (p. 26).
opened the way for the success of the itinerant virtuoso, as there was now a wider public audience and more homes able to take in musicians for evening entertainments. Around this time, music also became a safe means of expressing hopes for an even greater equality and national freedom (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006).

Beethoven also features to some degree in the rise of the salon culture (Knittel, 2001). It was in Viennese aristocratic salons where Beethoven first gained his position as a truly authoritative figure, perhaps making him in a sense, the first significant salon musician. As the Viennese were influenced by France around this time, the early foundations of this salon culture can already be seen. Hence, although the salon culture was truly a child of Paris and appears to have developed independently, Beethoven is a significant figure in its early establishment.

The rise of the virtuoso was fundamental to salon culture (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006; Grabkowski, 1996; Nagy, 2015; Schwarz & Stowell, 2014). The new expectations of technical virtuosity and showmanship were often displayed in the form of salon pieces, also referred to as “genre works”, “show pieces”, “miniatures” or “character pieces”. This era saw the proliferation of such short crowd-pleasers (Rosen, 1998). This popularised form of miniature writing produced shorter compositions which often showcased dazzling display and deep lyricism (“Miniature”,...

15 This is interesting in the light of nineteenth-century salon culture which will be discussed later in this chapter. Beethoven’s connection with early salon culture is an important link to the developments of salon compositions, or miniatures, which became the basis of most of Wieniawski’s compositions.
16 It must be clarified though that in Beethoven’s time, salon culture was only in its infancy. It had yet to flourish and bring to western music its vast assortment of miniatures.
17 Salon culture became important in Paris, where Wieniawski received his early training (Taruskin, 2009). It likely left its mark on the young composer’s mind, influencing the host of short salon pieces he composed during his life.
18 Kolneder (1998) observes: “An avalanche of often trivial compositions resulted, with titles such as ‘character pieces,’ ‘romances,’ ‘elegies,’ and ‘Hungarian airs.’ ... To be sure, some of these compositions were inspired and were attractive to violinists” (p. 436).
Hence, ‘salon’ culture also affected the compositions of the era, encouraging the composition of many smaller forms, and the addition of such character pieces to performance programs. This transformation of the concert program in the nineteenth century through the inclusion of virtuoso pieces was a significant change from the previous performance culture. Taruskin (2009) styles the miniature, or “romantic fragment”, as “the most suggestively romantic statement of all.” As Harvey (2012) observes, these works “showcased a performer’s range of virtuosic techniques in an entertaining way” (p. 2). They became a typical and much loved part of the concert program, usually following the performance of a more standard concerto or sonata. Character pieces were generally relatively simple for listeners to follow, and frequently in ABA, rondo, or theme and variations form (Harvey, 2012).

Popularised by salon culture, these smaller forms came to make very significant contributions to nineteenth-century musical culture, and continued to have an impact well beyond that time. Carl Flesch (1930) remarked, “We violinists … cannot exist in the concert hall without smaller forms” (p. 122). And as Flesch (1930) further observes, one of the very first to undertake “to fill the vacancy” was Wieniawski (p. 122).

3.13 Summary

This chapter has endeavoured to set the stage for some of the central developments on...
which Wieniawski’s career depended, illuminating its background. This includes Beethoven’s influence on Wieniawski, the bourgeoisie becoming the principal force behind musical life, the corresponding rise of a school to accommodate its education, and the emergence of the salon music forms which were so significant for Wieniawski’s career (Bloomberg, 2007; Suchowiejko, 2011; White, 2009). The next chapter looks more specifically at Wieniawski’s emergence on the musical scene.
Chapter 4
Henryk Wieniawski

4.1 Wieniawski’s biography

With the emergence of the nineteenth-century virtuoso era, many violinists joined the ranks of itinerant virtuosos, receiving homage and acclamation (Harvey, 2012; Taruskin, 2009). One of the most significant of these was the Belgian violinist-composer Henry Vieuxtemps (1820–1881), who would come to be regarded as the king of violinists prior to Wieniawski’s appearance (Eanes, 2014; Suchowiejko, 2011). Vieuxtemps himself was a violin student of Bériot in Paris, and studied composition with Reicha in Paris in the winter of 1835–6 (Schwarz & Hibberd, 2014). Upon returning from America in 1871 he accepted a position as Professor at the Brussels Conservatorium (Schwarz & Hibberd, 2014). After a stroke in 1873 that left him temporarily paralysed, he was obliged to resign from teaching. Henryk Wieniawski (1835–1880) was called in as a substitute teacher for him, teaching there for the next few years.²⁰

Wieniawski and Vieuxtemps were both closely associated with the Franco-Belgian School, largely based on their years of training in Paris. Subsequently, reviewers of their violin performances have observed that both virtuosos bore similarities in their

²⁰ Wieniawski taught at the Brussels Conservatoire in 1875–7 (Stowell, 2005). After limited improvement, Vieuxtemps resumed teaching in 1877–8, but resigned permanently the following year (Schwarz & Hibberd, 2014).
playing styles (Suchowiejko, 2011).\textsuperscript{21} However, historic accounts often slightly favour Wieniawski. One such account is given as follows, highlighting Wieniawski’s position as successor:

“We think that presently, Wieniawski in many respects surpasses Vieuxtemps. The latter enchants us with the power of his bow and mastery of execution, but he does not move us. In Wieniawski, aside from mastery, there burns a holy fire which draws us instinctively – here arousing anxiety and shaking our emotions, there tenderly caressing our ears. All things come to an end: Vieuxtemps long held in his hands the sceptre of the king of violinists, but now without doubt cedes it to Wieniawski” (cited in Suchowiejko, 2011, p. 29).

Henryk Wieniawski was born in Poland on July 10, 1835 (Cardenas, 2011). In 1843, at the young age of eight, four years below the minimum age required of candidates, he was admitted to the Paris Conservatoire, “enrolled by special decree as number 468 on the pupils’ register at the Conservatoire” (Grabkowski, 1996). In 1844, he joined the class of the violin teacher Lambert Massart, and grew to be known as Massart’s favourite student (Straeten, 1968).\textsuperscript{22} Wieniawski became the youngest graduate in the history of the distinguished Paris Conservatoire at the age of 11 – an age at which he was theoretically ineligible to even commence studying at the Paris Conservatoire (Duleba, 1984). The same year, he won a premier prix (Kolneder, 1998). With Anton Rubinstein as his pianist, he then toured extensively, and a year later, became chamber virtuoso in St. Petersburg for the imperial court (Cardenas, 2011; Kolneder, 1998). As

\textsuperscript{21} The two musicians even performed together. An account is given of Wieniawski playing while Vieuxtemps conducted (Flesch, 1930).

\textsuperscript{22} It has been observed that this report (Wieniawski being Massart’s favourite student) produced such admiration, that it is believed even Berlioz later put aside his unresolved quarrel with Wieniawski on these grounds (Duleba, 1984).
Serwaczyński predicted, Wieniawski quickly made a great name for himself, coming to be regarded as one of the finest violin virtuosos (Duleba, 1984). Sharing exceptional talent with Paganini, by the age of twenty-two he was hailed as “the world’s most prominent virtuoso,” with “a Lisztian talent and glorious prospects” (Kolneder, 1998; Reiss, 1931, p. 68). Another enthusiast described Wieniawski as “a man who will bear the fame of being Europe’s top violinist world-wide” (cited in Harvey, 2012, p. 61). Very early in his career, Józef Sikorski (1860) wrote in the journal The Musical Movement, “Mark my words: if you live to see it, you will witness this violinist become the stuff of legend just like Tartini and Paganini” (cited in Grabkowski, 1996).

One critic even suggested that Wieniawski was in some ways better than Paganini. Indeed, it was not too long before news about a mysterious virtuoso who was alleged to be Paganini’s successor in style and powers, spread through Europe (Duleba, 1984). Anton Rubinstein, who performed numerous times with Wieniawski, concurs, saying that he was “without doubt the greatest violinist of his time” (cited in Schwarz & Chechlinska, n.d.).

