Montessori's mediation of meaning:
a social semiotic perspective

by

Susan Feez

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

University of Sydney

May 2007
Preface

I have been unusually fortunate to be a member of two remarkable intellectual communities, each one emerging from the work of an inspiring scholar.

As a Montessori teacher I belong to an international community of educators motivated by an intense respect for, and profound understanding of, the contribution children make to our shared humanity. This community works with a rich and expansive approach to pedagogy, an approach first described by Dr Maria Montessori.

As a teacher linguist, specialising in systemic functional linguistics, I belong to an international community of linguists who share a commitment to theoretical and social integrity. This community is inspired by a rich and expansive approach to the study of meaning, a social semiotics, first described by Professor Michael Halliday.

Writing this thesis has provided me with an opportunity to bring together the rewards membership of these two communities has bestowed. I sincerely hope the final result does justice to such a distinguished provenance.
Acknowledgements

Special thanks must go first to my supervisor, Professor Geoff Williams (formerly of the University of Sydney, and now of the University of British Columbia) for giving me the confidence to initiate this study and the encouragement to persevere with it. His careful reading, thoughtful responses and insightful guidance have been wonderfully motivating. In my opinion, his generous, apposite and respectful intervention over the years of the study has earned him the right to be considered an honorary Montessori teacher.

Sincere thanks are also due to Professor Margaret Clunies-Ross (University of Sydney), who has so carefully and generously supervised the completion and submission of the thesis.

Friends, colleagues and parents from the Montessori community have contributed to this project in more ways than I can record here. I am very grateful indeed to them all for so much support. In particular, I wish to thank:

Sue Birdsall (Principal, Montessori East, Bondi NSW and Board Member, Association Montessori Internationale) who first invited me to train as a Montessori teacher

Fiona Campbell (Principal, Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW), for her encouragement, and very helpful ‘Montessori’ reading of the first three chapters of the thesis

Catherine Harding (Teacher, Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW) for the anecdote used in Chapter 8

I would also like to acknowledge Ms Elizabeth Hall (most recently of the Montessori Institute, Denver, Colorado) and the late Signor Camillo Grazzini (Fondazione Centro Internazionale di Studi Montessoriani, Bergamo, Italy), the Association Montessori Internationale teacher trainers to whom I am forever indebted. Their masterful presentations and inspiring, yet always practical, interpretations of Montessori pedagogy
laid the foundation that made this study possible. Any limitations in the interpretation of Montessori pedagogy in this thesis, however, are my own.

It is impossible to name all the many friends and colleagues from the community of systemic functional linguists who have provided intellectual and moral support. The genuine interest they have shown in this project and the sharing of so many stimulating ideas and wise suggestions have been enormously valuable and appreciated more than I can say. In particular, I would like to thank:

Professor Jim Martin (University of Sydney) who first suggested that the Montessori approach to the study of grammar deserved to be shared with a wider audience

Dr Clare Painter (University of New South Wales) for sharing so generously her time and the benefit of her extraordinary expertise

Helen de Silva Joyce (Director, NSW AMES) for her invaluable help with the final production of the thesis

Completing such a project has only been possible with a great deal of support and understanding from family and friends. My most grateful thanks is extended to all of them, with special mention to my parents for their very practical help, including the use of their home in country Queensland as a retreat during the final stage of thesis-writing.

As Dr Montessori would expect, this thesis is dedicated to the children and young people who, everyday around the world, are working with so much energy to construct the future, reminding us all of our responsibility to provide them with the best materials we can offer. In my world, the individuals engaged in this most important of all work include my nieces and nephews: Rebecca, Finn, Lachlan, India, Toby and Harry.

