

**Thesis Chapters**

1. Introduction & theoretical foundations
2. Literature review & research design
3. Introduction to visual meaning in the news photo
4. Visual appraisal: attitude in the news photo
5. Visual appraisal: graduation in the news photo
6. Visual appraisal: engagement & interdiscursivity in the news photo
7. Verbal-visual evaluative stance in news review standouts
8. Conclusion & implications

## **Chapter 2**

# **Literature Review and Research Design**

### **Outline**

#### **2.0 Introduction**

#### **2.1 Literature review: journalism and media**

##### **2.1.1 Journalism practice**

##### **2.1.2 Media and/or communication studies**

##### **2.1.3 Journalism studies**

#### **2.2 Literature review: social-semiotic critical discourse analysis**

##### **2.2.1 CDA: theoretical contributions**

##### **2.2.2 CDA: methodological contributions**

##### **2.2.3 SFL CDA: methodological contributions**

#### **2.3 Research design**

##### **2.3.1 Aims**

##### **2.3.2 Data and methodology**

##### **2.3.3 Pilot study**

##### **2.3.4 Relevance of pilot study to thesis**

#### **2.4 Conclusion**

## **2.0 Introduction**

This thesis inquires into visual and verbal-visual meaning in print news discourse, and though a major aim is to develop theoretical description of visual meaning, it is ultimately concerned with applying this in social semiotic critical discourse analysis of news media (print journalism) texts. This chapter considers literature relevant to these aims and explains the nature of the research project. The chapter begins with a two-part literature review (2.1 and 2.2) and concludes with a presentation of the research design and procedures followed for this thesis (2.3). Though the thesis is not located centrally within journalism or media studies, the review first surveys relevant literature from the overlapping fields of journalism practice, media/communication studies and journalism studies (2.1) as the thesis data are all broadsheet news texts and the overarching aim is to examine this journalistic discourse from a pedagogic perspective. The literature review goes on (2.2) to examine the literature from social semiotics critical discourse analysis, the field most relevant to the final analyses undertaken in the thesis.

### **2.1 Literature review: journalism and media**

The examination of journalism practice literature in 2.1.1 reviews insider perspectives on the purpose, structure and meanings of journalistic texts such as those analysed in the thesis. Media and communication and journalism scholarship is reviewed in 2.1.2 as it has the same critical concerns as this thesis – to explore how readers are ideologically and evaluatively positioned towards knowledge in media discourse.

#### **2.1.1 Journalism practice**

This survey of professional training or reference books in print journalism suggests that the inquiry reported on in this thesis can make a contribution to journalism practice with regard to news photos and verbal-visual interaction, particularly in introductions to feature stories. Specifically, the review examines if and how social values and attitudes involved in journalistic decisions in this area are referred to and looks in detail at what a few of the most popular of the training books say in this regard. Most noticeable across most of this literature is the limited application of findings from the large body of research into journalism texts by critical discourse analysis, even where journalism

training is located in the academy. This is confirmed by a recent survey of journalism training by Zelizer (2004), who reports that linguistics and discourse analysis have both been generally regarded as of limited use to practicing journalists. The reasons she offers include insufficient consideration by analysts of context, too much theoretical diversity and over-dependence on microanalysis.

In the journalism practice literature surveyed here, there is no systematic application of CDA findings (Hall, C. 1999; Henessey, 1996; Hicks, 1996, 1999; Itule and Anderson, 2003; Keeble, 2006, Marsh & Marshall, 2004). For example, in the most recent edition of the popular *Newspaper Handbook* (Keeble, 2006), guidance is offered in writing different types of news stories in terms of specific language choices (pp. 94-108) and also in upholding journalistic ethics in terms of maintaining objectivity and avoiding bias (pp. 26-50). However, there is little explicit or systematic connection made between these two aspects of practice in respect to the news story, a connection that is a central concern of CDA (explored in 2.2 below).

The relationship between language choices and social values is more likely to be illustrated (though rarely explicated) in respect to news feature writing and in terms of the social purpose of the verbal-visual displays introducing feature stories (Keeble, 2006: 219-239). Describing feature writing as primarily concerned with “negotiating the subjective”, Keeble (2006) critiques his own earlier writing in a paragraph-by-paragraph commentary of a story he reproduces. He notes that his subjective responses and social class orientation led to inclusion of damaging quotes and an overall “detached, ironic tone” towards the subject (p. 232). However, though he emphasises the importance of journalists understanding their own history and subjectivity, the recommendations to handle subjectivity “delicately” and to maintain “a genuine tone” are not accompanied by any systematic or specific guidance on how this is achieved (p. 228). Where verbal-visual interaction in large displays (i.e. standouts) introducing a feature story is discussed, evaluative effects to do with promoting the story are suggested but not explicated. Thus though he notes “the headline, stand-first..., the intro, the picture captions and sometimes the graphic content are worked on together with the subeditor to convey the overall message of the piece” (p. 219), no examples are given and the discussion is brief and a-theoretical.

More discussion of visual and visual-verbal concerns and references to social values involved are found in the literature addressing visual or graphic designers (Campbell, 1985; Crow, 1986; Evans, 1973, 1978; Frost, 2003; Garcia, 1997; Giles & Hodgson, 1990; Swann, 1991) and newspaper sub-editors (Hicks & Holmes, 2002; Hodgson, 1998; Walker, 1992). However, though there is better identification in these books of choices made at different stages of production and more regular references to social values and evaluative effects involved, few explicit or systematic links are made between the two.

Books on visual design generally include many visual illustrations, but the advice given for managing images, words and layout is often given in unexplicated, value-laden terms which assume shared knowledge and values amongst professionals. Thus, pictures are seen to have different purposes (“provide impact”, “add beauty”), with “their presentation as important as the content”, there being a “limitless variety of visual effects possible from a single general theme” and many ways of “modifying the effect of a photo” (Crow, 1986: 76-79). Pictures are also seen as needing accompanying words to work well and editorial decisions in this area dependent on “the cognitive level, topical interest, and sophistication of intended readers”. Specific presentation selections such as particular gradations of light, focus and colour are recommended to be made “appropriate” to the content. (Crow, 1986: 76-79). Layouts are viewed as having “an affective tone” and “art elements should accurately convey the tone and message of the stories” (Crow 1986: 155). Thus, the importance of semiotic choices is recognised and emphasised but the exact relation between particular choices and particular effects is not laid out.

In the news subediting literature, there is a more comprehensive identification than in the news writing literature of tasks and technology used to manipulate the verbal and visual elements of a text. Though the verbal and visual may be dealt with in different chapters (as in the well-known *New Subediting* by Hodgson, 1998) their interaction is discussed throughout. However, where problem areas related to evaluation are pointed out in terms of specific verbal-visual choices made at different stages of selection, editing and layout of photos, there may be little illustration or explanation. This is so even though a greater likelihood today of “misrepresentation” due to the ease of digital manipulation (Hodgson 1998: 50) is noted in newspapers. Suggesting a reliance on

implicit guild knowledge, the expression of such concerns is often in terms that do not explicate but assume shared values even where accompanied by illustration. For example, Hodgson (1998) writes of a photo being “imbued with significance” by the way it is used (p. 59); that it should “*properly* complement the story”; its composition should be “*pleasing*”; and it should not be used to “*condition* the reader by selecting one that shows a person in a particular light” (p.57) [emphases added here and below]. The reason one photo might appear in different ways in different newspapers is linked to “different *ideas in projecting* a story” (p. 59) and “the *intentions* of the visualiser” (p. 61). The only linking of choices at any stage of the photo editing or page design process to the overall social function of the text or attitudinal effect on readers is in such general recommendations or warnings to editors.

In discussions about putting together visual displays for feature stories, there is reference to the need for great vigilance regarding libel and defamation laws where the stories deal with “matters of public concern” such as those analysed in this thesis (Hodgson, 1998; 189-215). However, this is not explicated in regard to evaluative meaning. Where the display’s evaluative effects on the reader are emphasised, it is in respect to the editor’s job of “projecting” or “selling” the feature visually to the reader via the display. And the display is described as more “contrived” than for news stories (p.194) and visuals as being “given a deliberate display function”, with, in one example, the arrangement of words and fonts used in headline being described as creating “a model of visual persuasion” (p.199). The examples reproduced to illustrate are described in mostly value-laden terms which are not explicated. For example, photos are described as “*immaculately* cropped”, as having “*subtle* crops”, “giv(ing) a touch of traditional *elegance*”, (p.199) or as having “quality” and capturing the imagination [emphases added here and below]. Finally, the “yoking” of photos and headline together is described as inviting the reader’s participation (p.209) with the headline as possibly “hinging on what the photos *symbolise*” or on what the story argues. Thus, editorial aims for the verbal-visual displays include “drawing out the *mood* and the *underlying* substance” of the feature story (p.213). Not only is a range of possible values implied in all these descriptions, but also much of the complexity pointed to here in respect to verbal-visual text is left undiscussed.

In the magazine journalism literature, concerns regarding evaluation and verbal-visual interaction are more often highlighted and discussed (Click & Baird, 1990; Mackay 2006, McLoughlin, 2000; Morrish, 1996, 2003; Owen, 1992). In this area of journalism, visual design in terms of the value orientations it carries has always been paid more explicit attention than in traditional news journalism. In recent publications (Mackay, 2006), CDA findings are explicitly taken into account. For example, the presence of ideological values in what is considered “common sense” is accepted, as is a journalist’s power over how a reader views the world through the way he tells or angle he takes on a story (while also noting the tension resulting from the level of journalistic responsibility this entails). Thus, a reporter’s subjectivity or “attitude of mind contributing to the shape of the final story” is accepted as inevitable even in news writing, (Mackay, 2006: 77) and journalistic bias as the results of “habits of mind” or norms absorbed in skills training is recognised (p.78). However, though there are examples given, there is no more specific explanation of how this might work.

Where interaction between words, images and layout in magazine features is discussed at length, the complexity of production processes and the social values carried by decisions at all stages are acknowledged but not suggested as amenable to systematic analysis. Magazine design, defined as “the way words, images (and other elements) work together” is seen as additional to subediting and layout (Holmes, 2006: 163). It is also described here as “a matter of taste”, creating a style and look aimed at “serving the readers best” (p.163). Guidelines about visual conventions (like layout, image composition, colour) are given to facilitate better communication between editors and designers. Advice includes choosing “strong” images (Holmes, 2006: 165), “good”, “clever”, or “tempting” words, and an “appropriate” balance and hierarchy of importance for elements in composition (p.170). At the same time, notions of good design are described as being “subjective”, and designers as “disagreeing profoundly about what counts as good” (p. 162). Semiotic theory (in particular Barthes’ work (1972)) is referred to here but is inadequately and misleadingly summarised, leading to the statement that “visual conventions (like linguistic ones) are to a greater or lesser extent arbitrary” (pp.163-164). Thus, even here, where visual design is described as a powerful language that editors as well as designers need to become literate in (Holmes, 2006: 163-167), the general principle offered is that its meanings cannot be systematically explained.