4.2 Wieniawski’s style

Wieniawski’s musical cultural heritage was diverse. He was born in Lublin, a Russian-owned part of Poland (Chechlinska et al, 2001). It is of interest to observe that in many ways, Poland was a land that had developed its own distinct musical individuality in violin playing. Geminiani (1751) observes that for hundreds of years in the history of Polish dance music, the violin was a favourite instrument. During this time, history

recalls that several unique techniques were developed and became characteristic features of this Polish style. Among these, the use of the fingernails to stop the strings was intriguing. In the time of George Philipp Telemann (1681–1767), violinists from such groups were said to play with a “barbaric beauty”. Telemann records this personally, and further observes that the violins themselves were also tuned a third higher than usual (Geminiani, 1751).

But in spite of some unusual features in traditional Polish music, the influence of such music on Wieniawski as a musician appears to have been negligible. As the “Polish salon culture” became popular in Poland around the time of Wieniawski’s birth, his numerous “salon” compositions may have been partially influenced by this. Some of the titles of his miniatures (eg. Polonaises, Kujawiak, Mazurkas, Fantasy on Polish Airs, etc.) could suggest this, and represent his Polish nationality. However, as observed in the previous chapter, the “salon” culture was an import from Paris, suggesting that the flourishing “salon culture” in Poland was perhaps largely a result of the French influence on Polish high society. In the mid-nineteenth century, it was customary for Polish violinists to travel to Paris to receive their musical education (Kolneder, 1998), and in spite of his early Polish influences, it was primarily Wieniawski’s French training at the Paris Conservatoire that influenced him as a musician (Chechlinska et al, 2001). After training with Belgian violinist Lambert Massart at the Paris Conservatoire, Wieniawski became an exponent of the Franco-Belgian violin school of playing, as represented in both his performances and his compositions (Stowell, 2005). In particular, the expressive style of the Franco-Belgian school was remarkable in Wieniawski’s playing.
4.3 Wieniawski from eyewitness reports

Eyewitnesses observed that he appeared completely at ease when playing virtuosic Paganini-style works (Cardenas, 2011). The “Constitutional Press” described him as “a most accomplished violinist”. Wieniawski was especially adept in the virtuosic use of the bow, to such an extent, that he was styled “the master of the bow” (Duleba, 1984, p. 7). Though a great master of bowing technique, he had an unconventional method of holding his right elbow high, pressing the bow with his index finger above the second joint and stiffening his arm to produce a virtuosic staccato effect (“Henryk Wieniawski,” 2013). This virtuosic staccato technique was noted to be particularly incredible for its firmness, clarity and extreme rapidity (Pace, 2012).

Despite his phenomenal technique and apparent ease in playing the most challenging passages, it is interesting to note that Wieniawski himself still regarded many of these passages as hazardous. Andreas Moser, chancing to explore Wieniawski’s room in Berlin in 1878, observed a manuscript, sprinkled with red pencil markings, with the words, “il faut risquer”, translated, “Here I must risk it.” Upon inquiry, it is of interest to observe, “Wieniawski admitted that these entries served to stimulate his daring at especially dangerous passages” (cited in Flesch, 1930, p. 106). Whether this daring added to the excitement of his performances remains unclear. Suffice it is to observe that he did not shy away from such passages, but instead showcased the compositions in a manner which captivated audiences due to his incredible bowing technique (Schwarz & Chechliniska, n.d.).

His outstanding ability technically was matched by his extreme popularity. As just one illustration of the enthusiastic favour with which he was popularly regarded, one report
observes that after one of his performances in Hamburg, the audience was so ecstatic that he was encored at least twelve times – something unusual by today’s standards (Duleba, 1984).

However, his popularity was not due merely to his breathtaking technique (Schwarz & Chechlińska, n.d.). In Wieniawski’s day, there were many technically outstanding violinists, including Vieuxtemps, Joachim and later in his career Sarasate. So what was it that distinguished Wieniawski from his contemporaries? Wieniawski possessed a power beyond display and fireworks: the power to not only dazzle, but also to emotionally move through his expressive deviations in rhythm, tone and character (Kolneder, 1998). In addition to his effortless technique and breathtaking virtuosity, Wieniawski was also known for the depth of his expression and his ability to move even initially indifferent members of the audience to tears (Silvela, 2001). Reports suggest that it was the emotional quality in his playing that set this remarkable violinist apart from the rest of the nineteenth-century virtuoso violinists (Cardenas, 2011).

Apparently, this expressive ability developed at a very early age. As a child, Wieniawski is said to have delighted guests in his mother’s house. The great poet Adam Mickiewicz, who himself was “a passionate music-lover”, is said to have listened to him during these childhood days “for hours on end” (Duleba, 1984). Henryk’s brother Julian recorded that Adam listened “with his hands on his knees, his fine head buried in his palms and tears in his eyes”.

On his first concert tour, given at the young age of 12, Vieuxtemps himself commented: “There is no doubt that this child is a genius, for at his age it would otherwise be
impossible for him to play with such passionate feeling” (cited in Suchowiejko, 2011, p. 25, ft. 4). During this same concert tour, ‘a reviewer from the “The Warsaw Courier” (1848) wrote: “Spring freshness, strength, skill and the profound emotional feeling of a mature adult vie for supremacy in his amazing playing” (cited in Grabkowski, 1996). Indeed, during his early years, some critics even suggested that his maturity was so great, so far beyond his years, that they feared for the success of his future.

During his lifetime, Henryk Wieniawski was recognised far and widely for the deep expressivity of his playing. Numerous eyewitness reports highlight this. Andreas Moser was a contemporary of Wieniawski, who had heard him perform several times. As an eye-witness of Wieniawski’s performance of *Legende*, in 1867 he gave the following report: “The piece is of little musical significance, but when he performed it, even some blasé members of the audience would soon have tears in their eyes” (cited in Kolneder, 1998, p. 417).

Numerous other eyewitness reports further highlight this deep expression. One such describes his solo playing as “incredibly emotional and imaginative”. After hearing Wieniawski one listener even remarked, “It is impossible to play with greater feeling and expression” (cited in Suchowiejko, 2011, p. 29). The violinist-composer Fritz Kreisler greatly admired Wieniawski, and recalled his emotional tone-quality, enhanced by intense vibrato, “brought to heights never before achieved” (cited in Silvela, 2001, p. 147). On 1 June 1864, *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* described Wieniawski’s performance as “remarkable not only for that dash and brilliancy which he has gained by constant solo playing, but for an amount of feeling for which we were

24 Contemporary press reports and concert reviews speak of “much feeling” marking Wieniawski’s performances (cited in Suchowiejko, 2011, p. 29).
scarcely prepared” (‘Monday Popular Concerts’, p. 305). Still another eyewitness reporter described Wieniawski as a “master of the more delicate and pathetic style wherein a good violinist so readily stirs the deepest emotions of his listeners” (*The Aldine*, 1873, p. 28). *The Aldine* (1873) also asserts, “Wieniawski is assuredly one of the greatest violinists now living, and one who combines the merits of distinct styles – classical finish, and correctness, with the freedom and feeling of the romantic school of Paganini” (p. 28).25

The *Musical Gazette* recorded that Wieniawski performed “with so much grace and expression as to justify our placing him among the first of living violinists”.26 This suggests that it was his expression, perhaps even more than his technique, which placed him in the forefront as a violinist. Later reports give evidence that this expression was a marked feature that remained with him throughout his entire career. In his later life, contemporary musician and critic Jan Kleczyński described his violin performance in the words: “it brims over with expression”. His power to shake the emotions of his listeners was one for which Wieniawski was also remembered after his death. His expression was apparently so remarkable and so characteristic of his style that in a newspaper report announcing his death, the reporter highlighted the fact that Wieniawski’s extraordinary technique was combined with feeling.

