Gender in the Fifty-first New South Wales Parliament

A.R. Smith

Ph D

2002

The University of Sydney
Declaration

This thesis is submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Arts, University of Sydney. The material has been compiled originally for this purpose. Any material previously published has been acknowledged.

This thesis is entirely the result of my own research.

..............................

Acknowledgments

Many people have contributed to the completion of this work. Since I began my candidature in 1995, the tasks of research and of drafting parts of the thesis involved interaction with colleagues, parliamentarians and many people indirectly concerned with the scholarly task.

The MPs and former MPs who generously gave their time deserve special thanks. Considering the pressures on their time and the enormous scrutiny they already experience, the decision by MPs to assist a project that is bound to take a critical approach to their roles shows generosity, understanding and some courage.

The project’s directions have been influenced by fellow postgraduate students who gave contact, empathy and support. Organizers of conferences (Unauthorised Texts, Diverse Feminisms 2, Australasian Study of Parliament Group 1999 and APSA 1999) provided me with opportunities to test my approaches. Editors (Legislative Studies, The People’s Choice, The Drawing Board and Lingua Franca) encouraged me to think that some parts of my research were valuable enough to publish. Staff in the Discipline gave valuable critical insights at seminars. Many scholars working in related fields inspired me to explore similar themes in mine.

Many people helped with important details. These included Attendants at the New South Wales Parliament, the staffs of MPs and administrative staff at the University of Sydney. The research would have been impossible without the assistance of dedicated librarians and the permission of the Human Ethics Committee of the University of Sydney. The thesis could not have been written without the support of I.T. professionals in the Faculty of Business and Economics.

I was fortunate in having three excellent supervisors in succession in the Discipline of Government and International Relations. My thanks is due to Professor Helen Nelson, Professor Michael Jackson and Dr Rodney Smith, who saw the project completed. Of course the final product is my own work and my supervisors should not be held responsible for my shortcomings.

While part-time employment in the Discipline was of great assistance in enabling me to complete this project, a great deal of the time spent on the thesis might otherwise have been spent at home with my family. I thank my partner, Gene for her patience and encouragement.
Abstract: Gender in the Fifty-first New South Wales Parliament

Responsible Government began in New South Wales in 1856. Direct participation by women began 70 years later in 1925 with the election of Millicent Preston-Stanley. Her first speech questioned whether Parliament was a fit place for women. Another significant milestone was reached after another 70 years when female MLAs in the Fifty-first Parliament constituted 15% of the Legislative Assembly and female MLCs made up 33% of the Legislative Council. In the 1990s there was no formal barrier to the participation of persons on the basis of their sex but no scholarly study had addressed the question of whether the Parliament’s culture was open to all gender orientations.

This study examines the hypothesis that the Parliament informally favoured some types of gender behaviour over others. It identifies ‘gender’ as behaviour rather than a characteristic of persons and avoids the conflation of gender with sex, and particularly with women exclusively.

The research used interviews, observation and document study for triangulation. The thesis describes the specific context of New South Wales parliamentary politics 1995-1999 with an emphasis on factors that affect an understanding of gender. It explores notions of representation held by MPs, analyses their personal backgrounds and reports on gender-rich behaviours in the chambers.

The study concludes that gender was a significant factor in the behaviour of Members of the Parliament. There were important differences between the ways that male and female MPs approached their roles. Analysis of the concept of gender in the Parliament shows that some behaviours are more likely to bring political success than are others. The methodology developed here by adapting literature from other systems has important strengths. The data suggest that there is a need for many more detailed studies of aspects of gender in parliaments.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 The Method</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 The Specific Context</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 Sex Ratios and Representational ideals</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 Issue Representation</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 Becoming an M.P.</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7 Parliamentary Behaviour</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 8 Conclusions</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: Interview Instrument</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1 Introduction

Section 1.1: ‘A fit place for women’?
Section 1.2: Problems of sex, gender and parliament
Section 1.3: Gender and the Parliament, 1995-1999
Section 1.4: Expectations on female M.P.s
Section 1.5: Outline of the thesis