The more detailed and comprehensive discussions of images in the magazine literature include discussion of social functions and values as well as of technical choices but these are not related to each other. Thus, images may be classified (photo and non-photo), have social functions (pleasure, emotional impact/drama, mood, information), and go through stages of processing (selecting and production). Decision-making may be divided into technical considerations (such as contrast, grain, colour, exposure) and non-technical considerations (such as emotive quality like capturing mood, offering more insight) but again, usually not related to each other (Ang, 2006: 180-185). Amongst the technical considerations, value-laden terms such as “normal”, “good”, “appropriate” and “proper” (p.180) are used to advise editors on decision making, with agreement assumed on what these mean. The non-technical decisions (including visual composition in the balance of elements and hierarchy of their importance, “croppability” and colour) are described as involving subjective factors and as creating connotations for the reader (pp. 181-183), but with no illustration or elucidation provided. The general approach to decisions can be summed up by advice to editors to act “appropriately”, but at the same time to “always remember that rules are often broken”. (Holmes: 2006: 170).

On the whole, then, the journalism practice literature does not attempt to explicate or systematise evaluative meanings made by visual semiosis and verbal-visual intersemiosis in the news. This is the case even though social values and evaluative meaning are both implied and explicitly discussed in respect to this area throughout the literature. Thus, advice given to editors at all stages of visual and verbal-visual decision-making includes many un-explicated value-laden terms such as “correct”, “appropriate” “proper”, “effective” or “good”. Also, where the social purposes and evaluative effects of images, layout and words and their interaction are discussed, particularly in the magazine and feature story literature, these include their capacity to attract, engage, persuade, shock or offend different kinds of readers. However, neither the social values assumed in practical advice nor the evaluative effects of visual-verbal meaning discussed are explicitly or systematically linked with the range of visual expression forms available to photographers, designers or editors, nor are they linked to different target reader groups. Though there may be some illustration of visual content or forms in terms of some evaluative effect, the links are rarely identified as the result of interaction between content and various expression forms selected at different stages. The aim of this thesis is to take up these issues and move towards making explicit the range of

evaluative meanings assumed in good practice, as well to elaborate on the effects created by visual and verbal-visual meaning in the news.

### **2.1.2 Media and/or communication studies**

The burgeoning field of Media and/or Communication Studies is generally distinguished from Journalism Studies, not only by its broader scope but also by its greater focus on critical analysis of mass media texts. There is great diversity of work in this interdisciplinary field, both in terms of its objects of study (all kinds of media discourse not just news) and in terms of theoretical approaches taken (major approaches being Narrative Theory, Rhetorics and Cultural Studies). This is the case also with Image Studies, a recently developed and equally interdisciplinary field originally associated with U.S. scholar, T.M. Mitchell (1980, 1986, 1992, 1994, 1995). Much of the research surveyed here assumes, as this thesis does, the constructedness of both verbal and visual text and also explores this in terms of how texts realise social context and how they ideologically and evaluatively position a mass readership. However, as noted in respect to criticism of CDA by practising journalists, Media and Communication Studies are also often seen as lacking relevance to practice (Zelizer, 2004a: 111-144).

This review is limited to those Media and Communication studies that focus on the visual and verbal and use semiotics-based Narrative Theory or classics-based Rhetoric studies (DeLuca, 1999; Hocks & Kendrick, 2003; Schirato & Webb, 2004; Sturken & Cartwright, 2001), since such studies are concerned, as is this thesis, with systematically describing textual choices in terms of ideology, evaluation and reader positioning. Most use to varying degrees classical Greek theories of representation and rhetoric, which are broad enough to encompass the image as well as language. For example, Aristotle in his *Poetics* (1984) analyses the image's emotional appeal as due to both its mimetic quality and its manipulation by the artist. Scholars in this field also use Semiotic theory to varying degrees, particularly as developed in terms of the visual by the work of Barthes in Europe (1972, 1973, 1977, 1981) and Pierce in the USA (1972). Some of these studies also have links with CDA work based on social semiotics and SFL as used in this thesis. Research in Cultural Studies is not surveyed here, even though it too has critical concerns, because it is highly diverse methodologically and is theoretically at odds with this thesis in emphasising the *individual* subjectivity of the reader and infinite

possible readings of a text. The socio-semiotic approach taken by this thesis, on the other hand, emphasises the *social* subjectivity of readers and textual and contextual constraints on possible meanings.

One group of studies edited by Fulton (2005) demonstrates how CDA in combination with SFL's socio-semiotic descriptions allow fuller explication of the workings of ideology, evaluation and rhetorical effects in verbal and visual new discourse than can narrative theory, semiotics or rhetorics alone. Though situated explicitly in Narrative Theory, with application of both classical rhetoric and semiotics theory in analysis, both these models are problematised as lacking sufficient analytical power (Fulton, 2005: 2-3; Huisman, 2005:11-16). To address this, a case is made for also applying notions of discourse and findings from social semiotic CDA and for using the more "sophisticated toolbox of linguistic and interpretative concepts" of social semiotic SFL theory (Fulton, 2005: 245). The stratified and metafunctional SFL model is presented as better able to account for the workings of ideology in text, differences between news text types, and what Hall (1973) refers to as the public idiom of mass media news discourse.

The value of SFL discourse semantic systems, including appraisal, in the SFL model is demonstrated in the analysis of news writing (Fulton, 2005: 245-268). SFL contextual variables of field, tenor and mode and the metafunctions are applied to sample texts. The different linguistic realisations of appraisal (here called 'forms') from the more explicit to implicit (called 'levels') are shown to enable distinctions to be made between different styles or registers of newspapers and different tenor of texts. Bringing implicit evaluation to the surface is shown to be particularly significant in analysing rhetorical persuasion and positioning of newspaper readers. In illustration of how news writers establish reader alignment with certain values, tenor is shown to be established not only by Modality choices in the grammar, but also by explicit and implicit appraisal choices in attitude, graduation and engagement, as well as by lexical choices in metaphors like *election honeymoon*, by colloquialisms from different registers (like popular speech, in *the President did coke at Camp David*) and through intertextual references. In this way, this work goes one step further in systematising evaluative meanings than CDA work such as that of Fairclough (1995). The linguistic choices relevant to tenor are also shown to interact powerfully with transitivity and thematisation patterns carrying covert ideological positions which naturalise social values and institutional power structures.

Overall, then, Fulton (2005) presents a strong case for the value of linguistically informed social-semiotic analysis in elucidating ideology and evaluative stance.

In addition, the value of Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) SFL-based visual systems is illustrated by its direct application to the analysis of one news photo (Fulton, 2005: 260-267) although additional descriptive categories are found necessary and elaborations are suggested in relation to evaluative meaning. One addition is the use of Pierce's (1991) triadic typology of signs (as 'iconic', 'indexical' and 'symbolic') to capture certain evaluative aspects. For example, the clothing and props of the policemen and protestors in the news photo are identified as being iconic (looking like what they represent) and at the same time, indexical (standing metonymically for something else) and also symbolic (representing an idea or association). Another possible extension proposed, though not developed in the discussion of visual meaning, refers to technical choices of "shades of light and focus suggesting shades of opinion and appraisal" (p. 265) and a number of other visual expression forms are associated with specific evaluative meanings. Overall the work recognises and demonstrates the need for a more considered and systematic framework for evaluative meaning in the visual. This thesis addresses this issue by applying all appraisal categories to visual text, and by using these to analyse a large data set of broadsheet daily news photos in Chapters 3-6 and a smaller, but related data set of verbal-visual broadsheet displays introducing news review feature stories in Chapter 7.

### **2.1.3 Journalism studies**

Compared to the Media and Communication Studies literature, critical approaches to media texts and text and image analysis play a relatively smaller part in the similarly interdisciplinary field of Journalism Studies. Despite their narrower object of study than Media Studies, disciplines using linguistic or semiotic tools have not featured prominently here. The disciplines traditionally applied, such as sociology, have been those which provide descriptions of the journalism context, practices and processes, rather than its products (e.g. Bourdieu, 1984, 2005; Blumler and Gurevitch, 1995; Curran, 1998; Curran and Gurevitch, 1991; Tunstall (1971, 1996, 2004, 2001, 2004). A few scholars here do look more closely at news products, such as Barnhurst and Nerone's (2001) description of the evolution of newspaper design. More recently, the field of cultural studies has played a larger role in journalism studies, focusing more on

the reception than production of news texts, continuing on from early critical approaches to news (Hall, 1973). However, as noted earlier, there is a focus on personal subjectivity rather than on systematic links between textual choices and social values. (Cottle, 2000, 2004, 2006); Hartley, 1992, 1996; Sparks and Tulloch, 2000).

Where journalism is examined in the field of political science (Kuhn and Neveu, 2004) one approach taken examines both verbal and visual news texts and their reception much more closely. Referred to as the 'priming and framing' literature, this typically relies on psychological and cognitive analytical methods using framing, scripts and schema (Domke, Shah and Wackman, 1998; Gamson and Modigliani, 1989; Gombrich, 1993; Higgins and Bargh, 1987; Iyenga and Kinder, 1987; Mendelsohn, 1996; Shah, Domke and Wackman, 1996). In this work textual choices in news texts are discussed in terms of their cognitive reception by readers, which is described in terms of their beliefs, thoughts, feelings and attitudes. And the text types examined here with the aim of revealing links between political beliefs and news are, like those analysed in Chapter 7 of this thesis, investigative stories referred to as civic journalism, and those that focus on the development of media scandals (Glasser and Lee, 2004; McNair, 1998, 2004; Tiffen, 2004)

Other applications of political science to journalism are related to ethical values of journalists and referred to broadly as 'bias studies' (Harcup, 2007; Hurst & White, 1994; Keeble, 2001; Wilkins & Coleman, 2005). These also focus on investigative reporting and civic journalism as raising more ethical issues than other kind of reporting, but where there is consideration of text it often remains at the more general level of content. Though journalistic practice as associated with social values of the writers and targeted readers is attended to, it is not often by means of detailed exploration of how textual choices realise social factors and values. Typically, the method of content analysis (Krippendorff, 1980) is applied and the only choices considered are in terms of what is included or not included in a text. However, despite dealing only with item selection, content analysis has provided some useful evidence of ideological forces at work in news writing. For example, it has revealed systematic patterns in news item selection typical of different newspapers, or of news text types, particularly along the lines of partisan politics, gender and race (Glasgow Media Group, 1976, 1980).

Where priming or bias studies apply psychology or cognitive experimental methods to journalism, many also explore reactions to news photos. These often demonstrate the complexity of reader reactions and also therefore suggest the complexity of visual and verbal-visual evaluative meaning. For example, viewers' reactions to photos are found to depend on their "pre-existing values", are strongest in response to images of social actors rather than actions, and are also found to activate a spread to evaluation of other aspects of text and context (Domke, Perlmutter & Spratt, 2002). Sometimes both quantitative and qualitative methods are used in surveys, experiments and/or interviews with journalists to explore a range of ethical issues to do with news photos. For example Wilkins & Coleman (2005) use both methods to identify the connection between emotional reaction to a photo and empathy for those depicted. They also problematise different kinds of attitudinal response to attention-grabbing photos with respect to decisions about publishing (pp. 69-81). Their study also suggests that, besides an initial emotional impact, such photos may also trigger "mental elaboration" leading to evaluation and ethical reasoning. Their journalist subjects are shown to be more susceptible to prejudice in visual rather than verbal processing, making it more likely that stereotypes are subliminally called-up by photos than by verbal text (pp. 82-91). Overall, this work is most illuminating for its demonstration of the complexity of readers' attitudinal responses to visual and verbal-visual meaning.