Looking at such reports, it can be established that expressivity was an integral aspect of his performances. In addition to Wieniawski’s exceptionally passionate playing and unanimously acclaimed technique, many other eyewitness accounts provide numerous

---

25 ‘Freedom’ suggests ‘deviations.’
26 “He at once established his position as a player of wonderful facility, and gave many passages with so much grace and expression as to justify our placing him among the first of living violinists” – The “Musical Gazette.”
other insights and shed light regarding other specific aspects of Wieniawski’s performance style. An array of such eyewitness reports has filtered down to the present time (Field, 2011; “Henryk Wieniawski,” 2013; Pilatowicz, 2001; Straeten, 1968, p. 384; Suchowiejko, 2011). It was further reported, among other things, that Wieniawski played with a tone which was both sweet and powerful, that he had an extremely intense vibrato, played with great beauty of sound, bringing much variety into his performance (Field, 2011; Straeten, 1968, p. 384; Suchowiejko, 2011). Toward the close of his life, *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* of March 1878 also defined Wieniawski’s “exquisite cantabile” as a distinguishing feature of his style (p. 146). This moving *cantabile* remained a feature commented on throughout his career in press reviews from many countries (Suchowiejko, 2011).27

Sam Franko, a contemporary violinist from the Paris orchestra who accompanied Wieniawski in 1878, reminisced, years after hearing Wieniawski perform:

“I was electrified by his playing. I have never heard anyone play the violin as he did, either before or since. His wonderfully warm, rich tone, his glowing temperament, his perfect technique, his captivating élan – all this threw me into a kind of hypnotic trance” (cited in “Henryk Wieniawski,” 2013).

From the research we can ascertain that above all other aspects and skills, Wieniawski’s expressive power was unrivalled and profound in audience impact. Reflecting the expressivity of the Franco-Belgian style, this quality appears to have been a significant factor in determining the popular favour in which he was held (Cardenas, 2011).

27 After an extensive study of press reports, Suchowiejko (2011) concluded, “His extraordinary feeling, charm and refinement deeply moved audiences” (p. 29).
4.4 Wieniawski’s compositions

In addition to an extensive career as a violin virtuoso, Wieniawski left a rich legacy of compositions. His compositions were described in his day as “free and original” (Shaw, 1937, p. 335). Of Wieniawski’s 24 opus groups, all contain the violin, and with only a few exceptions, most of these works are violin miniatures (Nishida, 1997). Indeed, aside from his two violin concertos, most of his compositions are shorter expressive or bravura pieces written for violin, with either piano or orchestral accompaniment. These miniature works formed an important part of Wieniawski’s career. In many of these, he displays a Paganini-style virtuosity, and as audiences expected to hear his own compositions in his performances, they display his persona and individual technical strengths (Harvey, 2012). Hence, from studying his showpieces, one might gain some understanding of his artistic idiosyncrasies. Harvey (2012) affirms that these showpieces were well received by his audiences but largely overlooked by critics, suggesting that this may represent a gap in scholarly research (Harvey, 2012).

Wieniawski’s Legende Op. 17 represents a well-known example from this category. Legende is one of the most famous of Wieniawski’s violin miniatures, and is said to be a work that every violinist has played (p. 249). It was first published in 1860, the year Wieniawski moved to St. Petersburg. It has been reported that this Romantic composition was written just prior to obtaining the permission of Isabel Hampton’s father to marry his daughter. However, these reports remain unclear and of doubtful origin (Duleba, 1984).
‘Salon culture’ was prevalent in Paris where Wieniawski received his early training (Taruskin, 2009). He developed close connections with this culture as he frequently performed chamber music in the salons of the aristocracy (Suchowiejko, 2011). Jonathan Bellman (2009) further suggests that this salon culture not only flourished in its birthplace, Paris, but also in Wieniawski’s birthplace, Poland. Wieniawski was thus exposed to it both as a child and as a student. This association with salon culture made its mark on the developing composer, influencing the host of short salon pieces he composed during his life.28

4.5 Wieniawski’s expressiveness in his compositions

Auer (1921) acknowledged that Wieniawski’s music has much more to recommend it than mere technical display implying that expressivity was characteristic of his compositions (p. 207). Throughout his music, the scores themselves include numerous indications of expressive deviations through the use of fine dynamic shadings, various instructions indicating rhythmic fluctuations, and other expressive markings. Taking for an example one of the most famous of his works, Legende, the score clearly reveals Wieniawski’s intentions. Looking through one of the first published editions of Wieniawski’s Legende from 1863 as he transcribed it for violin and piano, there are numerous indications revealing the value of expressive nuances. Along with numerous other such indications, these include the following examples:

(1) *ritard. morendo*, marking the end of a phrase, demonstrating the importance of phrasing

---

28 Wieniawski followed the new models for concert programs, especially in the inclusion of miniatures.
(2) *poco agitato*, adding increased drama and passion to a modulatory passage, reflecting the instability of the tonality.

*Figure 4.2*

(3) *expressivo* – as a simple four-note figure is repeated, the term giving meaning to the repetition, increasing its expressive intensity.

*Figure 4.3*
With the exception of the “Allegro moderato” double-stopping section in the middle, where extra score markings are comparatively sparse, the score is covered with copious rhythmic and dynamic indications. Presumably Wieniawski put them there because that was how he heard the expressive character of the piece. However, the significance of this point is lessened by the fact that the amount of such score indications differs little from many contemporaries of his day, including Vieuxtemps. Hence it was more than simply score indications that set Wieniawski’s playing apart; there must have been some quality in his playing which produced this expressive effect, which cannot perhaps be truly represented in the score alone. This raises the question of whether it was perhaps charisma or the other many intangibles of his performance. As there are no recordings of his playing to reveal how he played, such questions quickly enter the realm of speculation. Exactly what Wieniawski did is probably neither crucial to this study, neither can we establish it. However, based on the reports of his playing, combined with what we know of nineteenth-century expressive devices, it is probable that he employed similar aesthetic means.

Wechsberg (1973) observed, “Wieniawski was a modern artist: he played Mozart in the style of Mozart and Viotti in the style of Viotti, resisting the temptation to make them
all sound like Wieniawski” (p. 249). This suggests that his expressive superiority lay
not merely in such aspects as may have been determined by his score indications, but in
his actual performance style. He was clearly known for his expressive quality across a
wide range of composers, revealing that faithful interpretation must have been
important to Wieniawski and making it more imperative to attempt to recapture
assumes that the composer as the original creator is separate from the performer (as is
necessarily the case with much pre-twentieth-century music), then it is logical that the
performer should, at least in part, aim to fulfil the intentions of the composer as far as is
possible (p. 4).” In Wieniawski’s case, one of these major intentions was clearly
expression, and expressive nuances in dynamics and agogics as well as other expressive
devices must have been an integral factor in his performances.

In short, with Wieniawski’s music, the essence of successful expressive interpretation
appears to go far beyond score instructions: it lies in recapturing the spirit of expression
beyond the score. While the scores themselves reveal numerous markings suggesting
the importance to Wieniawski of intense expression, these markings still have great
limitations. Baillot (1834), acknowledging these limits and the inadequacy of merely
following marked indications, makes the following recommendation:

“Nuances should be observed with the greatest care, and when they are not
indicated, it is up to the artist’s talent to supply them. This falls into the category
of feeling ... It is less essential to fix his attention on what is written than on the
spirit, and especially on the spirit of the piece he is performing.” (p. 256) [emphasis supplied].

It is further recommended that even if violinists are unsuccessful in their attempts, “The injury done the aesthetic enjoyment of an artwork by a few not quite correctly determined phrases is insignificant compared with that arising when a specific phrasing is not attempted at all, but one follows only the composer’s dynamic indications, and even observes the measure-beat as traditionally prescribed” [emphasis supplied] (Baillot, 1834, p. 256).

It is of interest to observe that Lussy, as a representative of the Franco-Belgian school, speaks of such expressive nuances as largely subconscious and as a natural expression of feeling, in contrast to the more intellectual approach with which the German school viewed such aspects of expression. Hence, in the performance of Wieniawski’s works, representing compositions of the Franco-Belgian school from the mid-nineteenth century, it cannot be the purpose of creative performances to pre-plan every expressive device prior to the performance. Instead, the aim must be to make these expressive devices as natural and instinctive as possible. At the same time, attention should be paid to all such details, especially in examining selected recordings in conjunction with recital preparation. The resulting performance is certainly not to be looked upon as the only ‘correct’ interpretation, and this study makes no such claims. Instead, it aims to explore the expressive content in the performance of the selected works, and to provide a more informed rendition of these works in performance, with particular consideration
of the types of expressive devices\textsuperscript{29} identified as being important to a performance in Wieniawski’s ‘expressive’ style. In this sense, the performance may be regarded as an experimental demonstration of the expressive aspects explored in this research.