Most especially, this thesis is dedicated to all the wonderful children in my ‘six to nine’ class at Montessori East (Bondi NSW) between 2002 and 2006. What I learned watching these children use the Montessori materials lies at the heart of this study.
Photographs

I wish to acknowledge the following organisations, websites and individuals for the photographs used in this document:

Government Printing Office collection, State Government Archives PICMAN database, State Library of New South Wales for the photographs used in Illustrations 1.1 and 7.3, and for the black and white photograph in Table 7.7

Candy le Guay for photographs used in Illustrations 1.2; 6.4; 6.8 and 7.12

Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW, with special thanks to Nirmala Santhiran and Catherine Harding, for photographs used in Illustrations 4.1; 5.1; 5.2; 6.5; 6.6; 6.15; 7.1; 7.3 and 7.7

Australian Montessori Teacher Education Foundation, Lindfield NSW, for the photograph used in Illustration 6.3

Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue for the photographs used in Illustrations 6.4; 6.7; 6.10; 6.11; 6.12; 6.14; 7.2; 7.7 and 7.9.

Montessori East, Bondi NSW, for photographs used in Illustrations 7.4; 7.6; 7.8; 7.10, 7.12 and 7.14, and in Tables 7.5; 7.6; 7.7; 7.8; 7.9 and 7.11

Toby Grannall for the photograph used in Figure 7.9

Bauhaus-Archiv, Berlin for the photograph used in Illustration 7.13.
Table of Contents

Preface .................................................................................................................................................. i
Acknowledgements .......................................................................................................................... ii
Photographs ....................................................................................................................................... iv
Table of contents ................................................................................................................................ v
List of figures ....................................................................................................................................... xii
List of tables ...................................................................................................................................... xiv
List of illustrations ........................................................................................................................... xv
Style note ............................................................................................................................................ xviii
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... xix

CHAPTER 1. Introduction

1.1 A Montessori classroom .............................................................................................................. 1
  1.1.1 The Montessori objects ......................................................................................................... 3

1.2 Maria Montessori and her legacy
  1.2.1 Montessori’s life and work ................................................................................................. 4
  1.2.2 The origins and scope of Montessori’s legacy ................................................................. 12
  1.2.3 Varying interpretations of Montessori’s legacy ............................................................... 14
  1.2.4 Locating Montessori’s legacy in the history of educational thought ............................ 16
  1.2.5 Re-viewing Montessori’s legacy from a semiotic perspective ...................................... 20

1.3 A meta-analytic framework for the study
  1.3.1 Examining the design and use of the materials ............................................................... 24
  1.3.2 Social semiotics as a central component of the meta-analytic framework ............... 26
  1.3.3 Recontextualising educational knowledge in pedagogic discourse ........................... 29

1.4 Pedagogic objects: Re-theorizing Montessori’s proposals
  1.4.1 Meaning relations by design .............................................................................................. 30
  1.4.2 Pedagogic objects for learning grammar ....................................................................... 30
  1.4.3 Educational knowledge designed into objects ............................................................... 32

1.5 Thesis overview ......................................................................................................................... 33
CHAPTER 2. Reading Montessori

2.1 The Montessori material legacy and the Montessori literature ........................................ 35
2.2 Contemporary interpretations of Montessori’s published work ........................................ 35
  2.2.1 The publication of Montessori’s work ............................................................................ 36
  2.2.2 The expression of Montessori’s ideas .......................................................................... 38
  2.2.3 A closer reading of the Montessori style ...................................................................... 40
2.3 An oral tradition .................................................................................................................. 43
  2.3.1 Anecdotal advocacy .................................................................................................... 44
  2.3.2 A movement of dialects ............................................................................................. 45
  2.3.3 An oral training .......................................................................................................... 46
  2.3.4 A theory of practice ................................................................................................... 49
  2.3.5 Discipline knowledge as a ‘special psychology ...................................................... 50
  2.3.6 Thinking the unthinkable ........................................................................................... 51
2.4 Locating the study within the Montessori tradition ......................................................... 52
  2.4.1 A practitioner’s perspective ....................................................................................... 53
  2.4.2 Primary sources: personal albums ............................................................................. 55
2.5 Secondary literature .......................................................................................................... 56
  2.5.1 A literature diverse in time and place ...................................................................... 56
  2.5.2 A literature diverse in purpose and scope .................................................................. 57
2.6 Montessori and positivist anthropology ............................................................................ 59
2.7 Interpretation of Montessori literature .............................................................................. 64