Recent work in journalism studies now generally accepts critical discourse analysis findings asserting that ethics, bias and subjectivity play a part in all types of news writing, (not just civic journalism) (Mackay, 2006: 76-78). However, CDA analytical methods are still rarely applied by journalism scholars themselves due to the perceived difficulty of microanalytical approaches and the profession's concerns about insufficient consideration by CDA of socio-political factors, institutional processes and audience (Zelizer, 2004a: 142-43). One exception here is the application of CDA to demonstrate the location and operation of journalistic bias in a comparative case study of different kinds of news writing (Zelizer, Park & Gudelunas, 2002). Here, the workings of bias are revealed as far more complex than generally understood in journalism, and the phenomenon is noted as pervasive (p. 286) and embedded with "no feature ... free of value preference" (p. 302). Unlike most studies of bias, Zelizer, Park & Gudelunas (2002) examines a wide range of features across many related texts including headlines, photos, sourcing practices, captions and lead paragraphs. Most significantly, they also

focus on the interaction of features and on systematic patterns formed across texts over time, asserting that “The question of bias cannot be resolved by looking at certain isolated features of news reportage” (p. 303). The analysis reveals a range of similarities and differences in the coverage of the same issue by three newspapers, and in particular, it reveals bias in what is regarded as a newspaper of record with high status as objective source of information. This work is persuasive but CDA-based methods such as used by Zelizer, Park & Gudelunas (2002) have not been adopted widely in journalism studies.

Research by Zelizer most closely related to the concerns of this thesis is focused on photojournalism (1992, 1995a, b, 1998, et al 2002, 2004b, 2005, 2007). In particular, a historical-critical survey of the development of photojournalism shows how practices and attitudes to the news photo have served to support notions of journalistic authority based on objectivity (Zelizer, 1995b). This examination reveals journalism’s early defensive responses to the news photo’s success, including denouncement of its sensationalising aims. The later, more positive responses to news photos as factual evidence are associated with the profession’s need to maintain its authoritative status as the objectivity of ‘factual’ written news was questioned (also in Zelizer, 2007). One consequence of this attitude to news photos, as Zelizer (1995a,b, 2005) points out, is that technical expertise and attention to photo-editorial practices and processes are not needed if news photos are seen as capturing or mirroring rather than constructing reality. This explains why so little attention is paid to such practices even today, with many more accessible and less traceable digital manipulation techniques available.

Zelizer demonstrates that the many common editorial practices in respect of news photos cannot be explained in terms of visually informing. Rather, the many procedures she identifies by which news photos are selected, edited and presented are shown to give lie to a simplistic view of journalistic practice relating to photos. In an analysis of news photos in time of war, a number of common practices that clearly do not aim to visually inform are identified (Zelizer, 2004b: 115-135). These are described by her as connotative, and shown to suggest a broader frame of reference or set of values and beliefs, like patriotism and sacrifice. She shows that practices that achieve this end include more than the obvious and much criticised ones of withholding or staging photos, or even the writing of accompanying headlines that recast visual information in terms of some recognised set of values. Other, less obvious practices include selection of

photos with minimal information about events reported (e.g. a facial expression only), photos with no *new* information about the event (as in repeatedly shown photos), or photos with no information at all about the event (e.g. photos from another time or event with which the present event is linked).

Zelizer's work has shown the need for the journalism profession to acknowledge, identify and make explicit certain evaluative meanings made in the news photo, in what she calls common connotative practices. However, many of her examples are associated only with decisions about content. There is a need to make explicit the many evaluative meanings made through practices associated with photo presentation, such as the use of focus, colour and light. Thus, even those practices that seem to be viewed by Zelizer as unproblematically denotative need to be analysed in terms of any evaluative meanings they may evoke. This thesis aims to take this work further by demonstrating the need to deconstruct news photos and all related editorial practices in terms of their value orientations.

The understandings regarding the evaluative potential of news photos, as illustrated by Zelizer (1995b, 2004b, 2005, 2007) and as part of verbal-visual news discourse as explored in a comparative study in Zelizer, Park & Gudelunas (2002), are extended, illustrated and more fully and systematised in this thesis. Firstly, a description of the range of different ways in which visual meaning can inscribe and evoke evaluation via selection and adjustment of content in news photos is provided (Chapters 4-6). In addition, analysis and comparison of a set of broadsheet news texts of the same type, about the same issue, and over the same period of time that will focus closely on the interaction of news photos and surrounding verbal text is undertaken (Chapter 7). It is hoped in this way that the thesis can go some way towards addressing the problems regarding the use of images in the news - problems that Zelizer (2005) argues are caused by the accrual of authority in photos unaccompanied by sufficient consideration of their full meaning potential.

## 2.2 Socio-semiotic critical discourse analysis

The large body of social semiotic CDA work on media texts grew out of the groundbreaking Critical Linguistics work in the 1970s (Fowler, Hodge, Kress & Trew, 1979; Fowler, 1987, 1991). This married linguistic analysis with the critical concerns and aims elucidated by media scholars such as Hall (1973, 1997) and early investigation into media texts by the Glasgow University Media group using content analysis (1976, 1980). Using SF grammar, critical linguists deconstructed ideological stance in ‘objective’ print news media text by identifying recurrent patterns of grammatical and lexical choices throughout the text. For example, in a well-known study of British news stories reporting violent street incidents, Trew (1979) shows how the structure of each clause is strategic – shaped by an evaluative process (that operates throughout the texts) through which certain participants (“rioters”) are made central and others (“police”) peripheral, and causal relations are expressed or not.

### 2.2.1 CDA: theoretical contributions

#### **Fairclough: intertextuality and social change**

Of the many CDA studies following the above-mentioned early Critical Linguistics work in applying SF grammar to a broad range of media texts, the work of Fairclough (1985; 1988; 1989; 1992a, b, c, d; 1995; 2003; 2006), has been the most influential amongst those scholars who take a socio-semiotic approach<sup>1</sup>. Fairclough has drawn on SFL theoretical tools and SFL has also drawn on his theorising and analysis of news media texts (For discussion of this exchange, see Fairclough, 1988; Chouliaraki and Fairclough, 1999: 139-155 and Martin, 2000b: 275-303). Fairclough consistently applies and foregrounds the key notion within SFL of the dialectical relationship of language and discourse with the social context, whereby language can both reproduce and transform social structure (Fairclough 1992: 63-73). In turn, Fairclough’s notion of the ideological functionality and value orientation of all language choices underlies the formulation of rhetorical potential in text as developed in SFL, particularly by White (1997, 1998) and Martin and White (2005), whose work most directly informs this thesis.

---

<sup>1</sup> The most well-known alternative CDA approach is a socio-cognitive one, developed chiefly by van Dijk (1991, 1998a, b, 2001).

Though his overall conceptualisation of discourse is different from that of SFL, two aspects of Fairclough's theorising have particularly contributed to this thesis. These are his description of intertextuality and related to this, his work on social change as constituted by discourse change, concepts brought together in his book *Discourse and Social Change* (1992c). One limitation of Fairclough's work is that his application of SFL has for the most part been limited to SF grammar and Halliday's notion of register. He does not use SFL discourse semantic descriptions for analysis nor apply principles of stratification and system/structure in his theoretical descriptions. Because of this, Fairclough's overall model is not applied in this thesis, nor his analytical procedures, but certain concepts he delineates in discussion of his analyses are incorporated, particularly those regarding intertextuality.

Fairclough's theory of intertextuality aims to explicate how the more abstract social-cultural context of media texts is constituted, mostly through the incorporation of intertexts (1992a, 1992c: 101-136, 1995). Like the engagement system within appraisal theory, Fairclough applies Bakhtin's notions of dialogism, heteroglossia and polyphony (1935/1981, 1986) to conceptualise intertextuality. Like SFL, he also applies Bernstein's (1996) work on the inevitable operationalising of ideology in any recontextualisation of knowledge (Fairclough, 2006: 26). His findings from close readings of news texts in respect to different kinds of intertext, and different ways in which they have been incorporated in media texts highlights systematic trends that reveal changes in the contemporary media context. Most importantly, his conceptualisation of intertextuality also points to the need to examine whose interests are served, both by the choice of intertexts and the manner of their recontextualisation.

Of the two main types of intertextuality described by Fairclough as 'manifest' and 'constitutive', it is his description of the latter that has guided aspects of thesis, helping to fill out certain areas of the SFL model (as elaborated below). The resources for manifest intertextuality have to do with incorporation of meanings from other texts and are in the same semantic domain mapped more systematically and consistently by the SFL appraisal system of engagement. His description of what he calls 'constitutive intertextuality' or 'interdiscursivity', however, deals with resources not covered by the Engagement system, nor brought together conceptually in the SFL model and have therefore informed aspects of this thesis. They broaden the semantic area described by

the engagement system by offering descriptions of a wider range of resources for evoking evaluation across a whole text. These resources are identified by Fairclough as various external ‘discourse conventions’ (1992c: 124-125) incorporated into a text, as opposed to specific external knowledge, positions, texts or sources incorporated into the text in manifest intertextuality.

Discourse conventions used in interdiscursivity include what Fairclough calls ‘genres’, ‘activity types’ and ‘discourses’, and also ‘styles’, ‘modes’ and ‘voices’ (1992c: 125-130; 1995: 76-77). From the SFL stratification perspective, these all refer to higher-level meanings than those of manifest intertextuality, and may be either at the level of genre, register and/or discourse semantics. From a metafunctional perspective, the first group (genre, activity type and discourse) seem more field/ideation oriented and the latter (like style and voice) more tenor/evaluation oriented. Though Fairclough emphasises that intertextual analysis is a separate stage and a different kind of analysis from linguistic analysis of a text, all his evidence of interdiscursivity in text is in the form of linguistic or semiotic features. Many of these realise the three kinds of interpersonal meaning (interaction, involvement and appraisal) as identified by Martin and White (2005: 33-35) at the discourse semantic level, and also include evaluation evoked by ideational or textual meaning.

The interdiscursive resources described by Fairclough that are well covered by SFL descriptions include what he refers to as genre and activity type. His descriptions of these (1992c, 1995) are based on van Leeuwen’s work (1987) on how a news media text can incorporate different genres, either sequentially as stages (a recount followed by an exposition within a report), or embedded within a single stage of the overall genre of the text (a recount embedded within an argument in an exposition). However, SFL work on mixed, embedded and sequential genres has taken van Leeuwen’s work further than Fairclough. Thus SFL descriptions of ‘macrogenres’ in different contexts - in school curriculum genres (Christie, 1997) and media genres (Iedema et al, 1994) are applied in this thesis. Similarly, SFL description of genre agnation applying Lemke’s notions of topology have been used (Martin and Rose, 2008)<sup>2</sup>, as have genre descriptions applying Halliday’s metafunctionally diverse structuring principles (Martin, 1996). For example,

---

<sup>2</sup> A topological view of genre identifies specific genres in terms of their resemblance to others, leading to the identification of genre ‘families’ comprising a number of agnate genres.

in Martin and White's (2005) work on media texts a distinction is made between logical structuring of a text via ideationally oriented generic stages and its rhetorical structuring via appraisal prosodies. Also applied here is Bakhtin's (1986) position that genre is the impetus for all kinds of intertextuality in that it constrains the intertextual potential of the text.

