This thesis must be used in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

Reproduction of material protected by copyright may be an infringement of copyright and copyright owners may be entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright.

Section 51 (2) of the Copyright Act permits an authorized officer of a university library or archives to provide a copy (by communication or otherwise) of an unpublished thesis kept in the library or archives, to a person who satisfies the authorized officer that he or she requires the reproduction for the purposes of research or study.

The Copyright Act grants the creator of a work a number of moral rights, specifically the right of attribution, the right against false attribution and the right of integrity.

You may infringe the author’s moral rights if you:

- fail to acknowledge the author of this thesis if you quote sections from the work
- attribute this thesis to another author
- subject this thesis to derogatory treatment which may prejudice the author’s reputation

For further information contact the University’s Director of Copyright Services

sydney.edu.au/copyright
Galant and Grotesque Aesthetics in the Musical Language of Haydn’s Cello Concerti.

*Cello Concerto in C Major* (c.1765)

*Cello Concerto in D Major* (1783)

Mee Na Lojewski

Master of Music Performance
Sydney Conservatorium of Music
The University of Sydney

2012
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements 4

Abstract 5

1. Classical Style 8
   Performance traditions; Classic and Classical concepts.

2. The Rhetoric of Attention 14
   Classical rhetoric; Rhetoric in eighteenth century instrumental music;
   Rhetorical figures in Haydn’s Cello Concerti; Harmonic expression;
   Improvisatory rhetoric: Stable and unstable elements; Musical listening.

3. The Galant Style 25
   Haydn’s biographical context; French influence on German style; Galant
   literature and the idea of a ‘middle style’; Musical features; Haydn’s
   C Major Concerto; Character contrasts and techniques of alternation
   and ellipsis; Feminine sensibility; Haydn’s D Major Concerto.

4. Grotesque Aesthetics 34
   Rhetoric of ellipsis; Grotesque origins; Eighteenth century grotesque modes.

   The Burlesque 34
   Haydn and theatre music; Social, moral and sexual subversion; Haydn’s
   burlesque rhetoric: humour, novelty, parody.

   Virtuosity 41
   Conceptions of virtue and virtuosity; Aesthetic objections to virtuosity;
   Virtuosic rhetoric in Haydn’s Cello Concerti; Mimicry.

   Sturm und Drang 46
   Germanic values and expression; Dualistic Arbitrary and Natural concepts;
   Plurality and fragmentation; Linguistic idioms in instrumental music;
(Grotesque Aesthetics cont.)

_Sturm und Drang elements in the Cello Concerti; Baroque references;
Dualistic thematic construction; Comparisons to Shakespeare._

_Fantasy_  
_Re-contextualising the Baroque; Fantasy style of C.P.E. Bach; Aesthetic debates; Influences of C.P.E. Bach on Haydn; Haydn D Major Concerto Finale; Repetition, intensification and unity; Heightened attention._

5. The Sublime  
_Creative genius and individuality; Simple and complex modes of the sublime; Galant and Grotesque equivalents; Challenging evolutionism._

List of Illustrations  
67

Bibliography  
68
Acknowledgements

I have many people to thank for their invaluable involvement in my MMus studies and the realisation of my thesis. I am most grateful to Associate Professor Dr. Goetz Richter, my primary supervisor, for his keen involvement and support of my learning, not only during my MMus, but also throughout my eleven years of study at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music. He has supplied me with continual ‘food for thought’, directed my attention at key moments to the small details as well as to the bigger picture and encouraged me to take up opportunities to develop as a musician. Susan Blake, my cello teacher since 2001, has enriched my musical studies with countless wonderful hours spent in her studio at the Con and at her home. I will always cherish her sagacious advice, generous spirit and way of bringing music to life for me. Thank you to Dr. Neal Peres da Costa, my associate supervisor. I was exposed to a new world in my undergraduate degree, participating in a semester of his Early Music Ensemble and he has since been a guiding force in my musical learning and research enquiry. My MMus performance research has been wonderfully enriched by a Year-Abroad at the Royal Academy of Music during 2010 and 2011. I am grateful to the research faculty there, in particular Dr. Rachel Baldock, for sharing her specialised knowledge of eighteenth century music. Her ideas and perspectives helped form the kernel of my thesis topic. Neil Heyde and Peter Sheppard Skaerved brought the fields of performance and research meaningfully together for me. To my parents, Christine Cornish and Steven Lojewski, I extend my deepest thanks and gratitude. For their continual support during the course of my studies and in the writing of my thesis, for challenging me and encouraging me, I cannot thank them enough.
Abstract

My performance research is motivated by my practical study of Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*. My interpretative understanding of this music, which begins in instrumental study and listening, is enriched by an exploration of its historical context. Writings on eighteenth-century music, aesthetic theory and musical criticism bring me new levels of understanding of the music of this period. As a performer I have realised that the traditional view of the ‘classical style’ of Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* is a limiting one. This view, which seems to prevail among modern cellists, suggests that there is a ‘correct’ approach to playing them. The aesthetic theories of Haydn’s time reveal that unexpected contrasts and a sense of spontaneity are much closer to the heart of his music than a striving for purity, which flattens out its expressive contrasts. An understanding of the *galant* and *grotesque* styles of Haydn’s time provides an alternative, more informative and imaginative basis for interpreting his music.

Structuring my thesis into five chapters I explore the main concepts that I see as relevant to my interpretation of Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*. These concepts are not arranged according to a chronology or hierarchy of aesthetic relevance, but rather seek to present a web of intersecting ideas that contribute to my interpretation. I introduce *classical* as a term that needs to be reconsidered in relation to this music. To understand what *classical* meant during Haydn’s time, in chapter two I look at how instrumental music used ancient classical rhetoric to develop an expression equivalent to language. Chapter three examines the *galant* style that modernised musical rhetoric in mid-eighteenth century Germany and Austria. Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* are explored in the context of the period’s salon culture and Haydn’s residency in the Austrian court. Chapter four explores the burlesque, virtuosity, *Sturm und Drang* and fantasy
as branches of the \textit{grotesque} aesthetic. Chapter five discusses the sublime in the context of creative genius and how this affected Haydn’s critical reception. In the context of eighteenth-century dualistic ideas, I explore the interaction of \textit{galant} and \textit{grotesque} aesthetics as seemingly opposite yet ultimately inseparable concepts.
Ludwig Guttenbrunn, *Portrait of Joseph Haydn* (1770 or 1791).\(^1\)

\(^1\) From Beghin and Goldberg, eds., *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2007), plate 3.
1. Classical Style

Performing Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* in different contexts and studying them with different teachers has led me to the realisation of varying opinions about the correct interpretation of these works. Modern performers seem to have a generalised understanding of the Classical and Romantic styles that derives largely from conventions of twentieth-century musicology, teaching and performing. Generally considered part of the so-called classical repertory, performances of Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* are often criticised for their overly romantic interpretation, as evidenced in the recordings by Jacqueline du Pré (1967) or Rostropovich (1975). As performers we have inherited to varying degrees, a Romantic notion of the individual artist who possesses unlimited, expressive freedom over interpretation.

The idea of unlimited interpretative freedom has been relativised by reminders about the importance of performance traditions. Nikolaus Harnoncourt (1989) discusses how early music is bound by performance traditions that are ‘as formative a factor as the manuscript of the work itself.’ He believes authentic interpretations evolve when works have been performed continuously over time. He sees performances of Beethoven’s works, which have been in circulation continuously since their first performances, as likely to achieve this authenticity. Many of J.S. Bach’s compositions, such as the *Cello Suites*, however, do not have this continuity of performance. Harnoncourt uses the example of Bach’s oratorios, which were rediscovered by Mendelssohn a century after they were composed. Thus, he sees that a performance tradition of Bach has been born out of the Romanticism of

---

Mendelssohn’s age and this still informs, to an extent, how Bach is played today. The issue of performance traditions is especially relevant to Haydn. Mark Evan Bonds (2007) argues that our understanding of Haydn has been tainted by a post-Beethovenian tradition of listening and performing. The overlap of Haydn and Beethoven’s music in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth-centuries meant that writers and musicians often compared them. Haydn represented logical, humanistic ideas and Beethoven, innovation and romantic genius. E.T.A. Hoffmann articulates this:

Haydn grasps romantically what is human in human life; he is … more comprehensible for the majority … . Beethoven’s music sets in motion the lever of fear, of awe, of horror, of suffering, and wakens just that infinite longing which is the essence of romanticism.\(^4\)

Beethoven’s significance to nineteenth-century Romanticism overshadowed Haydn’s, which has led to a limiting conception of Haydn as a classical composer. One might argue that, like Bach, Haydn and Beethoven were both subject to interpretative mediation during the nineteenth-century. Performance traditions that have developed over time have shaped these composers’ identities, perhaps even more than their music itself. Modern performance traditions of Haydn’s Cello Concerti are further affected by the fact that these works fell out of fashion for at least a century. The C Major Concerto manuscript disappeared before Haydn’s death and was only rediscovered in the 1950s. Haydn’s authorship of the D Major Concerto was also questioned in the twentieth-century, as the original manuscript was lost until the mid-1950s. The authenticity that Harnoncourt attaches to an unbroken lineage of successive performances of a work, such as Beethoven’s, is lacking in the case of


Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*. The great Romantic concerti by Brahms and Dvorak that were regularly performed throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries developed an aesthetic attitude that favoured heroic, large-scale works. Haydn’s concerti were, by comparison, considered less significant.