4.6 Wieniawski’s impact

Wieniawski did not only have a significant impact on his numerous contemporaries; his influence lasted well beyond his death. As a virtuoso of the Franco-Belgian school, who in addition to revealing a phenomenal technique also captured his audiences with an almost unparalleled depth of grace and expression, Wieniawski’s legacy lived on. Cardenas (2011) asserts that Wieniawski’s “unique style, which is apparent in his compositions, influenced musicians during his time and continues to impact violinists today.” Cardenas (2011) also remarks, “Wieniawski’s music has stood the test of time, as has his legacy as violinist and composer, and will continue to influence future violinists and prodigies all over the world.” Cardenas addresses the legacy of Wieniawski as both a composer and violinist. It is proposed that expressivity is one of the important features in his legacy as a violinist that has influenced many right through to today. Expressive deviations from the “norm”, as seen in the recordings of those who have since been influenced by him, will be explored in greater depth in the following chapter.

\textsuperscript{29} Including flexibility in rhythm, etc.
Chapter 5
Recording Analysis

Although this research does not attempt to create a specific formula regarding expression, an analysis of the expression found in early recordings can serve to heighten awareness and enhance understanding of expression in performance. This research has already established certain elements that may be highlighted to produce more expressive outcomes, including tempo and dynamic deviations. For the purpose of this study, expression is defined as deviations from regularity (Seashore, 1938). These expressive deviations include the variation of such aspects as time, dynamic, pitch and articulation (Braun, 2005). Hence, though these early performances cannot be imitated while retaining sufficient degree of naturalness, it is hoped that the following exploration of these features and their extent as displayed in early recordings will provide insights and clues to performance preparation and musical understanding.

5.1 Recordings

As we have seen, merely following score markings faithfully, under the impression that the strict adherence to these details constitutes a completely faithful rendition of the composer’s intentions, is erroneous and naïve (Wilson, 2014). Clive Brown (2013) stresses that, although Urtext scores may embody a composer’s notational intentions, even these scores fail to guarantee the full embodiment of a composer’s performance intentions. Bernard Sherman (1996) goes as far as to say, “in order to be faithful to historical practice, we would have to be unfaithful to the score” (p. 7). This may include, for example, modifying tempi for expressive purposes. To gain full insight into
the elements of expression in nineteenth-century music, one must analyse both aural as well as written music; hence the relevance of recordings for the analysis of their embodiment in early performance interpretations.\(^{30}\)

Kunits (1918) advises, “In spite of heaping the most minute suggestions to every measure and to every note of the score, the musical work of art never becomes unalterable and eternally fixed ... Minute regulation as to the last detail is neither possible nor desirable. A masterwork ‘lives’ by its interpreters and in no other way” (p. 132). Hence in making observations from recording analysis, it is not desirable to follow the minute details observed, but rather to highlight the importance of heightened freedom in expression.

Fabian (2006) maintains that early recordings were usually unedited, giving an especially “live” quality to them. In spite of the technical constraints of the early recording industry, these recordings provide great insight into the artistry of the performers (Fabian, 2006).

This chapter explores several recordings in relation to the performance interpretation of two of Wieniawski’s miniatures. His Mazurka, Op. 19, no. 1 and Legende, Op. 17 are some of the earliest and most recorded of Wieniawski’s works and hence are selected for analysis in this research. As Legende is slower and more lyrical in style compared

---

\(^{30}\) Wilson (2014) proposes that important expressive tools of the nineteenth century are often overlooked by modern performers, and that face-value understandings of nineteenth-century texts has accentuated this problem.
with the livelier Mazurka, the study of these two miniatures presents an interesting contrast in style, bringing to light a broad range of expressive elements. For both of these miniatures, three of the oldest historical recordings have been selected for analysis, as listed below:

Early recordings of Wieniawski’s Mazurka, Op. 19, no. 1:

1909 – Karol Gregorowicz (student of Wieniawski)
1912 – Eugène Ysaÿe (student of Wieniawski)
ca. 1910 – Paul Viardot (violinist contemporary with Wieniawski whose recordings also reflect the Franco-Belgian school)

Early recordings of Wieniawski’s Legende, Op. 17:

1904–1908 – Pablo de Sarasate (friend and violinist contemporary with Wieniawski)
ca. 1910 – Bernhard Dessau (contemporary of Wieniawski)
1916 – Richard R. Czerwonky (American violinist of Polish origin)

In places where more recent recordings present a relevant comparison for this discussion, these early recording are also compared with recordings by Itzhak Perlman and Ruggiero Ricci. These renowned violinists have each recorded both miniatures, and are regarded as two of the violinists to have most frequently recorded Wieniawski since the commencement of the recording industry.
Deciphering the accuracy or success of expression in performance is highly subjective (Fallows, 2016). The selected recordings were first analysed aurally in reference to the elements of expression highlighted in Chapter 2. The recordings were then imported into Sonic Visualizer, which made further detailed observations possible, measured with the higher degree of accuracy via technological means.

The following discussion primarily explores the performance interpretations of the selected performances of Wieniawski’s *Legende*, investigating and contrasting various aspects of expression. The analysis explores some of the expressive deviations throughout the chosen performances, but by no means claims to be conclusive.

### 5.2 Outlining the main expressive categories for discussion in this chapter

Although many components contribute to expression, Chapter 2 has identified measurable expressive elements that are largely within the hands of the performer. While briefly touching on other aspects identified (articulation, timbre and intonation), this chapter focuses primarily on the two features highlighted as especially significant in having most impact on expression: deviations of tempo and volume (Auer, 1921; Chapin, Jantzen, Kelso, Steinberg & Large, 2010; Flesch, 1930; Olteteanu, 2010; Seashore, 1938; Schrempel, 2010). Vibrato has also been briefly explored as an element demonstrating expressive deviation. In comparing nineteenth century recommendations relevant to performance practice, quantifiable information is at times scarce. One chief reason why the texts may appear confusing to modern scholars is that often such forms of expression were regarded as so natural in the nineteenth century that writers at times cautioned of going to extremes (Wilson, 2014). A few important aspects have been identified, which comprise the basis of the conclusions below. White (n.d.)
acknowledges that dynamic and tempo indications have represented some of the primary ways composers have sought to prescribe their ideals of expression within a given work. However, score markings have significant limitations, leaving much to the performer. Though there are essential expressive directions within compositions, Nancy Baker (2016) acknowledges that, innately in its definition, expression has to do with those elements that vary between different performers, and hence in part, represents a somewhat personal response to music. Personal responses and individuality is to be expected when comparing recordings.

5.3 Tempo and rhythmic deviations

Alterations of tempo and rhythm, considered imperative for expression, were more commonly employed and accentuated in the nineteenth century compared with modern performance (Philip, 1992; Wilson, 2014). Twentieth-century performance style has moved progressively to more consistent tempi (Sherman, 1996). This is confirmed by the selected recordings for this analysis. In comparison with the older recordings, Perlman’s and Ricci’s performances display stricter rhythm. Taking Perlman’s recording of Legende for an example, where Wieniawski indicates changes, Perlman follows these score indications faithfully. But though the overall rhythmic structure remains consistent generally, there are moments of rhythmic fluctuation, serving to add expression to particular notes or provide expressive contrast to the previous phrase. The following discussion briefly explores a few such aspects, with illustrations from the selected recordings.