Though Fairclough's descriptions of interdiscursivity through 'voice' (1992a, c; 1995) are not outlined as systematically as those through 'genre', in some cases these refer to the 'internal textual voice' as a social subjectivity or identity constructed by the writer. A similar semantic area is elaborated more systematically in SFL discourse semantic descriptions of 'evaluative key' or 'voice' (Iedema et al, 1994: 200-33, Martin and White, 2005: Ch. 4). Using appraisal categories, recurrent syndromes of evaluative choices are identified as constituting three recognisable 'voices' or 'keys' (Martin & White, 2005 Ch. 4) and these are 'reporter', 'correspondent' and 'commentator' keys in the news media. Corresponding keys have also been identified in history texts (Coffin, 1997, 2006) and also suggested for news photos (Economou, 2008, based on text analysis in this thesis). Fairclough notes that though certain voices are typically associated with particular genres, in many media texts there is merging of, or shifting not only between different 'genres' but also different 'voices'. SFL evaluative key analyses also reveal that though each key is typically associated with one genre, movement between keys can occur in a single text. SFL analyses (Iedema et al, 1994: 233) also show that a key not typical of a genre may be used in a text of that genre. In other words, SFL descriptions of key using appraisal categories can reveal more specific ways in which interdiscursivity through 'voice' operates in text.

It is Fairclough's analyses of interdiscursivity referring to the incorporation of different 'discourses' and different 'styles' in a single text that have been most useful in this thesis (for example, in 2005: 194-102). They bring together a range of higher-level resources described in the SFL model from the perspective of external sourcing and ideological/evaluative functioning. Fairclough's 'discourses' are partly based on Foucault's theoretical model of 'discourse formations' (Foucault, 1984) and seem to correspond to the field dimension of context and thus to ideation as realised by lexical choices. Thus, 'discourses' typically refer to subject matter as associated with different institutions or domains, such as the law or the family. They also refer to social practices

and their purposes in a domain, and so, one practice such as ‘disciplining’ can be associated with different domains as in disciplining of children in the home or of offenders in court. The examples Fairclough gives of the various external ‘discourses’ as realised in a text are lexical choices, including metaphors that realise ideational meanings from a particular domain, which also carry and/or evoke associated evaluative meanings (2005: 96). This phenomenon is recognised by SFL work where the linking together of certain ideational items with specific evaluation is referred to as a type of ‘coupling’ (Martin, 2000: 161) and more specifically as ‘bonding’ (Martin and White, 2005). This work, like Fairclough’s, also emphasises the evaluative role of lexical metaphor in bringing into a text ideation from an external field along with evaluation associated with it, and so provoking a re-appraisal of ideation in the field of the text.

In Fairclough’s intertextual analysis of a print news text about the attack on Iraq (1995: 94-97), five different discourses are identified throughout the text, mostly lexically realised, particularly by lexical metaphors. One of these is realised in repeated references to Saddam Hussein in terms that are typically used for disciplining children in the home, such as *spanking* in *More than 100 Allied jets gave tyrant Saddam Hussein a spanking*. In SFL terms, this is an ideation-evaluation coupling realised by lexical choices throughout a text (and sometimes many texts) that provokes appraisal of the Allied Forces as powerful and responsible and Hussein as weaker, not responsible and thus manageable. This kind of interdiscursivity seems to involve higher-level meaning at the level of context of culture, but not those of genre as realised by generic staging. Rather, a kind of lexical cohesion including metaphor and collocation realises in the text certain aspects of an external field and associated tenor at the level of culture.

Another kind of interdiscursivity Fairclough describes is created by the mixing of ‘styles’ and is also closely associated with ‘modes’. This is centrally implicated in two significant interdiscursive tendencies he identifies in mass media texts in the 1980s and 1990s and also found in texts in this thesis. One tendency, described by him as ‘conversationalising’ (Fairclough, 2005: 89), can be described in SFL terms as incorporation of an external tenor/mode coupling through linguistic choices spread throughout a text. Fairclough’s analyses here provide linguistic evidence of the ‘personalising’ trend in the news media first noted by Hall (1973). This involves choices at different linguistic levels (phonology/ graphology, lexis and grammar) that are more

typical of intimate speech between friends. He shows how these have increasingly merged with the more distant, formal and public style of conventional news discourse. The other important tendencies in news media that Fairclough describes as ‘style’ and ‘mode’ interdiscursivity are ‘fictionalising’ and ‘dramatising’ (2005: 93, 159). These are higher-level choices associated with an external social purpose or genre and described in terms of styles associated with entertainment in certain modes. They are realised through a complex set of co-occurring meanings at different levels throughout a text. Fairclough’s analyses show how this external style has merged over time with the conventional news style, generally accepted as factual and neutral, to become typical practice across many news contexts, including the serious broadsheet examined in this thesis.

Fairclough’s intertextual analyses of texts have also shown how social changes both determine and are constituted by changes in discursive practices in the mass media (and education). This work has inspired the exploration of visual-verbal standout texts in this thesis as a text type that has recently become more prominent in serious broadsheets. Fairclough tracks social changes like technology, consumerism and corporatisation. Most relevant to this thesis is his tracking of the development of the market economy, leading to commodification of the news (1995b: 130-166). When news began to need to sell or promote itself as well as to inform, it had to adopt a new entertainment role. Fairclough’s demonstration of the increasing and spreading trends for fictionalising and dramatising (2005: 159-60) interdiscursivity provides evidence of this. The comparative study of standouts in Chapter 7 uses the full SFL model to locate and continue Fairclough’s work in this area.

Fairclough’s description of the different kinds of interdiscursivity as outlined above draws together a much wider range of resources than are mapped by the SFL engagement system. By identifying a number of higher-level semiotic resources for evoking evaluative meanings via intertextuality across or throughout a whole text, this work has been particularly illuminating in respect to evaluation in visual and verbal-visual text. Though the operation of most of these resources can be more explicitly located by the SFL model in terms of strata, metafunction, system and structure than they are by Fairclough, his work integrates them in terms of their external sourcing and

highlights their capacity to bring complex evaluative meanings into a text and to create strong reader alignments.

### **Van Leeuwen: social actors**

The social actor network developed by van Leeuwen as a “sociosemantic inventory of the ways in which social actors can be represented in discourse” (1996: 32), though not applied directly in this thesis, both complements and informs it. Like SFL discourse semantic systems already described, this network has the potential to apply to any semiotic. It is introduced as a “pan-semiotic” system of the kind needed for conducting critical analysis of verbal-visual media texts (1996: 34) and a reduced and adapted network is developed for visual representation (2000). Van Leeuwen locates the network in his larger project (also in 1987, 1993, 1995) to map how various “elements of social practices... are represented” in discourse and describes this as necessarily including “*sentiments* that accompany the practices” and “*purposes* and *legitimations* of the social practices” [emphases added] (1996: 34-35). However, though the italicised elements refer to social values and attitudes, so revealing a concern with the evaluative effects of representation, the network takes ideation or ‘representation’ as its point of entry.

Though van Leeuwen’s visual social actor categories are not adopted to organise the analysis here, they provide a complementary explication of how choices in representation of social actors can invoke different cultural and social values. Most useful is his adaptation of the network and its application to visual texts to discuss visual racism (2000). He demonstrates that specific visual choices in representation of people carry ideological values that evoke a cultural or racial stereotype and so present people as ‘other’. Relevant options in the social actor network include ‘genericisation’ and different types of ‘categorisation’ whereby an individual is visually represented as a social type by the presence or exaggeration of cultural or biological attributes; ‘homogenisation’ whereby groups of people may be represented as all alike; and ‘role allocation’ whereby people may be represented as playing an agentive role in a negatively valued action. These choices are noted as having connotations and associations with social values that together can invoke already held negative stereotypes and contribute to discrimination.

Van Leeuwen's term 'social actor' is used in ideational analysis in this thesis as it provides a way of identifying people across both verbal and visual text. In the factual news photos explored in this thesis, not only is most evaluation evoked by ideation but also the most commonly represented participants are people. However, though this thesis is concerned with similar issues as van Leeuwen's, discourse description is approached through a different metafunctional lens, that of evaluative meaning, and analysis through the appraisal system. The ideational metafunction (including representation of social action and actors) and the textual metafunction are thus almost always described in terms of their evaluative effect via options in the three appraisal systems. Most of the options mapped in the social actor network such as role allocation are thus subsumed within already available SFL ideational categories, even though the label 'social actor' has been incorporated into ideational analysis.

### **Chouliaraki: spectator roles**

Of the large body of CDA work on verbal-visual news text, Chouliaraki's recent conceptualisations of rhetoric and evaluative meaning in television news is of most theoretical relevance to work in this thesis (2000, 2004, 2005, 2006). Though studying multimodal text with moving images, her approach and aims are similar to those of this thesis and her findings applicable to verbal-visual print news. In her examination of how TV news in the West represents 'suffering' of various kinds (2006), she is specifically concerned with the role of evaluative meaning in visual news. Most useful is her explicit and elaborated conceptualising of the ideological and evaluative positioning of the reader/viewer by verbal-visual news. She uses the term 'spectacle' (after Butler, 2003) with its necessary corollary 'emotion', when describing the privileging of the visual in the public space of TV news (2006) and her aim is to explore how television "manages spectators' emotions" (2005: 145) or "engages the affective potential of the spectator", and its "moralizing effect" (2004: 185). Her concern is particularly with how this is managed while maintaining the objectivity and impartiality standards required for journalistic authority in a western democracy. In this sense her work dovetails very closely with SFL CDA work by Martin and White (2005) on the rhetorical structure of news texts reviewed below.

Much of Chouliaraki's work demonstrates how the shaping of public opinion and bias in the western news media is to be found in "assumptions implicit in routine professional

choices” (2005: 144) (as journalism scholar Zelizer’s work, reviewed earlier, also demonstrates). Her analytical framework (fully developed in 2006) allows her to relate intersemiotic choices (how the visual and verbal are linked) with three broad kinds of semantic categories - narrative mode, space-time and agency. SFL is acknowledged, though its categories used by Chouliaraki seem broadly restricted to the ideational, and are at varying levels of abstraction. At the highest level is narrative mode to do with the purpose of the text, identified as either description, narration or exposition<sup>3</sup>; at a lower level are spatio-temporal choices to do with circumstances of distance and proximity, and finally, agency, to do with participant roles in processes. The SFL model of discourse semantics, particularly Martin’s relevant work in appraisal, is not applied, even though she identifies the three ways a text organises the spectator’s feeling potential as around “sentiment”, “denunciation” and the “sublime” (2004: 191). Her descriptions here can easily be aligned with the three types of attitude in appraisal theory. This thesis may therefore contribute to Chouliaraki’s project as well as benefit from it; her categories can be aligned with the SFL framework used here and elaborated in terms of its conceptual organisation (metafunction, system and strata). They can also be extended by applying the appraisal system to map the configuration of evaluative options that help position the viewer-reader in each of the spectator roles she identifies.

Chouliaraki’s overarching concern as elaborated in *The Spectatorship of Suffering* (2006) is a pedagogic one and goes beyond revealing how the public space of Western TV new media operationalises the constituted or changing power hierarchies and structures, describing also one potential configuration by which the press could practise a more ethical pedagogy and create a new kind of spectator role (pp. 211-218). Referring to her identification of the potential available in semiotic strategies already being used by the media, Chouliaraki suggests new configurations of these may call new communities into being. Her proposal is for the constitution of a new ‘cosmopolitan’ community by aligning spectators around a different set of shared values than have been addressed so far (humanitarianism) and in a shared project with aims for the future (action to alleviate suffering). This proposal speaks to calls in the CDA literature for positive discourse analysis (PDA) (Martin, 2000a, 2004; Kress 1996, 2000) which aims

---

<sup>3</sup> Chouliaraki extends Fairclough’s work on fictionalising narrative interdiscursivity in her detailed descriptions of the “spectacularising” of real events by TV news via the creation of “cinematic proximity” (2005:151), and its resulting attitudinal effects.

to understand how positive social change can be achieved through discourse by identifying resources that can be deployed for building solidarity around shared values and enterprises.