CHAPTER 3. Liberty and knowledge: the Enlightenment to the twentieth century

3.1 Two proponents of liberty in education ............................................................................. 65
  3.1.1 Aristotle’s ground ....................................................................................................... 69
3.2 Montessori and the Enlightenment
  3.2.1 Charting the terrain .................................................................................................... 71
  3.2.2 Experience, perception and the senses ....................................................................... 72
  3.2.3 Attention and reflection ............................................................................................. 73
  3.2.4 Language and the functions of the mind .................................................................... 74
  3.2.5 Knowledge and reason ............................................................................................. 77
3.2.6 Liberty ................................................................. 78
3.2.7 Social relations between children and adults .................. 79
3.2.8 The evolution of Locke’s terms .................................... 81

3.3 Pedagogies arising from Rousseau

3.3.1 The liberty of Rousseau ........................................... 83
3.3.2 Pestalozzi’s method ................................................. 86
3.3.3 Froebel’s gifts ......................................................... 87
3.3.4 Competing interpretations ....................................... 89

3.4 The liberty of Condillac ............................................ 90

3.4.1 Liberty through signs ............................................. 94

3.5 A child of nature ..................................................... 99

3.5.1 Visual grammar as pedagogy .................................... 102
3.5.2 A medical pedagogy .............................................. 102
3.5.3 Awakening the child’s senses ................................... 104
3.5.4 Developing the child’s intellectual function .................. 106
3.5.5 Teaching the child to read and write ......................... 109
3.5.6 Itard’s influence on Montessori pedagogy ................. 110

3.6 Séguin’s physiological pedagogy ................................. 113

3.6.1. The well-being of children .................................... 114
3.6.2 Sensory training and comparison ............................. 115
3.6.3 Reading and grammar .......................................... 117
3.6.4 Séguin’s developmental trajectory ......................... 118

3.7 Pedagogy and Modernism

3.7.1 A generation of intellectual pioneers ......................... 119
3.7.2 Liberty, observation and activity ............................. 122
3.7.3 Montessori and twentieth-century ideas about education 123

3.8 Conclusion ............................................................ 129
CHAPTER 4. Mapping development across time and space: A first step towards a meta-analytic framework

4.1 Conceptual parallels between Montessori and Vygotsky .................................................. 132
  4.1.1 A shared heritage and context .......................................................... 133
  4.1.2 A comparable experimental method .................................................. 135
  4.1.3 Modelling human development as adaptation ................................. 138
  4.1.4 Séguin’s socially-oriented pedagogy .................................................. 142
4.2 Montessori’s reorganisation of the arrow of time .................................................. 144
4.3 Biogenetic and sociogenetic development .................................................. 147
  4.3.1 A genetic explanation of human liberty, activity and consciousness .... 148
  4.3.2 The word which makes man’s action free ....................................... 150
  4.3.3 The shifting relation between speech and action ............................. 151
  4.3.4 The reorganisation of the relations between natural functions .......... 153
  4.3.5 The reconstruction of memory ...................................................... 157
  4.3.6 The ontogenesis of higher mental functions: an overview .............. 159
4.4 Semiotic mediation as microgenesis .................................................. 160
  4.4.1 The microgenesis of Séguin’s method ............................................ 161
  4.4.2 Learning as a region of collaboration ............................................. 164
  4.4.3 Everyday knowledge and educational knowledge .......................... 169
  4.4.4 Learning as a spiral trajectory from concrete to abstract ................. 172
  4.4.5 Representation enriched by redundancy ........................................ 178
4.5 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 181

CHAPTER 5. Mapping meaning across multiple dimensions: further steps towards a meta-analytic framework

5.1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 184
5.2 An ensemble of developmental resources ............................................. 185
5.3 The evolution of a unit of analysis to accord with Vygotsky’s framework
  5.3.1 Word meaning and speech function ............................................. 187
  5.3.2 From word meaning to text as a unit of meaning ............................ 188
5.4 The significance of a relational model of meaning-making ................ 189
5.5 Social semiotics: a socio-semiotic view of meaning

