The Impact of Retailer-Supplier Cooperation and Decision-Making Uncertainty on Supply Chain Performance

Ju-Miao Melody Hsiao

A Thesis Submitted in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Institute of Transport and Logistics Studies
Faculty of Economics and Business
The University of Sydney

October 2006
ABSTRACT

Buyer-supplier relationships have been increasingly considered a critical part of contemporary supply chain management. In response to dynamic and unpredictable market changes, buyers and suppliers enter into cooperative relationships to pursue individual goals and joint goals for better economic and non-economic performance of the supply chain. On the other hand, cooperation between channel members is surrounded by uncertainty, which can create a detrimental impact on the performance of a supply chain.

Previous research has focused on various aspects of uncertainty that could affect supply chain member behaviour. The present research contends that relationship behavioural factors play an important role in increasing or mitigating channel members’ perceived uncertainty in their supply or purchase decision-making. Specifically, the purpose of this research is to investigate the impact of retailer-supplier cooperation and retailer/supplier’s decision-making uncertainty (DMU) on retail supply chain performance from the perspectives of both the retailer and the supplier. A holistic model was developed as the theoretical framework for this conceptualisation. A sample of 202 retailers and 64 suppliers in the sporting goods retail business in Taiwan was used to separately test a number of hypothesised relationships by using structural equation modelling (SEM).

The findings indicate that both cooperation and DMU are the key determinants of retail supply chain performance, including financial performance and non-financial performance (i.e., supply flexibility and customer service). Financial performance is positively affected by retailer-supplier cooperation and negatively affected by DMU in both the retailer model and the supplier model. The five dimensions of retailer-supplier cooperation (i.e. trust, guanxi, dependence, coercive power and non-coercive power) have significant effects on cooperation. However, apart from guanxi with the retailer/supplier, neither other relationship dimensions nor retailer-supplier cooperation have any influence on retailer’s DMU or supplier’s DMU. The results also indicate that differences and similarities exist across retailers and suppliers with respect to the effects of several relationship dimensions on cooperation and uncertainty.
The holistic empirical model developed for this research contributes further to understanding the links, which have been lacking in the extant channel relationship literature and supply chain management literature, between buyer-supplier relationships, DMU, and supply chain performance. The findings that a retailer/supplier’s DMU can erode the performance of a supply chain in various aspects highlight the need for improvement in some areas of supply chain efficiency and effectiveness, through cooperation-enhancing actions between the retailer and the supplier. From a managerial perspective, the performance improvement in the supply chain, in turn, will motivate more reciprocal commitment and efforts from the retailer and the supplier to maintain their working relationship. As such, mutual trust and enriched guanxi, dependence and non-coercive power help both the retailer and the supplier to have less uncertainty in their purchase/supply decision-making process. It creates a win-win position for both parties in the supply chain.

*Key words*: supply chain management, buyer-supplier relationship, cooperation, decision-making uncertainty, supply chain performance
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The journey of studying a PhD is like running a marathon, which needs enormous energy, patience, time, and wisdom. The completion of this dissertation could not have been accomplished without the support and encouragement from many individuals. Their contributions are sincerely appreciated and must be recognised.

First, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Professor David Hensher. His super efficiency and continuous support to my work motivated me to carry out a quality work until the end. He is more than just a supervisor. His intelligence, academic achievement and leadership always inspire me to follow his example not only in my academic pursuits, but also in life in general.

I would like to express my profound gratitude to Professor James Wilcox at Texas Tech University. His generous guidance in learning structural equation modelling tremendously helped me gain analytical skills, and he always answered my questions in detail. I am also thankful to Dr. Catherine Button-Bradly, from the Marketing Department, for constant advice and valuable comments in the last stages of my research.

I am grateful to my former supervisor, Dr. Sharon Purchase, at the Information Management and Marketing Department of University of Western Australia. She was the one who first introduced me to the interesting field of business networks and supply chain management.

My other wonderful and supportive PhD colleagues, Ale, Sean, Jaafar, Wafa, Geoffrey, Tony, Virginia and Theingi should be also praised. Particularly, I have to appreciate Dr. John Rose, who was also my PhD colleague, for his continuous assistance with my statistics questions at any time I need his help. He is really a helpful advisor for other PhD students.

A special thanks goes to my Chinese doctors – Dr. Wu, Dr. Chen, and Dr. Ma. They have been looking after my health whenever I study in Sydney all these years. I would like to express my deep-heart appreciation to Ms. Tigger Wise, who is my proofreader and is also a PhD mother, for her patience in correcting my writing.
It was a privilege that I was given study leave for three and half years from Ling Tung University in Taiwan. I show my sincerest appreciation to my colleagues at the Department of Technology Management and other colleagues for their administrative support and encouragement of my PhD study.