Chouliaraki (2006: 180-181) also provides valuable conceptualisation and illustration of the different kinds of ‘spectator roles’ associated with what she identifies as different verbal-visual news types that she calls ‘adventure’, ‘emergency/crisis’ and ‘ecstatic/sublime’. Each spectator role is systematically and explicitly related to a particular configuration of verbal and visual choices by which it is created or called up by the text, and also to the normative discourses that are thereby invoked. One of the three main spectator roles described by Chouliaraki is the ‘involved’ spectator who may be either the ‘observing voyeur’, the ‘feeling philanthropist’ (who is often “overwhelmed by empathy”) or the ‘doing protestor’ (who may sign a petition or send money). Another role is the ‘omnipresent’ spectator who is not overwhelmed by empathy, but may be angry and demand justice, focused on seeking out and denouncing ‘evildoers’. Finally, the ‘distantiated’ spectator role is reflexive, going beyond morality and the specific event and participants to contemplate wider-reaching temporal and causal connections. Different types of attitude values are highlighted in each of Chouliaraki’s roles – affect for the involved, judgement in the omnipresent and appreciation in the reflexive role. Though these role types were not available to be incorporated into the analytic framework applied in the thesis, there are clear links between her descriptions of how spectator roles are created in respect to TV news and reader alignments as unpacked in verbal text by appraisal analysis in SFL CDA (Martin, 2004b; Martin and White, 2005).

### **2.2.2 CDA: methodological contributions**

CDA studies of multimodal or verbal-visual texts that have been useful in developing the analytical procedure for this thesis (to be outlined in Chapter 3) are those that directly apply a range of SFL tools particularly where they are concerned with evaluative meaning. Of the two papers described in more detail below (Baldry, 2000 and Thibault, 2000, the latter (also reworked in Baldry & Thibault, 2006), is more illuminating in terms of evaluative meaning. However, like most CDA multimodal studies, the metafunctional analyses in these papers reflect the general focus in SFL

theorising of intersemiosis on ideational or textual meaning. Thus categories typically applied in CDA multimodal studies have been in terms of logico-semantic relations (Bateman et al, 2004, Bateman, 2008; Martinec, 2005), cohesion or conjunctive relations (Royce, 1998; Lemke, 1998b) and most recently, relational transitivity (Unsworth & Cleirigh, in press). Moreover, there have been few explorations of a particular media register or context and the one long term project on multimodal print news media texts is limited to ideational meaning (Bateman, 2008).

In most CDA studies concerned with analysis of specific texts where evaluative meanings are critical, the most explicit discussion of evaluation occurs in their discussions and analysis of intertextuality, which is distinguished from their metafunctional textual analysis. (Exceptions to this are Chouliaraki's work reviewed above, Macken-Horarick's reviewed below and other SFL CDA studies reviewed below). Thus, in Baldry's (2000) and Thibault's (2000/2006) metafunctional analyses of visual and intersemiotic meanings, Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) interpersonal systems are used to describe interactional meaning only and most evaluative meanings are captured in a separate intertextual analysis, as in the Fairclough analytical model. In both these studies, intersemiosis is described mostly by the application of SF cohesion categories, but some attempt is also made to describe how the evaluative meanings carried by intertextuality may be intersemiotically created.

The procedure followed in the metafunctional analysis of verbal-visual texts in this thesis has been guided by that used in both studies (Baldry, 2000 and Thibault, 2000) even though neither explicitly includes evaluation as an interpersonal category. Baldry's detailed analysis of a videoed university lecture begins with identification of a minimal multimodal unit of analysis, and also refers to multimodal sequences, phases and whole text. Minimal unit analysis involves analysis of each contributing semiotic in terms of each metafunction, as well as the analysis of the main structural relationship across semiotics. In Thibault's even more comprehensive analysis of a television advertisement, the minimal multimodal unit (here a single frame) as well as phases and whole text are also subjected to a staged metafunctional analysis of each contributing semiotic. In this way, they both use metafunctions and rank to begin the unravelling of what are referred to as the 'multiplicative' meanings created in intersemiosis (Lemke, 1998; 2002), while also taking into account differences between verbal and visual

meaning.

**Baldry: multimodal and verbal-visual texts**

A useful discussion early in Baldry's (2000: 43-52) paper concerns how multiplication of meaning via 'compression' or 'condensation' can be achieved in different ways in visual and verbal-visual text and page. However, though he uses SFL metafunctions and Kress and van Leeuwen's visual grammar, and exemplifies such 'condensation' in respect to ideational and logico-semantic meanings, there is no exemplification in respect to evaluative meaning. Though there are descriptions of the relationship between multiple simultaneous visual and verbal choices in a sequence of frames in two video lectures in terms of their interpersonal functioning (integrated or antithetical across semiotics) there is no discussion of how such choices may condense evaluative meaning (pp.72-74).

The only explicit discussion of evaluation here is in relation to intertextuality (pp75-80). Baldry focuses on the importance of tracking different 'voices' and their 'orchestration' in a multimodal text, in terms of the evaluative meaning each carries. Drawing on Bakhtin's (1986) and Lemke's (1988) notions of heteroglossia, Baldry applies these to visual meaning, referring specifically to a phenomenon in the visual that he says is similar to "quoting of the voice of the other" in language (2000: 75). In relation to verbal-visual intersemiosis in his text analyses, he refers to "visual, gestural and linguistic resources in the negotiation of different voices in the text" (p.80). The latter is made explicit in his detailed analysis of the video lecture, where a hand gesture is analysed in one frame as expressing a 'point of view' that evaluates a verbal quote it accompanies (p.80). This notion of one semiotic providing an evaluative orientation to ideation in other is potentially important, but is not accompanied by any classification of attitude values. Baldry's intertextual analysis of the 'orchestration' of voices in these multimodal lectures is also not made clear structurally, as it could be if accompanied by Halliday's notion of projection (1985), as incorporated into the engagement system. Neither is the orchestration of voices made clear semantically. Many types of dialogism (between text and audience, between voices in one semiotic and voices across semiotics) are referred to, but not specifically addressed in analysis.

Most relevant to this thesis is a heteroglossic interpretation of intersemiosis in a print

news text, implied when Baldry briefly notes how interplay between words, photo, layout and font in a tabloid front-page makes an overall intertextual reference to a cinematic text type (p.62) Though he emphasises how this orients viewers towards a particular evaluation of a represented social actor, like Fairclough's analyses of evoked evaluation through interdiscursivity, the effect is not clearly enough modelled in terms of its integration into a general multimodal and metafunctional analysis. A more systematic description of different kinds of evaluative meaning as provided by the appraisal systems of attitude, engagement (and graduation) would be a valuable supplement in such analysis.

### **Thibault: multimodal television advertisement**

Thibault (2000; Baldry and Thibault 2006) presents a detailed and comprehensive analysis of a television advertisement for Westpac bank which reveals more about how multimodal evaluative meanings may need to be tracked and how they contribute to the text's overall evaluative stance. In his use of cohesion categories to analyse intersemiosis, what is emphasised is the need to identify those meanings 'foregrounded' by the interplay between semiotic systems in terms of the 'co-patterning' of choices (Baldry and Thibault 2006:179). For example, in the advertisement, the frontal close up of a smile, head and body movement (and pauses) of a depicted Westpac supervisor are synchronised with accented syllables and pauses in two voice-over phrases, 'with money' and 'with advice' (2000: 325). Simultaneous visual choices from Kress and van Leeuwen's interpersonal systems identified here for represented people's facial expressions and body movements are also described in more or less explicit evaluative terms and referred to as evaluatively "modifying" the represented action. For example, a Westpac worker's movements are said to "indicate ... affective disposition to the specific action performed .... or index a more general 'state of mind'". A smiling face ('friendly'), body leaning forward ('ready to engage') and rolling up of sleeves ('keen to work') is a visual pattern repeated throughout the advertisement by a range of different social actors (2000: 345-347). This prosody (the foregrounding by repetition of such sets of co-patterns throughout a text) is identified here as giving a positive overall evaluative orientation to the overall thematic of the advertisement - the merger of two banks (2000: 365).

Further evaluative meanings are also identified by Thibault (2000) in a separate

intertextual analysis of the advertisement, and seen as additional to those of the kind already described above. Both kinds are identified in the analysis of the advertisement's background music (2000: 350-351; 357-359), where Thibault lists contributing choices that include (though not systematically distinguished as follows): the different semiotics of language and music, and within music, different sources (human voices and instruments) and different 'styles' (of singing). Each of these is noted as carrying evaluative meaning on its own. For example, he points out that the style of singing by a female soprano voice is associated with specific social values, and also that, together with many other choices, it may also contribute to making an intertextual reference to a certain kind of music (2000: 357-58). In this case, it is the early religious choral music of Handel and Bach, which, for those who recognise it, carries an evaluative orientation from another context into the text via the cultural and social values associated with it. Unlike Baldry, Thibault's multimodal analysis sometimes captures, distinguishes and shows interaction between the creation of evaluative meanings made within the internal thematic<sup>4</sup> of the text, and those carried simultaneously by intertextual references to an external thematic or text.

The procedures and findings in these two multimodal CDA studies go some way towards revealing the multiple layers of analysis required to unpack overall evaluative stance in the visual semiotic and in verbal-visual media texts. They confirm the need for a comprehensive and systematic description of evaluative meanings such as the appraisal system provides. In addition, a weakness pointed out by Thibault in respect to evaluative meaning in multimodal CDA has also provided guidance. Though Thibault offers some ethnographic background information, he stresses the need to better contextualise such analyses because of the difficulty of assigning specific values to evoked evaluation (312-313). The present thesis study is thus designed to better attend to this issue. It considers a large set of visual texts of the same type, analyses a set of verbal-visual texts concerned with the same thematic, and compares within this larger set, two subsets from two different cultures both familiar to the analyst. Identification of attitudinal values may thus be more easily linked to likely reader groups (with shared social values) targeted by the specific mass news publication in terms of how they may be aligned by textual choices

---

<sup>4</sup> Lemke's term used by Thibault (2000) referring to ideation at the discourse level.

### **Macken-Horarik: print verbal-visual texts**

Straddling CDA work reviewed above and SFL CDA work that is the focus of the remaining review are the multimodal analyses by Macken-Horarik, two of which (2003a, b.) analyse print news texts. These are Australian news stories about asylum seekers that are part of the same larger intertextual set to which texts analysed in Chapter 7 belong. Macken-Horarik (2003a) provides an ideational analysis of a news story and is concerned with how visual and verbal ideational choices relating to social actor representation work together to evoke a specific evaluation of people and their actions. Most useful here is Macken-Horarik's demonstration of how SFL transitivity categories and van Leeuwen's (1996, 2000) social actor categories can usefully describe ideation in visual semiosis and in visual-verbal intersemiosis. Though the social actor network has not been fully adopted here (see above section on van Leeuwen), a similar 'analogic' approach to Macken-Horarik's is taken in this thesis, with a wide range of SFL categories used heuristically to explore visual and verbal-visual meaning.