With the growing recognition of historically informed performance in more recent times, understanding of Haydn’s music is changing. Recordings of the *Cello Concerti* are viewed, like Bach’s complete *Cello Suites*, for their interpretative contribution to ‘early music’ style. Late twentieth century recordings by Anner Bylsma and Steven Isserlis reflect the influence of ideas that began developing in the 1970s about historical performance and the articulation of its harmony and musical rhetoric.\(^1\) Contemporary research also suggests that the generic use of the term *classical* to describe the music of key eighteenth-century composers, including Mozart, Haydn and Beethoven, is no longer supportable. Writers such as James Webster and Elisabeth Le Guin observe that the term *classical* today resembles nothing of its usage in the seventeenth or eighteenth-centuries.\(^6\) In the *Dictionnaire des beaux-arts* (1806) Aubin Louis Millin defines ‘classic’, rather than referring to style, as a ‘masterpiece’ and as such, as a model for teaching purposes.\(^7\) Later in 1841, the theorist Ferdinand Adolf Gelbecke (1812–1892) suggests that Haydn and Mozart are better described as ‘modern,’ rather than classical, in comparison to Beethoven, whom he considers ‘neo-romantic.’\(^8\)

---


\(^8\) Peter le Huray and James Day, 357.
Haydn and Mozart were not thought of as *classical* in their own time.\(^9\)

Today’s understanding of the *classical style* was established at the turn of the twentieth-century by the musicologists, Adolf Sandberger, Guido Adler and Wilhelm Fischer. Coming from an ‘evolutionist’ perspective these writers identified the qualities of the *classical style* as symmetry, coherence, rhythmic regularity, and large-scale unity.\(^10\) Webster (1991) notes that this perspective projects Haydn’s works as developing increasing maturity and objectivity. This construction of *classicism* emphasises the value of formal discipline in Haydn’s music and views experimentation and irregularity as evidence of ‘immaturity.’\(^11\)

The term *classical* has different connotations: one denotes a musical period, while another denotes, in any period or art form, a peak or pinnacle in style. As Leonard Ratner (1985) explains, any style of music can, theoretically, reach a *classical* point:

> Any perfected style in art can be called classic in the harmonious relationship of its elements and the refinement of its techniques.\(^12\)

The view of Haydn in his own time as one of the leading composers and creative geniuses of the second half of the eighteenth-century, accords his music with this *classical* status. Ratner points to the other meaning of *classical*, distinguishing the period of music represented by Haydn and Mozart, which preceded the Romantic.\(^13\)

Webster argues that this meaning, developed over a century later than the music it seeks to explain, in fact encourages conservative and ‘anti-Romantic’ interpretations.

---


\(^10\) Ibid., 348.

\(^11\) Ibid., 10.


\(^13\) Ibid., xv.
of Haydn’s music.\textsuperscript{14} Robert Donington (1973) suggests that striving for absolute authenticity in performances of early music restricts rather than enlivens it:

Any idea of absolute authenticity can only be illusory, and perhaps harmful in so far as it has encouraged a rather puritanical and quite unauthentic underplaying of baroque music (and indeed, of Haydn and Mozart) in some modern performances.\textsuperscript{15}

Approaching Haydn’s Cello Concerti through notions of \textit{classical} purity, poise and discipline would tend to underplay or even exclude the inherent idiosyncrasies of these works, for example, their capricious or improvisatory qualities. The history of performing traditions will always influence how a performer interprets Haydn’s music, but examination of the cultural and aesthetic language of Haydn’s time provides relevant interpretative insights. While one can appreciate \textit{classical} qualities in Haydn, my thesis proposes that his music is more appropriately situated within the framework of the eighteenth-century \textit{galant} style; a mainstream German style that reflected changing social and cultural values arising from the French Enlightenment. I argue that, in Haydn’s Cello Concerti, the \textit{galant} style intersects with elements of a \textit{grotesque} aesthetic that was parallel in the German cultural consciousness. I explore the interaction of \textit{galant} and \textit{grotesque} aesthetics to achieve an interpretation that I believe is truer to Haydn’s expression than one proscribed by a traditional twentieth-century conception of \textit{classical} style. The contemporary musicologists Tom Beghin and Sander Goldberg (2007) explore how music of Haydn’s time is located within a tradition of rhetoric. They show how Haydn’s music is understood more through its referencing of ancient classical rhetorical principles than through a twentieth-century conception of \textit{classical} music. The rhetorical tradition provides a fulcrum for my research of the various aesthetic and stylistic

\textsuperscript{14} Webster, \textit{Haydn’s “Farewell Symphony” and the Idea of Classical Style}, 350.
elements that are incorporated in Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*. My investigation of musical rhetoric also provides insight into the performing and listening contexts of these works.
2. The Rhetoric of Attention

In Haydn’s time musical performance was closely aligned with rhetoric and improvisation. Ancient classical rhetoric was the art of eloquent speech, which aimed to persuade the listener through a complex appeal to reason and emotion. Right up to the eighteenth-century rhetoric was a fundamental part of the European education system and applied to all forms of discourse. By the seventeenth and eighteenth-centuries it had become the basis for how music was composed, performed and understood.

The classical orators believed that spoken rhetoric should aspire to music’s ability to affect the emotions, but during the Renaissance this was reversed as music strove to create an expression equivalent to spoken rhetoric. Within the secular fashions of the Enlightenment, such as opera and salon conversation, musical rhetoric moved away from the spirituality and complexity of the Baroque towards a simpler, more accessible musical language. Eighteenth-century French writers, such as Charles Batteux and Jean-Jacques Rousseau, examined music’s place among the other art forms. Batteux considered that all art is imitative and Rousseau, that music must imitate nature to sustain the listener’s interest and pleasure. They believed that for music to be a valid form of expression like painting or poetry it needed to establish an intelligible language that conveyed emotions. Rousseau’s view that music should communicate understandable ideas and arouse feeling was based on the principles of classical rhetoric: to instruct, to please, and to move.

16 Batteux’ *Les beaux-arts réduits à un meme principe* (1746) and Rousseau’s *Dictionnaire de Musique* (1767) cited by Lisa Fishman, “‘To Tear the Fetter of Every Other Art’: Early Romantic Criticism and the Fantasy of Emancipation,” *19th Century Music* 25/1 (2001), 79.
Lisa Fishman (2001) examines the period’s emerging conception of music as a mimetic art that resides in its likeness to impassioned speech.\(^\text{17}\) She refers to the views of Haydn’s critic, Carl Friedrich Cramer, who saw music as the translation or illumination of words, and words as providing music with an object of imitation, a means for engaging reason and a basis for structure and unity.\(^\text{18}\) In Cramer’s view, music without words ‘stimulated the emotions while offering nothing for the understanding.’\(^\text{19}\) Fishman notes a shift, brought about by the proliferation of instrumental music during the second half of the century, from the belief in music’s need to represent the external world towards its emancipation from spoken language and imitation. Haydn and C.P.E. Bach’s instrumental music showed that ideas and sensations could be expressed without words and that music could develop its own language and form. In the preface to his *Trio Sonata for two violins and keyboard*, subtitled ‘*Dialogue between a Melancholicus and a Sanguineus*’ (1748), C.P.E. Bach states his intention to show that instrumental music can communicate character and dialogue effectively. This work presents the alternating emotions of two characters through the use of modulations from major to minor and contrasts of tessitura, articulation, rhythms and dynamics.

Burmeister’s *Musica Poetica* (1606) was the earliest published treatise to systematically document rhetorical figures and their musical equivalents. By Haydn’s time about three hundred ‘musico-rhetorical’ figures had been recorded in treatises. The critic, Giuseppe Carpini described one of Haydn’s symphonies according to the tradition of classical oratory:

\(^{17}\) Fishman, “‘To Tear the Fetter of Every Other Art’: Early Romantic Criticism and the Fantasy of Emancipation,” 78.
\(^{19}\) Fishman, 78.
You find in it, as in orations by Cicero, almost all rhetorical figures applied; among them are gradatio, antitheton, dubitatio, isocolon, repetitio, congeries, epilogus, synonymia, suspensia; but very special is his usage of reticentia and aposiopesis, which, when used in one of his incomparable fast movements, create a marvelous effect.  

Judy Tarling (2005) quotes a definition of *gradatio* from a mid-sixteenth century text:

Gradatio repeats what has already been said and before passing to a new point dwells on those which precede, leading by degrees and making the last word a step to further meaning.

*Gradatio* can be seen in the *Finale* of Haydn’s *D Major Concerto* where a d-note is repeated before leading chromatically to a d-sharp, which intensifies the harmonic colour before leading to a dominant chord *fermata*:

Musical example 1: *D Major Concerto*, third movement, bars 38–41.