Tempo modification
Fallows (2016) suggests that constant tempo adjustments can be expected in music from the second half of the nineteenth century, a period corresponding with Wieniawski’s career. This was confirmed through observations in the recording analysis. Compared with modern standards, Wieniawski’s student Gregorowicz displays extreme tempo flexibility in his recording of Wieniawski’s *Mazurka*, Op. 19, No. 1. Throughout this piece’s 96 bars for which the violin plays, 37 tempo deviations were observed, even though the score contains very few such suggestions: 4 indications in total. The additional deviations included several extended accelerandi over multiple bars, ritardandos at the end of phrases, sudden changes corresponding to harmonic progressions, and various smaller deviations.

Wilson (2014) also asserts that nineteenth-century violin performance appears to have been stamped with an outstanding degree of tempo modification, often appearing exaggerated. This is displayed in the early recordings selected for this study. Joachim and Moser (1905) place tempo modification as “the most important factor of musical performance,” asserting that without it, the performance “would be one of deadly dullness” (p. iii & 16).

5.4 Analysis of tempo deviations in the recordings

In the following example, the bar at the end of the first line is repeated four times. In the final repetition, Gregorowicz delays the plucked note by approximately one crotchet beat, creating a sense of expectation and a noticeable “deviation”.

---

31 Expressive devices, including those relevant to tempo, appear to have been often exaggerated in this time (Wilson, 2014).
In repeated passages of the Mazurka (including bars 3–6, 7–10, 14–15, etc.), Gregorowicz, Ysaye and Viardot manifest similar patterns in tempi modification. The congruence might suggest that this expression was founded on similar performance practice trends to expressively vary repeated passages.

In spite of some congruence, however, there is a high degree of individuality at many points. Taking as an example the opening 4 bars of Wieniawski’s Mazurka, as recorded by Viardot and by Ysaye, their individuality can be observed at a smaller level.

The musical score example shows these first bars:

The example below from Sonic Visualizer illustrates the first 4 bars of Viardot’s performance of the Mazurka. Each new point represents a new bar. The second (blue) layer has been added to make the precise points for the bar changes more clear visually.
To place each point with higher accuracy, the tempo of the recording was slowed down and the waveform expanded to visually clarify audible demarcations indicating a change of note at the commencement of a new bar. This was aided by visual displays indicating more precisely where the volume and articulation fluctuated, signifying the change of bow or pitch relevant to the first note of each new bar. Each new point in the example below represents a new bar line, hence comparing the overall time length for each bar:

**Figure 5.3**

Here is the same selection, highlighted to make the bars easier to see:

**Figure 5.4**
Using an expanded version on Sonic Visualizer, the precise timeframes for each indicated bar can be obtained. These results are given below, marking the commencement for the first five bars in seconds $[s.]$ (approximate values):

- **Bar 1 ~ 1.88 s.**
- **Bar 2 ~ 3.349 s.**
- **Bar 3 ~ 4.603 s.**
- **Bar 4 ~ 5.972 s.**
- **Bar 5 ~ 7.996 s.**

This makes the bars 1.469, 1.254, 1.369 and 2.024 seconds long respectively. The total combined length of the first 3 bars is 4.092 seconds – almost double the time of the fourth bar alone.

Hence, the average length of each bar in the first 3 bars is 1.364 seconds, giving bar 4 a pulse of approximately 150% the time value of the foregoing tempo. This adds the equivalent length of half a bar to bar 4, indicating, on a micro-level, Viardot’s flexibility in tempo. Through this, he extends the end of the phrase, providing a sense of partial-completion, while adding suspense that leads to the next bar.

In Ysaye’s performance of the same 4 bars, a rather different approach is taken. The example below shows the first 4 bars, with red lines marking the start of each new bar:
Again, highlighting makes the lengths visually clearer.

*Figure 5.5*

Here it is seen that Ysaye’s performance of the first 4 bars differs from Viardot. Ysaye lingers more on the first bar, as opposed to Viardot, who uses a more consistent initial tempi, with a pause on the final bar.

Like Viardot, Ysaye’s pulse is quite irregular. Ysaye lingers on the first bar, before speeding up somewhat to the tempo of the next two bars (bars 2 & 3). The overall pattern is rather different from Viardot’s rendition, as the bars are spaced differently, creating uneven bar lengths. However, the same general effect is produced: a sense of flexibility and freedom.

The new figures are given below (i.e. each number representing the time in seconds for the commencement of each bar; again, values are approximate):
Bar 1 ~ 2.017 s.

Bar 2 ~ 3.474 s.

Bar 3 ~ 4.53 s.

Bar 4 ~ 5.611 s.

Bar 5 ~ 6.938 s.

This makes bar 1 ca. 1.457 seconds long, which is very close to Viardot’s first bar length of 1.469 seconds, and relates to Ysaye’s faster tempo choice for these bars overall. Bars 2–4 of Ysaye’s recording are 1.056, 1.081 and 1.327 seconds long respectively.

In both recordings, the middle two bars are the shortest, lingering to some degree on the opening and end of the repeated passage. This suggests one general way in which a repeated passage might be modified: through tempo. In this case, this includes expressively lingering at the start and holding back or drawing out the end. While both of these violinists interpreted the first 4 bars differently, both reveal flexibility and freedom from the outset. The overall aural effect is a sense of fluidity or ‘deviation’ from strict values, enhancing expression. This is perhaps particularly relevant for these bars, due to the repetitive nature of the writing (which may in itself suggest that Wieniawski expected subtle interpretative variety in order to make such passages effective).

Around Wieniawski’s time, treatises reveal one of the general trends in the use of tempo modification: accelerandi during crescendos or climbing tessitura, and rallentendi in
antithetical passages of subsiding intensity. This is illustrated by the following example, in which an increase in tempo corresponds to climbing pitch and harmonic progressiveness. In bar 49\textsuperscript{32} of Dessau’s performance, both the violin and piano noticeably increase the tempo, moving from $\dot{i} = 60$ to $\dot{i} = 78$ between bars 48 and 49, adding a sense of urgency that corresponds with the unsettled tonality and sequentially moving harmony, as seen in the following score example.

*Figure 5.7*

This increased intensity is indicated in the score by Wieniawski’s marking: *poco agitato*, though the extent and means by which this is produced is left to the performer’s discretion.

\textsuperscript{32} Equivalent to bar 17.
Over bars 56–63 the tempo accelerates from ca. $\dot{i} = 51$ to 93. In bar 63, Dessau pulls back the tempo substantially to $\dot{i} = 70$, which is 75% of the tempo of the previous bar. This leads into bar 64, at which point he suddenly resumes a faster tempo, arriving at $\dot{i} = 90$, moving to 128% of the previous tempo. Throughout this passage, there are no score markings indicating these changes, illustrating the high degree of fluidity of the early recordings.

![Figure 5.8](image1)

*Legende, bars 63–64*

After the initially fast tempo of bar 64 ($\dot{i} = 90$), the speed winds down to ca. $\dot{i} = 79$ in the second half of the bar, before picking up speed in the subsequent bar (b. 65) to ca. $\dot{i} = 93$ and repeating the process:

![Figure 5.9](image2)

*Legende, bar 65*

In the more recent recordings, there are comparatively limited deviations from a consistent tempo. One of the most highlighted tempo modifications in these recordings is in Perlman’s recording of *Legende*, in which the *appassionato ritardando* in bar 55 is
very notably emphasised. Through use of technology, the amount can be measured more precisely. However, perhaps even more interesting is the more precise measurement obtained prior to the *appassionato ritardando*. After careful measurement and a few simple calculations, it was discovered that the tempo is reduced to approximately 78.6% of the original speed before the score indicates becoming slower. Here Perlman takes extra time, while also anticipating the score indications.

Another example of the liberty he takes with tempi, though spare in comparison to the earlier recordings, is found in the second bar (b. 146) of the *Moderato maestoso* section. Here, Perlman changes tempo from the first bar of this section (bar 145). Bar 146 is immediately significantly slower than the previous bar, sounding notably stretched out, and showing a great fluidity in tempo, appropriate to this cadenza-like section that preceding the return of the opening theme. This is an illustration of a general trait seen throughout the recordings: great expressive flexibility. The red lines in the image below represent the precise points of the first 13 quaver beats in this bar:

*Figure 5.10*

As seen, the first 9 lines are just over 0.4 of a second apart, in contrast with lines 9 and 10, which are almost 1 second apart. Lines 10 and 11 are even further apart: 1.1 seconds, making the quaver beat stretch to almost three times slower than the initial
tempo of this section. This emphasises the high *sul G* notes, affecting their expressiveness.