Macken-Horarik (2003b) extends the analysis of the same print news text (as in 2003a) in terms of ideological and evaluative effects by identifying 'homologous' categories of 'voicing' in the verbal and 'framing' in the visual (p.287) Her descriptions suggest that each may be able to be located within the semantic domain of the engagement system. Voicing is described as in Fairclough's 'discourse representation', and Halliday's grammatical category of projection is described as the most explicit verbal strategy for voicing. Framing involves initial composition of the shot by the photographer and then editorial selection and subsequent reframing of the photo by editors and news designers, often involving removal of context by cropping. Further 'multisemiotic' framing of a photo is achieved by accompanying verbal texts such as captions and headlines (pp.288-89). Macken-Horarik's study makes clear how the original framing of an event by a photographer can be removed and replaced, just as can the original voicing of an event by sources present at the event, also showing how verbal texts accompanying the photo significantly contribute to this 're-framing'. Particularly useful is the way visual framing and verbal voicing of the same event are shown as semantically aligned and thus able to multiply an evaluative effect. This suggests a general parallel can be drawn between verbal and visual engagement categories, an idea explored further in this thesis.

The third study by Macken-Horarik (2004) reviewed here is concerned directly with interpersonal meaning and one of the first to suggest the appraisal system as a further tool for intersemiotic analysis, noting that Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) visual tools need to be extended for analysis of evaluative meanings. The texts here are visual art works and accompanying text panels written by the artist, which contain many explicit evaluative meanings (unlike the news texts analysed in the other papers). Macken-Horarik applies Kress and van Leeuwen's Interactional systems for visual meanings, but also aligns two of them with appraisal systems used for the verbal. Parallels are noted between their visual Involvement system and the verbal attitude system and between their visual Power system and the verbal graduation system.

Findings here show that interaction of visual and verbal choices (identified in what are described as parallel attitude systems available in each semiotic) create intersemiotic evaluative meanings that are different from those in each modal element. Macken-Horarik's call for meaning systems to be developed or elaborated to account for attitude in the visual is addressed. She sees potential in appraisal descriptions to inform both 'transmodal work' and work in the 'visual realm' (p.21). This thesis aims to explore this potential by taking the verbal appraisal categories as foundational in guiding description of visual and intermodal evaluative meanings in verbal-visual news texts. As the most developed systematic model we have of this complex semantic area, appraisal is applied here to news photos and verbal-visual news texts to help identify and classify both visual and intersemiotic evaluative meanings more thoroughly than has been done to date.

### **2.2.3 SFL CDA studies: methodological contributions**

This last section reviews relevant SFL CDA studies that apply appraisal categories to analysis of evaluative meanings, and to overall evaluative stance (that referred to by Thibault (2006:180) as the "axiological/affective orientation the text adopts in relation to (its) thematic", which it "seeks to persuade readers to adopt"). The most useful studies reviewed here, like those reviewed above, are those that make a close reading of one text, or a small number of texts. As Martin notes (1992, 2000c, 2001) where discourse relies partly or substantially on evoked rather than inscribed evaluation (and so overlaps with ideological meanings), analysis needs to be more qualitative. Thus, interpretation

of evoked meanings, whether in verbal or non-verbal text is necessarily more reliant on close analysis of co-textual meanings and on contextual information. Among studies reviewed below, those that focus on image or image-verbiage relations in print media texts are the most pertinent, but there are relatively few of these, even fewer when the present study was designed. For this reason, included among the multimodal studies reviewed are those that use appraisal analysis on texts with moving images, and studies of written text only where these are of print news media texts. As exploration of evaluative stance is further advanced in studies of verbal text than in multimodal, it is the former that points the way forward for work on visual and verbal-visual text. They also provide important background for understanding the significance of analyses in this thesis.

Of the SFL work on education and mass media discourse, (some brought together in Martin and Christie, 1997 and Unsworth, 2000), the most relevant for this thesis is work on media texts in two areas. The first area to be reviewed is analyses incorporated in the wider SFL exploration of print news media and the second often overlapping area to be reviewed is where analyses explicitly demonstrate the ways in which appraisal analysis can help deconstruct ideological/evaluative stance and rhetorical functioning of media texts ((Iedema et al, 1994, republished with additions in Joyce, 2008); Iedema, 1997; 2004a; Martin, 2004a; Martin and White, 2005; White, 1997, 1998, 2000, 2002a, b, 2003, 2004, 2006). Thus, in this part of the review, the focus is on SFL discourse analysis studies with respect to their methodological contribution to the thesis, rather than on conceptual descriptions emerging from this work (for the latter see Chapter 2.1 Theoretical Foundations).

### **Iedema, Feez and White: media literacy**

The SFL analyses of a range of media genres identified in terms of social context, purpose and schematic structure in Iedema, Feez and White (1994) have guided understandings in this thesis. The most directly relevant analyses are of those texts referred to as ‘news feature stories’ (Iedema et al, 1994: 166-175), which are not explored elsewhere in the literature.<sup>5</sup> These news feature stories, identified as a macrogenres, include SMH news texts very like those referred to in this thesis as news

---

<sup>5</sup> The only other SFL studies of long feature stories are articles from popular science magazines in Fuller, 1998 and Miller, 1998.

review feature stories. Positioned between the media genres of hard news story and news commentary, these news feature stories are associated by Iedema, Feez and White with what journalists sometimes refer to as 'news analysis'. This genre is associated with 'correspondent voice', revealed as a particular mix of the appraisal syndromes associated with reporter and commentator voice. In correspondent voice, value judgements are made by the writer but not as explicitly as in commentator voice (Iedema et al, 1994: 166-188). Appraisal analyses of news texts in this work also reveal that a media 'voice' or evaluative key may be found in a genre that is not typically associated with it, such as reporter voice in exposition structure or commentator voice in report structure (Iedema et al, 1994: 67-235). Demonstration of the co-occurrence (sequential or simultaneous) of different voices and genres in sample texts have offered useful illustrations of types of interdiscursivity using the SFL model and have provided a model for analyses in the thesis.

Evaluative and ideological meanings are discussed in visual analyses of both news photos and print advertisements in Iedema et al (1994) and in the extended section on the visual in the later edition (Feez, Iedema and White, 2008), but only Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) categories are applied. More useful is the systematic description of different types of image-text relations, which include evaluative meaning (Iedema et al, 1994: 256-279). Photos are shown to enhance (amplify), extend (add to) or change (in order to covertly criticise) meanings in the verbal text. Also particularly useful as a model are two analyses (Iedema et al, 1994), one of a soft news story (pp. 262-65) and another of a television feature story (pp. 175-85), in which interaction between the introductory verbiage, image and following story is discussed in terms of evaluative meaning.

### **Martin: verbal-visual texts**

The only direct application of appraisal to visual and intersemiotic discourse analysis available at the time of the initial design of this thesis was Martin (2001 and 2004b). Like Macken-Horarik's papers reviewed above, these initial moves to apply appraisal to intersemiosis suggested the direction followed in this thesis. In Martin (2004b), the role of image in text is compared to that of imagery or lexical metaphor and images are analysed as 'evaluative Theme' in a visual-verbal text. Not only are both image and verbal imagery shown to 'provoke' attitude but also to 'texture' evaluation by occupying

equally prominent positions in a text. Martin (2001) proposes a third structuring principle in image-text relations, in addition to those of Given-New and Ideal-Real proposed by Kress and van Leeuwen (2006). He argues that images in initial position are not functioning as Given to the verbiage's New, but as evaluative macro or hyper-Theme, whose role is to evaluatively orient readers to ensuing text. This is demonstrated in two non-media visual-verbal print texts – the 1999 government report on the 'Stolen Generation' of indigenous children in Australia and a speech about freedom by Nelson Mandela on the last pages of his illustrated autobiography. Martin points out that not only do images in both act as evaluative Theme, but imagery echoing the image is also often found in the prominent final position, in the New of ensuing verbiage, thus reinforcing attitude initially provoked by the image.

Martin also identifies verbal-visual interaction in prominent positions as multiplying (or 'amplifying') evaluative meaning through co-articulation of attitude realised by images, verbal imagery and inscribed attitude (2004b: 298-99). Such trebling of evaluation is identified on the covers of the books that contain the two texts, and Martin explains it in terms of market forces, as helping to sell the book to a wide audience. This concept of intersemiotic texturing and multiplication of evaluation proves a useful one in the analysis of standouts in Chapter 7, (see also Economou, 2006, 2008 and in press). Headline-image interaction in standouts is, in these studies, analysed both as a higher-order visual-verbal evaluative Theme (for both standout and full feature story) and also as multiplying evaluative meaning. A similar pressure to attract and pull readers in is identified in this verbal-visual unit whose role is seen by editors primarily as promotion of the long feature story that follows them.

### **Martin and White: verbal texts**

In studies applying appraisal to news media texts, some analyses of news commentary texts (Martin and White, 2005; Martin, 2004a) provide more elaborated models for the kind of discourse analysis this thesis aims to apply to visual-verbal broadsheet news texts. The focus in these works is on a close analysis of the rhetorical as well as logical schematic structure of a text and each demonstrates the relationship between genre, evaluative key and evaluative stance. This work on verbal news texts offers the most valuable model for analysing evaluation in visual and verbal-visual news texts.

Martin and White (2005: Chapter 4) demonstrate how three texts in the same evaluative key each instantiate a different evaluative stance. The three texts have different schematic structures but are on the same topic (U.S war on Afghanistan) published in newspapers in different countries and addressing different audiences (U.K. and U.S.). Appraisal analysis reveals that the text whose overall stance is glossed as ‘damning’ is almost completely monoglossic with high force graduation values consistently associated with explicit judgement of the type described in appraisal as ‘social sanction’ (pp.186-91). The text whose stance is glossed as ‘excusing’ or ‘conciliatory’ is more heteroglossic, with less high force graduation, with explicit judgement but only one social sanction value (pp. 191-95). The stance of the only U.S., and thus insider, text is glossed as ‘sceptical’ and is highly heteroglossic in complex ways, with attitude values covering the full range in terms of values, types and loading (pp. 195-203). Their comparison of the ‘damning’ and ‘sceptical’ stance makes clear the association between stance and reader alignment. The more confrontational, ‘hectoring’ stance of the former reveals no authorial concern about alienating readers who disagree, and the latter, more cautious, inclusive stance a concern to keep aligned even those who disagree.

The analysis of a third, even more highly heteroglossic news text (Martin and White, 2005: 234-260) provides a clearer model of the construction of stance through appraisal choices and their interaction with other discourse systems, and also of the relationship of stance to reader positioning. This is an editorial about the September 11, 2001 attacks in the U.S. (also analysed in Martin, 2004a) from an English language Hong Kong lifestyle magazine addressing a very diverse readership. The analysis demonstrates in great detail how the appraisal system can deconstruct the rhetorical power of a highly complex text. Rhetoric is glossed as the construction of “positions of potential alignment between writer and reader” (in terms of shared values) by “the writer’s strategic investment of the text’s experiential content with the different types of attitude” (Martin and White, 2005: 211). Appraisal choices in a text are described as organising sociality, or “how we share feelings in order to belong” (2004a: 341), which becomes a more complex enterprise the more diverse the reader communities addressed are.

This study (Martin and White, 2005; Martin, 2004a) shows clearly how meaning systems across all metafunctions are involved at the discourse level in negotiation of social relations in a text. The rhetorical unfolding of the text “as axiology”, to do with

values or evaluation, is shown to complement the logical unfolding of the text “as rationality”, to do with things and ideas or ideation (Martin and White, 2005: 211). The interplay between them is shown to be organised by the texturing of language through the organisation of evaluative strategies involving different discourse semantic systems (Martin, 2004a: 337). The interaction of ideation, identification, conjunction and attitude in macro-Theme position, foregrounding an ideation/attitude coupling and initiating its spread through ensuing text is just one example.