The figure of *antitheton*, or *antithesis*, is created when two contrasting ideas are juxtaposed. Tarling notes how, in all art forms, the juxtaposing of opposites is a fundamental technique for making meaning more vivid. Alternating asymmetrical scalic and arpeggiated motifs in the recapitulation section of the first movement of the *C Major Concerto* suggest the rhetorical figure of *antithesis*. The step-wise motion of the first half of the bar juxtaposed with melodic leaps in the second half, creates a dialogue between two distinct characters:

---

22 Tarling, 202.
Musical example 2: C Major Concerto, first movement, bars 107–108.

The use of rhetorical figures that were familiar in Haydn’s time meant that fewer notations were used compared to scores from the nineteenth-century and later. Variations of melodic contour, harmony and rhythm also conveyed expression and dynamics. Harnoncourt notes how, as in speech, the repetition of motifs calls for varied expression. Slur markings imply varying articulation and dynamics as well. Harnoncourt illustrates this with a curve sign to show how the emphasis and dynamic of slurred and long notes create a ‘bell-like’ fading effect:


Paul F. Marks (1971) discusses how harmony was used to convey the dramatic principles of spoken rhetoric. A 1775 treatise describes the expressive meanings associated with keys:

Each key is either colored or not… melancholy feelings are expressed with flat keys, wild and stormy emotions with sharp keys.

C Major is completely pure. Its character is: innocence, naïveté, (child babblings.)
a minor: femininity and softness of character …
g minor: discontent, malaise, stretched into a disproportionate plane, untiring, gnawing: in a word, rancour and disgust.

Table of varying connotations associated with keys, 1691–1722.²⁶

²⁵ Friedrich Daniel Schubart’s treatise, Ideen zu einer Aesthetik der Tonkunst (Ideas on an Aesthetic of Musical Art, 1775), quoted in Marks, 52.
²⁶ From Judy Tarling, The Weapons of Rhetoric, 77.
Eighteenth-century audiences would have recognized the key of Haydn’s *C Major Concerto* as denoting a joyous, celebratory character. The *D Major Concerto*’s key also conveys an uplifting character but, compared to C Major’s naiveté, it expresses a more mature, triumphant voice. Rita Steblin (1996) observes that during this time the key of D Major was representative of ‘… triumph, of Hallelujahs … , the inviting symphonies, the marches, holiday songs and heaven-rejoicing choruses are set in this key.’

In music after 1750 Marks notes an increased use of minor modes that, in contrast to their connotations of joy and solemnity in the late Baroque period, came to signify ‘something out of the ordinary.’ In the *C Major Concerto*, a low-register passage of rapidly alternating semiquavers and sextuplets modulates upwards to a melody in *a minor*. This modulation achieves a change of mood, from one of repetitive insistency to *cantabile* yearning. Changes in register and rhythm in this passage add to the rhetorical effect:

![Musical example 4: C Major Concerto, first movement, bars 76–81.](image)

In the *Finale* of the *D Major Concerto*, a modulation from D major to D minor similarly creates a sharp change of mood. It occurs unexpectedly towards the end of the movement when the listener expects a return of the D Major opening theme that would follow rondo convention. Instead, Haydn uses a flattened third scale-degree as

---


28 Marks, 51.
the pivot for an unexpected, minor key modulation. From bar 119, the combination of the minor mode and the disjunct contour created by octave double stops conveys turbulence:


An improvisatory rhetoric in Haydn’s Cello Concerti conveys flexible expression and virtuosity. In classical oratory, spontaneous delivery was achieved through memorisation, so that the developing elements of a speech appeared to be drawn on at whim. Cicero memorised his speeches to make them seem improvised, but to avoid ‘suspicion of preparation and excessive ingenuity’, he advised modest language that would not excite the listener too early or risk making the rest of the speech tedious.29 He would gradually introduce increasingly elaborate, ornamented language to lead the listener in stages towards a state of awe and wonder.

Treatises by Leopold Mozart, C.P.E. Bach and J.J. Quantz reveal the importance of improvisation in interpreting eighteenth-century scores. Performers were not only expected to articulate rhetorical figures, but also to fill out passages with improvised ornamentations and cadenzas. Webster discusses the importance of improvisation in Haydn’s music. In the Cello Concerti, an improvisatory rhetoric is constructed around the interplay of stable and unstable elements that operate as ‘a

29 Tarling, 159.
continual process of expectation and deception. Webster also observes how musicologists have largely classified Haydn according to a stable, logical construction that would accord with the idea of a classical style. He argues for a revised understanding that acknowledges the unstable characteristics in Haydn’s music, such as the irregular, eccentric and capricious. Unstable elements of Haydn’s improvisatory rhetoric are seen in his use of abrupt changes, extended figuration, chromaticism and minor modes. Webster suggests that Haydn’s use of improvisatory techniques within a ‘fixed’ work is a conscious act that moves the composer from a ‘latent presence’ into the ‘foreground of consciousness.’ He locates this in passages such as written-out cadenzas or where Haydn creates an effect of ‘sudden inspiration’ through impulsive changes in harmony or rhythm. For example, a written-out cadenza in the slow movement of Haydn’s Sonata in G Major (1780) suspends the listener’s sense of direction with unresolved harmonies at cadence points, long-held notes with fermatas and repetitive figuration:


Ibid., 211.

Ibid., 208.

Ibid., 208.

Webster sees Haydn’s improvisatory rhetoric as revealing traces of a creative process in which we can ‘overhear’ Haydn, the composer-performer, changing his mind, ‘losing the thread’ and steering the music in new directions. A ‘slippage between composer, persona, and performer, between improvisation and finished work’ is thus created, which Webster associates with the ‘freedom and unpredictability … , unmediated juxtapositions and contrasts, (and) generic instability’ of C.P.E. Bach and Beethoven, qualities which he believes are undervalued in Haydn. Although the interface between normal and unusual, stable and unstable, is less overt in Haydn than in C.P.E. Bach or Beethoven, Webster argues that it is no less significant. In the D Major Cello Concerto, Haydn moves between the fixed and the improvisatory in an ambiguous detour at the end of the second subject group, which disrupts the anticipated course of the music. An extended dominant pedal and the absence of clear melody and rhetorical phrasing suggests his deliberate revealing of an experimental process:

Musical example 7: D Major Concerto, first movement, bars 61–64.

Ibid., 208–9.
Elaine Sisman examines the significance of the listener in Haydn’s rhetorical exchange. In classical oration, three elements were involved: the speaker, the speech, and the listener. Aristotle recognised that persuasion of the listener is the focus of both the speaker and the speech. Musical rhetoric during the German Enlightenment involved a dynamic relationship, which hinged on the listener’s attention. Matthew Riley (2004) locates the idea of attentiveness, stemming from Descartes, in Bernard Lamy’s *L’Art de Parler* (1676). Lamy explains how spoken rhetoric achieves attentiveness: ‘the greatest secret of eloquence is to hold minds attentive and to prevent them from losing sight of the goal to which they must be led.’ Haydn’s improvisatory detours elicit different states of attentiveness. The musical connoisseur recognises the improvisatory rhetoric of his harmonic transitions, for example, while the ‘naïve listener’ perceives a departure from the anticipated musical discourse but is unsure of its direction. To both kinds of listener, Haydn, like Cicero, engages an attentiveness that leads progressively to a state of awe and wonder.

37 Ibid., 289.
40 Donald Francis Tovey, cited in Webster, 207.
Antoine Watteau, *The Lesson of Love* (1716). Painting depicting early eighteenth-century French style and Enlightenment values emulated by the *galant* style.\(^{41}\)

3. The Galant Style

Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* are examples of the *galant* style, which was fashionable in German speaking countries from the early eighteenth century. Influenced by French culture, the *galant* style emerged as a movement towards social refinement, which David Sheldon (1975) cites as an outcome of commercialism and middle class values.\(^{42}\) Mark Radice (1999) notes the use of term *galant* exclusively in German and Austrian music:

The application of the concept of the galant or the galant style to the new structure of music, in contrast to the late Baroque polyphonic art, was limited almost exclusively to German music theory around the middle of the eighteenth century.\(^{43}\)

The German and Austrian use of the term *galant* revealed France’s powerful position in shaping cultural trends during the Enlightenment as new knowledge changed the way people viewed the universe and their place in it. The French notion of *sensibilité*, like the *galant*, re-evaluated social and cultural values. It reflected a rational, refined way of thinking that promoted happiness and balance as humanity’s natural state. The term *galant* was widely used and encompassed a range of meanings, but as fashions changed it eventually came to imply superficiality or naivety.