5.5.1 The multiple dimensions of semiosis: towards a social semiotic analytic framework for Montessori pedagogy ................................................................. 192
5.5.2 System ........................................................................................................... 193
5.5.3 Instantiation ................................................................................................. 195
5.5.4 Realisation ..................................................................................................... 200
5.5.5 Metafunction ................................................................................................. 204
5.5.6 Structure ........................................................................................................ 206

5.6 The Montessori ensemble as a multimodal semantic unit ........................................... 210

5.6.1 The ideational meaning potential of a Montessori ensemble ................................ 211
5.6.2 The interpersonal meaning potential of a Montessori ensemble ......................... 220
5.6.3 The textual meaning potential of a Montessori ensemble .................................... 223

5.7 The structure of the Montessori ensemble

5.7.1 The stages of a Montessori ensemble ............................................................ 228
5.7.2 The Montessori ensemble: analysing designed microgenesis ........................... 232

5.8 The pedagogic device: a social view of cultural reproduction

5.8.1 A grammar of pedagogy ................................................................................ 233
5.8.2 Educational knowledge and Montessori pedagogic discourse ............................. 234
5.8.3 Recontextualising knowledge in Montessori pedagogy ...................................... 236
5.8.4 Montessori pedagogy as an ‘invisible’ visible pedagogy ................................... 238

5.9 The meta-analytic framework: a review ..................................................................... 240

CHAPTER 6. An overview of Montessori pedagogy - recontextualising and decontextualising educational knowledge

6.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 241

6.2 The four planes of development

6.2.1 The constructive rhythm of life ....................................................................... 242
6.2.2 Sensitive periods and the rhythm of development ............................................ 244
6.2.3 The plane of infancy ......................................................................................... 245
6.2.4 The plane of childhood ..................................................................................... 246
6.2.5 Beyond childhood ............................................................................................. 247
6.3 Complementary approaches to developmental transitions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>Periodic transformation</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Expanding meaning potential</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>Providing a semiotic preparation for learning educational knowledge</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>A multi-dimensional instructional landscape</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4 A comparison between teaching aids and Montessori objects | 259 |

6.5 Recontextualising educational knowledge | 262 |

6.6 The exercises of practical life: voluntary control and independence through practical activity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1</td>
<td>Developing independence and training the ‘will’</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2</td>
<td>Practical life as instructional discourse</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.3</td>
<td>Practical life as regulative discourse</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.7 The exercises of the senses: controlling hierarchical meaning systems through practical activity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.7.1</td>
<td>Materialised abstractions</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.2</td>
<td>The three-period lesson of Séguin</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.8 Decontextualising educational knowledge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.8.1</td>
<td>Geometry cabinet</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.2</td>
<td>The geometry sticks and the passage to abstraction</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.9 Conclusion | 310 |

CHAPTER 7. Learning to read with grammatics

7.1 Introduction | 312 |

7.2 A background to the study of grammar in schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1</td>
<td>Grammar as parsing and etiquette</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2</td>
<td>Grammar as function and meaning</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3</td>
<td>Vygotsky and the study of grammar</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.4</td>
<td>Grammar, grammatics and redundancy</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.5</td>
<td>Parts of speech: word class and word function</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.6</td>
<td>Play and work, imagination and abstraction in literacy development</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.7</td>
<td>Writing as mechanics and writing as meaning-making</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.3 Phonics is not the whole language story

7.3.1 A review of contemporary debates ......................................................... 328
7.3.2 Applying the stratified model of language to literacy development .......... 329
7.3.3 The passage from a sensory to a literate culture ..................................... 330
7.3.4 Analysing the sounds of spoken language: the moveable alphabet .......... 334
7.3.5 From decomposing the sounds of speech to interpreting written words ...... 337