The detailed analysis of this one text reveals how a text can naturalise a complex reader positioning, here invoking multiple reading positions for the same readers (not for different reader groups). Evaluation choices in the editorial analysed here are shown to invoke the hybrid ‘differentiated subjectivities’ (2004a: 341), of a typical reader of the specific publication. The text constructs a complex rhetoric that integrates many different voices in its texture, reflecting and constituting complex affiliations involved in the overlapping social networks of Hong Kong communities. Though the news texts analysed in this thesis may have different kinds of readership and only some are explicit commentaries, the way in which the descriptive power of SFL systems is demonstrated in this appraisal analysis of a magazine text provides a model for the verbal-visual news discourse analysis undertaken here.

Particularly useful is how appraisal analysis reveals shifts in evaluative stance as the text progresses. This reveals how the same readers can be aligned in different communities around different kinds of attitude values, aligned in one community in one way but at the same time not aligned in another. For example, the editorial is argued to align readers initially around affect values as members of “all humanity” in sympathy with the U.S as victims of 7/11 attacks, but then also aligns readers around judgement values as “non-racists” in condemnation of the US “jingoistic” overreaction, and finally, as “thinking people outside the U.S. ... critical of racist behaviour in the local region” (Martin and White, 2005: 256-57).

Accompanying these shifts in types of attitudes (associated with different ‘us’ and ‘them’ communities) are changing graduation and engagement patterns in the text. In the first half of the text about events in the U.S., there are many explicit affect and judgement values, all accompanied by high force graduation choices, making it

interpersonally “louder” and more “involving” (Martin, 2004a: 329-330). But the second half about local events is much “quieter”, with only a few explicit attitude choices in textually prominent positions, often with appreciation values attached to events packaged as things (abstractions or nominalisations, such as *some unfortunate cases* in 2004a: 328). Martin describes this coupling of abstraction with appreciation values as having “a distancing effect, by forming a community of commenting observers rather than reactive participants” and notes that the closer the text gets to local events, the more distant the stance becomes (2004a: 328). Martin thus elaborates a similar phenomenon to that described by Chouliaraki in TV news texts, but uses the full SFL model, and in particular, the appraisal system to do so. The resulting descriptions of the complex rhetorical work orchestrated by a single text has motivated a similar approach in this thesis. This has specifically required the adaptation of appraisal categories to visual meaning in Chapters 3-6 in order to similarly deconstruct evaluative stance in verbal-visual standouts in Chapter 7.

This concludes the review of relevant literature begun in 1.2 with a summary of relevant SFL work that provides the theoretical foundations for the thesis, and continued in this chapter with a survey of literature from journalism, media and critical discourse analysis. The following section will present the thesis research design and process, demonstrating how these have been informed by, and build on the theoretical concepts and methodological approaches in the work reviewed above.

## **2.3 Research Design**

This section outlines the design of the thesis research project, including its aims, data and methodology. It concludes with an account of the findings of a pilot study and an outline of chapters to follow.

### **2.3.1 Aims**

As presented in 1.1 and reproduced below, the research questions specify the aims of the project.

### **1. Overarching Question:**

How do verbal-visual displays introducing civic journalism texts in prestige broadsheet sites create an evaluative stance in respect to critical social issues and align a mass readership with this stance?

### **2. Theoretical/Analytical Questions:**

2a. How are evaluative meanings realised by visual resources in the naturalistic news photo?

2b. How are evaluative meanings co-articulated across visual and verbal semiotic modalities in a verbal-visual print text, and how are they distributed within and across all verbal-visual components in the text to construct the overall evaluative stance?

### **3. Media discourse questions:**

3a. Can a schematic structure be identified for the verbal-visual ‘standout’ as a distinctive news text type, and how does it relate to the written story it introduces?

3b. How is evaluative stance constructed in a series of standouts on the same issue in a similar news context in two different countries, and how does the standout stance compare to the stance in the ensuing written story?

3c. How do differences between the two contexts impact on stance in each set of standouts?

## **2.3.2 Data and methodology**

All the data come from broadsheet newspaper pages, mostly collected as hard copy, digitally photographed and stored as PDF files. Some pages were obtained directly as PDF files from newspaper archives.

The procedure undertaken in order to pursue the research questions comprised three phases.

### **Phase 1**

A pilot study was undertaken to do a close reading of one exemplary civic journalism investigative feature story – a cover or ‘top’ story of the *News Review*, a lift out section of the weekend edition of the serious, high circulation broadsheet *The Sydney Morning*

*Herald (SMH)*. The top story was targeted as the story judged by editors to be the most significant of the week and the one introduced by the largest verbal-visual standout. The story analysed is entitled *Wait in fright*, written by Andrew McClennell and Mike Seccombe (*SMH*, January 26-27, 2002 pp. 26 and 29). It explores the issue of unauthorised immigration to Australia by people seeking asylum there. The front-page section featuring the standout and story beginning was reproduced as Example 1.1 in Chapter 1. The close reading of this one text involved a detailed analysis of the standout, the written story and of the relationship between the two. The long story (here 2,510 words) is written by journalists and edited by the *News Review* editor, while the standout is produced by photographer/s, the news designer and the *News Review* editor. Each is produced separately and can be read in isolation from the other. Each was thus analysed in terms of its generic structure and evaluative stance as a separate, independent text, and also both were analysed together as parts of a unified whole. The pilot study and its findings are described more fully below as it was instrumental in the design of the research as presented in the thesis. The pilot study is also discussed in Economou (2006 and in press) and the full written story can be found in Appendix 1.

## **Phase 2**

Phase 2 initially involved collecting further material to address the research questions related to news media discourse. Seven news review cover stories were collected on the asylum seeker issue published in the same year as the story analysed in the pilot study. This produced a corpus of eight news review feature stories with verbal-visual standouts. These were collected from two different cultural contexts from January 2001 to January 2002. Four stories (including the pilot study story) are from weekly *News Review* in the high circulation Saturday *Sydney Morning Herald* and four are from a weekly news review section from a similarly high circulation Sunday Athens broadsheet, *Kiriakatiki*, ('The Sunday' issue of the *Eleftherotypia* newspaper) in Greece.

Phase 2 also involved collecting material for building a system of visual meaning to address the first theoretical research question - a project suggested by the pilot study as a necessary prerequisite to satisfactorily answering the questions on verbal-visual news discourse. Since all images in the eight standouts were news photos of the kind found in the daily press, an additional corpus of 450 news photos was collected from the SMH (2001-2007) daily news pages on the highest circulation days of Friday, Saturday and

Monday as the basis for establishing a system of visual appraisal<sup>6</sup>. The starting point for visual analysis was the visual metafunctional categories developed by Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) (see Chapter 3). However, the system of appraisal, as developed for verbal meaning, was used to develop visual appraisal categories, an aspect of interpersonal meaning not focused on by Kress and van Leeuwen. The extent to which the present appraisal categories are relevant to visual meaning in news photos was tested while also attending to the different affordances of image and language. This process involved the application, adaptation, reworking and development of the present appraisal categories, arriving at the description of visual appraisal systems for attitude, graduation and engagement in news photos as presented in Chapters 4 to 6.

### **Phase 3**

Phase 3 was a comparative discourse analysis of the eight standout texts collected from the Australian and Greek contexts. This was undertaken to address the second theoretical question on describing evaluation across an entire verbal-visual text and the questions on news discourse, specifically the verbal-visual standout and how it might use evaluation to align readers. Texts were collected from two different cultural contexts as they might reveal more fully the relation of context to text in this register/genre, as well as revealing more of the potential for variation in evaluative stance on this one issue. This comparative study is presented in Chapter 7. In the study, a generic analysis of each of the eight standouts is followed by an analysis of the largest and obligatory component of the genre – the headline-image unit – using the visual appraisal categories developed in Phase 2. These are applied together with the verbal appraisal system (for verbal components) to gain an integrated account of evaluation and evaluative stance of this stage in all the standouts. Taking the analysis further, two of the standouts – one Greek and one Australian – are analysed in their entirety for evaluation, evaluative key and stance, further drawing out the effect on each of the cultural context of their production and reception. Finally, to exemplify the full potential of the analysis, the relationship between story and standout in terms of genre, evaluative key and stance is analysed for one Australian standout.

---

<sup>6</sup> Three photos from other newspapers are used to illustrate specific points in the thesis. All sample photos presented in the thesis are accompanied by any source information available at the time.

### 2.3.3 The Pilot Study

The aims of the Pilot Study were:

- to explore an investigative story featured on the cover of a prestige weekly news review section in a serious and mass circulation broadsheet;
- to analyse the long written story in order to guide the analysis of the verbal-visual introduction or standout. For the story, the full range of SFL tools could be confidently applied to describe its genre, evaluative meanings, overall evaluative stance and evaluative key. Findings here were expected to suggest the evaluative stance and key of the verbal-visual standout for which there are fewer analytical tools; and
- to analyse the large verbal-visual introductory stage of the story by using SFL tools, particularly genre and appraisal for the verbal component and Kress and van Leeuwen's 'grammar' for the visual. Where further tools were needed for visual and verbal-visual meaning, the full range of SF linguistic tools, in particular those for evaluative meaning, would be referred to and adapted for use.

#### Context

The known readership of the weekend *News Review* lift out section is mostly, though not solely, middle-class tertiary educated, typically professional Sydneysiders (Morgan, 2008). Even though the *SMH* is the only local broadsheet where the left has relatively frequent exposure, it is also the highest circulation weekend broadsheet. And the *SMH* weekend *News Review* is likely to attract both right and left leaning readers as its only major competitor, the more conservative *The Australian*, is not Sydney based. Those familiar with the work of the two authors of the story analysed will also know they lean to the left.

#### General findings

The analysis of the *Wait in Fright* story showed that the verbal-visual display that introduces the top news review story of the week may be an instance of an unrecognised news media genre or text type whose social purpose is predominantly evaluative and/or

persuasive. The most interesting finding in respect to evaluative stance on the asylum seeker issue was that the stance identified in the written story on the asylum seeker issue was not, as expected, closely consonant with that taken by the standout. In broad terms, the standout stance was identified as conciliatory towards the government's response and treatment of asylum seekers whereas the story's was damning (Martin & White, 2005 Ch 4, see discussion above). Also significant was the fact that although each positioned readers differently in respect to that issue, both made evaluative choices overall suggesting a concern not to alienate readers positioned across the political spectrum on this issue. Unlike the story, however, the standout made evaluative choices suggesting a major concern was also to attract and emotionally engage readers quickly.

The similarity found between the story and the standout in attracting and keeping a broad cross section of their mass audience aligned, along with the mismatch in their stance on the issue is of concern given the high epistemic status of the news review site and the front page standout's greater audience reach. This wide reach, resulting from its position, prominence, attractiveness and brevity, means that the standout's evaluative positioning on a significant social issue may have a greater effect on the community. The findings suggested the importance of focusing on the standout as text in its own right and indicated a potential ethical problem in civic journalism practice where standouts are used. The journalism literature does not consider the standout as a stand-alone text (See 2.1) but only if it is recognised as such can production decisions be reflected on from the point of view of the construction of an overall standout stance, especially significant for readers who do not read on.

Besides suggesting a hitherto unrecognised verbal-visual news genre, the pilot study indicated that a better description of how evaluative meanings are made in the visual semiotic and in verbal-visual intersemiosis is needed to consider the evaluative stance of such texts. The study also demonstrated that the appraisal system, developed for analysis of evaluative meanings in linguistic text, could be adapted to help describe evaluative meaning in news photos. It also suggested that appraisal categories could be used to integrate analysis of evaluative meaning across verbal-visual text, here across news photos, headlines, sub-headlines and photo captions.