Emerging at the end of the seventeenth-century well before it was adopted in music, literature conceived the *galant* as a ‘middle’ style between the official ‘high’ German language and the ‘low’ style of familiar speech.\(^{44}\) Compared to ‘high’ German it was more concise, but it continued to use Baroque rhetorical devices, for example, *amplificatio* and *variatio*. Sheldon discusses the etymological link between


galant and ‘elegant’ in its reference to a naturally ornamented style free from ostentation.\textsuperscript{45} He sees the ideals of galant literature realized in the period’s appreciation for opera, which promoted the ‘gratification of the senses.’\textsuperscript{46} Compared to the high Baroque style, ornamentation and harmony in galant music is simple, in keeping with the idea of a ‘middle style’. Sheldon cites a treatise by Johann Mattheson on galant musical ideals that aimed to raise cultural awareness in Germany ‘to new heights.’\textsuperscript{47} Amongst the developing middle-class, musical knowledge was considered a mark of respectability. Galant music shared with literature the values of moderation, sensitivity, and expressive decorum.\textsuperscript{48} Mark Radice discusses the musical features of the galant, which include homophonic textures, sequences, balanced phrases, and alternating duple and triple subdivisions of the beat. Major keys, clearly defined melodies and simple harmonies replaced the abstract, spiritual aspects of Baroque music.\textsuperscript{49}

\textit{Haydn and the Cello Concerti}

Separated from each other by almost two decades, Haydn’s Cello Concerti were both composed for the Austrian court of Prince Esterházy. The contrasting situations that Haydn experienced during his life can be seen to have influenced the versatile rhetoric of the Cello Concerti. After a rural upbringing and religious schooling, his early freelance work as a musician and composer with the burlesque theatre was followed by almost three decades of royal patronage. Haydn’s musical output, which encompasses religious and secular genres, ranges from the deeply spiritual to social irony and parody. Harnoncourt views Haydn’s musical innovations along with

\textsuperscript{45} Sheldon, 246.
\textsuperscript{46} Ibid., 250.
\textsuperscript{47} Johann Mattheson, \textit{Das neu-eröffnete Orchestre}, (1713) quoted by Sheldon, 251.
\textsuperscript{48} Sheldon, 258.
\textsuperscript{49} Radice, 621, 625, 628.
Mozart’s and Beethoven’s, as part of an increasing movement towards the musical work as autobiography:

The more autobiographically (i.e., drawing inspiration from his own life) a composer wrote, the more precisely he determined interpretation and the further he removed himself from tradition.\textsuperscript{50}

In contrast to C.P.E. Bach who lived in the cultural centres of Berlin and Hamburg, Haydn attributed his originality significantly to his position and isolation at Esterházy:

As head of an orchestra, I could make experiments, observe what created an expression and what weakened it, and thus improve, add, make cuts, take risks. I was isolated from the world; no one in my vicinity could make me lose confidence in myself or bother me, and so I had to become original.\textsuperscript{51}

\textit{The C Major Concerto}

The \textit{C Major Concerto} (c. 1761–8), composed early in Haydn’s royal appointment is dedicated to the court’s principal cellist, Joseph Weigl. The \textit{galant} style was most popular around the mid-century and this would have influenced the tastes of Haydn’s patron. The remote Esterházy palace, designed to rival the splendour of the Palace of Versailles, was built around the same time that Haydn was composing this concerto. The \textit{C Major Concerto} displays the accessible and clearly defined musical rhetoric of the \textit{galant}. Contrasts of masculine and feminine characters reveal how the period’s construction of gender operated through comparison and alternation. Le Guin observes how gender traits in Haydn’s time were considered biologically determined and male and female stereotypes were embedded into the social consciousness of the period through literature, theatre, painting and music. She notes Diderot’s (1765)

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{50} Harnoncourt, 111.
\item \textsuperscript{51} Donald Grout and Claude Palisca, \textit{A History of Western Music}, 6\textsuperscript{th} ed. (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2001), 467.
\end{itemize}
comparison of the virtuous and modest female to the inquisitive male. Diderot describes the anticipated response virtuous women on viewing the female subject of Jean-Baptiste Greuze’s painting *La mere bien-aimée* (Late 18thC):

That half-open mouth, those swimming eyes, that backward-leaning attitude, that swollen neck, the voluptuous mixture of pain and pleasure: all will make virtuous women lower their gaze and blush in that place [the Salon].

Haydn’s opening cello entry is bold and celebratory with a simple melody of short phrases and skipping rhythms. Rhythmically decisive chords and the upward rising contour convey a masculine character that is answered in the second subject with a melody whose falling contour and slurred articulations convey femininity:


Haydn uses the rhetorical techniques of alternation and *ellipsis* to contrast masculine and feminine characters. Johann Nikolaus Forkel (1749–1818) described how these techniques engage the listener’s imagination and maintain their attention. He explains an example of *ellipsis* where a developing idea is suddenly overtaken by another. In the first movement rising scalic runs are interrupted at their peak by a new contrasting character:

---

54 Ibid., 135.
Musical example 9: *C Major Concerto*, first movement, bars 41–43.

The first idea is extrovert and masculine in its detached articulation, containing emphatically repeated notes and rising tessitura. When the second idea enters halfway through bar 42, the rhythmic drive is interrupted by a feminine melody of slurred, falling intervals. In contrast to the first movement’s vivid contrasts, the *Adagio* movement presents a gentle dialogue between masculine and feminine voices. Question and answer phrases are suggested by contrasting pitch contours:

Musical example 10: *C Major Concerto*, second movement, bars 20–22.

Double stops in this movement, where one part is static and the other moving, create a harmonious blend of two voices. Polite discourse is suggested in the way the parts interchange, the upper voice taking over the melody once the lower voice has concluded:

Musical example 11: *C Major Concerto*, second movement, bars 35–38.
The D Major Concerto

Sheldon notes how, by the time of the D Major Concerto (1783) galant ideals were not as prominent but ‘remnants of its courtly and urbane manner, its delicate and refined grace remain in Haydn and Mozart.’ More so than the C Major Concerto, the overall character of the D Major Concerto expresses feminine sentiment and beauty. Matthew Head (2004) observes how Johann Sulzer (1720–1779) associates the fine arts with a feminine ideal:

Just as philosophy and science have knowledge as their ultimate goal, so the fine arts have the goal of sentiment. Their immediate aim is to arouse sentiments in a psychological sense. Their final goal, however, is a moral sentiment by which man can achieve his ethical value. If the fine arts are ever to become the sister of philosophy, and not just a gaggle of loose wenches one calls upon for diversion, they must be guided by reason and wisdom in their stimulation of sentiment.

Head sees this passage as Sulzer’s call ‘for art to move out of the brothel into the drawing room.’ Sulzer, like others of his time, for example Diderot and Edmund Burke (1729–1797), drew attention to the morality and aesthetics attributed to femininity. James van Horn Melton (2007) observes an increased recognition of educated women coinciding with Maria Theresa’s ascension to the Habsburg throne.

Her attendant, Charlotte von Greiner, established the first Viennese salon and was possibly the first Austrian woman to promote respect for the female intellect.

In both the first and second movements of the D Major Concerto the use of upper registers, long legato phrases, sighing figures and appoggiaturas convey a feminine, galant ideal. The orchestral strings enhance an overall character of serenity,

---

55 Sheldon, 269.
57 Head, 248.
especially in the second movement. As the first violins harmonise the solo cello melody in thirds, the second violins and violas provide rhythmic regularity and melodic commentary. At the end of bars 4 and 7 in this example, Haydn uses the coupling of two notes falling in step-wise motion, a device that he frequently uses, which suggests genteel values:

Musical example 12: *D Major Concerto*, second movement, bars 1–8 (orchestral score).

In the first movement, the opening cello entry’s graceful melody unfolds through *legato* slurring and long phrases:

In this example, the upper register evokes femininity and the unornamented, smooth, melodic contour is typical of *galant* rhetoric. Upward reaching intervals at the start of bar 32 and in the middle of bar 33 add to a sense of a feminine voice. The gentle mood of the first five bars is interrupted in the upbeat to bar 34 by a sudden shift to a lower register and an ornamented *D* Major scale to the cello’s bottom octave. The technique of *ellipsis* here creates an abrupt contrast between feminine and masculine characters. *Ellipsis* might be thought of as a metaphor for how the *galant*, conceived on many levels as the antithesis of the Baroque, was challenged by antithetical ideas. Sheldon compares the initial virtuous connotation of the *galant* to later, mid-century criticisms of superficiality, of the *galant homme*’s concern with ‘… what he can see and hear as though looking at a mirror to powder himself.’\(^{59}\) Disruptive rhetorical techniques, such as *ellipsis*, were a feature of *grotesque* styles that challenged the *galant*. The idea of *ellipsis* paralleled the period’s interest in opposing aesthetics.

\(^{59}\) Mattheson (1721), paraphrased by Sheldon, 253.
Groteskensaal (1714) Lower Belvedere, Vienna. An example of eighteenth-century grotesque wall decoration combining ambiguous aesthetic affects.⁶⁰

⁶⁰ From Beghin and Goldberg, Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric, 273.
4. Grotesque Aesthetics

The term *grotesque* was first applied to a sixteenth-century style of wall painting that fused images of animals, humans and nature in incongruous and fantastic arrangements. 61 Eighteenth-century modes of the *grotesque* challenged the period’s belief in rational perception by highlighting humanity’s diversity and the ambivalent and complex nature of experience. In music, the *grotesque* encompassed ideas and styles that were antithetical to the *galant*, such as the burlesque, virtuosity, *Sturm und Drang* and fantasy. *Grotesque* expression was contradictory to *galant* ideals of elegance and decorum. Le Guin observes in the *grotesque* aesthetics of the period an unsettling ‘doubleness’ in which ‘beauty is explicitly perverted.’62 In the *Cello Concerti*, Haydn juxtaposes *galant* beauty and naturalness with incongruous effects that surprise, disrupt and create irony.