7.4 Grammatics as mediational means towards ‘total’ reading ......................... 341

7.4.1 Contemporary grammar teaching resources ............................................. 342
7.4.2 Montessori grammatics: a passage from the mechanical to logical reading .. 343
7.4.3 Functions of words: from meta-representation to metalanguage ............. 346
7.4.4 The Montessori grammar symbols as reading pedagogy ......................... 351
7.4.5 Using the grammar symbols to mediate potential and instance ............... 353
7.4.6 Representing logical meaning with the grammar symbols ...................... 362
7.4.7 How the Montessori grammar symbols make use of the semiotics of colour 366
7.4.8 Extending the study of grammar ............................................................ 371

7.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................... 375

CHAPTER 8. Conclusion

8.1 Re-viewing a Montessori classroom ............................................................ 377
8.2 Directions for future research beyond the study ........................................ 381
8.3 Letting the Montessori objects go ............................................................... 383

Bibliography ....................................................................................................... 385
## List of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1</td>
<td>The shifting relation between speech and action</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.2</td>
<td>The re-organisation of the relations between natural functions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.3</td>
<td>The reconstruction of memory</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Language and context as potential and instance</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.2</td>
<td>Situation type and register as sub-potential</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.3</td>
<td>The two layers of a simple sign</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.4</td>
<td>The multiple layers of language</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.5</td>
<td>Language and context</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.6</td>
<td>The rank scale of grammar</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.7</td>
<td>Typical grammatical realisation of sequences, figures and elements</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.8</td>
<td>The system instantiated by the embroidered lines</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.9</td>
<td>The system instantiated by the array of folded cloths</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.10</td>
<td>Typical grammatical realisations of speech functions</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.1</td>
<td>Box 1 colour tablets and the system they materialise</td>
<td>284 [Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.2</td>
<td>Box 2 colour tablets and the system they materialise</td>
<td>286 [Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6.3</td>
<td>Box 3 colour tablets and the system they materialise</td>
<td>287 [Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.1</td>
<td>From the use of objects (objects + action) in the material domain to conscious choice and abstract thought in the domain of meaning</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.2</td>
<td>Developmental interplay between imagination and abstraction</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.3</td>
<td>Developmental spiral from play via drawing to writing</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.4</td>
<td>A typical entry-level system of sandpaper letter shape-/sound/ contrasts</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.5</td>
<td>The sandpaper letters: attending to the expression stratum of spoken and written language (sounds and letter shapes)</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.6</td>
<td>The moveable alphabet: attending to the relation between the semantic and expression strata of spoken and written language</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.7</td>
<td>Word reading: finding the accent as a first step towards attending to the lexicogrammatical stratum of written language</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7.8</td>
<td>Redundant multimodal resources for attending to the noun family shunting attention between instance and potential</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 7.9: Redundant multimodal resources for attending to the *verb family*
shunting attention between instance and potential .......................... 362
Figure 7.10: Representing logical meaning .................................................. 363
Figure 7.11: Representing logical meaning in an expanded noun ‘family’ .......... 363
Figure 7.12: The six variable features of colour ........................................... 369
Figure 7.13: Designing objects to recontextualise grammatics as pedagogic discourse ... 370
List of tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.1</td>
<td>A dynamic figure realised as both manipulated object and as grammatical structure</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.2</td>
<td>A static figure represented as a value in a system, both materially and linguistically</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.3</td>
<td>An element attributed with a value and a class, both materially and linguistically</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5.4</td>
<td>The structure of a Montessori ensemble</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.1</td>
<td>A comparison of Montessori’s and Halliday’s developmental models</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.2</td>
<td>The presentation stage of the table washing ensemble</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.3</td>
<td>Teacher language in the three period lesson of Séguin</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.4</td>
<td>First period: colour tablet assigned a quality</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.5</td>
<td>First period: colour tablet identified by a signal and by a value</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.6</td>
<td>First period: conflation of experiential and interpersonal meanings</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.7</td>
<td>First period: conflation of experiential, interpersonal and textual meanings</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.8</td>
<td>Third stage of the ensemble: experiential meaning</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.9</td>
<td>Teacher language in a geometry cabinet three period lesson</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.10</td>
<td>First period: plane inset given a common name</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.11</td>
<td>Second period: name as a signal for an inset</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6.12</td>
<td>Third period: name as class of shapes</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.1</td>
<td>The progression of Montessori grammar pedagogy from four to nine years</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.2</td>
<td>Probe question as a gateway from signal to symbol and future-oriented semantic contour</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.3</td>
<td>The Montessori grammar symbols</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.4</td>
<td>Presenting the noun symbol</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.5</td>
<td>Presenting the noun family symbols: from three-dimensional to two-dimensional symbols</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.6</td>
<td>Presenting the verb symbol</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.7</td>
<td>The verb family</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.8</td>
<td>The conjunction presentation</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.9</td>
<td>The preposition presentation</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.10</td>
<td>Advanced grammar symbols</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7.11</td>
<td>Grammar box examples</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# List of illustrations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 1.1</td>
<td>Blackfriars Demonstration School, Chippendale, Sydney</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken by unknown photographer in 1914 and archived in Government Printing Office collection, State Government Archives PICMAN database, State Library of New South Wales]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 1.2</td>
<td>Inner City Montessori School, Drummoyne, Sydney</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken by Candy le Guay in 1984 at the Inner City Montessori School, Drummoyne, NSW]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 3.1</td>
<td>Froebel’s gifts</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph by E. Y. Do <a href="http://code.arc.cmu.edu/~ellendo/0.Froebel/031-6.html">http://code.arc.cmu.edu/~ellendo/0.Froebel/031-6.html</a> accessed 15 October 2007]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 4.1</td>
<td>Montessori geometry insets</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 5.1</td>
<td>The folding cloths</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW; drawing from a Montessori teacher’s album prepared in 1984]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 5.2</td>
<td>A folding cloth dynamic ‘figure’</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 5.3</td>
<td>A synoptic array of related elements concluding the folding cloth activity</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Drawing from a Montessori teacher’s album prepared in 1984]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 6.1</td>
<td>The stages of development</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Diagram reproduced in Grazzini 1979, p. 30]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 6.2</td>
<td>Prepared paths to culture</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Diagram reproduced in AMI Communications Number 4, 1973, p. 12.]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 6.3</td>
<td>The exercises of practical life on the shelf</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph taken in 2005 at the Australian Montessori Teacher Education Foundation, Lindfield, NSW.]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illustration 6.4</td>
<td>The second stage of practical life ensembles (independent work)</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[Photograph of washing up taken by Candy le Guay in 1984 at the Inner City Montessori School, Drummoyne, NSW; photograph of shoe polishing from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illustration 6.5 Table washing set up (array) and colour-coded elements .......................... 276
[Drawing from a Montessori teacher’s album prepared in 1985; photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW.]

