

DELEUZE AND KANT'S CRITICAL PHILOSOPHY

M. J. McMahon

**Thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy (PhD).**

**Department of Philosophy
School of Philosophical and Historical Inquiry
Faculty of Arts**

The University of Sydney 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Synopsis	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Prefatory notes on sources and references	v
Abbreviations for key texts	vi
Introduction	1
Deleuze, Kant and ‘Kantianism’	
The critical problems: foundation, coherence, orientation	
PART I: BEGINNINGS: SURVEYING THE TERRAIN	
Chapter 1: <i>Deleuze’s reading of Kant</i>	25
Hume: empirical critique	
Nietzsche: genealogical critique	
Kantian critique	
The critique of Kant	
Chapter 2: <i>Kant and the orientation of thought</i>	43
The critical attitude	
Orientation and disorientation: the division of reason	
Truth and method	
Chapter 3: <i>Deleuze and the “image of thought”</i>	58
The search for “the plane”	
The dogmatic image of thought	
The (non-) sense of the dogmatic image	
PART II: MIDDLES: PUTTING THINGS TOGETHER	
Chapter 1: <i>The sense of the problem</i>	74
The problem in geometry and philosophy	
Logic and existence: the problematic orientation of critique	
Chapter 2: <i>The problem and the problematic in Kant</i>	88
Schematism	
Synthesis	
Modality	
Ideality	
Chapter 3: <i>The problem and the problematic in Deleuze</i>	98
Ideal determination	
Subjective determination	
Temporal determination	
PART III: EXTREMITIES: GROUND ZERO	
Chapter 1: <i>The Critique of Judgement and the image of nature (1)</i>	118
Introduction to the problem	
Critique and the scientific revolution	
Critique and teleology	
Chapter 2: <i>The Critique of Judgement and the image of nature (2)</i>	132
The feeling of life	
Life and teleology	
Noematic fields and the field of the noematic	

Chapter 3: <i>The transcendental aesthetic</i>	147
Judgement and accord	
Genetic structure: the sublime	
The aesthetic idea and genesis in the beautiful	
Chapter 4: <i>'A' transcendental aesthetic</i>	161
The aesthetic image of thought	
The aesthetic community of thinkers	
Life and thought on the plane	
Conclusion	175
Primary Bibliography	180
Secondary Bibliography	185
Appendices	
1. Gilles Deleuze—"The Method of Dramatisation"	
2. Émile Bréhier—"The Notion of the Problem in Philosophy"	
3. Gilles Deleuze—"Introduction" to Instincts and Institutions	

SYNOPSIS

This thesis considers the status of Deleuze as a Kantian, and as such committed both to the critical destiny of philosophy, and the contestation of the sense of this destiny. The focus of Deleuze's reading of Kant is an *active* conception of thought: the fundamental elements of thought are will and value rather than being or the concept. In the development of this idea we can note a progressive 'tapering' of the foundational instance of thought, in three stages: from the speculative field of being to the practical field of reason; from the intellectual category of the concept to the problematic category of the Idea; from the teleological notion of the organism to the aesthetic notion of the singular. Within each stage we can perceive a polemic between the two terms: it is in each case a question of the 'sufficient reason' of thought, its conditions of the actuality beyond its possibility. The highest expression of our reason, for Kant, is neither theoretical nor utilitarian, but moral: the realisation of our lawful freedom. For Deleuze, on the other hand, the ultimate secret of our freedom and thus all of our thought is to be found rather in the realm of the aesthetic.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people who were indispensable to the successful completion of this thesis, and who I am pleased to acknowledge.

Paul Patton, who, as well as supervising the formative stages of this thesis, was an invaluable teacher and model during the formative stages of my philosophical studies as an undergraduate. Paul Redding, who supervised this thesis in its final stages, and who has demonstrated a faith and interest in my thinking at crucial points in its development. Antonia Soulez and Alain Badiou, who respectively served as informal and formal supervisors during my study in France, and whose philosophical largesse was both instructive and inspiring.

Laleen Jayamanne, for her Socratic ability to teach by placing herself in the position of the student, and George Markus, for his magisterial inspiration and intellectual generosity.

Dr Jan Orman, who 'held my hand' during the inevitable crises of faith.

My workmates and director, Rowanne Couch, Liz Wilson, Tim Rayner and Margaret Harris, who went out of their way in considering my success their personal problem and duty, and actively collaborated in order for it to be realised, shouldering the burden and cheering me from the sidelines.