Chapter 2 The Method

Section 2.1: Introduction
Section 2.2: Defining and studying ‘gender’
Section 2.3: Literature on role perceptions
Section 2.4: Applying the research
Section 2.5: The interviews
Section 2.6: Observation
Section 2.7: Document study
Section 2.8: Conclusions

Chapter 3 The Specific Context

Section 3.1: Introduction
Section 3.2: The media and public perceptions of parliamentarians: ‘it’s a dangerous road to always knock politicians’.
Section 3.3: Parliamentarians dealing with media: ‘conflict and blood on the floor’.
Section 3.4: Labor in Government and Parliament: ‘it was always robust. Now it’s ridiculous’.
Section 3.5: The Premier and Cabinet: ‘theatrical and presentation skills’.
Section 3.6: The 1995 election: political time and ‘the need to be seen and to politically project’.
Section 3.7: Position (the federal system) and place: ‘they wouldn’t let me near it’.
Section 3.8: Conclusions
Chapter 4: Sex Ratios and Representational Ideals
Section 4.1 Introduction
Section 4.2 Theories and political realities of representation
Section 4.3 Implementation of gender representation through elections
Section 4.4 Parliament as representative collection – the presence of the sexes
Section 4.5 Interviewee perceptions of representation
Section 4.6 Representational ideals – interviewee self-perceptions
Section 4.7 Whom M.P.s represent – evidence from inaugural speeches
Section 4.8 Conclusions

Chapter 5 Issue Representation
Section 5.1 Introduction
Section 5.2 Issues and advocates
Section 5.3 Promotion to Portfolios
Section 5.4 Committee membership
Section 5.5 Parliamentary debates and sexed issues
Section 5.6 Contentious issues: two case studies
Section 5.7 Conscience votes
Section 5.8 Party dominance of issues
Section 5.9 Conclusion

Chapter 6 Becoming an M.P.
Section 6.1 Introduction
Section 6.2 General consciousness of sex and gender: ‘I’m not a gender sort of person’
Section 6.3 Political orientation
Section 6.4 Political socialization and reasons for entering parliament
Section 6.5 Career ambitions
Section 6.6 Obstacles: ‘What do you want, “War and Peace”?’
Section 6.7 Assistance: ‘Males have mentors’
Section 6.8 The family effect
Section 6.9 ‘Two for the price of one’
Section 6.10 ‘Everyone should have a wife’
Section 6.11 ‘Nannies and cleaners’
Section 6.12 Conclusion
Chapter 7 Parliamentary Behaviour

Section 7.1 Introduction
Section 7.2 Perceptions of Parliament and M.P.s
Section 7.3 Comfort in the role
Section 7.4 Body language
Section 7.5 The impact of television
Section 7.6 Presence and listening
Section 7.7 Appearance and the gaze
Section 7.8 Unparliamentary language and silencing
Section 7.9 Conclusion