I am very grateful to my parents, my sister, and my brothers. Their special love, caring, and understanding have always given me the greatest strength and spiritual support during the PhD journey. The success of this work belongs to them as much as anyone else.
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

I certify that this work has not previously been submitted for a degree or diploma in any university. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the dissertation contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the dissertation itself.

Ju-Miao Melody Hsiao
Institute of Transport and Logistics Studies
Faculty of Economics and Business
The University of Sydney
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .......................................................................................................................... I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................. III

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY .................................................................................. V

TABLE OF CONTENTS .................................................................................................. VI

LIST OF TABLES ............................................................................................................. XI

LIST OF FIGURES ....................................................................................................... XIII

CHAPTER ONE ..................................................................................................................1

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................... 1

1.1 Performance Issues in Buyer-Supplier Relationships ............................................. 2
1.2 Research Questions and Objectives of the Research .............................................. 3
1.3 Scope of the Research ............................................................................................. 5
1.4 The Sporting Goods Industry .................................................................................. 6
  1.4.1 Current Sports Retail Supply Chain in Taiwan............................................ 7
  1.4.2 The Role of SMEs in Taiwan’s Economy .................................................. 8
  1.4.3 Growth Opportunities for Sporting Goods Industry ................................ 9
  1.4.4 Issues in the Sporting Goods Supply Chain ........................................... 10
1.5 Overview of the Methodology and Analysis ........................................................ 11
1.6 Organisation of the Dissertation ........................................................................... 12

CHAPTER TWO ............................................................................................................... 13

LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................................................. 13

2.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 13
2.2 Theoretical Foundation on Buyer-supplier Relationship ........................................ 15
  2.2.1 Social Exchange Theory ........................................................................ 15
  2.2.2 Transaction Cost Analysis ...................................................................... 17
  2.2.3 Comparison between Social Exchange Theory and Transaction Cost Analysis .................................................. 18
2.3 Supply Chain Performance ................................................................................... 19
  2.3.1 Definition and Objectives of Supply Chain Performance ..................... 19
  2.3.2 Need for Supply Chain Performance ..................................................... 19
  2.3.3 Measurement of Supply Chain Performance ......................................... 20
2.4 Cooperation ........................................................................................................... 26
  2.4.1 Definition of Cooperation ...................................................................... 26
  2.4.2 Importance of Cooperation .................................................................... 26
2.4.3 Motivations of Cooperation ................................................. 27
2.4.4 Impact of Cooperation in Relationship ................................. 29
2.5 Decision-Making Uncertainty .................................................... 30
  2.5.1 Definition of Decision-Making Uncertainty (DMU) ............... 31
  2.5.2 Types of Retail Purchase Decision ....................................... 32
  2.5.3 Effect of Buyer-Supplier Relationship on DMU ..................... 34
2.6 Trust ......................................................................................... 37
  2.6.1 Definition of Trust ............................................................... 37
  2.6.2 Importance of Trust in Buyer-Supplier Relationship .............. 39
  2.6.3 The Role of Trust ............................................................... 39
  2.6.4 Impact of Trust in Relationship ............................................ 41

2.7 Guanxi (Interpersonal Relationship) ......................................... 44
  2.7.1 Definition of Guanxi ........................................................... 44
  2.7.2 The Background of Guanxi in Chinese Society ...................... 45
  2.7.3 Importance of Guanxi ........................................................ 47
  2.7.4 Impact of Guanxi ............................................................... 48

2.8 Power and Dependence .......................................................... 51
  2.8.1 Definition of Power and Dependence ................................. 51
  2.8.2 Sources of Power ............................................................... 52
  2.8.3 Channel Power in the Retail Supply Chains ......................... 54
  2.8.4 Impact of Power and Dependence ....................................... 55
  2.8.5 Empirical Studies of Power and Dependence in Chinese Context 58

2.9 A Critical Assessment of Relevant Literature ............................ 59
2.10 Summary .................................................................................. 61

CHAPTER THREE ............................................................................. 62
CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AND HYPOTHESES ............................. 62

3.1 Introduction ............................................................................... 62
3.2 Retailer-Supplier Cooperation and Supply Chain Performance .......................... 64
3.3 Decision-Making Uncertainty and Supply Chain Performance .......................... 67
3.4 Financial Performance and Non-financial Performance ............................... 69
3.5 Relationship Dimensions, Cooperation, and DMU ................................. 71
  3.5.1 Trust, Cooperation, and DMU ............................................. 71
  3.5.2 Guanxi, Cooperation, and DMU ......................................... 73
  3.5.3 Dependence, Cooperation, and DMU .................................. 75
  3.5.4 Power, Cooperation, and DMU .......................................... 77
  3.5.5 Cooperation and DMU ...................................................... 80