My philosophical friends: The "Deleuzean Desperadoes" (Stephen O'Connell, Graham Jones, Heather Barton & Tim Matheson), Ben Horsfall, Jeremy Moss, Adrian Mackenzie, Simon Lumsden, Linnell Secomb, Amir Ahmadi, Garrett Barden, Didier Debaise, Pierre Nadaud, Adrian Miles, Linda Daley, Nicolas Pradines, Lisa Trahair, Dawn Mischiewski.

For their personal support and professional recognition: Garry Genosko, Charles Stivale, Brian Massumi, Steven Shaviro, Max Deutscher, Penny Deutscher, John Mullarkey, Keith Ansell-Pearson.

And my parents, Barrie and Dorothy, whose questioning spirit I have inherited, but who never questioned my choice of career, and have always supported me through the dramas and impoverishment it has frequently entailed.

PREFATORY NOTES ON SOURCES AND REFERENCES

This thesis is based on my own research, and incorporates no works published by myself elsewhere or submitted towards another degree. Use of other's work is referenced in the footnotes and listed in the bibliography.

The bibliography is divided into two sections: a primary bibliography with sourced works by Deleuze and Kant, and a secondary bibliography with all other sources. A list of abbreviations for frequently cited works by Kant and Deleuze follows these notes. The standard scholarly pagination is used for Kant's three *Critiques* and his *Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View*.

Apart from printed works, I have also made reference to some of Deleuze's seminars at the Université de Vincennes in the 70s and 80s, transcribed and made available online by Richard Pinhas, whose translation is being overseen by Timothy Murphy. In these cases I have provided the subject and date of the seminar, and the paragraph number. The URL for the site is provided in the bibliography.

In researching this thesis, I have mostly worked from the original French texts by Deleuze and the other French authors used, and English translations of Kantian sources. In references to the French texts, I have given both the French (F) and English (E) pagination, where both were available. I have often made modifications of the published English translation, mostly expressing relatively minor stylistic preferences of wording, stress and syntax, and often in order to bring out a 'Kantian' resonance in the French that is less apparent in the English rendition (for example, rendering "*s'orienter dans la pensée*" as "to orient oneself in thought" rather than "to find one's bearings within thought"). Where modifications are made, this is indicated in the notes. Where there is a significant semantic divergence between my own and the standard translation, I have clarified the grounds and substance of the difference in the notes, along with the original French text. Translations of passages from untranslated French sources are my own.

I have included as appendices translations of three untranslated French texts to which extensive references are made: Deleuze's address to the French Society of Philosophy in 1968, "La Méthode de dramatisation", Emile Bréhier's article on "La notion de problème en philosophie" from the Swedish journal of philosophy *Theoria* in 1948, and Deleuze's introduction to *Instincts and Institutions* from 1953. The original pagination of these works has been retained in their reproduction here.

ABBREVIATIONS FOR KEY TEXTS BY DELEUZE AND KANT

DELEUZE:

- CC** *Critique et Clinique* (1993)/*Essays critical and clinical* (1997)
- DR** *Différence et répétition* (1968)/*Difference and repetition* (1994)
- ES** *Empirisme et subjectivité: Essai sur la nature humaine selon Hume* (1953)/*Empiricism and subjectivity: an essay on Hume's theory of human nature* (1991)
- NP** *Nietzsche et la philosophie* (1962)/*Nietzsche and philosophy* (1983)
- MD** “La Methode de dramatisation” (1968). Translated as Appendix 1.
- PCK** *La philosophie critique de Kant: Doctrine des facultés* (1963)/*Kant's critical philosophy: the doctrine of the faculties* (1984)
- QP?** *Qu'est-ce que la philosophie?* (1991)/*What is Philosophy?* (Deleuze and Guattari 1994)

KANT:

- AP** *Anthropologie in pragmatischer Hinsicht/Anthropology from a pragmatic point of view* (1798)
- CJ** *Kritik der Urtheilskraft/Critique of Judgement* (1790)
- CPR** *Kritik der reinen Vernunft/Critique of Pure Reason* (1781 & 1787)
- OT** “Was heisst: Sich im Denken orientieren?”/“What is orientation in thinking?” (1786)
- QE** “Beantwortung der Frage: Was ist Aufklärung?”/“An Answer to the Question: ‘What is Enlightenment?’” (1784)