5.5 Rubato (tempo modification)

In 1883, the first edition of *A Dictionary of Music and Musicians* provides insight into the understanding of the term ‘rubato’ at that time:

“This (rubato *sic*) consists of a slight *ad libitum* slackening or quickening of the time in any passage, in accordance with the unchangeable rule that in all such passages any bar in which this license is taken must be of exactly the same length as the other bars in the movement, so that if the first part of the bar be played slowly, the other part of the bar must be taken quicker than the ordinary time of the movement to make up for it; and *visa versa*.”

In Perlman’s rendition, the *Allegro Moderato* section of *Legende* is played with few fluctuations until bars 126 and 127. Here Perlman builds tension by stretching the tempo, before regaining momentum in bar 128, and thus releasing the tension. The first green vertical line in the waveform image below marks the first beat of bar 126. Each successive line marks the subsequent crotchet beats. The line just before 4:39 indicates the last beat of bar 129, which is stretched somewhat, prior to hurrying the following notes. This rubato adds to the building excitement leading towards the climax.

---

33 This is given a separate entry, as tempo modification can include more general deviations, while the rubato of that era was always “balanced” (at least in theory).
In spite of a few such passages demonstrating tempo deviations in Perlman’s recording of *Legende*, Sarasate’s early recording presents a striking contrast with Perlman’s more conservative interpretation. Throughout Sarasate’s recording, there are numerous significant modifications.

For example, in bar 91, Sarasate takes time over the second double stop, then rushes the next two double stops:

*Figure 5.11*

![Figure 5.11](image)

In the image below, the beats for this bar and the previous bar (b. 90) are shown. The final point is the first beat of the next bar (b. 92). In this, the inconsistent beat values become more apparent. In the first bar, Sarasate accelerates throughout the bar. The subsequent bar is significantly stretched, before accelerating towards the end of the bar. In producing the diagram below, the pace was slowed twofold.

*Figure 5.12*

![Figure 5.12](image)

---

34 There are four beats per bar.
5.6 Asynchrony (rhythmic deviations)

Perhaps one of the most old-fashioned sounding rhythmic deviations in the early recordings is asynchrony. To modern ears, these deviations in rhythm can sometimes be heard as moving beyond expressivity to suggest lack of control. While some tempo alterations in early recordings seem coordinated in ensemble, the early recordings also display asynchrony (Wilson, 2014).

In Dessau’s recording of Legende, asynchrony is displayed between the violin and piano from the beginning of the violin entry, the piano initially appearing to play in a deliberately faster tempo. Not only is asynchrony demonstrated between the violin and piano parts, but it is also very noticeably in evidence between the pianist’s two hands at the third beat of bar 44,\textsuperscript{35} an expressive effect. What modern ears might interpret as a lack of ensemble communication or coordination may instead be a deliberate effort to create surprising and expressive deviations from the expected rhythm or pulse.

\textsuperscript{35} Equivalent to bar 12, due to the recording reduction that deleted the first entry.
In the opening bars of Ysaye’s recording of Mazurka to which we have previously referred, it is interesting to observe the asynchrony at the start of bar 5 between the commencement of the violin part and that of the piano part. The orange highlighted section (at about 7 seconds on the time scale) represents the gap between the violin entry, and that of the piano (which are both meant to commence together at the start of the bar):

![Figure 5.14](image_url)

There is 0.14 seconds between the two lines in the orange section in this example. Using the average time length for the previous 3 bars, this makes the gap in entries of this asynchrony ca. 10.6% of the bar length, a quite significant degree of asynchrony between the parts.

### 5.7 Agogic accents (rhythmic deviations)

Of these expressive deviations, it has been suggested that agogics has the most powerful effect on emotions. Riemann introduced the German term “Agogik” in 1884, but while the term was only coined towards the end of the nineteenth century, “its intended meaning is clearly being described by earlier writers, in their view of small-scale lengthening of values to stress their phrase importance” (p. 36). Joachim writes of such expression, describing the “imperceptible dwelling” on important notes, or “slight
lingering” on strong beats (cited in Milsom, 2003, p. 36). Agogic accents often served to highlight melodically or harmonically pivotal notes (Wilson, 2014).

Such lingering can be seen to various degrees in numerous places throughout the early recordings. As one of the more marked illustrations of this, Dessau lingers over the opening notes in bar 40 (upbeat to bar 41). In the image below, the first red line indicates the last crotchet beat of bar 40, the second marks the first beat of bar 41, and the third line marks the third beat of bar 41. Hence, the space between the first two red lines represents one crotchet beat, which is approximately 75% of the length of the next two crotchet beats combined, making the opening crotchet 1.5 times the length of the next beats. Such subtle deviations enhance the freedom of the performance.

Figure 5.15

In another example, in bar 138 of Sarasate’s performance of Legende, the last semiquaver is also held significantly longer.

---

36 Equivalent to bars 8 & 9, due to the reduction.
In the above waveform, the green lines indicate the minim beats, commencing in bar 137. The second minim beat of the second bar (the start of the octave leap) is brought in at less than half the value of a single crotchet beat. This allows more time for the octave leap, perhaps adding a sense of drama leading into the “appassionato” of the subsequent bar:

*Figure 5.16*

*Figure 5.17*

*Legende, bars 137-139*
5.8 Dynamic deviations

Milsom observes that in the nineteenth century, phrasing was more consciously considered than is generally the case in modern times. Comparing our modern approach with that of the nineteenth century, Milsom (2003) observes, “if the remarks upon this subject of even the most cogent treatise are compared with those of today, the reader is inevitably struck by the fact that musicians of the nineteenth century attempted to tabulate ‘rules’ regarding phrasing in a way that is now virtually absent ... Thus, it might be suggested that nineteenth-century phrasing was conscientiously observed, an idea that implies not only a more thoughtful approach, but also a more detailed reading of phrasing in which light and shade combine” (p. 44). This suggests the importance of conscious consideration in performance of the works of this era. This thoughtful approach is imperative in the interpretation of nineteenth-century music. At the same time however, instinctive freedom in expression was also considered essential to true expression. This view was especially paramount in the Franco-Belgian school which Wieniawski represented.37

5.9 Analysis of dynamic deviations in the recordings

From the end of bar 16 in Ricci’s performance of Legende, there is a crescendo, even though the crescendo marked in the score does not appear until bar 5. This anticipated crescendo corresponds with the rising pitch of the notes. The general correlation between pitch and dynamic fluctuations is a frequent feature throughout. The following image commences at the end of bar 16 (i.e. the commencement of the new phrase). The

37 Instinctiveness in expression beyond the mere score was a feature of Franco-Belgian musical performance.
initial general rise and fall correlates approximately to the rise and fall of the pitch of the notes. The ‘Times Values Layer’, represented by the points connected with green lines, represents the dynamic markings in the score, as indicated by the crescendi and decrescendi. The waveform shows that each written marking has been faithfully rendered in the performance, while additional gradations are seen throughout, especially in places where the composer’s markings are sparse. The crescendo between the last two points is particularly marked, considering there are no indications either before or after it to illustrate the dynamic level. Following the crescendo, there are no further dynamic indications in the visible section in the graph below. The significant drop in volume, is indicated, however, by a “p” marking immediately following the crescendo in the piano part, and though there is no such indication in the violin score, the violin reflects this drop in volume.

In dynamic shadings, Perlman and Ricci demonstrate greater expressiveness than the early recordings, filling the performance both with subtle shadings and with significant contrasts, even when unmarked in the original score. Whether this is due primarily to the early recording facilities remains unclear, though it can be assumed that these technological elements affected dynamic deviations to some extent.
Taking Perlman’s *Legende* as an example, the following image shows the waveform for these first two phrases. The added dark purple vertical lines indicate phrase divisions in the music. While in the original score the only dynamic marking for the entire section is \( p \), as seen below, the second repetition is played at an increased dynamic level, adding increased passion to the repetition:

*Figure 5.19*

![Waveform Image]

Similar nuances in dynamics are seen throughout the whole performance.