3.6 Hypothesised Models and Summary of Hypotheses .......... 81
3.7 Summary .................................................................................. 82
CHAPTER FOUR ..............................................................................................................87
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN .............................................................87

4.1 Introduction ...........................................................................................................87
4.2 Empirical Design .................................................................................................87
  4.2.1 Research Context ...................................................................................88
  4.2.2 Survey Method .......................................................................................89
  4.2.3 Unit of Analysis .....................................................................................90
  4.2.4 Techniques to Increase Response Rate ..................................................91
4.3 Sampling Design .................................................................................................92
  4.3.1 Sampling Frame .....................................................................................92
  4.3.2 Selection of Key Informants ..................................................................93
4.4 Questionnaire Development .................................................................................95
  4.4.1 Process of Questionnaire Development .................................................95
  4.4.2 Development of Measures ...................................................................100
  4.4.3 Measures of Buyer-Supplier Relationship ...........................................101
  4.4.4 Measure of Decision-Making Uncertainty ...........................................106
  4.4.5 Measures of Supply Chain Performance .............................................107
4.5 Data Collection ................................................................................................... 110
  4.5.1 Response Rate ......................................................................................110
  4.5.2 Non-response Bias ...............................................................................110
4.6 Analytical Procedures......................................................................................... 113
4.7 Summary............................................................................................................. 115

CHAPTER FIVE ............................................................................................................. 116
EXPLORATORY DATA ANALYSIS ............................................................................. 116

5.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................... 116
5.2 Data Screening ....................................................................................................116
5.3 Descriptive Analysis of Sample Demographics ..................................................117
  5.3.1 Characteristics of Retailer Samples .....................................................117
  5.3.2 Characteristics of Supplier Samples ....................................................122
5.4 Summary Statistics .............................................................................................126
  5.4.1 Item Analysis .......................................................................................126
  5.4.2 Assessment of Reliability ....................................................................128
5.5 Test of Equality of Covariance Matrices ............................................................133
5.6 Factor Analysis ..................................................................................................134
  5.6.1 Results of Factor Analysis for Retailer Group .....................................134
  5.6.2 Sample Size Issue with Supplier Group .............................................137
5.7 Summary.............................................................................................................140
CHAPTER SIX ................................................................................................................141

STRUCTURAL EQUATION MODELLING ...............................................................141

6.1 Introduction.........................................................................................................141
6.2 Overview of Structural Equation Modelling .......................................................141
  6.2.1 Assumption ..........................................................................................143
  6.2.2 Sample Size ..........................................................................................143
  6.2.3 Model Specification and Identification ................................................144
  6.2.4 Model Estimation .................................................................................145
  6.2.5 Model Re-specification ........................................................................146
  6.2.6 Evaluation of Goodness-of-Fit Criteria ...............................................146
    6.2.6.1 Overall Model Fit ..................................................................147
    6.2.6.2 Assessment of Measurement Model Fit ................................149
    6.2.6.3 Assessment of Structural Model Fit ......................................152
6.3 Procedures of Structural Equation Modelling ....................................................152
  6.3.1 Data Normality Checking ....................................................................152
  6.3.2 Path Model and Equations ...................................................................153
6.4 Assessment of Measurement Model ...................................................................157
  6.4.1 Measurement Model for Retailer Group..............................................157
    6.4.1.1 Assessment of Overall Model Fit .........................................159
    6.4.1.2 Reliability and Validity .........................................................159
  6.4.2 Measurement Model - Supplier ...........................................................166
    6.4.2.1 Assessment of Overall Model Fit .........................................171
    6.4.2.2 Reliability and Validity .........................................................171
6.5 Assessment of Structural Model .........................................................................176
  6.5.1 Results of Retailer’s Structural Model.................................................176
  6.5.2 Results of Supplier’s Structural Model ................................................179
6.6 Summary .............................................................................................................183

CHAPTER SEVEN..........................................................................................................184

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION .....................................................................................184

7.1 Introduction.........................................................................................................184
7.2 Effects of Cooperation on Supply Chain Performance .......................................185
  7.2.1 Results and Discussion ........................................................................185
  7.2.2 Managerial Implications ......................................................................189
7.3 Effects of DMU and Supply Chain Performance ................................................190
  7.3.1 Results and Discussion ........................................................................191
  7.3.2 Managerial Implications ......................................................................194
7.4 Relationships between Supply Chain Performance Dimensions .........................195
  7.4.1 Results and Discussion ........................................................................196
7.4.2 Managerial Implications ................................................................. 197