Illustration 6.6 Table washing figures ................................................................. 277
[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]

Illustration 6.7 The pink tower ............................................................................. 281
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 6.8 Stage 2 - Independent work with the pink tower and the solid cylinders ... 282
[Photographs taken by Candy le Guay in 1984 at the Inner City Montessori School, Drummoyne, NSW]

Illustration 6.9 Box 1 colour tablets array in progress ............................................. 285
[Drawing from a Montessori teacher’s album prepared in 1984]

Illustration 6.10 The geometry solids and the geometry cabinet ................................. 299
[Photographs from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 6.11 The geometry cabinet presentation tray ............................................. 300
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 6.12 Independent work with the geometry cabinet ..................................... 301
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue; photograph taken by Candy le Guay in 1984 at the Inner City Montessori School, Drummoyne, NSW]

Illustration 6.13 The cards of the geometry cabinet .................................................. 305
[Photographs from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 6.14 The geometry sticks ...................................................................... 308
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 6.15 Constructing figures with the geometry sticks and a final array .......................... 309
(\textit{the seven triangles of reality}) with labels and definition booklets ... .................................
[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]

Illustration 7.1 Presenting the metal insets .............................................................. 331
[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]

Illustration 7.2 Using the sandpaper letters ............................................................ 332
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 7.3 Using the moveable alphabet in 1914 and 2006 ... ............................. 335
[Black and white photograph taken by unknown photographer in 1914 and archived in Government Printing Office collection, State Library of New South Wales; coloured photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW]
Illustration 7.4 Action word cards colour-coded red ........................................... 340
[Photograph taken in 2005 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]