In the earlier recordings, analysing dynamic deviations is often more problematic, largely due to significant amounts of distortion and background noise, combined with the recording limitations of the time.\(^\text{38}\) The following image is the compressed waveform for the first 2 minutes for Czerwonky’s recording of *Legende*:

\(^{38}\) The distortion and crackles affecting the waveforms, the compression limiting the dynamics, the studio process potentially producing a more mechanical performance due to the focus on accuracy, and other potential limitations, are beyond the scope of this paper to explore in detail. Suffice it is for now to recognise these limitations, and hence, the inconclusiveness in precise applications.
Compare this with the first 2 minutes for Ricci’s version of Legende:

Figure 5.20

This shows a much more marked overall shaping for this performance, compared with the Czerwonky’s recording.

Figure 5.21

The image below again shows Czerwonky’s recording of the opening line:
In this image of the opening bars in the recording, the commencement of the visible waves indicates the start of the recording (purely background noise/crackles/distortion). The first pink line indicates the piano’s entry, while the second indicates the violin’s entry. As this waveform image indicates, ironically there is actually a decrease in sound when the music starts. This illustrates how problematic it can be to use waveform images to decipher subtler dynamic shadings with any degree of accuracy.

Nevertheless, on the early recordings with clearer quality that have been preserved, the extent of the dynamic deviations suggests that this was a musical element important to these violinists. Based on the recordings, however, Sarasate appears to be an exception. Though relatively clear in sound, Sarasate’s recording of *Legende*, for example, appears aurally to be particularly lacking in dynamic shading. Schwarz & Stowell (2014) also recognise this limitation in Sarasate’s recordings. Sarasate’s playing has been further criticised for its “lack of musical insight and emotional involvement” (Schwarz & Stowell, 2014). This conservativeness may, in part, reflect his connection to the German school. This only serves to confirm the likelihood of the possibility that the Franco-Belgian performance style, as manifested in Wieniawski’s own performances, may have been enhanced by greater dynamic deviations than previously expected.
5.10 Deviations in intonation

Though other deviations are not the focus of this analysis, a few of these will be briefly touched on. Portamento was one such tool especially used for expressive purposes in nineteenth-century performance (Yoo, 2010). Louis Spohr (1832) defines its use as follows: “The artificial shifts which are not used merely on account of any easier mode of playing, but for expression and tone, to which belongs also the gliding of one note to another” (p. 179). Flesch (1924) identified a distinction between shifting for technical purposes versus expressive ones. He advises players to keep technical shifts as unobtrusive and discrete as possible, while shifts used to enhance expression were purposefully pronounced. When referring to technical shifts, Flesch (1924) identifies them as glissandi. The term portamento, on the other hand, described deliberately expressive shifts, which were more audible. Portamento is defined in the New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (1980) as “smooth and rapid ‘sliding’ between two pitches, executed continuously without distinguishing the intervening tones or semitones”.

Portamento was considered an indispensable adjunct to expressive playing during the latter nineteenth century, especially prominent in the German school (Wilson, 2014, p. 6). As Wieniawski’s performance style was unanimously regarded to be of the Franco-Belgian school, this feature is perhaps of less relevance than the other modes of expression already discussed. However, a few brief observations will be noted, based on the recordings we have discussed.
In Czerwonky’s recording of *Legende*, the sound and pitch are so distorted that subtle shades of intonation can be difficult to discern or clarify. In spite of this, throughout the recording there are several prominent examples of portamento clearly discernable. For example, in bar 14, he seems to make a real feature of portamento, similar to Dessau’s interpretation of the corresponding passage, although unlike Dessau, with little effect on overall timing.

In bar 13 of Sarasate’s performance of *Legende*, shortly after the solo violin’s entry in the score, the use of portamento sliding into the third beat delays the rhythm as it does with Dessau. This is the first of numerous examples throughout Sarasate’s recording, the recording being filled with examples. In the selected recordings, it is interesting to observe that Sarasate, despite being a representative of the German school, uses portamento more abundantly than the other violinists analysed. Schwarz and Stowell (2014) confirm these observations regarding Sarasate’s use of portamento in his recordings. This further establishes the previously stated comparison in the extent of portamento between the two violin schools.

During the early twentieth century, portamento gradually faded in importance, while vibrato increasingly became the tool that took its place.\(^{39}\) As Wieniawski was known for his vibrato and for his expression, it is possible that he displayed a more modern, expressive approach to vibrato than many of his contemporaries, which may have aided in setting him apart expressively. This could represent a fruitful subject for future

\(^{39}\) More continuous vibrato was a feature of the Franco-Belgium violin school (Pace, 2014), while portamento was more common in the German violin school (Wilson, 2014). As the Franco-Belgian became the dominant musical school over time, performance trends reflected these preferences.
research.

5.11 Vibrato

In the mid-nineteenth century, instead of the more continuous vibrato usual for today’s performers, it was quite common to commence vibrating part way through a note (Wilson, 2014). Vibrato in its modern use only became established during the latter nineteenth century.

As Wieniawski was strikingly known for both his vibrato and his expressiveness, it is possible that Wieniawski used a more modern approach to expressive vibrato. It is beyond the scope of this paper to explore this fully but a few concise observations from the recordings will be given.

In very early recordings, Wilson (2014) observed very limited application of vibrato. For example, in Joachim’s recording of the Romance in C, 27% of the total notes had vibrato, even when not taking note values faster than quavers into consideration. Including semiquavers and smaller values, it makes the total only 17% – very low by today’s standards (Wilson, 2014, p. 354).

Use of vibrato was more frequent and of a wider style in the more adventurous and progressive Franco-Belgian school, when compared with the more traditional German school (Pace, 2012). Ysaye, for instance, used quite frequent, wide vibrato. As he was a student of Wieniawski, this further suggests that Wieniawski’s approach to vibrato may also have been wider and more continuous, hence more modern, again distinguishing him from his contemporaries.
5.12 Articulation

Though it is beyond the scope of this paper to discuss the use of articulation as an expressive medium in detail, brief observations in the use of articulation for the recordings will be highlighted here. This includes variations in articulation in repeated passages, suggesting the value the early recording artists placed on variety in articulation compared to modern times. One of the more distinctive examples is seen in bars 60–63 of Dessau’s recording of *Legende*. From bar 60, Wieniawski indicates sudden increases in dynamic level at the commencement of the ensuing bars:

![Figure 5.23](image)

*Legende*, bars 60–63

Dessau uses particularly marked articulation in this section by slightly anticipating the beat through changing the bow early, then suddenly accenting the octaves part way through the note at the commencement of the beat. The effect of this is apparent in the highlighted sections of the waveform below:

![Figure 5.24](image)

---

40 In this recording, the octaves are played early, before accenting them part way through the note. It appears that this is purely for musical rather than technical reasons, due to the fact the note remains the same in the first two bars, and also given that the second repetition is accentuated further. The drop is followed by a sudden rise.
This representation shows the first two octaves in the passage, bars 60 and 61. The darker orange sections highlight the commencement of the notes just prior to the bar. The accent is enhanced by the additional weight on the upper note at the commencement of each beat, shown by the sudden increase in volume immediately after the two highlighted sections.

In early recordings, Wilson (2014) establishes a tendency to vary repetition of passages through articulation (p. 106). As such bowing characterisation was largely subjective (Wilson, 2014) it is not surprising to find a good deal of variety when comparing early recordings.

5.13 Expressive elements in combination

The above exploration has focused on individual expressive elements. It is important to establish, however, that many of the deviations observed in the recordings affect more than one element simultaneously. For example in bar 46 of Legende, Dessau expressively lingers over the shift for the last two notes, involving both deviations in intonation (portamento) and in rhythm.