*The Burlesque*

Elaine Sisman (1990) sees one of the principal influences in Haydn’s style of the 1760s and 1770s as his involvement with theatre music of all kinds. 63 She explores how Haydn’s symphonies from this period were developed in a style that could function either as a stand-alone composition or accompanying a spoken play. Sisman quotes from a review of Haydn’s music for the play, *Der Zerstreute*, which praises his skill in portraying a variety of characters:

One notices, this time in music intended for a comedy, the same spirit that elevates all of Hayden’s (sic) work. His masterful variety excites the admiration of experts and is

nothing short of delightful for the listener; he falls from the most affected pomposity directly into vulgarity, and Hayden and Regnard vie with each other for the most comic absentmindedness.\(^64\)

James Melton explores theatrical influences in Haydn as linking directly to his work with the burlesque Kärntner Tor Theatre during the 1750s.\(^65\) The rising popularity of the burlesque in early eighteenth-century Vienna coincided with the city’s rapid economic expansion and growing imperial power.\(^66\) Popular among both high and low class audiences, the burlesque theatre provided a social commentary on the contrasts between the aristocracy and lower classes. Melton also observes the humour of the Kärntner Tor Theatre, where the Esterházy family had a permanent box: ‘… this juxtaposition of master and servant … made the aristocratic demeanour of the former all the more incongruous in light of the coarse, plebeian antics of the latter.’\(^67\)

Haydn’s mixing of high and low brow elements is suggested in the C Major Concerto’s first movement where rustic sounding double-stops that evoke a hurdy-gurdy instrument are immediately followed by an empfindsam style melody of descending 7ths that are characteristically performed as slurred couplets:

Musical example 14: C Major Concerto, first movement, bars 83–85.

---

\(^64\) Pressburger Zeitung (1774) quoted by Sisman, 321.
\(^67\) Melton, “School, Stage, Salon,” Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric, 95.
William Hogarth, *The Enraged Musician* (1741), showing how empirical values encouraged a division between high and lowbrow musical tastes.\textsuperscript{68}

\textsuperscript{68} Beghin and Goldberg, *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, 72.
Haydn’s familiarity with the rhetorical tactics of the burlesque contributed to his ability to engage his audience: ‘Off the cuff allusions …, bantering back and forth with the audience - such improvisation was standard ….’\(^{69}\) It was common for composers to collaborate with actors in the construction of humour and Melton suggests Haydn’s work with actors, such as Johann Kurz, would have contributed to the ‘playful and mischievous qualities that came to be a hallmark of his compositions.’\(^{70}\) Haydn’s early burlesque opera, *Der krumme Teufel* (The Lame Devil, c.1751), where he collaborated with Kurz, was banned because it was considered too vulgar.\(^{71}\) The provocative social caricature and sexual allusions of the burlesque theatre usually escaped censorship, however, because of the absence of dramatic scripts. The burlesque theatre exposed and ridiculed what the *galant* had formulated as socially acceptable. Displays of lustful and obscene behaviour subverted the stereotypes of polite society and the use of ‘vulgar gestures and sexual innuendo to spice up routines’ was common.\(^{72}\) A Viennese critic of the time wrote, ‘the more depraved the characters, the more applause they win.’\(^{73}\) In the context of *galant* ideals of beauty, sexuality and desire were considered dangerous if unchecked and the burlesque played on this. Meg Armstrong (1996) observes how the period’s attempts to channel passion and desire in socially acceptable ways ironically ensured a need for novelty and subversion.\(^{74}\) She notes Edmund Burke’s fascination with the exotic, erotic status of the ‘black female’ as epitomising this.\(^{76}\)


\(^{70}\) Ibid., 98.

\(^{71}\) Ibid., 94.

\(^{72}\) Ibid., 101.

\(^{73}\) Ibid., 101.


\(^{76}\) Ibid., 215.
Franz Xaver Messerschmidt, *Characterköpfe; A Wilful Buffoon* (after 1770), detail from a series of sixty-nine sculptures. An example of grotesque caricature.\textsuperscript{75}

\textsuperscript{75} From Beghin and Goldberg, *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, 279.
In the third movement of the *C Major Concerto* the predominantly *galant* mood of the first and second movements is abandoned in favour of burlesque humour. The *Allegro molto* marking and a bass line pulse of alternating octave leaps in the orchestral parts set a playful mood. Frequent character contrasts are conveyed by sudden shifts in register and rhythmic pattern changes. In the opening cello theme, a single note tied over three bars creates suspense that is relieved in the fourth bar by a comical, upward semiquaver run; the initial stasis followed by rapid motion is like the sudden release of a spring:

![Musical example 15: C Major Concerto, third movement, bars 41–46.](image)

Within a conventional three-part structure defined by tonic-dominant harmonies, Haydn introduces new ideas at such a pace that the effect is also one of surprise. Forkel refers to the power of novelty in the use of musico-rhetorical figures to arouse the imagination: ‘… Of this type are all new, unexpected turns and sudden transitions in the progression.’ In contrast to the overt humour of the *C Major Concerto Finale*, the *D Major Concerto Finale* alternates a mood of *galant* elegance with sections of burlesque, instrumental brilliance. Marked *Allegro*, a swinging rondo theme in 6/8 meter suggests a gentle, *dance-like* merriment:

![Musical example 16: D Major Concerto, third movement, bars 1–4.](image)

Haydn soon subverts this with lively semiquaver runs, octave leaps, and syncopated wedge accents in bars 22 and 23:


Parody plays an important role in this movement. The more the simple beauty of the theme is repeated, the more it appears to be subverted by the insertion of incongruous harmonies and texture. For example, the cello part’s moving melody over a held drone suggests a rustic character:


While most of Haydn’s critics appreciated this combination of high and lowbrow elements, some, for example Johann Adam Hiller, saw his ‘low jokes’ as lacking in taste: ‘Is not that curious mixture of the noble and the common, the serious and the comic, which so often occurs in one and the same movement, sometimes of a bad effect?’ \(^{77}\) Haydn’s antithetical rhetoric in the *Cello Concerti* owes much to the burlesque’s close interaction between stage and audience.

---

Virtuosity

Contrary to galant refinement, slapstick elements in the burlesque theatre often included exaggerated technical manoeuvres and risk-taking, for example, machinery or even a live donkey flying across the stage. In Haydn’s Cello Concerti, the burlesque, like other manifestations of the grotesque, relied on virtuosity. The idea of virtuosity, which emerged in the pursuit of enlightened reason and knowledge, developed in music as a grotesque subversion of its original connotation. While virtuosity signified accomplishment and musical excellence, it also became the subject of controversy. The first recorded definition of virtuoso in Dictionnaire de Musique, (1703) linked skill and talent with virtue:

… not only that propensity of the soul which makes us agreeable to God and makes us act according to the rules of right reason, but also that superiority of talent, skill or ability which makes us excel be it in the theory or be it in the practice of the Fine Arts …

The idea of virtue was central to the principles of the galant. Some critics of virtuosity felt that it undermined beauty, believing that the physical demands of virtuosic performance were contrary to ‘natural’ expression. Noverre, (1727–1810) who refers to the virtuoso as ‘an automaton …(a) piece of machinery,’ objects to virtuosity as:

… mere jargon, absolutely foreign and superfluous in these arts; whose voice should be pathetic, as always addressed to the heart: their proper language is the language of sentiment …

80 Le Guin, Boccherini’s Body, 137.
81 Le Guin, “‘One Says That One Weeps, but One Does Not Weep’: Sensible, Grotesque and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini’s Chamber Music,” 226.
Johann Jakob Engel, *Ideen z\textsuperscript{u} einem Mimik* (Berlin 1785). Engraving of an actor expressing doubt. According to Diderot, the act of performing presents a dilemma between truth and artifice.\footnote{From Beghin and Goldberg, *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, 152.}
His contemporary, Angiolini, describes how audiences responded to the period’s *grotesque* style of virtuosic dance with ‘astonishment mixed with fear’. Le Guin observes how, despite these criticisms, virtuosity held ‘seductive wonders’ in its foreignness to *galant* expression.

The representation of virtue through performance was increasingly seen as a paradox, as the word, *virtuoso*, that had initially denoted goodness and excellence came to infer a subversion of truthfulness. Rousseau (1712–1778) and Diderot both observed in the idea of the virtuoso a conflict between truth and artifice. Rousseau argued that virtue is evident in capacity, rather than in the performance of that capacity. He reasoned that any expression that requires practice, such as the French language, is unnatural and therefore less virtuous. Diderot questioned whether an actor’s feelings can be true and sensible, while their performance is itself an act: ‘Don’t you say, frankly, that true sensitivity and performed sensitivity are two very different things?’ Unlike Rousseau, however, Diderot believed that virtue can be conveyed through performance and that the truest performance is not necessarily realised by the most virtuous person.

Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* present alternating *galant* and *grotesque* characters that highlight the paradox of virtue and virtuosity. In this passage from the *C Major Concerto*, the gentle contour of a modest *galant* melody is cut short by a virtuosic two octave run up the A string that finishes with mechanically angular string crossings:

---

84 Ibid., 138.
85 Ibid., 136.
86 Ibid., 136.
87 Le Guin, “‘One Says That One Weeps, but One Does Not Weep’: Sensible, Grotesque and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini’s Chamber Music,” 207.
88 Ibid., 207.
Haydn’s virtuosic rhetoric demonstrates the potential for deviation in any categorical style, such as the *galant*. Contrasts between the simplicity of the *galant* and the complexity of the virtuosic and *grotesque* in Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* challenge and intensify each other. Haydn’s use of virtuosity in the *Cello Concerti* is a device of mimicry. Le Guin perceives eighteenth-century virtuosity, in its combining of truth and affect, as an act of ‘doubleness’, or duplicity. Diderot saw performance itself as imitative and therefore involving moral ambiguity. Challenging the protagonist’s performance in *Neveu de Rameau* (1761) he summarised this dilemma: ‘Is this irony or truthfulness?’ Within this ambiguity there is the suggestion that through irony truth is revealed, and in truth we see irony. Virtuosity epitomises the *grotesque*’s ability to reveal truth through its antithesis.

---

89 Le Guin, “‘One Says That One Weeps, but One Does Not Weep’: Sensible, Grotesque and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini’s Chamber Music,” 241.
90 Ibid., 241.
Autograph of Haydn’s *Keyboard Sonata in E-flat Major*, first movement, Hob.XVI:49 (1790), showing the recapitulation, which develops dialogic contrasts between left and right hands.\(^{91}\)

\(^{91}\) From Tom Beghin, *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, 151.
The *Sturm und Drang* (‘storm and stress’) movement was part of a reaction against the rationalism of the Enlightenment. As knowledge of psychology increased subjectivity in the arts, the *galant* aesthetic was considered inadequate for expressing emotion in literature and music. *Sturm und Drang* writers considered the self-conscious sentimentality of *galant* literature and music to be lacking in meaningful expression. While the *galant* represented French cultural superiority and the objective values of empiricism, *Sturm und Drang* sought to develop a purely German expression with emotion at its centre. Widely acknowledged as a short-lived artistic movement, Paul Marks (1971) observes *Sturm und Drang* as part of a broader context of philosophical, literary and musical thinking, which hinged on the Enlightenment's understanding of duality.92

Riley identifies Descartes’ idea of the divided self, of mind and body, as the source of eighteenth-century dualistic ideas.93 The Enlightenment established a new logic based on the dualistic conception of intellect and emotion. The *galant* ideal of pleasure, which was considered the most desirable and natural state, was believed to arise from a balancing of mind and heart. Developing Descartes’ idea that the mind and body govern rational and irrational responses, the German theorists, Sulzer and Georg Friedrich Meier (1718–1777), observed how music affects *arbitrary* and *natural* modes of attention. They conceptualized a ‘rhetoric of attention’ in which the listener’s sense of self-awareness and morality is aroused.94 In the eighteenth-century, the term, *arbitrary*, was equated with voluntary choice and thus, an *arbitrary* response was seen as a rational one based upon known experience and accepted values. Riley

---

93 Riley, 28.
94 Ibid., 27.
explains this connotation as stemming from the Enlightenment assumption that the free, educated man was fundamentally rational and balanced, led by intellect rather than intuition. The term *natural* refers to the antithesis of the *arbitrary* and implies an emotional or irrational response governed by involuntary bodily instinct. Meier associates these terms with conscious and compulsive responses respectively:

Our attention is either natural or arbitrary. The arbitrary is determined through our free choice, and under this type comes also the voluntary attention, which is dependent on our freedom . . . All attention that is not arbitrary or voluntary is called natural attention. We are forced into this attention by a natural compulsion, and are not capable from refraining from it.  

Riley explains how the voluntary nature of the *arbitrary* mode was considered morally acceptable but the ‘elusive and indefinable’ *natural* mode, which could compel wonder and astonishment, was given only a ‘guarded welcome.’ While these concepts were not systematically developed in the eighteenth-century, he observes that they are useful in locating an understanding of eighteenth-century musical listening.

The *Sturm und Drang* movement’s expression of spontaneous, contradictory experiences and emotions is connected to the eighteenth-century idea of *natural* expression. *Sturm und Drang* philosophy is also defined by dichotomies, such as good and evil, which reveal the inconsistent nature of emotions and morality. For example, in *Sturm und Drang* literature, a protagonist driven to action through revenge or greed would represent a dualistic dilemma. Feud and rivalry are typical themes in the works of *Sturm und Drang* writers such as Goethe and Schiller. In music, the *Sturm und Drang* style included a cross section of influences and juxtapositions of these. Marks

95 Riley, 68.
97 Riley, 32.
sees *Sturm und Drang* as a pre-romantic movement of changing ideologies that reveals a ‘peculiarly German emotional range’.

He describes a stylistic transition from the Baroque towards ‘a kind of romantic fervor’ that developed fragmentary principles and contrasts, which were at odds with *galant* ideals of balance and coherence.

The *Sturm und Drang* writer, Johann Gottfried Herder (1744–1803) defined music as language in its most primitive, sensual form. Believing that the aesthetic origins of music came from primitive forms such as traditional folk songs, he argued that music’s link with language would enable the expression of emotion at a subconscious level. Marks traces Herder’s ideas back to Rousseau’s ‘philosophy of the unencumbered man’, however, he is careful to distinguish Rousseau’s rationalism from *Sturm und Drang*’s principles. The appeal of the primitive to *Sturm und Drang* philosophy was its unity within culture, especially through links between language and music. The primitive elements in *Sturm und Drang* also reflect the archaic and mythological connotations of the grotesque. *Sturm und Drang* instrumental music realises its link with language through fragmented ideas that evoke the syntax of dramatic speech and recitative. The idea of a Germanic expression is conveyed in Haydn’s *C Major Concerto* through choppy, gestural articulations that evoke the consonant-rich German language:

---

98 Marks, 54.
99 Ibid., 53.
100 Ibid., 59.
101 Ibid., 54.
George Barth sees this ‘short-slurring’ style as mirroring the German language’s consonantal endings of words in succession such as “Guten Tag” or “Der Tod und das Mädchen.” Marks notes the Sturm und Drang influence in C.P.E. Bach and Haydn: ‘Harmonically, and rhythmically, the minor mode, chromaticism, and increased modulation were more and more the order of the day.’ He observes the combination of ‘lyric monologue with recitativo secco’ in C.P.E. Bach’s Six Prussian Sonatas Wq. 48 (1740–1742) as the earliest evidence of the Sturm und Drang style in music. Fragmented periods in these sonatas convey a grammatical expression equivalent to recitative’s non-lyrical verse structure. Rapidly changing harmonies create disjointed melodic lines like impassioned speech and fragmented textural motifs often take precedence over melody. The following example from the slow movement of the first Prussian Sonata is marked recit. (recitativo), indicating speech-like flexibility. Wide intervals in bars 1 and 2 create a fragmented melodic line and the recitativo passage, marked forte, creates textural emphasis with dissonant, rolled chords in the left hand:

103 Marks, 62.
104 Ibid., 61.

_Storm und Drang_ elements in the development section of the _C Major Concerto_’s first movement build on textural and rhythmic motifs rather than melody. Marks sees the increased use of major and minor juxtapositions in compositions from this time as a reaction against the _Galant_. In the following example, wide intervals, layered triadic figurations and repeated upper notes over an ostinato-like accompaniment create turbulence, which is intensified by alternating contrasts between major, minor and diminished chords:

Musical example 22: _C Major Concerto_, first movement, bars 72–73.

In the _D Major Concerto_, the development section as a whole shows a wide melodic range and complexity of ideas; features that are synonymous with Haydn’s

---

105 Marks, 51.
Henry Fuseli, *Three Witches* (1783). *Grotesque* depiction of the witches of Shakespeare’s *Macbeth*. Haydn owned an engraving of this painting.106

symphonic works from the 1770s. In the following example, rapid arpeggios explore textural variation as the pitch travels from low to high registers. *Sturm und Drang* unrest is conveyed in the angular string crossings and sudden modulations between major and minor keys:


Marks examines how dynamic markings in *Sturm und Drang* music are used to indicate dramatic intensity. Although dynamic markings are scarce in Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*, dynamic gradations, most frequently crescendos, are implied through tessitura. In the above example there is an implied crescendo with the ascension of pitch, as the sense of vocal projection naturally increases with the rising pitch. Marks also notes a ‘self-conscious archaism’ in *Sturm und Drang* music’s referencing of Baroque contrapuntal forms. Although the cello is essentially a homophonic instrument, Haydn at times evokes the polyphony of Baroque writing. For example, in the *D Major Concerto* first movement, the alternation of upper and lower string double-stops, which are linked by the interval of a tritone, creates contrapuntal and harmonic tension. The accompanying doubling of oboe and violins evokes the blending of voices in a Baroque orchestra:

\[\text{Equation}\]