7.5 Effects of Relationship Dimensions on Cooperation and DMU .............. 198
7.5.1 Trust, Cooperation, and DMU ......................................................... 198
7.5.1.1 Results and Discussion ............................................................. 199
7.5.1.2 Managerial Implications ........................................................... 201
7.5.2 Guanxi, Cooperation, and DMU ..................................................... 202
7.5.2.1 Results and Discussion ............................................................. 202
7.5.2.2 Managerial Implications ........................................................... 204
7.5.3 Dependence, Cooperation, and DMU ............................................. 205
7.5.3.1 Results and Discussion ............................................................. 205
7.5.3.2 Managerial Implications ........................................................... 206
7.5.4 Power, Cooperation, and DMU ...................................................... 207
7.5.4.1 Results and Discussion ............................................................. 207
7.5.4.2 Managerial Implications ........................................................... 209
7.5.5 Cooperation and DMU ................................................................. 210
7.5.5.1 Results and Discussion ............................................................. 210
7.5.5.2 Managerial Implications ........................................................... 211

7.6 Similarities and Differences between Retailer Model and Supplier Model ... 214
7.7 Summary ............................................................................................ 215

CHAPTER EIGHT ......................................................................................... 217

CONCLUSION ........................................................................................... 217

8.1 Summary of the Empirical Findings ..................................................... 217
8.2 Contributions of the Research ............................................................. 219
8.3 Limitations .......................................................................................... 221
8.4 Directions of Future Research .............................................................. 221
8.5 Implications and Concluding Thoughts ................................................. 223

REFERENCES ........................................................................................... 225

APPENDIX A: IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW QUESTIONS ...................................... 253
APPENDIX B: INFORMATION SHEET AND QUESTIONNAIRES (ENGLISH) ... 256
APPENDIX C: COVER LETTER AND QUESTIONNAIRE (CHINESE) ............. 270
APPENDIX D: INITIAL RESULT OF FACTOR ANALYSIS ............................ 285
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Measures of Performance Pertinent to Retail Supply Chains.................................25
Table 2.2: Trust and Performance ........................................................................................43
Table 2.3: Guanxi and Performance.....................................................................................50
Table 2.4: Dichotomisation of Sources of Power ..................................................................53
Table 2.5: Studies of Power, Dependence, and Other Relational/Outcome Variables ......56
Table 3.1: Summary of Hypotheses from the Retailer Perspective .....................................83
Table 3.2: Summary of Hypotheses from the Supplier Perspective ....................................85
Table 4.1: Summary of In-depth Interviews with Retailers and Suppliers..........................98
Table 4.2: Summary of Questionnaire Items for Relationship Constructs .........................104
Table 4.3: Summary of Questionnaire Items for DMU .....................................................107
Table 4.4: Summary of Questionnaire Items for Supply Chain Performance .................109
Table 4.5: Test for Any Significant Differences between Respondents and Non-respondents - Retailer Group..............................................................112
Table 4.6: Test for Any Significant Differences between Respondents and Non-respondents - Supplier Group ..............................................................112
Table 5.1: Number of Years in Sporting Goods Business - Retailers ................................117
Table 5.2: Number of Employees - Retailers .....................................................................118
Table 5.3: Number of Outlets .............................................................................................118
Table 5.4: Geographical Location of Store ........................................................................119
Table 5.5: Annual Sales Volume - Retailers ........................................................................119
Table 5.6: Number of Years of Relationship with the Major Supplier - Retailers ..........120
Table 5.7: Percentage of Total Sales Contributed by the Major Supplier - Retailers ....121
Table 5.8A: Number of International Brands Carried .......................................................122
Table 5.8B: Number of Local Brands Carried ...................................................................122
Table 5.9: Number of Years in Sporting Goods Business - Suppliers ...............................123
Table 5.10: Number of Employees - Suppliers ..................................................................124
Table 5.11: Number of Retailers Supplied .........................................................................124
**LIST OF FIGURES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Channel of Distribution of Sporting Goods in Taiwan</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Main Focus Areas in Channel Relationship Research</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Types of Supply Contract</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Conceptual Framework for Buyer-Supplier Relationship and Supply Chain Performance</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Hypothesised Model from the Retailer Perspective</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Hypothesised Model from the Supplier Perspective</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Process of Survey Instrument Development</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Statistical Analysis Procedures</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Full Structural Equation Model - Retailer Group</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Cooperation</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Supplier’s DMU</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Supply Chain Performance</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Supplier’s Trust in the Retailer</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Retailer’s Guanxi with the Supplier</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Supplier’s Dependence on the Retailer</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Measurement Model - Retailer’s Power</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Results of the Structural Model - Retailer Perspective</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Results of the Structural Model - Supplier Perspective</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Comparisons of the Effects of Cooperation on Supply Chain Performance</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Comparisons of the Effects of DMU on Supply Chain Performance</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Comparisons of the Relationships between Supply Chain Performance Dimensions</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>Comparisons of the Effects of Relationship Dimensions on Cooperation</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>Comparisons of the Effects of Relationship Dimensions on DMU</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Four Types of Supply Chain Relationships</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>