Though there is a tenuto on the second note, the luxuriantly timed portamento over the last shift expressively highlights the end of the bar, setting up the next bar to die away

---

41 Equivalent bar 14.
as determined by considerations of phrasing.\textsuperscript{42} Through this, a simple succession of four notes involves deviations in tempo, dynamic and intonation working together to create an expressive effect. Wilson (2014) upholds the importance of such interrelation of expressive devices, rather than only seeing a less inclusive picture of individual elements, declaring, “It is, however, the combination of tone shading with the use of other techniques, such as portamento, vibrato and rhythmic flexibility that creates an intensely expressive result” (p. 126). Hence, though in this chapter, specific elements and passages have been briefly discussed, it must be clarified that the implications for performance affect the overall freedom in such aspects of expression.

5.14 Conclusion

Though we do not have any recordings of Wieniawski’s performances, it seems fair to assume from the comparison of reviews and recordings of those connected with him, that some of the expressive features identified in this chapter exhibit expressive practices that Wieniawski himself is likely to have used and which are therefore valuable considerations for modern performers.

Research has established the “use of these expressive devices”,\textsuperscript{43} although the extent of these has remained unclear. While expressive elements are apparent in early recordings, the extent of their use is particularly noteworthy. While this research does not assume to measure the extent of their use, it does aim to shed further light on the subject,

\textsuperscript{42} The use of portamento over the shift at a more ample tempo expressively highlights the last notes, leading into the next bar.

\textsuperscript{43} Original wording: “The extensive use of expressive devices” (Wilson, 2014, p. 359)
enhancing our understanding of the culture of expression, particularly as it applies to Wieniawski, and hence inform our modern performances of his works.
Chapter 6
Implications for performance

6.1 Creative work

The overarching objective of this thesis has been to extend research into nineteenth-century performance style with regard to its culture of expression. This study has investigated existing evidence connecting this culture with Wieniawski. Through literature and recording analysis, this paper has established the importance of expression in the performance of Wieniawski’s music through expressive deviations, especially rhythmically and dynamically. Hoffmann remarks, “The genuine artist throws himself into the work, which he first comprehends from the point-of-view of the composer, and then interprets” (Hoffmann, 1810, pp. 132–133). This is the aim in this study: to gain a deeper comprehension of Wieniawski’s point-of-view, enriching our interpretation and immersing us more deeply in his works.

While the intentions of the corresponding recitals are not to re-enact an anachronistic performance, this study aims to shed light on those elements that were crucial to nineteenth-century ideals of expression in performance, and make inroads into the largely untapped subject of Wieniawski’s relation to this culture of expression. The performances provide a subjective application, or at least a plausible one, of some of the expressive devices discussed, aiming to be historically informed to some degree, while generally preserving the characteristics of modern performances throughout. In this way, the theory and practice are interwoven. Ultimately, the creative part of this project
has assisted me in expanding my comprehension of the culture of expression of which Wieniawski was a part.

In my performance of the Wieniawski miniatures discussed, the research encouraged a heightened focus on expressive considerations. My performances represented an exploration in elements of expressive deviation through *rubato*, dynamic deviation and intonation deviation.

### 6.2 Conclusions

In the study of musical aesthetics, the expressive power of music has come under ever deeper scrutiny. This thesis has briefly explored aspects crucial to understanding the expressive value of Henryk Wieniawski’s violin music. As we have seen, numerous reports from Wieniawski’s contemporaries suggest that his playing had an exceptional emotional impact on audiences as a result of his expressive performance style and that this expressive dimension of his playing found unanimous acclaim. While it is not possible to establish the precise way in which he achieved his expressive intentions, since written reports are the only form of surviving evidence regarding his playing, there is evidence that provides insights and clues into the specifics of his expressive strategies. Though this research does not claim to be conclusive in identifying exactly how Wieniawski achieved his expressive ends, it has been able to explore aspects of his contribution to the nineteenth-century’s culture of expression.

Roger Scruton (2016) argues that expression “is integral to the aesthetic character of a piece of music”. This study has sought to uncover and explore key elements
fundamental to musical aesthetics through expression. Coming to the forefront through Beethoven, they formed an integral part of nineteenth century violin music. As these expressive possibilities were so strikingly exploited by Wieniawski (Cardenas, 2011), it underscores the significance of these possibilities in the performance of his works for modern violinists.

As Auer highlights, playing with expressive deviations is not only the key to playing with soul and emotion, but also an indispensible form of musical communication, without which all other skills as a violinist are valueless (1921). Hence, an improved understanding of expression is an essential key in the making of future great violinists, supporting the pedagogical significance of expression and creating the stimuli for future research. Among other topics, possibilities for further research include an in-depth comparison between the early recordings of his works and those of modern times, a detailed comparison between the reports of Wieniawski’s expressive playing with reports of his contemporaries’, and a closer analysis of the many other aspects of expressive performance. It is hoped that this thesis might inspire future research, while encouraging in the violinists of today a greater appreciation of, and interest in realising, the expressive demands of Wieniawski’s compositions.
APPENDIX: Final 2 Recital Programs

Friday 14 August, 2015 – 1.00pm
Verbrugghen Hall

LIESL SCHEMAN
violin

Dr. Jeanell Carrigan
piano

PROGRAM

L.V. BEETHOVEN
(1770-1827)
Violin and Piano Sonata in G Major, Op. 30, No. 3
I. Allegro assai
II. Tempo di Minuetto
III. Allegro vivace

H. VIEUXTEMPS
(1820–1881)
Violin Concerto No. 5 in A minor, Op. 37
I. Allegro non troppo - Moderato
II. Adagio
III. Allegro con fuoco
Thursday 24 March, 2016 – 12.00pm
East Recital Hall

LIESL SCHEMAN
violin

David Miller piano

PROGRAM

H. WIENIAWSKI Violin Concerto No. 2 in D minor, Op. 22
(1835–1880) I. Allegro moderato
II. Romance: Andante non troppo
III. Allegro con fuoco – Allegro moderato

L.V. BEETHOVEN Violin and Piano Sonata in C minor, Op. 30, No. 2
(1770-1827) I. Allegro con brio
II. Adagio cantabile
III. Scherzo: Allegro
IV. Finale: Allegro; Presto


Simrock.


Levinson, J. (2002). Sound, gesture, spatial imagination, and the expression of emotion in


Monday Popular Concerts. (1878). *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular, 19*(421), p. 146. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy1.library.usyd.edu.au/stable/3357473?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=Wieniawski&searchUri=%2Faction%2FdoBasicResults%3FQuery%3DWieniawski%26amp%3Bprq%3D%2528%2529%2529%2BAND%2B%2528The%2BConstitutional%2BPress%2529%2529%2BAND%2Bpt%253A%2528The%2BConstitutional%2BPress%2529%26amp%3Bgroup%3Dnone%26amp%3Bfc%3Doff%26amp%3Bwc%3Doff%26amp%3Bacc%3Doff%26amp%3Bhp%3D25%26amp%3Bso%3Dold%26amp%3Bs%26amp%3D1&seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents


Music. (1873, January). *The Aldine, 6*(1), p. 28. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy1.library.usyd.edu.au/stable/20636463?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=Wieniawski&searchUri=%2Faction%2FdoBasicResults%3FQuery%3DWieniawski%26amp%3Bprq%3D%2528%2529%2BAND%2B%2528The%2BConstitutional%2BPress%2529%29%2BAND%2Bpt%253A%2528The%2BConstitutional%2BPress%2529%26amp%3Bgroup%3Dnone%26amp%3Bfc%3Doff%26amp%3Bwc%3Doff%26amp%3Bacc%3Doff%26amp%3Bhp%3D25%26amp%3Bso%3Dold%26amp%3Bs%26amp%3D1&seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents


Nowak, A. (2001). *The Violin Concerti of Henryk Wieniawski from Style Brilliant to the
Romantic Idiom. In M. Jabłoński & D. Jasińska (Eds.), Henryk Wieniawski: Composer and Virtuoso in the Musical Culture of the 19th and 20th Centuries (P. Żebrowski, Trans.) Poznan: Rhytmos.


Books.


White, S. (2009). *Music as a Tool of Revolutions: Examining the French, Russian,