107 Marks., 63.
108 Ibid., 62.
109 Ibid., 54.
The *Sturm und Drang* style developed a richness of expression in instrumental music that strove to match the scope of language. While Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* are not considered *Sturm und Drang* works in the same way as, for example, his *Symphony No. 26* (c.1768), they reveal the influence of this style. Their use of *recitativo* gestures, fragmentation and increased modulation convey typical *Sturm und Drang* intensity. The *Cello Concerti* also engage with the *Sturm und Drang* dialectic between theme and motif, unity and contrast that Marks observes. Harmonic and motivic contrasts create a ‘dualistic thematic construction’ that opens up possibilities for expansion and development.\(^{111}\) Marks notes how this construction provided ‘the groundwork for the mature works of Haydn and Mozart.’\(^ {112}\) In Haydn’s *Cello Concerti*, this dualistic construction is seen in the repeated juxtapositions of *galant* and *grotesque* characters. For example, the first movement of the *D Major Concerto* alternates slurred and staccato statements throughout, suggesting, more than simple contrast, a developing interplay of opposing elements. This dualistic interplay is perhaps why Haydn’s critics described him as ‘the Shakespeare of music.’\(^ {113}\) The 1770s saw a revival of Shakespeare’s plays across Germany and Austria. *Sturm und*
Drang’s principles of contrast and unity found a dramatic equivalent in the moral dilemmas of Shakespeare’s opposing characters, in the fragmentation and disintegration of relationships that develop in complexity before arriving at resolution. Richard Will (1997) observes how Haydn transforms the mid-century emphasis on conversation by extending dialogic contrasts.\textsuperscript{114} In the Cello Concerti, particularly in the first movements, repeated contrasts of galant and grotesque characters eventually achieve unity. Through the reoccurrence of ideas in a movement, cyclic unity fits the aesthetic criterion of the classical style. Yet rather than supporting a classical idea of sympathetic unity, Haydn’s reoccurring characters retain their distinctness. Will describes how the characters in Haydn’s string quartets ‘continue to reiterate their own identities until they either overcome their opponent or effect some compromise.’\textsuperscript{115} As with Shakespeare, Haydn’s music juxtaposes characters and ideas against their antitheses to arrive at a meaningful resolution.

Fantasy

The galant style developed in the new secular musical environs of the salon, drawing room and concert hall. Quantz expresses the period’s negative view of the Baroque, or ‘learned style’, as having a ‘dark or bizarre manner, which would be incomprehensible to the listener.’\textsuperscript{116} Referencing the Baroque’s abstract complexity, the Fantasia genre developed as a conscious rejection of galant restraint in favour of the composer’s freedom of expression. Discussing the creative initiative of C.P.E. Bach, Germany’s leading fantasist, Tobias Plebuch (2007) notes:

\textsuperscript{115} Will, 185.
\textsuperscript{116} Quantz’ Versuch (1752) cited in Tobias Plebuch, ‘Gerstenberg’s monologues for C.P.E. Bach’s C Minor Fantasia,’ C.P.E. Bach Studies, 49.
Rejecting classicist ideals of rational and tempered speech, decency, and vraisemblance, the young generation of the 1760s and 1770s regarded enthusiasm as the seal of authentic self-expression.\textsuperscript{117}

Sulzer identifies the \textit{grotesque} with the \textit{fantastic}:

(The grotesque) surprises, like a quixotic dream, through the extravagant connection of things that have no natural connection to each other … . It therefore belongs in general to the genre of the Ridiculous and Fantastic, which is by no means to be dismissed.\textsuperscript{118}

C.P.E. Bach developed the fantasia into a musical style that reflected the elliptical and highly ornamented forms of late-seventeenth century Baroque art and architecture. Fantasy elements in the music of both C.P.E. Bach and Haydn are seen in an improvisatory rhetoric of experimental harmonic modulations and rhythms, rapidly contrasting ideas and technical virtuosity. The eighteenth-century critic, Carl Friedrich Cramer, praised the fantasy style of C.P.E. Bach, the features of which he observed as:

… the novelty of so many frequently quite heterogeneous and yet always correctly and artistically interconnected ideas, their unexpectedness and constant surprises, given the absence of any clear theme which might register with listener and generate expectations, the boldness of the modulations, the harmonic digressions and returns, the inexhaustible supply of material and ideas, the variety of the separate figures which make up the whole, and the brilliant fingerwork which affords even the most inexperienced listener at least the pleasure of astonishment at hearing technical difficulties overcome … .\textsuperscript{119}

\textsuperscript{119} Cramer review (1783–86), quoted in Riley, \textit{Musical Listening in the German Enlightenment}, 31.
The idiosyncratic structure of C.P.E. Bach’s fantasies results from their unpredictable flow of ideas and fragmented syntax, which Riley likens to ‘notated improvisations.’\(^{120}\) C.P.E. Bach explains the spontaneous process of modulation:

… even in the galant style the composer invents modulations which were not there before. One modulates wherever one wants – sometimes slowly, in galant and even in contrapuntal pieces; always however in a pleasing and surprising manner. Wisdom, learning and courage suffer no such restricted modulations of the kind our elders prescribed.\(^{121}\)

In C.P.E. Bach’s *Trio Sonata in G Major* Wq. 90/2 (1775), a frequently repeated theme in the Rondo movement interchanges with improvisatory key modulations and virtuosic passagework to develop into what Forkel describes as a ‘harmonic labyrinth.’\(^{122}\) Mary Sue Morrow explains how fantasy was understood linguistically in the eighteenth-century as ‘fancy,’ which implies its link with the imagination.\(^{123}\) The word *Phantasie* denoted a level of creativity and originality that was aligned with genius. However, the spontaneous expression of contrasting affects in instrumental music contradicted conservative opinions. Gotthold Ephraim Lessing (1729–81) suggested that such contrasts cause ‘uncertainty and confusion.’\(^{124}\)

Discussing a Fantasia by C.P.E. Bach, Heinrich Wilhelm von Gerstenberg (1737–1823) disputed this:

By the way, I can’t avoid remarking that this Bachian fantasy disproves pretty clearly Herr Lessing’s opinion in the 27\(^{th}\) piece of the Dramaturgie that in one single piece a

\(^{120}\) Riley, 151.

\(^{121}\) Ibid., 161.

\(^{122}\) Forkel (1778–79), quoted in Riley, 152–153.

\(^{123}\) Mary Sue Morrow, *German Music Criticism in the Late Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 69–74.

musician cannot change from one passion into the opposite, e.g. from the calm to the stormy, from tenderness into cruelty.  

Recognizing that his fantasias did not conform to galant tastes for uniformity and simplicity, C.P.E. Bach advised younger composers: ‘In pieces that are to be printed, in other words, intended for general consumption, be less artful and put in more sugar.’

Towards the end of the eighteenth-century, Haydn and C.P.E. Bach’s greatness and originality were considered equal:

If we had but one Haydn and one C.P.E. Bach, we Germans could assert with impunity that we have our own style, and that our instrumental music is the most interesting of all.

C.P.E. Bach and Haydn are traditionally viewed as opposites: Bach is considered a fantasist and incoherent, while Haydn is appreciated for his logic and humour. Webster suggests that because of this, eccentricities and irregularities in Haydn are overlooked. C.P.E. Bach composed numerous fantasies and capriccios, genres that are characteristically experimental. Haydn, by comparison, composed few actual fantasies or capriccios and is recognised for more stable forms, such as symphonies and string quartets. Yet parallels with C.P.E. Bach were recognised in Haydn’s time:

The stile of Bach is closely copied, without the passages being stolen, in which his capricious manner, odd breaks, whimsical modulations, and very often childish manner, mixed with an affectation of profound silence, are finely hit off and burlesqued.

---

126 Riley, 152.
128 European Magazine (1784) cited by, Riley, 261.
Webster sees the improvisatory assemblage of ideas in Haydn’s music as ‘fantasizing.’\textsuperscript{129} Haydn’s incorporation of fantasy into traditionally ‘stable’ genres makes their effect all the more surprising. In the \textit{Cello Concerti}, this can be seen most clearly in the witty, improvisatory character of the \textit{Rondo-Finale} of the \textit{D Major Concerto}. Morrow describes the eighteenth-century connotation of wit as ‘the ability to connect seemingly disparate ideas, possibly, but not necessarily in a manner that could induce laughter.’\textsuperscript{130} Haydn’s \textit{Rondo} opens with its main theme of a simple and symmetrical \textit{galant} melody. Webster sees this simplicity as a regular technique of deception in Haydn’s music.\textsuperscript{131} Between returns to the main theme, the material that is introduced is progressively more diverse and eccentric. Like C.P.E. Bach, Haydn constructs a virtuosic rhetoric in which the listener, like the performer, is challenged to keep up. The quick succession of new motifs, fragmented counterpoint between high and low voices, chromaticism and unexpected pauses recall the labyrinthine development and broken syntax of C.P.E. Bach’s rondos:\textsuperscript{132}

\begin{music}
\begin{musicx}{85-91}
\end{musicx}
\end{music}


Surprising digressions from the thematic repetition take the listener into unfamiliar territory. The effect is initially destabilising but, as explained by Forkel, the repetition of this pattern achieves unity. Haydn transforms what we recognise into something else before leading us back to his original idea. By alternating the known with the

\textsuperscript{130} Morrow, 75.
\textsuperscript{131} Webster, 183.
\textsuperscript{132} Richards, \textit{C.P.E. Bach Studies}, 21.
unknown he reveals their inseparability. Forkel describes how the interconnectedness of contrasting ideas is realised through their repeated alternation:

It is thus the case here in the sciences and arts, just as overall in nature, that everything is grounded and connected in everything else, and consequently can never be completely separated and distinguished according to its limits. So, for example, there is nothing better for arousing the attention than intensification and most types of repetition.¹³³

Forkel also reveals how rhetorical techniques for gaining attention move the listener’s experience towards an intensified state of wonder and astonishment, which he associates with the sublime.¹³⁴ His theory of heightened attention dates back to Descartes, who wrote:

Wonder is a sudden surprise of the soul which makes it tend to consider attentively those objects which seem to it rare and extraordinary.¹³⁵

Forkel links the sublime to musical features such as ‘new, unexpected turns and sudden transitions in the progression.’¹³⁶ Fantasy, which revived the Baroque’s striving to express the unknown and infinite, was the musical style most clearly associated with the sublime.