Illustration 7.5 An array of labels, objects and grammar symbols ......................... 350

Illustration 7.6 Using adjectives in ‘noun families’ to organise and label the farm .......... 350
[Photograph taken in 2005 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]

Illustration 7.7 Storing the Montessori moveable alphabet and the Montessori grammar symbols ................................................................. 351
[Photograph taken in 2006 at the Inner City Montessori School, Balmain NSW; photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 7.8 The Montessori grammar symbols in use ........................................ 352
[Photograph taken in 2005 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]

Illustration 7.9 The Montessori grammar symbols .............................................. 355
[Photograph from the Nienhuis Montessori online catalogue]

Illustration 7.10 Working with the functions of noun families, prepositions and conjunctions using objects, slips of paper and symbols ..................................................... 365
[Photograph taken in 2006 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]

Illustration 7.11 Im Blau by Wassily Kandinsky, 1925 Oil on canvas. 80 x 110 cm. Kunstsammlung Nordrhein-Westfalen, Düsseldorf, Germany .............................................. 366

Illustration 7.12 Reading analysis ........................................................................... 372
[Photograph taken in 2006 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]

Illustration 7.13 Grammar box from the period 1913 to 1935 .................................. 373
[Photograph from the Bauhaus-Archiv, Berlin, Germany]

Illustration 7.14 Grammar boxes on the shelf ....................................................... 374
[Photograph taken in 2006 at Montessori East, Bondi NSW]
Style note

This thesis includes quotations in which the pronouns ‘he’ or ‘it’ are used as a generic reference to ‘the child’. Such usage represents either the English convention of an earlier era or the direct translation of grammatical gender as used in a language other than English.
Abstract

The distinctive objects designed by Dr Maria Montessori as the centrepiece of her approach to pedagogy are the topic of this study. The Montessori approach to pedagogy, celebrating its centenary in 2007, continues to be used in classrooms throughout the world. Despite such widespread and enduring use, there has been little analysis of the Montessori objects to evaluate or understand their pedagogic impact.

This study begins by outlining the provenance of the Montessori objects, reaching the conclusion that the tendency to interpret them from the perspective of the progressive education movement of the early twentieth century fails to provide insights into the developmental potential embodied in the objects. In order to appreciate that potential more fully, the study explores the design of the objects, specifically, the way in which the semiotic qualities embodied in their design orient children to the meanings of educational knowledge.

A meta-analytic framework comprising three components is used to analyse the semiotic potential of the Montessori objects as educational artefacts. First, Vygotsky’s model of development is used to analyse the objects as external mediational means and to recognise the objects as complexes of signs materialising educational knowledge. In order to understand how the objects capture, in the form of concrete analogues, the linguistic meanings which construe educational knowledge, systemic functional linguistics, the second component of the framework, is used to achieve a rich and detailed social semiotic analysis of these relations, in particular, material and linguistic representations of abstract educational meanings. Finally, the pedagogic device, a central feature of Bernstein’s sociology of pedagogy, is used to analyse how the Montessori objects re-contextualise educational knowledge as developmental pedagogy. Particular attention is paid to the Montessori literacy pedagogy, in which the study of grammar plays a central role.

The study reveals a central design principle which distinguishes the Montessori objects. This principle is the redundant representation of educational knowledge across multiple
semiotic modes. Each representation holds constant the underlying meaning relations which construe quanta of educational knowledge, giving children the freedom to engage with this knowledge playfully, independently and successfully.

The conclusion drawn from this study is that the design of the Montessori objects represents valuable educational potential which deserves continued investigation, as well as wider recognition and application. To initiate this process, the findings in this study may provide insights which can be used to develop tools for evaluating and enhancing the implementation of Montessori pedagogy in Montessori schools. The findings may also be used to adapt Montessori design principles for the benefit of educators working in non-Montessori contexts, in particular, those educators concerned with developing pedagogies which promote equitable access to educational knowledge.