**Findings: the news review feature story** (For full text of story, see Appendix 2)

The feature story written by journalists was identified as a complex macrogenre (Iedema et al, 1994) comprising three subgenres linked in a sequence - a short moral exemplum, followed by an extended news story and finally, a long exposition. Embedded genres were also found within each subgenre, such as a mini moral exemplum (the Bible story of Moses in the bullrushes) within the moral exemplum identified as the first subgenre, and mini-expositions within stages of the news story identified as the second subgenre. As stages of the story macrogenre, each of the two first subgenres was shown to contribute to building up the argument expounded in the last stage of the text. At the same time, evaluative meanings and strategies work across all stages of the story alongside its schematic structure to construct its rhetorical structure and overall evaluative stance.

The overall evaluative stance is ‘damning’ of the Australian government in respect to its response to asylum seekers, both in what the government says about them and how they treat them in detention. One possible gloss of this stance is ‘The Australian government is lying about asylum seekers (which is wrong) and treating them barbarically (which is very bad) and the government’s only reason is political gain (which is even worse)’. This condemnation of the government is supported by consistently positive reader alignment through sympathy with asylum seekers created by appraisal choices, glossed here as ‘Asylum seekers are suffering (which is sad).’ Initially asylum seekers are presented as oppressed and desperate refugees who love their children and in latter stages, as sad and suicidal people who are physically and mentally incapacitated by their detention.

Though the story is full of both criticism of the government’s behaviour and descriptions of the suffering of asylum seekers, very few attitude values are expressed in the writers’ voice. The story is in correspondent key overall, with long stretches in reporter key which have no inscribed attitude in the writer’s voice. Where there are a few explicit negative judgements of the government in the writer’s voice, these are all distanced to some extent. Thus, rather than a strident railing against the government, this is more a measured laying out of a great deal of information supporting the few negative judgements the writers make in the story. This supporting information comprises much ‘factual’ evidence such as statistics from reputable sources and many assessments and

opinions given by people with high evidential standing. The first source of such information is the Bible quote in the exemplum, followed in the news story by many statements attributed to a recently resigned immigration officer, and in the final exposition, by quotes from a long list of experts who include doctors, counsellors and high-ranking government members.

The damning stance of the story seems to be made all the more powerful by its expression in correspondent key and by its relatively covert construction. For example, unlike an opinion piece or news commentary, there are few explicit judgements made in the writer's voice and these come late on in the long story in its continuation on a later page, not in an initial thesis statement. The writers' overall position is developed mostly through evoked evaluative meanings via a range of complex strategies involving the interaction of textual and ideational meaning. Such strategies suggest that writers are taking care not to alienate people who hold an anti-asylum seeker, pro-government position, at least on the first page of the story. One example is the repeated combination of intensified negative affect and incapacity of asylum seekers consistently causally linked with government decisions, supported by reputable statistics and accompanied by quoted, authoritative negative judgements of the government. For those who read the whole story, the spreading, accumulating and intensifying of certain combinations of such values across the text make the writers' anti-government stance increasingly clear.

Not only did the analysis of the story suggest what the evaluative stance and key of the standout might be expected to be, but also revealed many ways in which inscribed and evoked evaluation interact, different kinds of evaluative strategies used and the different ways all these interact in patterns and prosodies across various stages of this written text.

**Findings: the standout** (See Australian Standout 4 in Appendix 1.)

The visual-verbal display was identified both as the initial, title stage of the story macrogenre and as an independent text. Its schematic structure was identified as orbital, comprising a nucleus of headline and three news photos, and a number of satellites. These latter include the image captions/credits, the sub-headline (or 'stand first') and story credits, (also termed by *SMH* journalists as the 'write off'). The pilot study showed the need for further data to confirm whether this schematic structure describes a hitherto unrecognised news genre, or at least text type, referred to here as the standout.

The overall standout evaluative stance in respect to the government response to asylum seekers is, though not highlighted, identified as conciliatory. The more highlighted stance is in respect to asylum seekers, identified here as conditionally sympathetic. A possible gloss of the main attitude values involved is ‘Asylum seekers are suffering in our detention system (which is sad) but they are causing a problem in Australia, leading to divisiveness (which is not right and not good).’ The latter can imply that the government response – their detention – is necessary. Strong reader bonding is created with detained asylum seekers in the headline-images nucleus as it is in the story (by negative affect and judgment of their incapacity). But unlike the story, no attention is explicitly drawn to the government as the cause of their suffering, nor is the government explicitly condemned. In contrast to the story, the only similar condemnation in the standout is of asylum seekers who *have polarised Australia*.

Like the story, the stance taken in the standout is also made more powerful by its expression in the more measured correspondent key and in a text in which the effect of factuality is strong and much of the evaluation is evoked rather than inscribed (this time by an interplay of values across verbal and visual elements). Like the story, these strategies create bonding with a wide cross section of readers, both pro and anti-asylum seekers and pro and anti-government. As in verbal correspondent key, though there is a strong ‘factual’ rhetorical effect created by verbal-visual interaction (captions identifying real people, places and things in the photos) and by single-voiced ‘factual’ assertions in the headlines, there are also verbal evaluative choices not available to reporter key. These include lexical metaphors, like *polarised Australia*, which provoke evaluation (here of depicted people), carrying the authority of the editorial voice as well as the aura of factuality. Other choices suggesting less evaluative constraint than reporter key are those that make an intertextual reference to a horror/prison movie drama through interaction between layout and content of photos and the movie title-like main headline. These choices, aimed at attracting and emotionally engaging a mass audience, contribute to the mismatch between standout and story key and stance on asylum seekers.

### **2.3.4 Relevance of the pilot study for the thesis**

#### **(i) Recognition of the standout as a genre**

While more data would be needed to confirm the description of the standout as a recognisable genre with identifiable stages, the pilot research suggested that it is an important news media text type. Though a brief text, in terms of its verbal components, the standout's overall rhetorical effect is made more powerful by its size, position and prominent use of visual text. In the pilot study the standout's conciliatory stance towards the government and its shifting stance in respect to asylum seekers is greatly at odds with the story. However it is only fully constructed by interaction of meanings across all major components of the standout and so the positioning effect is most relevant for readers who focus only on the standout.

#### **(ii) Significance of the lack of fit between the evaluative stance of the written story and that of the standout**

The similarity found between the story and the standout in terms of keeping a broad cross section of their mass audience aligned suggests that the producers of each are conscious of that audience. However, given the standout's greater audience reach and its extra care to quickly attract and engage a wider audience than the story, the mismatch between its stance and the story's in respect of the social issue at stake is of concern. The findings therefore suggest the importance of establishing the standout as a text in its own right. As long as the journalism literature does not recognise the potential of the standout as a stand-alone text, production decisions may not take into account construction of its overall stance in relation to the accompanying story and complex evaluative effects of visual-verbal interaction are likely to be ignored.

#### **(iii) Potential of appraisal for analysis of visual meaning in news photos**

In examining visual meaning in the standout, Kress and van Leeuwen's (1996/2006) categories were applied but proved insufficient for describing evaluation in the news photos. Indeed, when juxtaposed with the linguistic tools available for describing evaluation in the verbal, the limitations of their tools for evaluative meaning were evident. Thus, along with some extensions and adaptation of Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) categories, there was an attempt to make wider use of the categories of the appraisal systems in the analysis of photos in the standout than the preliminary forays so

far in the literature (Martin, 2001, 2004a; Macken-Horarik 2004). The attempt, even though relatively tentative at this stage, proved fruitful and suggested directions for further work.

### **Attitude**

First, in respect to attitude, the analysis showed that different types of attitude values can be identified even though most attitude is evoked by ideational items rather than inscribed. The pilot study highlighted a number of ways in which attitude analysis should proceed by demonstrating the importance of the following:

- The need to distinguish different ways in which values can be evoked. This may be through what is depicted in the visual (young children writing at desks) or by what is implied by this (a primary school setting, local primary education). The latter will be interpreted differently depending on readers' knowledge, experience and the values they associate with what is depicted. Reference thus needs to be made to identifiable reader groups targeted by the news.
- The necessity of teasing out the distinction between attitude values ascribed to participants (people behaving violently implying anger, or people actually looking angry) and the feelings or attitudes these evoke or trigger in readers (condemnation of depicted people and behaviour).
- Sensitivity to the different affordances of the visual and verbal semiotic; for example, a social actor in the verbal can be represented as 'a man', but in the visual there can be no avoidance of attributes such as gender, body shape, skin/hair colour and/or clothing. This is clearly relevant in relation to values the reader brings to the text.
- Recognition of the fact that the visual semiotic allows for a kind of 'ideational abstraction', even in the naturalistic news photo, that is comparable to nominalisation. This has a similar function of distancing readers from participants as sentient agents, as in the effacement of a depicted actor by a rear angle shot or cropping off of their head.

### **Graduation**

The pilot study findings showed that the concept of visual graduation was a key one for

evaluation, drawing attention to the following:

- The nature of the visual semiotic facilitates many different means of grading visual ideational meaning that need to be teased out. Size, light, colour and focus, adjustable by camera angles and settings, all offer ways of raising or lowering the intensity of some depicted item in an image. This can have the effect either of calling attention to an item likely to evoke attitude, or of intensifying an attitude that is explicitly depicted, such as in a smile or tears.
- Two different kinds of repetition are afforded by the visual semiotic, making it potentially a more complex means of evoking attitude than verbal repetition. Besides the depiction of more than one similar ideational item, the shape or colour of one item may also be visually echoed or ‘repeated’ in the shape or colour of a different item. If one item is repeated in both these ways, its power to evoke attitude may be multiplied.

#### **(iv) Potential of appraisal for intermodal analysis in verbal-visual news texts**

##### **Attitude value couplings and prosodies across visual-visual**

The pilot study showed how attitude values combined to create sympathetic bonding of readers with a social actor can be allocated differently across the visual and verbal, and how such decisions are motivated in terms of rhetorical effect. Thus, participants’ incapacity may be depicted and their negative emotions expressed verbally as in this standout, creating a different evaluative effect on readers than would the opposite allocation. In terms of prosody, attitude values in one stage of the standout (creating one kind of reader alignment with a social actor) were shown to interact with those in another stage, in such a way that readers could be quite easily coherently realigned in respect to the same actor.

##### **Verbal-visual intertextual reference evoking attitude values**

The pilot study also suggested that attitude values creating bonding with readers can be realised via a different kind of visual-verbal interaction. An intertextual reference can be made to a non-news verbal-visual source associated by readers with a set of attitude values, which are thereby evoked. In this standout, the reference made by the image-headline unit is to a horror/prison movie drama. (See discussion in Chapter 6). This finding suggested an avenue for expanding the present engagement system to include

values evoked by such intertextuality.

## **2.4 Conclusion**

The pilot study suggested the value of focusing on the standout and of applying the SFL appraisal categories to visual and verbal-visual text. It also made clear that a larger data set was required to:

- begin to map the meaning potential of visual appraisal in relation to news photos;
- establish the characteristics of the verbal-visual news genre, the standout;
- apply visual appraisal in analysis of verbal-visual evaluation in standouts; and
- explore potential for variation in the interaction between context and text in the news review feature story and standout.

The remaining chapters of the thesis take up these challenges. They demonstrate how findings from the pilot study have provided a basis for elaborating visual appraisal in news photos (Chapters 3-6) and for the analysis of visual-verbal news review standouts in Chapter 7. Chapter 8 then draws out the thesis project findings and implications.