Chapter 8 Conclusions

Section 8.1 Introduction
Section 8.2 Differences between the perceptions of male and female interviewees
Section 8.3 Conclusions about gender
Section 8.4 Conclusions about methodology
Section 8.5 Hindsight and foresight
Tables
Table 1.1: Achievements by Australian Women MPs: New South Wales Compared.................. 5
Table 1.2: Women and Parliament: New South Wales Compared May 1996......................... 6
Table 1.3: Members who entered during the Fifty-first Parliament.............................. 8
Table 2.1: Stages of research on women in Australian Parliaments.............................. 20
Table 2.2 Observation diary .................................................................................. 31
Table 3.1: Polar perceptions of media effectiveness .................................................. 46
Table 3.2: Accuracy of media trivialisation of female MPs as an explanation for the sex ratios in Parliament .......................................................... 47
Table 3.3: ‘Tougher Penalties are needed to deter crime’ .......................................... 61
Table 3.4 1996 Spring Sittings ............................................................................... 64
Table 3.5 Proportion of cohorts regarding the role of MP as ‘very important’ .................. 66
Table 4.1 ‘How many women should there be?’ ...................................................... 83
Table 4.2 Comparative Table of Women MPs .......................................................... 86
Table 4.3: Marginality of seats with major party female candidates 1995 election ....... 89
Table 4.4: Marginality of seats with major party male candidates 1995 election ......... 89
Table 4.5: Number of ‘very important’ responses on some representational ideals ...... 92
Table 4.6: Inaugurals, ‘Class of 1995’ i.e. Fifty-first Parliament .................................. 94
Table 4.7: The Class of ‘95: analysis of inaugural speech content: mentions ................ 95
Table 4.8 Earlier Inaugurals made by some female Members of the Fifty-first Parliament.. 98
Table 5.1: ‘Gender-relevant policy areas’ ................................................................. 105
Table 5.2: Comparison of male and female policy first specialisations ....................... 107
Table 5.3: Committee Membership by Sex ................................................................ 116
Table 5.4: Members and Chairs by Sex Council General Purpose Standing Committees 117
Table 5.5 Three male and three female Members: speaking on Bills ......................... 119
Table 5.6: Three male and three female Members: Questions Without Notice ............ 120
Table 5.7: Three male and three female Members: other activities indexed ............... 122
Table 5.8: Women MPs are ‘more loyal to party’ ...................................................... 137
Table 6.1 Aggregate of responses to ten sex-comparative statements by sex .............. 146
Table 6.2 ‘Politics is ……. ’ ..................................................................................... 149
Table 6.3: Reactions to issues .................................................................................. 150
Table 6.4: Personal political orientation ................................................................. 151
Table 6.5: Reactions to issues by interviewee party ................................................. 152
Table 6.6 Socialisation influences ...................................................................... 153
Table 6.7 Reasons for entering parliament .............................................................. 156
Table 6.8 How long interviewees intended to remain in parliament ......................... 157
Table 6.9 Ambitions ......................................................................................... 158
Table 6.10 Factors likely to determine whether interviewees achieve their ambitions 159
Table 6.11 ‘Do you enjoy electioneering?’ 163
Table 6.12 Very important electoral assets 163
Table 6.13 Factors assisting interviewees to settle in to parliament 164
Table 6.14 Importance of ‘promptings of a mentor’ in decision to run for parliament 167
Table 7.1 Parliament’s effectiveness as … 186
Table 7.2 Formal contacts between MPs 188
Table 7.3 Contacts across the chamber 189
Table 7.4 Qualities likely to advance the career of an MP 191
Table 7.5 Very important qualities in a colleague 193
Table 7.6 Characteristics likely to be displayed by most respected colleagues 194
Table 7.7: Qualities likely in a respected colleague rated ‘very important’ 194
Table 7.8 Rating own effectiveness in aspects of the role 195
Table 7.9 Time spent on activities 197
Table 7.10 Interviewees who saw aspects of the parliamentarian’s role as ‘very important’ 198
Table 7.11 Positions on various statements about parliamentary life 199
Table 7.12 Enjoyment ratings for aspects of the parliamentary role 201
Table 7.13 Comfort levels 204
Table 7.14: Interviewees agreeing with perceptions of comparative strengths of women MPs 214
Table 7.15: Ratings of personal ‘high’ effectiveness by area of activity 215
Table 7.16: New South Wales Parliament – Sex Composition June 1996 220
Table 7.17: Interruptions of Question Time Hansard June 1996 220
Table 7.18: Question Time: interruption types 221
Table 7.19: Chamber comparison of interruptions: averages 221
Table 7.20: Sex comparison: interjections 221
Table 7.21: Sex comparison: calls to order 222
Table 7.22: Sex comparison: Assembly: ratio of calls to interjections 222
Table 7.23: Sex comparison: Council: ratio of interjections to calls 222

Figure

Figure 5.1: Parliamentary experience L.A. 1998 113