¹³³ Forkel quoted in Riley, 142.
¹³⁴ Riley, 31–32.
¹³⁵ Descartes, The Passions of the Soul (1649), quoted by Riley, 28.
¹³⁶ Riley, 30.
George Stubbs, *A Lion Attacking a Horse* (1770).\(^{137}\) Painting depicting the complex sublime effect of the coinciding extremes of beauty and horror.

5. The Sublime

Examining the late eighteenth-century theories of German music, Mary Sue Morrow observes a focus on the sublime, which challenged the primacy of reason and accorded new status to creative genius.\(^\text{138}\) She observes that from the 1760s, music reviews began to value creativity over compositional correctness. Haydn’s ability to transform the ordinary into something unique is admired in 1787 by a German critic:

What prevails here is not the ordinary, hum-drum minuet tone; everywhere you look you find new invention in ideas and the way they’re used.\(^\text{139}\)

The emergence of burlesque, *Sturm und Drang* and fantasy elements in music from the mid-century reveals increasingly individual approaches to composition. Morrow describes a developing worship of the creative impulse that developed during Haydn’s time. The *Sturm und Drang* writer, Johann Georg Hamann (1730–1788) maintained that ‘a work of art expressed the artist’s personality and thus could not be subject to arbitrary rules.’\(^\text{140}\) Herder, who viewed Shakespeare as an original genius, also consistently advocated the power of creativity and inspiration over the mechanics of art. Morrow describes how the musical genius attributed to C.P.E. Bach and Haydn came to mean more than clever inventiveness; it was associated with bold, striking variety and the courage to break with tradition and explore new directions. The concept of genius provided a new locus for the sublime connotations of Baroque spirituality.

In Germany the sublime was theorised by writers such as Moses Mendelssohn (1729–1786) and Immanuel Kant (1724–1804), who developed the ideas of British

\(^{138}\) Morrow, 103.
\(^{139}\) Review of Haydn *Sei Menuetti* (Hob IX:9a) in *Neue Leipziger gelehrte Zeitungen*, October 1787, quoted by Morrow, 113.
\(^{140}\) Hamann’s *Aesthetica in nuce* (1762), Morrow, 103.
theorists in particular Burke. Burke’s *Aesthetic Theory Concerning the Sublime and Beautiful* (1756) observes how the sublime experience arises from juxtaposition and duality, for example, when the light, beautiful, or feminine is contrasted with the dark, masculine, melancholy or fearful, or from the feeling that one’s beliefs or sense of reality are challenged or confused.\(^{141}\) Burke explains the sublime as the result of a break with a recognised totality or unity, for example, when feelings of exile or alienation arise from man’s relationship with God or nature. The sublime experience is often the result of coinciding extreme opposite emotions such as horror and awe.

Richards describes Mendelssohn’s theory of simple and complex modes of the sublime as deriving either from profound simplicity or from the experience of contradictory and overwhelming emotions.\(^{142}\) The simple sublime, which Mendelssohn refers to as ‘naïve’, occurs in moments of stasis or from ‘the dispensing of all wit, artifice and decoration.’\(^{143}\) The complex mode results from a kind of disorder in which regular beats, harmonies, or periods are omitted. Mendelssohn also observes how the simple and complex modes can coincide, thus intensifying the effect of each. Richards suggests that C.P.E. Bach’s experimental conjoining of the simple and the complex were consciously in keeping with Mendelssohn’s ideas.\(^{144}\) Haydn’s improvisatory juxtaposition of *galant* and *grotesque* aesthetics in the *Cello Concerti* similarly suggests a conscious interplay of simplicity and complexity. *Grotesque* elements, such as harmonic ellipses, rapidly changing ideas and technical virtuosity disrupt the simple beauty of the *galant* and disorientate the listener. Burlesque parody and its association with the forbidden transgress *galant* decorum. *Sturm und Drang*’s

\(^{141}\) Armstrong, 214.
\(^{143}\) Richards, 166.
\(^{144}\) Ibid., 170.
fragmented musical language evokes unstable emotions that challenge the fundamental *galant* belief in balance and happiness. Fantasy elements elicit wonder. Haydn’s insertion of these unexpected *grotesque* aesthetic features within the stable context of the *galant* creates a complex, sublime effect.

The *galant* also operates alone in the *Cello Concerti* as an expression of sublime simplicity and beauty. The slow, middle movements of both concerti exemplify the feminine, *galant* ideal. Their pure lyricism combined with subtle modulations and textural shifts, evokes Mendelssohn’s ‘naïve’ sublime. A sense of stillness and otherworldly perfection creates a profound contrast to the clever invention of the outer movements. Mendelssohn describes how the simple sublime requires the composer’s presence to be ‘veiled by understatement’. He also notes that elements of the complex sublime, such as ellipsis or dislocation, can occur in the simple sublime. For example, in the *D Major Concerto* slow movement, an unexpected modulation from the dominant of A Major to C Major in bars 42 and 43 creates harmonic uncertainty and a sense of poignancy:

---

145 Richards, 68–9.
Musical example 26: *D Major Concerto*, second movement, bars 38–43 (orchestral score).

It is ultimately through the sublime that Haydn affirms his originality and distinguishes himself from other composers. Barth notes how, following on from C.P.E. Bach, Haydn tried ‘to solve the problem of expressing clearly in instrumental music, without words, the meaning of the words.’\(^{146}\) He observes that the originality of Haydn’s rhetoric comes from his ability to express specific and vivid meanings rather than ‘general character.’ Haydn was acknowledged in his own time for his ability to convey human experience ‘in ways that were utterly particular, intimate and

detailed. He achieves this, as Shakespeare does, through alternating contrasts. In the *Cello Concerti*, these contrasts develop through the dramatic interaction of *galant* and *grotesque* aesthetics. As theorised by Sulzer and Meier, the *galant* aesthetic invites an *arbitrary* response that stems from the listener’s known, rationalised experience. The *grotesque*, on the other hand, takes the listener involuntarily from the known into the sublime. Contrasts of the formulaic and improvised, and the *arbitrary* and *natural* in Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* account for what Webster refers to as ‘the fundamental duality of his musical persona.’ Haydn’s biographer, Albert Christoph Dies, explains an aspect of this duality:

Haydn’s first goal… was always to engage the mind through a rhythmically correct and attractive melody. Thus he leads the listener in a concealed manner to the main goal: to move the heart in manifold ways and finally, long after the emotion has ebbed away and the intellect wishes to analyze the work of art critically even after centuries, to offer the latter rich material for its satisfaction.

Haydn was considered *modern* in his time, which Webster attributes to his experimentation with new ideas. Exploring Haydn’s unique rhetoric of contrasting ideas and aesthetics in the *Cello Concerti* reveals a more useful perspective for a performer’s interpretation than a *classical* approach. As Webster points out, eighteenth-century thought was largely free from evolutionism. He argues that the *classical* style, which is defined by an evolutionist perspective, is therefore an inaccurate and misleading basis for interpreting Haydn’s music. The explanation of eighteenth century music according to stages of development, for example the *galant*

---

147 Barth, *The Pianist as Orator*, 40.
151 Ibid., 355.
superseding the Baroque, is especially problematic because it precludes the possibility of different styles co-existing.\footnote{Webster, Haydn’s “Farewell” Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style, 300.} In Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* the *galant* style coexists with *grotesque* expressions of virtuosity, the burlesque, *Sturm und Drang* and fantasy. It is this multi-faceted blending of convention with contravention that moves the musical language of Haydn’s *Cello Concerti* towards the sublime.
List of Illustrations


Table of varying connotations associated with keys, 1691–1722. From Judy Tarling, *The Weapons of Rhetoric*, p. 77. 18


*Groteskensaal* (1714) Lower Belvedere, Vienna. From Beghin and Goldberg, *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, p. 273. 34


George Stubbs, A Lion Attacking a Horse (1770). http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:A_Lion_Attacking_a_Horse_by_George_Stubbs_1770.jpeg. 61
Bibliography

Books


**Articles**


**Score Editions**


**Sound Recordings**


